



**COMILLAS**

UNIVERSIDAD PONTIFICIA



FACULTAD DE TEOLOGÍA

*THE DELIBERATIO PRIMORUM PATRUM,  
THE PNEUMATOLOGICAL PROCESS FOR  
THE IGNATIAN CHARISM: YESTERDAY AND TODAY*

---

Autor: Du Hyun Kim

Director / Tutor: Dr. Eduard López Hortelano

MADRID

Junio 2019





**COMILLAS**

UNIVERSIDAD PONTIFICIA



FACULTAD DE TEOLOGÍA

THE *DELIBERATIO PRIMORUM PATRUM*,  
THE PNEUMATOLOGICAL PROCESS FOR  
THE IGNATIAN CHARISM: YESTERDAY AND TODAY

---

Autor: Du Hyun Kim

Visto bueno del director  
Dr. Eduard López Hortelano

Fdo.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Madrid, \_\_\_\_\_



## Table of Content

Abbreviations.....	v
Introduction.....	1

### CHAPTER 1

<b>The <i>Deliberatio Primorum Patrum</i>, from <i>Amigos en el Señor</i> to the <i>Societas</i>.....</b>	<b>5</b>
1.1. Semantic words of the <i>Deliberatio</i> .....	6
1.1.1. Deliberation/to deliberate ( <i>deliberación/deliberar</i> ).....	7
1.1.2. Discernment/to discern ( <i>discernimiento/discernir</i> ).....	7
1.1.3. Election/to choose ( <i>elección/elegir</i> ).....	8
1.1.4. Discretion ( <i>discreción/ser discreto</i> ).....	9
1.2. The Historic context of the First Companions.....	9
1.2.1. The birth of the Charism: Manresa.....	9
1.2.2. Theological-spiritual places and its persons.....	12
1.2.3. Genesis of the discernment process.....	16
1.2.4. Question of true discernment in common or decision of charismatic Ignatius.....	17
1.3. The <i>Deliberatio</i> , the inspiration for the communal discernment.....	18
1.3.1 The First Discernment.....	19
1.3.2. The Second Discernment.....	22

1.3.3. The true nature of the <i>communal</i> discernment.....	25
--	----

## CHAPTER 2

<b>The <i>Spiritual Exercises</i>: the Ignatian Charism into the <i>Deliberatio</i> .....</b>	<b>31</b>
2.1. The Dynamics of the <i>Exercises</i> .....	32
2.1.1. Some principle elements of The <i>Spiritual Exercises</i> .....	32
2.1.2. The aim of the <i>Spiritual Exercises</i> .....	34
2.1.3. Dynamics of the <i>Spiritual Exercises</i> .....	35
2.1.4. Dynamics within a day.....	36
2.1.5. Dynamics within each Week.....	36
2.1.6. Dynamics between Weeks.....	39
2.1.7. Inward Movement and Outward Movement.....	40
2.1.8. Movements ( <i>Mociones</i> ).....	42
2.2. Spiritual conditions reached by the Election.....	43
2.2.1. Conditions to make the Election.....	44
2.2.2. Matters for the Election.....	45
2.2.3. Three times of the Election.....	45
2.3. From Discipleship in the Second and Third Week (an individual process) to the Apostolic Body (a communal process) in the Four Week: Biblical and Christological perspectives.....	47
2.3.1. The biblical perspective of the Fourth Week <i>in the Mysteries</i> <i>of the Life of Christ</i> .....	48
2.3.2. “ <i>El oficio de consolar</i> ”.....	50
2.3.3. Contemplation to Attain Love.....	52
2.3.4. The Genuine Attitude in the Church.....	53
2.3.5. Other communitarian elements in the <i>Spiritual Exercises</i> .....	54

## CHAPTER 3

<b>“Dispersed throughout Christ’s vineyard” [Co 603]: One Apostolic Body in the continuous communal <i>Deliberatio</i> into the present.....</b>	<b>57</b>
3.1. GC 35 – GC 36: From Community to the Discernment in Common.....	58
3.1.1. Community is mission.....	58
3.1.2. <i>Triptych</i> of identity – mission – community.....	59
3.1.3. Discernment in Common – GC 36.....	61

3.1.4. Going back to the origin, the Charism of the Society of Jesus.....	63
3.1.5. Giving witness to the world.....	65
3.1.6. Discernment in Common and returning to the Charism.....	66
3.2. Discernment in Common in the Letters of the Fathers General.....	67
3.2.1. Pedro Arrupe, “On the Communitarian Spiritual Discernment” (25 <sup>th</sup> December 1971).....	67
3.2.2. Peter Kolvenbach, “On Apostolic Discernment in Common” (5 <sup>th</sup> November 1986).....	70
3.2.3. Adolfo Nicolás, “Common Apostolic Discernment” (19 <sup>th</sup> January 2009).....	77
3.2.4. Arturo Sosa, “On Discernment in Common” (27 <sup>th</sup> September 2017).....	80
3.2.5. The Discernment in Common and the Responses to the Sign of Times.....	83
Conclusion.....	87
Bibliography.....	91
Appendix.....	101



## Abbreviations

[between the brackets are the number of the volumes of the general series of MHSI]

### 1. SOURCES

#### 1.1. From the Ignatian writers

- Au* *Autobiography. Acta Patris Ignatii scripta a P. Lud. González de Câmara 1553 - 1555, FN I, Roma 1943, 354-507 (MHSI 66); Munitiz, J. A. - Endean, P., (eds.), Saint Ignatius of Loyola: Personal Writings, Penguin Books, London, 1996 [repr. 2004], 3-64.*
- Co* *The Constitutiones. Monumenta Constitutionum, vol. II Textus Hispanus, Roma 1936 (MHSI 64).*
- Deliberatio* *The Deliberation. Monumenta Constitutionum I, Roma 1934, 1-7 (MHSI 63); MARUCA, D., “The Deliberation of Our First Fathers”, Woodstock Letters 95 (1966), 325-333.*
- Epp* *Letters. Sancti Ignatii de Loyola Societatis Iesu fundatoris epistolae et instructiones (12 vols.), Madrid 1903 — 1911 (repr. 1964-1968) (MHSI 22, 26, 28, 29, 31, 33, 34, 36, 37, 38, 40, 42).*
- Obras* *RUIZ JURADO, M. (ed.), Obras Completas San Ignacio de Loyola, Biblioteca de Autores Critianos, Madrid 2014.*

*Sp. Ex.*            *The Spiritual Exercises. Monumenta Exercitiae*, vol. I Exercitia Spiritualia, Roma 1969 (MHSI 100); GANSS, G. E., *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius*, The Institute of Jesuit Source, Saint Louis 1992.

## 1.2.            From other Ignatian sources

D99                “Part III: The Official of Directory 1599” in *On Giving the Spiritual Exercises: The Early Jesuit Manuscript Directories and the Official Directory of 1599*, Palmer, M. E., (trans. and ed.), the Institute of Jesuit Sources, Saint Louis, 2006.

*FN*                *Fontes Narrativi de S. Ignatio de Loyola et de Societatis Iesu initiis* (4 vols.), Roma 1943-1965 (MHSI 66, 73, 85, 93).

*MCo*              *Monumenta Constitutionum* (I Praevia; II Textus Hispanus; III Textus latinas), Roma 1934-1938 (MHSI 63, 64, 65).

*MEx II*            *Monumenta Exercitiae* (II, Directoria 1540 - 1599), Roma 1955 (MHSI 76).

*MHSI*              *Monumenta Historica Societatis Iesu*.

*Sommervogel*    SOMMERVOGEL, C., *Bibliothèque de la Compagnie de Jésus* (10 vols, Supplément, Tables, Histoire), Paris-Bruxelles, 1890-1932.

## 2. JOURNALS

*AR*                Acta Romana Societatis Iesu. Rome.

*CIS*                Centrum Ignatianum Spiritualitatis. Rome.

*Man*              Manresa. Madrid.

*RIS*                Review of Ignatian Spirituality. Rome.

*SSJ*                Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits. Saint Louis.

*The Way*        The Way. Oxford.

*The Way Sup*    The Way Supplement. Oxford.

## 3. DICTIONARIES AND OTHER MORE CITED WORKS

*Concordancia*    ECHARTE, I. (ed), *Concordancia Ignaciana*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 1996.

*DiccAut*         *Diccionario de Autoridades* (3 vols.), Gredos, Madrid 1990.

<i>DCECH</i>	COROMINAS, J. - PASCUAL, J. A. (dirs.), <i>Diccionario Crítico Etimológico Castellano e Hispánica</i> (6 vols.), Gredos, Madrid 1980 (repr. 1991).
<i>DEI</i>	GRUPO DE ESPIRITUALIDAD IGNACIANA (ed.), <i>Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana</i> , Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007.
<i>DHCJ</i>	O'NEILL, Ch. E. - DOMÍNGUEZ, J. M., (dirs.), <i>Diccionario Histórico de la Compañía de Jesús</i> (4 vols.), IHSI - UPComillas, Roma - Madrid 2001.
<i>TLC</i>	COVARRUBIAS, S. de, <i>Tesoro de la Lengua Castellana</i> (1611), Altafulla, Barcelona 1987.

#### 4. OTHERS

BAC	Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos. Madrid.
ch.	Chapter.
cf.	confer (compare) .
CIS	Centrum Ignatianum Spiritualitatis (ed.) .
collab.	collaborator.
collabs.	Collaborators.
<i>contemplatio</i>	Contemplation to Attain Love (Contemplación para alcanzar amor).
VCII	The Second Vatican Council.
coord.	coordinator.
D	Decree.
dir.	director.
dirs.	directors.
ed.	editor.
eds.	editors.
GC	General Congregation.
GC 31	31 <sup>st</sup> General Congregation of the Society of Jesus.
GC 32	32 <sup>nd</sup> General Congregation of the Society of Jesus.
GC 33	33 <sup>rd</sup> General Congregation of the Society of Jesus.
GC 34	34 <sup>th</sup> General Congregation of the Society of Jesus.
GC 35	35 <sup>th</sup> General Congregation of the Society of Jesus.
GC 36	36 <sup>th</sup> General Congregation of the Society of Jesus.
GCs	General Congregations.

n.	number.
nn.	numbers.
repr.	reprint.
trans.	translated.
UPComillas	Universidad Pontificia Comillas. Madrid.
vol.	volume.
vols.	volumes.

“... after we had diligently expended all human effort, we would then cast all our cares upon the Lord, trusting in Him who is so good and generous.”

- *Deliberatio*, n.1.

## Introduction

When the document of the General Congregation 36 first came out, it was a pleasant surprise to find it looking back to the *First Fathers* of the Society of Jesus and attempting to reclaim the sense of the *discerning community* in the Society. The discernment in common seems to attract much attention as something new that inspires to bring renewal in the spirit of the Charism. GC 36 shows the continuation of the emphasis on the life of community from the GC 35. GC 35 has put a different level of importance on the community life by literally saying that the community is a mission as well. It seems to be timely because with the fast-changing world that is increasingly secular, and with the decline of number of members and vocations to the Society, more so than ever, there is a need for revitalising and refreshing the life in the community. In addition, the discernment in common hits on the fundamental place in terms of the apostolate works of the Society, which should be done according to the reading of the sign of the time, ever seeking the Will of God present in the world. This means that the apostolate works are not done in favour of personal preferences, ideologies, and traditions, but they should be based on the disposition of seeking the Will of God and also doing it. More often than not, the Society has lost this sense of seeking the Will of God as a community, and much more emphasis has been on the obedience.

Nonetheless, since GC 35 and 36, there has been much hope in this new understanding of the Society, much desire to get to know the discernment in common better, and more so, to practise it in the real community, and much longing to realise the original “fire” of the *First*

*Fathers* re-kindled in today's world. Their experience of Venice and Rome<sup>1</sup> also triggered the interest in the *Deliberation* of the *First Fathers* of 1539 and their discernment in common, which initiated the foundation of the Society. Looking back to the origin, the Jesuits seem to find that fire of the *First Fathers* as well as to question the relevance of the past situation to today and how to realise that fire and the discernment in common in today's world.

One positive follow-up from GC 36 is that the long process of the discernment in common for the Universal Apostolic Preferences began and after nearly two years, it has recently born its fruits in its four Preferences for the Society. However, the discernment in common remains not so well known to many people, let alone to Jesuits themselves. As well as the lack of knowledge of the methodology and the process of the discernment in common, often it is the lack of experience itself and the problem of realising it in reality that seems to be the real trouble. Many Jesuits would comment that they have never experienced discernment in common in their formation. Obviously, it is more often talked about than done in practice. Therefore, the question about the discernment in common also leads to the practice, the question of how it could be done; how one can reach the indifference and prepare oneself before an election; and how that could be done not only individually but as a group as well?

This thesis shall attempt to find out about the discernment in common through three different perspectives. Firstly, the *Deliberation* of the *First Fathers* shall be looked at. Initially, it will attempt to follow the footsteps of the spiritual journey of Ignatius of Loyola in order to discover the spiritual source that began all things. Then, it will follow Ignatius gathering his *Friends in the Lord* in Paris and move on to the situation and circumstance that lead to the genesis of the *Deliberatio*. Finally, the text of the *Deliberatio* itself shall be studied, tracing the atmosphere of the discernment as well as the methodology that was employed. It will see the value of this document for the Jesuits as well as for the Church in terms of the transmission of this particular experience of the communal discernment.

In the second chapter, the *Spiritual Exercises* shall be studied to look at its spiritual dynamics that is provoked and inspired in the exercitant, and at the way that one is prepared to make an election by arriving at the Ignatian indifference. The reason for looking at the *Exercises* here is because all *First Fathers* had done the *Exercises* and clearly, they shared the same spiritual

---

<sup>1</sup> GC 36, D.1, n.4; while their frustration of not being able to go to Jerusalem in Venice is true, the later part of discernment for the new direction, that is, the *Deliberation* of the *First Fathers*, occurred in Rome in 1539.

experience that had transformed their outlook of the world, God and oneself in a particular way. With the converted heart and mind, one is also equipped to discern the interior movements, from which one can also discern the Will of God. Thus, the materials and methodology on the Election shall be studied. The *Deliberatio* shall be understood better with the Election as it is the base of their process. Moreover, while the *Exercises* is known for a personal spiritual experience of God and for an individual election, it will be investigated to see the communitarian aspect of the *Exercises*. It is obvious that those who have gone through the *Exercises* do share something in common with each other. This shall call forth the communal elements of the *Exercises* that allow the discernment in common.

Thirdly and lastly, the documents of GCs, especially of GC 35 and 36, and the letters of the Fathers General will be read in order to see the discernment in common and its role in today's world, especially for the Jesuits. GC 35 and 36 have produced documents that are very distinctive from the previous recent GCs. It is more concerned with *how* to do things rather than with what to do as apostolate. It is a surprise that every Father General since Arrupe has written a letter about the discernment in common and that even with such emphasis and articulation, it does not seem to bear much fruit. Through reading the documents and letters, it is hoped to find the place of the discernment in common in the life of the Society today and to recover the sense of vitality with it.

\* \* \*

Nowadays, there are many requests to Jesuits to know and learn more about the discernment in common. The need of the discernment in common is definitely not only for the Society but for the Church in general. Pope Francis has been pointing out the need of discernment in the Christian life and this leads to the Jesuits how they could respond to this need of the Church. Going back to its origin to re-discover its Charism may reinvigorate the initial fire and hopefully, re-ignite the heart of people today. While it may not bring out something totally new in the current research, it is hoped that it may shed some light on the role and place of the discernment in common in the Society of Jesus, as well as in the Church and that it may call to attention of its origin and in turn, its importance.



# Chapter 1

## The *Deliberatio Primorum Patrum*, from *Amigos en el Señor* to the *Societas*

“Religious vocation is not a calling to a way of working, or to a specific activity, or even to a group of nice or friendly people that may attract because of their tasks, ideology, mission or lifestyle. It is a calling to a charism, a gift of the Spirit in history, an invitation to live in a given way - and it is in this *given* where God lets himself be heard by way of consolation”<sup>1</sup>.

During the first half of 1539, ten companions came together to make the *deliberation* regarding their imminent future. Ignatius of Loyola (1491 – 1556) and his “*Friends in the Lord*”<sup>2</sup> were discerning the God’s will for them; whether to maintain to stay as a group even though they may be dispersed, or to be dispersed individually without a special association according to the mission they received from Pope. And then further, if they were to stay together, would they pronounce the vow of obedience to one of their own? The fruit of the deliberation is obvious, in the foundation of the Society of Jesus soon after.

---

<sup>1</sup> GARCÍA DE CASTRO, J., “Alcanzados por Las Fuentes: ¿por qué? ¿cómo?”, *Man* 81 (2009), 311-328. Here, 318.  
<sup>2</sup> *Epp* I, 119 (24 July 1537): *Obras*, 8: a letter to Mosén Juan de Verdolay from Venecia; OSUNA, J., “Amigos en el Señor”, in *DEII*, 143-148.

*Deliberatio Primorum Patrum*<sup>3</sup> contains their story of the communal discernment in the spring of 1539. While theirs is not the original and the only way of the communal discernment, its process and approach has been used not only in the Society of Jesus but in the Church in general throughout the history. In this chapter, the historical context and the journey of the *First Companions* up to the deliberation will be studied. And then it shall move on to the text of *Deliberatio* itself, with the particular interests in the process; namely, the matter for discernment, its methodology and the outcome. It will become soon obvious that they were eager and passionate about seeking God's will for them, individually as well as communally, and they thoroughly and seriously put that desire into action. In their devoted and spiritual manner, they approached this deliberation and their friendship and companionship shines through in the process of the deliberation.

### 1.1. Semantic words of *Deliberatio*

Based on the Ignatian vocabulary of the *Spiritual Exercises*, four of the essential words in the *Deliberatio* shall be looked at. García de Castro reckons that in the time of Ignatius, the anthropological understanding of a soul attributes three powers; understanding (*entendimiento*), memory (*memoria*) and will (*voluntad*). This can be also found from the well-known prayer of the offering, “take and receive [*Sp. Ex.* 234]”, which also includes liberty (*libertad*). In this liberty, one uses three capacities of a soul and it results in certain consequences. With these four elements, a person goes through the *Exercises*, having the particular experience of God<sup>4</sup>. All four words to be considered are linked with the internal action of a person and will be considered in the form of verb. To deliberate (*deliberar*) and to choose (*elegir*) belong to the category of liberty. On the other hand, to discern (*discerner*) belongs to the category of understanding and while it is not mentioned by García, being discreet (*ser discreto*) is also of the faculty of understanding. García finds, through the study of the 118 verbs in the *Exercises*, how Ignatius put an exercitant in various activities through his precise, technical and intentional use of the text, and how these various activities involve all dimensions of a person into a particular spiritual experience.

---

<sup>3</sup> *MCo* I, 1-7.

<sup>4</sup> GARCÍA DE CASTRO, J., “¿Qué hacemos cuando hacemos ejercicios? La actividad del ejercitante a través de sus verbos”, *Man* 74 (2002), 11-40. Here, 13.

### 1.1.1. Deliberation/to deliberate (*deliberación/deliberar*)

According to *DCECH*, “to deliberate (*deliberar*)”<sup>5</sup> means “to consider the pro and the con”, “to resolve” while in *DiccAut*<sup>6</sup>, it means “to discover, consider, premeditate” as well as “to determine, resolve some thing with discourse and advice”. *TLC*<sup>7</sup> states “to determine”.

In the *Exercises*, the noun form *deliberación* appears twice in the First Method of the Third Time of the Election<sup>8</sup> while the verb form *deliberar* appears five times; once in the third point of the second part in the “Call of the King” mediation [*Sp. Ex.* 98], twice in “Three Ways of Being Humble”<sup>9</sup>, once in the fourth rule of the Second Method of the Third Time election [*Sp. Ex.* 187], and once in the rules regarding scruples [*Sp. Ex.* 349].

*Deliberación* implies the liberty prior to the reflection process. It refers to the Election of the Third time<sup>10</sup>, after having discovered and reasoned of all parts [*Sp. Ex.* 182] or having looked and considered various situations and limits<sup>11</sup>. When applied to the setting of a community, it may consider all the communal process of the Election which pays attention to reasons, opinions, and etc, and considers the theme of the Election from all the points of view that the natural and supernatural reason offer<sup>12</sup>.

### 1.1.2. Discernment/to discern (*discernimiento/discernir*)

*DCECH*<sup>13</sup> states its definition as “to separate, distinguish, look, comprehend” and according to *TLC*<sup>14</sup>, “to use to commonly distinguish a thing from the other and to make judgement of them”. According to *DiccAut*<sup>15</sup>, it means “to distinguish one thing from the other, to know and bring sense of the difference between the two things”.

---

<sup>5</sup> *DCECH*, II 440.

<sup>6</sup> *DiccAut*, II 60.

<sup>7</sup> *TCL*, 449.

<sup>8</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 182, 183.

<sup>9</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 165, 166.

<sup>10</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 182, 183, 187.

<sup>11</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 185-187.

<sup>12</sup> JESUITAS ARGENTINA, “La Vida de Comunidad a La Luz de Los Documentos Ignacianos (Argentina)”, in *Dossier “Deliberatio” A*, CIS, Roma 1972, 61-87. Here, 63.

<sup>13</sup> *DCECH*, II 48. “*Cernir*”.

<sup>14</sup> *TLC*, 475.

<sup>15</sup> *DiccAut*, II 295.

Interestingly, the term used to describe the essential element of the Ignatian spirituality is not mentioned neither in the *Exercises* nor the *Constitutions* in the noun form. A matter of fact, not once it is used in the Ignatian texts although the verb form to discern (*discerner*) is used once in the *Exercises* to describe the consolation without cause [*Sp. Ex.* 336].

It is used to differentiate the particular experience of the *Exercises*; the Second Time of the Election, with the Rules of the Discernment of Spirits, ones suitable for the First Week and the others for the Second Week. While it can be used alone, when it is used with various movements (*mociones*), various spirits, experience of consolation and desolation, it refers to one of the experiences of discretion and of the election according to the Second Time but not other times of election and discretion<sup>16</sup>.

### 1.1.3. Election/to choose (*elección/elegir*)

Based on *DCECH*<sup>17</sup>, it means “to pull out”, “to take out”, “to choose”, and “to pick up”. *DiccAut*<sup>18</sup> defines it as “to make a choice on someone or something”, “to choose it and to set it aside for an end with prior knowledge”. *TLC*<sup>19</sup> simply puts “to choose”. The word *Elección* is used 36 times in the *Exercises* and except for four times, it is used in the section about the Election<sup>20</sup>. Meanwhile, the verb form *elegir* is used 21 times and is used more widely out of the Election as it is used ten times within the section about the Election.

The Election in the *Exercises* is to have two prior conditions; first, to choose one that is desired<sup>21</sup>; and second, always to choose according to the end for which we are created<sup>22</sup>. It can refer to all the decision and option taken as the will of God in one’s disposition of life [*Sp. Ex.* 1]. It could also mean the process written in the *Exercises* in order to reach the state of one of the three “Times of the Election” [*Sp. Ex.* 175] while the other one is for the discernment of various spirits and the other for deliberation<sup>23</sup>.

---

<sup>16</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 176; *Dossier “Deliberatio” A*, 62.

<sup>17</sup> *DCECH*, II 551.

<sup>18</sup> *DiccAut*, II 374.

<sup>19</sup> *TLC*, 502.

<sup>20</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 169-189.

<sup>21</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 23, 167, 177, 184.

<sup>22</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 23, 146, 147, 169, 180.

<sup>23</sup> *Dossier “Deliberatio” A*, 62.

#### 1.1.4. Discretion (*discreción/ser discreto*)

*DiccAut*<sup>24</sup> does not have a noun form “*discreción*” but in adjective “*discrete*”, meaning “sensible and of good judgement”, “knowing how to weight up and distinguish things”, and “giving each one its place” while noting it derived from the word *discernir*. Meanwhile, *TLC*<sup>25</sup> has *discreto*, saying that it derived from the verb *discernir*. *Discreción* is mentioned twice, once in the description of the Second Time of the Election [*Sp. Ex.* 176] and the other in the title of the Rules for the Discernment of Spirits for the Second Week [*Sp. Ex.* 328]. The adjective form *discerto* is not used within the *Exercises* but in the *Constitutions*.

The word can be used to refer the various “movements (*mociones*)” or various “spirits”<sup>26</sup>, which coincide with the term “discernment”. But in general, like in the *Constitutions*, we can understand it as the attitude present in all three Times of the Election, and all that results from the application of the rules of spiritual discretion written in the *Exercises*, not only those for the First Week and the Second Week<sup>27</sup>.

## 1.2. The Historic context of the First Companions

### 1.2.1. The birth of the Charism: Manresa

After his conversion in Loyola in 1521, Ignatius began his pilgrimage and at one point arrived at Manresa in 1522. Many find the experience of Manresa<sup>28</sup>, particularly that of Cardoner as the key experience for Ignatius. Arrupe finds that the Ignatian charism starts from the experiences of Ignatius and it is in his trinitarian inner life<sup>29</sup>. The experience in Manresa, particularly at the river Cardoner, is among the three key spiritual experiences that define his trinitarian inner life<sup>30</sup>. Ignatius stayed in Manresa for eleven months and Arrupe divides this period into three stages of his spiritual journey. The first four months involved an

---

<sup>24</sup> *DiccAut*, II 298.

<sup>25</sup> *TLC*, 476.

<sup>26</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 176, 328.

<sup>27</sup> *Dossier “Deliberatio” A*, 62.

<sup>28</sup> *Au* 18-34; MELLONI, J., “Manresa”, in *DEI* II, 1192-1195.

<sup>29</sup> ARRUPE, P., *The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism* (8 February 1980); ARRUPE, P., “L’inspiration Trinitaire Du Charisme Ignatien”, in *AR* XVIII, 115–163, 1980. Here, n.2.

<sup>30</sup> *Ibid.*, n.3; The other two sources of the experiences are in the chapel of La Storta and the *Spiritual Diary*.

ascetic style of life with penance, vigils, and prayers, as “a desert across which blows a fire that purifies his past”<sup>31</sup>. While he was converting from the old life to a new one, he was enjoying spiritual maceration; “in one identical interior state, with largely unvarying happiness, without having any acquaintance with spiritual things within the self [Au 20]”<sup>32</sup>. In the second stage, Ignatius faced the inner turbulence and a time of struggle through scruples and temptations, even of suicide. Through this experience, however, the great inner changes that were distinctive from the previous experiences began [Au 21], and eventually led to the discernment of the different spirits, particularly in terms of consolation and desolation; “since he now had some experience of the difference in kind of spirits through the lessons God had given him, he began to mull over the means through which that spirit had come [Au 25]”. In the third stage, God’s presence was felt in elemental and pictorial representations and God guided and taught Ignatius “as a schoolteacher deals with a child [Au 27]”. From here onward, the Trinity took on an important place in Ignatius’ spiritual life, where the saints used to be; “great devotion to the Most Holy Trinity [Au 28]”. Arrupe states that at this third stage, Ignatius had grown up in maturity and serenity in spirit as well as in the apostolic zeal after the time of penance and desolation in the first two stages in Manresa<sup>33</sup>.

The special experience at the river Cardoner<sup>34</sup>, “an enlightenment so strong [Au 30]”, was truly significant for Ignatius. When others asked him about reasons, he often referred to this experience as reasons for the certain decisions he made, especially during writing the *Constitutions*; “through something that happened to me at Manresa”<sup>35</sup>. This unique mystical experience brought changes in two aspects; firstly, it brought the qualitative change from seeing visions to understanding and knowing [Au 30]; and secondly, the quantitative change was that he received more at this point of life than all in his life combined [Au 30]. Arrupe mentions many earliest references to the *Fontes Narrativo* of the *Monumenta Historica Societatis Iesu* and concludes that all the references regarding the experience at Cardoner clearly claim “the trinitarian content of the vision of the Cardoner, the radicality of the change it worked in Ignatius and its virtual founding of the Society”<sup>36</sup>. Moreover, Arrupe

---

<sup>31</sup> *Ibid.*, n.7.

<sup>32</sup> The English version of *Autography* used in this thesis is; MUNITIZ, J. A. - ENDEAN, P., (eds.), *Saint Ignatius of Loyola: Personal Writings*, Penguin Books, London, 1996 [repr. 2004], 3-64.

<sup>33</sup> ARRUPÉ, *The Trinitarian Inspiration*, n.9.

<sup>34</sup> August or September of 1522. Cf. *Ibid.*, n.10.

<sup>35</sup> Cf. Câmara, *Memoriale*, (17 February 1555), n.137, FN I, 610.

<sup>36</sup> ARRUPÉ, *The Trinitarian Inspiration*, n.14.

puts the further development within Ignatius after the experience; “it is an infused intellectual illumination about the Divine Essence and the Trinity of Persons in a generic way and, more concretely, about two of its operations *ad extra*: the creation and the Incarnation”<sup>37</sup>.

Ultimately, according to Arrupe, the outcome of the experience at Cardoner for Ignatius is like “Damascus was for St. Paul, and the burning bush for Moses”<sup>38</sup>; the extraordinary theophany transforming a person instantly. Ignatius was totally transformed by the experience and became a new person. He now moved away from a solitude and ascetic life and made himself presentable to the society and also followed the normal rhythm of life. It manifests also his inner change, now that he moved out of the individualistic and personal pursue of the spiritual life, towards becoming more communitarian and apostolic. His seeking of companions from then onwards is a great example of this transformation. Arrupe also notes that the pilgrimage to Jerusalem for Ignatius had altered from penances to a meeting with Jesus at His places of birth, apostolic works, and death and resurrection.

However, the most important transformation that Arrupe finds is that Ignatius learned “a methodology for all his further progress”<sup>39</sup>. He quotes Nadal saying, “There he learned to discern spirits”<sup>40</sup>. This methodology of discerning spirits allowed Ignatius to seek the spirits of God among many, and through it, to find the God’s will. He learnt and grew in capacity to seek and respond to the God’s will while he went on into a very ambiguous and open future. Looking further on to the future, this grace at the end of the experience of Cardoner truly ignited the flow and grow of the Charism into the foundation of the Society.

In another perspective, Veale sees this experience of Manresa at the centre of all that Ignatius did afterwards and also of three main documents; the *Autobiography*, the *Spiritual Exercises* and the *Constitutions*<sup>41</sup>. He points out these elements of the experience; The Trinity in relation with the world; sacramental reality of Christ in the Eucharist and the humanity of Christ<sup>42</sup>. All in all, the experience impacted Ignatius the most in seeing the world in relation

---

<sup>37</sup> *Ibid.*, n.17.

<sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*, n.18.

<sup>39</sup> *Ibid.*, n.20.

<sup>40</sup> *Ibid.*; Cf. NADAL, *Dialogi*, n.8; *FN II*, 239.

<sup>41</sup> VEALE, J., “From Exercises to Constitutions a Spirit in Search of a Body”, in *Constitutions of the Society of Jesus, Incorporation of a Spirit*, CIS (ed.), Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, Anand 1993, 3-24. Here, 5.

<sup>42</sup> *Ibid.*, 4.

with the Trinitarian God, human and divine, all connected together<sup>43</sup>. This mystic experience and the vision of the world learned from it is the base of all Ignatian spirituality and also of the Charism of the Society.

Therefore, it is fair to believe that the *Exercises* contains the experience of Manresa at its heart and through it a person can be guided to have the same experience. In his pilgrimage of searching to do God's will, at one point, Ignatius had a change of heart from going solo to looking for companions, in order to share his experience and to live together his way of life. After some failures to find the lasting companions in Barcelona (1525), Alcalá (1526), and Salamanca (1527), in Paris he finally found the lasting companions who would become the co-founders of the Society of Jesus known as the *First Fathers*. They all received the *Exercises* from Ignatius and Pierre Favre<sup>44</sup> (1506 – 1546), and with that shared spirituality, they lived the way of Ignatius and shared the same dream of going to Jerusalem.

### 1.2.2. Theological-spiritual places and its persons

The so-called “*the First Companions*” (*primeros compañeros*) are a group of ten, including Ignatius, studying at the University of Paris between 1528 and 1536. At the end, they founded the Society of Jesus as the first group of Jesuits; thus, also called “*the First Fathers*”. However, the term “*First Companions*” are not found in the Ignatian texts even though the relationship they shared is mentioned with the hint of “companions/companionship”<sup>45</sup>. The formation of this group started when Ignatius moved to Paris in order to further his study.

After his stay and spiritual experience in Manresa, he went to Jerusalem as he had been longing to do so. His intention to stay and “help the souls” at Jerusalem was not approved by the superior who was in charge of the pilgrims. He then moved back to Spain and decided to study in Barcelona. After some time, He moved on to Alcalá and Salamanca. His intention to study was in order to “help the souls” at the time when the inquisition was very active against

---

<sup>43</sup> *Ibid.*, 5.

<sup>44</sup> *Fabri Monumenta: Beati Petri Fabri Epistulae, Memoriale et Processus*, Madrid 1914 [repr. 1972] (MHSI 48); SOMMERVOGEL, “Lefebre, Pierre”, in *Sommervogel IV*, 1657-1658; DONNELLY, J. P., “FABRO (FABER, FAVRE, LE RÈVRE), Pierre”, in *DHCI II*, 1369-1370.; ALBURQUERQUE, A., “FABRO, Pedro”, in *DEI I*, 863-868.

<sup>45</sup> GARCÍA DE CASTRO, J., “Primeros Compañeros”, in *DEI II*, 1481-149. Here, 1481.

*alumbrados*<sup>46</sup> and other movements, and against the converts from Judaism and Islam as well as Protestantism. In such religious atmosphere, the study would make him qualified in teaching the religious and, especially, the spiritual matters. While studying, he also began to look for companions who could share his style of life. There had been some; namely, Calisto de Sa and Lope de Cáceres of Segovia and Juan de Arteaga of Estepa, but their companionship did not last like the “*First Companions*” of Paris<sup>47</sup>.

Ignatius then moved to Paris in order to continue on his studies in Art and Theology. On 2 February 1528, he arrived in Paris. The reason might have been the accusations and the rumours around him at the different cities in Spain, and thus moved away from Spain. It is also in Paris that he changed his name to Ignatius at Collège Sainte-Barbe, mistakenly thinking that it was a variant of Iñigo<sup>48</sup>, his actual name. Anyhow, in Paris, while undergoing his studies, he successfully gathered companions who would continue the journey through to the foundation of the Society of Jesus and onwards. They shared the friendship through conversations, especially of spiritual. They were given the *Exercises* and more importantly shared his style of life with zeal and passion to follow Christ, and to search and to do God’s will.

The first two among them were Pierre Favre and Francisco Xavier<sup>49</sup> (1506-1552). Both of them were from Basque and came to study in Paris in 1525. Later Ignatius came to share the room with them at Collège Sainte-Barbe. Favre and Ignatius soon became very close friends while Xavier resisted for long time the invitation of Ignatius for having the *Exercises* and for the conversion of heart and life. Favre was from Savoy, a shepherd boy from a small village. Ignatius especially helped him out of his religious scruples and perhaps because of his vigorous spiritual struggle, Ignatius noted Favre as the best giver of the exercises<sup>50</sup>. As for Xavier, he came from a noble family with a worldly ambition and outlook. While it took

---

<sup>46</sup> SANZ DE DIEGO, R. M., “Alumbrados”, in *DEI* I, 130-132.

<sup>47</sup> For more details of the experience of Ignatius with Calisto de Sa and Lope de Cáceres of Segovia and Juan de Arteaga of Estépa; GEGER, B., T., “The *First First Companions*: The Continuing Impact of the Men Who Left Ignatius”, *SSJ* 44-2 (2012), 1-38.

<sup>48</sup> O’MALLEY, J., *The First Jesuits*, Harvard University Press, Cambridge 1993. Here, 29.

<sup>49</sup> *Monumenta Xaveriana*, 2 vols., Madrid 1912 (MHSI 67, 68); ALONSO ROMO, E. J., “Javier, Francisco”, in *DEI* II, 1051-1054; LÓPEZ GAY, J., “Javier, Francisco”, in *DHCJ* III, 2140-2141; SOMMERVOGEL, “Xavier, Saint François”, in *Sommervogel* VIII, 1326-1336.

<sup>50</sup> *MEx* II, 113.

some time and a lot of persuasion from Ignatius, finally he received the *Exercises* from Ignatius and converted in September 1534.

In 1533, Ignatius also came across two other Spanish in Paris, Diego Laínez<sup>51</sup> (1512-1565) and Alfonso Salmerón<sup>52</sup> (1515-1585). Both of them were lifelong friends, having studied in Alcalá together for five years<sup>53</sup>. Laínez was from a wealthy family of Castile and was considered “New Christians” even though it was his great-grandfather who had converted from Judaism. He would later become the second Father General in 1558, succeeding Ignatius. Salmerón is not well known and was probably from a relatively humble family. Both received the *Exercises* by Ignatius in early 1534. Then, around the same time in 1534, Nicolás de Bobadilla<sup>54</sup> (1509 – 1590) and Simão Rodrigues<sup>55</sup> (1510-1579) came to join the group. Bobadilla, after having studied in Alcalá and in Valladolid, arrived in Paris in 1533. Rodrigues was from Portugal and had been studying in Paris since 1527. Later both would embroil in the major crises of the Society between 1552 and 1557<sup>56</sup>.

While they were in Paris, they called themselves “*Amigos en el Señor*”, the friends in the Lord<sup>57</sup>. They lived following the style of Ignatius; while studying, also went out to beg for alms, preached and gave catechism, helped at hospitals and did other apostolate works. Favre was the first among the group to be ordained in July 1534. And soon later, on 15 August 1534, seven of them took vows at Montmartre of chastity, which would have been essential as they all intended to become priests, and of poverty, which they were already living it in one way or another. They also vowed to go to Jerusalem to help the souls in the service of Christ, and if that option was not possible, they vowed to offer themselves to Pope,

---

<sup>51</sup> LAÍNEZ, D., *Monumenta Lainii, Epistolae et acta Patris Iacobi Lainii* (8 vols.), Madrid 1912 - 1917 (MHSI 44, 45, 47, 49, 50, 51, 53, 55); ALBURQUERQUE, A., “Laínez, Diego”, in *DEI* II, 1109-1115; SCADUTO, M., “Laínez, Diego”, in *DHCJ* II, 1601-1605; SOMMERVOGEL, “Layneze, Jacques”, in *Sommervogel* IV, 1596-1600.

<sup>52</sup> *Monumenta Salmeronis*, 2 vols., Madrid 1906-1907 (MHSI 30, 32); PARENTE, U., “Salmerón, Alfonso”, in *DEI* II, 1598-1603; SCADUTO, M., “Salmerón, Alfonso”, in *DHCJ* IV, 3474-3476; SOMMERVOGEL, “Salmerón, Alphonse”, in *Sommervogel* VII, 478-483.

<sup>53</sup> O’MALLEY, *op. cit.*, 30-31.

<sup>54</sup> *Monumenta Bobadillae*, Madrid 1913 [repr. 1970] (MHSI 46); BURRIEZA SÁNCHEZ, J., “Alonso Pérez, Nicolás”, in *DEI* III, 227-230; DALMASES, C. de, “Bobadilla, Nicolás”, in *DHCJ* I, 463-465; SOMMERVOGEL, “Bobadilla, Nicolás”, in *Sommervogel* I, 1553-1555.

<sup>55</sup> *Monumenta PP. Broeti, Claudii Jaii, Roderici Joannis Coduri, Simonis Rodericii Societatis Iesu*, Madrid 1903 [repr. 1971] (MHSI 24), 451-517; ALONSO ROMO, E. J., “Rodríguez, Simón”, in *DEI* II, 1574-1577; VAZ DE CARVALHO, J., “Rodrigues, Simão R. de Azevedo”, in *DHCJ* IV, 3390-3392; SOMMERVOGEL, “Rodriguez, Simon”, in *Sommervogel* VI, 1979-1980.

<sup>56</sup> O’MALLEY, *op. cit.*, 31.

<sup>57</sup> GARCÍA DE CASTRO, J., “Comunidad”, in *DEI* I, 362-369. Here, 364; *Epp* I, 119.

considering that Pope would know better the situation of the Church and thus the place with the greater need. However, until this point, none of them were thinking of creating a new religious community, except around this time or later Ignatius might have been pondering with the idea<sup>58</sup>.

Due to his health, Ignatius left Paris and headed to his hometown Loyola in April 1535. The companions decided to meet together in Venice when Ignatius would return, in order to seek to pursue their dream of going to Jerusalem. While Ignatius was away, Favre gathered three more companions. They were all French, namely Paschase Broët<sup>59</sup> (ca. 1500-1562), Jean Codure<sup>60</sup> (1508-1541), and Claude Jay<sup>61</sup> (ca. 1504-1552), and Fabre gave them the *Exercises* himself in 1536. Paschase Broët had been a priest since 1524 and came to Paris at the end of 1532 or the beginning of 1533, in order to study philosophy. He joined the group after the *Exercises*. Jean Codure enrolled in the University of Paris in October of 1534 and also joined the group soon after the *Exercises*. As the last one to join the group, Claude Jay, from Savoy, also came to Collège Sainte-Barbe in October of 1534. He had been a friend of Favre and shared the same tutor Pierre Velliard under whom trained in the Latin and Greek classics.

On 8 January 1537, after leaving Paris November 1536<sup>62</sup>, nine companions arrived at Venice where Ignacio had been waiting for more than a year. On 25 January 1537 they met with Ignatius<sup>63</sup>. It is important to note here that these nine companions seem to have worked well together for over a year when Ignatius was not present among them as a leader. This proves that while Ignatius was indeed a charismatic leader of all but that does not mean that they shared the strong bond of fraternity between them and even without him, they could live,

---

<sup>58</sup> O'MALLEY, *op. cit.*, 32.

<sup>59</sup> *Monumenta PP. Broeti, Claudii Jaii, Roderici Joannis Coduri, Simonis Rodericii Societatis Iesu*, Madrid 1903 [repr. 1971] (MHSI 24), 22-54; GARCÍA DE CASTRO, J., "Broët, Paschasio", in *DEI* I, 246-250; DONNELLY, J. P., "Broët (Brouay), Paschase", in *DHCJ*, I, 552; SOMMERVOGEL, "Broet, Pascase", in *Sommervogel* II, 200.

<sup>60</sup> *Monumenta PP. Broeti, Claudii Jaii, Roderici Joannis Coduri, Simonis Rodericii Societatis Iesu*, Madrid 1903 [repr. 1971] (MHSI 24), 415-433; GARCÍA DE CASTRO, J., "Codure, J", in *DEI* I, 329-331; DALMASES, C. de, "Coduri (codure), Jean", in *DHCJI*, 833.

<sup>61</sup> *Monumenta PP. Broeti, Claudii Jaii, Roderici Joannis Coduri, Simonis Rodericii Societatis Iesu*, Madrid 1903 [repr. 1971] (MHSI 24), 255-405; GARCÍA DE CASTRO, J., "Jayo, Claudio", in *DEI* II, 1054-1061; DALMASES, C. de, "JAY (LE JAY, JAYO), CLAUDE", in *DHCJ* III, 2142-2143; SOMMERVOGEL, "Jay, Claude Le", in *Sommervogel* IV, 765.

<sup>62</sup> GARCÍA DE CASTRO, "Comunidad", 363.

<sup>63</sup> ITURRIOZ, J., "Íñigo de Loyola, universitario", in *Ignacio de Loyola, Magister Artium en París 1528-1535*, Caro Baroja, J. / Beristain, A., (dirs.), Kutxa, San Sebastián, 1991, 379-404. Here, 394.

pray, work and pursue their dream of going to Jerusalem. Here in Venice, Diego de Hoces<sup>64</sup> (c.1490-1537) who was a priest from Málaga, also joined the group after receiving the *Exercises* from Ignatius while he was waiting for others to arrive in Venice. Unfortunately, Hoces died within two years as “the first deceased” of the Society<sup>65</sup>.

On 24 June 1537, six of them, namely Ignacio, Xavier, Laínez, Rodríguez, Bobadilla, Codure and Jayo, were ordained by Vincenzo Nigusanti, Bishop of Arbe, except for Salmerón who was still too young, while the other three were already priests by then; Favre (24 of May 1534), Broët (12 of March 1524) and Hoces (before 1536)<sup>66</sup>. In Venice, they started to call themselves, “*Societas Jesus*”, which would be translated into “*Compañía de Jesús*”<sup>67</sup>. While they were not a religious group, they were held together by the common love of Jesus formed in the *Exercises* and shared the profound friendship and were led by the charism of Ignatius and lived an active apostolic life helping other souls in various ministries.

### 1.2.3. Genesis of the discernment process

At the end, their plan of going to Jerusalem did not materialized when the alliance between Venice and Turkey broke and it was clear that it was impossible to sail across to the Holy Land in the summer of 1537<sup>68</sup>. Following their initial decision, Ignatius, Favre, and Laínez, as representatives of the whole companions, went to offer themselves to Pope Paul III, arriving in Rome at the end of November in 1537. Pope accepted them with delight at the time where the Reformation brought about much trouble and difficulties in the Church, and such educated and decent priests were rare at the time.

The group soon realised that they were to be dispersed with the missions from the Pope; In 1539, Paschase Broët and Simão Rodrigues were to be sent to Siena, Pierre Favre and Diego Laínez to Parma, Nicolás Bobadilla to Naples, and Claude Jay to Brescia; and in 1540, Simão Rodrigues to Portugal, and Francis Xavier to Portugal and then to India. This meant that now they would be dispersed in separate ways to their own missions from the Pope. This

---

<sup>64</sup> DALMASES, C. de, “HOCE (HOZES), Diego”, in *DHCJ* II, 1929.; *Au* 92.

<sup>65</sup> GARCÍA DE CASTRO, “Primeros Compañeros”, 1483.

<sup>66</sup> *Ibid.*, 1486.

<sup>67</sup> O’MALLEY, *op. cit.*, 34.

<sup>68</sup> COSTA, M., “Venecia”, in *DEI* II, 1757-1766. Here, 1764.

realisation brought them to make a communal discernment. It was to seek God's will for them in this new reality that opened up in front of them. From the end of Lent in 1539<sup>69</sup> to the feast of John the Baptist, 24 of June 1539, they vigorously went through the process of communal discernment. The first main concern was whether it was more advantageous to be joined and united into one body and keeping the friendship in the Lord while being dispersed physically, as "one spiritual body with apostolic dispersion". They all by now shared the same way of life, *the way of Ignatius*, and more importantly, they found from each other companionship and friendship in their vocation. Certainly, they felt that it was a common calling for all of them<sup>70</sup>.

#### 1.2.4. Question of true discernment in common or decision of charismatic Ignatius

There is a debate of whether the *Deliberatio* on keeping one body of fraternity and on obedience was truly done as a discernment *in common*. The argument is that Ignatius would have had a greater influence over the others in the process of decision making because of his charism and his role of authority and inspiration on the others' lives so far, and thus, the process would not have been contributed equally from all the members of the *Deliberatio*. The other argument is that Ignatius might have already known personally that it is a God's will to found this religious group with his companions. Jules J. Toner<sup>71</sup> differs his opinion against these two arguments, especially of Ladislav Orsy<sup>72</sup>. Indeed, Ignatius might have had a stronger influence over the others for obvious reasons that he had the special charism to attract others to join the way of life he was leading and also initiated them in the Exercises. However, Toner claims;

"For Ignatius' charism was first to raise in individuals a desire to find and to do God's will, then to give them in the Spiritual Exercises a way of finding his will *for themselves*, not swayed one way or the other by Ignatius or by anyone else while searching for the right

---

<sup>69</sup> That year the Easter was celebrated on 9 April. Joseph Cornwell argues that the date must have been before 25 March 1539; CONWELL, J., "Deliberaciones 1539", in *DEI* I, 549-553. Here, 550.

<sup>70</sup> The version of the English translation of "*Deliberatio Primorum Patrum*" used is: MARUCA, D., "The Deliberation of Our First Fathers", *Woodstock Letters* 95 (1966), 325-333. Here, 1.

<sup>71</sup> TONER, J. J., "Deliberation that started the Jesuits", *SSJ* 6/4 (1974), 179-212.

<sup>72</sup> ORSY, L., "Toward a Theological Evaluation of Communal Discernment", *SSJ* 5/5 (1973), 139-188.

decision. By the same charism, he prepared and led the whole group to search for and to find God's will for the group, he with them in the search"<sup>73</sup>.

This very reasonably describes what may have been the relationship between Ignatius and others. Furthermore, Toner admits that the contribution would not be equal across all members but then the method in the *Deliberatio* demonstrates "equal opportunity to contribute and equal responsibility to contribute whatever one can"<sup>74</sup>. It also does not make sense to see the struggle of difference and diversity in opinions of all involved reported in the *Deliberatio* if Ignatius had already known that it was the will of God to create this religious enterprise. Nonetheless, Toner finds a prophetic role of Ignatius in the process;

"If he played a prophetic role, it was as the prophet who calls others to cleanse their hearts to pray for light, and through religious experience, through use of their reason guided by faith, to find out for themselves what God wants them to do with their lives and to act with freedom in accord with what they find"<sup>75</sup>.

Conclusively, Ignatius was indeed a person with much charism and thus with much influence over the others. However, with this charism Ignatius led the others in searching for God's will in total earnest of each companion in the *Deliberatio*, as he would have wanted to do in his whole life after his conversion.

### 1.3. The *Deliberatio*, the inspiration for the communal discernment

*Deliberatio Primorum Patrum* is the document that contains the process of the communal discernment the *First Fathers* made in Rome in 1539<sup>76</sup>. It outlines not only the content of the discernment but also how, at different stages, they approached the whole discernment process; deciding on the matter to be discerned, deciding on the preparation and the methodology of the discernment, and the conclusion of the discernment. Its method and process of the communal discernment has a lasting impact and importance to the Society and also for the

---

<sup>73</sup> TONER, *op. cit.*, 183.

<sup>74</sup> *Ibid.*, 210.

<sup>75</sup> *Ibid.*, 183-184.

<sup>76</sup> This document is preserved in the handwriting of either Jean Codure or Pierre Favre, while more likely the later. *Deliberatio*, 326.

Church in general, as an instrument of communal discernment. It is also rather an honest and open record of what happened and of what was shared among them; it plainly manifests the difference of opinions and thoughts and the struggle of coming to a conclusion during their communal discernment. However, it is apparent that they all sought, “with the singleness of purpose and intent, ... the gracious design of God’s will”<sup>77</sup>.

### 1.3.1 The First Discernment

#### *a) The Question*

The *First Fathers* came together to talk about the raised question from the new and imminent reality of separation due to the missions from the Pope. This is a direct consequence of what they thought as God’s will for them, namely offering themselves to the Pope to be sent wherever the need is. Thus, the first question that they formed to find the will of God for them was whether to bind themselves together as a group sharing the fraternity even though they are to be sent and dispersed to different missions and to various places, which meant the physical dispersion and the geographical distance.

#### *b) The Methodology*

At first, they could not come to a decision on the “means” due to the diverse opinions and differences. They found themselves in the struggle of reaching to a common decision, especially due to their national and cultural diversity as well as different social classes. However, this diversity and difference did not hinder their desire to seek God’s will for all of them as companions and did not lose sight of the vocation that they shared;

“After a number of such sessions, we found ourselves divided. Some of our group were French, others Spaniards, still others Savoyards or Portuguese; our views and opinions were diversified. We were in perfect accord in singleness of purpose and intent; namely, to discover the gracious design of God’s will within the scope of our vocation. But when it came

---

<sup>77</sup> *Ibid.*, n.1.

to the question of which means would be more efficacious and more fruitful, both for ourselves and for our neighbor, there was a plurality of views”<sup>78</sup>.

Therefore, they decided to prepare their heart more attuned to God as well as readying into the heart of indifference through stronger devotion to prayers, Eucharist, and meditation. This human effort was done with a deep trust in God’s kindness and generosity;

“after we had diligently expended all human effort, we would then cast all our cares upon the Lord, trusting in Him who is so good and generous. ... We were confident that He would in no way fail us, but since His kindness is without measure, He would assist us beyond our fondest hopes and expectations”<sup>79</sup>.

Then, all of them would “embrace as the truer judgement the view which was recommended by the force of stronger arguments and enjoyed a majority of votes”<sup>80</sup>. This means that the view should have good reasons for its argument and that all of them unanimously would accept and follow the decision made by the majority of votes. The minority would accept the decision as the will of God for them, with trust in God’s goodness and kindness that expressed in such a way.

The question they formed to ask was; “would it be more advantageous for us to be so joined and united into one body that no physical separation of our persons, be it ever so great, could divide our hearts? Or, on the contrary, would such an arrangement be not at all desirable?”<sup>81</sup> It is important to note here that it is not about starting something new but rather about whether to continue the existing bond or not.

The first impressive thing in this process of the deliberation is that the *First Fathers* start by, in a way, offering their precious fraternity to God and making a discernment in common together about whether it is God’s will to keep it. It is obvious that “our common calling and the style of life”<sup>82</sup> was cherished and valued very highly and that they acknowledged the goodness of this fraternity is definitely from God and His grace. Therefore, this act of

---

<sup>78</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>79</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>80</sup> *Ibid.*, n.2.

<sup>81</sup> *Ibid.*, n.3.

<sup>82</sup> *Ibid.*, n.1.

discernment demonstrates that they are truly seeking in all their earnest God's will for them, offering everything and not withholding nothing, with a heart of indifference<sup>83</sup>. Toner notes that even the goodness that they shared as God's will from before is put forward again to be discerned again and this flexibility allows us to continue to seek God's will in the ever-changing world<sup>84</sup>.

The other impressive aspect of their attitude towards this deliberation is that while they worked very hard with their own power, possible means and capacity, at the end of the day, it is their trust in God's presence and guidance that was stronger and more decisive. Finally, they decided on the following methodology; all day they would spend time praying, reflecting and meditation on the question and at night, they would come to discussion, each sharing their view and then, would come to a decision by a majority of votes with a stronger argument. With trust in God's kindness and goodness that shall reveal His will for them, they intensely applied themselves with the decided methodology.

Another aspect to note is the fact that "at night each person proposed to the group what he considered the better and more expedient course"<sup>85</sup>, in which each one of them had to speak his view formed through the process of prayer and reflections and his reasons for it. It means that not only a few more vocal and influential persons but all of them would contribute to the deliberation.

### *c) Outcome*

The deliberation came to an end rather quickly, on the first night of discussion. They would accept that the fraternal bond they shared was not of their own but from God who had united and bound them together; 'since our most merciful and affectionate Lord had seen fit to assemble and bind us to one another – we who are so frail and from such diverse national and cultural backgrounds – we ought not to sever what God has united and bound together'<sup>86</sup>. Moreover, now that they acknowledged the fraternal bond as God's gift to them, they would go further, to strength the bond of union, as one body, by making more efforts to know of

---

<sup>83</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 23, 170.

<sup>84</sup> TONER, *op. cit.*, 191-192.

<sup>85</sup> *Deliberatio*, n.2.

<sup>86</sup> *Ibid.*, n.3.

each other and to have more concern for each other; “with each passing day we ought to confirm and strengthen the bond of union, forming ourselves into a single body”<sup>87</sup>. Indeed, by working on this single body, they find their spiritual power intensified and strengthened when united<sup>88</sup>.

Furthermore, it is acknowledged that this decision was not a fruit of human effort and reasoning, but it is because they “simply assented to whatever the Lord inspired and the Apostolic See subsequently confirmed and approved”<sup>89</sup>. Through them, God worked to reveal His will on their future and path to be taken.

Coming to a decision on the first night is admirable. More so, after the decision, their effort to get to know each other, and to have more concern and love for the other is quite moving. The realisation that the fraternal bond they shared was not of their own but from God who invigorates them to cultivate a deeper and more genuine fraternity with each other, was a fruit of the discernment in common.

### 1.3.2. The Second Discernment

#### *a) Question*

The companions then reminded themselves of having already pronounced the vows of chastity and poverty<sup>90</sup>, and now, ask themselves whether it would be more beneficial to take a vow of obedience to one of their members. This meant that the vow of obedience shall not be limited to the apostolic work but also other aspects of life. This also implicitly meant that the fraternity that they shared would turn into a religious group and would eventually accept new members to follow this way of proceeding. It is also a very natural step in the thinking process after deciding on keeping their fraternal bond<sup>91</sup>.

#### *b) Methodology*

---

<sup>87</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>88</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>89</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>90</sup> Because of their ordination to priesthood. See chapter 1.2.1.

<sup>91</sup> TONER, *op. cit.*, 194.

Following the method of the first discernment, they spent many days with prayers, reflection and discussion but it was fruitless. However, with trust in God, they kept on seeking ways, not losing their sight on the main question.

Therefore, they came to consider for a new methodology and they considered three options; first, everyone withdraws to remote places for thirty to forty days in order to devote themselves to prayers and meditation, fasting and penance; second, in the name of the whole group, three to four would do such a retreat; and third, no one goes into the seclusion but everyone continues to engage the usual works while spending the half of the day with the question in hand, praying, meditating and reflecting.

Here we can note that having a group of representatives to make the discernment and decision for the whole group was also an option, and this means that they thought it as a legitimate option as a way of discernment in common. This example may be found alive in the form of consultants for a local community as well as in the level of the provincial, the conference and the curia.

At the end, they came to a decision that all were to stay and remain in Rome for two reasons; firstly, they were concerned on gossip and scandal of the people who would assume their absence in thoughtless judgement; and secondly, they wished to maintain the existing apostolates for their benefits<sup>92</sup>. When that was decided, they settled on further three steps of preparation; first, everyone should try to come to peace and joy in the Holy Spirit about the vow of obedience, through personal prayers, Eucharist, and meditations; second, they were not to talk with each other about this topic in order to have an individual opinion that derives from his own personal prayers and meditations; and third, they were to think themselves not as one of the companions, that is, to consider oneself as an outsider of the group.

Through these three steps of preparation, we can see their efforts to be indifferent and to seek the will of God wholeheartedly with the conditions of heart and soul that are achieved through the election of the location and the said preparations. Regarding the first step about the vow of obedience, they made efforts to dispose themselves that they “would rather obey

---

<sup>92</sup> *Deliberatio*, n.6.

than command”<sup>93</sup>. Through this act, they would have sought to become more indifferent and perhaps many were more inclined to command because to be indifferent and be as if in the middle of the balance, we are to seek the opposite<sup>94</sup>. And through the second step, they intended to listen and feel where God is calling each of them without influence of the other human factors around<sup>95</sup>. Finally, the third step reminds us of the second rule of the Second Method in the Third Time of the Election [*Sp. Ex.* 185], where one imagines as a third person to give an advice to a person who is in the same situation as I am.

Then, for many days, they came together after having prepared themselves by following the steps of the preparation and each one of them shared only about the advantages of taking the vow of obedience on one day<sup>96</sup>, and then only about its disadvantages on the other day. It is important to note that each one of them contributed, and they were to argue only for either advantages or disadvantages at one time<sup>97</sup>. This means that they did not intend to hurry and finish on one point on one day but took their time to share thoroughly the reasons that they had arrived at through prayers, meditations and reflections. Another remarkable thing is that this sharing of contribution of each one of the members involved in the deliberation is not a usual argument where one argues for a point while the other argues against it. Everyone involved should argue only for the point that is considered, as if that is their own preference. They are “to support every alternative actively and sympathetically”<sup>98</sup>. The *Deliberatio* illustrates in details of the reasons and arguments that had been put forth on the advantages and disadvantages, in rather frank and raw way. It also demonstrates that the deliberation took many days with conflicting views and opinions. However, we are left blind-sided as it recounts without names of contributors, that is to say, there are no clues to suppose who is the one making a certain point. Neither is it known how much of the contribution is of Ignatius.

---

<sup>93</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>94</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 16, 157, 179.

<sup>95</sup> Cf. *Sp. Ex.* 15. The giver should not interfere between God and the exercitant and let God influence the exercitant directly and between them.

<sup>96</sup> Toner argues that there is no concrete reason to believe that we must start with the disadvantages rather than advantages but in this case, they just happened to start with points on disadvantages. TONER, *op. cit.*, 301.

<sup>97</sup> *Deliberatio*, n.7.

<sup>98</sup> TONER, *op. cit.*, 203.

### c) Outcome

Finally, with the unanimous consent, they came to a decision at the end; “it would be more advantageous and even essential for us to vow obedience to one of our number”<sup>99</sup>. The most notable aspect here is that the decision came to be “with the help of God”<sup>100</sup>, and this means that while they all approached this deliberation with all seriousness and sincerity and had put much effort in it, it is God, through the Holy Spirit, who guided them and led them to this decision. This decision is said to be made “without a single dissenting voice”<sup>101</sup> and since there is no mention of altering the methodology, it can be assumed that it was unanimous vote for the vow of obedience to a member.

Their decision had three purposes; first, in this way, they could pursue the will of God in all things better; second, the *Compañía* could be preserved more securely; and third, the individual spiritual and temporal matters could be better served and provided properly. Thus, after around three months of the deliberation, the *First Fathers* had come to a conclusion that consequently resulted in creating a religious order. The end was marked by a consolation, “in a spirit of perfect harmony” and they noted that it was a fruit of their rigorous efforts in searching with God’s help<sup>102</sup>.

#### 1.3.3. The true nature of the *communal* discernment

##### a) Desire to search for the will of God

The *Deliberatio* does not record only the questions that they discerned together and the answers that they had arrived at but also the process of the whole deliberation. It narrates in this remarkably frank way of the process and in turn, it offers us a significant value of learning about the discernment in common. One may find in their honest quest to seek the will of God the diversity that the *First Fathers* represent. Their nationalities, cultures, ages, social classes, and opinions were so different that the writer of *Deliberatio* mentions very

---

<sup>99</sup> *Deliberatio*, n.8.

<sup>100</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>101</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>102</sup> *Ibid.*, n.9.

early on about this difference and diversity<sup>103</sup>. And then in the process of discussion of advantages and disadvantages, their differing opinions and thoughts are laid bare<sup>104</sup>. The one thing that helped them through the seemingly impossible process of reaching a decision is perhaps their desire to do God's will by finding it first.

Another point that helped them was the methodology of the discernment in common. The process reveals how the process has certain elements from the *Exercises* as already mentioned above in the investigation of the text. Interestingly, they also sought and discerned on the methodology of discernment while in the process when the previously agreed methodology did not work. They started with a very concrete question – yes or no question – and then tried one method of the election. When they failed with that method, they discerned together which method would be more suitable. Then, they would come up with clear steps of the process.

#### *b) Fraternity*

The *Deliberatio* is a fascinating document to see through the process of the deliberation among the *First Fathers* and also to feel and grasp what was more of importance for them. Among many things in this discernment is the fact that throughout the process of the deliberation, they seem to manifest the importance of fraternity and bond of union that was shared with each other. They take that friendship and companionship as a gift from God and came around to see it to be strengthened, with more knowledge of each other and also with more concern for each other.

Even more astonishing is the fact that at the first discernment, they would let go of this friendship too, as if to offer it back to God, in order to be truly indifferent seeking God's will for the group. This reminds of the image of Abraham leading his only son Isaac as an offering, and also of the well-known prayer in the *Exercises*, “*take and receive*”. This act of sincere and humble search of God's will brought them back to see the friendship that they shared was indeed God's gift and it should be appreciated even more; this was expressed in

---

<sup>103</sup> *Ibid.*, n.1.

<sup>104</sup> *Ibid.*, n.6.

the fruit of the first discernment, in which would cultivate the fraternity more and would work to grow in concern for each other.

What they shared with each other and had in common was not only the style of life, following the way of Ignatius at the time, and the spirituality of Ignatius through the *Exercises*, but also the strong and close friendship, more precisely, the friendship in the Lord. This friendship was stronger than the differences that they had individually, culturally, and in terms of nationality. In addition, it would be good to notice here the change of heart of Ignatius, “the second conversion”<sup>105</sup> – from going solo to seeking for companions in his journey in the Lord, and how through it, with God’s help, he came to bear so many great fruits.

More precisely, this friendship and the sense of community is revealed through the wording of *Deliberatio*. It constantly refers to “us” and uses the verb form of the first-person plural, “we did something”. e.g. “*determinamos*”, “*concluimos*”, “*determináramos*”, “*decidiéramos*”<sup>106</sup>. Thus, the discernment that started the process of foundation of the Society came about through the discernment *in common*, of the ten *First Fathers*. This brings a different perspective into the life of Jesuits in the Society where often and usually Ignatius of Loyola is considered as its sole founder. Having co-founders provides an insight into the initial Charism of the Society. Their friendship, love and concern for each other, their desire to serve God by seeking God’s will and their desire to live according the way of Ignatius were all significant, if not essential, elements. The discernment in common, in turn, is a prominent tool for Jesuits to live out the Charism of the first fathers, with the same desire to serve God, to seek God’s will, to live sharing the same way of proceeding with fellow Jesuits.

---

<sup>105</sup> GARCÍA DE CASTRO, “Primeros Compañeros”, 1481.

<sup>106</sup> Cf. FABRE, P., “The Writings of Ignatius of Loyola as Seminal Text”, in *A Companion to Ignatius of Loyola: Life, Writings, Spirituality, Influence*, Maryks, R. A., (ed.), Brill, Leiden 2014, 103-122. Here, 108.

\* \* \*

It is an extraordinary journey of Ignatius of Loyola; from a soldier to an obvious leader of a group of ten young men from various backgrounds to found a brand new religious order. His profound spiritual experience after the conversion led a life of solitude in a more ascetic manner in Manresa where he went through many intense spiritual experiences and grew deeper into this spiritual life. Later on, he began to look for companions to share his way of life. From his experience, he collected materials for prayers and meditations, which later is known as the *Spiritual Exercises*. After some failures and mishaps, starting from his stay in Paris, he gave the *Exercises* to those who were attracted to his way of life and also to those who were very resistant initially but turned around with the effort of Ignatius. And these men shared the life style and the dream with Ignatius and became the so-called *friends in the Lord*.

Further on, they became the *companions of Jesus*, as He is the head of the group and the central figure of their life. Their dream of going to Jerusalem did not come to a reality and their alternative plan of offering themselves to Pope to be sent for any mission led to a great consequence. That was the physical dispersion to various places. Faced with this new reality the *companions of Jesus* came together to seek and find God's will for them, as a group, whether to maintain this fraternity while dispersed or not. That discernment in common was handed down to us as a document called *Deliberatio* and it provides their methodology and process they went through during the three months of discernment together.

The pneumatological movement of Ignatius of Loyola in this journey is genuinely impressive in terms of how God has led him through his desire and effort of finding God's will. Firstly, it was a personal journey; being able to distinguish different spirits, going through severe ascetic penance, receiving the profound grace at Cordero, and seeking to get educated. Later on, slowly and gradually, there had been a movement toward a communitarian life and seeking companions. The shared friendship and companionship in living the same spirituality and the style of life grew more and more, so that by the time they were at the *Deliberatio*, they saw the fraternity that they shared was truly a gift from God to all of them. And the fruit of that deliberation led to initiate a movement of founding a new style of a religious order, the Society of Jesus. It would be very interesting to investigate further on the development of this pneumatological movement onto the *Constitutions*, especially how the elements of the

discernment in common in the *Deliberatio* go on to be elements of the *Constitutions* such as parts on the General Congregation. For this work, the focus shall remain within this boundary of the *Deliberatio*.



## Chapter 2

### The *Spiritual Exercises*: the Ignatian Charism into the *Deliberatio*

“Love consists in a mutual communication  
between the two persons”<sup>1</sup>.

The *Spiritual Exercises* can be viewed as the fruit of the spiritual experience of Ignatius in his journey with God. Based on his own mystical experiences, most notably in Manresa, he thought that it would also be helpful for others, thus recorded and collected them into this book [*Au* 18]. The book itself is a sort of manual that by following the guided meditations and prayers, with the accompaniment of the experienced person, ideally for a month of time, the exercitant shall have such an intense experience of God that he/she will desire to follow Jesus with the ordered heart and desires. Through the whole experience, he/she is also equipped with the ability to discern the movement (*mociones*) of the spirits and the will of God. Thus, at the end, with indifference and desire to serve God by doing His Will, he/she is prepared with a disposition of heart to go out to the world with Christ.

It is through the *Exercises* that Ignatius and the *First Fathers* shared together this converted heart, with a certain spirituality of the understanding of God, oneself and the world<sup>2</sup>. It is

---

<sup>1</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 231.

<sup>2</sup> Everyone had received the *Exercises* by Ignatius and Favre. cf. Ch.1, 1.2.1.

indeed the source of the Charism of the Society of Jesus that still flows through it to today. In this chapter, the general dynamics of the *Exercises* will be looked into, followed by the Election and the conditions for making a good election. Then, the communal aspect of the *Spiritual Exercises* shall be investigated as it is often thought as personal and individual in terms of experience and spirituality.

## 2.1. The Dynamics<sup>3</sup> of the Exercises

### 2.1.1. Some principle elements of The *Spiritual Exercises*

Fleming uses an analogy of an exercise book in order to demonstrate the active involvement of a person. An exercise book is not a text book that is to be read in order to learn its content. It is where the active use of the content occurs, and in the case of the *Exercises*, the exercises are done in relation with God, especially through stories of Jesus in the Gospel<sup>4</sup>. In another word, it is not for reading and learning the content but for following the instruction and putting it into action, in this case, of considering, meditation, contemplating, and examining. In doing so, the *Exercises* cannot be done alone but it clearly states the need of accompaniment with the one who gives the *Exercises* (*el que da los ejercicios*) [*Sp. Ex.* 1]. It is obvious that the *Exercises* giver should have received the *Exercises* in the ideal length of a month. There are directories in addition to the annotations, notes and rules in the *Exercises* itself, which give guidelines and suggestions on how to give and receive the *Exercises*. Here, some principle elements of the *Exercises* shall be noted.

---

<sup>3</sup> Here the word *dynamics* shall be used to describe the general spiritual flow of the exercitant according Fleming; cf. FLEMING, D. L., *Like the Lightning: the Dynamics of the Ignatian Exercises*, the Institute of Jesuit Sources, Saint Louis, 2004. García Domínguez uses *proceso* to describe the same aspect of the Exercises and it seems to mean a progressive and linear process in translation to English; cf. GARCÍA DOMÍNGUEZ, L. M., “Acompañar un proceso espiritual”, in *La Entrevista en Los Ejercicios Espirituales*, García Domínguez, L. M., Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2010, 133-164. The word *Dynamics* may bring more overall flow, not only in linear but in various ways. Meanwhile, in his study of the text of the Exercises, López Hortelano finds this dynamic to be more circular than lineal, and to be helicoidal; cf. LÓPEZ HORTELANO, E., “Los ejercicios espirituales de san Ignacio. Análisis del texto como proceso helicoidal y especular”, *Estudios Eclesiásticos* 93/364 (2018), 131-163. Here, 139.

<sup>4</sup> FLEMING, *Like the Lightning*, 9.

Firstly, the *Exercises* starts with twenty *anotaciones* (introductory explanations<sup>5</sup>; some preliminary helps<sup>6</sup>), which introduce the *Exercises* and set out some guidelines for the exercitant and for the *Exercises* giver. One essential element here is how the adaptation plays a very significant role in giving the *Exercises* according to the person who receives them. It is based on an Ignatian principle that God works in each one of us intimately and distinctively<sup>7</sup>. Therefore, the *Exercises* giver should note that his/her experience is not the same as the others and should not expect the same flow or dynamics from others either.

Secondly, there is an active engagement of three-way conversation between God, “the one who gives the *Exercises* (*el que da los ejercicios*)” and “the one who receives the *Exercises* (*el que recibe los ejercicios*)”. In the Ignatian use of the active phrases, especially in the use of verbs, rather than nouns in describing the persons involved in the *Exercises* manifests the activity of relationship in the *Exercises*. Anyhow, God is the Creator and Lord who will lead and guide the exercitant and the *Exercises* giver should not get in the way between those two<sup>8</sup>. Moreover, it is also important to note that the text of the *Exercises* itself plays a special role of stirring up and stimulating this three-way conversation.

Thirdly, the *Spiritual Exercises* means literally *exercising spiritually*, like physical exercises [*Sp. Ex.* 1]. As there are various ways and types of physical exercises, there are various kinds of spiritual exercises, such as examination of conscience, meditation, contemplation, vocal or mental prayer, the Eucharist, spiritual reading, spiritual accompaniment and conversation, etc<sup>9</sup>. Other activities like walking in nature and listening to music can also help us to connect with God who is ever present in all things. In such way, all the activities of a day in the

---

<sup>5</sup> The title in English version of Ganss; GANSS, G. E., *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius*, The Institute of Jesuit Source, Saint Louis 1992. In this thesis, this English version will be used throughout.

<sup>6</sup> The title in English, the contemporary reading version of Fleming, FLEMING, D. L., *Draw Me into Your Friendship: The Spiritual Exercises A Literal Translation & A Contemporary Reading*, The Institute of Jesuit Sources, Saint Louis 1996.

<sup>7</sup> FLEMING, *Like the Lightning*, 11.

<sup>8</sup> “The one giving the Exercises ought not to lean or incline in either direction but rather, while standing by like the pointer of a scale in equilibrium, to allow the Creator to deal immediately with the creature and the creature with its Creator and Lord.” [*Sp. Ex.* 15].

<sup>9</sup> In one of the contemporary take on the *Exercises*, Tim Muldon uses the image of gym and its dominant importance for people of today in a term “*work out*” in place of “*exercises*” in order to express the dimension of activity for health and growth; MULDON, T., *The Ignatian Workout: daily spiritual exercises for a healthy faith*, Loyola Press, Chicago 2004.

*Exercises* should be considered and reflected on as how God is present and communicates to us, in addition to the typical prayer exercises in the given day<sup>10</sup>.

Finally, the book itself does not have an actual ending. There is no conclusion to the experience of the *Exercises* nor to the book itself. Finishing a month of the *Exercises* is not the end of the *Exercises* but what has been experienced and learnt in it should be carried on to the ordinary, daily life. The Contemplation to Attain Love helps us to see and find the actively present God in the world, and through the *Exercises*, one is more disposed and open to the call and invitation of God, and shall be able to more generously respond to the Will of God. The sense of “for the greater glory of God” grows in one and it leads one to continue its journey of labouring, that is, exercising, with Christ<sup>11</sup>.

### 2.1.2. The aim of the *Spiritual Exercises*

In the text of the *Exercises*, its end is described as “preparing and disposing our soul to rid itself of all its disordered affections and then, after their removal, [...] seeking and finding God’s will in the ordering of our life for the salvation of our soul [*Sp. Ex.* 1]” and “to overcome oneself, and to order one’s life, without reaching a decision through some disordered affection [*Sp. Ex.* 21]”. There are three groups that interpret the text differently. Firstly, so-called “electionists” such as Grandmaison argues that the end of the *Exercises* is to prepare a person to make a wise election of a state of life in which one can serve God the best. Secondly, so-called “perfectionists” such as Peeters, claims that the end and the culminating point is the intimate union with God. Thirdly, Guibert thinks that these two ends are complementary, not mutually exclusive. Ganss seems to agree on Guibert that the text clearly states the end as to assist in making a good decision, but Ignatius’ use of the *Exercises* for Xavier and Favre also shows its end for union with God<sup>12</sup>. In other words, the *Exercises* introduces the exercitant into two dynamics that are intertwined and mutually connected; on one hand, the intimate union with God through following Jesus by making discernment and election to do so; and on the other, ordering oneself from the disordered affections. Both

---

<sup>10</sup> FLEMING, *Like the Lightning*, 12.

<sup>11</sup> *Ibid.*, 14.

<sup>12</sup> GANSS, *op. cit.*, 147. Cf. *Obras* puts it in a similar way; firstly, the system of prepare and dispose the soul properly ordered in order to be able to love and serve God in all things (Casanovas, Calveras); secondly, a school of prayer as means of intimate union with God (Peeters); thirdly, the election (Hummelauer, Iglesias, Grandmaison). Orlandis have the election with wider sense that it becomes like the first. *Obras*, 154.

dynamics are inevitably connected in that each other requires the other to move forward and grow in the journey of life with God.

### 2.1.3. Dynamics of the *Spiritual Exercises*

The exercitant going through the *Exercises* would go through certain *dynamics* of the *Exercises*. *Dynamics* here may mean two aspects; “pattern of change or growth” and “forces related to motion and to balance”<sup>13</sup>. It is not the content itself, but through the use of the content, one may go through movement, development or growth in terms of insights and affections. While using the term process (*proceso*), García Domínguez states the Ignatian spiritual process has two aspects; firstly, an objective process that the text proposes in the spiritual itinerary with the arranged character of the experience and a series of parts that form in the determined order (*modo y orden*); and secondly, a subjective process which the exercitant goes through personally according to his/her particular situation while following the itinerary according to the objective process<sup>14</sup>. This dynamic also has a pedagogical mode in that God guides and teaches the exercitant “gently (*suavemente*)” as if a teacher teaches a child [*Au 27*].

Moreover, in the dynamics of the *Exercises*, the anthropological development of a person may be understood in its progressive process. It requires firstly, a certain growth in affection, that is, in the capacity to love maturely; secondly, a certain growth in cognition; thirdly, a certain growth in morality; and finally, a growth in the capacity to be motivated by altruistic, generous and universal motives. Furthermore, the *Exercises* demands the qualitative change of mind and heart, and mental, affective and relational adaptation to the new reality. As a result, the *Exercises* can be truly completed when the previous ways of a person – manner of knowing, loving and acting – is broken in some ways that can incorporate the new truth is constructed<sup>15</sup>. Within the *Exercises*, there are three levels of dynamics; dynamics with a day, dynamics within each Week and dynamics between Weeks<sup>16</sup>.

---

<sup>13</sup> FLEMING, *Like the Lightning*, 16.

<sup>14</sup> GARCÍA DOMÍNGUEZ, *op. cit.*, 134-135.

<sup>15</sup> *Ibid.*, 139-140.

<sup>16</sup> cf. FLEMING, *Like the Lightning*, 15-28. Here, 17; GARCÍA DOMÍNGUEZ, 133-164. Here, 140.

#### 2.1.4. Dynamics within a day

Each day the exercitant will pray five times and generally has a structure of two prayers, two repetitions and then application of senses. The first two prayers are given with the content according to the day of a Week. Then, the following repetition prayers are without particular prayer content, but Ignatius invites the exercitant to return and to pray on certain moments of the previous prayers “where [the exercitant] felt greater consolation or desolation or had a greater spiritual experience [*Sp. Ex.* 62]”. And then, in the Second, Third and Fourth Weeks, the fifth prayer of the day is application of senses except for the First Week. This prayer asks to absorb the world with our senses, in an attentively passive way. Fleming finds that this structure of five prayers gradually move from actively working to actively passive towards quieting down and deepening movement<sup>17</sup>, and that this is constant throughout the *Exercises* except for the Fourth Day of the Second Week<sup>18</sup>. In addition, each prayer should be followed by examen, in which one looks back at and reflects on the movements (*mociones*) within the prayer<sup>19</sup>.

#### 2.1.5. Dynamics within each Week

As Ignatius has indicated, a Week is not a week of seven days but can be depended on the flow of the exercitant [*Sp. Ex.* 6]. Fleming claims that like the movement in a day of the *Exercises*, a movement within a Week is a progression from greater activity at the beginning to quieter and more passive at the end<sup>20</sup>.

##### a) *The First Week*

In the First Week, it follows the general structure of a day but in the place of the application of senses, there is a meditation on hell<sup>21</sup>. Like the usual final prayer of a day, application of

---

<sup>17</sup> FLEMING, *Like the Lightning*, 18-19.

<sup>18</sup> *Ibid.*, 20.

<sup>19</sup> The exercitant learns to be aware the inner movement (*mociones*) throughout the *Exercises* and the prayers are exercises that may provoke the movements. In this discretion of the movements/spirits, we can discern how God is leading us and what is the will of God for us. Here lies the importance of movements. Thus, it makes sense when Ignatius recommends to ask questions to the exercitant if there is no movement in prayers [*Sp. Ex.* 6].

<sup>20</sup> FLEMING, *Like the Lightning*, 20.

<sup>21</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 65-71.

senses, this meditation suggests the exercitant to be actively passive in the experience of hell, using each sense to make it as real and concrete experience<sup>22</sup>. The Principle and Foundation is introduced and involves a consideration style of prayer while the prayer contents of the Week ask for the meditation style. Through the Week, one shall get to know oneself better and to have reconciliation with oneself and with God, having the spiritual change. The renewed self-knowledge, one's role in the world, and the deep sources of self-esteem shall lead to see everything as gifts of God and to enable to offer it to God completely<sup>23</sup>.

*b) The Second Week*

While four Weeks generally have the same dynamics within each of them, the Second Week presents certain disruptions. During the first days of the Week, the Ignatian contemplation is introduced, which is distinctive from the meditation style of the first two prayer content of the First Week and also from the consideration style of the Principle and Foundation and the Call of the King<sup>24</sup>. In the style of the Ignatian contemplation, Jesus is contemplated with mostly biblical sources. On the contrary, on the Fourth Day, all prayers are back to the meditation style. Two prayers are given with the same prayer points, which is rare because it is not a repetition prayer and normally two prayers are given with its own prayer points. Then, usual two repetitions are proposed. The following fifth prayer is a meditation called Three Types of Persons<sup>25</sup>. Fleming finds that this Fourth Day is distinctive from other days for having all prayers in the meditation style and for being actively engaged all day long<sup>26</sup>.

In addition, on the Fifth Day, the materials on the Election<sup>27</sup> is introduced with the Three Degrees of Humility<sup>28</sup> [*Sp. Ex.* 163]. These materials are additional to the usual prayers of a day, to be considered and pondered upon. As time goes by with prayers and considerations, one would find oneself closer to the third degree of humility, more intimate with Christ and to be able to choose for Christ. It would be a proper response to the Call of the King<sup>29</sup>. In the meditation at the start of the Second Week, Christ the King, in the image of a medieval court,

---

<sup>22</sup> FLEMING, *Like the Lightning*, 19.

<sup>23</sup> GARCÍA DOMÍNGUEZ, *op. cit.*, 149.

<sup>24</sup> FLEMING, *Like the Lightning*, 20.

<sup>25</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 149-157.

<sup>26</sup> FLEMING, *Like the Lightning*, 21.

<sup>27</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 169-189.

<sup>28</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 165-168.

<sup>29</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 91-98.

invites all to come and join him, to conquer and spread the Good News to all the earth and every nation. This meditation serves us to place oneself next to Christ and to labour with Him, being prepared to dispose oneself to follow wherever He goes and to do whatever is asked of us. The Election is a response to this personal calling of Christ and through the Second Week, one shall be disposed and prepared to answer it in one's particular situation.

Furthermore, the meditation of the Two Standards<sup>30</sup> holds the key for the discernment on *how* to follow and labour with Christ. It gives the three criteria that contrast with those of the world; namely, "first, poverty as opposed to riches, second, insults and contempt as opposed to worldly fame, and thirdly humility as opposed to pride [*Sp. Ex.* 146]". It is the way that Christ Jesus invites us to proclaim as the way of Christ. Responding to the call of Christ the King, now we have the criteria on *how* to make discernment what is the way together with Him in the mission.

#### *c) The Third Week*

The Third Week retains the basic format of a day with the contemplation style with two prayer contents, two repetitions and application of senses. However, Ignatius offers freedom to choose optional alternatives, especially regarding the last three days of the Week. One option is to read the passion narrative in two parts over two days and then as a whole on the third day, while the other option is to pray on distinctive prayer contents at each prayer period without repetitions nor application of the senses, and to read the whole passion on the final day of the Week [*Sp. Ex.* 209]. At the end of the Week, there is the Rules to Order Oneself Henceforth in the Taking of Food<sup>31</sup>.

#### *d) the Fourth Week*

While the Fourth Week follows the general movement from greater activeness to quietness, Ignatius suggests to have a prayer content on each prayer period, without repetitions but with application of senses as the last prayer. He also proposes to have four exercises a day rather than the usual five. This is a dramatic change in comparison to the beginning when only two

---

<sup>30</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 136-148.

<sup>31</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 210-217.

prayer contents for a day are given. With more prayer contents a day, each prayer now has two more prayer points with each prayer period on top of that. This may be because the single focus of the Week is Jesus as Consoler and it may not burden too much<sup>32</sup>. It is also interesting to note that Ignatius offers more freedom now to the exercitant on the selections of prayer points [*Sp. Ex.* 228]. It appears that after experience of the three Weeks, one is prepared to sense the inner movements and make decisions on his/her own regarding prayer points.

The Contemplation to Attain Love<sup>33</sup> is offered at the end of the Fourth Week in the text but without any indication how it is to be integrated within the Week. Traditionally, it has been given on the last days of the Week. Another option is to have the *contemplatio* as the final prayer point of each day in the Week, with the possibility of having the whole content as prayer points on the final day<sup>34</sup>. Fleming sees this *contemplatio* as a continuity between the activity of the Risen Jesus as a consoler and the day to day activity of God as source of love<sup>35</sup>. Unlike the other Weeks, the Fourth Week does not have a clear conclusion while all four Weeks share the general dynamics from activeness to quietness. However, in this way, the Fourth Week, by the role of bridge in the *contemplatio*, leads one back into the real world, with a new perspective and converted heart with the experience of the *Exercises*.

#### 2.1.6. Dynamics between Weeks

The graces that are asked in prayers in each Week inform of what needs to be desired and in turn, what would be the fruits of the prayers. The First Week shall result in the experience of the grace of being gifted, sinful and forgiven, and loved after seeing the nature of original, common and personal sins and experiencing the forgiveness of God in Christ. With a renewed sense of self in the relationship with God, the Second Week comes the experience of closer in friendship with Jesus, that is to say, to serve and labour with Jesus, through contemplations on life of Jesus as well as the original Ignatian prayers such as the Call of the King, Two Standards, Three Types of Persons, and Three Degrees of Humility, and the

---

<sup>32</sup> FLEMING, *Like the Lightning*, 22.

<sup>33</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 230-237.

<sup>34</sup> FLEMING, *Like the Lightning*, 22.

<sup>35</sup> *Ibid.*

mentals on the Election. The Election would affirm one's disposition to follow Jesus after searching for the God's will for oneself.

In the Third Week, the exercitant shall stop *doing* things with Jesus but move beyond it and start *being/staying* with Jesus through the Passion and death. Here the focus is not the activity of Jesus but what is happening to him. This will deepen the relationship with Jesus, in one's helplessness and powerlessness while trying to be with Jesus in the Passion. The exercitant is invited to be with Jesus compassionately, that is, as the word *com-passion* means, to suffer together. Fleming considers that this graced experience of compassion enables one to enter into deeper relationship with Jesus, which in turn, reorders the values about apostolate works and activities with Him<sup>36</sup>. On the other hand, some find that the grace in the Third Week is confirmation of the Second Week and the Election within it.

Finally, the Fourth Week leads the way to Jesus the Consoler after the experience of the Passion. As the exercitant has compassionately stood by Christ in his Passion in the Third Week, now it is the risen Jesus' turn to console with compassion in whatever circumstances he/she may be. Through the *contemplatio*, a new dynamic is initiated with the experience of the active and labouring omnipresence of God that prepares one to go out of the *Exercises* into the world, with the increased trust in God's love and grace. In this *contemplatio*, one recognises that it is the same presence of God who has been present in the experiences of various movements throughout the four Weeks<sup>37</sup>.

#### 2.1.7. Inward Movement and Outward Movement

Another way of looking at the movement of the *Exercises* can be seen in terms of the direction of one's attention and focus. In the First Week, the exercitant shall look into oneself, introspection and reflection about one's life while in the following three Weeks, the attention and focus are entirely on Jesus.

---

<sup>36</sup> *Ibid.*, 25.

<sup>37</sup> *Ibid.*, 24-26.

*a) Inward Movement: The First Week and then towards following Jesus Christ*

Throughout the First Week, the exercitant contemplates on sin and disorder, and reflects back on one's own life. This involves looking into some of dark and sinful moments of life and of things that need to be reconciled and forgiven, that is, to be ordered. However, while this Week may involve feeling of heaviness and darkness because of the introspect into our sin and disorder, it also consists of the experience of forgiveness and mercy of God. In the first *exercise*, there is a colloquy to be made imagining Christ suspended on the cross before the exercitant, and it invites the exercitant to converse with Him on various questions, including "What have I done for Christ? What am I doing for Christ? What ought I to do for Christ? [*Sp. Ex. 53*]". This forms an important reflection, like a mirror, with the Third Week where the exercitant will face with the crucified Jesus but by that time in the Third Week, the exercitant would have journeyed through the Second and Third Week and there would be a stronger sense of bond and intimacy with Jesus.

Therefore, an image of the First Week may be a spiral inward movement into oneself, looking into and reflecting upon one's life and its history, especially about sin and disorder. The Colloquy provides a springboard that from the Second Week, the movement would be spiral outward movement from oneself, with the focus of the attention moved to Jesus. The attention of the exercitant will follow Jesus through His life, Death and Resurrection up to the Fourth Week.

*b) Outward Movement from the Second Week Onward: The desires that are sought leading up to the Fourth Week*

It is obvious that Jesus Christ is the centre of prayers, especially continuously from the Second Week until the Fourth Week. It is doubtlessly manifested by the continuation of the petitions of what is desired of the exercises. In the Second Week, the desired grace is "to ask for an interior knowledge of Our Lord [*Sp. Ex. 104*]"; in the Third Week, "sorrow with Christ in sorrow; a broken spirit with Christ so broken; tears; and interior suffering because of the great suffering which Christ endured for me [*Sp. Ex. 203*]"; and in the Fourth Week, "to ask for the grace to be glad and to rejoice intensely because of the great glory and joy of Christ our Lord [*Sp. Ex. 221*]".

In each Week, the desire sought is to have the intense intimacy and association with Jesus Christ our Lord in one form or another. In the Second Week, the exercitant journeys with Jesus throughout His life from the very beginning, the incarnation onward, and gets to know Him more internally, and then, in the Third Week, the suffering and pain are shared with Jesus in His Passion and Death. The exercitant desires to be with Jesus in this difficult moment, going through the same feelings and experiences of Jesus. Finally, in the Fourth Week, the exercitant is to celebrate with the Risen Jesus, sharing the joy and glory with Him.

Retrospectively, this continuation of desires through the Third and Fourth Weeks displays Ignatius' invitation to imitate and share with the Eternal King; "whoever wishes to come with me must labor with me, so that through following me in the pain he or she may follow me also in the glory [*Sp. Ex. 95*]"<sup>38</sup>. The exercitant journeys through the Death and the Resurrection of Jesus in both His pain and glory, intimately associating with Him and sharing the experience in a more profound way.

#### 2.1.8. Movements (*Mociones*)

*Mocion* is a very Ignatian term to describe the interior movement. It was not commonly used among the spiritual writers in Spanish. *DCECH* defines it as "movement" in the Sixteenth Century<sup>39</sup>. According to Ignatius, there are three kinds of thoughts; "one kind is my own, which arises strictly from my own freedom and desire; and the other two come from outside myself, the one from the good spirit and the other from the evil [*Sp. Ex. 32*]"<sup>40</sup>. The movement is of these thoughts, but for Ignatius, these thoughts are not only strictly rational but also include the production of ideas; such as, imagination, fantasy, and the contents brought up by memories<sup>40</sup>. Thus, the movement is very complex and it refers to "the interactions of feelings, thoughts, and impulses of attractions and recoil, which occur spontaneously in consciousness"<sup>41</sup>. It should be noted that feelings are also part of thoughts and movements for Ignatius.

---

<sup>38</sup> GANSS, *op. cit.*, 179. Emphasis mine.

<sup>39</sup> *DCECH*, IV 170.

<sup>40</sup> GARCÍA DE CASTRO, J., "Moción", *DEI* II, 1265-1268. Here, 1265; Cf. *Au* 7.

<sup>41</sup> IVENS, M., *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, Gracewing Publishing, Wiltshire 1998, 210.

Ignatius started to distinguish the different movements within him when he was in the sickbed in Loyola. He noticed that some thoughts led to sadness while the others to happiness and saw the causes as from the demon and from God [Au 8]. Later, he developed the hermeneutical formula of consolation and desolation, and it becomes the criteria for finding the Will of God. He refined his experiences and findings of these spiritual movements into two sets of rules regarding discernment of the spirits<sup>42</sup> in the *Exercises*, especially for the First Week and the Second Week. Another finding of Ignatius is that a thought, a movement, has an orientation, that is, it has a goal and desired point of arrival. Through reviewing the beginning, middle and the end of the movements, one can discern whether the thought/movement is from God or the enemy of the human nature<sup>43</sup>.

Therefore, within the *Exercises*, the exercitant learns to be more aware of the movement within him/herself and by learning so, he/she is much more attuned to what is happening within and then to how God is leading him/her as well as how the enemy of human nature tricks and ensnares. In another words, throughout the *Exercises*, the meditations, contemplations, and considerations provoke and inspire certain interior movements. In this sense, the exercitants is truly exercising interiorly, and through these movements, one is to be more aware of God's presence and guidance. This enables a person to sense and see the direction to which God is leading one, that is to say, to discern the Will of God.

## 2.2. Spiritual conditions reached by the Election

The *Spiritual Exercises* offers a powerful tool for making a decision through the election and discernment of spirits. Especially, the part on the Election in the Second Week is the base of any discernment whether it be a state of life or any significant decision to be made. Certainly, we can trace the use of the methodology of the Election in the *Deliberatio* of the *First Fathers*. To make a good election, the exercitant should be prepared in certain conditions as well as having certain capacities. The methodology of the Election in the *Exercises* shall also be looked at.

---

<sup>42</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 313-336.

<sup>43</sup> *Cf. Sp. Ex.* 333, 334.

### 2.2.1. Conditions to make the Election

To make a good election, Ignatius emphasises on the concentrated focus on “the purpose for which I am created, to praise God our Lord and to save my soul [*Sp. Ex.* 169.2]”. His attention to this purpose insists to distinguish well between the means and the end; we are to choose the end, not the means that may seem like the end. The disordered attachments can cause this; one may not desire to serve God directly but instead one desires for God to come to their disordered attachments and in turn, create a confusion between the means and the end in the election [*Sp. Ex.* 169.6]. Therefore, before making an election, one should have in his/her sight only on “the service and praise of God our Lord and the eternal salvation of my soul [*Sp. Ex.* 169.8]”. This prompts back the Principle and Foundation and its certain themes; the end with which human being is created, indifference regarding the use of things, and desiring and choosing one that is more conducive to the end<sup>44</sup>. Trust in the Holy Spirit who assigns a person into his/her proper place according to God’s will<sup>45</sup> shall assist to reach the required indifference [D99 164].

In Chapter 23<sup>46</sup> of the *Official Directory of 1599*, it states the condition of the exercitant who are to engage in the election. Firstly, the character and capacity of the exercitant; the exercitant should not be incapable of high perfection, such as being fickle and inconsistent, and should not have unmastered passions and bad habits. Secondly, the exercitant him/herself should desire and request the election. Thirdly, the exercitant should be free from the disordered affections and should be indifferent to all things, only to seek to follow God’s will. To obtain this, he/she should have the third degree of humility or at least the second degree. The meditations of the Two Standards and Three Classes of Persons should assist to reach this kind of indifferent disposition. If there is no indifference, the election would not achieve its fruit. Fourthly, the best disposition is that the exercitant does not incline to the earthly possessions and constantly seeks to incline towards which is more perfect. The *Exercises* suggests the more perfect way one should desire the most and ask God of. Finally, one should enter into an inward reflection where; firstly, one should only focus on this matter with the

---

<sup>44</sup> Respectively, *Sp. Ex.* 23.2, 23.5, 23.7.

<sup>45</sup> Cf. “Now there are varieties of gifts, but the same Spirit; and there are varieties of services, but the same Lord; and there are varieties of activities, but it is the same God who activates all of them in everyone.” 1 Cor 12:4-6. New Revised Standard Version, Anglicised Catholic Edition is used.

<sup>46</sup> D99, 169-173.

whole effort and attention exclusively while setting aside everything else; and secondly, one should not admit considerations other than of heaven and of God. In any case, a perfect election is an election that is motivated entirely by love of God.

### 2.2.2. Matters for the Election

Ignatius clearly states what matter can undergo the process of the election. Firstly, all the matters should be indifferent or good, in aligned with the Church. They cannot be intrinsically bad or opposed to the Church [*Sp. Ex.* 170.2]. In this way, Ignatius seems to indicate that this method of making an election can be used for much wider matters than marriage and priesthood that are explicitly stated. Secondly, the election is distinguished into two groups; an unchangeable election and a changeable election [*Sp. Ex.* 171]. Regarding the unchangeable election, such as marriage and priesthood, once the election is made, then there is no further election to be made, that is, there cannot be any change. If the election is not made properly with disordered affections, one can only repent the bad decision and consider how to lead a good life within the decision that has been already made [*Sp. Ex.* 172.2]. Ignatius considers that this kind of bad election is not a divine vocation for a vocation is from God and is pure without mingling of disordered affections [*Sp. Ex.* 172.5]. On the other hand, regarding the changeable election, if an election is made well already, it does not need a new election, but one should seek perfection within the election made [*Sp. Ex.* 173]. However, if a bad election has been made and one wishes better fruits from it, one can make a new election in a properly ordered way [*Sp. Ex.* 174].

### 2.2.3. Three times of the Election

On the Fourth Day of the Second Week, the introduction of the Election on the state of life [*Sp. Ex.* 135] is offered, followed by meditations on the Two Standards<sup>47</sup> and the Three Classes of Persons<sup>48</sup>. On the Fifth Day, points on the Making of an Election<sup>49</sup> can be given with the Three Ways of Being Humble<sup>50</sup>. In it, Ignatius suggests three different times to make

---

<sup>47</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 136-148.

<sup>48</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 149-157.

<sup>49</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 169-189.

<sup>50</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 165-168.

a good election. It is called “times” to indicate those moments when one experiences the certain movements described in those “times”<sup>51</sup>.

*a) The First time*

This is when God moves and draws a person into His Will without a doubt or being unable to doubt. The biblical examples may be St. Paul<sup>52</sup> and St. Matthew (Mt 9:9). This does not occur often in practice but cannot be excluded.

*b) The Second time*

This time is when one can receive sufficient clarity on the election through the experience of movements (*mociones*) – consolations and desolations – and the discernment of spirits<sup>53</sup>. There are dangers of illusion or self-deception in this time and so it may be advisable to take the reasoning method of the Third time in order to be certain and to confirm.

*c) The Third time*

This is when one is in tranquillity and is able to use his/her reasoning in freedom and peace. When an election is not carried out in the First nor in the Second time, Ignatius suggests two methods in this Third time. The First Method is for the matter of a changeable Election [*Sp. Ex.* 178.3]. Firstly, being indifferent and without any disordered affection, one should find oneself “in the middle, like the pointer of a balance” in order to choose more for the glory and praise of God and the salvation of one’s soul [*Sp. Ex.* 179]. Then, one should ask for God’s grace to be able to use reasoning and intellect to choose in conformity with God’s will [*Sp. Ex.* 180]. Now, one should consider advantages and disadvantages of the matter in hand, such as having the office, and then consider again advantages and disadvantages of the opposite of the matter, here, not having the office [*Sp. Ex.* 181]. After that, one should see to which side the reasoning inclines more and according to the greater motion raised from reasoning, one should come to a decision [*Sp. Ex.* 182]. Here the motion of reasoning

---

<sup>51</sup> D99, 187.

<sup>52</sup> Acts 9:6, 15; 22:21; 26:17-18.

<sup>53</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 313-336.

(*moción racional*) is distinguished from the sensual motion (*moción sensual*). There are respectively motions that arise from human intellect and that arise from sensitive human nature. It is motions from one's own activities, different from motions that arise from God<sup>54</sup>. Finally, when the election is made, one should pray and offer the decision to God to receive and confirm it [*Sp. Ex.* 183]. Regardless of Times and Methods, this final act of praying and offering to God is an integral part of the election process.

Next, for the Second Method, foremostly, one should remind oneself of the love of God from which one can decide on the matter. That love moves and brings one to decide on the matter and is essential in choosing entirely for the sake of our Creator and Lord [*Sp. Ex.* 184]. Then, Ignatius offers three ways to see the matter in different ways. Firstly, one imagines a total stranger, and wishing him/her all perfection, one considers how he/she would advise and persuade the other person to elect for the greater glory of God and the greater perfection of soul [*Sp. Ex.* 185]. Secondly, one imagines oneself in a death bed and considers how he/she would reflect back on the present election and how he/she would wish the election had been made [*Sp. Ex.* 186]. Thirdly, imagining the judgement day, one considers how he/she wishes he/she had made the election [*Sp. Ex.* 187]. Finally, through the above considerations, one would come to a decision and as in the First Method, one should offer it to God [*Sp. Ex.* 188].

### 2.3. From Discipleship in the Second and Third Week (an individual process) to the Apostolic Body (a communal process) in the Four Week: Biblical and Christological perspectives

It may seem that the *Spiritual Exercises* is principally for individuals through the intense spiritual experience that involves the union with Christ and ordering of oneself with discernment of spirits, and that it does not contain much in the sense of community. This part would briefly attempt to see if there is any communitarian characteristic in the *Exercises*, and also a sense of common mission in it. It will look into the Fourth Week, especially the points on *the Mysteries of the Life of Christ, the office of consoler, the Contemplation to Attain Love, and the Genuine Attitude in the Church*. The hope is to see that the intense personal spiritual

---

<sup>54</sup> GANSS, *op. cit.*, 178.

experience does not hold one into its own world but propels out to others with a sense of desire to share what one has received.

### 2.3.1. The biblical perspective of the Fourth Week *in the Mysteries of the Life of Christ*

The Fourth Week of the *Exercises* is original and unique. In the time of Ignatius in the Sixteenth Century, much devotion and attention in the life of Jesus was focused on the Passion. This rather new attention to the risen Jesus brings originality of Ignatius and the Pascal mystery is fully appreciated while the full journey of Jesus on earth with His disciples come to completion. In this Week, the prayer points in the *Mysteries of Life of Christ* follow the apparitions of the Risen Jesus<sup>55</sup>. While the points are not originally made of Ignatius<sup>56</sup>, but through his selections of the particular bible verses about the Resurrection, the sense of community and mission is visible through these points on the apparitions<sup>57</sup>.

There are prayer points on thirteen apparitions and the Ascension. Except for the first Apparition to Mary and the twelfth Apparition to Joseph of Arimathea, which are based on *Vita Christi* by Ludolph, all points are based on the bible verses from the New Testament. On one hand, let us look at the persons to whom the Risen Jesus appeared to. Except four occasions of Mary, Peter, James and Joseph of Arimathea<sup>58</sup>, all the apparitions are to a group of persons or to a community<sup>59</sup>. It is important to remember here that as Jesus approached the last supper with His beloved disciples, He loved those till the end<sup>60</sup>. And His love did not end with His death on the cross but it continues on after His Resurrection. It is apparent that the story of the risen Jesus involves all the people with whom Jesus spent his journey and time before his death.

---

<sup>55</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 299-312.

<sup>56</sup> Throughout the Weeks in the *Exercises*, especially from the Second to the Fourth, there are prayer points, that is, *exercises*, with the Gospel verses about Jesus. Often times, they are not in the chronological order in the Gospel itself but takes a different order. One reason may be a notable influence of *Vita Christi* by a Carthusian monk Ludolfo de Sajonia (+1377) on Ignatius. It is the book that he read in the sickbed in Loyola alongside with the life of saints [*Sp. Ex.* 5]. Anyhow, at the end, it is Ignatius who had arranged the prayer points in such a way that would invoke movements (*mociones*) within the soul of the one who receives the *Exercises*. Ganss notes that almost all points in the Mysteries of life of Christ are from *Vita Christi* and are also in the same order as in it. GANSS, *op. cit.* 188.

<sup>57</sup> See the table “The Mysteries of Christ’s Life - The Risen Life” in the Appendix A for the following section.

<sup>58</sup> Respectively *Sp. Ex.* 299, 302, 309, 310.

<sup>59</sup> There are some apparitions that are mainly focused on a particular person, but he is also accompanied by others present in the scenes of the bible verses. cf. Thomas and other disciples [*Sp. Ex.* 305], and Peter and seven other disciples [*Sp. Ex.* 306].

<sup>60</sup> Jn 13:1.

In addition, more often than not there is a sense of being sent and being given a mission after the encounter with the risen Jesus and it often involves being back with the community. For example, Emmaus<sup>61</sup> tells a beautiful story of two disciples having encountered the risen Jesus while walking away from Jerusalem and the new life of discipleship that started with Jesus and going back to their home and to their old life. However, after the encounter, they realised how their hearts were on fire after being taught about the necessity of the Passion and death of Christ, and went back to Jerusalem and to their companions, their community. The other example may be three Marys<sup>62</sup> who encounter the risen Jesus and are asked to go back to the community and tell the others about the Resurrection. Obviously, the two evident aspects of the stories of Easter are community and mission. The Biblical Easter stories inevitably involves these two elements. In the commentary on the Resurrection stories in the Gospel of Luke, Brendan Byrne points out how the evangelist Luke creates a story by first narrating experiences of individuals or groups separately, and then bring all together to share with each other their own stories. In this way, Byrne notes, individual experience becomes community experience<sup>63</sup>. As such, it is without doubt that the Easter stories in the Bible itself contains such aspects of community and mission. Nonetheless, it should be born in mind that from the Bible, *Vita Christi*, and its Easter stories, Ignatius chose these points with his own intention in the flow of the *Exercises*. Thus, the Fourth Week inevitably shares the theme and grace of the Easter stories in the Bible, that is, community and mission.

Furthermore, according to Guillén, in the Fourth Week, Ignatius invites to contemplate the mysteries of the Resurrection up to the Ascension [*Sp. Ex.* 226] and in this way, the exercitants shall end with hearing what the disciples had heard; “you will be my witnesses in Jerusalem, in all Judea and Samaria, and to the ends of the earth”<sup>64</sup>. Guillén notes that the exercitant shall return back to their ordinary life with a sense of mission and now equipped with a new vision<sup>65</sup>.

---

<sup>61</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 303; Lk 24:13-35; this is also a great example of the risen Jesus as “consoler” and of what kind of consolation he brings.

<sup>62</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 301; Mt 28:8-10.

<sup>63</sup> BYRNE, B., *The Hospitality of God: A Reading of Luke’s Gospel*, Liturgical Press, Collegeville 2000, 203.

<sup>64</sup> Acts 1:8.

<sup>65</sup> GUILLÉN, A., “Directorio breve sobre la Cuarta Semana”, *Man* 88 (2016), 189-192. Here, 192.

### 2.3.2. “*El oficio de consolar*”

As the fifth point of an exercise in the Fourth Week, Ignatius suggests to “consider *the office of consoler* which Christ our Lord carries out”<sup>66</sup> [*Sp. Ex.* 224]. Ganss observes that the Fourth Week does not focus upon the Resurrection itself but on the risen Christ Himself and on how He appears to His loved ones and communicates to them the joy and grace as well as consolations to them as friends would do to each other<sup>67</sup>. It is this act of the risen Jesus that *the office of consoler* indicates. When the disciples of Emmaus said of their heart on fire, it is a clear realisation in the sense of the Ignatian consolation, which is the increased sense of faith, hope and love [*Sp. Ex.* 316.3]. Gray pays attention to the risen Jesus sharing joy and consoling others. Indeed, when He returned from death, He did not accuse and got even with the disciples who had fled and had abandoned Him alone through the Passion and Death. Rather, He looked for them and consoled them, sharing His joy and glory with them<sup>68</sup>. The risen Jesus is a continuing presence of Jesus even through the death, sharing the same humanity as us.

It would be beneficial to remind ourselves that this risen Jesus, through his acting *the office of consoler*, provides the sense of community back to His loved ones, disciples whom He loved till the end, and also sends them to a mission, to share that joy and consolation with others. Therefore, when the exercitant prays upon this fifth point during the Fourth Week, Ignatius is inviting to do the same work, *the office of consoler*, at one’s own community and as a mission. Most of all, Gray finds that as the risen Christ is united with the humanity again, the grace of the Fourth Week is the union with Christ<sup>69</sup>. As mentioned before, from the Second Week, the intimacy and association with Jesus leads to this union with Christ in the Fourth Week. This union leads us into a community and sends us out to a mission.

Moreover, the consolation outlined in the third rule of the Rules of Discernment of Spirits [*Sp. Ex.* 316] can be understood in the trinitarian perspective. In it, “Creator and Lord” is mentioned twice at the start [*Sp. Ex.* 316.1] and at the end [*Sp. Ex.* 316.3] and obviously refers to the only God. “Lord” appears twice [ *Sp. Ex.* 316.2] and clearly points to Christ.

---

<sup>66</sup> Emphasis mine.

<sup>67</sup> GANSS, *op. cit.*, 182; *Sp. Ex.* 224.

<sup>68</sup> GRAY, H. J., “Joy and friendship in the Fourth Week”, *The Way Sup* 99 (2000) 11-21. Here, 19.

<sup>69</sup> *Ibid.*

Three paragraphs of the rule seem to indicate each of the Trinity and its characteristics. The first paragraph describes how the consolation comes down to the exercitant from the Creator and His creation through the love of God. Here, the Creator and Lord points to the Father as the creation as His work implies that. God, in his self-giving, gives himself in the creation, which in turn, shall arise our own self-giving back to God, in the creation – in the reality and in the human history<sup>70</sup>. In the second paragraph evidently directs to Jesus, especially to His salvific work in the Passion. The tears of regret and grief over one's sins, which leads to the increase of love to Christ, are apparent signs of the consolation as well as tears over the Passion of Christ. Other things that lead us closer to His service and praise are also the consolation. While the creation leads us to God as loved creatures, it is interesting to note that Jesus brings us to the Father as His children, anticipating the immersion into the trinitarian life<sup>71</sup>. Finally, the third paragraph suggests the Holy Spirit even though it is not explicitly stated<sup>72</sup>. It is the Holy Spirit that increases three Christian virtues, namely hope, faith and charity; that invokes within our soul to desire of the things of heaven while on earth; that brings peace and quietness in our Creator and Lord. Thus, the consolation as understood by Ignatius is indeed trinitarian.

In addition, according to the office of consoler, for Ignatius, it is the risen Jesus that brings consolation. Arzubialde finds that the office of consoler in the risen Jesus is to grant the Holy Spirit that comes from God the Father<sup>73</sup>. While Ignatius does not mention the Holy Spirit, he indirectly points to it by referring to the effects of the Resurrection and its gifts; namely, admiration, happiness and joy. These are manifested by the disciples who witnessed the risen Jesus. In contemplation of the Fourth Week, the exercitant would experience the Spirit and its gifts, especially the consolation, by entering into the reality of the Spirit in the life of the risen Christ. Arzubialde also finds the trinitarian and pneumatological sense in the Fourth Week and in its happiness of the pascal consolation. This Spirit consists in true happiness of the Resurrection of Christ and in faithful communion of Jesus with the Father by the Love<sup>74</sup>. This trinitarian perspective and sense that is introduced and nurtured in the Fourth Week shall

---

<sup>70</sup> CORELLA, J., "Consolación", in *DEI I*, 413-424. Here, 418.

<sup>71</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>72</sup> The absence of the Holy Spirit in the Exercises generates interests, considering the major process within it is the discernment of spirits. For more on this theme; CODINA, V., "A Silent Presence the Holy Spirit in the Ignatian Exercises", *EIDES* 6 (2016), 5-36.

<sup>73</sup> ARZUBIALDE, S., *Ejercicios Espirituales de S. Ignacio: Historia y Análisis*, (2nd ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2009, 551-552.

<sup>74</sup> *Ibid.*

prepare the exercitant to live the life in the Spirit, intimately connected to God the Father in the creation, that is, the reality of human history, and to the risen Jesus who is ever present to consoler. This in turn enables him/her to fulfil one's own mission to share and give oneself to others and to a community.

### 2.3.3. Contemplation to Attain Love

The exercitant will come close to the end of the *Exercises* and may end with the Contemplation to Attain Love<sup>75</sup>, as a conclusion to the long journey. Interestingly, Ignatius seems to put aside Pentecost in these mysteries. Ganss suggests that the reason for it is that as the title states, it is about "The Mysteries of the Life of Christ our Lord". Meanwhile, Polanco mentioned that Pentecost was under the heading Resurrection at one point<sup>76</sup>. Some argue that this *contemplatio* is in place of the Pentecost while the others say that this is the climax of the *Exercises*. Nonetheless, as Ganss puts it, it plays a significant role as a bridge between the intense spiritual experience of the *Exercises* and the ordinary life that awaits the exercitant.

First, as mentioned before, through the Second, Third, and Fourth Weeks, the exercitant would have grown in intimacy and association with Christ. The Ignatian way of saying this would be the internal knowledge of Christ. Now, in the *contemplatio*, there is growing internal knowledge of God who gives abundantly in all the creatures and in the world as well as in our own history of life. God's this immanence in all the creatures and in the world is indeed the great expression of love of God for us<sup>77</sup>. This internal knowledge of God's love leads to the sense of gratitude, which in turn prepares the heart of the exercitant into a disposition of *to love and serve in all things* [*Sp. Ex.* 233]. With that kind of disposition of heart, one can go on to say the following prayer with the whole heart, "*take and receive*" [*Sp. Ex.* 234]. Moreover, the understanding of love according to Ignatius at the beginning of the *contemplatio* lays the foundation of such relationship between the exercitant and God; that "love consists in a mutual communication between the two persons [*Sp. Ex.* 231]". The growth in love in God entails giving and receiving what one has with another, which assumes not an individual but a people, a community.

---

<sup>75</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 230-237.

<sup>76</sup> GANSS, *op. cit.*, 189.

<sup>77</sup> *Ibid.*, 185.

At the end of the *Exercises*, thus, its dynamic moves the exercitant's heart and disposition from to love Christ more towards to love God more in all things through this *contemplatio*. Surely, in such a way, the exercitant is ready to embark into the reality of everyday life, carrying the intense spiritual union with Christ and love for Him, while now the exercitant is equipped with a tool to see and feel and experience the presence of God in all things and to love Him back. Thus, the *contemplatio* becomes a bridge that assists the continuation of the experience of the Exercises into the ordinary life<sup>78</sup>.

#### 2.3.4. The Genuine Attitude in the Church

At the end of the book, we have a set of rules for “a true habitual attitude of mind” in which we should have in the Church “to have the genuine attitude which we out to maintain in the Church militant [*Sp. Ex.* 352]”<sup>79</sup>. Guillén provides a very inviting view into the rules, that is, this set of rules are not rules to be obeyed but it is more like rules to guide for discernment.<sup>80</sup>

Guillén points out the importance of the usage of “praise” in the rules; it is not to be understood as “some blanket approval” of the Church, but “a call to recognise the working of the Spirit in them”<sup>81</sup>. Ignatius is asking us to see how the Holy Spirit is working in the Church, in all its members and in its structure. This opens us up to see and accept the presence of God in different opinions, points of view and perspectives within the Church. “Laying aside all judgement of our own, we should keep our minds disposed and ready to obey in everything the bride of Christ our Lord, which is our holy mother the hierarchical<sup>82</sup> Church [*Sp. Ex.* 353]” holds the key to this understanding<sup>83</sup>. This “laying aside all judgement of our own”, keeping “our minds disposed and ready to obey in everything”, invite us to be indifferent in the discernment with the Church.

For Guillén, the placement of the rules at the end of the *Exercises* seems to be very significant in terms of the personal experience of the exercitant of the thirty days. After

---

<sup>78</sup> *Ibid.*, 184.

<sup>79</sup> *Ibid.*, 197.

<sup>80</sup> GUILLÉN, A., “Praise: The Fundamental Attitude in the Church”, *The Way* 52/2 (2013), 101-112. Here, 102.

<sup>81</sup> *Ibid.*, 105.

<sup>82</sup> Guillén notes that ‘the hierarchical Church’ here means ‘Church incorporates the mediations’, not ‘Church hierarchy’. *Ibid.*, 106.

<sup>83</sup> *Ibid.*

looking into oneself and discovering one's own sinfulness and disorderedness, and in turn, God's mercy, the exercitant for many days would have journeyed closely with Jesus Christ through His life; His ministries, Passion, Death and Resurrection. Then, the exercitant would make *contemplatio*, which would provoke a deep sense of the presence of God in all things; how Love of God is poured upon the whole world and how active His Love is in every creature. And to read and ponder about this set of rules about the Church at this final stage of the exercises is incredibly crucial to fully appreciate the meaning behind the rules as Ignatius may have intended; that is, to see and feel and know how the Holy Spirit is ever present in the Church, however corrupt and stained it may be. "Praise comes as the result of having discovered the action of the Spirit in all things and of having witnessed how that Spirit works and is reflected in the actual reality of the Church."<sup>84</sup> In addition, it helps that they have now gone through the exercises with the knowledge of the discernment of spirits according to the First and Second Weeks. And they now should have had an experience of being indifferent to do God's will according to the discernment. Furthermore, they must have now found to favour the ecclesial "we" over the individual "ego"<sup>85</sup>. Indeed, God has called to save us, not as individual but as a people.

### 2.3.5. Other communitarian elements in the *Spiritual Exercises*

While the movement from personal to communal is more noticeable in the Fourth Week and especially in the *contemplatio*, there are also other communitarian elements within the *Exercises*. At the beginning, the Principle and Foundation<sup>86</sup> appears to appeal to a personal relationship with God at first. It begins with man (*el hombre*) and uses the third-person-singular (he/she/it) verb forms. This "man" indicates the personal "I". However, in the last three sentences, the verb forms change to the first-person-plural (we); *hacernos, queremos, somos*; and the possessive pronouns are also the first-person-plural; *nuestro, nuestra*. It is evident that this statement is not for a person but for all those who believe in God and follow Christ. In addition, the Call of the King is indeed a personal call of Christ to the exercitant but Christ the King calls not only "me" but to all the world [*Sp. Ex. 95*]. The call and the mission from Christ is personal and individual but at the same time, shared and

---

<sup>84</sup> *Ibid.*, 111.

<sup>85</sup> *Ibid.*, 109.

<sup>86</sup> *Sp. Ex. 23*.

communitarian. In a similar manner, the Two Standards and the Three Types of Persons are about internal and personal discernment and decisions but those are done in relationship with others, not in solitude.

\* \* \*

The *Spiritual Exercises* contain so much more depth and dynamic within its rich and remarkable experiences than what has been studied here. While each exercitant may have a very personal and individual experience of God, in particular through the life of Jesus, he/she is not a single person with the experience of the *Exercises* but there are many. And they share a common spirituality, a way of following God, through the *Exercises* and from what they have experienced and learned through it. The *First Fathers* would have shared the same spirituality as well as the way of living of Ignatius. The Election is obviously the base of the *deliberatio* in terms of its methodology. And their dispositions of heart would have been grown through the *Exercises*, ordering oneself with the end in mind and being indifferent and desiring only the will of God. The Fourth Week was treated lengthily to bring out the communitarian aspects and the sense of mission within the *Exercises*. The Biblical Easter stories certainly tells the encounters with the risen Jesus that bring the sense of community and mission, renewed and reinforced. The risen Jesus consoles His loved ones and invites us to be in union with Him, in this office of consolation too, as a mission, to others and to our community. The *contemplatio* prepares one to bridge the intense spiritual experience and the ordinary life, now more than ever, to find God in all things. This leads to understanding with the Church, that is, seeing that the Spirit is working through the Church, even in its somewhat corrupted and damaged ways as it may be. One is able to discern with the Church, our community and one body in Christ. Indeed, the individual spiritual experience through the *Exercises* sends one into the world, as one belongs to a community of faith, and as a human being in a society, with a sense of sharing what one has received with gratitude, a mission to console and share joy. It is evident that the experience of the *Exercises* not only enables a person to discern the movements of spirits and to have more intimate relationship with God in all things while ordering oneself through freeing from the disordered affections, but equips a person to be with others, with sense of community and mission, sharing the joy and

consolation of the risen Christ as well as living out the love of God that communicates with each other.

## Chapter 3

### “Dispersed throughout Christ’s vineyard” [Co 603]: One Apostolic Body in the continuous communal *Deliberatio* into the present

“Jesuit community is not just for mission:  
it is itself mission”<sup>1</sup>.

“For the First Companions, life and mission,  
rooted in a discerning community,  
were profoundly inter-related”<sup>2</sup>.

The Second Vatican Council has brought a new air into the Church and definitely to the Society of Jesus as well. The newly elected Pedro Arrupe at GC 31 brought the spiritual renewal to the Society according to the Charism of Ignatius and the *First Fathers*, and that legacy continues in the Society as it seeks to respond to the changing world. Their such effort can be seen in GCs documents from GC 31 to the latest GC 36. Remarkably, GC 36 brought the discernment in common to the front with a great deal of importance after GC 35 stated that community is mission. However, the emphasis of discernment in common, especially in the context of renewal in the Charism, has always been there since GC 31. Furthermore, each of the last four Fathers General has written a letter to the whole Society at least once on the theme of discernment in common. Through the study of GC documents, especially of GC 35

---

<sup>1</sup> GC 35, D.3, n.41.

<sup>2</sup> GC 36, D.1, n.5.

and 36, and the letters of Fathers General on discernment in common, it is clear that discernment in common that seems to have newly found its importance has already been spoken often with much attention and emphasis for a long time, and that it is truly a part of the way of proceeding of the Society, which needs to be truly lived out in order to renew its spirit following its Charism.

### 3.1. GC 35 – GC 36: From Community to the Discernment in Common

“Community is mission” was the most striking statement of GC 35. Then, it was followed by GC 36 where the discernment in common found a significant importance. Often GC documents talk about the identity and the mission of the Society, and so these two statements of GC 35 and 36 are distinctive in that it pays a great attention to the community life that has not been present in the conscience of the Jesuits and also to the discernment in common which has not been widely practised in the Society while talked about much. This first part of this chapter will see how the connection and development from the importance of community in GC 35 to the discernment in common of GC 36 will play out. And then, it will also enquire about the *triptych* relationship between identity – mission – community and the way the discernment in common plays its role in this *triptych* relationship.

#### 3.1.1. Community is mission

After the VCII, the Society of Jesus worked diligently in order to renew and rediscover its religious Charism according to the Church’s new direction. From GC 31 onward to the latest GC 36, the Society has been pondering and discerning its identity and its mission thoroughly and in diverse ways. The service of faith and promotion of justice has been the renowned identity and mission of the Society since GC 32, which also produced many decrees in various aspects of life of the Society. The following GCs have continuously confirmed its importance. GC 34 was another GC that produced many decrees and among them, the collaboration, the inter-religious dialogue, and ecology are the better-known themes. GC 35 brought a new perspective of the apostolate of reconciliation, which developed further in GC 36.

As such, more often than not, the decrees of GCs have been about identity, mission and governance of the Society. However, GC 35 called for a dramatic turn of interest when it said; “Jesuit community is not just for mission: it is itself mission”<sup>3</sup>. This is strikingly distinct from the usual decrees of the GCs, in which normally we would find decrees on “mission” as *what we should do for others* in the outward actions. This emphasis on community as mission was further followed by the letter to the whole Society by Arturo Sosa, titled “Our life is mission, mission is our life”<sup>4</sup> in 2017.

### 3.1.2. *Triptych* of identity – mission – community

How could this relationship of mission and community life, which is also inevitably connected to the question of the identity of a Jesuit be understood? Some may find it in an approach that, Jesuits have the community life as a mission alongside of many other missions, such as various apostolic works. However, it may not be the case; “Jesuit identity and Jesuit mission are linked by community; indeed, identity, community, and mission are a kind of triptych shedding light on how our companionship is best understood”<sup>5</sup>. The word *triptych* may hold the key to understanding what the GC 35 desired of this relationship between identity – mission – community. Among others, the perspective of Valero seems to offer much more depth on the understanding of this relationship as well as its implication on the understanding of each element of identity – mission – community.

According to Oxford Dictionary of English, *triptych* means; “a picture or relief carving on three panels, typically hinged together vertically and used as an altarpiece; *a set of three associated artistic, literary, or musical works intended to be appreciated together.*” Valero notes that this word, *triptych*, has been used in the metaphorical sense, in that identity – mission – community are three parts of one, which should be understood as all three in a unity and not separately<sup>6</sup>. Here the idea of *triptych* is as an icon and, according to Valero, is expressed in a more functional level. That is to say, that the community serves as a foundation from which Jesuits find its own identity and also are sent out to mission. In his

---

<sup>3</sup> GC 35, D.3, n.41.

<sup>4</sup> SOSA, A., *Our life is mission, mission is our life*, (10<sup>th</sup> July 2017).

<sup>5</sup> GC 35, D.2, n.19.

<sup>6</sup> VALERO, U., “Identity, Community, Mission: Reflections around ‘a kind of Triptych’”, *RIS* 125 (2010), 54–66. Here, 55.

point of view, GC 35 has not added much to what has been said regarding this functional contribution of community to identity and mission in the past GCs, especially in GC 31.

However, Valero claims that in the GC 31, there are more to be found than this functional contribution of community. He argues that “identity and mission in the Society are fundamentally communitarian and that community is the obligatory method and channel by which they are presented and developed”<sup>7</sup> and furthermore, that “identity and mission are communitarian in the Society and community is shaped and determined by them”<sup>8</sup>. To reason his argument, he elaborates on the implicated sense of community in the Jesuit identity. Firstly, one of the ways to describe the Jesuit identity is a sinner called to be a companion of Jesus. And being a companion of Jesus implicitly declares oneself as a companion of all other ‘companions of Jesus’. Jesuits are not called individually but as a group, as a society, of companions. Moreover, according to the Formula of the Institute, being a Jesuit means belonging to the Society, that is to say, being a part of the Society. This also confirms that a Jesuit is never an individual, being one-self but always *being a part of the Society*, a community. “Being a Jesuit is more than being just one-self; it is being one-self but also forming part of something which goes beyond one’s own individuality; it is ‘being-part-of’ or ‘being-with’, in other words, being essentially part of a community”<sup>9</sup>. Therefore, for Valero, the Jesuit identity incorporates a community as the essential part of its being<sup>10</sup>.

In addition, Valero notices that the bilateral relationship of identity and mission of Jesuit also has a communitarian aspect in the Society as a Jesuit is sent to a mission as a part of one mission of the whole Society of Jesus. GC 32 declares that “a Jesuit is essentially a man with a mission”<sup>11</sup> and Valero sees this relationship of identity and mission as follows;

“Mission is not something which simply happens to a Jesuit (as a result of which he becomes a man with a mission) nor is it principally an ideal or an obligation, however important, that he has to fulfil, but something which is an integral part of him, makes him what he is, defines his life, and this takes place simply by his “being part of the Society whose identity is to “exist-for-mission””<sup>12</sup>.

---

<sup>7</sup> *Ibid.*, 58.

<sup>8</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>9</sup> *Ibid.*, 59.

<sup>10</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>11</sup> GC 32, D.2, n.14.

<sup>12</sup> VALERO, *op. cit.*, 60.

His notion of the relationship between identity and mission is a more fluid and inter-connected way of understanding these two often-mentioned elements; one defines the other and vice-versa, and never separately.

Furthermore, a mission of a Jesuit is always a community mission that is of the whole Society of Jesus. “It is by being sent that the Jesuit becomes a companion of Jesus”<sup>13</sup>. According to Valero, each Jesuit is a Jesuit by ‘being part of the Society’ and he shares his mission with all others, because essentially his mission is the mission of the whole one body of the Society<sup>14</sup>. Thus, the identity – mission – community are very much inter-connected and cannot be understood individually apart from the unity because each element holds the integral and intrinsic aspects of the others.

### 3.1.3. Discernment in Common – GC 36

In 2017, GC 36 was convoked to elect a new Father General after the resignation of Adolfo Nicolás. This GC did not produce many decrees like the previous GCs but only two. Nonetheless, the emphasis on the discernment in common with the reference to the experience of the *First Fathers* in Venice in Decree I has made a deep impression. By going back the story of the *First Fathers* in the origin of the Society, GC 36 develops upon the relationship of identity – mission – community from GC 35; “For the First Companions, life and mission, rooted in a discerning community, were profoundly inter-related”<sup>15</sup>. Note that here, Jesuits do not just have *a community* but a *discerning* community. “In our individualistic and competitive age, we should remember that the community plays a very special role since it is a privileged place of apostolic discernment”<sup>16</sup>. The community is now understood with emphasis of being a more profound place as a place of having the discernment in common.

Ruiz Pérez provides the understanding of the vital and life-giving connection between the discernment in common and the triptych of identity – mission – community. He first finds that this GC 36 was more about *how* Jesuits do things than *what* Jesuits do; “The Congregation noticed, and not always transparently, that its discernment was about the *hows*

---

<sup>13</sup> GC 32, D.2, n.14.

<sup>14</sup> VALERO, *op. cit.*, 61.

<sup>15</sup> GC 36, D.1, n.5.

<sup>16</sup> GC 36, D.1, n.8.

and not about the *whats*: it led them to *delve into the 'apostolic' dimension that our religious life needs today*"<sup>17</sup>. Indeed, the focus has moved from *what* to *how* and from *us* to *God*, in the sense of discernment; "Rather than ask what we should do, we seek to understand how God invites us [...] to share in that great work"<sup>18</sup>. In this way, the discernment helps Jesuits living out their identity, in mission and community; "GC 36 detects that the discernment is the apostolic *how* of prime importance, which helps the triptych identity-community-mission to be connected internally"<sup>19</sup>.

According to Ruiz Pérez, the discernment of *how* extends to the second Decree about the governance of the Society; "discernment is more than ever critical for apostolic effectiveness"<sup>20</sup>. Through the experience of the GC 36, especially through the laborious challenges of coming to an agreement on the critical issues for the future of the Society, one participant of the GC remarks how the approach of discernment in common has assisted the process of going through the disagreement that was much based on the analytical and critical thinking<sup>21</sup>. The emphasis on *how* rather than *what* itself is the common theme of GC 36, and Ruiz Pérez concludes that "to discern is an apostolic way(*cómo*) that results in the greater or lesser sacramentality of apostolic religious life as such. That(*que*) which is acted upon is not apostolically determinant without how(*cómo*) it is done"<sup>22</sup>.

Therefore, the personal and communal discernment in the Society would act as a catalyst and lubricant that provides vitality and life into the intrinsically inter-connected *triptych* of identity – mission – community. Guided by the Spirit, the discernment will move and develop Jesuits in all three aspects of identity – mission – community. However, this also implies that all the Jesuits should be living out the Ignatian spirituality according to the *Spiritual Exercises* because discerning does not come easily and naturally, and requires many

---

<sup>17</sup> RUIZ PÉREZ, F. J., "La Congregación General 36 y su invitación al discernimiento en común", *Man* 90 (2018), 17-26. Here 21; My translation to English. "La Congregación se percató, y no siempre diáfananamente, de que su discernimiento versaba sobre los *cómos* y no sobre los *qués*: la conducía a *ahondar en la dimensión "a la apostólica" que hoy necesita nuestra vida religiosa.*"

<sup>18</sup> GC 36, D.1, n.3.

<sup>19</sup> RUIZ PÉREZ, *op. cit.*, 23; My translation to English. "La CG 36 detecta que el discernimiento es un *cómo* apostólico de primer orden que ayuda a que el tríptico identidad-comunidad-misión esté conectado internamente."

<sup>20</sup> GC 36, D.2, n.5.

<sup>21</sup> MCFARLAND, M. C., "Communal Discernment" in "The Moment of GC 36 for Its Members", *Members of General Congregation 36, SSJ* 49 (2017), 28-32.

<sup>22</sup> RUIZ PÉREZ, *op. cit.*, 24; My translation to English. "discernir es un *cómo* apostólico que redundo en la mayor o menor sacramentalidad de la vida religiosa apostólica como tal. El que se actúe no es determinante apostólicamente sin el *cómo* se haga."

elements, especially spiritual conditions and preparations for a person, and also for a community, in order to make the personal and communal discernment.

Indeed, the discernment is one of the major elements of the *Spiritual Exercises* and it goes with all other aspects of the Ignatian spirituality; “The heart of an Ignatian work is the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius. Indeed, any work may be said to be Ignatian when it manifests the Ignatian charism: i.e., when it intentionally seeks God in all things; when it practices Ignatian discernment; when it engages the world through a careful analysis of context, in dialogue with experience, evaluated through reflection, for the sake of action, and with openness, always, to evaluation”<sup>23</sup>.

Conclusively, a Jesuit should be grounded firmly and deeply in Christ through the Ignatian spirituality in order to make the personal and communal discernment, which in turn helps to live out the Jesuit vocation in the inter-connected *tritych* of identity – mission – community. And even this is not a one-way but bi-lateral, that is to say, the healthy *tritych* of identity – mission – community shall help the Jesuit to live out his vocation based in Ignatian Spirituality better in return.

#### 3.1.4. Going back to the origin, the Charism of the Society of Jesus

GC 36 goes back to the experience of the *First Fathers* in Venice and re-tells that origin story<sup>24</sup>. And in this manner, the importance, if not being essential, of the discernment in common in the Society seems to be *newly found*; “We return to those roots now, first to a discerning community, then to our life in faith, and finally to the mission that flows from both”<sup>25</sup>. However, this is not the case. Even just by looking at the major letters written on the discernment in common by every Father General since Arrupe, the significance of the discernment in common in the life of the Society has been constantly emphasised<sup>26</sup>. It may be

---

<sup>23</sup> GC 35, D.6, n.9.

<sup>24</sup> GC 36, D.1, nn.4-5 and nn.7-8.

<sup>25</sup> GC 36, D.1, n.6.

<sup>26</sup> The following four letters are precisely on the discernment in common. Arrupe writes on communitarian Spiritual discernment ahead of calling for the preparation of GC 32 and Sosa’s letter is at the beginning of a long process of discernment on the Universal Apostolate Preferences, which is recognised as a first ever bottom-up discernment process of the whole Society. Kolvenbach’s letter has an appendix on the manner of making the discernment in common; ARRUPÉ, P., *Sobre el discernimiento espiritual comunitario*, (25<sup>th</sup> December 1971); KOLVENBACH, P., *On Apostolic Discernment in Common*, (5<sup>th</sup> November 1986); NICOLÁS, A., *Common Apostolic Discernment*, (19<sup>th</sup> January 2009); SOSA, A., *On Discernment in Common*, (27<sup>th</sup> September 2017). In

comprehended in a way that the discernment in common has been said much frequently and has been acknowledged of its importance, but it has never been practised much commonly and widely, let alone have been taught properly in the formation. Moreover, GC 35 also reflects back on the initial experience of the *First Fathers* and this time, it attempts to find the origin of the mission and obedience, with emphasis on community<sup>27</sup>. The *First Fathers* were called themselves “*Amigos en el Señor*” and “*Compañeros de Jesús*”, and profoundly shared the friendship and companionship in Jesus Christ, following the way of Ignatius in his spirituality and apostolic life.

These two GCs look back to the origin story of the *First Fathers* to bring out the importance of community and discernment in common as they are a part of the Charism of the Society. They were the integral part of their way of proceeding. However, this looking back to the origin is also nothing new. GC 31 did the same thing in search of spiritual renewal of the Society especially after VCII<sup>28</sup>. This re-telling and re-discovering of the origin serves to remind Jesuits of their Charism. In the Decree 19, especially of nn.1-3, the community life is called to attention; “It is a community of men who are called by Christ to live with Christ, to be conformed to Christ, to fulfil the work of Christ in them-selves and among men. This is the foundation and aim of community life in the Society of Jesus”<sup>29</sup>. Valero believes this as the great discovery of GC 31 and it is reflected back in GC 35. And GC 32 Decree 11 takes this theme of community and then confirms and deepens it; “*our union with God in Christ, from which flows our brotherly communion with one another, a communion strengthened and made apostolically efficacious by the bond of obedience*”<sup>30</sup>.

GC 36 sees this community life and in its context, the discernment in common as the essence of being a Jesuit following the Charism of the *First Fathers*; “For the First Companions, life and mission, rooted in a discerning community, were profoundly inter-related”<sup>31</sup>; And “we return to those roots now, first to a discerning community, then to our life in faith, and finally to the mission that flows from both”<sup>32</sup>. Furthermore, GC 34 states that the religious life of

---

addition, before GC 32, Arrupe made a point on the life of community and the discernment in common; ARRUPE, P., *La rénovation spirituelle de la Compagnie*, (24<sup>th</sup> June 1971). Moreover, Kolvenbach also wrote a letter on the life of community; KOLVEBENBACH, P., *On Community Life*, (12<sup>th</sup> March 1998).

<sup>27</sup> GC 35, D.4, nn.2-8.

<sup>28</sup> GC 31, D.1, nn.1-9.

<sup>29</sup> GC 31, D.19, n.2.

<sup>30</sup> GC 32, D.11, n.5.

<sup>31</sup> GC 36, D.1, n.5.

<sup>32</sup> GC 36, D.1, n.6.

obedience, chastity and poverty are greatly strengthened by flourishing community life<sup>33</sup>. Valero finds that “when religious life is strengthened in this way, union and availability, universality and complete dedication, and the evangelical freedom needed to help souls in every possible way, is also strengthened, - which was *the intention of the first Jesuits*”<sup>34</sup>. Surely, the community life is also the integral part of the religious life itself.

Valero mentions that the renewal of the Society brought a great change from the pre-VCII era. The community life before VCII and GC 31 and 32 was ruled by the various rules and so the Jesuits would have lived together according to the external rules that were to be obeyed<sup>35</sup>. He finds that the change brought Jesuits into a community life of vitality and spirit;

“Community life, from being thought of as a life in common regulated by multiple disciplines, became a life in common knit together and energised by deep inter-personal relationships on all levels, - human, spiritual, apostolic, - among members of a community sharing a common identity and mission”<sup>36</sup>.

It is clear that the change is indeed a renewal, re-discovery of the charism from the *First Fathers*. In many aspects, a community for Jesuits is to be regarded as the integral part of the Chrism of the Society and its significance is acknowledged through many GC documents as well as the letters of Fathers General. It is asking for the spiritual renewal and the conversion of heart, going back to the original Charism of the *First Fathers*. GC 35 speaks of going back to the origin and in doing so, hopes to bring back the original fire that may kindle other fires<sup>37</sup>. In other words, “the Society seeks to keep the fire of its original inspiration alive in a way that offers warmth and light to our contemporaries”<sup>38</sup>.

### 3.1.5. Giving witness to the world

While the community life is about Jesuits living out their Charism in reality, it can also be viewed from outside of the Society itself, from the world and from the people around them. Kolvenbach in his letter to the whole Society wrote that only through in Christ, this

---

<sup>33</sup> GC 34, D.8, n.21.

<sup>34</sup> VALERO, *op. cit.*, 57. The emphasis is mine.

<sup>35</sup> *Ibid.*, 56.

<sup>36</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>37</sup> GC 35, D.2, n.25.

<sup>38</sup> GC 35, D.2, n.1.

communion in the life of community is possible; “This is why community life has begun to give a witness: communion, which here and now seems impossible by any human means, is possible in Christ”<sup>39</sup>. Indeed, only when we share our faith in Jesus Christ as His companions, the community shall give true witness;

“much more than simply sharing the same house, the same table and the same rules. [...] Without a sharing of our faith, of our reasons for living and working as companions of Jesus, and of our deeper experiences in encountering Him who sends us, we will be giving no witness”<sup>40</sup>.

GC 36 goes further and stresses that the union in community would bear more witness than the competence;

“If, however, we forget that we are one body, bound together in and with Christ, we lose our identity as Jesuits and our ability to bear witness to the Gospel. It is our union with one another in Christ that testifies to the Good News more powerfully than our competences and abilities”<sup>41</sup>.

Hence, the community life of the Charism loses its vitality and spirit if Jesuits, as individuals and as a community, cannot form a communion in Christ. On the other hand, the community life can be “a manifold testimony for our contemporaries, especially since it fosters brotherly love and unity by which all will know that we are disciples of Christ”<sup>42</sup>. Furthermore, this giving witness to people may, in turn, bear fruits in a way of vocation to the Society; “our community life can become attractive to people, inviting them – above all the young – to ‘come and see’, to join us in our vocation and to serve with us in Christ’s mission”<sup>43</sup>.

### 3.1.6. Discernment in Common and returning to the Charism

The powerful statement of GC 35, “community is a mission” and the eager call of GC 36 to re-find and live out the discernment in common are essentially a call of spiritual renewal in the Charism of the Society of Jesus, following the way of the *First Fathers*. The effort is not

---

<sup>39</sup> KOLVENBACH, P., *On Community Life*, (12<sup>th</sup> March 1998), n.3.

<sup>40</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>41</sup> GC 36, D.1, n.7

<sup>42</sup> GC 31, D.19, n.4.

<sup>43</sup> GC 35, D.2, n.19.

something new, yet there always has been the emphasis in community and discernment in common while it has been neglected in reality and in practice. This time, the Society again re-tells its origin story and attempts to reclaim community life and discernment in common as a part of the Charism of the Society, where identity – mission – community are very much inter-connected and assist Jesuits in the dynamic and fluid way. In this way, the importance of the community life in the Society can be emphasised as one essential aspect of the Charism of the Society. It is obvious that the community life is not something that Jesuits have to do, but have to be, according to their Charism. To conclude, below is the quote of García de Castro, and according to it, if living out the community life and the discernment in common is a part of the Chrism, then, it is the vocation that Jesuits are called to live out.

“Religious vocation is not a calling to a way of working, or to a specific activity, or even to a group of nice or friendly people that may attract because of their tasks, ideology, mission or lifestyle. It is a calling to a charism, a gift of the Spirit in history, an invitation to live in a given way - and it is in this *given* where God lets himself be heard by way of consolation”<sup>44</sup>.

### 3.2. Discernment in Common in the Letters of the Fathers General

The growing awareness on the importance of the discernment in common that is present from GC 31 to GC 36 goes hand in hand with some of the letters of the Fathers General of the Society. Every Father General since VCII has explicitly written one letter on the theme of discernment in common; namely, Arrupe, Kolvenbach, Nicolás and the current Father General, Sosa. Each has its own emphasis due to the particular situation and climate of the time and to the personal approach of the General.

#### 3.2.1. Pedro Arrupe, “On the Communitarian Spiritual Discernment” (25<sup>th</sup> December 1971)<sup>45</sup>

Pedro Arrupe was elected as the Father General of the Society of Jesus in GC 31 in 1967 during the time of VCII. The Church and the Society were experiencing the new breath of air from the Council and it called upon Arrupe for the renewal of the Charism of the Society in

---

<sup>44</sup> GARCÍA DE CASTRO, “Alcanzados por Las Fuentes: ¿por qué? ¿cómo?”, 318.

<sup>45</sup> ARRUPÉ, P., *Sobre el discernimiento espiritual comunitario*, (25<sup>th</sup> December 1971); *AR*, XV (1971), 767-773; ARRUPÉ, P., “Sobre el discernimiento espiritual comunitario (25.XII.71)”, en *La identidad del jesuita en nuestros tiempos*, Mendizábal, M., (ed.), Sal Terrae, Santander, 1981: 247-252.

this modern world. Known as the second Ignatius for the Society, he had led with the charismatic vision and energy to revitalise and reinvigorate the Society into the new era.

In his letter to the whole society on 25 December 1971, Arrupe talks about the communal discernment, especially with the upcoming GC 32 in mind. Kolvenbach later in his letter on the same topic notes that this is the first time that the communitarian discernment was explicitly recommended to the Society<sup>46</sup>. Arrupe introduces the communitarian spiritual discernment in following points; conditions of communitarian discernment, object and effects of the common search, difficulties in this process of common search, and practical effects of the search in common. As seen above, while not giving much on how to do it, he pays more attention to the reasons for doing it and the fruits and purpose seeking from it.

#### *a) Conditions of communitarian discernment*

On the conditions of the communitarian discernment, Arrupe emphasises the communitarian spiritual exchange, which is often referred to as spiritual conversation in recent GC documents and other letters. He wishes to stir up (*suscitar*) and invigorate (*vigorizar*) the Society and its members to have “an atmosphere of sincere and true communitarian spiritual exchange based on a deep union, and capable of converting itself in a *true spiritual discernment or deliberation in common*”<sup>47</sup>. Nonetheless, he also points out the role of the Superior in the discernment with emphasis on the Ignatian obedience; “it is clear that this is a discernment that must be done in union with the Superior and that the decision belongs to the Superior”<sup>48</sup>. Therefore, the communitarian conclusion that is made in such conditions is of a great value and should be taken into consideration by the Superior while the community should have the true spirit of indifference and disposition to accept the final decision of the Superior<sup>49</sup>.

---

<sup>46</sup> KOLVENBACH, P., *On Apostolic Discernment in Common*, (5<sup>th</sup> November 1986), n.29.

<sup>47</sup> ARRUPE, *Sobre el discernimiento espiritual comunitario*, 248. My translation to English. “un clima de sincero y verídico intercambio espiritual comunitario, base de una profunda unión, y capaz de convertirse en ocasiones en un *verdadero discernimiento o deliberación espiritual en común*.”

<sup>48</sup> *Ibid.*, 248-249. My translation to English. “es claro que es éste un discernimiento que debe hacerse en unión con el Superior y que la decisión pertenece al Superior.”

<sup>49</sup> *Ibid.*, 249.

*b) Object and effects of the discernment in common*

Then, Arrupe discusses the object and effects of the discernment in common. Firstly, Jesuits living and working together shall come up with response and discernment when they are confronted by the calls of the world such as the change in the society and the new demands of the Church. In this way, Arrupe believes that a deep and spiritual union can be created because it will ask members of community to know not superficially but in spirit and in supernatural gifts. Notably, it may seem too distinctive and diverging but through them, the Spirit shall reveal the richness of the gifts. Sometimes the communities may face difficult moments and through them, shall need to be purified, cleared up and discerned. At the end, through it all – the possible tensions, the slow process of purification of its members, and the respectful and sincere spiritual exchange – a community shall come “to harmonise its efforts toward the future and to meet often new and precise orientations that will generate peace and joy in the Spirit”<sup>50</sup>. Indeed, it will lead to the growth in faith, hope and charity for every one of community.

*c) Difficulties in the process of discernment in common*

On the difficulties in the process of discernment in common, Arrupe gives two recommendations; firstly, not to stop when faced with difficulties and not to wait for ideal situations to turn up; secondly, to choose themes that are within the capacity of the group that would engage in the discernment while attempting to learn and adapt to do it. While tackling on the difficulties that communities and their members and superiors may face in the process of discernment in common, Arrupe seeks to inspire both superiors and members of the communities to feel responsible in the life of communities and of the universal body of the Society in adapting the apostolic communities with the sense of reading “the signs of God”, and urges each one to renew their vocation interiorly.

Overall, the most interesting part of the letter of Arrupe is his going back to the origin story of the *First Fathers* and their *Deliberation* in 1539. He “dares to think” that this attitude is

---

<sup>50</sup> *Ibid.*, 250. My translation to English. “a armonizar sus esfuerzos hacia el porvenir y a encontrar muchas veces orientaciones nuevas y precisas, generadoras de paz y de gozo en el Espíritu.”

essentially the same as the one of the First Fathers in the *Deliberation*<sup>51</sup>. He wishes to bring this original spirit of the Charism of the Society into the present day;

“If the Society conceived in the mutual agreement with the First Fathers and in the atmosphere of prayer and common deliberation, it will be able to encourage better its unity and its dynamism, and its service to the Church, by means of an communitarian experience based on the same spirit that animated our First Fathers, and that bears in mind the modern circumstances at the time of the particular implementation”<sup>52</sup>.

This is an important perspective into the understanding of the foundation of the Society through this *Deliberation* of the *First Fathers* in 1539 because it enables to understand that the foundation was not only by Ignatius himself, but as a community in the discernment in common. This means that the communal discernment is very much a big part of the Charism of the Society of Jesus, through which it was founded.

### 3.2.2. Peter Kolvenbach, “On Apostolic Discernment in Common” (5<sup>th</sup> November 1986)

The annual letters of 1986 during the time of Kolvenbach was on the apostolic discernment in common. In his letter as a response to those letters sent to him, Kolvenbach presents positive aspects and negatives aspects of the experience in discernment in common from the letters received, and then provides the reflection on the theory of discernment in common. On this later part, he outlines in details on the discernment in common; its terminologies, its root and origin, today’s historical context, the subject and the object of discernment, state and practice of discernment in the Society, growth in the practice of discernment in common personally, communally in communities, and with superior.

#### a) *The annual letters of 1986*

Firstly, among the positive aspects<sup>53</sup>, Kolvenbach confirms the growing awareness about the common apostolic discernment after three GCs (namely, 31, 32, and 33) have insisted on this

---

<sup>51</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>52</sup> *Ibid.*, 251. My translation to English. “Si la compañía fraguó en el acuerdo común de los primeros Padres y en clima de oración y deliberación común, podrá mejor fomentar hoy su unidad y su dinamismo y su servicio a la Iglesia, mediante una experiencia comunitaria basada en el mismo espíritu que animó a nuestros primeros Padres, y que tenga en cuenta las circunstancias modernas, a la hora de la aplicación concreta.”

<sup>53</sup> KOLVENBACH, *On Apostolic Discernment in Common*, n.3-9.

theme, and also about its importance for the vitality of community life. He states that GC 33 made an impact in promoting efforts made in communities, which have helped to grow in mutual respect, in attention to one another and in trust, leading to a deeper union like '*Friends in the Lord*'. And there is a growing awareness that the discernment in common is not a democratic process and also it is compatible with the Ignatian obedience. Furthermore, there is a growing orientation towards discernment in common with non-Jesuit collaborators.

On the other hand, among the negative aspects<sup>54</sup>, many of them are about the difficulties raised from the practicality of the discernment in common in real life situations. To name some of the difficulties; a lack of a clear understanding of what the discernment in common actually is, a lack of actual experiences and practices, a lack of formation to be open and to share with trust, a lack of indifference, a lack of faith, a fear of change and thus seeking stability, and a preoccupation with immediate results. However, one point stands out more than the others, in which it had been asked about the authenticity of discernment in common as the characteristic of the Jesuits because while the *Constitutions* talks of prudent, discretion and discernment, there is no mention of the common apostolic discernment<sup>55</sup>. It is thus reasonable that on later paragraphs, Kolvenbach talks about the origin story of the Society of Jesus, in Ignatius and his *First Fathers* in order to justify the practice of the common apostolic discernment. He briefly covers the Ignatian root from the *Deliberation* of the *First Fathers* to the *Constitutions*<sup>56</sup> in order to reflect on the discernment in common in the life of the Society.

## b) *The theory of apostolic discernment in common*

### b1. Terminology

Then, Kolvenbach expounds on the terminology of “apostolic discernment in common”. Firstly, following the Pauline tradition, discernment means an attempt to find that which is pleasing to God, and in the Ignatian perspective, it is not limited to the discernment of spirits, but it also includes all the things of the process of the Election<sup>57</sup>. Moreover, he emphasises that there are indeed *three* Times of the Election because commonly the discernment is

---

<sup>54</sup> *Ibid.*, n.10-18.

<sup>55</sup> *Ibid.*, n.12.

<sup>56</sup> *Ibid.*, n.25-28.

<sup>57</sup> *Ibid.*, n.22 (a).

understood only according to the third time of the election. This limited understanding may cause the discernment as done solely within the human wisdom. He recommends to look at each of all three Times of the Election as the possible manner of discernment, and also emphasises all the successive steps and preparation of the election that Ignatius has set out<sup>58</sup>. Secondly, he points out that the discernment recommended by GC 33 is not only individual but also in common.<sup>59</sup> Thirdly and lastly, the discernment is apostolic because firstly, the apostolate is essentially our vocation and has, as its part, the common efforts to search for the will of God.<sup>60</sup>

## b2. Ignatian Root

Going back to the origin story of the Society of Jesus, Kolvenbach briefly covers the discernment in common from the *Deliberation* in 1539 to the framing the *Constitutions*. He finds the continuation of this particular experience, Charism, in the procedures of GCs in the *Constitution*<sup>61</sup>. Regarding the difficulty of using the discernment in common in the governance in the Society, he offers two points from the *Constitutions*<sup>62</sup>. Firstly, the discernment in common is done through the spiritual conversation that seeks together the will of God, and the more important the decision is, the more prayers and consultations are required<sup>63</sup>. Secondly, regardless of limitations and defects, the discernment in common should be used searching together, and often with regards to apostolate, for the means to better serve the will of God, accordance with the vocation, and to respond to the calls. Furthermore, he quotes the letter by Arrupe on the communitarian spiritual discernment to highlight the use of consultation as a form of discernment in common<sup>64</sup>.

## b3. Today's historical context

Then, regarding the context of today, Kolvenbach talks about the development in the Church after VCII<sup>65</sup>. VCII has opened up the Church to the exercise of the ecclesial responsibility in

---

<sup>58</sup> *Ibid.*, n.23.

<sup>59</sup> *Ibid.*, n.22 (b).

<sup>60</sup> *Ibid.*, n.24.

<sup>61</sup> *Ibid.*, n.27. Cf. *Co* 711-715.

<sup>62</sup> *Ibid.*, n.28.

<sup>63</sup> *Co* 211, 618.

<sup>64</sup> KOLVENBACH, *On Apostolic Discernment in Common*, n.28.

<sup>65</sup> *Ibid.*, n.29.

a more participative mode and in this regard, the religious life was also recommended for a responsible obedience and the exercise of a model of authority that promotes the cooperation<sup>66</sup>. In addition, VCII invites all the religious to understand adequately about the world today and the needs of the Church, and to return to their spiritual source and Charism<sup>67</sup>. Thus, Kolvenbach believes that “it is understandable that the present context stressing communion and participation has focused on discernment in common as a legitimate, even necessary expression of our charism”<sup>68</sup>.

Kolvenbach finds that the Society is following the movement of the Church and GC 33 makes it clearer about the discernment in common. In a more complex situation that makes it very difficult to analyse in its various aspects, the involvement of everyone in searching for the will of God is more appropriate because each one of them can bring to the discernment all the resources from their own inspiration, human and spiritual. Moreover, it would be much easier for everyone to appropriate the final decision when everyone has been involved in the process of the discernment. All in all, the discernment in common helps to prepare the decision to be made by the Superior<sup>69</sup>.

#### b4. Subject and object of the discernment in common<sup>70</sup>

The discernment in common needs a specific object of its discernment, which is the apostolate, and Kolvenbach points out that it is always a search for better “means” to accomplish the mission received, with the constant consideration of the changing circumstances<sup>71</sup>. Regarding the subjects of the discernment in common, various sizes and types of a group can be called upon depending on the issue at hand, and the institutional procedures and responsible groups within the institution should be respected. Kolvenbach suggests that it will be useful to consider the discernment as a phase of the preparation in a decision process. He makes clearly again that the responsibility of making decision belongs to the Superior.

---

<sup>66</sup> PAUL VI, *Perfectae Caritatis*, (28<sup>th</sup> October 1965), n.14.

<sup>67</sup> *Ibid.*, n.2.

<sup>68</sup> KOLVENBACH, *On Apostolic Discernment in Common*, n.29.

<sup>69</sup> *Ibid.*, n.31.

<sup>70</sup> *Ibid.*, n.33.

<sup>71</sup> *Ibid.*, n.32.

#### b5. Conditions for the discernment in common<sup>72</sup>

In order to grow in the capacity of apostolic discernment in common, Kolvenbach suggests the certain conditions as pre-requisites. He refers to GC 32 d.11 n.22 for these conditions and adds a bit more of his own. Firstly, according to GC 32, on the part of individual on personal level, there should be a certain familiarity of the Ignatian rules for the discernment of spirits<sup>73</sup>, from the actual experience. In addition, each individual should have a firm intention to find the will of God for the community whatever the cost may be, and the dispositions of heart and mind cultivated in the First and Second Weeks in the *Exercises*. On the part of the community, everyone should work with; a clear definition of the object of discernment; sufficient information about the object of discernment; and “a capacity to convey to one another what each one really thinks and feels”<sup>74</sup>.

Then, Kolvenbach adds more the following points from two points of view. Firstly, from the personal point of view, one is required to sustain the dispositions proper to the first two Weeks of the *Exercises* that are the practice of personal prayer, examination of conscience, and spiritual direction, and the repeated experience of the Exercises made under expert guidance. One also should have consciousness and historical awareness of human and social reality as they establish the context for the apostolate. Secondly, from the communitarian point of view, it should have a clear sense of ‘belonging’ to a particular apostolate or to a global apostolic mission of the Society. At the end, Kolvenbach also mentions that as precondition, there should be freedom from the serious psychological problems.

#### b6. Community Practices<sup>75</sup>

GC 33 urges the Jesuits to lead a style of community life in which they live in an ongoing attitude of searching for fidelity to the will of God. Kolvenbach thinks that “the more the conditions for such a search are deepened, the deeper will be community life itself, and its apostolic effectiveness”<sup>76</sup>. There are some ways of communal efforts to grow in the capacity to respond to the call of God and to the discernment. He suggests some community practices

---

<sup>72</sup> *Ibid.*, n.34.

<sup>73</sup> *Sp.Ex.* 313–336.

<sup>74</sup> ARRUIPE, P., “De spirituali discretione”, *AR XV* (1971), 767–773.

<sup>75</sup> KOLVENBACH, *On Apostolic Discernment in Common*, n.37.

<sup>76</sup> *Ibid.*, n.35.

that could encourage and accomplish it; a shared community prayer; a faith-sharing in common. Kolvenbach believes that this could be ‘for the spiritual growth of a community in line with our Ignatian Charism’<sup>77</sup>; a sharing in community of the personal spiritual discernment. This can be a variation of the procedure of the discernment in common; a review of life. A communal faith-sharing regarding certain elements of community life or discipline following the procedure of “observe (fact)”, “judge (in light of the Gospel and of the vocation)” and “act (program of act)”; and an evaluation of the apostolic work.

*c) Growth in the practice of apostolic discernment in common*

Kolvenbach traces an image of a Jesuit and of how he would live out regarding the discernment in common from GC 31, 32 and 33 as well as from Arrupe. He intends to “stimulate” the Jesuits to walk in hope, more relying on God’s grace to live out this ideal that may feel difficult to be achieved.

*c1. Personal challenges*<sup>78</sup>

Kolvenbach lists some of the challenges on the personal level. Firstly, everyone has a call to grow in freedom in order to be open to the apostolic renewal and to the detachment; this can only be done in prayer and growing union with God. Secondly, one has to be able to harmonise commitment and reflection. Thirdly, one should continue to work on the full integration in the body of the Society and to have a fraternal dialogue with those who share the life and work, confronting against the individualism, lack of attention to others and the intolerance. Finally, one must have a sincere openness to the Superior and the spiritual director in order to grow in the fraternal exchange and in his common responsibility for the mission.

*c2. Demands for community building*<sup>79</sup>

Kolvenbach emphasises that the community to be built in the letter means the apostolic community. Within the community, the creation and fostering friendship should root and

---

<sup>77</sup> *Ibid.*, n.37 (b).

<sup>78</sup> *Ibid.*, n.39.

<sup>79</sup> *Ibid.*, n.40.

express itself in trust, in mutual interest, in exchange and collaboration, and should find people more important than the work. Prayer and exchange of experience shall assist to find the community founded on grace and charity as gathered in the name of the Lord and His Spirit. In addition, there should be a real apostolic collaboration with lay persons and non-Jesuits.

### c3. Role of the Superior<sup>80</sup>

The Superiors play an important role in this matter and have a responsibility of building the body of the Society, in particular with the efforts of the discernment in common about the apostolate. One should have an attitude and a habitual practice of discernment; a correct understanding of the socio-cultural situation that is the context of the apostolate; and a feeling for dialogue with individuals as well as with the group. Importantly, a superior should have an ability to guide the process of the apostolic discernment in common.

### c4. Steps/Elements in the process of apostolic discernment in common<sup>81</sup>

Kolvenbach proposes the steps for the apostolic discernment in common while he also offers it as an appendix at the end of the letter<sup>82</sup> in a plainer manner. The following are the steps proposed that are summarised; First, definition of a question and analysis of reality; Second, reflection and prayer as a personal discernment; Third, pooling of the rational arguments and spiritual feelings without discussion. This can be repeated as needed; Fourth, common prayer and possible common Eucharist; Fifth, conclusions; And sixth, decision by Superior. Regarding the relationship between the superior of a community and the director of the apostolic work, Kolvenbach refers to the letter of Arrupe, 31 December 1976<sup>83</sup>.

#### *d) Means of living out in the true community*

In his conclusion, acknowledging the growing consciousness on the importance of the spiritual and apostolic discernment, he emphasises that the apostolic discernment in common

---

<sup>80</sup> *Ibid.*, n.41.

<sup>81</sup> *Ibid.*, n.42.

<sup>82</sup> Appendix 2 in KOLVENBACH, *On Apostolic Discernment in Common*.

<sup>83</sup> ARRUPÉ, P., *Guidelines for Distinction and Relation between Director of Work and Superior*, (31<sup>st</sup> December 1976); AR XVI, 1024-1060.

is a part of the Ignatian Charism. For him, living in today's contemporary world, this apostolic discernment in common is "a very important means for realising and fostering this vital unity in the Society"<sup>84</sup> that is asked of in the *Constitutions*;

"the more difficult it is for the members of this congregation to be united with their head and among themselves, since they are so spread out in diverse parts of the world among believers and unbelievers, the more should means be sought for that union. For the Society cannot be preserved or governed or, consequently, attain the aim it seeks for the greater glory of God unless its members are united among themselves and with their head [*Co* 655]".

### 3.2.3. Adolfo Nicolás, "Common Apostolic Discernment" (19<sup>th</sup> January 2009)

This is actually not a letter per se of Adolfo Nicolás, but on an occasion in the international workshop of "Common Apostolic Discernment (CAD) in the light of GC 35" on 19<sup>th</sup> January 2009, he answered to three questions in a conversational mood regarding the common apostolic discernment<sup>85</sup>.

#### a) *Change and ongoing discernment and 'communal' discernment*

The first question deals with the reason why the working of the apostolic body needs a permanent common discernment and why the whole apostolic body of the community has to be involved. Nicolás first emphasises very much on changes around us such as people that we serve, language, symbols that are used in the world for different generations, the heart of people, the circumstance of our apostolate, our knowledge of reality and even our questions themselves. "New situations bring new discernment, new creativity and new response. [...] New forms, new developments, new needs, new responses arise"<sup>86</sup>. This change requests us to discern with the new data and factors, and Nicolás believes that this calls us for the ongoing discernment. "All this means that we need to discern. However, our discernment is not made once and for all. We have to keep on discerning. The process never stops"<sup>87</sup>. Changes may even go beyond what we can foresee.

---

<sup>84</sup> KOLVENBACH, *On Apostolic Discernment in Common*, n.44.

<sup>85</sup> That discourse has been redacted and published in the journal 'Review of Ignatian Spirituality'; NICOLÁS, A., "Common Apostolic Discernment", *RIS* 122 (2009), 9–20.

<sup>86</sup> NICOLÁS, *Common Apostolic Discernment*, 13.

<sup>87</sup> *Ibid.*

Meanwhile, in this ongoing discernment, Nicolás calls to mind ‘creative-fidelity’<sup>88</sup> that was articulated by Kolvenbach. The fidelity demands staying true in the relationship with Christ and with the Church while the creativity calls for seeing the change and responding to it. Nicolás comments, “Tradition gives us the core and the wisdom. We have to take it fully and make it our own”<sup>89</sup>.

Furthermore, in the communal discernment, Nicolás emphasises the importance of communal aspect of collecting and gathering individual efforts in discernment. “Discernment is the way to live in the midst of a changing world. It has to be communal, for no single person can control everything, and God does not allow himself to be captivated by anyone”<sup>90</sup>. His focus on the point where “God is free and far bigger than our understanding”<sup>91</sup> implies that in the process of seeking God’s will, no one can be perfect on one’s own but can help out to be done collectively and communally. In addition, he brings the point of how the discernment is a slow process and how time and consistency is needed in communal discernment: “Communal discernment is, I think, a slow process; it is slow and down to earth. There is no such thing as instant discernment. [...] its nature is that of searching, and searching is a slow process”<sup>92</sup>. Through this slow process of communal discernment, he believes that we can come across God even though He may seem hidden during the process: “God hides in the process of discernment. If we follow a process that is real, we find God”<sup>93</sup>.

#### *b) Elements to consider for common apostolic discernment*

The second question put to Nicolás is what elements and dimensions must be taken into consideration in today’s world for a common apostolic discernment. The first approach of Nicolás is to find out the need of people. From the example of Jesus, he finds three ways that Jesus responds to the people in need. Firstly, He answers to the need that is asked for. Secondly, he responds to the hidden but deeper needs of the people. Finally, he reaches to open a new horizon for people at large, including those who are there watching and listening. Following Jesus’ example, we are to find what people need and also what they really need. While on it, we are to see not only individuals but into a wider reality. In addition, he

---

<sup>88</sup> KOLVENBACH, P., “Creative Fidelity in Mission”, *RIS* 95 (1990), 25–40.

<sup>89</sup> NICOLÁS, *Common Apostolic Discernment*, 13.

<sup>90</sup> *Ibid.*, 14.

<sup>91</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>92</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>93</sup> *Ibid.*, 15.

mentions the following elements that should be considered; our interior life, especially through the help of the psychological literacy, reflection on our attachment on places, groups and results, forms of the prayer life in community and the perception of success. The last element is interesting in that he calls into question why we cannot celebrate failure in community while we celebrate successes. Indeed, success can be the toughest enemy to fight<sup>94</sup>.

*c) Contribution to the Church in general*

The third question is what the Society of Jesus can contribute to the Church in general through the common apostolic discernment. Nicolás responds that it can help the Church in three different stages; at the starting point of the discernment, along the process, and its end. At the starting point, the needs of the Church should be understood as a concrete problem rather than some thing abstract. Also, it should not be something that we create. Then, we are to approach the reality in order to find God with the help of the Holy Spirit: “Learn how to approach and how to be touched by reality, how to be moved within this reality by the Holy Spirit”<sup>95</sup>.

Along in the process, Nicolás points out three key elements; aware, listening, and integration. Being aware, especially God’s at work in the world, is the core of spirituality and needs practice and effort. Then, on listening, he warns about the understanding of consolation; it is not simply a good feeling but the feeling of the Holy Spirit and listening to it. And it is not something instant but needs time to fully grasp its presence and movement. Then, it can be truly said; “To learn to become sensitive to the action of Holy Spirit is a great grace for the Church”<sup>96</sup>. Further on, the integration is what Nicolás thinks the Society of Jesus can assist the Church. Here the integration means integrating the individual discernments into the communal discernment; “I think we can help the Church and one another by learning how to integrate our insights with the insights of the community”<sup>97</sup>; and “communal discernment requires much more humility than personal detachment. So does the acceptance of the common good in preference to the private idea”<sup>98</sup>. This is truly humbling experience in

---

<sup>94</sup> *Ibid.*, 17.

<sup>95</sup> *Ibid.*, 18.

<sup>96</sup> *Ibid.*, 19.

<sup>97</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>98</sup> *Ibid.*

discerning the God's will of individuals but also enriching one too in the company of others. In this way, we are led to the obedience to God through others.

Finally, at the end, the Society of Jesus can help the Church to recognise the signs of confirmation on the discernment according to Nicolás. Firstly, he points out that if there is no community, there is no superior and a superior is always at the service of community and of the will of God<sup>99</sup>. Thus, authority can assist in the confirmation; "Authority is a part of the whole process of discernment, not an outside agent. Real communal discernment will find at the end that the authority will confirm the process"<sup>100</sup>. Moreover, on one hand, some interior signs of confirmation are "joy, hope, charity in the community, sometimes even health"<sup>101</sup>. On the other hand, the external signs are "the community itself, its consensus and sometimes the superior"<sup>102</sup>. It is interesting to note how he mentions that personal gains are never good signs of a communal discernment.

Conclusively, at the end of the discourse, Nicolás re-emphasises his point on ever present change in our life and in the world, and in turn, on the need of being open to this change and available to the ongoing discernment; "At the end we are always willing to revise everything if new signs or new data appear. Ignatius was always ready to reconsider"<sup>103</sup>.

#### 3.2.4. Arturo Sosa, "On Discernment in Common" (27<sup>th</sup> September 2017)

This relatively shorter letter compared to the others was sent out to the whole Society following GC 36. Sosa acknowledges that in order to implement the two major decisions of GC 36, the discernment in common is the prerequisite<sup>104</sup>. The Jesuits and also its collaborators are called to improve on this discernment in common<sup>105</sup>. GC 36 confirmed that it is indeed an inherent part of the way of proceeding<sup>106</sup>. Improving the capacity to discern in common is also to contribute to the wider Church in general, following the invitation of Pope

---

<sup>99</sup> *Ibid.*, 14.

<sup>100</sup> *Ibid.*, 19.

<sup>101</sup> *Ibid.*, 20.

<sup>102</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>103</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>104</sup> SOSA, A., *On Discernment in Common*, (27<sup>th</sup> September 2017), n.1.

<sup>105</sup> *Ibid.*, n.2

<sup>106</sup> *Ibid.*, n.3.

Francis and his insistence on the importance of the spiritual discernment in the Church as a whole<sup>107</sup>.

*a) Discernment in common and apostolic planning*

Sosa makes the interesting connection between the discernment in common and the apostolic planning. Firstly, he recognises that the discernment in common is for both communities and apostolic works<sup>108</sup>. Then, he says that the discernment in common is the prior condition for apostolic planning at all levels of the Society's organisational structure<sup>109</sup>. In order to grow in the fidelity to the will of God, the *spiritual examen*, following the Ignatian vision, is required in discernment in common and apostolic planning. This is in order to avoid following just the trendy techniques of the corporate planning. By supplementing the systematic evaluation with the spiritual perspective of the *examen*, apostolic planning born of discernment in common can become an instrument of apostolic effectiveness<sup>110</sup>. Sosa also emphasises to seek out the conditions to hear the Holy Spirit and to be guided by Him in life-mission, in order to have disposition to seek and follow the will of God<sup>111</sup>.

*b) Main properties of discernment in common*

Then, Sosa lists and describes the main properties of discernment in common<sup>112</sup> and notes that they are to be used following the Ignatian criteria, according to the time, the place and the person. Firstly, one needs to know how to choose well the matter that requires an election through discernment in common, and to have full and concrete information about the matter to be dealt with and about the result that is expected from the process. Secondly, one should know who should take part in the discernment and why. The matter about which the election is to be made will determine which persons shall participate, why they participate, and in which condition they do so. Thirdly, one should have the interior freedom that is, in the Ignatian terminology, *indifference*, which is noted as the fruit of an authentic spiritual life. Fourthly, the union of hearts and mind in the group that is discerning is required to make the election. This union is derived from the shared purpose and sense of belonging in all

---

<sup>107</sup> *Ibid.*, n.5.

<sup>108</sup> *Ibid.*, n.6.

<sup>109</sup> *Ibid.*, n.7.

<sup>110</sup> *Ibid.*, n.8.

<sup>111</sup> *Ibid.*, n.9.

<sup>112</sup> *Ibid.*, n.11-24.

members of the group. This means that it is essential for the group to have a mutual knowledge that yields trust in each other and in turn, motivates their active participation.

Fifthly, Sosa talks in length on this point, more than others, and mentions the three Times of making the Election<sup>113</sup>. The capacity of group to discern of spirits is the condition in which a group can make the election by perceiving and weighing the movements (*mociones*) of the spirits between consolations and desolations, which is according to the Second Time of the Election. By giving an example of agonised Jesus choosing to follow the will of God in the Garden of Olives, Sosa makes a clear point that consolations and desolations are not merely about the feeling and the state of our souls, but they are about the appeal of the movement of the spirits to choose and follow the will of God. Being in harmony with the Holy Spirit, one shall find a profound internal peace and also the joy of the Gospel as confirmation. Afterward, Sosa introduces the Third Time of the Election in which the election is made through the rational deliberation of the pros (advantages) and the cons (disadvantages) about the matter of the election. When the election is made, it is to be offered to God for confirmation.

Sixthly, Sosa recommends finding ways and spaces for personal and communal prayers in order to maintain the healthy tension between heaven and earth. It reminds the group of being one body that are sent to mission by God. The Eucharist is noted as the privileged way of praying in common and as having a special significance and a central role in discernment in common. Seventhly, Sosa reminds of the recommendation of GC 36 on the spiritual conversation; it is an essential part of discernment in common. With disposition to listen respectively, one can grow to perceive the movements of the spirits within oneself as well as in the others. He points out the difference between this way of conversation and the conversation and speech of business or parliamentary, in which discernment distinguishes from the others for having to do more about the movement of the spirits.

Eighthly, Sosa points out that the examen helps to truly perceive the movements of spirits and to confirm the orientation of life, and in such way, one moves from seeking the will of God to finding it. Furthermore, this personal examen can be combined with others in the communal examen where the movement of spirits in the group can be perceived and be confirmed. Sosa encourages to develop this ability to perceive and understand the movements

---

<sup>113</sup> *Sp. Ex.* 175-188.

of spirits in group. And finally, before the process of discernment begins, the way to make the final decision should be established and known by the participants. For example, in communities of the Society of Jesus, the local superior has the final say on the decision.

### *c) Apostolic planning*

The most interesting aspect of the letter of Sosa on discernment in common is his introduction of the apostolic planning. It does not repeat to explain the steps to be taken for making discernment in common like Kolvenbach nor it emphasises the communal process and the need of discernment in common in this fast-changing world like Nicolás. However, Sosa pays attention to the fact that with the decisions made through discernment in common, one must make it actualised into a reality. He touches upon this aspect of the realisation of the fruit of discernment in common. He also provides certain properties as prerequisites of discernment in common in order to realise it.

#### 3.2.5. The Discernment in Common and the Responses to the Sign of Times

While on the same theme of discernment in common and with the same fervour and enthusiasm for it, four Generals have manifested different emphasises on it. Arrupe approaches the discernment in common from the perspective of renewing the Charism of the Society by going back to the origin story of the *Deliberatio* in 1539 and desires to invigorate the whole Society with the original fire in the life of community with the discernment in common. He, as visionary as he was, already saw that this way of community life will help not only the Jesuits living the community life but the Church in general. This brings to the point that Pope Francis calls the whole Church to discernment and invites the Jesuits to assist her in this regard.

While Arrupe was focusing on bringing the discernment in common back on the minds of the Jesuits, Kolvenbach wrote a long letter to introduce it in a more theoretical approach and to lay out the practical instruction on its process and steps. The basic formula of the process, as well as the guidelines about conditions, community practices to improve the capacity of discernment in common, and inviting points for individuals, community and superiors involved in discernment in common facilitate to assist the realisation of the discernment in common if there is a will to make it. This approach may be because while the discernment in

common was now growing in its awareness and had been accepted as a part of the way of the proceeding in the spiritual renewal, not much had been discussed and known about the ‘how-to’ practical application.

Nicolás in a way reaffirmed the importance of discernment in common but put a particular stress on the ongoing aspect of it. The world continues to change and evolve, more so our contemporary world. He points out this constant change as an invitation to communally seek the will of God again. The changing circumstances, situations and ever-expanding knowledge provide new information for discernment. Thus, although it may be hauntingly tiresome as it seems to direct to a never-ending discernment, it should be approached as truly a part of the way of proceeding.

Finally, Sosa introduces a new aspect of apostolic planning along with the discernment in common. The decision made by discernment in common is like a vision and a pointer to where the Society should be headed. However, it is often not easy and straightforward to set out from the current reality to that vision of the future. The apostolic planning is presented as a bridge between this gap, the present and the desired future, and can provide the realistic and practical procedures to realise the hard-earned fruit of discernment in common. The reason may have been that when the discernment in common is ended with a fruitful new decision, often times that decision has not been materialised as much as it was aspired to be. A long list of GC documents is also fruit of the discernment in common while many decrees of GCs since GC 31 have not been made into reality, for example, GC 31 D.3 Task of the Society regarding Atheism. Therefore, Sosa was perhaps elected to close the gap between the present reality and the desired future by implementing the apostolic planning.

\* \* \*

On 19<sup>th</sup> February 2019, Sosa sent out to the whole Society the letter on the Universal Apostolic Preferences of the Society of Jesus for the years 2019-2029. After 16 months of deliberation from local communities to the provinces to the conferences and finally to the Roman curia, this discernment in common has impressed many for its long process, for a new and/or renewed experience of the discernment in common and for its outcome. Four

preferences are<sup>114</sup>; firstly, to show the way to God through the Spiritual Exercises and discernment; secondly, to walk with the poor, the outcasts of the world, those whose dignity has been violated, in a mission of reconciliation and justice; thirdly, to accompany young people in the creation of a hope-filled future; and finally, to collaborate in the care of our Common Home. However, the more impressive thing was the response of Pope Francis confirming the preferences saying; “the first preference is crucial because it presupposes as a basic condition the Jesuit’s relationship with the Lord in a personal and communal life of prayer and discernment”<sup>115</sup> because “without this prayerful attitude the other preferences will not bear fruit”<sup>116</sup>.

After VCII, the Society has sought to renew itself according to its spiritual source while facing and contemplating the reality. The discernment in common, as a part of its Charism and of the way of proceeding, has been mentioned often and has been highlighted with different emphases through documents of GCs and letters of Fathers General. Undeniably, it is not just merely a tool but an essential element of being a Jesuit, in the inter-connectedness of identity – mission – community. Looking back to the origin of the Society, the *First Fathers* are still an inspiration in seeking the will of God to respond communally to a concrete world. The constantly changing world is unsettling and nowadays it especially feels like there is nothing stable and reliable, represented with the business jargon VACU – volatility, ambiguity, complexity, and uncertainty. This current atmosphere makes the discernment in common a more valid, solid, and communal way to weave through the unpredictable reality of today.

---

<sup>114</sup> SOSA, A., *Universal Apostolic Preferences of the Society of Jesus, 2019-2029*, (19<sup>th</sup> February 2019), 1.

<sup>115</sup> Letter of Pope Francis attached at the end of SOSA, *Universal Apostolic Preferences of the Society of Jesus, 2019-2029*.

<sup>116</sup> *Ibid.*



“We were confident that He would in no way fail us, but since His kindness is without measure, He would assist us beyond our fondest hopes and expectations.”

- *Deliberatio*, n.1.

## Conclusion

Recently, my community has had a one-day retreat of Easter time. The retreat giver gave points on the new four Universal Apostolic Preferences (UAP) and at one point, jokingly talked about what Jesuits do whenever a new document of the Church or of the Society of Jesus comes out, saying that when we have a new document, we have a process of *read*, *preach* and then *archive*. He was pointing out the fact that we, at least as Jesuits, often receive those new documents with rigor, and read and investigate on it to understand it better. Then, often we preach and teach on the topics. Finally, the documents are done in a way that now we *know* them already and let us move on. More often than not, there is no follow up in action. The documents, such as of this new UAP and of GCs, become good documents to read and ponder on.

While doing the research on this topic of the discernment in common, it was a pleasant surprise that there are indeed many books, articles and resources regarding the discernment in common. There are also plenty of historical and theological studies regarding the *First Companions* and the *Deliberatio* itself. Not only that, GC 31 already had begun to talk about it, followed by the succeeding GCs, and it is a topic written by every Father General since Arrupe. However, one troubling fact is that most of those works were dated back to 1970s. And then, came the resurgence of interest and emphasis once more with GC 36 in 2016. It brings one to wonder whatever happened to those thirty something years in-between those two periods. One elderly Jesuit joked the other day while talking about this vacuum of time, “The

discernment in common is like old fashion coming back. The retro fashion is back, after forty something years, just like any fashion. And it will pass by like the last time”.

The actual realisation of the usage of the discernment in common has hit the great wall and has never realised what it is supposed to be in the Society as well as in the Church. Some may find the reasons for that in the recent history of the Catholic Church and Popes. However, more than the other reasons, one is fairly obvious; that it, for whatever reason, has not been practised in the Society. While talking with other Jesuits, they tend to agree with the importance of the discernment in common and its necessity in today’s world, but most often they have not had any experience of it in their Jesuit life, let alone in their formation. By the look of it, the usual routine of ‘*read, preach and archive*’ may happen once more at this time of the renewed trendy “intellectual” interest in the discernment in common. This short investigation will join those articles, books and talks eventually if it is sadly so. There is an apparent reality of obvious obstacles and resistance to the discernment in common, in the Society at least, and it is true that in order to do the discernment in common properly, many elements of the personal and communal life as well as spiritual life require to be lived accordingly, and this may mean a lot of change in the manner of living and in the culture of a group/community. This area can be further investigated, with more realistic and practical perspective, and also may find some ways and answers to revive the practice of the discernment in common and to revitalise it within the Society and the Church in the Spirit.

In spite of lack of practice and of formation in the discernment in common, there are much to hope for through this investigation. Ever since he became the first Jesuit Pope, Pope Francis has been urging people at all different levels in the Church to learn discernment and the Church should be a discerning church;

“A synodal Church is a Church of listening. It is a mutual listening in which everyone has something to learn: the faithful, the College of Bishops, [and the] Bishop of Rome; each listening to the others; and all listening to the Holy Spirit, the “Spirit of truth” (Jn 14, 17), to know what he ‘says to the Churches’ (Rev 2: 7)”<sup>1</sup>.

---

<sup>1</sup> POPE FRANCIS, *Address at the General Synod, on the 50th Anniversary of the General Synod*, (17 October 2015).

The discernment, whether that be personal or communal, requires the quality and capacity, that are both natural and nurtured. It is no doubt that Ignatius of Loyola with the *Spiritual Exercises* has given the Church this discernment as a gift, through the grace of God. The so-called Ignatian spirituality is based on the *Exercises* and as seen before, the Election is its one key element. The recent Universal Apostolic Preference confirms that this Ignatian Spirituality, through the *Spiritual Exercises* and discernment, is the first preference of the apostolate work of the Society. With them, the Society intends to help people and the Church to see the way to God.

Furthermore, being able to do the personal discernment properly would enable a group of people, a community, to do the discernment in common. The *First Fathers*, including Ignatius, made the *Deliberatio* in 1539 in order to seek the will of God for them, following the method of Ignatius that can be found in the *Exercises*. The impressive fact of the *Deliberatio* is that this decision made together is a small but significant spark of fire<sup>2</sup> that led to the foundation of the Society of Jesus. They shared the same spirituality through the experience of the *Exercises* and also the same way of living and working the apostolate works. The recent GCs, especially of 35 and 36 find the community and discernment in common as essential parts of the Charism of the Society of Jesus and attempts to rediscover that in the reality. It is the key element that initiated this religious order, in the true sense of *compañía*, but somehow on the way, got lost in practice. The renewal of the religious Charism after VCII and following works of Arrupe began the important process of renewal and has formed and evolved the Society in many ways. Moreover, the community life should be renewed in greater shared fraternity and concern for each other together, in order to be able to seek the will of God together, that is, the discernment in common, and to be sent to mission while remaining in one apostolic body of the Society. It is truly a privileged place for the discernment in common<sup>3</sup> as well as a place to inspire others through the community life, especially young people<sup>4</sup>. However, somehow, this aspect of its Charism is still dragging behind. Thus, it is very logical that the Society today should re-find this art of discernment in common as a part of constituting its way of proceeding. Here, it is important to note the shift of focus from “what to do” to “how to do” in GC 36. It did not have the usual decree on a certain apostolate but the decree on the methodology of “*how*”.

---

<sup>2</sup> GC 35, D.2, n.2.

<sup>3</sup> GC 36, D.1, n.8.

<sup>4</sup> GC 35, D.2, n.19.

More so now than before, the discernment in common can offer much needed communal collaboration in reading the sign of time and in seeking God's will in this ever-changing, diverse and complex world. The increasingly secularised society pushed out God and other metaphysical principles and values out of the world. The globalisation and relativism lead to lose the sense of objectivity while celebrating subjectivity and an attitude of "all is well". On the other hand, the increasingly divided and fragmented world with the growing polarisation in the various areas such as political, social, economic, religious and cultural, lead to the situation where a conversation between two extremes is not possible. The rise of "the fake news" and the Social Network Services of the internet create the bubbles that just reinforce one's own ideology and perspective, but do not challenge and confront with other ideas and perspectives. In this diverse and extremely complex world, no one person can confidently say anything with certainty; it is time when many should come together and seek the way together. In such situation, what better way is available in the Church and in the Society than the discernment in common? Diverse experiences and various reflections on them are necessary to see this complex and changing reality in a more complete and clear way. Through the discernment in common, it is not the ideas and solutions that are sought; rather, in midst of all that is going on, the will of God is sought for this particular moment in the human history through the movements in our soul. At this precise moment of time, it is such a great gift for all of us in the Church from God through Ignatius of Loyola, and it is true Charism, that is, the particular grace that God bestows upon a religious order, especially for the Society. Indeed, it is a great time to share this special gift<sup>5</sup> that the Society has with the Church and the world.

---

<sup>5</sup> GC 36, D.1, n.23; Francis, *Gaudete et Exsultate*, (19<sup>th</sup> March 2018), nn.167-168.

# Bibliography

[between the brackets are the number of the volumes of the general series of MHSI]

## 1. PRIMARY SOURCES

1.1. Ignatian Sources

1.2. Translations and collections

## 2. SECONDARY SOURCES

2.1. Books

2.2. Articles

## 3. DICTIONARIES

## 4. DOCUMENTS OF THE MAGISTERIUM OF THE CHURCH

4.1. The Magisterium of the Church

4.2. The Magisterium of the Society of Jesus

## 1. PRIMARY SOURCES

### 1.1. Ignatian Sources

“Autobiography. Acta Patris Ignatii scripta a P. Lud. González de Câmara 1553 - 1555”, in *Fontes Narrativi de S. Ignatio de Loyola et de Societatis Iesu initiis*, vol. I, Fernandez Zapico, D. - Dalmases, C. de, (eds.), Roma 1943, 354-507 (MHSI 66).

“Deliberatio Primorum Patrum”, in *Monumenta Constitutionum*, vol. I, Roma 1934, 1-7 (MHSI 63).

*Fabri Monumenta: Beati Petri Fabri Epistolae, Memoriale et Processus*, Madrid 1914 [repr. 1972] (MHSI 48).

*Fontes Narrativi de S. Ignatio de Loyola et de Societatis Iesu initiis* (4 vols.), I, Fernandez Zapico, D. - Dalmases, C. de, (eds.), Roma 1943-1965 (MHSI 66, 73, 85, 93).

*Monumenta Bobadillae*, Madrid 1913 [repr. 1970] (MHSI 46).

*Monumenta Constitutionum* (I Praevia; II Textus Hispanus; III Textus latinas), Roma 1934-1938 (MHSI 63, 64, 65).

*Monumenta Exercitiae*, Iparraguirre, I. - Calversa, I. - Dalmases, C. de, (eds.), I Exercitia spiritualia, Textus, II Directoria 1540 - 1599), Roma 1955-1969 (MHSI 76, 100).

*Monumenta Lainii*, Epistolae et acta Patris Iacobi Lainii (8 vols.), Madrid 1912-1917 (MHSI 44, 45, 47, 49, 50, 51, 53, 55).

*Monumenta PP. Broeti, Claudii Jaii, Roderici Joannis Coduri, Simonis Rodericii Societatis Iesu*, Madrid 1903 [repr. 1971] (MHSI 24).

*Monumenta Salmeronis, Epistolae P. Alphonsi Salmeronis Societatis Iesu* (2 vols.), Madrid 1906-1907 (MHSI 30, 32).

*Monumenta Xaveriana, Epistolae S. Francisci Xavierii aliaque eius scripta* (2 vols.), Schurhammer, G – Wicki, I., (eds.), Roma 1944-1945 (MHSI 67, 68).

*Sancti Ignatii de Loyola Societatis Iesu fundatoris epistolae et instructiones* (12 vols.), Madrid 1903-1911 [repr. 1964-1968] (MHSI 22, 26, 28, 29, 31, 33, 34, 36, 37, 39, 40, 42).

*The Constitutions, Monumenta Constitutionum*, vol. II Textus Hispanus, Rome 1936 (MHSI 64).

*The Spiritual Exercises, Monumenta Exercitiae*, vol. I Exercitia Spiritualia, Calversa, I. – Dalmases, C. de, (eds.), Rome 1969 (MHSI 100).

## 1.2. Translations and collections

- FLEMING, D. L., *Draw Me into Your Friendship: The Spiritual Exercises A Literal Translation & A Contemporary Reading*, The Institute of Jesuit Sources, Saint Louis 1996.
- GANSS, G. E., *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius*, The Institute of Jesuit Source, Saint Louis 1992.
- GRUPO DE ESPIRITUALIDAD IGNACIANA, (ed.), *Escritos Esenciales de Los Primeros Jesuitas*, (2nd ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilao-Santander 2017.
- MARUCA, D., “The Deliberation of Our First Fathers”, *Woodstock Letters* 95 (1966), 325-333.
- MUNITIZ, J. A. - ENDEAN, P., (eds.), *Saint Ignatius of Loyola: Personal Writings*, Penguin Books, London, 1996 [repr. 2004].
- RUIZ JURADO, M. (ed.), *Obras Completas San Ignacio de Loyola*, Biblioteca de Autores Critianos, Madrid 2014.

## 2. SECONDARY SOURCES

### 2.1. Books

- ARZUBIALDE, S., *Ejercicios Espirituales de S. Ignacio: Historia y Análisis*, (2nd ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2009.
- BYRNE, B., *The Hospitality of God: A Reading of Luke’s Gospel*, Liturgical Press, Collegeville 2000.
- CARO BAROJA, J. - BERISTAIN, A., (dirs.), *Ignacio de Loyola, Magister Artium en París 1528-1535*, Kutxa, San Sebastián, 1991.
- CENTRUM IGNATIANUM SPIRITUALITATIS, (ed.), *Constitutions of the Society of Jesus, Incorporation of a Spirit*, Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, Anand 1993.
- \_\_\_\_\_, (ed.), *Dossier “Deliberatio” A*, Rome 1972.
- \_\_\_\_\_, (ed.), *Dossier “Deliberatio” B*, Rome 1972.
- FLEMING, D. L., *Like the Lightning: the Dynamics of the Ignatian Exercises*, the Institute of Jesuit Sources, Saint Louis 2004.

- GARCÍA DOMÍNGUEZ, L. M., *La Entrevista en Los Ejercicios Espirituales*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2010.
- GIULIANI, M., *La experiencia de los Ejercicios Espirituales en la vida*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 1997.
- GONZÁLEZ, L. - IBAÑEZ, J. - IPARRAGUIRRE, I. - ITURRIOZ, J., *Dimensión eclesial de los Ejercicios*, Mensajero, Bilbao 1973.
- IVENS, M., *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, Gracewing Publishing, Wiltshire 1998.
- LEAR MONREAL, J. M., *La pneumatología de los Ejercicios Espirituales*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2016.
- MARYKS, R. A., (ed.), *A Companion to Ignatius of Loyola: Life, Writings, Spirituality, Influence*, Brill, Leiden 2014.
- MULDON, T., *The Ignatian Workout: daily spiritual exercises for a healthy faith*, Loyola Press, Chicago 2004.
- O'MALLEY, J., *The First Jesuits*, Harvard University Press, Cambridge 1993.
- RAHNER, H., *Ignatius the Theologian*, Geoffrey Chapman, London 1990.

## 2.2. Articles

- ALBURQUERQUE, A., “FABRO, Pedro”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. I, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 863-868.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Laínez, Diego”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. II, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 1109-1115.
- ALONSO ROMO, E. J., “Javier, Francisco”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. II, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 1051-1054.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Rodríguez, Simón”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. II, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana, Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 1574-1577.
- BURRIEZA SÁNCHEZ, J., “Bobadilla, Alfonso N.”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. I, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 238-240.

- CODINA, V., “A Silent Presence the Holy Spirit in the Ignatian Exercises”, *EIDES* 6 (2016), 5-36.
- CONWELL, J., “Deliberaciones 1539”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. I, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 549-553.
- CORELLA, J., “Consolación”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. I, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 413-424.
- COSTA, M., “Venecia”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. II, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 1757-1766.
- DALMASES, C. de, “Bobadilla, Nicolás”, in *Diccionario Histórico de la Compañía de Jesús*, vol. I, O’NEILL, Ch. E. - DOMÍNGUEZ, J. M., (dirs.), Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu - Universidad Pontificia Comillas, Roma - Madrid 2001, 463-465.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Coduri (codure), Jean”, in *Diccionario Histórico de la Compañía de Jesús*, vol. I, O’NEILL, Ch. E. - DOMÍNGUEZ, J. M., (dirs.), Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu - Universidad Pontificia Comillas, Roma - Madrid 2001, 833.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Hoce (Hozes), Diego”, in *Diccionario Histórico de la Compañía de Jesús*, vol. II, O’NEILL, Ch. E. - DOMÍNGUEZ, J. M., (dirs.), Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu - Universidad Pontificia Comillas, Roma - Madrid 2001, 1929
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Jay (Le Jay, Jayo), Claude”, in *Diccionario Histórico de la Compañía de Jesús* vol. III, O’NEILL, Ch. E. - DOMÍNGUEZ, J. M., (dirs.), Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu - Universidad Pontificia Comillas, Roma - Madrid 2001, 2142-2143.
- DECLoux, S., “Identity, Community, Mission: Their links within the Society of Jesus”, *Review of Ignatian Spirituality* 125 (2010), 67–74.
- DONNELLY, J. P., “Broët (Brouay), Paschase”, in *Diccionario Histórico de la Compañía de Jesús*, vol. I, O’NEILL, Ch. E. - DOMÍNGUEZ, J. M., (dirs.), Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu - Universidad Pontificia Comillas, Roma - Madrid 2001, 552.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Fabro (Faber, Favre, Le Rèvre), Pierre”, in *Diccionario Histórico de la Compañía de Jesús*, vol. II, O’NEILL, Ch. E. - DOMÍNGUEZ, J. M., (dirs.), Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu - Universidad Pontificia Comillas, Roma - Madrid 2001, 1369-1370.
- FRICK, E., “The Jesuit community a space for discovering our missionary identity”, *Review of Ignatian Spirituality* 126 (2011), 25–34.

- GARCÍA DE CASTRO, J., “¿Qué hacemos cuando hacemos ejercicios? La actividad del ejercitante a través de sus verbos”, *Manresa* 74 (2002), 11-40.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Alcanzados por las Fuentes: ¿por qué? ¿cómo?”, *Manresa* 81 (2009), 311-328.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Broët, Paschasio”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. I, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 246-250.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Codure, J”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. I, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 329-331.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Comunidad”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. I, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 362-369.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Jayo, Claudio”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. II, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 1054-1061.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Moción”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. II, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 1265-1268.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Primeros Compañeros”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. II, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 1481-1490.
- GEGER, B. T., "The *First First* Companions: The Continuing Impact of the Men who Left Ignatius”, *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 44-2 (2012), 1-38.
- GRAY, H. J., “Joy and friendship in the Fourth Week”, *The Way Supplement* 99 (2000), 11-21.
- GUILLÉN, A., “Praise: The Fundamental Attitude in the Church”, *The Way* 52-2 (2013), 101-112.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Directorio breve sobre la Cuarta Semana”, *Manresa* 88 (2016), 189-192.
- LÓPEZ HORTELANO, E., “Los ejercicios espirituales de san Ignacio. Análisis del texto como proceso helicoidal y especular”, *Estudios Eclesiásticos* 93/364 (2018), 131-163.
- LÓPEZ GAY, J., “Javier, Francisco”, in *Diccionario Histórico de la Compañía de Jesús*, vol. III, O’NEILL, Ch. E. - DOMÍNGUEZ, J. M., (dirs.), Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu - Universidad Pontificia Comillas, Roma - Madrid 2001, 2140-2141.

- MELLONI, J., “Manresa”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. II, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 1192-1195.
- MEMBERS OF GENERAL CONGREGATION 36, “The Moment of GC 36 for Its Members”, *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 49 (2017), 1-40.
- OLIVA DE LA ESPERANZA, A., “The Jesuit Community as Mission”, *Promotio Iustitiae* 112 (2013), 28–32.
- ORSY, L., “Toward a Theological Evaluation of Communal Discernment”, *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 5-5 (1973), 139-188.
- OSUNA, J., “amigos en el Señor”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. I, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 143-148.
- PARENTE, U., “Salmerón, Alfonso”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. II, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 1598-1603.
- REISER, W., “Locating the Grace of the Fourth Week: A Theological Inquiry”, *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 38-3 (2006), 1-40.
- RUIZ PÉREZ, F. J., “La Congregación General 36 y su invitación al discernimiento en común”, *Manresa* 90 (2018), 17-26.
- SANZ DE DIEGO, R. M., “Alumbrados”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. I, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 130-132.
- SCADUTO, M., “Laínez, Diego”, in *Diccionario Histórico de la Compañía de Jesús*, vol. II, O’NEILL, Ch. E. - DOMÍNGUEZ, J. M., (dirs.), Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu - Universidad Pontificia Comillas, Roma - Madrid 2001, 1601-1605.
- \_\_\_\_\_, “Salmerón, Alfonso”, in *Diccionario Histórico de la Compañía de Jesús*, vol. IV, O’NEILL, Ch. E. - DOMÍNGUEZ, J. M., (dirs.), Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu - Universidad Pontificia Comillas, Roma - Madrid 2001, 3474-3476.
- TEJERA, M., “Cuarta Semana”, in *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, vol. I, Grupo de Espiritualidad Ignaciana (ed.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007, 511-515.
- TONER, J. J., “The Deliberation That Started the Jesuits”, *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 6-4 (1974), 179-212.
- VALERO, U., “Identity, Community, Mission: Reflections around ‘a kind of Triptych’”, *Review of Ignatian Spirituality* 125 (2010), 54–66.

VAZ DE CARVALHO, J., “Rodrigues, Simão R. de Azevedo”, in *Diccionario Histórico de la Compañía de Jesús*, vol. IV, O’NEILL, Ch. E. - DOMÍNGUEZ, J. M., (dirs.), Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu - Universidad Pontificia Comillas, Roma - Madrid 2001, 3390-3392.

### 3. DICTIONARIES

COROMINAS, J. - PASCUAL, J. A. (dirs.), *Diccionario Crítico Etimológico Castellano e Hispánica* (6 vols.), Gredos, Madrid 1980 (repr. 1991).

COVARRUBIAS, S. de, *Tesoro de la Lengua Castellana* (1611), Altafulla, Barcelona 1987.

*Diccionario de Autoridades* (3 vols.), Gredos, Madrid 1990.

ECHARTE, I. (ed.), *Concordancia Ignaciana*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 1996.

O’NEILL, Ch. E. - DOMÍNGUEZ, J. M., (dirs.), *Diccionario Histórico de la Compañía de Jesús* (4 vols.), Institutum Historicum Societatis Iesu - Universidad Pontificia Comillas, Roma - Madrid 2001.

GRUPO DE ESPIRITUALIDAD IGNACIANA (ed.), *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae, Bilbao-Santander 2007.

SOMMERVOGEL, C., *Bibliothèque de la Compagnie de Jésus* (10 vols.), Supplément, Tables, Histoire), Paris-Bruxelles, 1890-1932.

### 4. DOCUMENTS OF THE MAGISTERIUM OF THE CHURCH

#### 4.1. The Magisterium of the Church

PAUL VI, *Perfectae Caritatis* (28<sup>th</sup> October 1965).

FRANCIS, *Gaudete et Exsultate* (19<sup>th</sup> March 2018).

#### 4.2. The Magisterium of the Society of Jesus

31<sup>st</sup> General Congregation of the Society of Jesus.

32<sup>nd</sup> General Congregation of the Society of Jesus.

33<sup>rd</sup> General Congregation of the Society of Jesus.

34<sup>th</sup> General Congregation of the Society of Jesus.

35<sup>th</sup> General Congregation of the Society of Jesus.

36<sup>th</sup> General Congregation of the Society of Jesus.

ARRUPE, P., *Quelques points pour la rénovation spirituelle* (24<sup>th</sup> June 1971).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Sobre el discernimiento espiritual comunitario* (25<sup>th</sup> December 1971).

\_\_\_\_\_, “De spirituali discretione”, in *Acta Romana Societatis Iesu XV* (1971),  
767–773.

\_\_\_\_\_, *Guidelines for Distinction and Relation between Director of Work and Superior* (31<sup>st</sup> December 1976).

\_\_\_\_\_, *The Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism* (8 February 1980);

ARRUPE, P., “L’inspiration Trinitaire Du Charisme Ignatien”, in *Acta Romana Societatis Iesu XVIII* (1980), 115–163.

KOLVENBACH, P., *On Apostolic Discernment in Common* (5<sup>th</sup> November 1986).

\_\_\_\_\_, “Creative Fidelity in Mission”, *Review of Ignatian Spirituality*, 95  
(1990) 25–40.

\_\_\_\_\_, *On Community Life* (12<sup>th</sup> March 1998).

NICOLÁS, A., *Common Apostolic Discernment* (19<sup>th</sup> January 2009).

SOSA, A., *Our life is mission, mission is our life* (10<sup>th</sup> July 2017).

\_\_\_\_\_, *On Discernment in Common* (27<sup>th</sup> September 2017).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Universal Apostolic Preferences of the Society of Jesus, 2019-2029*  
(19<sup>th</sup> February 2019).



## Appendices

1. Appendix A. The Mysteries of Christ's Life – The Risen Life
2. Appendix B. The General Congregations 31, 32, and 33 on the Discernment in Common
3. Appendix C. The General Congregations 34, 35, and 36 on the Discernment in Common



Appendix A.

The Mysteries of Christ's Life – The Risen Life

Sp.Ex.	Title	Source	Persons	Actions achieved	Quotes from the <i>Sp. Ex.</i>
299	The 1 <sup>st</sup> Apparition	<i>Vita Christi</i>	Mary		
300	The 2 <sup>nd</sup> Apparition	Mk 16:1-11	Three Marys		
301	The 3 <sup>rd</sup> Apparition	Mt 28:8-10	Three Marys	Back to Community; given mission	“Tell my brothers to go into Galilee”
302	The 4 <sup>th</sup> Apparition	Lk 24:9-12, 33-34; Jn 20:1-10	Peter		
303	The 5 <sup>th</sup> Apparition	Lk 24:13-35	Disciples of Emmaus	Back to Community; mission; understanding of the passion and death	
304	The 6 <sup>th</sup> Apparition	Jn 20:19-23	Disciples in fear	Building Community; receiving of the Holy Spirit; given mission	“whose sins you forgive are forgiven them”
305	The 7 <sup>th</sup> Apparition	Jn 20:24-29	Thomas with other disciples	Brought back into Community in its communion; no one is left behind	
306	The 8 <sup>th</sup> Apparition	Jn 21:1-17	7 disciples & Peter	Apostleship; given a mission	“Feed my sheep”
307	The 9 <sup>th</sup> Apparition	Mt 28:16-20	Disciples	Apostleship; given a mission	“Go, therefore, and teach all nations, baptizing them ...”
308	The 10 <sup>th</sup> Apparition	1 Cor 15:6	More than 500 brethren		
309	The 11 <sup>th</sup> Apparition	1 Cor 15:7	James		
310	The 12 <sup>th</sup> Apparition	<i>Vita Christi</i>	Joseph of Arimathea		
311	The 13 <sup>th</sup> Apparition	1 Cor 15:8	Paul; holy ancestors in limbo; disciples	Conversion; given a mission	
312	The Ascension	Acts 1:1-12	Apostles	Given a mission	“Men of Galilee, why are you standing there looking up at the sky?”

Apparition - <b>PERSONAL</b>
Apparition - <b>COMMUNAL</b>
Sense of <b>MISSION</b> ; of being sent



## The General Congregations 31, 32, and 33 on the Discernment in Common<sup>1</sup>

### 1. General Congregations 31

#### Decree 8: The Spiritual Formation of Jesuits

##### D.8 n.3

“Our following of Christ will be more genuine and intimate the more intent each Jesuit is on adopting that manner of serving Christ peculiar to the Society ... And let those attitudes of mind be cultivated which St. Ignatius held most dear: ... the ability to find God in all things, development of skill in the discernment of spirits ...”

##### D.8 n. 5

“For the sake of each one's spiritual growth, we should all cooperate actively in a spirit of fraternal love ... All should therefore have high regard for the account of conscience, ... and also for fraternal gatherings which, if they promote common seeking of God's will, bring spiritual joy, encouragement, and apostolic fruitfulness.”

---

<sup>1</sup> This appendix is the *Appendix 1* in KOLVENBACH, P., *On Apostolic Discernment in Common* (5<sup>th</sup> November 1986). The emphasis is of Kolvenbach.

## Decree 17: The Life of Obedience

### D.17 n.6

“But in order that he may more easily discern the will of God, the superior should have at hand able advisers and should often consult them. He should also use the services of experts in reaching decisions on complex matters ... Besides, since all who work together in God's service are under the influence of the Holy Spirit and His grace, it will be well in the Lord to use their ideas and advice so as to understand God's will better. Superiors in the Society should readily and often ask for and listen to the counsel of their brethren, of a few or of many, or even of all gathered together, according to the importance and nature of the matter ... but the duty of the superior himself to decide and enjoin what ought to be done remains intact.”

## Decree 19: Community Life and Religious Discipline

### D.19 n.5

“More concretely, the following are increasingly necessary for community life in the Society of Jesus: ... Frequent consultation with experts, to share their insights, and frequent consultation among the members of the community, aimed at actively engaging everyone in the process of coordinating and promoting the apostolate, and in other things which pertain to the good of the community.”

## 2. General Congregations 32

### Decree 2. Jesuits Today

#### D.2 n.19

“The Jesuit community is also a community of discernment. The missions on which Jesuits are sent, whether corporately or individually, do not exempt us from the need of discerning together in what manner and by what means such missions are to be accomplished. That is why we open our minds and hearts ... always on the shared understanding that final decisions belong to those who have the burden of authority.”

## Decree 4. Our Mission Today

### D.4 n.71

“... Each province or group of provinces must undertake programme of reflection and a review of our apostolates to discover what action is appropriate in each particular context.”

### D.4 n.72

“What is required is not so much a research programme as a process of reflection and evaluation inspired by Ignatian tradition of spiritual discernment, in which the primary stress is on prayer and the effort to attain “indifference,” that is, an apostolic readiness for anything.”

### D.4 n.73

“The general method to be followed to produce this awareness and to engage in this discernment may be described (see Octogesima Adveniens, n. 4) as a constant interplay between experience, reflection, decision and action, in line with the Jesuit ideal of being “contemplative in action.” The aim is to insure change in our habitual patterns of thought, a conversion of heart as well as of spirit. The result will be effective apostolic decisions.”

### D.4 n.74

“The process of evaluation and discernment must be brought to bear principally on the following: ... and the review and renewal of our apostolic commitments ...”

### D.4 n.77

“In each province or region, or at least at the Assistancy level, there should be a definite mechanism for the review of our ministries. Now is a good time to examine critically how these arrangements are working and, if need be, to replace them by others which are effective and allow for a wider participation in the process of communal discernment.”

## Decree 11. The Union of Minds and Hearts

### D.11 n.20

“Certain features of our Ignatian heritage can be given a communitarian dimension ... For

instance, the examen of conscience could, at times, be made a shared reflection on the community's fidelity to its apostolic mission. Similarly, fraternal correction and personal dialogue with the superior can usefully become a community review of community life-style.”

D.11 n.21

“We can go further and say that community spiritual interchange can, under certain conditions, become communitarian discernment. This is something quite distinct from the usual community dialogue. It is "a corporate search for the will of God by means of a shared reflection on the signs which point where the Spirits! Christ is leading" (Fr. Arrupe, "De Nostrorum in spiritu institutione," AR XV, 1967, 123-4), and the method to follow in such communitarian discernment is analogous to that which St. Ignatius teaches for the making of a personal decision on a matter of importance (Sp. Ex. 169-189).”

D.11 n.22

“There are prerequisites for a valid communitarian discernment. On the part of the individual member of the community, a certain familiarity with the Ignatian rules for the discernment of spirits, derived from actual use (*Sp. Ex.* 313-336); a determined resolution to find the will of God for the community whatever it may cost; and, in general, the dispositions of mind and heart called for and cultivated in the First and Second Weeks of the Exercises. On the part of the community as such, a clear definition of the matter to be discerned, sufficient information regarding it, and ‘a capacity to convey to one another what each one really thinks and feels.’”

D.11 n.23

“Clearly, the requisite dispositions for true communitarian discernment are such that they will not be verified as often as those for ordinary community dialogue. Nevertheless, every community should seek to acquire them, so that when need arises it can enter into this special way of seeking the will of God. Indeed, ... even ordinary community meetings and house consultations can incorporate elements of true communitarian discernment, provided we seriously seek God's will concerning the life and work of the community.”

D.11 n.24

“What is the role of the superior in communitarian discernment? It is, first, to develop, as far as he can, the requisite dispositions for it; second, to decide when to convoke the community

for it, and clearly to define its object; third, to take active part in it as the bond of union within the community and as the link between the community and the Society as a whole; and, finally, to make the final decision in the light of the discernment, but freely, as the to whom both the grace and the burden of authority are given. For in our Society the discerning community is not a deliberative or capitular body but a consultative one, whose object, clearly understood and fully accepted, is to assist the superior to determine what course of action is for God's greater glory and the service of men.”

D.11 n.50

“To the extent possible, superiors should strive to build an Ignatian apostolic community in which many forms of open and friendly communication on a spiritual level are possible. Since it is a privileged way to find God’s will, the use of communal spiritual discernment is encouraged if the question at issue is of some importance and the necessary preconditions have been verified.”

### 3. General Congregations 33

Decree 1. Companions of Jesus Sent into Today's World

D.1 n.12

“If we are to hear and respond to the call of God in this kind of world, then we must have a discerning attitude. For us Jesuits the way of discernment involves: the examination of conscience, prayer and brotherly dialogue within our communities, and the openness to superiors that facilitates obedience.”

D.1 n.13

“We cannot attain this discerning attitude without self-abnegation ... Without such an attitude we cannot present ourselves as interiorly free enough for the authentic service of Him who calls us.”

D.1 n.39

“If we are to fulfill our mission, we must be faithful to that practice of communal apostolic discernment so central to “our way of proceeding,” a practice rooted in the *Exercises and Constitutions*. This way of proceeding calls for a review of all our ministries, both traditional and new.”

D.1 n.40

“Such a review includes: an attentiveness to the Word of God; an examination and reflection inspired by the Ignatian tradition; a personal and communitarian conversion necessary in order to become “contemplatives in action”; an effort to live an indifference and availability that will enable us to find God in all things; and a transformation of our habitual patterns of thought through a constant interplay of experience, reflection and action ... This process, undertaken in the local community, province or region, leads to apostolic decisions made by superiors, after normal consultation and with accountability to Father General.”

D.1 n.41

“But such an effort runs the risk of failure unless we attend to the practical conditions required for its serious application. These conditions, to be given special attention both in initial and ongoing formation, include: deeper involvement in the lives of the people around us ...; a regular exposure to new situations of life and thought which oblige us to question our way of seeing and judging; a gradual assimilation of that apostolic pedagogy of St. Ignatius; a well-informed use of social and cultural analysis; and an inculturation ...”

D.1 n.42

“Definitions alone cannot clarify the apostolic directions of our mission. Such clarity can only come when we are faithful to the process and conditions a communal apostolic discernment ...”

## The General Congregations 34, 35, and 36 on the Discernment in Common

### 1. General Congregation 34

#### Decree 1. Introduction: United with Christ on Mission

##### D.1 n.7

“Ignatius presents a Christ who is on the move, travelling through villages and visiting synagogues to preach the Kingdom, going where people dwell and work. This contemplative identification of Jesus on mission is linked to the Election of the Exercises. In their own communal apostolic discernment, which led to the founding of the Society, Ignatius and his companions saw this as their unique call, their charism: to choose to be with Christ as servants of his mission, to be with people where they dwell and work and struggle, to bring the Gospel into their lives and labours.”

##### D.1 n.11

“There is need for Jesuits themselves to be in dialogue with one another, to create an atmosphere of discerning listening and exchange.”

## Decree 5. Our Mission and Interreligious Dialogue

### D.5 n.17

“As Companions of Jesus sent into today's world, a world characterized by religious pluralism, we have a special responsibility to promote interreligious dialogue. The Ignatian vision of reality provides the spiritual inspiration and ministerial grounding for this urgent task. It opens our eyes to the incomprehensible mystery of God's salvific presence (*Deus semper major*) in the world. It makes us sensitive to the sacred space of God's direct dealing with human persons in history. The contemplation of God labouring in all things helps us to discern the divine spirit in religions and cultures. The Kingdom meditation enables us to understand history as God's history with us. The Jesuit heritage of creative response to the call of the Spirit in concrete situations of life is an incentive to develop a culture of dialogue in our approach to believers of other religions.”

## Decree 6. The Jesuit Priest: Ministerial Priesthood and Jesuit Identity

### D.6 n.7

“The Companions of Jesus who offer themselves to the Church for priestly ministry do so because they discern this as the will of the Lord, which the Church confirms by ordaining and commissioning them for ministerial service in its name.”

### D.6 n.20

“In the exercise of their ministerial priesthood, Jesuits try to see what God has already done in the lives of individuals, societies and cultures, and to discern how God will continue that work.”

## Decree 7. The Jesuit Brother

### D.7 n.3

“From the very beginning of his conversion, Ignatius felt called to "help others," to give himself entirely to the service of "the Eternal King and Lord of all."<sup>5</sup> The group of companions, "friends in the Lord," were to find in their discernment how they were to live their apostolic vocation in the Church: by founding a Religious Order.”

D.7 n.11

“If everyone — priests, brothers and scholastics — share in all aspects of community life, including faith, domestic tasks, relaxation, prayer, apostolic discernment, the Eucharist, and the Spiritual Exercises, we will truly become "friends in the Lord." This sharing of life will help to build up communities of shared responsibility in our common following of Jesus, and complementarity in the one mission. To make this sharing a reality among us, we need human and spiritual maturity and a better formation in inter-personal communication.”

#### Decree 8. Chastity in The Society Of Jesus

D.8 n.19

“This should be a principal concern of all Jesuits: to seek the conscious presence of the Lord in such private prayer as meditation, contemplation, and the examination of conscience and in such community prayer as the liturgy of the hours, communal discernment and group spontaneous prayer. In their manifold occupations, Jesuits can learn to reverence the divine presence as the horizon in which they live, to apprehend the immanent providence of God that draws them into its own working for the salvation of human beings, and to hold on to God as the purpose that energizes their work — learning thus to find God in all things.”

D.8 n.28

“The directions of Ignatius and the experience of the Society over the past centuries emphasize that a certain sober realism, discernment, and abnegation are necessary to deal with the many influences that enter into a Jesuit's life. This need for discipline of the body and of the mind has for millennia been recognized in many spiritual traditions, and Jesuits can learn much from these spiritual masters to discipline and integrate the body and the mind into a life of prayer and service.”

#### Decree 9. Poverty

D.9 n.12

“An important topic for community discernment should be our lifestyle. What is required is that the community make a common plan that reflects its desire to live simply and in solidarity, a plan which can be easily evaluated at regular intervals. It must include the concrete means to

attain simplicity, the manner in which the spirit of gratuity is manifested by the community, and how goods will be shared among the companions and with the poor.”

D.9 n.17

“We frequently make use of means and institutions in our apostolates which in themselves are not poor (since they must in fact always be suitable to their apostolic purpose). Here it is fitting to recall that effectiveness and apostolic poverty are two values which must be kept in ongoing tension; this should be the rule for each individual as much as for communities and works. Maintaining this difficult equilibrium requires constant discernment and a readiness to abandon such institutions and means when they no longer result in the "greater service" of God.”

Decree 11. On Having A Proper Attitude of Service in the Church

D.11 n.14

“Obedience, then, cannot exclude our prayerful discernment of the course of action to be followed, one that may in some circumstances differ from the one suggested by our religious and Church superiors. Such discernment, and its respectful representation to superiors, is an authentic element of our Ignatian tradition confirmed in GC 31 and clarified in GC 32.”

D.11 n.15

“Once the discernment is accomplished and the representations made, the Jesuit attitude will ultimately be one modelled on the "Rules in order to have the proper attitude of mind in the Church Militant" of St Ignatius.”

D.11 n.20

“If our love of Christ, inseparable from our love for his spouse the Church, impels us to seek the will of God in each situation, it can also oblige us to engage in constructive criticism based on a prayerful discernment. But it cannot justify a lack of solidarity with the Church, from which we are never in any way distinct or apart.”

## Decree 13. Cooperation with the Laity in Mission

### D.13 n.8

“Putting ourselves at the service of the apostolate of the laity challenges us. We need to respond to their desire for formation so that they are able to minister as fully as possible according to their call and gifts. This formation should draw on the abundant resources and experiences of the Society. We should not hesitate to offer, when requested, the experience of the Spiritual Exercises and our spiritual direction. We can encourage them towards the apostolic priority of the service of faith and the promotion of justice with a preferential love of the poor. By responding in this way we offer who we are. As persons whose lives are centred on loving and serving God in all things, we should help others recognize and discern the apostolic possibilities of their lives and work. Laity who collaborate in Jesuit apostolates can expect from us a specific formation in Ignatian values, help in discernment of apostolic priorities and objectives, and practical strategies for their realization.”

### D.13 n.13

“All those engaged in the work should exercise co-responsibility and be engaged in discernment and participative decision-making where it is appropriate. Lay persons must have access to and be trained for positions of responsibility, according to their qualifications and commitment.”

## Decree 16. The Intellectual Dimension of Jesuit Ministries

### D.16 n.7

“Theological reflection, social analysis, and discernment are phases of a process which Pope John XXIII and Vatican II called "reading the signs of the times:"<sup>5</sup> the effort to discern the presence and activity of God in the events of contemporary history in order to decide what to do as servants of the Word. This will bring the perennial sources of Catholic theology to bear upon the lived experiences, individual and communal, of the members of the faith community that is the Church, especially their experience of poverty and oppression; it relates Catholic theology to the secular disciplines, especially philosophy and the social and natural sciences, in order to discern, illuminate, and interpret the opportunities and problems of contemporary life.”

## Decree 19. Parish Ministry

### D.19 n.4

“A Jesuit parish is energized by Ignatian spirituality, especially through the Spiritual Exercises, and by individual and communal discernment. It tries to provide well-developed programmes in catechesis and formation for both individuals and families; it offers opportunities for spiritual direction and pastoral counselling. Following the model of the election in the Spiritual Exercises, it helps individuals to discern their vocation in life.”

## Decree 26. Conclusion: Characteristics of Our Way Of Proceeding

### D.26 n.8

“For a Jesuit, therefore, not just any response to the needs of the men and women of today will do. The initiative must come from the Lord labouring in events and people here and now. God invites us to join with him in his labours, on his terms, and in his way. To discover and join the Lord, labouring to bring everything to its fulness, is central to the Jesuit way of proceeding. It is the Ignatian method of prayerful discernment, which can be described as "a constant interplay between experience, reflection, decision and action, in line with the Jesuit ideal of being ‘contemplative in action.’”<sup>8</sup> Through individual and communal apostolic discernment, lived in obedience, Jesuits take responsibility for their apostolic choices in today's world. Such discernment reaches out, at the same time, to embrace the larger community of all those with whom we labour in mission.”

## 2. General Congregation 35

### Decree 2. A fire that kindles other fires: rediscovering our Charism

#### D.2 n.2

“We Jesuits are frequently surprised that, despite our differences in culture and context, we find ourselves remarkably united. Through prayerful discernment, open discussion, and spiritual conversations, we have again and again been privileged to know ourselves as one in the Lord: one united, apostolic body seeking what is best for the service of God in the Church

and for the world. This graced experience reminds us of the experience recounted in the Deliberation of the First Fathers. Our earliest companions, even though they considered themselves weak and fragile and originating from many different places, found the will of God together amid great diversity of opinion. What enabled them to find God's will was their "decided care and alertness to initiate a completely open way" and to offer themselves fully to it for the greater glory of God."

D.2 n.19

"Jesuit identity and Jesuit mission are linked by community; indeed, identity, community, and mission are a kind of tryptich shedding light on how our companionship is best understood. This companionship shows how people different in background and diverse in talent can live together as true "friends in the Lord". Jesuit identity is relational; it grows in and through our diversities of culture, nationalities, and languages, enriching and challenging us. This is a process that we enter upon as we join the Society, and we grow in it every day."

D.2 n.22

"It is here that we must discern our mission according to the criteria of the magis and the more universal good."

Decree 3. Challenges to our Mission today. Sent to the Frontiers

D.3 n.21

"The *Spiritual Exercises*, which from the start have been a precious instrument in our hands, are today of invaluable assistance to many of our contemporaries. They help us to initiate and to progress in a life of prayer, to search for and to find God in all things, and to discern his will, making faith more personal and more incarnate. Our contemporaries are also helped in the difficult task of feeling a deeper sense of integration in their lives; the experience of the Exercises helps them achieve this by entering into a dialogue with God in freedom."

D.3 n.23

"We need to discern carefully how we carry out educational and pastoral ministries, especially among youth, in this fast-changing post-modern culture. We need to walk with young people, learning from their generosity and compassion so as to help each other to grow through fragility and fragmentation to joyful integration of our lives with God and with others."

## Decree 4. Obedience in the Life of the Society of Jesus

### D.4 n.4

“When the Pope decided to send the First Companions on various missions that would involve their separation from each other, they asked whether they should unite themselves as a body. According to the Deliberation of the First Fathers, they unanimously decided, after prayerful discernment, to become a body in which each would care for the others, strengthening their bond of union through mutual knowledge and sharing in each others’ lives.”

### D.4 n.7

“The goal of the spiritual formation outlined in the Constitutions is to prepare Jesuits in formation for apostolic life in the Society and to deepen the apostolic life of the body of the Society on mission. The Third Part of the Constitutions introduces the novice to spiritual and apostolic discernment. It confronts him with the demands of a life apostolic discernment. lived in companionship at the service of the apostolate and offers him an opportunity to grow in faith and trust in the Lord, to understand the obstacles to human and spiritual growth, and to avail himself of the spiritual means to overcome them.”

### D.4 n.8

“The whole Seventh Part is a demonstration of the foundational principle of obedience, the magis. Here the emphasis is on discernment, freedom, and creativity in seeking the will of God and engaging in apostolic activity.”

### D.4 n.14

“The incarnation of the Son of God in human history invites us to see God in all things and leads us to understand that he can make use of all things in carrying out his saving work. This is why our discernment must take into account our historical, social, and personal circumstances; it is in the midst of them that God calls us to fulfil his will.”

### D.4 n.20

“An exaggerated desire for autonomy has led some to various expressions of self-sufficiency and lack of commitment: lack of availability to our superiors, lack of prudence in the expression of our opinions, lack of a spirit of cooperation in our approach to the local Church, and even disaffection from the Church and the Society. Some have used the language of discernment to

excuse a desire to determine their own mission, forgetting that discernment in the Society is a communal exercise that takes into account a multiplicity of voices but reaches its completion only in the conferral of a mission by the superior.”

#### D.4 n.26

“The trust that marks obedience is mutual. Jesuits make an act of trust in their superiors when they obey; superiors make an act of trust in their brothers when they send them on mission. This trust is grounded in the superior’s appreciation of the Jesuit he sends as someone who discerns; that is, someone who seeks familiarity with the Lord through prayer, desires freedom from disordered attachment, and thus opens himself to the guidance of the Spirit in an on-going quest to discover the divine will.”

#### D.4 n.28

“The community is also a privileged place for the practice of apostolic discernment, whether through formally structured communal discernment<sup>46</sup> or through informal conversation. Such that has the more effective pursuit of the mission as its goal. Discernment will help us not only accept our personal missions but also rejoice in and support the missions received by our brothers. In this way, our common mission is strengthened and the union of minds and hearts confirmed and deepened.”

### Decree 5. Governance at the Service of Universal Mission

#### D.5 n.34

“From his privileged place at the heart of the community, the superior is also responsible, together with each member, for developing its apostolic life. Concretely, this commits the local superior to lead his community in a Jesuit common life characterised by the celebration of Eucharist, prayer, faith sharing, communal discernment, simplicity, hospitality, solidarity with the poor, and the witness that “friends in the Lord” can make to the world.”

## Decree 6. Collaboration at the Heart of Mission

### D.6 n.9

“The heart of an Ignatian work is the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius. Indeed, any work may be said to be Ignatian when it manifests the Ignatian charism: i.e., when it intentionally seeks God in all things; when it practices Ignatian discernment; when it engages the world through a careful analysis of context, in dialogue with experience, evaluated through reflection, for the sake of action, and with openness, always, to evaluation.”

### D.6 n.13

“All Jesuits, but especially those assigned to a work, can help to foster a spirit of discernment and collaboration by their example and their willingness to share their lives with others.”

### D.6 n.20

“[the Jesuits in formation] should receive suitable formation in the distinctive dimensions of our way of proceeding, in decision integration of apostolic discernment especially the making.”

## 3. General Congregation 36

### Decree 1. Companions in a Mission of Reconciliation and Justice

#### D.1 n.4

“The meeting of the First Companions in Venice<sup>9</sup> is a powerful image, an important step in the formation of the Society. There, the companions confronted the frustration of their plans to go to the Holy Land. This drove them to a deeper discernment of the Lord’s call. Where was the Spirit drawing them? As they discerned new direction for their lives, they held fast to what they had already found to be life-giving: sharing their lives together as friends in the Lord; living very close to the lives of the poor; and preaching the Gospel with joy.”

#### D.1 n.5

“For the First Companions, life and mission, rooted in a discerning community, were profoundly inter-related.”

D.1 n.6

“We return to those roots now, first to a discerning community, then to our life in faith, and finally to the mission that flows from both.”

D.1 n.8

“each of us should constantly desire that our own apostolic work develop, be stimulated, and helped to bear fruit, through the encouragement of our brothers. We always receive our mission from God in the Church, through our Major Superiors and local Superiors, in the practice of Jesuit obedience, which includes our personal discernment. If, however, our mission is not supported by the body of the Society, it risks withering. In our individualistic and competitive age, we should remember that the community plays a very special role since it is a privileged place of apostolic discernment.”

D.1 n.10

“In our Jesuit community life, we should leave room for encounter and sharing. This disposition helps the community become a space of truth, joy, creativity, pardon, and of seeking the will of God. Thus, community can become a place of discernment.”

D.1 n.11

“Communal discernment requires that each of us develop some basic characteristics and attitudes: availability, mobility, humility, freedom, the ability to accompany others, patience, and a willingness to listen respectfully so that we may speak the truth to each other.”

D.1 n.12

“An essential tool that can animate apostolic communal discernment is spiritual conversation. Spiritual conversation involves an exchange marked by active and receptive listening and a desire to speak of that which touches us most deeply. It tries to take account of spiritual movements, individual and communal, with the objective of choosing the path of consolation that fortifies our faith, hope and love. Spiritual conversation creates an atmosphere of trust and welcome for ourselves and others.”

D.1 n.14

“This disposition to attend to the Spirit in our relationships must include those with whom we work. Often they teach us this openness to the Spirit. Important discernments concerning mission are often enriched by their voices and their commitment.”

D.1 n.17

“Our First Fathers entered into such a rich discernment of God’s call together because they had experienced the grace of Christ that set them free. Pope Francis urges us to pray insistently for this consolation that Christ desires to give.<sup>17</sup> Reconciliation with God is first and foremost a call to a profound conversion, for each Jesuit, and for all of us.”

D.1 n.20

“For us Jesuits, compassion is action, an action *discerned* together.” (Emphasis mine)

D.1 n.21

“What GC 35 had identified as three dimensions of this ministry of reconciliation, namely, reconciliation with God, with one another, and with creation, assumed a new urgency. This reconciliation is always a work of justice, a justice *discerned* and enacted in local communities and contexts.” (Emphasis mine)

D.1 n.23

“A special gift Jesuits and the Ignatian family have to offer to the Church and her mission of evangelization is Ignatian spirituality, which facilitates the experience of God and can therefore greatly help the process of personal and communal conversion. Pope Francis constantly affirms that discernment should play a special role, in the family, among youth, in vocation promotion, and in the formation of clergy. Christian life is more and more personalized through discernment.”

D.1 n.37

“In all we do, we want to heed Pope Francis, who has urged us to promote dynamics of personal and social transformation. “What we need is to give priority to actions which generate new processes in society.” Prayerful discernment ought to be our habitual way of drawing closer to reality when we want to transform it.”

#### D.2 n.1

“Apostolic mission lies at the very heart of the Society. From its earliest days, discernment has guided the development of governance to better serve and support the Society’s mission, the *Missio Dei*. Governance in the Society is personal, spiritual and apostolic.”

### Decree 2. Renewed Governance for a Renewed Mission

#### D.2 n.4

“Discernment, a precious gift of Ignatius, is integral to our personal and corporate apostolic life. It begins in contemplation of God at work in our world and allows us to draw more fruit in joining our efforts to God’s designs. Discernment is what “roots us in the Church in which the Spirit works and distributes his various gifts for the common good.” Discernment serves as the foundation for decision-making by the proper authority in our way of proceeding. [...] This discernment process offers the spiritual base that enables our apostolic planning.”

#### D.2 n.5

“Given the magnitude and complexity of contemporary challenges to the mission, and the declining numbers in our least Society, discernment is more than ever critical for apostolic effectiveness.<sup>4</sup> Consistent and participative discernment is our way of ensuring that ongoing apostolic planning, including implementation, monitoring and evaluation, is an integral element in all Jesuit ministry.”

#### D.2 n.5 (b)

“Given the crisis of authority in contemporary culture (family life, education, politics, religion), the practice of discernment is a gift that we can offer to others. By living discernment, we can impart its practice to others. Sharing in discernment leads to a shared vision. Forming collaborators for mission means first that we be formed for discernment.”

#### D.2 n.12

“The Society should continue to improve its process of discernment, making it always more coherent, that is, better able to identify and respond to challenges at the global level in a way that integrates local, provincial, conference and central governance.”

D.2 n.27

“If our governance can inspire us to renew our service of mission, with greater commitment to discernment, collaboration and networking, God’s grace can move us closer to its fulfilment.”