

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Testing mixed strategies in the field: an experiment with soccer penalty kicks

Juan Sentana 🔀

First published: 13 July 2025

https://doi.org/10.1111/ecca.70002

Abstract

I conduct a (quasi) field experiment in the soccer field with junior players to study if non-professionals satisfy the implications of mixed strategy equilibrium when repeatedly facing the same opponents in the penalty kick game. By having repeated observations on different pairs of soccer players, a rare situation in real life, I can not only deal with the heterogeneity of the optimal strategies across pairs of players, but also study possible interactions between the actions of the players. My empirical results are consistent with the theory, even though the least experienced goalkeepers tend to replicate each other's actions. Interestingly, when all pairs are erroneously treated as a homogeneous one, I find rejections of the equilibrium implications, highlighting the importance of heterogeneity for determining mixed strategy play at the non-professional level.

REFERENCES

Anderson, A., Rosen, J., Rust, J. and Wong, K. P. (2025). Disequilibrium play in tennis. *Journal of Political Economy*, **133**, 190–251.

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Azar, O. H. and Bar-Eli, M. (2011). Do soccer players play the mixed-strategy Nash equilibrium? *Applied Economics*, **43**, 3591–601.

Web of Science® 🗵 Google Scholar 🗹

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Bar-Eli, M., Azar, O. H., Ritov, I., Keidar-Levin, Y. and Schein, G. (2007). Action bias among elite soccer goalkeepers: the case of penalty kicks. *Journal of Economic Psychology*, **28**, 606–21.

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Bar-Eli, M., Krumer, A. and Morgulev, E. (2020). Ask not what economics can do for sports—ask what sports can do for economics. *Journal of Behavioral and Experimental Economics*, **89**, 101597.

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Bikhchandani, S., Hirshleifer, D. and Welch, I. (1992). A theory of fashion, custom, and cultural change as informational cascades. *Journal of Political Economy*, **100**, 992–1026.

Google Scholar

Chiappori, P.-A., Levitt, S. and Groseclose, T. (2002). Testing mixed-strategy equilibria when players are heterogeneous: the case of penalty kicks in soccer. *American Economic Review*, **92**, 1138–51.

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Chowdhury, S. M., Kovenock, D. and Sheremeta, R. M. (2013). An experimental investigation of Colonel Blotto games. *Economic Theory*, **52**, 833–61.

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Cipriani, M. and Guarino, A. (2009). Herd behavior in financial markets: an experiment with financial market professionals. *Journal of the European Economic Association*, **7**, 206–33.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Coloma, G. (2007). Penalty kicks in soccer: an alternative methodology for testing mixed-strategy equilibria. *Journal of Sports Economics*, **8**, 530–45.

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Coloma, G. (2012). The penalty kick game under incomplete information. *Journal of Game Theory*, **4**, 15–24.

Google Scholar 🗹

Davidson, R. and MacKinnon, J. (1998). Graphical methods for investigating the size and power of hypothesis tests. *The Manchester School*, **66**, 1–26.

Dohmen, T. and Sonnabend, H. (2018). Further field evidence for minimax play. *Journal of Sports Economics*, **19**, 371–88.

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Gauriot, R., Page, L. and Wooders, J. (2023). Expertise, gender, and equilibrium play. *Quantitative Economics*, **14**, 517–23.

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Hamilton, J. D. (1994). *Time Series Analysis*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Google Scholar 🛚

Hsu, S.-H., Huang, C.-Y. and Tang, C.-T. (2007). Minimax play at Wimbledon: comment. *American Economic Review*, **97**, 517–23.

Judge, G. G., Griffiths, W. E., Carter Hill, R., Lütkepohl, H. and Lee, T.-C. (1985). *The Theory and Practice of Econometrics*. Hoboken, NJ: Wiley.

Google Scholar ☑

Kovash, K. and Levitt, S. D. (2009). Professionals do not play minimax: evidence from Major League Baseball and the National Football League. NBER Working Paper no. 15347.

Google Scholar 🗹

Kreps, D., Milgrom, P., Roberts, J. and Wilson, R. (1982). Rational cooperation in the finitely repeated prisoners' dilemma. *Journal of Economic Theory*, **27**, 245–52.

Web of Science® Google Scholar

Malkov, E. (2018). Minimax outside the top-5; available online at https://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3200795

Google Scholar 🗹

Mercier, J. F. (2024). Professionals do play minimax: revisiting the Nash equilibrium in major league baseball. *Sports Economics Review*, **7**, 100039.

Google Scholar 🗹

Osborne, J. (2003). An Introduction to Game Theory. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Google Scholar 🗹

Palacios-Huerta, I. (2003). Professionals play minimax. Review of Economic Studies, 70, 395–415.

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Google Scholar 🗹

Palacios-Huerta, I. (2023). The beautiful dataset; available online at. https://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.4665889

Google Scholar 🛚

Rosen, S. H. and Sanderson, A. (2001). Labour markets in professional sports. *Economic Journal*, **111**, 47–68.

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Scharfstein, D. S. and Stein, J. C. (1990). Herd behavior and investment. *American Economic Review*, **80**, 465–79.

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Sentana, J. (2022). Test for independence between categorical variables. *Economics Letters*, **220**, 110850.

Google Scholar 🖸

Sentana, J. (2024). *Heterogeneity in mixed strategy equilibrium*. Working Paper, Universidad Pontificia Comillas.

Google Scholar ☑

Walker, M. and Wooders, J. (2001). Minimax play at Wimbledon. *American Economic Review*, **91**, 1521–38.

Web of Science® ☑ Google Scholar ☑

Download PDF



Terms of Use

About Cookies

Manage Cookies

Accessibility

Wiley Research DE&I Statement and Publishing Policies

Developing World Access

HELP & SUPPORT

Contact Us
Training and Support
DMCA & Reporting Piracy
Sitemap

OPPORTUNITIES

Subscription Agents
Advertisers & Corporate Partners

CONNECT WITH WILEY

The Wiley Network Wiley Press Room

Copyright © 1999-2025 John Wiley & Sons, Inc or related companies. All rights reserved, including rights for text and data mining and training of artificial intelligence technologies or similar technologies.