

UNIVERSIDAD PONTIFICIA COMILLAS DE MADRID

FACULTAD DE TEOLOGÍA

INSTITUTO UNIVERSITARIO DE ESPIRITUALIDAD

Self-Love to Self-Emptying Love

THE DIVINE KENOSIS AND HUMILITY IN THE
FOUNDATIONAL EXPERIENCES OF THE SOCIETY OF JESUS
AND CHAPTER 4 OF THE GENERAL EXAMEN

Tesis para la obtención del grado de Doctor

Director: Prof. Dr. José García de Castro, S.J.

Autor: Ldo. Francis George Pudhicherry, S.J.



Madrid 2016

*Dedicated to
Our Lady of Guadalupe*

As long as we walk on earthly roads, humility, though always seen as necessary, must be understood as being far beyond our reach. For the instinct of ownership does not avoid seizing upon it as an object which it enjoys, clothes it with vanity as it takes root and grows, and thus destroys it. Only God, by making us aware of the fact that we cannot be humble, makes us humble. The victory of humility can only be the admission of its defeat

Francois Varillon, The Humility and Suffering of God, pp. 54-55.

The service of the Society is a service “under the banner of the Cross”. Every service done out of love necessarily implies a self-emptying, a kenosis. But letting go of what one wants to do in order to do what the Beloved wants is to transform the kenosis into the image of Christ who learned obedience through suffering (*Heb 5,8*). It is for this reason that St. Ignatius, realistically, adds that the Jesuit serves the Church “under the banner of the Cross”.

Homily of Franc Cardinal Rodé to the Members of GC 35, 7th January, 2008.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	1
ABBREVIATIONS	13
INTRODUCTION.....	17

SECTION ONE

THE HUMILITY OF CHRIST IN THE DIVINE KENOSIS.....	25
GENERAL INTRODUCTION TO THE FIRST SECTION	27
CHAPTER 1: DIVINE KENOSIS AND HUMILITY IN THE BIBLE.....	31
INTRODUCTORY REMARKS	31
1.1 HUMILITY IN THE OLD TESTAMENT.....	32
1.1.1 GENERAL OVERVIEW.....	32
1.1.2 THE SONGS OF THE SUFFERING SERVANT.....	33
1.2 HUMILITY IN THE GOSPELS	36
1.2.1 THE INFANCY OF JESUS	36
1.2.2 JESUS' PUBLIC LIFE.....	37
1.2.3 THE PASSION AND CRUCIFIXION	42
1.3 HUMILITY IN THE EPISTLES	50
1.3.1 HUMILITY IN THE LETTER TO THE PHILIPPIANS – CH. 2, 1-11.....	50
1.3.2 HUMILITY IN OTHER EPISTLES	56
CONCLUSION	61
CHAPTER 2: HISTORICAL UNDERSTANDING OF THE DIVINE KENOSIS	63
INTRODUCTORY REMARKS	63
2.1 DOCTRINAL DEVELOPMENTS REGARDING KENOSIS UNTIL CHALCEDON	65
2.1.1 INTRODUCTION	65
2.1.1.1 The Initial Phase.....	65

2.1.1.2 The Apostolic Fathers	66
2.1.1.3 Doctrinal challenges during the Pre-Nicene period	66
2.1.2 THE PRE-NICENE PERIOD	70
2.1.2.1 Justin the Martyr (100 - 165).....	71
2.1.2.2 Clement of Alexandria (150 - 215).....	72
2.1.2.3 Irenaeus (130 – 202)	73
2.1.2.4 Hippolytus (170 - 235).....	75
2.1.2.5 Origen (185 - 254)	76
2.1.3 THE NICENE PERIOD	78
2.1.3.1 The problem of Arianism	78
2.1.3.2 Athanasius (296 – 373)	79
2.1.3.3 Hilary of Potiers (300 – 368).....	83
2.1.4 THE POST-NICENE PERIOD.....	86
2.1.4.1 The ‘homousious’ debate	86
2.1.4.2 Apollinarius and the problem of Christ’s humanity	87
2.1.4.3 Gregory of Nazianzus (330 – 390)	89
2.1.4.4 Cyril of Alexandria (378 - 444).....	91
2.2 THE KENOTIC THEORIES OF THE 18 TH AND 19 TH CENTURIES.....	95
2.2.1 BACKGROUND AND EFFORT OF THE KENOTIC THEORIES	96
2.2.2 THE GERMAN CONTRIBUTION TO THE KENOTIC THEORY	99
2.2.2.1 Gottfried Thomasius (1802 – 1875).....	99
2.2.2.2 Other German Theologians.....	102
2.2.3 THE ENGLISH CONTRIBUTION TO THE KENOTIC THEORY	104
2.2.3.1 P. T. Forsyth (1848 - 1921).....	104
2.2.3.2 H.R.Mackintosh (1870 - 1936)	107
2.2.3.3 Charles Gore (1853 - 1932).....	109
2.2.4 CRITICISMS OF THE KENOTIC THEORY	111
2.3 KENOSIS AND CONTEMPRARY TRENDS	112
2.3.1 SØREN KIERKEGAARD (1813 - 1855)	113
2.3.2 KARL BARTH (1886 – 1968)	115
2.3.3 SERGEI BULGAKOV (1871 – 1944).....	118
2.3.4 HANS URS VON BALTHASAR (1905 – 1988).....	123
2.3.4.1 Introduction	123
2.3.4.2 Christology	125
2.3.4.3 Trinity	127
2.3.4.4 Mission and Participation in Divine Life	129

2.3.4.5 Conclusion	132
2.3.5 KARL RAHNER (1904 – 1984).....	134
2.3.5.1 Human Experience as a Starting Point	134
2.3.5.3 The Transcendental Method	136
2.3.5.3 Trinity and Christology	138
2.3.5.4 Kenosis	142
2.3.5.5 Conclusion	148
CONCLUSION	149

CHAPTER 3: DIVINE HUMILITY AND HUMAN TRANSFORMATION 151

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS	151
3.1 CHRIST'S HUMILITY AND THE REVELATION OF GOD'S LOVE:	153
3.1.1 HUMILITY AND THE IMPASSIBILITY OF LOVE.....	153
3.1.2 INCARNATION AND PASSION AS KEY MOMENTS OF THIS SELF-REVELATION.....	154
3.1.3 THE CROSS AND THE TOTALITY OF GOD'S LOVE.	156
3.2 HUMILITY AND THE TRINITY.....	158
3.2.1 INTRODUCTORY REMARKS - TRINITY AS EXISTING FOR THE OTHER.	159
3.2.2 THE HUMILITY OF THE FATHER, SON AND SPIRIT.....	161
3.2.2.1 Humility of the Father.....	161
3.2.2.2 Humility of the Son	163
3.2.2.3 Humility of the Spirit	164
3.2.3 <i>PERICHORESIS</i> – TRINITY AND INTER-RELATEDNESS	167
3.2.3.1 Introduction.....	167
3.2.3.2 Unity and Distinctness within the Trinity.....	169
3.2.3.3 <i>Perichoresis</i> and the Human Person.....	170
3.3 HUMILITY AND TRANSFORMATION IN THE DIVINE-HUMAN RELATIONSHIP:.....	172
3.3.1 THE GOAL OF THE HUMAN PERSON	173
3.3.2 THE TENDENCY IN THE HUMAN PERSON TOWARDS SELF-LOVE	174
3.3.2.1 Narcissistic Self-Love	175
3.3.2.2 Positive Self-Love and Transcendence.....	177
3.3.3 THE ONTOLOGICAL SPLIT, RUPTURE AND CONVERSION	177
3.3.3.1 The Ontological Split.....	178
3.3.3.2 Humility and Rupture.....	179
3.3.3.3 Divine Love, Conversion and Compunction	181
3.3.4 NEW LIFE	184

3.3.4.1 The Divine Initiative	184
3.3.4.2 Humble Response	190
CONCLUSION	199

SECTION TWO

HUMILITY IN THE FOUNDATIONAL EXPERIENCES OF THE SOCIETY OF JESUS	201
GENERAL INTRODUCTION TO THE SECOND SECTION	203
CHAPTER 4: HUMILITY IN THE <i>AUTOBIOGRAPHY</i> OF IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA	205
INTRODUCTORY REMARKS	205
4.1 THE INITIAL DESIRE TO BE HUMBLE AT LOYOLA.....	208
4.1.1 THE ACTUAL EXPERIENCE OF HUMILITY AND OPENNESS TO GOD.....	210
4.1.2 THE HUMILITY OF GOD	212
4.1.3 THE CONSEQUENCES.....	215
4.2 TRANSFORMATION TOWARDS A LIFE OF POVERTY AND HUMILITY IN MANRESA.....	217
4.2.1 THE ACTUAL EXPERIENCE OF HUMILITY AND OPENNESS TO GOD.....	219
4.2.2 THE HUMILITY OF GOD	225
4.2.3 THE CONSEQUENCES.....	228
4.2.3.1 The three levels of emptying	228
4.2.3.2 Surrender and Enlightenment	231
4.2.3.3 Generous response by humble service.....	232
4.3 THE ECCLESIAL DIMENSION IN THE EMERGENCE OF A MATURE HUMILITY	234
4.3.1 THE ACTUAL EXPERIENCE OF HUMILITY.....	234
4.3.2 THE HUMILITY OF GOD	238
4.3.3 THE CONSEQUENCES.....	242
4.3.4 CONCLUDING REMARKS.....	245
4.4 <i>LA STORTA</i> AND IDENTIFICATION WITH CHRIST POOR AND HUMBLE.....	248
4.4.1 THE ACTUAL EXPERIENCE OF HUMILITY.....	249
4.4.2 THE HUMILITY OF GOD	254
4.4.3 THE CONSEQUENCES.....	258
CONCLUSION.....	261

CHAPTER 5: 'LOVING HUMILITY' IN THE <i>SPIRITUAL DIARY</i>.....	263
INTRODUCTORY REMARKS	263
5.1 THE <i>SPIRITUAL DIARY</i> – A UNIQUE TEXT	264
5.2 TEXTUAL ANALYSIS OF THE VARIOUS PARTS OF THE <i>SPIRITUAL DIARY</i>	266
5.2.1 STAGE I: THE ELECTION AND OBLATION TO GOD [1-22].....	267
5.2.1.1 The Deliberation on Poverty:	267
5.2.1.2 An overview of Stage I.....	268
5.2.1.3 Humility and Recourse to Mediators.....	269
5.2.2 STAGE II – ELECTION, OBLATION AND THANKSGIVING [23-44]	272
5.2.2.1 An overview of Stage II.....	272
5.2.2.2 Humility and Reconciliation	274
5.2.3 STAGE III: OBLATION AND THANKSGIVING [45-64]	277
5.2.3.1 An overview of Stage III	277
5.2.3.2 Humility and Enlightenment	279
5.2.4 STAGE IV: CONFIRMATION (CHRIST) AND RECONCILIATION (TRINITY) [65-110]	282
5.2.4.1 Overview of Stage IV	282
5.2.4.2 Humility and Growing Passivity.....	285
5.2.5 STAGE V: FINAL RECONCILIATION, CONFIRMATION AND SUBMISSION [111-153].....	288
5.2.5.1 Overview of Stage V	288
5.2.5.2 Humility and Confirmation	293
5.2.6 STAGE VI – A NEW PATH OF AFFECTIONATE AWE, REVERENCE AND HUMILITY [154-490] ...	298
5.2.6.1 Overview of Stage VI	298
5.2.6.2 The Grace of Humble Love	301
5.3 HUMILITY AND MYSTICISM IN THE <i>SPIRITUAL DIARY</i>	308
5.3.1 HUMILITY IN THE DIVINE-HUMAN RELATIONSHIP	309
5.3.2 NEW LIFE THROUGH AFFECTIONATE AWE, REVERENCE AND HUMBLE LOVE.....	310
CONCLUSION	313
 CHAPTER 6: HUMILITY IN THE <i>SPIRITUAL EXERCISES</i>	 315
INTRODUCTORY REMARKS	315
6.1 THE PREDISPOSITION TO BEGIN THE <i>SPIRITUAL EXERCISES</i>	317
6.1.1 HUMILITY IN THE ANNOTATIONS.....	317
6.1.2 PRINCIPAL AND FOUNDATION AS A CALL TO HUMILITY.....	319
6.2 THE GRACE OF COMPUNCTION AND SORROW DURING THE FIRST WEEK.....	320
6.2.1 THE THREE EXAMENS AS AN EXERCISE OF HUMILITY	320

6.2.2 SINFULNESS AND HUMILITY IN THE FIRST MEDITATION.....	324
6.2.2.1 Personal Sin and Humility in the Second Meditation.....	326
6.2.2.2 Humility in the remaining meditations of the day.....	327
6.2.2.3 The additions as an aid to grow in humility.....	328
6.3 THE 2 ND WEEK: KNOW, LOVE AND FOLLOW CHRIST IN THE KINGDOM MEDITATIONS & INFANCY NARRATIVES.....	331
6.3.1 THE CALL OF THE ETERNAL KING TO POVERTY AND HUMILITY.....	331
6.3.2 THE CONTEMPLATIONS OF THE SECOND WEEK AND HUMILITY.....	334
6.3.2.1 The Incarnation.....	337
6.3.2.2 The Nativity of our Lord.....	338
6.3.2.3 Other contemplations before the fourth day.....	341
6.4 THE TWO STANDARDS, THREE KINDS OF PERSONS AND THE THREE DEGREES OF HUMILITY IN THE CONTEXT OF MAKING AN ELECTION.....	342
6.4.1 THE PREFACE.....	343
6.4.2 THE MEDITATION ON THE TWO STANDARDS.....	344
6.4.2.1 Title & Textual Analysis.....	344
6.4.2.2 The dynamics of the standard of Christ and that of Satan.....	348
6.4.2.3 Theological Significance.....	359
6.4.3 THE THREE CLASSES OF PERSONS.....	365
6.4.3.1 Introduction and Relevance.....	365
6.4.3.2 Significance of the word ' <i>querer</i> '.....	366
6.4.3.3 Humility and Transformation.....	368
6.4.4 THE THREE WAYS OF BEING HUMBLE.....	370
6.4.4.1 Preliminary Notes.....	370
6.4.4.2 Introduction.....	372
6.4.4.2 Structure of the Text.....	374
6.4.4.3 The disposition of humility and election.....	377
6.4.5 THE ELECTION.....	378
6.4.5.1 Disposition and subject matter.....	379
6.4.5.2 Humility during the three times to make an election.....	380
6.4.5.3 Concluding Remarks.....	386
6.4.6 THE GOLDEN RULE OF SPIRITUAL LIFE – SELF EMPTYING LOVE [189].....	388
6.5 THE THIRD WEEK.....	389
6.5.1 HUMILITY AS SEEN IN THE TEXT OF THE THIRD WEEK.....	390
6.5.2 KENOSIS IN THE THREE CONSIDERATIONS [195, 196, 197].....	393
6.5.2.1 The First Consideration – Humanity of Jesus [195].....	394

6.5.2.2 The Second Consideration – the Divinity hides itself [196]	394
6.5.2.3 The Third Consideration – He suffers for my sins [197]	395
6.5.3 PROGRESSIVE IDENTIFICATION WITH CHRIST AND PURIFICATION OF SELF-LOVE	398
6.6 THE FOURTH WEEK	400
6.6.1 THE JOY OF THE RESURRECTION AS A VINDICATION OF HUMILITY AND POVERTY	401
6.6.2 MARY AS THE MODEL FOR EVERY CHRISTIAN	403
6.6.3 CTOL AND PARTICIPATING IN THE SELF-EMPTYING LOVE OF GOD	405
CONCLUSION	407
CHAPTER 7: HUMILITY IN THE DELIBERATIONS OF 1539.....	411
INTRODUCTORY REMARKS	411
7.1 IGNATIUS' INITIAL YEARS OF BEING INDIVIDUALISTIC AND SOLITARY	412
7.2 LEARNING THE ART OF 'DELIBERATIONS' IN PARIS	414
7.2.1 DELIBERATIONS AND THE FORMATION OF A STABLE GROUP	414
7.2.2 VOWS AT MONTMARTRE.....	417
7.2.3 EVIDENCE OF COLLECTIVE SELF-EMPTYING LOVE AND HUMILITY	420
7.3 'DELIBERATIONS' IN ITALY	422
7.3.1 VENICE – FIRST DELIBERATIONS AND HUMBLE SERVICE OF THE SICK	423
7.3.2 VENICE – SECOND DELIBERATIONS AND A LIFE OF POVERTY	424
7.3.3 VICENZA – THIRD DELIBERATION AND OBEDIENCE	427
7.3.3.1 Two important decisions at Vicenza	428
7.3.3.2 Humility as reflected in the deliberations	429
7.4 THE DELIBERATIONS OF 1539	431
7.4.1 DATE AND AUTHORSHIP OF THE DELIBERATIONS	432
7.4.2 CAUSES FOR THE DELIBERATIONS.....	433
7.4.3 DELIBERATIONS WITHIN THE DYNAMICS OF SELF-LOVE AND HUMILITY	434
7.4.3.1 The Context and the Question	435
7.4.3.2 The Initial Disposition of humility	436
7.4.3.3 Presence of self-love and measures to overcome it.....	437
7.4.3.4 Humility and the adoption of new measures	440
7.4.3.5 Election through unanimity	441
7.4.3.6 Election by majority vote	443
7.4.4 THE TEXT OF THE DELIBERATION AND HUMILITY	444
7.4.4.1 Unanimity followed by an awareness of disordered affections.....	444
7.4.4.2 Humility as the key to resolving the question of obedience.....	446

7.4.4.3 Obedience and its relationship to pride and humility	449
7.4.4.4 Ongoing Tensions and Humility as the way forward.....	450
CONCLUSION.....	452

SECTION THREE

HUMILITY IN THE 4TH CHAPTER OF THE GENERAL EXAMEN	455
GENERAL INTRODUCTION TO THE THIRD SECTION.....	457
CHAPTER 8: 1ST & 2ND STAGE – GIVING UP POSSESSIONS & AFFECTIVE DETACHMENT ..	461
INTRODUCTORY REMARKS	461
8. 1 GIVING UP TEMPORAL GOODS [53-59]	462
8.1.1 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND.....	462
8.1.2 THE TEXT AND ITS INTERPRETATION.....	466
8.1.2.1 The Text	467
8.1.2.2 Interpretation of the Text	469
8.1.3 THE EXPERIENCE OF IGNATIUS IN GIVING UP POSSESSIONS.....	470
8.1.4 HUMILITY AND GIVING UP TEMPORAL GOODS – FIRST STEP.....	473
8.2 AFFECTIVE DETACHMENT [60-62].....	476
8.2.1 AFFECTIVE SEPARATION IN THE TRADITION OF THE CHURCH [60-62].....	477
8.2.2 THE TEXT AND ITS INTERPRETATION.....	478
8.2.3 AFFECTIVE SEPARATION IN THE LIFE OF IGNATIUS	480
8.2.3.1 The Letter to his brother Martin in 1532.....	480
8.2.3.2 Ottaviano Cesari.....	482
8.2.4 HUMILITY AND AFFECTIVE SEPARATION – SECOND STEP.....	485
CONCLUSION.....	490
CHAPTER 9: 3RD STAGE – EMPTYING OF ONESELF.....	493
INTRODUCTORY REMARKS	493
9.1 FRATERNAL CORRECTIONS [63].....	494
9.1.1 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND.....	494
9.1.2 THE TEXT AND ITS INTERPRETATIONS.....	498
9.1.2.1 The Text	498

9.1.2.2 Interpretation of the Text	498
9.1.3 FRATERNAL CORRECTION IN THE LIFE OF IGNATIUS.....	501
9.1.3.1 Letter of Ignatius to Nicolas Bobadilla (1543)	501
9.1.3.2 Letter of Ignatius to Antonio Barandão (1551)	505
9.2 THE PRINCIPAL AND SECONDARY TESTING EXPERIENCES [64–90].....	508
9.2.1 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND	508
9.2.2 THE TEXT AND ITS INTERPRETATION	515
9.2.2.1 The Text of the Six Principal Experiences.....	516
9.2.2.2 Interpretation of the Six Principal Testing Experiences	518
9.2.2.3 Text of the Secondary Testing Experiences	528
9.2.2.4 Interpretation of the Secondary Testing Experiences	533
9.2.3 TESTING EXPERIENCES IN THE APOSTOLIC LIFE OF THE EARLY SOCIETY	538
9.2.3.1 Ignatius’ letters to the Fathers of the Council of Trent (1546).....	538
9.2.3.2 Ignatius’ letter about activities in Rome (1547).....	539
9.2.3.3 Letter to Jesuits leaving for Germany (1549).....	542
9.3 ACCOUNT OF CONSCIENCE, VOWS AND STABILITY [91–100]	544
9.3.1 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND	544
9.3.2 THE TEXT AND ITS INTERPRETATION	549
9.3.2.1 The Text and its division.....	550
9.3.2.2 Interpretation of the Text.....	555
9.3.3 THE MANIFESTATION OF CONSCIENCE IN THE LIFE OF IGNATIUS	561
9.4 HUMILITY AND THE PROCESS OF SELF-EMPTYING – THIRD STEP [98–103].....	569
9.4.1 HUMILITY AND SELF-EMPTYING LOVE IN THE CANDIDATE	570
9.4.1.1 Methodological Considerations.....	570
9.4.1.2 Internal Transformation.....	571
9.4.1.3 Self-emptying and inter-relatedness	573
9.4.2 THE SELF-EMPTYING OF THE ‘MÍNIMA’ SOCIETY OF JESUS	574
9.4.3 A ‘SERVANT’ CHURCH AT THE SERVICE OF OTHERS	576
9.4.4 GLORIFYING GOD’S SELF-EMPTYING LOVE IN A BROKEN WORLD	578
CONCLUSION	580
CHAPTER 10: UNION WITH GOD–HUMBLE LOVE & DESIRE TO BE ‘CLOTHED IN CHRIST’	583
INTRODUCTORY REMARKS	583
10.1 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND.....	584
10.1.1 THE EARLIEST RULES – PACHOMIUS, BASIL AND AUGUSTINE	584

10.1.2 LATE PATRISTIC PERIOD – CASSIAN, <i>THE RULE OF THE MASTER</i> AND BENEDICT	586
10.1.3 BERNARD OF CLAIRVAUX (CISTERCIANS) AND THE CARTHUSIANS.....	588
10.1.4 THE RULE OF FRANCIS OF ASSISI AND THE DOMINICAN CONSTITUTIONS	589
10.1.5 THE MODERN DEVOTION	591
10.2 THE TEXT AND ITS INTERPRETATION.....	593
10.2.1 THE TEXT.....	593
10.2.2 THE DYNAMICS OF THE TEXT	597
10.2.3 RELATIONSHIP WITH THE 3 DEGREES OF HUMILITY IN THE <i>SpEx</i>	598
10.2.4 INTERPRETATIONS OF THE EARLY COMPANION AND GCs	600
10.2.5 CONCLUDING REMARKS	603
10.3 IGNATIUS' SPIRITUAL PROCESS OF ' <i>BEING CLOTHED IN CHRIST</i> '	604
10.3.1 THE EXTERNAL & INTERNAL TRANSFORMATION OF IGNATIUS IN THE ' <i>AUTOBIOGRAPHY</i> ' .	605
10.3.1.1 Introductory remarks.....	606
10.3.1.2 The initial conversion and choice of attire	606
10.3.1.3 The functional role of attire during his journeys	608
10.3.1.4 The attire of his companions.....	609
10.3.1.5 Growing internal transformation.....	610
10.3.2 AUTHENTICITY AND SELF-TRANSCENDENCE	610
10.3.2.1 Cognitive, Moral and Religious Self-Transcendence.....	611
10.3.2.2 Authenticity and transcendental precepts.....	613
10.3.3 THE TRANSCENDENTAL METHOD IN LONERGAN AND IGNATIUS' REFLECTION ON HIS INTERNAL PROCESS.....	615
10.3.3.1 The importance of understanding the <i>method</i> of spiritual transformation.....	615
10.3.3.2 The Transcendental Method of Lonergan.....	616
10.3.3.3 The transformative process as seen in the <i>Autobiography</i>	619
10.3.3.4 Growth in consciousness and widening horizons	622
10.3.4 THREE LEVELS OF CONVERSION IN IGNATIUS.....	623
10.3.4.1 Intellectual Conversion.....	624
10.3.4.2 Moral Conversion.....	625
10.3.4.3 Religious Conversion.....	627
10.3.4.4 The dynamic nature of conversions.....	629
10.3.5 CONCLUDING REMARKS.....	631
CONCLUSION.....	635
CONCLUSION.....	641

BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	657
1. PRIMARY SOURCES.....	657
1.1 IGNATIAN SOURCES.....	657
1.2 PATRISTIC, MEDIEVAL AND RENAISSANCE SOURCES	659
2. SECONDARY SOURCES	664
2.1 IGNATIAN SOURCES.....	664
2.2 KENOSIS AND HUMILITY	674
2.3 OTHER.....	679
3. WEBSITES.....	685
INDEX OF AUTHORS.....	687

ABBREVIATIONS

1. IGNATIAN SOURCES AND DOCUMENTS

<i>Au</i>	Autobiography of Ignatius of Loyola
<i>AHSI</i>	Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu
<i>CIS</i>	Centrum Ignatianum Spiritualitatis
<i>Co</i>	Constitutions of the Society of Jesus
<i>DEI</i>	Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana
<i>Delib</i>	The Deliberations that started the Jesuits
<i>DHCJ</i>	Diccionario Histórico de la Compañía de Jesús
<i>EI</i>	Estudios Ignacianos
<i>EppIgn</i>	Sancti Ignatii de Loyola - Epistolae et Instructiones
<i>FD</i>	Fontes Documentales
<i>FI</i>	Formula of the Institute
<i>FN</i>	Fontes Narrativi
<i>GC</i>	General Congregation
<i>IOS</i>	Incorporation of a Spirit
<i>LADC</i>	La Apertura de Conciencia - Goiri
<i>LI</i>	Ignatius of Loyola - Letters and Instructions (Saint Louis)
<i>Manresa</i>	Revista Manresa
<i>MCon</i>	Monumenta Constituciones
<i>MNad</i>	Monumenta Nadal - Epistolae P. Hieronymi Nadal
<i>MHSI</i>	Monumenta Historica Societatis Iesus
<i>Pol-Chro</i>	Juan de Polanco - Chronicon
<i>SD</i>	Spiritual Diary
<i>SpEx</i>	Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola
<i>Studies</i>	Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits

2. DICTIONARIES AND COMMENTARIES

<i>AYBC</i>	Anchor Yale Biblical Commentary
<i>CDT</i>	A Consise Dictionary of Theology

<i>DBS</i>	Dictionnaire de la Bible Supplément
<i>DCT</i>	Diccionario de Conceptos Teológicos
<i>DE</i>	Diccionario de Espiritualidad
<i>DNTB</i>	Dictionary of New Testament Background
<i>DS</i>	Dictionnaire de Spiritualité
<i>EBC</i>	The Expositor's Bible Commentary
<i>ICC</i>	International Critical Commentary
<i>ISBE</i>	The International Standard Bible Encyclopedia Revised
<i>NAC</i>	The New American Commentary
<i>NBD</i>	The New Bible Dictionary (3 rd Edition)
<i>NDCS</i>	The New Dictionary of Catholic Spirituality
<i>NDSB</i>	The New Daily Study Bible
<i>NDBT</i>	The New Dictionary of Biblical Theology
<i>WBC</i>	Word Biblical Commentary

3. OTHER DOCUMENTS

<i>Ad.Ha</i>	Adversus Haereses - Irenaeus
<i>ANF-CE</i>	Ante-Nicene Fathers-Catholic Edition
<i>BAC</i>	Biblioteca de Autores Cristianos
<i>CCC</i>	Catechism of the Catholic Church
<i>CSDC</i>	Compendium of Social Doctrine of the Church
<i>CCSL</i>	Corpus Cristianorum Series Latina
<i>CCEO</i>	Codex Canonum Ecclesiarum Orientalium
<i>CCR</i>	Cambridge Companion to Karl Rahner
<i>CD</i>	Church Dogmatics – Karl Barth
<i>CFT</i>	Conceptos Fundamentales de la Teología
<i>CIC</i>	Codex Iuris Canonici
<i>CN</i>	Complementary Norms
<i>CSM</i>	The Concise Sacramentum Mundi
<i>DCE</i>	Deus Caritas Est
<i>ee</i>	Electronic Edition
<i>FCF</i>	Foundations of Christian Faith – Karl Rahner

<i>fn</i>	Foot Note
<i>FR</i>	Fides et Ratio
<i>GS</i>	Gaudium et Spes
<i>LAC</i>	Love Alone is Credible – Hans Urs von Balthasar
<i>LG</i>	Lumen Gentium
<i>MP</i>	Mysterium Paschale – Hans Urs von Balthasar
<i>MT</i>	Method in Theology – Bernard Lonergan
<i>NPNF-CE</i>	Nicene and Post Nicene Fathers – Catholic Edition
<i>NRSVCE</i>	New Revised Standard Version – Catholic Edition
<i>NT</i>	New Testament
<i>OT</i>	Old Testament
<i>Paed</i>	Paedagogus – Clement of Alexandria
<i>PSRP</i>	Post-Synodal Apostolic Exhortation Reconciliation and Penance
<i>RA</i>	Rule of St. Augustine
<i>RB</i>	Rule of St. Benedict
<i>Refu.Haer</i>	Refutatio omnium haeresium
<i>RF</i>	Rule of St. Francis
<i>RM</i>	Rule of the Master
<i>RP</i>	Rule of St. Pachomius
<i>RPR</i>	Relational Perspective of Rahner - Ingvild
<i>Rv.Ed</i>	Revised Edition
<i>RPr</i>	Reprint
<i>SM</i>	Sacramentum Mundi
<i>STh</i>	Summa Theologica
<i>STL</i>	Surrender to Life - Ingvild
<i>Strom</i>	Stromata – Clement of Alexandria
<i>TD</i>	Theo-Drama – Hans Urs von Balthasar
<i>TI</i>	Theological Investigations – Karl Rahner
<i>Trin</i>	De Trinitate – Hilary of Potiers
<i>USL</i>	Unconditional Surrender and Love - Ingvild
<i>VatII</i>	Second Vatican Council
<i>ViRel</i>	Vida Religiosa
<i>VS</i>	Veritatis Splendor

Besides these abbreviations, other abbreviations have been used in a localized manner. They have been indicated as and when necessary.

In the body of the text we have not indicated the author while referring to Ignatian original sources. However the editor or translator has been pointed out. An exception to this criteria is the *Vida de Ignacio de Loyola* by Pedro de Ribadeneyra. The references to the General Congregations are taken from two books edited by John Padberg and others: a) *For Matters of Greater Moment – The First thirty Jesuit General Congregations* and b) *Jesuit Life & Mission Today: The Decrees of the 31st – 35th General Congregations of the Society of Jesus*. Both these books are published from the Institute of Jesuit Sources, Saint Louis.

References to electronic books have been indicated by the initials '(ee)' and are primarily from three different sources: a) various books purchased through the website www.logos.com ; b) books from iTunes store and c) digital versions of different magazines related to Jesuit spirituality such as 'Manresa', 'Studies' and 'The Way'. Information regarding websites visited and last accessed is offered in the relevant footnotes.

INTRODUCTION

*...in all spiritual matters, the more one divests oneself of self-love, self-will,
and self-interests, the more progress one will make. (SpEx 189)*

This text from the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius is considered by many authors to be the golden rule of spiritual life. It is presented to the individual during the course of making a new election or when the person reflects on reforming one's present choice of life. The new election or reformation which is rooted in an experience of God's love aids a person in progressively moving away from a life rooted in self-love towards a life of self-emptying love. There is a gradual transformation of love whereby self-centered love is converted into love that is oriented towards others. In this spiritual transformation, humility plays a critical role.

THE THESIS

The present work deals with humility as expressed in the Society of Jesus'¹ charism. Based on the premise that humility is a concrete expression of love,² the thesis highlights its importance in the transformative process of moving from self-love to self-emptying love. This is done by explaining the dimension of humility as revealed in the Divine Kenosis. Later on we elaborate its transformative role in the foundational experiences of the Society and the spiritual process proposed to a candidate in the fourth chapter of the General Examen in the Constitutions.

¹ Henceforth we shall use the word 'Society' in order to refer to the Society of Jesus.

² This premise will be elaborated at length during the course of our work. However it is important to point out at the onset that love is not limited to humility because the reality of love is far more comprehensive and profound. However we do believe that a genuine expression of love would necessarily manifest itself in humility.

THE CONTEXT AND ITS TITLE

The context for the above mentioned premise as well as the transformative process is the invitation of God through the Divine Kenosis and the human capacity to generously respond to God's revelation. In the Divine Kenosis, Christ's humility reveals the Triune God's self-emptying love. A person who has genuinely experienced such love would have his own love transformed and be inspired to humbly empty himself for others. The degree of humility in the life of an individual who desires to imitate Christ indicates the degree of that person's love. Humility thus understood as an expression of love is not a vague and abstract concept, but through specific choices manifests itself in a life of concrete service and commitment.

The main title "Self-Love to Self-Emptying love" indicates the broad framework within which the investigation is elaborated. It relates to the spiritual process that characterized the nascent Society at an individual and collective level. It is also proposed as the spiritual process for a candidate desirous of living the Society's charism.

Within this general framework, the sub-title, "The Divine Kenosis and humility in the foundational experiences of the Society of Jesus and chapter 4 of the General Examen", indicates the specific element investigated in this thesis. It refers to the transformative role of humility as understood in the Society of Jesus.³ However, what does humility mean and how are we to understand it? We believe that the humility of Christ as revealed in the Divine Kenosis manifests to us the true Christian meaning of humility. Based on this understanding we have interpreted various foundational texts of the Society of Jesus and these include the *Autobiography*, the *Spiritual Diary*, the *Spiritual Exercises* and the *Deliberations* of the first companions in 1539.⁴ The institutionalization of these experiences can be seen in a document called the "General Examen." This is a text

³ The interpretation of humility based on the Divine Kenosis has not been the exclusive domain of the Society of Jesus. An overview of Christian spirituality indicates that humility has often been explained by the Divine Kenosis with different charisms offering varied and nuanced understandings of humility.

⁴ The *Formula of the Institute (FI)* enshrines the unique charism of the Society of Jesus and was presented to Pope Paul III for his approval in 1540. While the *FI* continues to remain the foundational document of the Society, we believe that the spiritual process in order to live the charism enshrined in the *FI* is well elaborated in the General Examen (*GE*). Hence we have chosen this document instead of the *FI* as the last chapter of our work.

placed at the beginning of the Constitutions of the Society of Jesus and was written for prospective candidates and examiners. It contains a brief synthesis of the spirituality of the Society of Jesus.

THE DEVELOPMENT OF THE THESIS

In order to proceed systematically we have divided the entire work into three sections. Section one deals with the theological foundations. In it we have highlighted the humility of Christ as a revelation of the totality of God's self-emptying love and the source of transformation within the human person. Section two elaborates the specific dimension of humility within the Society. We have elaborated it by analyzing different foundational texts which refer to humility at two levels: a) as observed in the actual experiences of Ignatius and b) in the first companions. Section three underlines the importance of humility in the proposed spiritual process for a prospective candidate. The texts of sections two and three were redacted during the initial years of the Society's existence.

SECTION ONE

Section one deals with the humility of Christ in the Divine Kenosis and contains three chapters. Chapter one highlights the Biblical foundations of the humility of Christ. While the text from Paul's letter to the Philippians (2:7-11) is considered a key text, various other texts allude to the humility and self-emptying love of God. We begin with some texts of the Old Testament which prefigure the humility of Christ. The texts related to the suffering servant stand out in this regard. We then dwell on the humility of Christ as seen in Gospels wherein the texts indicating the humility of Christ will be commented upon. Finally we explain the letter of St. Paul to the Philippians and end by referring to four texts related to the humility of Christ in various other letters.

Chapter two provides a historical overview of the understanding of the Divine Kenosis. The dogmatic formulations would take nearly four centuries until the Council of Chalcedon definitively declared that Jesus Christ was fully human and fully divine. The importance of this declaration helps us understand that the humility of Christ is

situated in the very being of God and that the eternal love of God has been definitively revealed in the poverty and humility of Christ. This chapter is divided into various historical periods with special emphasis on the first period until the council of Chalcedon in 451 C.E. We briefly dwell upon the Kenotic Theories of the 18th and 19th centuries and end by highlighting some eminent theologians of the last century in order to indicate contemporary trends related to the Divine Kenosis.

Chapter three explains the process as to how an experience of the humility of Christ transforms a person in order to live a new life of humility and self-emptying love. It begins by showing how Christ's humility reveals the very being of God and in effect the humility of the Holy Trinity. Further on this chapter highlights the significance of humility in the relationship between God and the human person. The reality of sin, self-love and suffering as constituting the reality of the human person is pointed out. Finally this chapter concludes by indicating how the new life in Christ is intimately linked to a spiritual process that leads to an ever growing imitation of the poverty and humility of Christ.

SECTION TWO

Section two deals with four important texts related to the foundational experiences of the Society of Jesus. These include four experiences that consist in the *Autobiography*, the *Spiritual Diary*, the *Spiritual Exercises* and the *Deliberations* of the first companions.

Chapter five deals with the *Autobiography* of Ignatius. It indicates the relationship between the spiritual process of Ignatius and the growth in humility. The chapter begins with the initial desires to be humble in Loyola, followed by the definitive transformation in his desire at Manresa and the continuing growth in humility during his sojourn in Spain, Paris and Italy. The chapter concludes with the experience of La Storta where he is definitively placed with Christ poor and humble. This in turn will be the defining element in the new religious order that would emerge in the subsequent years.

Chapter five is related to the life of Ignatius who as general of the Society had to deal with the issue of poverty. The process he underwent from 2nd February 1544 to 27th

February, 1545 has been preserved for us in a set of manuscripts known as the *Spiritual Journal* or *Spiritual Diary*. This text provides a glimpse into the spiritual life of Ignatius and reveals to us the centrality of humility in his personal spiritual process. The text indicates that during this period he was illumined by the Lord not only in matters related to poverty within the Society, but instructed on how he could 'grow in loving humility'.

Chapter six deals with the *Spiritual Exercises* and shows how humility is a transversal theme throughout the Exercises. We begin by highlighting the importance of humility as an essential predisposition to enter into the Spiritual Exercises. The second week invites the exercitant to contemplate the humility of God as revealed in the infancy and public life of Jesus. The attitude of humility is important when the exercitant is expected to make an election at the end of the second week. Here we find reference to the golden rule of spiritual life as well as the indication of the three degrees of love or three degrees of humility. The chapter ends with an explanation of the third and fourth weeks where the humility of the passion and death as well as the glory of the resurrection reveals the nature of God's love.

Chapter seven highlights the communitarian dimension of humility within the process of discernment. The decision of Ignatius and the first companions to form themselves into a group was a communitarian decision. This chapter shows that from the very onset, Ignatius' approach was a communitarian approach and deliberations were always a part of the process envisaged by him. However this process became more refined providing important indicators and criteria in the *Deliberations* of 1539. The focus of this chapter is to show how humility is a precondition in order to have a genuine process of communal discernment.

SECTION THREE

The third section deals with the fourth chapter within a text known as the *General Examen*. This text has a total of eight chapters and the fourth chapter offers a beautiful synthesis of the spirituality of the Society of Jesus. While providing a structural and

textual analysis of the fourth chapter we have primarily maintained our focus on the spiritual content of this text wherein there is a constant invitation to grow in self-emptying love.

Chapter eight deals with the process of emptying oneself of material possessions and affective attachments. The renunciation of temporal goods and affective attachments are fundamental requisites for spiritual growth. We begin by providing a historical overview and textual interpretation to these two stages. Through an analysis of some letters we explain how this process was lived by Ignatius during his life. The relationship between humility and each step of emptying oneself is explained at the end of each point.

Chapter nine explains the process of emptying one's own self. It explains the methodology and process proposed by Ignatius in order that a candidate can be aided in this process of emptying himself. The themes of fraternal correction, the various experiences, account of conscience, vows and stability are explained. The chapter ends by showing that the third step of the candidate's growth in humility and growth in self-emptying influences the individual as well as his wider environment.

The tenth chapter develops the last three numbers of the fourth chapter - [101-103]. These numbers contain some of the most sublime and succinct expressions of the Society of Jesus' spirituality. It synthesizes the three levels of emptying and explains the unique invitation of the Society of Jesus in order to be united to God. After offering a historical overview of the various forms of internal and external transformation in the history of the Christian tradition, the chapter explains the text followed by an interpretation. It explains the transformative process within the candidate from self-love to self-emptying love by using the schema of Bernard Lonergan. Finally the chapter concludes with some comments on the mysticism of service and union with God.

At the end we offer some concluding remarks. They reiterate the fact that Ignatian spiritual process offers a unique method in order to help transform the desire of a person from narcissistic self-love to joyful self-emptying love. It begins by restating the

basic thesis of our work. The transformative role of humility as explained in each chapter is summarized and related to the entire body of this work. This is followed by an explanation on the transformative process from self-love to self-emptying love through greater internal knowledge, more intense love and closer following of Christ. The transformation of desire and its influence in terms of inter-relatedness and community life will be further elaborated. Finally we indicate the specific contribution of our work in the context of the spirituality of the Society and end by underlining the fact that a person who lovingly and totally empties himself for others is fulfilled and exalted – thus revealing the glory of the Triune God.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work would not have been possible without the grace of God, the intercession of our Blessed Mother and the generous and timely assistance of various persons. Though it would not be possible to name all those who have supported and encouraged me, it is appropriate to acknowledge my heartfelt gratitude to the contribution of some significant persons.

In the first place my sincere gratitude to Dr. (Fr.) José García de Castro whose constant guidance, encouragement, patience and timely suggestions have helped me to engage in a work of this nature. Secondly I would like to express my gratitude to the Province of Gujarat and the last three Provincials - Fr. Keith, Fr. Changanacherry and finally Fr. Francis Parmar. They have always been a source of support and encouragement. Thirdly I would like to express my gratitude towards other professors of the Pontifical University of Comillas who have helped broaden my horizon regarding various aspects of spirituality and the Ignatian charism. Fourthly I would also like to thank the members of my community at Cantoblanco, especially the superior Fr. Guillermo Giménez and other Jesuits who have been a constant source of inspiration and support. Finally I would like to express my gratitude to the members of my family, friends and well-wishers for their constant love and affection. Their encouragement, prayers and blessings have been a source of great strength and support.

I hope that this work may enlighten our understanding and help us better experience the unfathomable, unconditional and eternal love of God – a love which has been concretely and definitively manifest in the Kenosis of Christ. I further hope that this work may help us recognize the importance of humility in order to take forward the process of our internal transformation in order to be more sensitive to be the presence of Christ who carries the Cross in today's world. A transformed love which desires to empty itself for the sake of others would result in a life of ever greater love and service. We firmly believe that a life which is constantly being transformed in such manner would help a person experience true human fulfillment thus revealing the glory of God.

SECTION ONE

**THE HUMILITY OF CHRIST IN THE DIVINE
KENOSIS**

GENERAL INTRODUCTION TO THE FIRST SECTION

The word 'kenosis' is applied in Christian theology to the attitude and action of Jesus Christ or the Logos as elaborated by St. Paul in his letter to the Philippians¹ (Phil. 2,6-11).²

The word 'Kenosis' is applied in Christian theology to that attitude or action of Jesus Christ, or the Logos, referred to by St. Paul in Ph 2:6f., ... We cannot say definitely what the Apostle intended to convey by the words quoted. No other passage in his writings casts any light upon them. There is certainly no doubt that by the phrase he was expressing the same idea as he had in his mind when speaking of 'Jesus Christ' in 2 Co 8:9. This passage, however, is no less ambiguous than the former. In both the antecedent designation 'Jesus Christ' seems to indicate an action of the historical Jesus. But, on the other hand, (it seems that) he is speaking here of an action effected by the pre-existent Christ at His incarnation.

This word is derived from "the original Greek word *kenos* meaning 'empty, without effect' and its very form, *kenoō* means 'to make empty or of no effect.'"³ The passage which is a pre-Pauline hymn⁴ is prefaced by an invitation to have the mind of Christ. It alludes to the fact that the divine Christ emptied Himself and made Himself nothing when He assumed the form of a servant. The term 'emptied' is a key concept in the Divine Kenosis and describes 'the divine being and the divine action in Christ.'⁵

The Divine Kenosis has been interpreted down the centuries by various authors. It has been manifested through doctrinal formulations, sermons, liturgical expressions, prayers and hymns.⁶ This development was influenced by contextual factors and changing world-views. Despite the fact that the development was not gradual and uniform, it can be said without doubt that this theme has been perennially present

¹ The Bible used throughout this work is the digital version of the NRSVCE (New Revised Standard Version – Catholic Edition) as it appears in the digital library of www.logos.com.

² Cf. LOOFS, FRIEDRICH. "Kenosis" *Encyclopedia of Religion and Ethics - VII*. (Ed. James Hastings), T. & T. Clark: Edinburgh, 1914, p. 680. (ee) ('ee' refers to electronic edition. The books in electronic edition are those which have been purchased and downloaded at www.logos.com.)

³ SENIOR, DONALD. "Kenosis" *The New Dictionary of Catholic Spirituality*. (Ed. Downey, Michael), Liturgical Press: Minnesota, 1993, p. 584. (ee)

⁴ Cf. GRILLMEIER, ALOYS. *Christ in Christian Tradition – Vol. 1*, (Tr. Bowden, John), John Knox Press: Atlanta, 1975², p. 20.

⁵ DAWE, DONALD G. *The Form of a Servant*, WIPF & STOCK: Oregon, 2011, p. 17.

⁶ Cf. DAWE, DONALD G. *The Form...*, pp. 22-23.

within the Christian tradition and has been interpreted from biblical, doctrinal, linguistic, sociological, historical and other perspectives.

Why does the understanding of the Divine Kenosis have such an appeal within the Christian tradition? This is because the main expressions of the Christian faith are influenced by the Divine Kenosis. Themes such as the divine attributes, freedom and the glory of God are covered by the Divine Kenosis. A kenotic framework helps us understand the fundamental themes of Christology such as the Incarnation, life, passion and death as well as the resurrection of Jesus.⁷ The revelation of God in Christ leads to a reflection on the nature of the Triune God with most major theologians speaking of 'kenosis as lying at the very heart of the life of God as Trinity.'⁸

Besides revealing the nature of God, it is also the focal point for any serious reflection on the human person.⁹ The nature of God revealed in total self-emptying and humility motivates a Christian to live a life of selfless love and service. The Divine Kenosis as revealed in Christ responds to the deepest yearnings of the human person and provides life with a sense of meaning and harmony.

Only in the mystery of the incarnate Word does the mystery of man take on light. ...Such is the mystery of man, and it is a great one, as seen by believers in the light of Christian revelation. Through Christ and in Christ, the riddles of sorrow and death grow meaningful. (GS 22)

The strength of a Christology centered on the Divine Kenosis is both intellectual and symbolic. Its imagery of the self-emptying love of God revealed in Jesus' Incarnation, life and ultimate death on the cross provides Christians today with a fundamental understanding of the transformative power of love that always entails vulnerability.¹⁰

While the reality of the Divine Kenosis is vast and encompasses various fields, it

⁷ Cf. IBID., pp. 13-17.

⁸ BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity – Kenosis and the Construction of a Christian Theology*, Baylor University Press: Texas, 2011, p. 1.

⁹ Cf. RICHARD LUCIEN. *Christ: The Self-Emptying of God*, Paulist Press: New York, 1997, p. 2.

¹⁰ Cf. RICHARD LUCIEN. *Christ: The Self-Emptying of God...*, p. 8.

needs to be highlighted that the scope of this work is limited to the dimension of the humility of Christ and the concrete humiliations accepted by Him in the Divine Kenosis. Christ is the prototype of radical humility and Paul in his letter to the Philippians invites the believer to have the mind of Christ. The attitude of humility as seen in Christ cannot be separated from actual humiliations that were experienced by Him and though the two are intimately related to each other, there is a nuanced difference.¹¹

Before moving on to the first chapter, it would be pertinent to briefly make a few comments on a general understanding of humility. The word humility originates from the Latin word *humus* which refers to earth or the soil. In the Greco-Roman world, magnanimity was considered to be a virtue while humility was looked down upon.¹² However Christianity reversed this perspective by proclaiming a God who manifested solidarity with the poor. This solidarity was affirmed in the humility of Christ and continued through the humility of the Christian community towards the poor and marginalized. The new community which was counter-cultural to the dominant culture was a community of solidarity, humility and love.

Humility thus understood consists in having the attitude of Christ towards God and towards one other. The human person is called to live in conformity with one's human condition as a creature¹³ that is radically dependent on God. The awareness that God is the source of creation and redemption leads to a deep sense of gratitude, reverence and humility.

Puesto que Yahveh como Dios creador ha dado al hombre su existencia y lo conserva en ella, puesto que Yahveh es también el Señor de la historia y del pueblo judío y de cada hombre, y puesto que él, como donador y don de la salvación escatológica, garantiza el sentido de la historia de su pueblo escogido, de cada individuo y de la humanidad entera;

¹¹ Humility is a virtue which refers to the attitude of a person, while humiliations refer to concrete acts that are experienced by a person.

¹² Aristotle in book IV of Nicomachean Ethics speaks about humility. In his understanding virtue was a midpoint between an excess and deficiency. Magnanimity was considered the mid-point between vanity and humility. Well-being was related to honor and wealth, while humility was related to those who were down trodden, did manual labor, were socially inferior, lived like slaves and were incapable of higher thought.

¹³ SCHAFFNER, O. "Humildad", *CFT – I*, (Dir. Fries, Hienrich), Ediciones Cristiandad: Huesca, 1979², p. 692.

consecuentemente la actitud adecuada frente a Dios sólo puede ser la humildad.¹⁴

Humility is not only an attitude before God, but is also reflected in one's relationship towards others. It avoids exaggerating or undervaluing the dignity and worth of created reality and places each aspect of reality in its rightful position¹⁵. Humility is intimately linked to love and the sign of authentic Christian love is the attitude of humility in the realm of human inter-relationships. Christ is the reference point of humility and reveals a God who would empty Himself, bend before others, suffer humiliations and accept death for the sake of others. A credible and coherent manifestation of Christian discipleship can be seen in a progressive growth in self-emptying love which is concretely expressed in a growing desire and acceptance of sufferings and humiliations for the sake of others.

¹⁴ HUERGA, ÁLVARO. "Humildad", *SM*, (Dir. Rahner, Karl), Editorial Herder: Barcelona, 1976, p. 555.

¹⁵ SCIADINI, P. "Humildad", *DE – II*, (Ed. Ancilli, Ermanno), Editorial Herder: Barcelona, 1987, p. 267.

CHAPTER 1

DIVINE KENOSIS AND HUMILITY IN THE BIBLE

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

*For God so loved the world that he gave his only Son,
so that everyone who believes in Him shall not perish
but have eternal life. (Jn. 3,16)*

This text from the gospel according to John indicates the self-emptying love of God as revealed in the Incarnation of Christ. The fullness of God's love revealed in Christ finds echoes in the Old Testament and is elucidated further in the letters of the New Testament. The central text can be found in the letter of Paul to the Philippians where he speaks of how Christ emptied Himself and in humility stooped down to become human so as to save and reconcile all reality in God. Christ through His words and deeds – in fact through His entire life teaches us how humility is the very being of God. By imitating the humble self-emptying love of God revealed in Christ one grows in the likeness of Christ and lives one Christian vocation.

This chapter provides an overview of the Divine Kenosis and the humility of Christ as presented in the Bible. In the humility of Christ we have a definitive revelation of the immensity of the Triune God's self-emptying love. We shall begin by briefly highlighting the Old Testament's allusion to humility. This will be followed by a detailed understanding of the humility of Christ as revealed in the Gospels. The next section will contain an explanation of the kenotic hymn from Paul's letter to the

Philippians. Finally we shall end by highlighting other texts that refer to the humility of God in the letters of the New Testament.

1.1 HUMILITY IN THE OLD TESTAMENT

The OT time and again indicates that humility is the attitude proper to a creature. This is because man is insignificant compared to God and hence the proper disposition ought to be one of reverence and submission.

Ante Dios, el hombre es polvo y ceniza (*Gn. 18,27; Sab. 9,13-16*), una sombra (*Job 13,25; 14,1s*); los pueblos son como gota de agua en el caldero; el mundo, como un grano de arena (*Is. 40,15ss; Sab. 11,22*). Y también: “¿Qué es el hombre para que tú pienses en él?” (*Sal. 8,5; Ecl. 5,1*). Admiración, rendida obediencia y lealtad incondicional es la postura del hombre (*Sal. 115,1*). Qué significa esta humildad lo muestra el *Salmo 131,1*. En el AT es ante todo humildad ante Dios.¹

1.1.1 GENERAL OVERVIEW

The Old Testament is replete with instances when the humble have been exalted by God and used to fulfil God’s mission. Abraham, Moses, David, Gideon and others humbled themselves before God and God used them effectively for fulfilling God’s mission. While the result of humility was honour and exaltation, the consequence of pride was destruction. The history of individuals was intertwined with the history of Israel where they experienced humiliation while traveling through the desert, during slavery, failures, illnesses and so on. However through these humiliations Israel learnt of its absolute dependence on God’s salvific power. They realized that they had no claim to God and were called to submit to God who was sovereign and demanded righteousness.²

The initial attitude of humility consisted in considering oneself poor, miserable, low and fearful before a God who was sovereign and all powerful. With the progress of the Old Testament we find a more positive interpretation of humility. During the time of the kings it was found that those kings who humbled themselves and submitted

¹ SCHAFFNER, O. “Humildad”, *CFT...*, p. 693.

² Cf. SCIADINI, P. “Humildad”, *DE – II*, p. 268.

themselves to God flourished and were exalted and vice-versa.³ The prophets and psalmists exhorted the Israelites to a more rigorous practice of humility. Various psalms would express confidence that God will humble the wicked and deceitful.⁴ A unique development in the understanding of humility would take place in the book of Job. Job was a righteous man, but despite his righteousness, he was humiliated and humbled. This reveals that no one, not even a righteous man has a claim on God while God's claim on the human person is total.⁵

Within the various OT writings, the Songs of the Suffering Servant have a special place as far as the theme of humility is concerned. They underline the salvific value of humility as manifested in the Suffering Servant.

1.1.2 THE SONGS OF THE SUFFERING SERVANT

The *Songs of the Suffering Servant* in the book of Isaiah provides us an important understanding of humility and will help us better comprehend the humility of Christ. They consist in the following texts: *Is. 42,1-4; 49,1-6; 50,4-9* and *52,13-53,12*.⁶ There has been some debate about the identity of the servant with some authors suggesting that it refers to a person, while other indicate that this refers to the people of Israel. It must be said that the term 'servant' had been used on other occasions in the Old Testament to indicate Abraham (*Gn. 26.24*), Isaac (*Gn. 24.14*), Jacob (*Ez. 37.25*), Moses (*Ex. 14.31; Nm. 12.7*), Joshua (*Jos. 24.29*), David (*2 Sm. 7.8; 1 Kgs. 8.24-25*), Prophets (*1 Kgs. 18.36; Am. 3.7; Jer. 7.25*), Zerubbabel (*Hg. 2.23; Zec. 3.8*), Israel as a nation (*Ps. 104 (105); Jer. 30.10; 46.27; Ez. 28.25*), Nebuchadnezzar, king of Babylon (*Jer. 27.6; 43.10*), to Israel as a whole (*Is. 41.8-9; 42.19; 43.10; 44.1-2; 45.4; 48.20; 49.3*) and occasionally to faithful Israelites (*Is. 54.17*).⁷

³ Cf. VERHEY, A. D. "Humble", *ISBE – Vol. 2*, (Ed. Bromiley, G. W.), W. B. Eerdmans: Michigan, p. 775. (ee)

⁴ Cf. SCHAFFNER, O. "Humildad", *CFT ...*, 693.

⁵ Cf. VERHEY, A. D. "Humble", *ISBE...*, pp. 775-776.

⁶ All the biblical texts have been taken from the electronic edition of NRSV (Catholic edition). Though there is some minor disagreement regarding the exact verses that constitute the four songs, the above mentioned texts have been generally accepted by most scholars.

⁷ S. T. Pardue quoting Gignilliat (GIGNILLIAT, MARK. *Paul and Isaiah's Servants*, TT & Clark: New York, 2007.) indicates

The *Songs of the Suffering Servant* are important because various New Testament authors indicate that the prophecy made in Isaiah has been fulfilled in Jesus Christ. Humility of the suffering servant shows a remarkable affinity with the humility of Jesus Christ and most early Christians noted the continuity between the two. At this stage we do not wish to engage in a detailed analysis because of the limited nature of this part in our entire work. However we would like to comment on the empowering nature of humility as seen in the *Suffering Servant*. This perspective would help us better understand the meaning and importance of humility in the Divine Kenosis.

The first song emphasizes the fact that the suffering servant would bring *justice* and an allusion to it is made three times. It says that Yahweh's 'spirit (is) upon him (and) he will bring forth justice to the nations' (*Is. 42,1*), 'he will faithfully bring forth justice' (*Is. 42,3*) and that he will not 'not grow faint... until he has established justice in the earth' (*Is. 42,4*). The second song which speaks of the *call of the servant* goes on to speak of how the servant has been formed 'to bring Jacob back to him, and that Israel might be gathered to him' (*Is. 49,5*). He is to 'raise up the tribes of Jacob and to restore the survivors of Israel' (*Is. 49,6*). It concludes by saying that the servant will be 'a light to the nations (so that) ...salvations may reach to the ends of the world' (*Is. 49,6*). The third song indicates the *obedience and suffering* of the servant. However the servant is confident of confronting and facing his accuser. Trusting fully that God will enlighten and help him he expresses confidence that those who condemn him 'will wear out like a garment (and) the moth will eat them up' (*Is. 50,9*).

The fourth song has the greatest resemblance to the kenotic hymn in Paul's letter to the Philippians. The suffering of the servant is provided in its most graphic detail and is bracketed within the ultimate triumph of God in the exaltation of the suffering servant. It begins with confidence that the 'servant shall prosper (and) he will be exalted

that there is a movement which takes place within the narrative as the focus of the Servant (singular) shifts to the servants (plural). The servants bear deep resemblance to their progenitor and leader. They continue in righteousness and suffering, placing their hope in the future vindication of God. (Cf. PARDUE, S. T. *The Mind of Christ: Humility and the Intellect in Early Christian Theology*, (Eds. J. Webster – McFarland, I. A. – Davidson, I), Bloomsbury: London, 2013, p. 44. (ee)

and lifted up and shall be very high' (*Is. 52,13*). After a description where the servant is described as being 'marred... beyond human semblance', having 'no form or majesty', 'despised' and 'rejected by others' we have a section which indicates how this humiliation was 'for our transgressions', that the punishment endured by him 'made us whole' and that 'by his bruises we are healed' (*Is. 53,5.8*). The ultimate consequence of this humiliation would be vindicated when it is indicated that 'he shall see his offspring and shall prolong his days'; 'through him the will of the Lord shall prosper in his hand'; 'he shall see the light; he shall find satisfaction through his knowledge' and 'make many righteous' (*Is. 53, 10-11*). Finally Yahweh will 'allot him a portion with the great and he shall divide the spoil with the strong' (*Is. 53, 12*).

Humility thus presented in the Suffering Servant is empowering in nature and leads to participation in divine life. It becomes a means for a manifestation of God's providence and leads to hope, restoration and healing of Israel.⁸ The songs indicate a deep identification and relationship between Yahweh and the servant wherein the empowering presence of the Spirit assures success. The abject humiliation of the servant paradoxically becomes the source of a manifestation of God's glory.

Finally, we would like to conclude by saying that in the OT humility was a call to the people to submit to God who is sovereign and demands righteousness. It primarily consisted in humility before God and there is little talk of humility towards others.⁹ However in the NT, the Incarnation will provide a different interpretation of humility by founding it in the very being of God and giving it a horizontal dimension.

En el AT la palabra de Dios lleva al hombre a la gloria por el camino de una humilde sumisión a Dios, creador y salvador suyo. En el NT la palabra de Dios se hace carne para conducir al hombre al culmen de la humildad, que consiste en servir a Dios en los

⁸ Cf. PARDUE, S. T. *The Mind of Christ...*, pp. 53-56.

⁹ The Magnificat of Mary in the New Testament is a good example of the OT understanding of humility. It extolls humility as seen in a person who has found God's favor. The Magnificat indicates the attitude of radical dependence and knowing one's true position before God. At the same time it indicates the true nature of God's blessing and God's Messianic activity which consists in humbling the proud and exalting the humble.

hombres, en humillarse por amor para glorificar a Dios salvando a los hombres.¹⁰

Through the events in the personal and collective history of Israel, the people are led to understand that it is only through humility that a person is led to God. Only a contrite heart which is aware of its radical dependence on God can humble itself. This attitude is further illumined in the humility of Christ revealed in the Gospels. In the humility of Christ we see that true humility is rooted in God's gratuitous love and oriented towards the service of others. Such humility glorifies God and exalts the human person.

1.2 HUMILITY IN THE GOSPELS

Humility in the New Testament is found in the very person of Christ and it has no trace of the pejorative meaning given to it by the Greek philosophers. The Incarnation, words and life of Jesus invites and demands one to live a life of humility. Christ would time and again speak of his status as a servant and would highlight it in a dramatic manner when he washed the feet of his disciples. The culmination of Christ's humility would be on the cross where the absolute manifestation of God's self-emptying love is revealed in a humiliating death.

The following section will elaborate the humility of God as revealed in the person of Jesus Christ. It begins with Jesus' birth¹¹, infancy and presentation in the temple. Later on we shall move to the public life of Jesus where the sayings of Jesus and the moments of rejection will be highlighted. Finally we shall elaborate the humility of Christ in the passion, crucifixion and death on the Cross. It would be this final event of total self-emptying love which would give us a definitive insight into the being of God.

1.2.1 THE INFANCY OF JESUS

The infancy narratives of Jesus are replete with texts that strongly underline the choice of

¹⁰ SCIADINI, P. "Humildad", *DE – I...*, p. 269.

¹¹ The Incarnation is not extensively elaborated at this point because it will be the focus of our attention in the second section where we shall dwell at length on various contemplations proposed by Ignatius in the Spiritual Exercises. These contemplations are related to the Incarnation, birth and infancy of Jesus.

Jesus to be born in a humble state. The humble context which left Jesus vulnerable was not a mere coincidence, but reveals a definitive option of God to share fully in the poor and fragile condition of the human person.

Narrating the birth of Jesus the gospel of Luke highlights the poverty, humility and vulnerability of Jesus when he says that 'she gave birth to her firstborn son and wrapped him in bands of cloth, and laid him in a manger, because there was no place for them in the inn.' (*Lk. 2,7*).¹² The first persons to adore the Divine in the manger would be humble and poor shepherds, who were open to God's revelation, believed in what was communicated to them and had the privilege of encountering the Divine in the form of a humble and vulnerable child in the manger. (*Lk. 2,15-16*). The presentation of Jesus in the temple too indicates the humble state of Jesus. Being poor, his parents could only afford 'a pair of turtle-doves or two young pigeons' (*Lk. 2,24*).¹³ The fact that he was the son of a carpenter (*Mk. 6,3*) and that he was obedient to his parents (*Lk. 2,51*) further reinforce the humble settings in which Jesus grew up.

1.2.2 JESUS' PUBLIC LIFE

The public life of Jesus is replete with exhortations to humility. On various occasions Jesus extolled the redemptive value of humility through words, symbols and parables. His disciples found it difficult to understand this message and Jesus would repeat his exhortation to a life of poverty and humility until his humiliating death on the Cross.

1.2.2.1 The Beginning of Jesus' Public Life

The baptism of Jesus would be an important moment when He identified with sinful humanity and chose to be baptised by John the Baptist. This event is highlighted by all the evangelists (*Mt. 3,13-17; Mk. 1,9-11; Lk. 3,21-22; Jn. 1,29-34*) signifying the importance attached to this event. Though all the evangelists would highlight the Sonship of Jesus,

¹² Centuries later the humility of God revealed in the manger will be creatively incorporated in Christian devotion and mysticism by St. Francis of Assisi at Greccio in 1293 CE.

¹³ If the parents were wealthy, they were to bring a lamb and a young pigeon or a turtle dove to be offered as a sacrifice at the Temple. However if the parents were poor, they were to offer two pigeons or two turtle doves for the sacrifice.

this act of Jesus where he joined the ranks of sinners indicates the humility of God who does not watch stoically, but shares in the human condition.

During the public life of Jesus there are various occasions when He highlights the paradox of humility being exalted and pride being brought down. One of them can be seen in a prayer of thanksgiving. In the gospel of Mathew He thanks the Father for revealing the truth not to 'the wise and intelligent... but to infants' (*Mt 11,25*). Those who feel burdened in life are invited to imitate Him who is 'gentle and humble in heart.' (*Mt. 11,29*) The same self-revelation of Jesus is expressed in its Trinitarian dimension in the gospel of Luke where Jesus, 'rejoicing in the Holy Spirit' (*Lk. 10,21*) prays to the Father for having chosen to reveal this eternal wisdom to 'infants'. It is only by having the attitude of humility that one will be able to enter into the mystery of Trinitarian love which is revealed 'to whom the Son choses to reveal...' (*Lk. 10,22*).

1.2.2.2 The Beatitudes

The *Beatitudes* that Jesus proclaimed give us an insight into the heart of Christ – and in effect into the heart of the Trinity. The first beatitude indicates that one who is 'poor in spirit' (*Lk. 5,3*) is a blessed person. Such a person can move out of one's false self-sufficiency and open oneself to others and the absolute Other. Jesus also praises one who is 'meek, for they will inherit the earth.' (*Lk. 5,5*) The last two beatitudes indicate the relationship between actual humiliation and humility by showing how a person is blessed on being 'persecuted for righteousness sake' (*Mt. 5,10*) and is also blessed when 'people revile and persecute you' (*Mt. 5,11*). The humility of God is evident in these beatitudes because Jesus Himself lives them to the fullest. The crucifixion at Calvary reveals a Christ who is totally humiliated and manifests the ultimate form of humility

1.2.2.3 The Argument on Greatness

The request of James and John¹⁴ is the setting for another of Jesus' famous sayings on humility. He stresses that the kingdom He proclaims is different from what was conventionally understood. In it, greatness consisted in being a servant or a slave and

¹⁴ The gospel of Mathew indicates that this request was made by the mother of James and John.

serving others in humility – ‘whoever wishes to become great among you must be your servant, and whoever wishes to be first among you must be slave of all.’ (*Mk. 10,44*) Immediately after this statement, He reveals his mission in saying that – ‘the Son of Man came not to be served but to serve, and to give his life as a ransom for many.’ (*Mk. 10,45*) Jesus indicates that there is a direct relationship between suffering, humiliation, a life of service and humility when he asks James and John whether they would be ‘able to drink the cup that (He) was about to drink?’ (*Mk. 10,39; Mt.20,22*).¹⁵

The gospel of Mark presents Jesus’ disciples arguing about who was the greatest. Jesus who was aware that the disciples were not grasping the core of his Good News and continued to look for places of honour and pride, ‘took a little child’ (*Mk. 9,36*) and asked them to ‘become humble like (a) child’ (*Mt. 18,4*). In the Semitic world where a child was not considered as important to a grown up male, Jesus holds up a child and asks his disciples to accept within their lives the childlike qualities of humility, littleness, and insignificance.

The participation in Christ has a more extended significance in the gospel according to Mark and Luke where the acceptance of the humility and simplicity of a child is related to union with the Trinity because it refers to a union not only with Christ, but also with one who has sent Him – ‘whoever welcomes one such child in my name welcomes me, and whoever welcomes me welcomes not me but the one who sent me.’ (*Mk. 9,37; Lk. 9,48*)

1.2.2.4 Honour and Pride

The attempts by some people to acquire for themselves places of honour would lead Jesus to reinforce the centrality of humility in the new order that he was ushering in. On observing that some guests were looking for places of honour at a wedding banquet He said that ‘all who exalt themselves will be humbled, and those who humble themselves

¹⁵ This statement is not a direct self-revelation as we see in the ‘I am’ statements, but indicates His mission and true identity which consists in an other-centered existence that is lived out in humble service. This is the being of the Triune God where each Person is totally for the sake of the other and the disciples of Jesus who are made in God’s image are invited to a similar form of existence.

will be exalted' (*Lk. 14,11*). Jesus used the imagery of the banquet to indicate the new realm of His Kingdom where all are invited by the Father. In this banquet there is an inversion of standards and those who, inspired by the Spirit imitate the Son through a life of humility and self-emptying love will share the place of honour.

The same point is underlined in the parable of the Pharisee and the tax-collector where Jesus says that – 'all who exalt themselves will be humbled, but all who humble themselves will be exalted' (*Lk. 18,14*). The final justification of the tax-collector indicates that the attitude of humility is what finds favour with God, while that of pride has its downfall. Pride symbolized in the Pharisee is totally centered on itself, and the façade of spiritual justification makes it extremely difficult for one to open up to the grace of God. Humility on the other hand leads to a greater aperture towards the mercy and grace of God leading one to encounter one's true self in the light of God's merciful love.

1.2.2.5 The Public Life of Jesus and Humiliations

The preceding section has briefly reflected on some moments in the life of Jesus when He spoke through words and symbols about the centrality of humility. However is it possible to understand and grow in humility without going through humiliations? The answer is obviously 'no' because without experiencing humiliations in one's own life or through participation in the life of another person it would be impossible to grow in humility. Humility does not emerge by mere academic consideration but is the result of an experience of humiliation and rejection.

We find that Jesus experienced rejection and humiliation from his own people as well as from others such as the Samaritans and Romans. The subsequent section highlights some important moments of actual humiliation and rejection in the life of Jesus. These moments would paradoxically reveal the glory of God.

1.2.2.5.1 Humiliations due to Jesus' humble origins

While we reflect on the rejection and humiliations that Jesus had to face, we must always keep in mind that this was in the context of an extremely fruitful and acclaimed public

ministry where Jesus was hailed as a Messiah. Despite the extraordinary signs that He performed, some people remarked that he was 'Joseph the carpenter's son', his mother was a humble and poor woman 'called Mary' and that his brothers were 'James and Joseph and Judas and Simon' (*Mk. 6, 3; Mt. 13,55; Lk. 4,22*).

The frustration of Jesus is evident when he uses popular sayings to show how 'prophets (are) dishonoured' (*Mk. 6,4; Mt. 13,57*) or that 'no prophet is accepted in (his) hometown' (*Lk. 4,24*). Jesus's lowly human origin was used to insult and disregard Him. However the gospel of Luke goes further and indicates that not only was he humiliated, the people in the synagogue 'were filled with rage' (*Lk. 4,28*) and wanted to 'hurl him off the cliff' (*Lk. 29*).

1.2.2.5.2 Frustration due to unbelief

Jesus' humble origins are an obstacle and lead to 'unbelief' (*Mk. 6,6; Mt. 13,58*). The rejection of the Messianic signs frustrated God's plan as seen in Jesus' inability to 'do deeds of power' (*Mk. 6,5; Mt. 13,58*). Despite this frustration Jesus is respectful of human freedom and voluntarily chooses to continue revealing God to very end. The ultimate sign that would manifest the being of God would be on the cross where the depth of God's self-emptying love would be revealed in the utter humiliation, rejection and abandonment on the Cross. Paradoxically the humiliation of Christ on the Cross would be the moment of exaltation, becoming in this manner the locus of eternal redemption.

The frustration of Jesus is seen in his rather stern words against the hard heartedness of the people of Chorazin, Bethsaida and Capernaum. Despite the signs that had been performed, 'they did not repent' (*Mt. 11,20*). The pride of the people in the above mentioned towns was an obstacle in knowing God. However other towns with a humbler gait had greater chance of a transformation and knowing God. In the condemnation of the various towns, Jesus expresses more hope in apparently sinful towns like 'Tyre and Sodom' (*Mt. 11,21; Lk. 10, 14*) than in the self-righteous towns of Chorazin, Betsaida and Capernaum. Jesus who said that he was meek and humble of heart would have certainly experienced rejection and humiliation of an intense degree in

order to use such strong words.

1.2.2.5.3 *Parable of the vineyard*

The rejection and humiliation that Jesus experienced is powerfully expressed in the parable of the wicked tenants where the son of the owner is 'seized, killed and thrown out of the vineyard' (*Mk. 12,8; Mt. 21,39; Lk. 20,15*). In explaining this parable Jesus quotes Psalm 118 where He says that 'the stone that the builders rejected has become the cornerstone.' The rejection and humiliation that Jesus experienced is poignantly summarized in the gospel of John where the evangelist delicately but succinctly says that 'he came to what was his own, and his own people did not accept him' (*Jn. 1,11*).

1.2.3 THE PASSION AND CRUCIFIXION

1.2.3.1 The Last Supper

The climax of Christ's humility is seen in the total self-emptying during the passion, the crucifixion and death at Calvary. The gospel of Luke places the discussion about greatness immediately after the last supper and in this context Jesus defines His identity as being opposed to the standard of the world by stating that He who is their Master, is 'among (them), as one who serves' (*Lk. 22,27*). In the gospel of John this dimension is presented in the episode of the washing of feet. When Jesus washes the feet of his disciples, He indicates that the very being of God is one of humility. Jesus in voluntarily choosing to give Himself for others indicates the centrality of humble service in God's redemptive work.

The range of verbs that the evangelist uses to express the entire act are impressive – 'he *got up* from the table, *took off* his outer robe, and *tied* a towel around himself. Then he *poured* water into a basin and began *to wash* the disciples' feet and *wipe* them with the towel...' (*Jn. 13,5*) The act of Jesus was proper for a servant or slave and this explains the astonishment of the disciples who dreamt of participating in the glory of a triumphant Master. In the act of bending to washing the feet of his disciples, He gave himself to them. To the protestations of Peter, Jesus told him that if one does not allow oneself to be 'washed' (*Jn. 13,8*) by the humility of God, then one has 'no share in (God).' (*Jn. 13,8*)

It is only by accepting God in God's humility that one participates in divine life. Jesus further goes on to instruct the disciples that those who have experienced the Lord washing their feet, 'ought to wash one another's feet' (*Jn. 13,14*).

The Last Supper is a special moment in Jesus' manifestation of self-emptying love. The intensity of this moment is experienced when Jesus tells that he 'eagerly desired to eat this Passover' (*Lk. 22,15*). During the Last Supper Jesus offered Himself totally to His disciples in the bread and wine that is 'blessed, broken and poured out' for all. The self-emptying of Christ in this Passover meal is in fact a moment which transcends time because through this gesture Christ institutes the Eucharist which will be the eternal symbol of God's humility and total self-emptying. Christ asked his disciples to repeat this symbol of self-emptying love 'in remembrance of (Him)' (*Lk. 22,19; 1 Cor 11,24*). The Eucharist is not merely the commemoration of an historical incident, but is a reality which is present every day.

Francis of Assisi explains the Eucharist as an eternal symbol of God's ongoing humility when he says:

Behold ... each day He himself comes down to us, appearing humbly; each day He comes down from the bosom of the Father upon the altar in the hands of the priest...

...O sublime humility! O humble sublimity! The lord of the universe, God and the Son of God, so humbles himself that for our salvation he hides himself under an ordinary piece of bread! Brothers, look at the humility of God, and pour out your hearts before him! Humble yourselves that you may be exalted by him! Hold nothing back of yourselves for yourselves, that he who gives himself totally to you may receive you totally.¹⁶

The disciples at the last supper and those who participate in the Eucharist realized that when they 'eat this bread and drink the cup' (*1 Cor 11,26*) they in fact share in the very being of God – in Divine life. Just as one who does not allow Christ to wash his feet has no part with Him, in the same way one who was unwilling to be nourished by the humility of Christ will have no part in Him either.

¹⁶ *Francis and Clare – The Complete Works*, (Tr. Armstrong, Regis – Brady, Ignatius), Paulist Press: New York, 1982, pp. 26,27,58.) The first text is from *The Admonitions* and the second is from *The Letter to the Order*. The text from no. 26 to 29 in the Letter to the Order is a beautiful hymn which refers to the Eucharist and speaks of the totality of Christ's humility and self-giving love and invites the brothers to respond by offering themselves totally.

1.2.3.2 Abandoned by His disciples

Jesus had experienced the rejection of religious authorities but now the time had come when his own would abandon Him. He would be betrayed by Judas, denied by Peter and deserted by all his disciples. Though he knew he would be abandoned by all to fend for Himself, He still loved them unconditionally to the very end.

The humility of God is evident in the helplessness of Christ in relation to his disciples. Especially significant is the vulnerability and helplessness of Jesus in the case of Judas Iscariot. All the evangelists are unanimous about the fact that Jesus all along knew that he would be betrayed (*Mk. 14,20; Mt. 26,23; Lk. 22,32; Jn. 13,24*). Yet his attitude towards his disciples was not one of anger.

The only time that Jesus was annoyed was when Peter in his pride remarks that he would not 'desert Jesus' (*Mk. 14,29*) and was willing to 'go to prison' (*Lk. 22,33*) or even 'to lay down his life for Him' (*Jn. 13,37*). The same Jesus who rebuked him for his pride (*Mk. 14,30; Mt. 26,34; Lk. 22,34; Jn. 13,38*) 'turned and looked' (*Lk. 22,61*) at him consolingly after he had denied Him. This look of a humble and helpless Jesus who was being led away caused a feeling of compunction within a humiliated Peter which led him to go out and weep bitterly.¹⁷

The same joy was not to be experienced by Jesus in the case of Judas. Jesus' attitude towards Judas reveals the love, humility and suffering of God and cannot easily be understood from a human point of view. The man who was to betray Him was allowed to 'dip bread in the bowl with him' (*Mk. 14,20; Mt. 26,23*) and was allowed 'to kiss him' (*Lk. 22,47*). We do not see the rancour or aggression that Jesus displays against self-righteous persons. Despite the fact that Jesus knew the evil intentions of Judas, his freedom was respected and he was allowed to proceed with his plan and asked 'do quickly what he is going to do' (*Jn. 13,27*). The gentleness, meekness and pain is evident in Jesus' question to Judas when he asked him if it was 'with a kiss that (he would)

¹⁷ Most spiritual authors would incline towards the value of tears of compunction which are caused by sorrow for one's sins or due to a deep sense of supernatural truths. (Cf. DE GUIBERT, JOSEPH. *The Theology of the Spiritual Life*, (Tr. Barrett, Paul), Sheed and Ward: London, 1956, pp. 225-28.)

betray the Son of Man? (*Lk.22,48*) This pain would be further accentuated on the knowledge that Judas had finally given up, taken his life and thus frustrated the plan of God's love (*Mt. 27,5; Acts 1,18*).¹⁸ However his inability to break out of the vicious circle of self-love led him to have a proud and exaggerated opinion of himself where he believed that his sin was greater than God's mercy.¹⁹

The anguish of Christ is evident in His words to Peter, James and John when he says that he is 'deeply grieved, even to death' (*Mk. 14,34; Mt. 26,28*). The disciples however do not understand the internal state of Christ and fall asleep. In this situation of total solitude we have a glimpse of the tender and totally self-emptying relationship between the Father and the Son – a relationship which was expressed by the word 'Abba' (*Mk. 14,36*). This relationship was put to the test and would be further tested to its limits in the experience of feeling abandoned by the Father on the cross. Jesus knew that for the Father 'all things are possible' (*Mk. 14,36*) and if 'it was possible' (*Mt. 26,39*) he wanted to the Father to 'remove the cup' (*Mk. 14,36; Mt. 26,39; Lk. 22,42*). The text undoubtedly indicates the faithfulness and obedience of Christ to the will of the Father when he desires 'not what I want but what you want' (*Mt. 26,39; Lk. 22,42*).

The passion in no way indicates merely an anthropomorphic God, but a God who in the biblical tradition shares fully in the human condition. Christ knew that He would most probably meet a violent death²⁰ and that it was now the 'time of trial' (*Mk. 14,38; Mt. 26,41; Lk. 22,46*). He humbly accepted the fact that he was afraid and did not desire to go ahead. This sentiment was expressed in the fact that he 'threw himself on the ground and prayed' (*Mk. 14,35; Mt. 26,39*) and so intense were his feelings that 'his sweat became like great drops of blood falling down on the ground' (*Lk. 22,44*). However in

¹⁸ The evangelist Mathew indicate that Judas '*repented*' (*Mt. 27,3*) because he realized that Jesus was '*innocent*' (*Mt. 27,4*).

¹⁹ According to the *Dialogues* of Catherine of Sienna, Judas was not primarily condemned for having betrayed Jesus. Rather he was condemned more for having rejected the mercy of God than for having betrayed Jesus. "...*the despair of Judas displeased Me more, and was more grave to My Son than was his betrayal of Him.*" (Last accessed on 09/05/2015 - <http://www.ccel.org/ccel/catherine/dialog.iv.iii.xxi.html>)

²⁰ Cf. O'COLLINS, GERALD. *Christology- A Biblical, Historical, and Systematic Study of Jesus*, Oxford University Press: 2009, pp. 68-69. (2nd ed.)

the end, realizing that His 'hour had come' (*Mk. 14, 41*), He asked his disciples to wake up for they had to 'be going' (*Mk. 14,42; Mt. 26,46*).

1.2.3.3 The Arrest of Jesus

The attitude of Christ towards his disciples is extraordinary at the time of his arrest. At the moment of his arrest, he demonstrated this attitude of humility by submitting himself to the authorities who had come to arrest Him. In this moment of passive submission which was 'voluntary'²¹ in nature we are once again reminded of the true glory and power of Jesus.²² The arrest of Jesus is an important moment because it began a phase where Jesus was primarily passive and was 'led' (*Lk.22,54*) by others.

The disciples did take steps to stop him being arrested and even took recourse to violence where one of them cut off the ear of the high priest's slave (*Mt. 26,51; Mk. 14,47; Lk. 22,50; Jn.18,10*). At this tense moment too, Jesus revealed his compassion for the poor and humble by healing the slave of the high priest (*Lk. 22,51*). He humbly accepted the fact that even those close to Him, including Simon Peter had not understood his proclamation – that He had come to reveal a God who was loving, self-emptying and humble. As Jesus was being 'arrested' and taken for the farce of a trial his disciples 'leave him and run away' (*Mt. 26,56; Mk. 14,50; Jn. 18,12; Lk. 22,54*). He is left all alone and had as His sustenance only his filial trust in His Father.

1.2.3.4 The Trial of Jesus

The three authorities before whom Jesus was tried included the Sanhedrin, Herod and Pilate. As we reflect on the trials the paradox could not be more striking – the true Lord of the Universe stands in humility against the pride of the apparent lords of the world. In the very trial and judgement being passed by these worldly powers against Christ, they were passing judgement on themselves.

²¹ The words of the second Eucharistic prayer emphasize this point which say that 'he entered willingly into his Passion' The Roman Missal – Third Typical Edition. (ee) This point is also stressed by Gerald O'Collins when he says that Jesus 'willed his death by accepting it rather than by deliberately and directly planning and courting it. (Cf. O'COLLINS, GERALD. *Christology...*, p. 69)

²² This is evident in his reference to the 'twelve legions of angels' (*Mt. 26,53*).

The first trial took place before the Council and Jesus was 'silent' (*Mk. 14,61*) before the false accusations and replied only when he was directly questioned by the high priest. On revealing that the humble, vulnerable captive was the Son of God - the Messiah, 'the high priest tore his clothes' (*Mk. 14,63; Mt. 26,65*). This was because the revelation of God's humility in Christ did not fit in with their stereotypes and categories of the Messiah or the Son of God.²³

The ignorance and blindness of the religious authorities was striking because they refused to acknowledge the truth despite the fact that the prophets of old had foretold that the Messiah would be the Suffering Servant. The actual humiliations and physical assaults begin right away when some of them 'spat in his face, struck him, slapped him and mocked Him' (*Mt. 26,67; Mk. 14,65; Jn. 18,22*). However since the Jewish authorities did not have the jurisdiction to kill Him, they had to take Him to Pilate, the governor.²⁴

The humility of Christ is seen in the meekness with which He responded to the charge that He was a political subvert who posed a threat to the Roman emperor and his authority. Pilate was convinced of Jesus' innocence and looked for various ways to release Him. He sent him to Herod because Jesus came from Galilee (*Lk. 23,6-11*), tried to secure His release by applying a custom that existed of releasing a convict (*Mt. 27,21; Mk. 15,9; Lk. 23,22; Jn. 18,38*) and even hoped that by having Jesus flogged (*Mt. 27,24; Mk.*

²³ The Messianic expectations during the second temple Judaism was highly diverse in form and content. From the early 5th century B.C.E to the 2nd century B.C.E. the desire for a renewed Davidic dynasty was not a strong element in Jewish history. However with the rise and fall of the Hasmonean dynasty there was a renewed interpretation of the sacred scripture and a desire for national redemption and resistance to foreign rule. Some continued to believe that collaborating with Rome would provide them imperial patronage. While the understanding of a messiah as someone 'raised up, sent or anointed for a particular task as it relates to the liberation of Israel from its perceived travail and suffering' was generally accepted, there was a great deal of variety in terms of interpreting the same. (Cf. BIRD, MICHAEL F. *Are You the One Who Is to Come? - The Historical Jesus and the Messianic Question*, Baker Academic: Michigan, 2009, pp. 31-34.) (ee)

²⁴ The issue about who was actually responsible for Jesus' death has been debated. It is believed that the early Christian community who lived in various parts of the Roman Empire sought to place the blame primarily on the Jewish authorities keeping in mind their relationship with the empire as well as with Judaism. Some modern studies have tried to show that the Romans were responsible for the death of Jesus, but that argument does not stand scrutiny. On the whole it is accepted that the Jewish leaders as well as the Romans were responsible for Jesus' death. [Cf. FITZMYER, JOSEPH A. *A Christological Catechism - New Testament Answers*, Paulist Press: New York, 1991, pp. 76-81. (2nd ed.) (ee)]

15,15; Lk. 23,16; Jn. 19,1), the people would be satisfied. All through this bizarre spectacle, Jesus endured the torments silently.

In fact Pilate was amazed at Jesus' silence and questioned Jesus' attitude of not responding to his questions (*Mt. 27,14; Mk. 15,5*). While the synoptic gospels indicate that Jesus only responded to Pilate's questions by saying 'you say so' (*Mt.27,11; Mk. 15,3; Lk. 23,3*) in response to whether he was the King of the Jews, the evangelist John places an important conversation between Jesus and Pilate wherein Jesus speaks of His kingdom, the truth and power. The conversation is a profound manifestation of the inversion of values that are proclaimed by Christ. Pilate's powerlessness is evident before the poor and humble Christ who is revealed as the true king – a king whose kingdom 'is not of this world' (*Jn. 18,36*).

In this encounter where Jesus reveals God and Pilate represents the world we have a stark contrast of the two standards. There is no façade which can hide one or the other standard. In keeping with the paradoxical inversion of values we find that the one who is humiliated, scorned, totally vulnerable and at the mercy of others is in fact one who has all the power in the world to continue loving and manifests total freedom towards the truth. On the other hand one who has the power of the mightiest empire behind him, clad in pomp and glory, receives the bows and adulation of all the leaders is in fact the person who is enslaved and incapable of doing what truth demands of him.

The humiliated is in fact exulted and the proud and powerful is humbled. The captivity and condemnation of Jesus is a further manifestation of humility as a necessary precondition of love while the powerful and apparently free are radically incapable of being their true selves. For this reason it is said that all would not be able to realize this truth, but 'only those who hear His voice' (*Jn. 18,37*).

1.2.3.5 The Crucifixion and Death of Jesus

Jesus had revealed the love of God during his public life through the signs he performed as he went about doing good. Now he was left all alone and deserted by the close circle of his friends. However it would be in this moment that by the sign of his own

humiliating death he would manifest the greatest sign of God's self-emptying love.

Jesus was condemned to death²⁵ and led to Calvary (*Mt. 27,31; Mk. 15,20; Lk. 23,26; Jn. 19,16*). He was stripped of all dignity, respect and honour. As He lay dying on the Cross, He revealed an important dimension of humility which consisted in the *totality* of self-emptying love. He began by giving His beloved mother who had been his most faithful disciple as a gift to the Church (*Jn. 19,27*). This was followed by an experience of the absence of the Father and hence He cried out in the words of Psalm 22 'my God, my God why have you abandoned me' (*Mk.15,34*).

Finally at the last moment of His earthly life he 'bowed his head and gave up his spirit' (*Lk. 19,30*). The humility and self-emptying love reaches its climax on the cross, but does not end here. It continues because 'He descended to the dead' as is said in the Apostles creed. This totally passive dimension of the Passion where He identified with the dead is the ultimate expression of humility and paradoxically through such humility He would manifest the fullness of God's glory.²⁶ The cross thus becomes the locus where Christ revealed the infinite love of God - a God who would not hold back anything and engaged in an act of total self-emptying. The death on the cross was '... so that the Son may glorify (the Father)' (*Jn. 17,1*) and through it proclaim the ultimate victory of love over all human sin and death.

'We know and experience that love in its purest form, is self-sacrifice for others. ...Jesus was ready to offer himself because he deemed the realization of God's love to be more important than his own life. One can understand Jesus' resurrection as confirmation of the victory of love over all human sin and over death. As messianic Son of man Jesus is the love of God personified (1 John 4:9-10,16).²⁷

²⁵ Three possible reasons can be give in order to understand the death of Jesus. He had too many enemies, he made a sacrifice of love and in order to reconcile us to God. Peter Stuhlmacher in his book *Jesus of Nazareth – Christ of Faith* indicates that 'Jesus did little to endear himself to Pharisees, scribes, rich Jews, zealots, or even to priests and Sadducees.' He goes on to explain this phrase with the presentation of six scenes. (Cf. STUHLMACHER, PETER. *Jesus of Nazareth – Christ of Faith*, (Tr. Schatzmann, Siegfried), Hendrickson Publishers: Massachusetts, 1988, pp. 42-47.)

²⁶ '...in this (the Cross/Crucified), not only is the world enabled by God to reach its goal, but God himself, in the moment of the world's very perdition, attains his own most authentic revelation and glorification.' VON BALTHASAR, HANS URS. *Mysterium Paschale*, (Tr. Nichols, Aidan), Ignatius Press: San Francisco, 1990, p. 14.

²⁷ STUHLMACHER, PETER. *Jesus of Nazareth...*, pp. 56-57.

1.3 HUMILITY IN THE EPISTLES

The Pauline letters form the major part of the epistles and contain various references to humility and the Divine Kenosis. The most important text related to the Divine Kenosis can be found in Paul's letter to the Philippians. Other texts which echo the same sentiment can be seen in Paul's second letter to the Corinthians where he says that Christ was rich but accepted poverty in order to make impoverished humanity rich (*2 Cor. 8,9*). The sending of Christ or His descent can also be found in the letter of Paul to the Romans (*Rom. 8,3*) and Galatians (*Gal. 4,4-5*).

Besides the Pauline corpus the first letter of Peter where he speaks of the need to be humble by quoting from the song of the suffering servant (*1 Pet. 2,18-25*) and the letter to the Hebrews (*Heb. 5,8*) also speaks of Christ's humility, suffering and obedience. The first letter of John (*1 Jn. 4,9*) also makes reference to the descent of Christ. For our purpose we shall limit ourselves to a detailed explanation of three verses in the letter to the Philippians followed by a few remarks about humility in the letters of Paul to the Romans and Corinthians as well as the first letters of Peter and John.

1.3.1 HUMILITY IN THE LETTER TO THE PHILIPPIANS – CH. 2, 1-11

During the incarceration of Paul, he wrote a letter to the Christian community of Philippians in which we have the most explicit reference to the humility and self-emptying of Christ (*Phil. 2,6-11*). This passage has been widely studied and is considered to be the 'Mt. Everest of Philippians study'.²⁸ The scope of research on this hymn is enormous and it is beyond our scope to provide an exhaustive explanation of this text. We shall limit ourselves to the dimension of humility and self-emptying love as manifest in the attitude and actions of Christ. In explaining this text we begin with some general comments and later on focus our attention on verses 5, 7 and 8. The explanation ends with some ethical considerations that emerge in this text.

The hymn is an invitation to imitate Christ through humble, unselfish living

²⁸ REUMANN, JOHN. *Philippians – A New Translation with Introduction and Commentary* - AYBC, Yale University Press: New Haven & London, 2008, p. 339. (ee)

wherein one places the needs of others before one's own needs. Paul gives the example of Timothy (*Phil. 2,19-24*) and Epaphroditus (*Phil 2:25-30*) to reinforce his point. However the chief example is that of Christ who despite being in the form of God emptied himself and took the form of a servant. This was against the attitude and actions of Adam who desired to exalt himself.²⁹ The text reveals two processes of emptying – a) that of becoming human and b) of suffering and dying on the cross.³⁰ The outcome of this descent and emptying was a final vindication in the form of exaltation.³¹ Both these processes have at their centre an attitude of humility and the actual choice of humiliations.³² This attitude and choice is difficult to explain from a human point of view, but can be justified in the ambit of Christian love.³³

This is a doctrinally loaded hymn which speaks about the Incarnation, service, death and exaltation of Jesus. It is a deeply theological text and reveals a high Christology.³⁴ Some have interpreted it in order to understand the theological import of the hymn by seeing it in from a Christological perspective and in terms of the history of salvation; others have tried to see in it the settings of the early Church and still others

²⁹ The community of Philippians was aware of the contrast between Adam and Christ. It can be assumed that Paul would have instructed them about this contrast. In day to day living this contrast would have been evident in the tendency towards ruler worship which had become more pronounced with oriental influences. *'Philippians would have been acquainted with Caesar as a godlike figure, by apotheosis at death, during the ruler's lifetime, and as part of his origins, in the sphere of the divine... (This) contrasts one who did not seek advantages but abased self to the level of a slave.'* (Cf. REUMANN, JOHN. *Philippians - AYBC...*, p. 368.)

³⁰ While this hymn has a clear parallel with the fourth song of the Suffering Servant, it should be pointed out that other literature during this period also spoke of suffering heroes or righteous sufferers. *'The theme was also found in Plato (Ap. 29A-31C, Crito 54D, Phaedo 115B-118A;...)'* Cf. REUMANN, JOHN. *Philippians - AYBC...*, pp. 371-72.

³¹ This structure of descending from a high position, being humiliated and then being exalted was present in the prevailing literary tradition – especially within Greek tragedies. An analysis of the same has been provided by, Bruce N. Fisk where he uses three works composed during the first and second centuries CE in order to show this pattern. (Cf. FISK, BRUCE N. *"The Odyssey of Christ" Exploring Kenotic Christology – The Self-Emptying of Christ* (Ed. Evans, C. Stephen), 2010, pp. 45-73.)

³² *'Philippians knew humiliation in daily life, "put in their place" by betters in the social structures of the Roman world, its hierarchy of authority, and economic networks. All could identify with a figure who suffered humiliation.'* REUMANN, JOHN. *Philippians - AYBC...*, p. 370.

³³ Cf. DAANE, J. "Kenosis", *ISBE – Vol. 3*, (Ed. Bromiley, Geoffrey W.), William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company: Michigan, 1992, p. 8. (ee) (Rpr)

³⁴ *"Although the exaltation theme presented there contributes to the context, here Paul advocated humility, not exaltation."* (MELICK, RICHARD R. *Philippians, Colossians, Philemon - NAC - Vol. 32*, Broadman & Holman Publishers: Tennessee, 1991, p. 96. (ee))

have seen in this text the emptying of Christ as a model for self-sacrifice. Whatever be the interpretation, it is generally accepted that the immediate concern for Paul was ethical³⁵ where he invited the members of the Christian community to have a humble attitude towards one other in order to foster greater unity and love. This attitude is stressed in verses 5, 7 and 8.

As stated earlier each word of the kenotic hymn is rich in meaning and can be used for an understanding of liturgy, ecclesiology, soteriology and Christology.³⁶ However for our purpose we shall limit ourselves to the dimension of the free-will within in the kenotic process, the process of emptying and the dimension of humility as seen in verses 5, 7 and 8.

Verse 5 - 'Let the same mind be in you that was in Christ Jesus'. These words form a link between the preceding text on humility and the succeeding hymn.³⁷ The invitation to a life of self-emptying and humility is presented in a positive context where one stands to gain or be exalted by imitating this attitude of Christ.³⁸ The ability to imitate Christ presupposes the free will of the person as well as Divine free-will. Though kenosis is part of Divine nature, it is not an automatic process because the Incarnation was a deliberate choice.

It must just be observed that even if *kenosis* is fundamental to the nature of God, this does not automatically make his action kenotic. He has to choose, by his free will, to act in this way. Even if creation was an act of *kenosis*, and so according to his nature, he still chose to create. Even if *kenosis* was fundamental to the nature of the second Person, he still chose to become incarnate. And this means that even if we share in the kenotic nature of God by virtue of our salvation uniting us to God and imparting something of his nature to us, it is

³⁵ Cf. MELICK, RICHARD R. *NAC – Vol. 32...*, pp. 96-97.

³⁶ '... the text praises the attitude of Jesus. The hymn was to be used in worship, and as such, it was doxological. The total impact was to move the Church to appreciate and imitate Jesus' actions. Each word contributes to the meaning. Certainly interpreters need not read more into the text than was intended, but overtones of Christology exist which cannot be dismissed.' *IBID.*, pp. 104-05.

³⁷ Cf. HAWTHORNE, GERALD F. *WBC-Philippians - Vol.43*, (Rev. Martin, Ralph), Thomas Nelson Publishers: New York, 2004, p. 107. (ee)

³⁸ There exists the subtle danger of thinking that humility is for personal gain. This was seen in the prudential ethics or Stoic ethics. This danger is however addressed by Paul in an earlier verse when he invites the Philippians to '*do nothing from selfish ambition or conceit, but in humility regard others as better than yourselves*' (v,3).

still necessary for us to act in that way.³⁹

Verse 7 - ‘...but (He) emptied himself, taking the form of a slave and being born in human likeness.’ Emptying here refers to the humility where Christ in the Incarnation gave up his divine condition and became human.

...despite years of speculation about what Christ emptied himself of according to 2:7 (divinity, power, some divine attribute, etc.), it is generally agreed that the self-emptying (*kenosis*, from the Greek verb used here) is metaphorical, pointing to the complete self-lowering that becoming human involved for one equal to God. This is confirmed by the three subsequent phrases “taking the form of a slave, being born in human likeness and being found in human form.”⁴⁰

The words of this verse are ‘not used or intended here in a metaphysical sense to define the limitations of Christ’s incarnate state, but as a strong and graphic expression of the completeness of his self-renunciation.’⁴¹ The word ‘emptying’⁴² is paradoxical in nature because while the word refers to giving up something it is in fact an addition – an addition of humanity to the divinity of Christ.⁴³

The actual humanity of Christ is emphasized by the phrase ‘he was born in human likeness.’ The process of self-empty is not a mere façade of humanity, but an acceptance of actual humanity.⁴⁴ The humility in this process of self-emptying is seen in the fact that Christ not only condescends to become human, but accepts the ‘form of a slave’. The phrase ‘taking the form of a slave’ resonates with the episode of Jesus washing the feet of his disciples. It shows that self-emptying had as its ultimate goal the

³⁹ WILLIAMS, DAVID T. *Have This Mind – following the example of Christ*, iUniverse: New York, 2007, p. xi.

⁴⁰ GORMAN, MICHAEL J. *Apostle of the Crucifix Lord - A Theological Introduction to Paul his Letters*, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company: Michigan, 2004, p. 436.

⁴¹ VINCENT, MARVIN R. *ICC – The Epistles to Philippians and Philemon*, T&T Clark: Edinburg, 1906, p. 59. (ee)

⁴² What was emptied? This question has been the topic of many debates and has been explained by various theologians down the centuries. While the text will speak of emptying Himself of His ‘equality with God’, there are various other explanations to this word and they will be presented in detail in the next chapter where we shall deal with the understanding of the kenosis in the Christian tradition.

⁴³ The word ‘emptying’ or ‘taking on the form of a slave’ does not mean an annihilation or exchange. Christ was in the form of God and thus divinity cannot be relinquished (Cf. KENT, HOMER A. Jr., *EBC – Ephesians through Philemon - Vol. 11*, Zondervan: Michigan, 1981, p. 123. (ee)) Servanthood was added to Lordship and humanity was later added to the deity. (Cf. MELICK, RICHARD R., *NAC...*, p. 104.)

⁴⁴ Cf. BARCLAY, WILLIAM. *The Letters to the Philippians, Colossians and Thessalonians - NDSB*, Westminster John Knox Press London, 1975, p. 43 (Rv. Ed.) (ee)

revelation of God's universal love and service.⁴⁵ These verses indicate a movement wherein an attitude has not remained in a theoretical realm, but has translated into action.⁴⁶ Extolling the humility of Christ, Gregory of Nyssa would say:

What is more humble than the King of all creation entering into communion with our poor nature? The King of kings and Lord of lords clothes himself with the form of our enslavement; the Judge of the universe comes to pay tribute to the princes of this world; the Lord of creation is born in a cave; he who encompasses the world cannot find room in the inn [...]; the pure and incorrupt one puts on the filthiness of our nature and experiences all our needs, experiences even death itself" (*Oratio I in beatitudinibus*).

Verse 8 – 'And being found in human form, he humbled himself and became obedient to the point of death – even death on a cross'. The three points we shall highlight in this verse include the fact that 'he humbled himself', 'was obedient' and the word 'even' which is used to describe the kind of death that He underwent. The words 'humbled himself' emphasizes that Christ engaged in a deliberate act.⁴⁷ As a human person he did not strive for what others desired, but his whole life was characterized by 'self-surrender, self-renunciation and self-sacrifice'.⁴⁸ The process of humility was in two stages and these included the Incarnation and death on the cross – both of which had salvific value. The death on the cross was the climax of the redemptive work of Christ.⁴⁹ The three stanzas in verses seven and eight offer us a dramatic depiction of the descent of Christ from the highest point to the lowest.

The obedience of Christ reveals His humility. Thomas Aquinas in his commentary on the letter to the Philippians said that in Christ the sign of humility is obedience.⁵⁰

⁴⁵ Cf. HAWTHORNE, GERALD F. *WBC-Philippians - Vol.43,...*, p. 119.

⁴⁶ Two verbs 'made himself' and 'humbled himself' indicate this movement. (Cf. MELICK, RICHARD R., *NAC...*, p. 103)

⁴⁷ Cf. VINCENT, MARVIN R. *ICC ...*, p. 60

⁴⁸ Cf. HAWTHORNE, GERALD F. *WBC-Philippians - Vol.43...*, p. 122.)

⁴⁹ This is a point of debate with some authors presenting the cross as the climax of Christ's humble self-emptying. Gregory of Nyssa would go on to say that '*he did not experience death due to the fact of being born; rather, he took birth upon himself in order to die*' (*Oratio catechetica magna*, 32). However others would highlight the Incarnation as being a moment of greater importance and suggest that the moment of Incarnation was more humiliating than the death on the cross. (Cf. BALTHASAR, HANS URS VON. *MP*, (Nichols, Aidan Tr.), Ignatius Press: San Francisco, 1981, pp. 25-26.)

⁵⁰ '*The manner and the sign of His humility is obedience, whereas it is characteristic of the proud to follow their own will, for a proud person seeks greatness. But it pertains to a great thing that it not be ruled by something else, but that it rule other things; therefore, obedience is contrary to pride. Hence, in order to show the greatness of Christ's humility and passion, he says that He*

His obedience was active and he made the will of the Father his own. He was not obliged to be obedient, but freely accepted to be obedient as a slave.⁵¹ Through a voluntary submission, Christ identified Himself to all humanity. In this manner he set himself to serve God and humankind. Finally the word 'even' indicates the totality and extent of Jesus' self-emptying. It was the ultimate form of human degradation and the lowest point of the descent.⁵² The fact that Jesus chose the cross even at the cost of his life revealed the degree of His self-emptying love – a choice which would have a profound impact on the community at Philippi.⁵³ These verses reminded the community of the mystery of salvation. They would not fully comprehend the meaning of this event, but would realize that in the descent of Christ who accepted death on the Cross we have the manifestation of the great mystery of love – a mystery which cannot fully be expressed in words and cannot be understood by the mind.⁵⁴

Let us now end by indicating the ethical debate that the kenotic hymn provokes. Some prefer to see in this hymn an invitation to ethical conduct wherein Christ's self-emptying, humility and obedience is the norm for individual and communitarian behavior. However there are others who would see this hymn within a soteriological setting. Those who advocate a soteriological perspective highlight the phrase 'in Christ Jesus' (v. 5). Accordingly a Christian is solemnly reminded that through baptism they are sharing a new life in Christ and thus belong to a new existence. The context within which the invitation is made, i.e. 'to have the mind of Christ', leads one to interpret this text as indicating a unique form of behavior. However the meaning of this text is not restricted to a specific behavior or attitude, but points towards a larger soteriological

became obedient; because if He had not suffered out of obedience, His passion would not be so commendable, for obedience gives merit to our sufferings. (Last accessed on 13/05/2015 - <http://dhspriority.org/thomas/SSPhilippians.htm#22>.)

⁵¹ VV.AA, *The Navarre Bible – St. Paul's Captivity Letters*, (Tr. Gavigan, James – McCarthy, Brian – McGovern, Thomas), Four Courts Press: Dublin, 2003, p. 104. (ee)

⁵² This phrase indicates that Christ was obedient to God unto death. At the same time he was obedient to the wishes of the people too. As a slave he set himself to serve not only God but also humankind's longing to be to be free from sin and death. '*Christ's acceptance of death, therefore, was his ultimate yes to God and humanity, his ultimate act of obedience to God in his self-giving service to people.*' (Cf. HAWTHORNE, GERALD F. *WBC-Philippians - Vol.43,...*, pp. 122-23.)

⁵³ Cf. MELICK, RICHARD R. *NAC...*, p. 105.

⁵⁴ Cf. BARCLAY, WILLIAM. *The Letters to Philippians, Colossians, and Thessalonians...*, p. 45.

context.⁵⁵ Going beyond the debate we can say that the text indicates that Jesus' life was an ongoing kenosis. He totally emptied Himself for all who were in need by choosing that which was in harmony with God's will. Each choice was a deliberate decision to engage in humble service and was kenotic in nature. This continuous kenosis wherein Christ limited Himself was rooted in love and Divine freedom.⁵⁶

1.3.2 HUMILITY IN OTHER EPISTLES

Besides the kenotic hymn in the letter to the Philippians, there are other texts in the letters of Paul, Peter and John which refer to humility and the Divine Kenosis. In this section we shall elaborate the texts from Paul's letter to the Romans (*Rom. 8,3*) as well as his second letter to the Corinthians (*2 Cor. 8,9*). This will be followed by a text from the first letter of Peter (*1 Pet. 2,18-25*) and the first letter of John (*1 Jn. 4,9*). We shall end with some concluding remarks.

Romans 8,3 - The phrase '*God...by sending his own Son in the likeness of sinful flesh ...condemned sin in the flesh*' is similar to the Kenosis hymn in the letter to the Philippians⁵⁷ and is placed in the context of an invitation to live a life in the Spirit. A life in the Spirit is contrasted against a life in the flesh. After explaining the freedom wrought through a life in the Spirit, Paul speaks about other consequences of a life lived in accordance with the Spirit as against a life led in accordance with the flesh. (*Rom 8, 5-7*) The use of the word '*own Son*' refers to the unique bond of love between the Father

⁵⁵ This debate has been highlighted by various authors. We would like to limit ourselves to two authors Ralph P. Martin and David T. Williams. Ralph in his book *Carmen Christi* has an appendix on the ethical interpretation of Philippians 2,5. He presents the arguments of W. P. de Boer, E. Käesmann and Evin Larsson. The arguments he presents lead one to see this as an ethical text but within a larger soteriological setting. David on the other hand is more inclined towards correct ethical behavior wherein '*conformity and imitation of Christ is the fundamental principal*'. (Cf. MARTIN, RALPH P. *Carmen Christi Philippians 2:5-11 – In Recent Interpretation and in the Setting of Early Christian Worship*, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company: Michigan, 1983, pp. 22, 84-88. (Rv. Ed.))

⁵⁶ Cf. WILLIAMS, DAVID T. *Have This Mind...*, pp. 17-38.

⁵⁷ The text is consonant with the earlier text 'being made in human likeness' (*Phil 2,7*) as seen in the letter to the Philippians. The pre-existence of the Son is implied and the doctrinal position is in keeping with the early Christological formulations. (Cf. HARRISON, EVERETT F. *Romans through Galatians – EBC*, Zondervan Publishing House: Grand Rapids, 1976, p. 87. (ee))

and the Son and the divine origin of the task that the Divine Kenosis entailed.⁵⁸

The purpose of the 'sending' the Son 'in the likeness of sinful man'⁵⁹ was in the context of human struggle. The law had failed not because it was faulty but because the human person was incapable of fulfilling it without the gift of the Spirit.⁶⁰ Paul highlights the fact that love was the fulfillment of the law and only a humble acknowledge of one's radical incapacity to live a life in the Spirit would allow one to be open to new life. Only the power of the Spirit could transform the person in order to live as children of God. (*Rom 8, 14-16*)

2 Corinthians 8,9 - Paul in this letter speaks of the Kenosis of Christ when he says that '*...our Lord Jesus Christ, that though he was rich, yet for your sake he became poor, so that by his poverty you might become rich.*' This text refers to the Kenosis because it implies the pre-existent state of the Son as well as the Incarnation. It refers to the fact that Christ gave up His royal status and accepted one of a slave. Along with his pre-existent state, it also refers to His pre-existent choice where he chose to give up His divine state and became poor by accepting the fragility and vicissitudes of human nature.⁶¹

The Corinthians were invited to contribute generously⁶² and help the poor in

⁵⁸ FITZMYER, JOSEPH A. *Romans: A New Translation with Introduction and Commentary* – AYBC, Yale University Press: London, 1993, p. 484. (ee)

⁵⁹ Everett points out that Paul avoids using the word 'sinful flesh' to preserve the sinlessness of the Son and also avoids 'in the likeness of flesh' to avoid denying the reality of the humanity of Christ. (Cf. HARRISON, EVERETT F. *Romans through Galatians...*, p. 87.)

⁶⁰ The law was flawless because it was a revelation from God. However the human person did not have the strength to fulfill it. '*The self-satisfied man will minimize the law's demands by magnifying his own achievement, whereas the conscientious man will end up in despair. ... Paul pictures the requirement of the law as fulfilled (passive) in the believer, not by him, as though to remind him that the redeemed person does not possess spiritual power he can control and utilize on his own. Rather, the Spirit is always channeling that power and never releases it to those he dwells in for them to use independently of him. The power resides in the Spirit, not in the one he indwells.*' (Cf. IBID., pp. 87-88.)

⁶¹ Cf. HARRIS, MURRAY J. *The Second Epistle to the Corinthians: A Commentary on the Greek text*, W. B. Eerdmans Pub. Co.: Michigan, 2005, p. 579. (ee)

⁶² The eighth chapter is dedicated to the collection project for the poor in Jerusalem. Paul reminds the Corinthians of the generosity of the Macedonians who were facing extreme poverty. Despite their weaker economic situation, they contributed towards the collection being made for the poor in Jerusalem. '*Rather than acting like a dictator and removing the elements of free choice and warm spontaneity from contributors to the collection, Paul preferred to use "friendly emulation" as a means of arousing the Corinthians to action and assessing the genuineness of their love.*' HARRIS, MURRAY J. *The Second Epistle to the Corinthians...*, p. 576.

Jerusalem⁶³ by recalling the Kenosis of Christ as well as the generosity of the Macedonians. The Corinthians had known the Macedonian community and were better off than them. Paul begins by presenting the self-giving generosity⁶⁴ of the Macedonians and then moves on the 'archetypal example presented by the 'gracious act' of the Lord Jesus Christ himself, here expressed in the language of self-impoverishment.'⁶⁵ The knowledge that Christ voluntarily gave Himself for the benefit of others is ultimately the defining reason to be generous towards others.

1 Peter 2, 18-25 - Peter uses the words from Isaiah's fourth song of the Suffering Servant (*Is 53,7-9*) in order to exhort the faithful. This letter was written in the background of a society where slavery was an integral part. The issue of master-slave relations was integral to any household management and the letter tries to address this issue from a Christian point of view. He urges all to respect authority and in this context asks slaves to accept the authority of their masters.⁶⁶

The Kenosis of Christ who despite being Divine took the form of a slave is presented as a model for the slaves to emulate.⁶⁷ In elaborating the self-emptying of

⁶³ The argument of Paul before the Corinthians is not they ought to contribute more because they are better off compared to the Macedonians. Rather he reminds them of how they have been enriched in Christ and in keeping with this spiritual enrichment, they are asked to contribute in a manner corresponding to their new spiritual status. The argument is therefore primarily spiritual and not economical. 'Paul is not presenting Christ's act of grace as an example for the Corinthians to emulate. If that were the case he ought to urge them to become "poor" for the sake of others as Christ did, but this he specifically does not ask them to do... (However) the emphasis falls much more on the salvation (the riches) with which the Corinthians have been enriched by Christ. The admonition implicit in this statement is not "Do what Christ did," or even "Do for others what Christ has done for you." It is, rather, "Do what is appropriate to your status as those who have been enriched by the grace of Christ." (Cf. FURNISH, VICTOR P. *II Corinthians: translated with introduction, notes, and commentary* – AYBC, Yale University Press: London, 2008, p. 418. (ee))

⁶⁴ The Macedonians were materially poor and gave generously from the little they had. However their self-giving was what manifested their enthusiasm and this attitude is what Paul indicates to the Corinthians. They put themselves totally at the disposal of Christ and the apostle. '...This self-giving will (was) demonstrated in the complete enthusiasm with which the Macedonians responded to the collection project. It was self-giving to the Lord because the care for one's fellow Christians exemplified in the collection is care for other members of Christ's body. And it was self-giving to Paul because he was the initiator and organizer of the project.' (Cf. THRALL, MARGARET E. *A critical and exegetical commentary on the Second Epistle of the Corinthians* - ICC, T & T Clark International: London, 2004, pp. 526–527. (ee))

⁶⁵ *IBID.*, p. 532.

⁶⁶ ELLIOTT, JOHN H. *1 Peter: a New Translation with Introduction and Commentary* - AYBC, Yale University Press: London, 2008, pp. 513-15. (ee)

⁶⁷ *IBID.*, pp. 529. 'The Isaian portrait of the innocent suffering servant of God provides our author with a model for describing

Christ he underlines the salvific nature of innocent suffering.⁶⁸ Peter uses the Divine Kenosis in order to humanize this relationship.⁶⁹ New Testament writers were not social revolutionaries and advocated a transformation (not elimination) of this social relationship based on the model of Christ who in the Divine Kenosis humbly accepted the condition of a slave.⁷⁰

The text presents the Christological motivation for a slave for being docile, submissive and respectful towards his master.⁷¹ The suffering of Christ as revealed in the Divine Kenosis is highlighted in order to relate it to the suffering of the slaves. Given the fact that slaves had to undergo various kinds of unjust suffering, the vicarious character of Christ's suffering and death is emphasized by Peter.⁷² The advice given to slaves who were invited to understand their own humility and suffering in the context of the Divine Kenosis was also an advice to the wider community of believers.⁷³

1 John 4, 9-10 - The first letter of John situates the Divine Kenosis in the context of God as love. John makes reference to the fact that God loved us first and this love consisted in sending His Son. In the two verses we have two references to the word 'sent'. '*....God's love was revealed among us in this way: God sent his only Son into the world*

Jesus Christ as a similar innocent suffering servant of God who, in turn, serves as an apposite model for innocently suffering servants/slaves.'

⁶⁸ IBID., pp. 523-24. '*The concept of dying on behalf of others, especially one's comrades, was not unknown to Greeks and Romans. However, the emphasis here on the vicarious character of Christ's suffering and death reflects a broad current of early Christological and soteriological Christian tradition that has its nearest roots in antecedent Israelite thought concerning the atoning power of virtuous conduct, suffering, and death.'*

⁶⁹ Cf. IBID., p. 516.

⁷⁰ The New Testament writers were not revolutionaries in the strict sense. They did not wanted to change social structures and transform society as understood today. '*Their concern was the relationship of individuals to God, and they focused on the sin and rebellion of individuals against their Creator. New Testament writers therefore concentrated instead on the godly response of believers to mistreatment. ...concentrated on the godly response of believers to mistreatment. Peter fits this paradigm nicely, for he admonished his readers to respond in a godly way to persecution and oppression.'* (Cf. SCHREINER, THOMAS R. 1, 2 Peter, Jude – NAC, Broadman & Holman Publishers: Nashville, 2003, p. 136. (ee))

⁷¹ Cf. ELLIOTT, JOHN H. 1 Peter: a New Translation with Introduction and Commentary..., pp. 522-23.

⁷² Suffering slaves are invited to bear their sufferings because Christ suffered for us. Elliott points out that the Kenosis in this text highlights the suffering of Christ as against His death which was the more common formulation. (Cf. IBID., pp. 524-25.)

⁷³ Cf. SCHREINER, THOMAS R. 1, 2 Peter, Jude – NAC..., pp. 138-39. '*It should also be noted that the injunction given to slaves becomes a model by which believers should respond to injustice, and hence what is said here is not applicable only to slaves. The use of the word "one" also indicates that the instructions relate to believers in their various situations.'*

so that we might live through him. In this is love, not that we loved God but that he loved us and sent his Son to be the atoning sacrifice for our sins.' The revelation of God's love is Christological in nature and these verses further explain the context of this love.⁷⁴

The Divine Kenosis in this text of John is within the general framework of God's revelation of love and an invitation to mutual love.⁷⁵ Christ through the Kenosis, self-discloses God's nature to us.⁷⁶ In elaborating the revelation of God's love in Christ John makes two points: a) God's love initiated the plan of salvation and b) this plan was fulfilled in God sending His Son to the world.⁷⁷ The essence of love does not consist primarily in man's love for God, but God's love for man. The divine-human relationship consists in the primacy and initiative of God's love. The believer is invited to accept this love in all humility and relate to others in the same manner.

The essence of love is not man's love for God, however lasting, but God's eternal love for man, which was embodied and expressed in Jesus at one particular *moment* of history. It is important to notice what John is saying in the negative clause. He does not say that we have *not* loved God. On the contrary, he claims, we *have* loved God; but "this is not love to call love". Human love,... has its ultimate origin in the love of God, of which our love is intrinsically a reflection, and to which it is necessarily a response.⁷⁸

The epistles of John make explicit reference to the fact that Jesus was 'sent' by the Father. Other epistles do not speak of the Father as one who sends the Son.⁷⁹ In the Son we experience the Father's life and love. The purpose of sending the Son is that we may have the fullness of life. This point is stressed in this text where it is pointed out that the Son has been sent into the world 'so that we might live through him.' (1 Jn 4,9) The Son

⁷⁴ Cf. BROWN, RAYMOND. E. *The Epistles of John: Translated, with Introduction, notes, and commentary* - AYBC, Yale University Press: London, 2008, p. 518. (ee)

⁷⁵ In keeping with Brooke Westcott explanation (WESTCOTT, BROOKE. *The Epistles of John*, p. 148), Smalley states that verse 9 describes the *manifestation* of love seen in its fact and in its end while verse 10 is a representation of love's *essence*. The essence and expression are 'inextricably related, and both are present in v9 just as much as in v10. Both also form the basis of John's appeal for mutual love in v 11.' (Cf. SMALLEY, STEPHEN S. *1, 2, 3 John* - WBC, Word Incorporated: Dallas, 1989, p. 243. (ee))

⁷⁶ IBID., p. 240. 'John now demonstrates that the character of God as love is determined and understood by his self-disclosure in Jesus the Son. In so doing he explains more fully his statement that "God is love,"...'

⁷⁷ Cf. SMALLEY, STEPHEN S. *1, 2, 3 John*..., p. 241.

⁷⁸ IBID., p. 243.

⁷⁹ Cf. BROWN, RAYMOND. E. *The Epistles of John*..., p. 517.

was sent to a 'world' which is neutral in itself. It is where mankind lives and God works.⁸⁰ It is in this world that the Kenosis of Christ has revealed love as the true nature of God. This has 'been shown in a way which men can understand and appreciate. In the fact and the purpose of the Incarnation, God gave His best, that men might be enabled to live the life of God.'⁸¹

The four texts indicate that the early Christian communities looked upon the Kenosis of Christ as the model for a new mode of existing and relating. An experiential knowledge of the humility of Christ led to a life of obedience and generosity. The mystery of God's love as revealed in the Divine Kenosis helped the first Christians and nascent communities live a transformed life in the Spirit and thus experience the fullness of life. The various epistles are an expression of the radical transformation wrought through an experience of God's love – a love revealed by the humility of Christ in the Divine Kenosis. The Divine Kenosis inverted the scale of values that they were accustomed to and thus leading them to understand the salvific value of humility and self-emptying love. Despite enormous difficulties and persecutions, the kenotic life of humble love that characterized the early Christian communities was the catalyst in monumental and historic transformations.

CONCLUSION

This chapter has tried to show how the humility of Christ reveals the self-emptying love of God from a biblical perspective. In Christ, humility which was considered abhorring was converted into an empowering and salvific reality. Individuals and communities, who had experienced the glory and gratuitous love of God in the humility of Christ, desired to live by the same attitude. The credibility of Christian life was seen in the imitation of Christ by a life of humble love and service.

The continuing experience of the mystery of God's love in the Divine Kenosis

⁸⁰ Cf. SMALLEY, STEPHEN S. *1, 2, 3 John...*, p. 242.

⁸¹ BROOKE, A. E. *A Critical and Exegetical Commentary on the Johannine Epistles - ICC*, C. Scribner's Sons: New York, 1919, p. 119. (ee)

leads to an ongoing personal kenosis whereby the person progressively grew out of one's self-love, self-will and self-interest. This was not an automatic process, but one which involved the free will and concrete choices. Each individual or group lived this process by being open to the Spirit in the context of its own unique charism, cultural peculiarity, temperament and historical reality.

In the present chapter we have laid the biblical foundation in order to better understand the meaning of humility as well as the inspiration to move from self-love to self-emptying love. An experience of God's self-emptying love as revealed in the humility of Christ is the base on which the spiritual process proposed by the Society of Jesus can be built. Without this biblical foundation, the spiritual process runs the serious risk of degenerating into a self-seeking enterprise with little value in terms of participating in the process of building the Kingdom of God.

The following chapter presents the Divine Kenosis as reflected within the Christian tradition from the apostolic period until the present time. While the fundamental contours were defined by the Council of Chalcedon in 451, the humility of Christ continues to illumine our understanding. Keeping in mind the scope of this work we would limit ourselves to exploring some authors of the early Church, the kenotic theories of the 18th and 19th century and some contemporary authors.

CHAPTER 2

HISTORICAL UNDERSTANDING OF THE DIVINE KENOSIS

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

The self-emptying of Christ took place within a Judaic setting. However in a short time it would extend to the Greco-Roman world and this interaction would lead to a sustained process of doctrinal development – a process which would last nearly five centuries. Finally the Council at Chalcedon (451) would lay down the boundaries for doctrinal orthodoxy¹ and these boundaries have continued to guide the interpretation of the Divine Kenosis up to the 20th century. While the fundamental interpretation has remained constant, it must be noted that historical realities have influenced the interpretation in varying degrees.

The doctrinal interpretation of Chalcedon provided the necessary theological foundation during the Patristic period and middle ages. With the advent of modernity, there emerged a new world-view which would call into attention the traditional understanding of the Divine Kenosis. Further on, the emerging historical consciousness and critical studies on the Bible influenced the understanding of God and the person of

¹ EVANS, STEPHEN C. "Introduction: Understanding Jesus the Christ as Human and Divine", *Exploring Kenotic Christology – The Self-Emptying of God*, (Ed. Evans, Stephen C.) Regent College Publishing: Vancouver, 2006, p. 1.

Jesus Christ.² This in turn would lead to the emergence of the Kenotic Theory during the 19th century. Though the Kenotic Theory did not take roots in mainstream theology, some of its fundamental elements would go on to influence major theological trends of the 20th century. The Divine Kenosis based on a kenotic Christology is today a subject of reflection because it responds to the profound questions raised by the Christian faith in the context of contemporary realities.

Despite its importance in understanding the central tenets of the Christian faith, it must be admitted that there have been contentious issues. From the earliest times, the possibility of conceiving Jesus Christ as God and man has been a struggle.³ With the emergence of modernity and the historical-critical method, the process of reconciling the Jesus of history with the Christ of faith became an arduous process.⁴ It was during this period that the 'kenotic theory' was proposed. However it failed because of the inability of its proponents to explain adequately the '*communicatio idiomatum*' and the self-limitation of God.⁵ They failed to address the issue related to the continued presence of divine attributes in Christ such as omnipotence, omniscience and omnipresence in the face of Biblical studies which indicated that the man Jesus progressively grew in wisdom, age and grace.

After highlighting the biblical foundations of the Divine Kenosis in the previous chapter, this chapter aims to show the doctrinal development related to the Divine Kenosis. This will be done by presenting the theological position of significant persons of the first four centuries, proponents of the kenotic theory during the 18th and 19th centuries and finally some eminent theologians of the 20th century.

These theological positions related to the self-emptying of Jesus Christ who was fully divine and fully human would offer us a greater understanding of the mystery of God and of the human person. The concrete humility of Jesus Christ as manifesting the

² Cf. DAWE, DONALD, *The Form...*, pp. 86-88.

³ Cf. IBID, p. 10.

⁴ GERBER, UWE. "Kenosis", *The Encyclopedia of Christianity – Vol. III*, (Eds. Fahlbusch, Erwin & others), William B. Eerdmans: Michigan, 2003, p. 111. (ee)

⁵ Cf. DAANE J. "Kenosis", *ISBE – Vol. III*, (Ed. Bromiley, Geoffrey), William B. Eerdmans: Michigan, 1986, p. 8. (ee)

being of God would be critical in having a glimpse of the infinite nature of God's self-emptying love. At the same time, the humble and total self-emptying of Jesus as a human person will reveal to us the mystery of the human person's capacity to freely respond to God by emptying oneself for the sake of others.

2.1 DOCTRINAL DEVELOPMENTS REGARDING KENOSIS UNTIL CHALCEDON

After the preceding introductory section we shall now have a brief glimpse of the historical development of the Divine Kenosis until the Council of Chalcedon in 451. We shall divide this period into three parts which include the pre-Nicene period the Nicene period and the post-Nicene period. In keeping with the limits of our work we shall focus on different theologians in so far as they interpreted the Divine Kenosis – i.e. their understanding of the humility of Christ as a revelation of God's self-emptying love.

2.1.1 INTRODUCTION

2.1.1.1 The Initial Phase

The community in the New Testament which emerged after the Resurrection reflected back on the person of Jesus Christ. They remembered him as a man who went about doing good, was persecuted by the authorities and was finally killed on the cross. They looked back and vividly remembered the historical Jesus. However this experience had to be integrated with the experience of Jesus as the Christ – the divine Son of God. The various gospels and the letters try to express this faith-experience wherein Jesus Christ was experienced as fully human and fully divine. Though some later expressions of the faith would tend towards an exaggeration vis-à-vis the divinity or humanity of Christ leading to heresies, the New Testament authors were very particular about indicating that the self-emptying of God took place in the historical person of Jesus Christ.⁶

The process of developing the concept of the Divine Kenosis during the new-testament period was not easy. This was primarily because of the fact that this first phase of doctrinal development took place within a strictly Judaic setting. The

⁶ Cf. FEE, GORDON D. "The New Testament and Kenosis Christology", *Exploring Kenotic Christology...*, p. 29.

understanding that a human person could be totally divine did not enter into the Jewish world view. Much less were they able to accept the fact that God could empty Himself and take on suffering and humiliation. This happened despite the fact that the means of salvation had been alluded to by Scripture. The task of faithfully taking forward the foundational experience passed on from the immediate apostles of Jesus Christ to the Apostolic Fathers who had been in contact with the apostles.

2.1.1.2 The Apostolic Fathers

These Apostolic Fathers had to contend with various religious, cultural and historical influences. Through their writings, they tried to emphasize the fact that the glorified and risen Lord was indeed the Suffering Servant who was born of a woman and died on the Cross. The divinity of Christ and His union with the Father was highlighted. It was also pointed out that the same divine and pre-existing Christ became human and the historical events were totally true in nature. Prominent among the authors was St. Ignatius of Antioch who in his letter to Polycarp said:

Look for Christ, the Son of God; who was before time, yet appeared in time; who was invisible by nature, yet visible in the flesh; who was impalpable, and could not be touched, as being without a body, but for our sakes became such, might be touched and handled in the body; who was impassible as God, but became passible for our sakes as man; and who in every kind of way suffered for our sakes.⁷

St. Ignatius' letter to the Philippians deals with the unity of the Trinity and then speaks of the historical fact that the second person became a human person who was born, lived, died on the cross and has risen. The insistence that God indeed engaged in a process of self-emptying, was humiliated and died on the cross was an inspiration for the Christians who had to face persecution by various Roman emperors.

2.1.1.3 Doctrinal challenges during the Pre-Nicene period

During the pre-Nicene period, the leading figures of the Church had to face various

⁷ ANF-CE1, "The Epistle of Ignatius to Polycarp", p. 94. (All quotes of the Fathers of the Church, i.e. in section 2.1, have been taken from the digital library of Patristic writings as seen in www.logos.com. When any other source has been used, it has been indicated. The sequence consists in the volume, followed by the text and finally the page number.)

challenges. Besides the physical persecutions by the Roman emperors, there were also other doctrinal challenges. These systems included those related to the Essenes, Stoicism, Platonism, Neo-Platonism and Gnosticism.

The *Essenes*⁸ believed that the goal of life was a return to a primordial state of Adam.⁹ They had no private property and the resources were divided according to the needs of the members of the community.¹⁰ The lives of the Essenes had some similarities with the first Christian community. Primary among this was the sharing of resources. (*Acts. 4,32*) They also believed in a radical nature of discipleship, the importance of hospitality, believed in the resurrection, the struggle between darkness and light and trusted in the providence of God. While there were similarities, important differences prevailed – e.g. the inclusiveness of Christianity as against the exclusive nature of Essenes.¹¹

The influence of *Stoicism* was greater than the Essenes. Christianity would be strongly influenced by the ethical and cosmological unity of the Stoics. They believed that the entire cosmos was guided by the ‘logos’ or divine reason and that all reality was led by a divine design.¹² All creation emerged from the undying fire *pneuma*.¹³ The understanding of God within the Stoic perspective was different from a personal God

⁸ The Essenes were members of a Jewish sect which flourished from the 2nd century BCE until 70 CE. Important writers who speak about them include Philo, Josephus and Pliny. They believed that the human person was in a state of conflict and the soul which was immortal was imprisoned in the body

⁹ They were preoccupied with purity and through a process of ritual purifications and faithfulness to the promptings of the good spirit would prepare themselves for the final victory of the truth over evil. They had a deterministic theology where all was left in God’s hands.

¹⁰ JOSEPHUS, F. *The works of Josephus: complete and unabridged*, (Tr. Whiston, W.), Hendrickson Publishers: Massachusetts, 1987. (ee) (There is no pagination in this electronic version. The concerned reference can be found in the book *The War of the Jews*, Bk. 2, Ch. 8, no. 3.)

¹¹ Cf. BUCHANAN, G.W. “Essenes”, *ISBE...*, pp. 153-55.

¹² Cf. TOBIN, THOMAS H. “Logos”, *AYBD - Vol. 4*, (Ed. Freedman, D. N. Freedman), Doubleday: New York, 1996, p. 349. The Stoics believed in the interchangeability of the logos, God and nature. ‘...For the Stoics, logos, God, and nature were in reality one. Logos was the rational element that pervades the controls all of the universe. Logos was the active element (to poion) of reality while matter without quality was the passive element (to paschon). For the Stoics, however, both these elements were ultimately material. Logos was identified with fire (and a blend of fire and air, which they referred to as breath or spirit (pneuma). The passive element was identified with earth and water.’

¹³ Through the condensation of this fire, the *logoi spermatakoii* emerged. Later on the reverse process took place and this led to annihilation of all once again into the undying fire.

who is involved in the world as seen in the Biblical experience. Although there were some personal references vis-à-vis Zeus, it generally tended towards monotheistic pantheism where the divine was a creative power.¹⁴

The interaction with *Platonism* strongly influenced the development of Christian doctrine during the Patristic period.¹⁵ In Platonism the concept of god was within the schema of the world of intelligence and sense-perception.¹⁶ Perfection was therefore related to an unchanging nature, and 'god is perfect and as good as possible and remains in his own form without variation forever.' (*Republic*, 381) Order and beauty of the universe can be credited to 'the handiwork of a divine Craftsman who, imitating an unchanging and eternal model, imposes mathematical order on a preexistent chaos to generate the ordered universe.'¹⁷ This concept of the unchangeability of God influenced the development of Christian doctrine. The Fathers of the Church would try to explain the Christ event within these categories during the centuries to come. God who became incarnate in Jesus Christ was the same unchangeable god alluded by various philosophical schools of the Greco-Roman world.

While speaking of Platonism, it would also be important to refer to the influence of *Neo-Platonism*.¹⁸ Plotinus built upon the philosophy of Plato and accordingly

¹⁴ SCHMELLER, T. "Stoicism", *AYBD* - Vol. 6, p. 211. 'The world thus represents a uniformly structured physical form, which is imbued with and created by a reasonable power, the logos. This creative force is identified with God. ...The divine logos is as shown, both physical and spiritual. It does not stand transcendent outside of the material world, but imbues and deifies it, although in differing degrees of purity. ...Monotheistic pantheism led the Stoics also to acknowledge the cosmos and parts of it (e.g., the planets) as gods (in the sense of manifestations of the one deity). ...Although the divine logos is partly described as an artist endowed with reason, the Stoic view of God is not a personalized one.'

¹⁵ The core of this philosophy was the division between the world of images and the world of ideas. Between these two worlds we have the soul which is part of this world of images, but which belongs to the world of ideas. It was through a contemplation of the world of images, that one is awakened to one's true existence at an earlier period. Thus through a process of assimilation one attains the primordial unity that had been lost at an earlier moment.

¹⁶ DILLON, J. M. "Platonism", *AYBD* Vol. 5, p. 379. God belongs to the intelligible world where '...the Ideas—transcendent models, mathematical in form, of which the things of this world are images ...constitute the contents of the Divine Mind. (Here), all is eternal, unchanging, (and) perfect. Its first principles are the Monad (God/Intellect), and the Dyad, a principle of plurality, on which the Monad acts to produce first the Ideas and the World-Soul, and then the physical world.'

¹⁷ <http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/plato-timaeus/#7>

¹⁸ The founder of this school was Plotinus who was a Monist and an important element in his system was the One and how all of reality is an emanation from the One.

organized his thought.¹⁹ He organized the three principles of Plato, the One – Mind or Spirit – and Soul into a descending triad.²⁰ Once again it is obvious that the concept of God was defined by philosophical categories, where an important component would include the attribute of unchangeability. This was the reason why the Divine Kenosis that God emptied Himself and became fully human was not easily understandable to the Hellenistic world.

Gnosticism was a system which strongly influenced Christianity during the first few centuries.²¹ It believed that a person was saved through true knowledge which was the domain of a select few.²² Their basic cosmogony believed that all reality emanated from an undefined Infinite Something which was pure spirit and not personal in nature. Matter was a deprivation of pure spirit.²³ The end of Gnosis was *metanoia*/repentance, by which there would be an undoing of sin/matter, returning one to the original spiritual state.²⁴

The idea of the gnostic savior had its roots in the Jewish idea of a Messiah and the Messianic hope.²⁵ The concept of God in Gnosticism was different from Christianity because the Gnostics believed that 'God is the ultimate, nameless, unknowable being

¹⁹ MEREDITH, ANTHONY. 'Plotinus', *The Study of Spirituality*, (Ed. Jones, Cheslyn - Wainwright, Geoffrey - Yarnold, Edward), SPCK: London, 1992, p. 98. 'This reality on the one hand transcends both the world of sense and that of form and intellect. It is also beyond being.'

²⁰ The supreme reality or the One was a static reality which is formless and infinite. However the Mind or Spirit as well as the Soul are dynamic realities. They are closely related to each other, yet at the same time they are eternally distinct. He does not believe that the Soul is really fallen, and proposes a five stage process in order to return to the true nobility of the Soul.

²¹ RENWICK, A. M. "Gnosticism", *ISBE, Revised Vol. 2*, (Ed. Bromiley, G. W.), Eerdmans: Michigan, 2002, p. 484. (ee) 'It appeared during the early years of the Church (and) ...became so widespread that by the beginning of the 3rd century A.D. most of the intellectual Christian congregations throughout the Roman empire were to some degree infected by it.'

²² Through their knowledge they believed that they became a superior class. It was presumed that through this knowledge they would be able to overcome the grossness of matter (which was a deprivation of the Deity) and return to the Parent-Spirit.

²³ From this Infinite Something there emerged a number of pure spirit forces (*Æons*) and these were classified differently by different systems. This collection of emanated spirits and the Infinite Something formed the *pleroma*. One of these forces (*Æons*), Sophia caused the emergence of matter.

²⁴ In order to help an individual to return to the *pleroma*, there is an emanation from the good god who would send a savior to show the individual the way back.

²⁵ Jesus and the Holy Spirit were two *Æons* who had been created at the command of the Father (according to Valentinianism). The gnostic savior is thus an *æon* and only had the appearance of a human being.

called the “Abyss.” He is perfect, but the material world is alien to the divine nature.’²⁶ This was in contrast with the Christian belief that ‘the worlds were prepared by the word of God, so that what is seen was made from things that are not visible’ (*Heb. 11,3*). The danger of Gnosticism was noticed by the Apostolic Church²⁷ because of its apparent similarities to the Christian faith. The use of Christian categories and Greek words were a mere façade to cover up a doctrine which was opposed to Christianity on many of its fundamental points.²⁸

The Fathers of the Church made efforts in order to define the doctrinal formulations which rightly expressed the faith of the Christian community. They maintained that God in God’s love engaged in a process of self-emptying, humbled Himself, became human and went through a life of poverty and humiliations. This self-emptying which began with the Incarnation, founds its fulfillment on the Cross. Despite various obstacles from the Hellenistic and Jewish milieu, they were unwilling to make any compromise on this central component of faith. Various confrontations took place and these in turn would lead to important doctrinal developments finally ending in the definitive demarcation of the faith in the Christological formulation at Chalcedon in 451.

2.1.2 THE PRE-NICENE PERIOD

In the following section, we present a brief overview of the Fathers of the Church during the Pre-Nicene period.²⁹ The various perspectives presented include those of Justin the martyr, Clement of Alexandria, Irenaeus, Hippolytus and Origen. The contribution of each person is unique and reveals new dimensions regarding God’s self-emptying love

²⁶ RENWICK, A. M. *ISBE...*, p. 488.

²⁷ Paul in his letter to Timothy says, ‘*Timothy, guard what has been entrusted to you. Avoid the profane chatter and contradictions of what is falsely called knowledge*’. (*1 Tim. 6,20*)

²⁸ The *Demiurge* as well as Jesus and the Holy Spirit were not God, but mere emanations of the Infinite who was inaccessible. There was no freedom, humility or self-emptying love in what was undertaken by these realities. Besides this, the fact that Jesus Christ was not really human and was a mere appearance went against the central ideal of the Divine Kenosis where God *became* human and engaged in a process of total self-emptying. The process of salvation was also a serious point of conflict where a person was not saved in Christ, but through a special and privileged knowledge which was available to a select few.

²⁹ In keeping with the classification made by HENRY, P. in his article ‘*Kénose*’ in the DBS, this section will first highlight the perspective of the Greek (or Oriental) writers, followed by the Latin writers.

in the light of Christ's humility. The religious, political and sociological circumstances which were challenges to the nascent Christian community turned out to be a blessing in disguise. They spurred the Fathers of the Church towards greater reflection and better understanding of the mystery of the Divine Kenosis.

2.1.2.1 Justin the Martyr (100 - 165)

The first important writer who attempted to define the Christian faith within the Hellenistic categories was Justin the martyr.³⁰ He contended that the revered Greek philosophers who lived in consonance with the Logos were Christians. (*1 Apol.*, 46) The Christian faith was the climax of the philosophical quest and there had been a steady movement from the philosophy of the Old Testament, to the refined Greek philosophies finally reaching its climax in the Christian faith.³¹

He emphasized that Christ was the Logos and this Logos was manifested in the person of Christ – a manifestation which was present in the historical person of Christ. He would go on to highlight the pre-existence of the Word and further state that though the Son and the Spirit have been begotten from the Father, they have existed from all eternity. While insisting about the eternal existence of Christ, he would underline the fact that the Logos took human form and died on the cross during the reign of Pontius Pilate. It is only by a participation in the Logos that one shares in the process of divinization. Justin makes this point on various occasions and an important moment was in the *Apology* to the emperor.

We are not atheists, worshipping as we do the Maker of this universe, and declaring, as we have been taught... Our teacher of these things is Jesus Christ, who also was born ...and was crucified under Pontius Pilate, procurator of Judea, in the times of Tiberius Caesar; and that we reasonably worship Him, having learned that He is the Son of the true God Himself, and holding Him in the second place, and the prophetic Spirit in the third... We give to a crucified man a place second to the unchangeable and eternal God, the

³⁰ He was a genuine seeker who had gone through a variety of philosophical schools and finally found what he was seeking for in Christianity. (*Trypho*, 2) The influence of Stoicism and Platonism are evident in his writings.

³¹ ANF – CE1, "The First Apology of Justine: LIX – Plato's Obligation to Moses", p. 182. (ee) '...It was from our teachers - we mean the account given through the prophets - that Plato borrowed his statement that God, having altered matter which was shapeless, made the world. ...Moses, who, as above shown, was the first prophet, and of greater antiquity than the Greek writers.'

Creator of all...³²

Justin is among the first serious philosophers who tried to explain the self-emptying of God in philosophical categories. Through his writings, he explained the Christ event as being a reality which went beyond its historical consequences. While the focus would be on trying to situate the Christ event in an eternal setting, he makes it a point to insist on the real and historical descent of God in the human person. The ability to juxtapose sublime Greek philosophical tradition along with the Old Testament and the Christ event was a contribution which would be built upon by other writers of the Patristic period.

2.1.2.2 Clement of Alexandria (150 - 215)

Clement of Alexandria like Justin the martyr had gone through various schools of philosophy. He too encountered the manifestation of the Logos in Jesus Christ and continued the tradition of integrating of philosophy with the Christian faith (*Paed.* 1.9). The important contribution consisted in the *Paideia* where God as the good pedagogue led the person through a specific spiritual process to contemplation.³³

The pedagogy of God begins with God's love which led God to come down and participate in the human condition. The 'loving medicine' consisted in helping the person pass through the stages necessary for spiritual growth – viz. intellectual knowledge, moral rectitude and finally contemplation (*Paed.* 1.6). Through contemplation a person transcends sensible realities towards that which is intelligible and from here moves on to God who has been manifest in the person of Jesus Christ (*Strom* 7.2). Through charity one participates in the being of God (*Strom* 4.8). A special feature of Clement is that in his writings on divinization he gives importance to the Holy

³² ANF – CE1, "The First Apology of Justine: XIII – Christians Serve God Rationally", pp. 166–167. (ee)

³³ ANF-CE2, "Clement of Alexandria: Paedagogus Bk.1, Ch.8 – Against those who think that what is just is not good." pp. 225-28. 'So that it is veritably clear that the God of all is only one good, just Creator, and the Son in the Father, to whom be glory for ever and ever, Amen. But it is not inconsistent with the saving Word, to administer rebuke dictated by solicitude. For this is the medicine of the divine love to man, by which the blush of modesty breaks forth, and shame at sin supervenes. ...The feeling of anger (if it is proper to call His admonition anger) is full of love to man, God condescending to emotion on man's account; for whose sake also the Word of God became man.' (ee)

Spirit who helps a person in the process of growth resulting in the perfect person or gnostic (*Strom* 4.21).

The influence of Clement in interpreting the Christian doctrine as well as engaging in a dialogue with the Hellenistic world had great significance. The Divine Kenosis is explained in the context of the pedagogy of God. The Kenosis does not change God, but reality which now shares in the *divine paideia* of God enters into the process of divinization. The Divine becomes part of reality so that reality through the Holy Spirit could become divinized. He would thus interpret the Divine Kenosis as the 'loving medicine' which heals and reconciles all in God.

2.1.2.3 Irenaeus (130 – 202)

Irenaeus was one of the primary anti-Gnostic writers. He refuted the negative perspective of the Gnostics vis-à-vis matter by arguing that if 'this material world is not due to God's will, it must have come about either without his knowledge or contrary to his will, either of which destroys his claim to omnipotence.' He interpreted the Divine Kenosis as taking place in order to further the process of divinization (*Ad.Ha.: V-Pr.*) and depict the Trinitarian process which was effecting the same through a beautiful imagery of God the creator laboring with the two hands which consist of the Son and the Holy Spirit (*Ad.Ha.: V-28.4*). This process did not consist in the return to an earlier Adamic state, but is a process where the created world is moving towards the realization of the Kingdom (City) of God (*Ad.Ha.: V-35.2.*) where the person is glorified and sees God.³⁴

He reaffirmed that Christ became human and it is in the 'flesh' of Jesus Christ that one experiences salvation (*Ad.Ha.: V-14*). Christ as being co-eternal with God is already

³⁴ ANF – CE1, "Irenaeus: Against Heresies – Bk. 4, Ch. 39", pp. 521–522. 'Man is endowed with the faculty of distinguishing good and evil; so that, without compulsion, he has the power, by his own will and choice, to perform God's commandments, by doing which he avoids the evils prepared for the rebellious. And thus in all things God has the pre-eminence, who alone is uncreated, the first of all things... But being in subjection to God is continuance in immortality, and immortality is the glory of the uncreated One. By this arrangement, therefore, and these harmonies, and a sequence of this nature, man, a created and organized being, is rendered after the image and likeness of the uncreated God,—the Father planning everything well and giving His commands, the Son carrying these into execution and performing the work of creating, and the Spirit nourishing and increasing, but man making progress day by day, and ascending towards the perfect, that is, approximating to the uncreated One.' (*Ad.Ha.: IV-38*) (ee)

indicated in the Old Testament. The Divine Kenosis where God becomes human is essential in the process of the divinization of the human person, because it is in the human reality of God that all humanity (and matter) experiences its fulfillment and salvation (*Ad.Ha.: V-6*).³⁵ In developing the Trinitarian perspective he interpreted the being of God as being unchanging and eternal, while the human person and all matter are subject to change (*Ad.Ha.: IV-11*). Salvation is a process which moves from creation towards redemption through a process that involves change. However in this process, what remains constant is the uniqueness of God.

Thus the apostles ...preached to the people that Christ was Jesus the crucified One, whom the same God that had sent the prophets, being God Himself, raised up, and gave in Him salvation to men (*Ad.Ha.: III-12*).³⁶

This dynamic change which effects the process of divinization takes place through the Holy Spirit (*Ad.Ha.: V-12.4*). According to his perspective of the Divine Kenosis we discover that his focus is not so much on the attributes that God leaves behind on becoming human, but the fact that in the Incarnation, God assumed the material world which was in a fallen state because of disobedience and sin. The Word through His obedience to the Father, an obedience which reaches its climax on the Cross, redeems the fallen dimension of the flesh (matter) (*Ad.Ha.: V-21*). The self-emptying of the Logos, who actually dies on the cross, contains within itself all the reality of the material world and through this real death and resurrection effects a reconciliation with God (*Ad.Ha.: V-14*). Salvation is thus the result of the Divine Kenosis which takes place in the actual death on the cross and it is through a union with the Spirit that one rises to the Son and subsequently to the Father (*Ad.Ha.: V-36*).

Irenaeus had to undo the damage being done by Gnosticism. Through the Divine Kenosis he tried to show how the One, the Eternal and the Good God humbled himself to actually take on human nature (materially) so that the created and material world

³⁵ In the course of developing his perspective he delineates his famous understanding of the divinization of the human person where he says that matter is from the Father, the form from the Son and the dynamism is from the Holy Spirit. Through the Spirit, a person moves from being the image of God to the likeness of God (*Ad.Ha.: V-16*).

³⁶ ANF – CE1, “Irenaeus: Against Heresies – Bk. 3, Ch. 12 – The Doctrine of the Rest of the Apostles”, p. 431. (ee)

would be divinized and become that which it actually contains. His efforts would be part of the ongoing effort of the writers of the Patristic period to interpret the actual and historical self-emptying of God as the salvific ground of the entire created order.

2.1.2.4 Hippolytus (170 - 235)

Hippolytus was probably a disciple of Irenaeus who lived in the second and third centuries.³⁷ His views on God and the Divine Kenosis can be found in two of his works which include – *Refutatio omnium haeresium* and the *Traditio apostolica*.³⁸

In his critique of Callistus, he rejected Callistus' notion that the Son and the Father are one and the same and emphasized the real difference between the Son (Logos) and the Father (*Refu.Haer.* 9:8). Interpreting his view on the Divine Kenosis he would indicate that the Father was no longer satisfied to proclaim his Word obscurely and therefore sent forth the Logos.

This Logos the Father in the latter days sent forth, no longer to speak by a prophet, and not wishing that the Word, being obscurely proclaimed, should be made the subject of mere conjecture, but that He should be manifested, so that we could see Him with our own eyes. This Logos, I say, the Father sent forth, in order that the world, on beholding Him, might reverence Him who was delivering precepts not by the person of prophets, nor terrifying the soul by an angel, but who was Himself—He that had spoken—corporally present amongst us. ...This Man we know to have been made out of the compound of our humanity. ...In order, however, that He might not be supposed to be different from us, He even underwent toil, and was willing to endure hunger, and did not refuse to feel thirst, and sunk into the quietude of slumber. He did not protest against His Passion, but became obedient unto death, and manifested His resurrection.³⁹

We have a clear understanding of his perspective vis-à-vis the Divine Kenosis in the *Fragment – Against Beron and Helix –I & II* where he speaks about the Divine Nature and Incarnation. The self-emptying of God is presented in creation, in the fall and in redemption. He begins by showing how Creation is from God who maintains all things

³⁷ He was famous for his debates with Calixtus (who went on to become Pope) and wanted more stringency while readmitting people to sacraments. He broke away from the Church and was banished from Rome. However before his death he was reconciled with the Church.

³⁸ Cf. DROBNER, HUBERTUS R. *The Fathers of the Church – A Comprehensive Introduction*. (Tr. Schatzmann, Siegfried), Hendrickson Publishers: Massachusetts, 2007, p. 122

³⁹ ANF – CE5, "Hippolytus: The Refutation of all Heresies – Bk.10, Ch. 29 – The Doctrine of the Truth Continued", p. 152. (ee)

in perfect harmony. However due to the fall this creation has become sinful and it is in order to effect the redemption that the Incarnation takes place. He is careful to insist that in the Incarnation the Word becomes flesh, but does not undergo change - God remains unchangeable and impassible. While he admits that the essence of divinity and matter is totally different, in the Incarnation there takes place an 'inexpressible and irrefragable union.' The divine and human nature are different essences, but they form one substance. In the Incarnation God truly becomes a person and introduces into flesh (matter) the activity which is proper of divinity. Through wonders and suffering the flesh is finally redeemed and all things are recapitulated in God.

2.1.2.5 Origen (185 - 254)

Origen had an enormous influence on various disciplines within the Christian faith.⁴⁰ In *Contra Celsus* he would hold that the Logos had been revealed in the person of Christ and that this Christ was fully divine. (*Contra Celsus II:31-33*). Drobner would indicate that Origen's doctrine of the Trinity has subordinationist tendencies where he indicates that the Son is divine but subordinate to the Father. However it must be said that this subordination is nuanced because he would try to show how the Word was begotten of God's own nature.⁴¹

...But it is monstrous and unlawful to compare God the Father, in the generation of His only-begotten Son, and in the substance of the same, to any man or other living thing... because His generation is as eternal and everlasting as the brilliancy which is produced from the sun. For it is not by receiving the breath of life that He is made a Son, by *any outward act*, but by His own nature.⁴²

Origen would be the first person to make full use of the Kenosis hymn in the letter

⁴⁰ He would speak of the interpretation of Scriptures at the literal, ethical and mystical levels (*De principiis 4:1.11-12*); his doctrine of the Trinity would allow us to understand his interpretation of the Divine Kenosis (*De principiis 1:1-3*); his cosmology would develop the idea that the intelligible and spiritual God was the source of all creation, his anthropology would define a person as consisting of the body and the soul and within this division, the soul is divided into the upper soul and the lower soul wherein the upper tends towards God, while the lower tends towards matter (*Contra Celsus 6-63*); he would provide a systematic understanding of spiritual life as consisting in the stages of purification, illumination and union and finally point out that the goal of a human person is union with God or the vision of God.

⁴¹ Cf. DROBNER, HUBERTUS R. *The Fathers of the Church...*, p. 145.

⁴² ANF – CE4, "Origen: Origen de Principiis – Bk. 1, Ch. 2 – On Christ", p. 247.

of St. Paul to the Philippians⁴³ where he would indicate that though Christ did lay aside something, he did not lay aside his essential divinity.⁴⁴ Kenosis did involve a real loss and change though the inner divinity of Christ remains immaculate and unaltered. Christ emptied himself out of his fullness and as He emptied himself there was no emptying of the divinity. Yet some kind of limitation did take place and in this change Christ voluntarily gave up the glory that was rightfully His and identified Himself with the human situation. As far as Origen was concerned, the act of Kenosis meant a real loss and change of state, even while the inner divinity of Christ remained immaculate and unaltered. From a Christological viewpoint this meant that it is the soul of Christ, and not the Logos Himself, which underwent the process of self-emptying.⁴⁵

Origen used the Divine Kenosis in order to develop the important elements of his theology. These include the two natures of God, revelation and redemption. He would indicate how the Divine Kenosis reveals God and would further emphasize as to why this specific means of revelation was necessary. Without a revelation in this manner it would have been impossible for the human person to know God (*Contra Celsus* 4:16). He would go on to say 'that the very magnitude of God keeps us from seeing him. It is only as we contemplate him on a small scale that we can know him (*De principiis* 1:2,8).'⁴⁶ He also interprets the self-emptying of God in the Divine Kenosis as the perfect manifestation of God's divine love.⁴⁷

⁴³ Cf. HENRY, P. "Kenose", *DBS - V*, p. 59.

⁴⁴ ANF – CE4, "Origen: *Contra Celsus* – Bk. 4, Ch. 14", p. 503. (ee) 'But if the immortal God—the Word—by assuming a mortal body and a human soul, appears to Celsus to undergo a change and transformation, let him learn that the Word, still remaining essentially the Word, suffers none of those things which are suffered by the body or the soul; but, condescending occasionally to (the weakness of) him who is unable to look upon the splendours and brilliancy of Deity, He becomes as it were flesh, speaking with a literal voice, until he who has received Him in such a form is able, through being elevated in some slight degree by the teaching of the Word, to gaze upon what is, so to speak, His real and pre-eminent appearance (*Contra Celsus* 4:15).'

⁴⁵ Cf. BOSTOCK, GERALD. "Origen's Exegesis of the Kenosis Hymn", *Sixth Origen Conference – Chantilly*, Lueven University Press: Louvain, 2003, p. 543.

⁴⁶ DAWE, DONALD. *The Form of a Servant...*, p. 55.

⁴⁷ BOSTOCK, GERALD. "Origen's Exegesis...", p. 546. '...Origen makes a distinctive use of the Kenosis hymn in the way in which he relates it to the love of God. The Kenosis hymn itself presents the reason for the descent of Christ in negative terms, namely the refusal of Christ to snatch at equality with God. But Origen is able to present it in positive terms by his interpretation of the descent of Christ as an expression of divine love. What is being revealed therefore is not just - in a limited form - the power and the glory of God, but also the perfect love of Christ. The act of Kenosis means not only that the Logos is brought within the

Origen was a towering personality within the Church and despite the fact that he was condemned by Emperor Justin in 543 and by the Council of Constantinople in 553 there is no doubt about his influence on the various branches of theology. There are some difficulties vis-à-vis his Christology as well as the distinction he makes between the ordinary people and those who were perfect. However we need to understand the controversies as part of a period of doctrinal evolution within the Christian faith. Origen's contribution was significant because he was able to situate the Divine Kenosis within a systematic framework of theology and spirituality.

2.1.3 THE NICENE PERIOD

The Nicene period deals with the period during the fourth century when important doctrinal developments took place. Many of them dealt with Trinitarian and Christological issues. Before looking at the viewpoints of individual writers, it would be important to briefly highlight the changing political and religious landscape.⁴⁸

2.1.3.1 The problem of Arianism

The heresy of Arianism derived its name from Arius who agreed with Origen's position on the Logos, but would go on to say that the Son was not eternal. The Son of God was not divine but the first born of all creation.

In view of the biblical witness concerning Jesus, Arius explained his position to this effect, that the Son of God nonetheless assumes a special status that is uniquely outstanding among all creatures. He had been created before time began, and everything else had been created only through him. He takes precedence over all of creation (*Prov. 8:22-31*). He also bears the names God, Logos, Sophia, and Dynamis, though not on account of his nature but on account of grace. God foresaw that Christ, despite his changeable nature, would always bring together freedom of his will with the will of God; therefore God bestowed glory upon him from the start, a glory that the human must attain only through moral excellence in life. However much this conception elevates the Son above all creatures, it does little to bridge the essential and absolute chasm between God the Father,

scope of man's limited vision but also that souls are drawn to Christ by the revelation of his love.'

⁴⁸ Cf. DROBNER, HUBERTUS R. *The Fathers of the Church...*, pp. 187-200. It was a century when Christianity was no longer a persecuted religion and Christians were free to practice their faith. The edict of Milan in 313 CE would legalize Christianity. This would be followed by Christianity's rapid expansion and by 381 CE when Theodosius would declare Christianity as the official religion of the Roman Empire it was already a potent force.

on the one side, and the Son, together with all the remain creatures on the other.⁴⁹

Due to this the Son of God was denied the divinity of God and was presented as being superior to creatures but being inferior to God. Arius would justify his claim by referring to *Jn.14,28* and *Col. 1,15*. The debates of the *homoousion* and the *homoiousion* represent the core of this controversy. While those who held an orthodox position would insist on the *homoousion* (same substance), the semi-Arians would hold the view of the *homoiousion* (similar substance).

The Arians held the view of two different substances - *heteroousion*. The fundamental problem with the Arian position would be their belief that the Son shared the likeness of the Father, but was not of the same essence. Therefore he was not eternal and would lack the same dignity as the Father. With the passage of time many of the moderates or semi-Arians reconciled with the Church and accepted the orthodox doctrine of *homoousion*. The Arians on the other hand were reduced to an insignificant group within the Church.⁵⁰

In denying that the Son was of the same essence or substance with God, Arianism relegated Jesus to a created being. This meant that the process of self-emptying was not part of the very being of God. On the contrary the being of God consisted in relegating the task of salvation to a created reality – albeit a unique and specific created reality. The seriousness of these ideas was not understood by all, especially by many political authorities who considered it as an idle dispute about words. However those who understood the implications of accepting the Arian or Semi-Arian position were aware of its consequences and hence used all their resources in combating the Arian doctrine.

2.1.3.2 Athanasius (296 – 373)

An important person who defended the Christian faith in the fight against Arianism was

⁴⁹ DROBNER, HUBERTUS R. *The Fathers of the Church...*, pp. 236-237.

⁵⁰ Cf. O'COLLINS, GERALD. *Christology – A Biblical, Historical, and Systematic Study of Jesus*, Oxford University Press: New York, 2009, pp. 181-187.

Athanasius⁵¹ and for his stance he was exiled five times. An important part of his theological doctrine⁵² would consist in understanding all three persons in the Trinity as being Divine, of the same substance and together forming a community of essence.⁵³ The Son and the Father are of the same nature, but are distinct.

...for the holy and blessed Triad is indivisible and one in itself. When mention is made of the Father, there is included also his Word, and the Spirit who is in the Son. If the Son is named, the Father is in the Son, and the Spirit is not outside the Word. For there is from the Father one grace which is fulfilled through the Son in the Holy Spirit; and there is one divine nature, and one God 'who is over all and through all and in all'.⁵⁴

The Father wills the Son and the Son wills the Father and this relationship is explained by using the analogies of light and splendor to speak of the distinctness but no separateness of the Son from the Father (*Dis. against Ar. III-3.4.30*).⁵⁵

An important writing by Athanasius is his work on the Incarnation. In order to illustrate the mystery of the Incarnation he would give the example of a great king staying in the house of a poor person. This visit would elevate the status of the house (*Incar. 9*). He would insist that only when the Word is divine and exists as the Son of God, can our divinization be effective (*Incar. 10*). In the Incarnation, the Logos is united to the flesh and through this union all flesh has been healed and sanctified. The Incarnation has been in order that the lost dignity of the human person may be

⁵¹ He was probably born of parents who were not Christians and witnessed the Diocletian persecutions. He was well versed in philosophy and became a Christian in his youth. He shot to prominence as a deacon of Bishop Alexander of Alexandria and made his mark in the Council of Nicaea in 325 CE. The most fruitful years from a pastoral, theological and literary point of view were the 10 years he spent in Alexandria (346-356).

⁵² Cf. KANNENGISSER, CHARLES. "The Spiritual Message of the Great Fathers." *Christian Spirituality – Origins to the Twelfth Century*, (Ed. McGinn, Bernard; Meyendorff, John ; Leclercq, Jean), Crossroad: New York, 1985, pp. 63-65. He preferred the revelation of God in the Gospels as the starting point for his doctrine rather than emphasizing the link between the innate aspiration for divine transcendence and faith in the Gospels. His spirituality contained a shift from a philosophical doctrine of the Logos to a doctrine of the Divine Sonship as well as an understanding that access to the Divine was not limited to a select few, but was within the scope of all persons

⁵³ O'COLLINS, GERALD SJ. *Christology...*, pp. 185

⁵⁴ ATHANASIUS, OF ALEXANDRIA, *The Letters of Saint Athanasius concerning the Holy Spirit*, (Tr. Shapland, C. R. B.), The Epworth Press: London, 1951, pp. 93-94. (ee)

⁵⁵ The Word functions in three ways – by being united to the Father, creating and guiding the world through the Logos and being united to the human race through the Incarnation. The Holy Spirit is a gift of the Son to the Church and everything moves through the Word in the Spirit.

restored.⁵⁶

Salvation is intrinsically linked to the divinity of Christ. He insisted that only if Christ shared in the Divinity of God was our union with God possible. The immortality of the human person also depended on Christ being fully divine. Thus Christ can be Savior only if He is fully divine and any decrease in his power would not allow Him to be Savior of the world and reconcile all in God.⁵⁷

Despite his insistence on the divinity of Christ it must be said that he would also speak of the real humanity of Christ.⁵⁸ In the Incarnation, God has become human in Jesus Christ and in humility has taken the form of a slave. While indicating clearly that Christ is fully Divine, He also had a body like any other person. It is this very body which becomes an instrument of salvation. Though he would indicate that he clothed Himself with the human body, he would be emphatic in stating that this clothing was not merely an external appearance, but a real body.⁵⁹

Moving on to his understanding of glorification which takes place at the end of the Kenosis Hymn it must be said that the final glorification does not add anything to the divinity of the Word because the Word was already glorified from the very beginning. What was glorified was the humanity of the Word. The Word did not lose its divine nature in the Incarnation, but it divinized the nature in which it was submerged.

...he had not promotion from His descent, but rather Himself promoted the things which needed promotion; and if He descended to effect their promotion, therefore He did not

⁵⁶ NPNF – CE2.4, “Athanasius: On the Incarnation of the Word - § 54”, p.65. (ee) ‘For He was made man that we might be made God; and He manifested Himself by a body that we might receive the idea of the unseen Father; and He endured the insolence of men that we might inherit immortality. For while He Himself was in no way injured, being impassible and incorruptible and very Word and God, men who were suffering, and for whose sakes He endured all this, He maintained and preserved in His own impassibility.’

⁵⁷ NPNF – CE2.4, “Athanasius: On the Incarnation of the Word - § 20”, p. 47. (ee)

⁵⁸ He would go at great lengths to show that God actually ‘became man, and did not (merely) come into man.’ (NPNF – CE2.4, “Athanasius: Discourse against Arians – Discourse III, 30-32”, p. 410. (ee)) It would be incorrect to believe that God merely came to a human person or that a human person received some element of the Divine as was the case with some prophets and holy men of old.

⁵⁹ The Lord went through all the emotions that are proper to a human person and the sufferings which were experienced were real. However it must be said that these emotions, feelings and sufferings did not affect the divinity. The unity of the divine and the human can be seen in the miracles. (*Discourse against Arians: III, 30-32*)

receive in reward the name of the Son and God, but rather He Himself has made us sons of the Father, and deified men by becoming Himself man (*Discourse against Arians: I-38*).⁶⁰

When the Word became flesh it did not make the divine unworthy, because the flesh already contained the glory of God. This glory which had been lost due to sin was now being recovered (*Discourse against Arians: I-42*). The humility of God in becoming human has allowed the recovery of the dignity of the human person.⁶¹

In speaking of the reason as to why God chose to engage in a process of self-emptying in the Divine Kenosis he would highlight two reasons. The benign attitude of God and for the sake of restoring humanity (both past, present and future) to the primordial state.⁶² In the restoration of the image of the human person he would give a wonderful imagery of a painting which has been covered with layers of dirt. The Son who is the image of the Father came to restore the human person who had been created in the image of the Father. A point to be remembered is that the Incarnate Word was present at all times in creation. All things were contained in Him and he was ordaining all things through His divine providence (*Incaration 17*).

Athanasius preferred the simple piety of the monks to the subtle intricacies of philosophical systems. For Athanasius the Divine Logos was the Incarnate Savior. He tended towards the deification theory which believed that human beings are saved from the power of sin and death by the deification of the flesh. Christ is Savior because He by his humble descent and self-emptying has shared in physical and material reality and by partaking in the human condition has divinized it. The divinization of all reality thus hinges on the crucial fact that the Word totally shared in the Godhead.

⁶⁰ NPNF – CE2.4 “Athanasius: Discourse against Arians – Discourse I, 38”, p. 329.

⁶¹ It was necessary to go through suffering and death because by doing so the Word assumed all corruption and death and put it to an end. By taking on a body like everyone else, the Son of the incorruptible God has given all of us the grace of immortality and the promise of resurrection (*Incaration 9*).

⁶² NPNF – CE2.4 “Athanasius: On the Incarnation of the Word - § 8”, p. 40. (ee) “¹He comes in condescension to show loving-kindness upon us, and to visit us. ...²He had mercy on our infirmity, and takes unto Himself a body, and that of no different sort from ours. ⁴...And thus taking from our bodies one of like nature, because all were under penalty of the corruption of death He gave it over to death in the stead of all, and offered it to the Father—doing this, moreover, of His loving-kindness, to the end that, firstly, all being held to have died in Him, the law involving the ruin of men might be undone and that, secondly, whereas men had turned toward corruption, He might turn them again toward incorruption...’

Athanasius was firm on not accepting any doctrine which even slightly suggested that the Son of God was less than the fullness of the Divine Godhead. The Divine Kenosis consisted in the Word becoming a human person and in the process of self-emptying, divinized the human person and restored the dignity which had been lost. It revealed the loving mercy of God who in order to cause the salvation of those who had died in the law and the conversion of all towards immortality. The Divine Kenosis did not cause any loss to the Godhead, glorified that which was assumed and restored the image of the human person to its original primordial state.

Athanasius' contribution in developing an orthodox understanding of the Divine Kenosis would be important for various reasons. He would emphasize the divinity of the Word and would refute all ideas which suggested that the Son was created or in some ways inferior to the Divine Godhead. This meant that self-emptying love manifest in Christ revealed the very being of God. He would affirm that the self-emptying did not take away anything from God and the classical attributes of God were not influenced. Finally he would insist that all reality was transformed due to this historic intervention of God, leading to a process of divinization and glorification.

2.1.3.3 Hilary of Poitiers (300 – 368)

Hilary of Poitiers⁶³ pointed out that God communicates with humanity at a given moment in time through the Incarnation of the Son. The Incarnation gives meaning to all moments in time, including creation because all these events have taken place through the Son. The Son is the mediator between God and the human person (*Trin.* 4,42). Through the Incarnation there is the possibility of a union with God because the Incarnate Word is fully endowed with divine and human attributes (*Trin.* 1,11).

⁶³ Cf. DROBNER, HUBERTUS R. *The Fathers of the Church...*, pp. 253-257. Hilary of Poitiers was born of non-Christian parents and had reached Christianity through the quest for philosophy. After being baptized as an adult he was made the bishop of Poitiers in 350 CE. Despite the Nicene formulation in 325, doctrinal orthodoxy was being threatened by Arianism. The heresy of Arianism was intertwined with political power struggles and therefore the effort to overcome this danger was rather complex. He realized the danger of any compromise regarding orthodoxy and was highly critical of the emperor who he claimed was worse than Nero. Like St. Athanasius, he too was exiled to Perugia. It was during this period he wrote his famous work *De Trinitate*. He was the author of many other works and strongly influenced the anti-Arian movements in Gaul and Northern Italy.

In explaining the Kenosis he would say that the Word undergoes a transition from having the form of God to having the form of a servant. Though He takes the form of a servant, there is no loss in his nature and he does not stop being God.

...He who was in the form of God, did not grasp at being equal with God, because from equality with God, that is, from the form of God, He descended into the form of a servant. But He could not descend from God into man, except by emptying Himself, as God, of the form of God. But when He emptied Himself, He was not effaced, so as not to be; since then He would have become other in kind than He had been. For neither did He, who emptied Himself within Himself, cease to be Himself; since the power of His might remains even in the power of emptying Himself; and the transition into the form of a servant does not mean the loss of the nature of God, since to have put off the form of God is nothing less than a mighty act of divine power. (*Trin. 12,6*)⁶⁴

Though He took the form of a servant, he was free from the sins and vices of the human body (*Trin. 10,25*). There was never any dilution in the divine nature of Christ, because the Son who was in the image of God had been sealed by God. Now one on whom the seal of God has been placed, continues to be God and is in the form of God (*Trin. 8,44-45*).⁶⁵

The Incarnation, which was a crucial moment in the history of salvation resulted in a new reality where the relationship between the Father and the Son continued to be one of union, but with a difference. Though Christ assumed a new nature without prejudice to his true nature, there was a change in His form (*Trin. 8,45*). The change in form affected the earlier unity which existed between the Father and the pre-existent Son (*Incar. 9,38*). He emptied himself of his original form – i.e. the form of God had departed and He took the form of a slave on being born as a human person (*Trin. 9,51*).⁶⁶

⁶⁴ NPNF – CE2.9, “Hilary of Poitiers: On the Trinity – Bk. 12,6”, p. 219. (ee)

⁶⁵ Though the two forms – of being a servant and God are incompatible, we have in the case of Jesus Christ a unique mystery where in the same person we have both the forms (*Trin. 10,65*). Thus Christ who took on a servant’s form continued to be fully divine without any loss to his original nature. The obedience of death has nothing to do with the form of God, just as the form of God is not inherent in the form of a servant. Yet through the Mystery of the Gospel Dispensation the same Person is in the form of a servant and in the form of God,... The emptying of the form does not then imply the abolition of the nature: He emptied Himself, but did not lose His self: He took a new form, but remained what He was.(NPNF – CE2.9, “Hilary of Poitiers: On the Trinity – Bk. 9,14”, p. 159. (ee))

⁶⁶ NPNF – CE2.9, “Hilary of Poitiers: On the Trinity – Bk. 9,38”, p. 167. ‘Christ, though abiding in the virtue of His nature, yet in respect of the humanity assumed in this temporal change, lost together with the form of God the unity with the divine

What was the reason for the self-emptying of the Son? It took place in order that through this process man could become like God. By descending to becoming a human person, there was no diminution of the Word, but that which was assumed was conferred with divinity (*Trin.* 9,4). The means of divinization was by being united with Christ who is united to the Father.⁶⁷ In developing this point Hilary would insist on a unity of the entire person without limiting the unity to only that of the will and obedience. The glorification of the Son which took place in the exaltation is shared with us through the union which took place through the sacrament of the Body and Blood. (*Trin.* 8,13-17)

The glorification of the humanity of Christ is a process and the works of Christ are a revelation of His divinity. The Holy Spirit⁶⁸ brought to fulfillment the perfection of the Mystery which already existed.⁶⁹ The humanity of Christ which is glorified has a collective dimension because by being united in Christ, the process that has taken place in Christ will also take place in each and every person. Through faith humanity participates in the divinity of Christ resulting in the final divinization of all in God (*Trin.* 2,24). The works of Christ are in order to reveal His divinity and invite a person towards the final eschatological glory (*Trin.* 7,37).

Hilary lived at a time when the Christian faith was finding expression in doctrinal formulations. Hilary's writings touch upon a variety of issues that were related to the Divine Kenosis. He highlighted the divinity of the Son and emphasized the equality of the Son to the Father. He also spoke about the changeable and unchangeable aspects of Christ's self-emptying and developed the soteriological dimension of the Divine Kenosis

nature also. ...The object to be gained (through the Incarnation) was that man might become God. But the assumed manhood could not in any wise abide in the unity of God, unless, through unity with God, it attained to unity with the nature of God.'

⁶⁷ NPNF – CE2.9 "Hilary of Poitiers: On the Trinity – Bk. 8,15", p. 141. 'By participating in the body and blood of Christ we are united with Him and through Him are united with the Father because 'He was in the Father through the nature of Deity, and we on the contrary in Him through His birth in the body.'

⁶⁸ Hilary's important contribution would be his doctrine of the Holy Spirit. He said that the Spirit was the divine energy of God and the source of cosmic life. Besides this the Spirit was also present in the Word and this power was received by the prophets in the Old Testament. The Holy Spirit glorifies the Son and is also the means of the divinization of the human person (*Trin.* 2,30-35).

⁶⁹ NPNF – CE2.9, "Hilary of Poitiers: On the Trinity – Bk.9,19", p. 209.

while explaining divinization.⁷⁰ In explaining the process of divinization, he would point out to the pre-eminent role of the Holy Spirit in the divinization of the humanity of Christ and consequently the divinization of the human person.

2.1.4 THE POST-NICENE PERIOD

The preoccupation until the Council of Nicea related to the divinity of Christ and His relation with the Father. After Nicea, the focus shifted towards the two natures of Christ. Given the fact that Christ was fully divine - 'how are Christ's two natures – divine and human – related to each other?'⁷¹ The theological debate tried to explain the union of the divine and human nature in the one person Jesus Christ.⁷² An important theologian during this period was Apollinarius, who in his effort to uphold the divinity of Christ, would consider the humanity of Christ as being insignificant. We now have a brief overview of the theological debate during this period, the specific terms involved, the confusions and the final clarity that was provided by the Councils of Nicea and Constantinople.

2.1.4.1 The 'homoousious' debate

Within the Trinitarian doctrine two important terms would be – *ousia* (being, reality, essence or substance) and *hypostasis* (primordial essence or individuating principle, subject or subsistence). The declaration at the Council of Nicea in 325 CE proclaimed that the Triune God is 'one *ousia* and three *hypostasis*.' In explaining the nature of the three *hypostasis*, it was said that the Son was of the same substance (*homoousious*) as the Father because the Son was not created but generated.⁷³ Despite some confusion among

⁷⁰ While the divinity remained constant and was in no way diluted, the form of the Son was changed. This change in form altered the unity between that which existed between the eternal Word and the Father. Since the Son was eternal and divine, the self-emptying would not bring about any diminution in His divinity, but lead to an assumption of the flesh which by being united to the divine would become divinized.

⁷¹ KÄRKKÄINEN, VELI-MATTI *Christology – A Global Introduction*, Baker Academic: Michigan, 2003, p. 72.

⁷² Cf. IBID. The focus of the eastern theologians consisted in showing the divinity of Christ without denying His humanity. Their soteriology focused on the process of deification or divinization. This was contrasted with the western theologians who accepted the divinity of Christ, but laid greater emphasis on Christ's humanity. Their soteriology focused on 'moral obedience and justification by faith on the basis of Christ's obedience to the Father.'

⁷³ The term (*hypostasis*) gave rise to a certain degree of confusion because it could be understood both as the primordial essence or the individuating principle. The Latins understood the term *hypostasis* as the primordial principle while the

the Latins and the Eastern Christians, the meaning of the term *homoousious* was generally accepted as referring to one *ousia* and three *hypostasis*.⁷⁴

As the debate moved from the divinity of the Son to the two natures of the Son, we have as a starting point the explanation of Tertullian who spoke of the Trinity as consisting of one unique substance and three distinct but undivided persons. In the Incarnation, divinity and humanity are united in one person without the substances being mixed up. In the East the two natures theory would be developed by Gregory of Nazianzus and Gregory of Nyssa who would distinguish between the two *physeis* (natures or principles of activity) and the one *prosopon* of Christ.⁷⁵

2.1.4.2 Apollinarius and the problem of Christ's humanity

Apollinarius was a friend of Athanasius and staunch supporter of the Nicene Creed. For the Eastern theologians, the union of Christ's divine nature with human nature was central in the process of deification.⁷⁶ Apollinarius believed that if the Logos assumed human nature, it would lead to its contamination thus compromising the sinlessness of Christ. He suggested that

...if a real human mind in Jesus were replaced by a purely divine mind, then and only then could Christ's sinlessness be maintained. He argued that a purely human mind and soul were replaced by a divine mind and soul, preventing contamination of the divine

Eastern Christians understood it as the individuating principle. Thus the use of this term shocked both because the Latins were afraid of being tritheists and the Eastern Christians were afraid of denying the distinction in God.

⁷⁴ Cf. O'COLLINS, GERALD. *Christology...*, pp. 181-185. Some bishops would have preferred the term *homoiousious* instead of *homoousious* where this term indicated that the Son and the Father were of similar substance. This was because the term *homoousious* had to be interpreted correctly or else would give rise to serious doctrinal problems. Failure to do so could on the one hand lead to a consideration of the Father and Son as being totally identical and leading to a return to Judaism, while the inability to understand the Trinity as a community of essences would lead to polytheism. In explaining this further, the first Council of Constantinople would use the word *prosopois* which would mean the face or visible manifestation of the *hypostasis*.

⁷⁵ Cf. O'COLLINS, GERALD. *Christology...*, pp. 185-187.

⁷⁶ Cf. DROBNER, HUBERTUS. *The Fathers of the Church...*, pp. 264-65. Given the fact that the human and divine natures were different, the question that naturally arose referred to the nature that was assumed in this union. In attempting to address this issue Apollinarius tried to explain as to 'how the Son of God, the Second Person of the Trinity, was bound up with the man Jesus, so that the two became genuinely one and did not remain split up as the Son of God and the Son of Man'.

Logos by any sin from a human mind.⁷⁷

He argued that every being could only have one principle of self-determination because each principle has its own aspirations which are unique and specific to it.⁷⁸ In trying to juxtapose two wills in one person and by emphasizing the dynamic unity of activity in Christ, the human will of Christ would be eliminated.⁷⁹

His understanding of the Divine Kenosis and the self-emptying of God was influenced by this doctrine. The self-emptying of God annihilated the humanity of Jesus altogether and was subsumed in His divinity. But he would now have to explain how a being that was totally divine could be limited. In order to explain this fact he would use the principle of self-limitation or kenosis to interpret the Incarnation. Accordingly in the Incarnation there is a change in the Logos, where this change consists in the realm of Christ's co-existence with the Father. The Son is no longer united with the Father in the manner that He was united before the Incarnation. They are still united, but the kind of unity has undergone a change. In explaining the limitation of Jesus he would make a difference between the unlimited Logos and the limited Logos. He would say that...

In the incarnate life the Logos is inferior to and estranged from the glories of the divine life. In this respect it is limited. Yet the unlimited divine power is not totally absent from Jesus. It can come into play... When the action of the Logos is limited, Jesus' will can operate independently from the Father and there can even be an opposition to the will of the Father – e.g. in Gethsemane. The Incarnate or limited will shrank from death, but the unlimited divine will accept death on the Cross.⁸⁰

From a logical point it can be said that Apollinarius had dealt with the issue of the human and divine natures of Christ without compromising on the unity of the one person. However in the process he had compromised the two natures of Christ and presented a solution which is closer to Doceticism. The unlimited divine nature and the limited nature which are found in Jesus Christ had been posited to the divine Logos by

⁷⁷ KÄRKKÄINEN, VELI-MATTI. *Christology ...*, p. 74.

⁷⁸ The reason and will of the divine nature and human nature are totally different from each other and it was impossible for both natures to co-exist. From this he came to the conclusion that in Christ the human principle (or at least part of it) was replaced by the Logos.

⁷⁹ DROBNER, HUBERTUS. *The Fathers...*, p. 265.

⁸⁰ DAWE, DONALD. *The Form of a Servant...*, p. 60.

presenting a Logos which is both unlimited and limited. This in turn would create a situation where Christ who had the dual natures of humanity and divinity was replaced by a Logos that was dual.⁸¹ He had thus solved a problem but in doing so also did away with the mystery of the Incarnation where the God became totally human in order to effect the salvation of the world.⁸²

2.1.4.3 Gregory of Nazianzus (330 – 390)

Gregory of Nazianzus, one of the three great Cappadocian Fathers which included Basil and Gregory of Nyssa would respond to Apollinarius.⁸³ The five chapters of the *Orationes* (27-31)⁸⁴ give us an idea of the theological position of Gregory. Though his focus would be on God, in the first chapter he emphasized on a life of purity, coupled with reverence for divine mysteries in order to be truly effective.⁸⁵ The second chapter begins with a prayer to the Holy Trinity and indicates the difficulty involved in any talk about God.⁸⁶

The third discourse would be important for our purpose because in it he speaks about the Trinity, the unity of God and the Son who is eternal and originates from the

⁸¹ Cf. IBID., pp. 60-61

⁸² The danger of this position was immediately noticed and it was opposed by the Eastern theologians. To be the Savior, Christ had to be both fully human and fully divine. Only by being fully human would our human nature be deified and only if He were fully divine would He have the power and authority to save us. Thus despite linguistic difficulties in expressing the relation between the two natures, the Eastern and Western theologians would strongly insist on the real union of the divine and human natures in Christ in order to indicate the salvation of the entire human person.

⁸³ After the death of Basil he moved to Constantinople at the invitation of Emperor Theodosius who wanted to unite the empire under the Nicene Creed. It would be there that he delivered five discourses in which he would expound the doctrine of the Trinity and the unity of the Godhead.

⁸⁴ An actualized translation of the five *Orationes* is made available by REYNOLDS, STEPHEN at the following website - <https://tspace.library.utoronto.ca/bitstream/1807/36303/1/Gregory%20of%20Nazianzus%20Theological%20Orationes.pdf> – as on 18/05/2015.

⁸⁵ NPNF – CE2.7, “Gregory of Nazianzus: *Orationes* – 27:3”, p. 285. (ee) ‘...Not to everyone, my friends, does it belong to philosophize about God; not to every one; the Subject is not so cheap and low. ...It is permitted only to those who have been examined, and are passed masters in meditation, and who have been previously purified in soul and body, or at the very least are being purified.’

⁸⁶ The reason would consist in the incomprehensibility of God and the limitedness of human nature (*Orationes* 28,4). Thus there is need of great humility while one is dealing with the Divine mysteries. (*Orationes* 28,7). In developing this point he would go on to indicate the radical impossibility of the human person to know God when he says that ‘every rational nature longs for God and for the First Cause, but is unable to grasp Him.’⁸⁶ It is only when our mind and reason is united to the Divine that we shall have some light vis-à-vis the Divine mysteries (*Orationes* 28,17).

Father.⁸⁷ After explaining the divinity of Christ he would go on to say that by uniting His divine nature to the human nature, the human nature was divinized and since His human nature was divinized, all human nature was divinized.

In the beginning He was, uncaused; for what is the Cause of God? But afterwards for a cause He was born. And that cause was that you might be saved, who insult Him and despise His Godhead, because of this, that He took upon Him your denser nature, having converse with Flesh by means of Mind. While His inferior Nature, the Humanity, became God, because it was united to God, and became One Person because the Higher Nature prevailed ... in order that I too might be made God so far as He is made Man (*Oration 29,19*).⁸⁸

In the fourth discourse he speaks of Christ being one person but two natures. Here he expresses his views on the Divine Kenosis and concludes by showing how Christ through His sufferings has been the source of salvation and sanctification. The will of the Father is fulfilled by the Son not because He is a slave, (though he has taken the form of a slave), but because the Son is like the Father and has all the authority of the Father (*Oration 30,11*). The fifth discourse would speak of the Holy Spirit as being totally divine.⁸⁹ Towards the end of the chapter he would once again highlight the linguistic limitation related to the Divine mysteries and depend on the guidance of the Holy Spirit in order to offer true adoration to the Triune God.⁹⁰

According to Gregory, the Divine Kenosis was concretely manifested in the Incarnation and had as its goal the divinization of the human person. Through his birth, public life, humiliation during the passion and ultimate death on the cross he fully shared in the condition of the human person and caused the redemption of all. In this way the prophecy of the Suffering Servant was fulfilled.⁹¹ The purpose of God's humble

⁸⁷ In explaining the Trinity he humbly accepts that words cannot easily express this profound mystery. Therefore visible things have to be used in order to express this reality (*Oration 29,2*). This would be followed by an exposition of the Divinity of the Son with an indication of the various titles which refer to His divinity in the Bible (*Oration 29,17*).

⁸⁸ *NPNF – CE2.7, “Gregory of Nazianzus: Orations – 29:19”, p. 308.(ee)*

⁸⁹ Against the accusation that the divinity of the Holy Spirit is not expressed in Scripture, he would quote various scripture passages to show how this was not true (*Oration 31,29*). The Old Testament manifested the Holy Spirit in an obscure manner. The New Testament has manifested the Son and now the Holy Spirit dwells within us revealing to us the mystery of God (*Oration 31,26*).

⁹⁰ *NPNF – CE2.7, “Gregory of Nazianzus: Orations – 31:33”, p. 328. (ee)*

⁹¹ *IBID.*, p. 309. ‘... He redeems the world, and that at a great price, for the Price was His own blood. As a sheep He is led to the

self-emptying was in order to rescue man who has been in darkness (*Oration 37,1*). He lay aside the timelessness and invisibility which are attributes of God and assumed something within the realm of time and human visibility. If God had not deigned to engage in this act of self-emptying, very few persons would have had access to God (*Oration 37,3*).

He would strongly insist on Christ being one person, but having two natures and any understanding of Christ ought to take into account His divinity as well as His humanity.⁹² Gregory of Nazianzus would be an important figure in providing a corrective to the position of Apollinarius who emphasized the divinity at the expense of the humanity of Christ. His writings indicate that the issue of the divinity of Christ was an ongoing problem and this is seen in his attempt to explain the 10 statements about Christ in his fourth discourse. Gregory tried through his writings to insist that in the Divine Kenosis, one who empties Himself was indeed God, and that this God fully shared in the human condition.

2.1.4.4 Cyril of Alexandria (378 - 444)

The issue of the two natures of Christ i.e. His humanity and divinity would continue to be the cause of much theological reflection. While it was accepted that Christ was fully human and divine the issue of how exactly this union took place would lead to the debates and letters between Nestorius and Cyril of Alexandria. Both Nestorius and Cyril would accept that Jesus was one person composed of the divine and human natures, yet they understood this mystery differently.⁹³

slaughter, but He is the Shepherd of Israel, and now of the whole world also. As a Lamb He is silent, yet He is the Word, and is proclaimed by the Voice of one crying in the wilderness. He is bruised and wounded, but He healeth every disease and every infirmity. He is lifted up and nailed to the Tree, but by the Tree of Life He restoreth us (Oration 29,20).'

⁹² At no point of time does he give the impression that the humanity of Christ was merely an external appearance. He insists on the fact that Christ was fully human and went through all the experiences of the human person. By sharing in the human condition, the human condition has been assumed into the divine. However it would be important not to interpret the humanity in isolation from the divinity or vice versa, rather both the divinity and humanity have to be understood as two realities within one single person – Jesus Christ. (Cf. *NPNF – CE2.7*, “Gregory of Nazianzus: Orations – 38:15”, p. 350.)

⁹³ Cf. GAVRILYUK, PAUL. *The Suffering of the Impassible God*, Oxford University Press: Oxford, 2004, p. 137. The debate

Nestorius believed in two natures within one person but dichotomized the two natures to such an extent that there was no union and the two natures functioned in a parallel manner in the person. Cyril on the other hand would insist that the two natures were united in the one person, i.e. Christ. The reason for his dogged insistence on the union of the two natures in Christ was because of its soteriological importance. It was precisely because of the union of the Divine with the human that humanity is redeemed.

In the debate, the position regarding the impassibility of God was a key issue.⁹⁴ Both would agree that the starting point of the Divine Kenosis was a voluntary self-emptying of God. Nestorius however contended that this God who engaged in an act of self-emptying could not have been 'sullied' by contact with humanity. His difficulty with accepting the unqualified impassibility of God was founded on his deep awe and transcendence at the mystery of God. Such an involvement would be unworthy of God, would destroy creation and would result in a case of anthropomorphism.⁹⁵ Cyril on the other hand would counter this and insist that the very impassible God had deigned to become human in order to reconcile fallen humanity with God.

We confess that the Son begotten of God the Father and Only-Begotten God Himself, albeit Impassible in His own Nature, hath suffered in the flesh for us according to the Scriptures, and was in His crucified body making His own in an Impassible manner the Sufferings of His own Flesh. And by the grace of God He tasted death even for every one, albeit by Nature Life and Himself the Resurrection. For in order that, with Ineffable Might having trodden down death in His own flesh first, He might become the First born of the Dead and First fruits of them that slept and might make a way to the nature of man for a return to incorruption...⁹⁶

The distinctness of the two natures would be maintained by both Cyril and Nestorius. However they would disagree in the manner how this distinctness would be

between these two theologians was not merely a debate regarding some superficial sophisms or political manipulations. The issue was rather complex and was to a great deal influenced by the redemptive function of the Divine Kenosis.

⁹⁴ Both Cyril and Nestorius agreed upon the impassibility of God. While Nestorius would argue for an absolute impassibility, Cyril argued for a qualified impassibility.

⁹⁵ Cf. GAVRILYUK, PAUL. *The Suffering...*, pp. 141-48.

⁹⁶ CYRIL OF ALEXANDRIA. *The Three Epistles of S. Cyril, Archbishop of Alexandria: English Text*, (Ed. Pusey, P. E.). James Parker and Co.:London, 1872, p. 64. (ee)

manifested. Nestorius would simplify the issue by advocating an absolute distinction between the two natures. Cyril on the other hand (while accepting the distinctness of the two natures) would stress the fact that in Christ the divine and human are united. They are distinct, but are not absolutely separated in the way that Nestorius explained. He rejected the apparently pious consideration that if divinity was united with the humanity, then the divine impassibility of God was lost. In the kenosis, the divine impassibility was not lost, but humanity was redeemed.⁹⁷

Interpreting the letter of St. Paul's to the Philippians Cyril would say that in the Incarnation something unique and unparalleled took place. It was not merely a qualitative difference between the person of Christ and the prophets of old, but that in the Incarnation the Word 'became' flesh. Cyril's objection was that the difference between God's presence in Christ and in deified human beings such as prophets or saints was not merely a matter of degree of grace.⁹⁸ The difference between Christ and the saints was qualitative, and for that reason all Christological statements required a subject that would make this fact clear:

'It was not the case that initially an ordinary man was born of the holy Virgin and then the Word simply settled on him —no, what is said is that he underwent fleshly birth united from the very womb, making the birth of his flesh his very own.' Cyril insisted that it was not a man indwelt by God, but God the Word incarnate who was the subject of all statements about Christ.⁹⁹

Despite God's participation in the human existential situation through the Divine Kenosis – a situation which includes humiliation and death, God does not become human and neither does the human become God in the strict sense. The impassible God does not become passible because God does not share the human condition as God, but as a human person. The union of the divine and human natures in the person of Christ does represent a divine paradox.¹⁰⁰ In the moment of the Divine Kenosis when God

⁹⁷ It is interesting to see how Cyril uses the word 'pious' sarcastically in his third letter to Nestorius. The tone of this letter is acerbic. While the earlier letters were more polite and conciliatory, this letter has an aggressive tone.

⁹⁸ GAVRILYUK, PAUL. *The Suffering of the Impassible God*, Oxford University Press: Oxford, 2004, pp. 151-52.

⁹⁹ Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 151-52

¹⁰⁰ Cf. WEINANDY, T. G. - KEATING, D. A. *The Theology of St. Cyril of Alexandria: A critical appreciation*, T&T Clark: London,

engaged in a loving and salvific act of self-emptying a radical change came about both within God and within the human reality. With the second person of the Trinity becoming human, the Divine participated in the human condition and through this participation deified humanity.¹⁰¹

The mystery of the Incarnation would be elaborated by Cyril through his explanation of the communication of idioms where the Word united to the flesh.¹⁰² Through the communication of idioms there came about a union of the divine and the human in Christ resulting in new kind of existence for both God and for humanity. God shared in the human condition as a human being – a condition that God had never experienced before. Similarly all the realms of human existence including suffering, humiliations and death were deified and exalted to share in God's glory.¹⁰³ In the Divine Kenosis the entire human person was assumed and this included weaknesses, vulnerability, suffering and death because what is not assumed is not saved.¹⁰⁴ In the process of appropriation there was no mixing or enmeshing of the two natures. Both the human and divine natures remained distinct.

...the personal identity of Christ lies squarely in the pre-existent Logos, and what is

2003, pp. 24-30. (ee) Nestorius did not want to enter into the paradox of the Divine Kenosis where in the person of Christ we have the fullness of humanity and the fullness of divinity. He therefore posited that the person Jesus consisted of a disjoint unity of the human and the divine. On the other hand, Cyril would say that the person Jesus Christ was in fact one single person within whom there existed an ontological unity of the human and divine.

¹⁰¹ Cf. IBID. p. 46-47 '*...the Incarnation is not the compositional union of natures but the person of the Son taking on a new manner or mode of existence. Because the incarnational 'becoming' is kath hypostasin, according to the person, it can actually be said then that the person of the Son of God is truly born, grieves, suffers and dies, not as God, but as man for that is now the new manner in which the Son of God actually exists.*'

¹⁰² In the communication of idioms there is a mutual exchange of divine and human properties by virtue of the hypostatic union. An actual transfer of divine attributes to the man Jesus and of human attributes to the Divine Logos takes place. (Cf. POHLE, J. - PREUSS, A. *Christology: A Dogmatic Treatise on the Incarnation*, B. Herder: St. Louis, 1913, p. 185. (ee)

¹⁰³ WEINANDY, T. G. *The Theology of St. Cyril of Alexandria...*, pp. 52-53. '*.... in an unqualified manner one can say that, as man, the Son of God had experiences he never had before because he never existed as man before – not the least of which are suffering and death. This is what, for Cyril, a proper understanding of the Incarnation requires and affirms, and this is what the communication of idioms so remarkably, clearly, and even scandalously safeguards, advocates and confesses. The eternal, almighty, all perfect, unchangeable, and impassible divine Son, he who is equal to the Father in all ways, actually experienced, as a weak human being, the full reality of human suffering and death. What was an infamy to the Docetists, to Arius, and to Nestorius was for Cyril and for the subsequent Christian tradition the glory and grandeur of the Gospel.*'

¹⁰⁴ Cf. GAVRILYUK, PAUL. *Suffering of Impassible God...*, pp. 162-66.

assumed involves no change to that identity, but merely an extension of its range for the sake of the salvific process. There is an ostensible loss of stature in this act of condescension, to be sure, but no actual ontological transformation of the Logos itself.¹⁰⁵

In conclusion we can say that Cyril, Nestorius and other theologians dealt with the very core of the mystery of God and the purpose and means of God's revelation in Christ. They dealt with themes such as the impassibility of God, the two natures in one person, the communication of idioms, the doctrine of appropriation and so on. Down the centuries these points would be qualified by various theologians. However with Cyril of Alexandria and the Council of Chalcedon, the basic parameters of orthodoxy would be defined. The Council of Chalcedon in 451 would place the stamp of authority on the position of Cyril by approving his letter to Nestorius as well as his letter to John of Antioch. With 451 the doctrinal orthodox vis-à-vis the Divine Kenosis was defined definitively.

Therefore, following the holy fathers, we all teach that with one accord we confess one and the same Son, our Lord Jesus Christ, the same perfect in human nature, truly God and the same with a rational soul and a body truly man, consubstantial with the Father according to divinity, and consubstantial with us according to human nature, like unto us in all things except sin; indeed born of the Father before the ages according to divine nature, but in the last days the same born of the virgin Mary, Mother of God according to human nature; for us and for our deliverance, one and the same Christ only begotten Son, our Lord, *acknowledged in two natures, without mingling, without change, indivisibly, undividedly, the distinction of the natures nowhere removed on account of the union but rather the peculiarity of each nature being kept, and uniting in one person and substance, not divided or separated into two persons, but one and the same Son only begotten God Word, Lord Jesus Christ,* just as from the beginning the prophets taught about Him and the Lord Jesus Himself taught us, and the creed of our fathers has handed down to us.¹⁰⁶

2.2 THE KENOTIC THEORIES OF THE 18TH AND 19TH CENTURIES

After the Council of Chalcedon kenosis continued to be an important element in Christian living and was not considered for formal theological reflection. The limits of Chalcedon were considered normative and left as such. Though the period from the 5th to the 18th century did not see any theological reflection regarding the Kenosis, we cannot deny the fact that the self-emptying of Christ continued to be a theme in popular

¹⁰⁵ EVANS, STEPHEN C. *Exploring Kenotic Christology...*, p. 251.

¹⁰⁶ DENZINGER, H. - DEFERRARI, R. J. - RAHNER, K. *The Sources of Catholic dogma*, Herder Book Co.: St. Louis 1954, p. 61

devotions, liturgy and spiritual writings.¹⁰⁷ Notable among those who used the kenosis was Bernard of Clairvaux. In the self-emptying descent of Christ and the ascent which followed he provided a pattern for spiritual life. Besides this it was also present in the traditional piety of the *Modern Devotion* which emphasized the humanity of Christ

The general Catholic position used the kenotic motif for spiritual, liturgical and other devotional purposes, but avoided using it as matter for theological reflection. However during the 18th and 19th centuries other Christian denominations would develop the 'Kenotic Theories' to better understand the Christian faith within a fast changing world. In this section we shall briefly try to understand the factors which led to the emergence of these theories, the major proponents, their criticisms and some concluding remarks.

2.2.1 BACKGROUND AND EFFORT OF THE KENOTIC THEORIES

The origin of the kenotic theory can be traced to the debates between the universities of Giessen and Tübingen regarding the use of divine attributes during Christ's earthly ministry.¹⁰⁸ Besides these debates, there were various other causes for the emergence of the Kenotic Theories which included the reform movements, new philosophical currents, development of historical sciences and the emergence of greater human consciousness.

The reform movements such as Lutheranism,¹⁰⁹ Calvinism¹¹⁰ and the Pietistic

¹⁰⁷ It would be important to highlight the importance given to kenosis by Bernard of Clairvaux. (*Bernard of Clairvaux – Selected Works*, (Tr. Evans, G. R. – Leclercq, Jean – Cousins, Ewert H.), Paulist Press: New York, 1987, pp. 35-38.) A pattern for spiritual life is seen in the descent and glorification of Christ whereby a soul who desires to grow in spiritual life ought to follow the same pattern. There is a desire in the human person to ascent, but this has been warped by sin. It is only by accepting lowliness and humiliations like Christ that a person can truly ascend. This is beautifully elaborated in his *Sermon on the Song of the Songs*.

¹⁰⁸ Cf. THOMAS, MOLY. *Christology in Context – Kenotic perspectives*, Intercultural publications: Delhi, 2005, p. 51. The Tübingen school which believed in the *krypsis*, held that Christ used his divine powers in secret while the Giessen school believed that Christ abstained from the use of divine attributes all together. Both these schools believed that Christ possessed the divine attributes, and the only question was whether Christ used them in secret or otherwise.

¹⁰⁹ Luther would bring to the fore the servant form of God and shift it away from what he thought had been the propagation of a terrible and wrathful form of God. His would insist that all the divine powers were assumed in the earthly Jesus and that Christ saves humanity because of a sharing in his mankind. Christ is to be worshipped as God even in His humiliation and suffering. (Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form of ...*, pp. 67-70.)

¹¹⁰ Calvin 'posits a kenosis of power that runs beyond the Son's exaltation after death until all the purposes of salvation have been

movement provided new theological perspectives. These movements basically remained faithful to the definition of Chalcedon but began to present different interpretations of fundamental theological positions. Some reformed theologians reversed the traditional trend of beginning with the attributes of God and then moving on to the person of Christ. They preferred to begin with the humiliation of Christ and took a more historical approach. Evangelical Piety would speak not only of submission to physical condition but a change in Jesus' own consciousness and an acceptance of human limitation. The humility of Christ was used as an aid to help the individual live a life of humility and self-sacrifice.¹¹¹

The other set of causes included new philosophical currents as well as the emergence of historical sciences during the period of the Enlightenment. New philosophical currents raised doubts about the traditional understanding of metaphysics and the role of reason in all human knowing. Immanuel Kant had already spoken about the limits of human knowledge and Friedrich Schleiermacher had insisted on the importance of human experience.¹¹² The emergence of the historical sciences during the period of Enlightenment questioned the historicity of Sacred Scriptures.¹¹³

History was now an important factor and had become an important category in theological thought and concern.¹¹⁴ The rise of scholarly and critical studies led to greater knowledge regarding the historical dimension of the person of Christ. This in turn led to a greater accent on Christ's humanity in theological reflection as against the

accomplished.' According to him the kenosis did not result in the loss of divine power. He held that there was a clear distinction between the human and divine and that in the kenosis the divine glory is hidden. However his nuanced position on the final coming of Christ led later theologians to indicate that in the Incarnation there has been some change in the divine nature. This position of Calvin could be taken to mean that in the exaltation Jesus has not yet attained full divine status. (Cf. BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, pp. 26-27.)

¹¹¹ Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, pp. 78-84.

¹¹² Cf. BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, pp. 36-38.

¹¹³ Cf. THOMAS, MOLY. *Christology in...*, p. 52. 'The forms of thinking developed in the Enlightenment era raised serious objections against classical Christology, attacking the orthodoxy of both Protestant and Catholic theology. Modern historical science questioned the historicity of Scripture, and the application of historical-critical methods revolutionized Christological thought.'

¹¹⁴ Cf. THOMSON, THOMAS R. "Nineteenth century Kenotic Christology – The waxing, waning and weighing of a quest for a Coherent Orthodoxy", *Exploring Kenotic Christology...*, p. 76.

earlier emphasis on the divinity of Christ.¹¹⁵ Along with the emergence of the historical-critical there was a new emerging realization of human consciousness. This self-consciousness led to a definitive shift towards anthropocentrism and its influence was noticeable in Christology.¹¹⁶

Anthropocentrism along with rise in the historical-critical method, led to the emergence of a new form of human consciousness which led thinkers to persistently highlight the metaphysical impossibility of the unity of human and divine natures as well as raise questions regarding the consciousness of Christ. The progress seen in various disciplines led to a situation which was unparalleled in the history of the Church. The divinity of Christ as defined at Chalcedon was challenged by growing knowledge of the historical Jesus as revealed in the emerging research. It could be said that the situation was as significant as the encounter of the early Church with Hellenistic culture.

As a response to this situation there emerged three positions – those who were skeptical of the orthodox Christian faith, those who refused to take into account new challenges and a third group which looked for some way of interpreting the orthodox Christian faith keeping in mind the new challenges. This third group was called the Mediating School who developed the Kenotic Christology whereby they tried to ‘mediate this new historical accent on Christ’s humanity with the confessions of the past.’¹¹⁷ The kenotic theologians used the kenotic motif in order to accommodate the humanity as well as defend the divinity of Christ.¹¹⁸ They thought that it was necessary to show that ‘God in some way had to limit himself so that the presence of the divine in

¹¹⁵ Some authors believe that the divinity of Christ is considered to have been over-emphasized by Patristic writers. Hence this shift towards the historical dimension of Christology with its concomitant focus on Christ’s humanity within the realm of theological reflection was a new direction within Christian theology.

¹¹⁶ Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, p. 88. ‘...it was the anthropocentric nature of the consciousness of Western man that was to be decisive for the growth of religious thought. The starting point for religious thought was not to be an unquestioned revelation given in Scripture or Church dogmas. For man had started to question and evaluate revelation by rational criteria and historical study. Revelation was to be approached rationally and experientially. Church dogma and even Scripture itself were reevaluated on these grounds. The whole Christological question was reopened in the most radical way.’

¹¹⁷ THOMSON, THOMAS R. “Nineteenth-century...”, p. 77.

¹¹⁸ Cf. THOMAS, MOLY. *Christology in Context...*, p. 53.

Jesus did not destroy the human dimension of his personhood.¹¹⁹ Kenosis thus required a real self-limiting, relinquishing and emptying of some divine attributes.

The theologians who proposed the kenotic theory were primarily from Germany and later on from England. This trend influenced theological reflection for nearly seven decades during the 19th century and would go on to play an important role in theologically interpreting the experiences of the 20th century. In the following section we shall briefly look at some of the important proponents of kenotic Christology during this period. We shall highlight the contribution of each person and critically evaluate them. At the end of this section we shall indicate some of the positive and negative fallouts of the kenotic theories.

2.2.2 THE GERMAN CONTRIBUTION TO THE KENOTIC THEORY

2.2.2.1 Gottfried Thomasius (1802 – 1875)

The most important contribution within the German theologians would come from Gottfried Thomasius. He tried to respond to the emerging historical-critical trends and new understanding of personhood by situating 'his kenotic approach to Christology within a setting of loyalty to Scripture and to the traditions of the Church.'¹²⁰ He believed that dualism affects the essentials of our faith and therefore tried to safeguard the full divinity of Christ, the full humanity of Christ and the unity of both. The area of his reflection was mainly the metaphysical question of the being of God present in the historical person of Christ.¹²¹

He took forward the 16th century debate between Giessen and Tübingen and began with the traditional formulation whereby the second person assumed a human nature. He would insist that in the Incarnation an actual kenosis took place.¹²² In the

¹¹⁹ Cf. LUCIEN J. RICHARD. *A Kenotic Christology – In the Humanity of Jesus Christ, the compassion of our God.* University of America: Washington, 1982, p. 158.

¹²⁰ BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, p. 43.

¹²¹ Cf. THOMAS, MOLY. *Christology in context...*, p. 59.

¹²² Cf. THOMSON, THOMAS R. "Nineteenth-Century...", pp. 80-81. '(In the Incarnation)...the second member of the Trinity, the divine Logos, assumed a human nature... The Logos appropriated a generic human nature fraught with all the weaknesses of

kenosis the Logos was limited to become the personal center of the man Jesus¹²³ and the entire New Testament is witness to the actual kenosis of Christ.

In the theology of Thomasius experience had a central place and Scriptures reveals to us the experience of an encounter between humanity and God.¹²⁴ The experience of God in our lives is possible because we have been made in the image of God.¹²⁵ It is this capacity which allows the Incarnation to take place because God would not have been able to become 'something wholly other than himself.'¹²⁶ The eternal God thus engages in a process of actual self-limitation to become a historical person in Jesus.¹²⁷ Thomasius insisted that there was an actual change in the divinity in order to highlight the humanity of Jesus Christ. This led to difficulties because it challenged the traditional understanding of divine immutability and raised serious difficulties regarding the attributes of God.¹²⁸

Thomasius would re-interpret divine immutability and challenged the strict ontological unchangeability of divine attributes.¹²⁹ He divided the attributes into two categories - immanent attributes and relational attributes, insisting that the change in the divinity took place in the relational attributes, while the immanent attributes remain

the flesh so as to be fully homogeneous with our own existence as conditioned by sin, but not volitionally determined by it... (However) the language and conceptuality of assumption does not go far enough to secure the historical person of the Logos. An actual kenosis is also necessary...'

¹²³ Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, p. 93.

¹²⁴ Further elaborating the point of experience he indicates that while sharing Schleiermacher's view of 'a single unified consciousness in Christ', he prefers to have as his 'starting point ...the movement of the divine to the human, (and) not, as in Schleiermacher, the perfect human's unclouded consciousness of the divine'. BROWN, DAVID. *Divine...*, p. 44.

¹²⁵ His position whereby the human person is able to experience the divine is strongly supported by the Christian tradition. This despite the fact that some others such as Kierkegaard and Barth would insist on a radical otherness between the divine and human. However it has been often affirmed that human dignity is based on the human person being created in God's image. (Cf. BROWN, DAVID. *Divine...*, p. 46.)

¹²⁶ Cf. IBID., p. 46.

¹²⁷ It must be pointed out that the theologians of the Kenotic theory were unanimous in highlighting the fact that the self-emptying of Christ in Incarnation took place for a soteriological purpose. Thomasius would stress on the actual divesting of the divine in order to that the historical person, Jesus Christ is a mediator. (Cf. THOMSON, THOMAS R. "Nineteenth-Century...", p. 81.

¹²⁸ The Incarnation did not result in the creation of a new person, but it only led to an assumption of human nature and for this assumption a process of self-emptying was necessary. As long as the assumption of human nature took place without any substantial change in the divinity, there was no difficulty.

¹²⁹ Cf. THOMSON, THOMAS R. "Nineteenth-Century..." p. 84.

unchanged.¹³⁰ He spoke of two moments of kenosis – one of self-emptying and another of self-humbling. Through the kenosis, God choose to engage in a process of self-limitation of the relational attributes.¹³¹ This would be done by explaining the difference between essence and attribute as well as between potency and actuality.¹³²

Thomasius redefined the understanding of divine immutability and indicated that the absoluteness of God is not in its changelessness, but the ability to change.¹³³ God is fully divine and even in the historical manifestation in the person of Jesus, the divinity continues to be absolute power and absolute truth.¹³⁴ The motive behind the kenosis that results in the Incarnation is love and it is love for the creature that prompts this historical decision.¹³⁵ Thomasius indicates that we need to get out of the idea that the fundamental element of the Divinity is power. Rather it is goodness which is most important in the hierarchy of attributes. Christian revelation is not a revelation of brute power, but the power of love and it is in powerlessness that God is discovered.¹³⁶

The kenotic theory of Thomasius would be a serious attempt to understand the Kenosis of God within a newly emerging society. However there were serious inconsistencies and criticisms against this theory. An important criticism would be

¹³⁰ DAWE, DONALD. *The Form of...*, p. 97. 'The immanent attributes are the attributes of God considered in and by himself. They are power, truth, holiness and love. These attributes spring out of God's inner-relatedness as a Trinity. ...These immanent attributes reflect what God is in himself. ... They are what characterize God as God. On the other hand, the relational attributes of God are omnipotence, omniscience, and omnipresence. These attributes are expression of God's relation to the created order. ... They are the result of a relationship into which God has freely chosen to enter and from which he can withdraw.'

¹³¹ Cf. THOMAS, MOLY. *Theology in...*, pp. 69-70.

¹³² Thomasius would insist that divine essence is one and it refers to God's will or self-determination. As far as potency and actuality is concerned, he would say that in the Incarnation the Logos relinquishes the divine glory actually and only has it potentially. (Cf. THOMSON, THOMAS R. "Nineteenth-Century...", p. 82.)

¹³³ DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, p. 94. 'The absoluteness of God is not found, then, in changelessness but in his ability to change. God is most fully God in his power to modify himself freely, even to the point of limitation. The kenosis is the expression of God's ability to self-determining in response to his will of love for mankind.'

¹³⁴ This is when absolute power is understood as the freedom of self-determination and absolute truth is the knowledge of the incarnate one concerning one's own essence and the will of the Father. (Cf. BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, p. 50)

¹³⁵ In the opinion of Thomasius, the classical understanding of immutability that stressed the omni-attributes, endangers God's freedom to love 'and makes absolute power into impotence.' THOMASIUS, GOTTFRIED. "Christ's Person and Work," p. 99. (Quoted by THOMAS, MOLY. *Christology...*, p. 75.)

¹³⁶ Cf. BROWN, DAVID. *The Form...*, pp. 53-54.

related to the doctrine of the Trinity where it would be argued that the ‘members of the Trinity are so closely related to one another that a limitation of one is really a limitation of all.’¹³⁷ The actual limitation of the divinity would also be challenged on the grounds that there was nothing unessential in the divine, and hence the totality of the divinity had to be present in the Incarnation.¹³⁸ Yet another criticism would be related to the governance function of the Logos during the time that the Logos was incarnate and had an earthly existence.¹³⁹

2.2.2.2 Other German Theologians

Bp. H. Martensen (1808-1884) stressed on experience, on Scriptures and the tradition of the Church. He believed that the central divine attribute was love and underlined the soteriological function of Christ. He distinguished between the revelation of the Logos which is present everywhere and the revelation of Christ where the revelation of the eternal Logos takes place in a special and personal way.¹⁴⁰

Martensen would thus speak of two centers of consciousness – one in heaven and another on earth. He would insist on the need that in order to save us, the Logos had to become fully human. He would also highlight the real modification of attributes and at the same time insist on unity. Despite his attempt to express his theological inclination by using the kenotic theory, he was criticized of veering towards Nestorianism because of his insistence on two centers of consciousness. His insistence on the divine and human as being two separate beings once again indicated the difficulty of reconciling the

¹³⁷ DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, p. 95.

¹³⁸ Cf. IBID.

¹³⁹ Two responses would be offered for this criticism – the first one being that the governance was carried on by the Trinity. However this argument is not really tenable because it seems to be some kind of division of labor within the Trinity. The second argument would be that the governance function continued in the Incarnate Christ because in engaging in a redemptive act, the Logos was actually fulfilling its essential function.

¹⁴⁰ Cf. THOMSON, THOMAS R. “Nineteenth-Century...”, p. 87. ‘*The kenosis consists in the self-limitation or concentration of the Logos in the man Jesus as the Christ revelation – the revelation of the Logos in limited human form and weakness. But while the Logos in the Christ revelation is encompassed within the concrete bounds of a human life, his revelation in nature is not diminished.*’

divine and human in the person of Jesus Christ.¹⁴¹

W.F.Gess (1819-1891) almost exclusively focused on Scriptures and insisted that the Logos became fully human. In the kenosis all divine attributes were relinquished and the pre-existent Word becomes literally flesh. Christ identifies with us as a brother and lived like a human person. The Son gains consciousness of the divine identity and mission only in the gradual course of human existence. His life consisted in a filial dependence on the Father and the power of the Holy Spirit. The criticism obviously related to the divine dimension of Jesus Christ. According to him, only the Father has an independence existence, while Christ has a derived existence. In order to explain the world governing functions he would go on to suggest that when the Logos emptied himself, the Father handed the world ruling function to the Spirit.¹⁴²

J. H. Ebrard (1818-1888), avoided the two separate consciousness of Martensen and the total identification with humanity as seen in Gess. He felt that there was need to maintain the unity and absoluteness of God and therefore interpreted 'kenosis as the transformation of all the divine attributes of the Logos into a form compatible with a true human life.'¹⁴³ All the immanent and relational attributes are present and continue to function at an unconscious level. In this way he was able to respond to the contradiction between the governing function of the Logos and the limitedness that is evident from the historical and critical study of Jesus Christ as revealed in scripture.¹⁴⁴

A biblical scholar who was a proponent of the kenotic theory was Fedric L. Godet (1812-1900). Unlike the trend of focusing on Philippians, 2.7-11, he contended that the Gospel of John too spoke about kenosis.¹⁴⁵ He preferred to understand this Gospel in a

¹⁴¹ Cf. BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, pp. 55-62.

¹⁴² Cf. BROWN DAVID., *Divine Humanity...*, pp. 64-68; Cf. THOMSON, THOMAS R. "Nineteenth-Century...", p. 87; Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, p. 100.

¹⁴³ IBID., p. 101.

¹⁴⁴ He is able to overcome the criticism of orthodox Christology which at times has tried to show how the humanity of Jesus was responsible for governing the world. However he has in some way compromised on the unity of the personhood of Jesus Christ by positing two levels of functionality within one person and once again would run the risk of being criticized like Martinesen.

¹⁴⁵ This point is important because it was generally held that the Synoptics clearly indicated the kenosis of God by

literal manner rather than a symbolic manner and indicated that the fullness of the Godhead was in the Ascension. In the Incarnation, we have a fully human life and this humanity helps us to know of higher levels of intimacy with God and participate in Divine Life. However the problem with this kenotic theory would be that it would be difficult to speak of Jesus Christ being like one of us after what is narrated of him subsequent to His baptism.

2.2.3 THE ENGLISH CONTRIBUTION TO THE KENOTIC THEORY

The influence of the kenotic theories proposed by the German theologians would have its echo in Scotland and England. In this section we shall highlight some important contributors of the kenotic theory and provide a detailed explanation of the perspective provided by P.T.Forsyth, H.R.Mackintosh from the Scottish side and Charles Gore from England. They depended on the Continental theologians, but were not mere copies. They wanted to avoid an exaggerated use of reason and desired to be more focused on an empirical study of the Bible.¹⁴⁶

2.2.3.1 P. T. Forsyth (1848 - 1921)

P.T. Forsyth was a Scottish theologian who believed in the centrality of Scripture and gave importance to experience.¹⁴⁷ He held that theological thought had been unduly influenced by abstract ontological thought and considered it important to restate Christianity in personal and moral terms.¹⁴⁸ He believed that both God and man are moral beings where one is a potential moral being and the other is an actual moral being.

highlighting the humanity of God, whereas the Gospel of John focused primarily on the divinity of God. Yet the Gospel of John too begins with the text indicating that the Word became flesh and hence is very kenotic in nature.

¹⁴⁶ Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, p. 127-28.

¹⁴⁷ Though he focused on Scripture and experience, he did not discard the importance of reason. He learnt about evolution, engaged with the historical method and used the available tools for research. However he did not believe in research for research sake. Rather he believed that the knowledge gained through modern scientific, historical and biblical research ought to help us become better Christians.. Cf. BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, p. 110.

¹⁴⁸ DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, p. 132. 'The basic key for understanding Christian doctrine is found in the unique moral experience of forgiveness through Jesus Christ. Christian faith can only be comprehended in terms of what it is - a personal moral experience based on Christ. Speculative philosophical language is incapable of setting forth Christian faith by its very nature. It is abstract and impersonal. Ontological thought is characterized by logical necessity rather than moral choice. Only as Christian faith is thought about in personalistic and moral terms can its uniqueness be set forth.'

God and man are united by the mutual action of the will and the wills are one when they are fixed on one common moral objective.¹⁴⁹ The Kenotic Project was therefore envisaged as part of a new programme to rethink Christian doctrine which consisted in the moralizing of dogma. Doctrine had to be taken out of the speculative world and become part of actual lived experience.¹⁵⁰ With this end in mind Forsyth would emphasize that Christianity was not a debate on two natures, but faith in a person – i.e. Jesus Christ.

In explaining the Kenotic theory, he used various analogies that aimed to show that there had been a voluntary abandoning of divine prerogatives.¹⁵¹ The abandonment of divine prerogatives was not an abandonment as such, but the abandonment of the exercise of these attributes. Despite the fact that he focused on the moral dimension of being a Christian, he was also concerned about upholding the single consciousness of Christ whereby 'the divine consciousness of the eternal Son can limit itself to the finite form and still retain continuity with its pre-incarnate form.'¹⁵²

In order to respond to this issue, he combined Ebrard who avoided the distinction of attributes and Thomasius who upheld the importance of self-limitation.¹⁵³ Forsyth re-interpreted the meaning of omnipotence not as the presence of brute power to do anything but as absolute freedom in order to fulfill the demands of God's love. This freedom is manifested in the ability to accept limitation, to become humble and fulfill the soteriological function.¹⁵⁴

¹⁴⁹ Cf. *IBID.*, p. 140.

¹⁵⁰ Cf. *IBID.*, p. 131.

¹⁵¹ BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, p. 112. 'Forsyth offers four human analogies, each of which over time might produce loss of a former capacity. Divine oblivion of the past might be like a vizier knowingly taking poison intended for his foolish ruler; a musical genius in Russia abandoning his instrument to serve the poor; a brilliant philosophy student giving up his studies to support his family; or even like our own forgetting of self-interest in the attempt to follow conscience and truth.'

¹⁵² DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, p. 134.

¹⁵³ In following Ebrard, he disapproved the separation of attributes into groups because divine life and action is unitary. Instead of using the word self-emptying, he preferred to speak of self-reduction or self-retraction. In following Thomasius, he would uphold the importance of self-limitation and interpreted it as an indication of self-determination.

¹⁵⁴ In this context he would go on to indicate how true omnipotence is in the ability to determine oneself and the

God's self-limitation led to a total participation in the human condition which includes the temptation to sin and this kenosis of God has as its consequence the plerosis or fullness. To the argument that a participation in the human condition would have to include a participation in sin, Forsyth would respond that 'sin and guilt as such do not belong to true humanity.'¹⁵⁵ Forsyth was convinced 'that kenosis is also pleroma, that the self-emptying was also fulfilment and completion.'¹⁵⁶ To understand the kenosis merely as self-emptying or self-limitation would be a partial understanding of the kenosis.¹⁵⁷ This Christological shift would influence the way kenosis was understood in the 20th century.¹⁵⁸ Instead of being focused on two natures in one person, 'we have two movements meeting: the divine descent and the incarnate human rising to the divine.'¹⁵⁹ The person of Christ would thus embody the search of God for man and man's search for God.

Though Forsyth would reach an important and interesting Christological position, he then becomes enigmatic in his explanation. Therefore two important problems arise: a) his Christological positions and b) the Trinity. His Christology veers towards Nestorianism and seems to speak of two persons in Jesus Christ. He himself acknowledges the limitations of his proposal, and prefers to avoid further speculations because of a conviction that 'knowledge of Christ lies ultimately in the saving experience and worship of Christ.'¹⁶⁰

highest power is manifested in God's ability to accept the limitations of human life and yet not become unlike himself. (Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, pp. 134-137.)

¹⁵⁵ Man who is made in God's image is a moral being and temptation is the condition of moral freedom. Temptation is therefore part of empirical humanity, but is itself not sin. Christ who was totally free, shared in the temptation to sin and struggled like any other human person. 'His inability to sin remained unknown to him until his life's end (and therefore) each struggle was real as far as it was known to his conscious mind.' *IBID.*, pp. 137-38.

¹⁵⁶ BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, p. 113.

¹⁵⁷ Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, pp. 138-39. The twin realities of self-emptying and self-fulfilment are manifested in the person of Christ. In his opinion kenosis and plerosis are the very being of His life. He would attempt a redefinition of Christology with the paradox of kenosis-plerosis. Forsyth maintains that in Christ we witness the fulfilment of the kenosis-plerosis wherein the divine initiative of God longs to united itself with the human person's longing for fulfilment.

¹⁵⁸ Cf. BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, p. 113.

¹⁵⁹ *IBID.*

¹⁶⁰ Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, pp. 139-41.

2.2.3.2 H.R.Mackintosh (1870 - 1936)

H.R. Mackintosh made a distinction between the kenotic principle and its various forms of articulation. He felt the need to defend the kenotic principle, but not its various forms of articulation. He accepted the Chalcedonian formula, but highlighted two negative aspects – an incredible and thoroughgoing dualism and a depreciation of the humanity of Christ.¹⁶¹ He was critical of the influence of Docetism in the history of Christianity and biblical criticism of the modern era was a welcome relief.¹⁶²

He continued with the tradition of Forsyth and stressed on the moral dimension that was commended by Forsyth and agreed that the primary issue that should interest a theologian should be spiritual and not philosophical. While he agreed with Thomasius that the pillars of Christology can only be held together by kenosis, he did not agree with the division of relative and immanent attributes.¹⁶³ However he was sympathetic to Thomasius because his 'Christological form represents the first significant articulation of the (kenotic) principle.'¹⁶⁴

Mackintosh along with others advocated the kenotic theories in which the divine attributes were laid aside.¹⁶⁵ He wanted to maintain a unified consciousness and believed that 'an unqualified equation of Christ and God can be fully justified and explained under kenotic assumptions.'¹⁶⁶ He partially accepted 'real limitations in Christ's self-consciousness' and found it to be 'an effective way of dealing with more radical biblical criticism.'¹⁶⁷

Mackintosh was attracted by the dimension of divine love as highlighted by the

¹⁶¹ Cf. THOMPSON, THOMAS R. "Nineteenth-Century...", pp. 88-90.

¹⁶² BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, p. 118.

¹⁶³ In his opinion, the omni-attributes are necessary and in the Incarnation the omni-attributes are transformed from a state of actuality to a state of potency.

¹⁶⁴ THOMPSON, THOMAS R. "Nineteenth-Century...", p. 88.

¹⁶⁵ Unlike earlier speculative reflections on the Incarnation which were apriori, he believed in a theological reasoning that was more a posteriori so as to have a more accurate interpretation of the historical fact of the Incarnation.

¹⁶⁶ BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, p. 120.

¹⁶⁷ *IBID.* p. 119.

kenosis.¹⁶⁸ Like Thomasius he would redefine immutability, but his understanding of immutability is 'love'. While Thomasius indicated that the motive of the kenosis is love and the immutable dimension is the self-determining will of God; Mackintosh insisted that both the motive as well as the immutable dimension of God is love. In his book *The Person of Jesus Christ* he indicates how the essential element in the kenosis is love.

What is immutable in God is the holy love which makes His essence. We must let Infinitude be genuinely infinite in its moral expedients; we must credit God with infinite sacrifice based on His self-consciousness of omnipotence. We must believe that the love of God is "an almighty love in the sense that it is capable of limiting itself, and while an end, becoming also a means, to an extent adequate to all love's infinite ends. This self-renouncing, self-retracting act of the Son's will, this reduction of Himself from the supreme end to be the supreme means for the soul, is no negation of His nature; it is the opposite, it is the last assertion of His nature as love.¹⁶⁹

'Kenosis is an expression – better, the supreme expression – of divine love, it is wholly consistent with who God is and therefore no violation of divine immutability'.¹⁷⁰ He carried forward a dynamic perspective of the kenosis as indicated by Forsyth and preferred 'the notion of two movements coinciding in Christ'.¹⁷¹ Christ manifests this divine love because in Him 'God and man are one ...not from formal juxtaposition of abstract natures, but from spiritually costly experiences of reciprocal possession and coalescence.'¹⁷²

Like other kenotic theories, Mackintosh's theory would also receive its fair share of criticisms. Regarding his Christology it can be said that while he underlines the humanity of Christ, he is rather silent about the divinity of Christ. The argument that

¹⁶⁸ THOMPSON, THOMAS R. "Nineteenth-Century...", p. 90. This quote contains another quote from MACKINTOSH, H.R. *The Person of Jesus Christ*, Student Christian Movement: London, 1925, pp. 90-91. (Rpr) '...what really attracts and impels Mackintosh to embrace (the kenotic principle) is the way kenosis accentuates the lengths to which divine love suffered for human salvation... it is not that divine love cannot be manifested apart from the Incarnation, he asserts, 'It is rather that, apart from Incarnation His love is not exhibited so amazingly'. This display of love in and through identification with the human condition, he contends, can only be truly appreciated by a kenotic model of Christ's person.'

¹⁶⁹ MACKINTOSH, H. R. *The Doctrine of the Person of Christ*, T.T. & Clark: Edinburg, 1951, p.473. (In this quote we can see that Mackintosh is including an important text from J.K.Mozley who reviewed Forsyth in the *Journal of Theological Studies*, 1911, pp. 313-14.)

¹⁷⁰ THOMPSON, THOMAS R. "Nineteenth-Century...", p. 93

¹⁷¹ BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, p. 118.

¹⁷² MACKINTOSH, H. R. *The Person...*, p. 371.

some attributes remained with Christ, but only in potential form led to various criticisms. Besides the Christological criticism, the doctrine of the Trinity was also criticized. The suggestion that during the humiliation some of the functions were taken up by other persons of the Trinity was also not tenable.¹⁷³

2.2.3.3 Charles Gore (1853 - 1932)

Charles Gore was an Anglican theologian¹⁷⁴ and believed that there was no need to divorce pious regard for Scripture and biblical criticism. An important publication which pushed him into the kenotic theory was a publication in *Lux Mundi* in 1889. In it he spoke about progressive development in Scripture and also highlighted biblical fallibility. He also refused to apply the same principles of criticism and development to the Old Testament and the New Testament.¹⁷⁵

Unlike other Scottish theologians, he hardly provides any reference to experience and stressed on a single consciousness of Christ. Like other English speaking kenotic theologians, he was less interested in speculation and more inclined towards devotional concerns. For him kenotic Christology was in fact biblical doctrine that helped integrate the gospel picture of Jesus. In the kenosis, there was an abandonment of divine attributes – in fact an abandonment of the exercise of divine attributes. The self-emptying was real and the Son of God participated in human conditions and limitations in a real way.¹⁷⁶

In the Incarnation, he emphasized the self-limitation of the Logos and highlighted

¹⁷³ Cf. THOMPSON, THOMAS R. "Nineteenth-Century..." p. 94.

¹⁷⁴ Gore was a rationalist and he believed in the power of reason. His interest in physical sciences led him to take seriously the theory of evolution and human sciences taught him the historical method. He did not believe in research for research sake but considered that it had to serve the cause of improving the quality of the life of a Christian. (Cf. THOMAS, MOLY. *Christology in...*, p. 83.)

¹⁷⁵ Cf. BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, pp. 134-135.

¹⁷⁶ Cf. THOMAS, MOLY. *Christology in...*, pp. 86-89. Dawe explains the position of Gore by saying that: '...Jesus' knowledge was limited. Specifically, Jesus was unaware of historical inaccuracies in the Old Testament. Jesus accepted the commonly held views on the Old Testament of a first-century Jew. Gore suggested that such limitation is not inconsistent with Christ's divinity. During his earthly ministry Christ had accepted a limitation upon his divine omniscience. As a true human being, Jesus shared human limitations in knowledge.' DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, p. 129.

its necessity in order to show the divinity of Christ.¹⁷⁷ He further explained that the moral dimension of God and the human person is intrinsically linked to the Incarnation. He endorsed the theory of evolution and said that despite the fall we are called to higher moral destiny. The Incarnation too is presented within this framework whereby it is indicated that the moral character within the human person makes possible the Incarnation.¹⁷⁸ Similarly 'in the occurrence of the Incarnation lies the supreme evidence of the real moral likeness of man to God.'¹⁷⁹

Gore believed that the Incarnation reveals the personality of love and the expression of this love is seen in the creation of human persons who are called to fellowship with God. Thus the central motive of the Incarnation is love which is a deliberate act of God in order to effect the recover and perfection of humanity.¹⁸⁰ However his Christology was criticized as being similar to Nestorianism.¹⁸¹ He upheld historical and biblical criticism, but desired to be faithful to the orthodox positions of Christology.¹⁸² His position led to incongruences in the doctrine of the Trinity. Different yardsticks for the Old and New Testament would also be the cause of criticism.¹⁸³

¹⁷⁷ Gore was of the opinion that humiliation and self-limitation was compatible with continued exercise of cosmic function. He highlights the limitation of Jesus' knowledge and speaks of the real participation of Jesus in our humanity. To reconcile the ignorance and limitedness of Jesus with the divinity of Christ, Gore proposes the kenotic theory as an explanation. He believes that for kenosis to be real, actual ignorance was necessary and limitations was compatible with His divinity. (Cf. THOMAS, MOLY. *Christology...*, pp. 96-97.)

¹⁷⁸ As indicated at an earlier point, what makes the human person the image and likeness of God is the moral character. God is the fullness of morality, while the human person is the same in potency.

¹⁷⁹ BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, p. 136. (quoting GORE, C. *The Incarnation of the Son of God*, John Murray: London, 1903, p. vii.)

¹⁸⁰ Cf. THOMAS, MOLY. *Christology in...*, pp. 88, 92-93. 'Gore believes that 'God declares His almighty power most chiefly in such an act of voluntary self-limitation for the purpose of sympathy... it is the higher power of love which is shown in self-effacement.' ...Sympathy does not mean 'mutability' rather 'self-adaptiveness', the movement of real spiritual life. The idea of self-sacrifice, resulting from love, is a key concept permeating all of Gore's Christology.' (IBID., p. 105.)

¹⁸¹ His position was similar to Martensen and he posited that the Logos led a dual life and that the self-emptying of the Logos was partial. (Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form...*, pp. 129-30.)

¹⁸² Gore did not feel the need to provide a fully coherent and rational presentation of the self-emptying of Christ. We need to recall that for Gore, the kenotic theory only explained part of the Christological mystery and was not the ultimate solution for all doctrinal situations. He was therefore content to use kenosis to explain the humanity of Christ. (Cf. IBID., p.130)

¹⁸³ Cf. BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity...*, p. 141.

2.2.4 CRITICISMS OF THE KENOTIC THEORY

The Kenotic theory was criticized for various reasons¹⁸⁴ by both Protestant and Catholic theologians. Francis Hall, an ardent critic of the Kenotic Theory, while respecting the theologians would point out to various inconsistencies related to the divinity of Christ. He said:

...We do not doubt for a moment the honesty of those kenoticists who assert their belief in Christ's Divinity. But we are convinced that they are inconsistent. They do not appear to see the logic of their position. The Divine nature is to be recognized as Divine only because of its possessing certain determinate attributes. ... (which include) omnipotence, omnipresence, and omniscience. ... If Christ ceased to possess any of the distinctive attributes of the Divine nature, He ceased to possess the Divine nature, and was no longer God. To remain truly Divine, Christ must be "whole in what was His" as well as "whole in what was ours."¹⁸⁵

He would go on to criticize the kenoticists of being too 'rationalistic', of having compromised on the major fundamentals of the Christian faith – i.e. the doctrine of Incarnation, the Trinity and the understanding of the Divine Mission.¹⁸⁶ 100 years later, Thomas R. Thompson provides a more synthetic explanation of what went wrong with the Kenotic Theory. He indicates that there were objections from theologians who held contrasting positions. Some considered that the kenoticists' statements were

'deficient on deity, humanity or unipersonhood and so on... They perceived in the kenotic theory a mitigation of the event of salvation – that is, the dubious implication of the kenotically weakened Son for his redemptive work and this caused them grave concern. ... Kenotic Christology was (also) cited for violating the doctrine of divine immutability... (Now) if kenotic Christology does not adequately account for the deity of the incarnate, earthly Christ, then this constitutes, quite obviously, a violation of the doctrine of the Trinity.'¹⁸⁷

There were those who believed that the kenotic theories did not go far enough

¹⁸⁴ The sources for the criticism and the panoramic view that will be provided in the next point have been developed using the following sources - *Exploring Kenotic Christology* (ed. Evans, C. Stephen), pp. 95-111; LUCIEN, RICHARD J. *A Kenotic Christology*, pp. 158-190; DAWE, DONALD *The Form of a Servant*, pp. 144-176; THOMAS, MOLY *Christology in Context – Kenotic perspectives*, pp. 113-218 and POWER, DAVID NOEL *Love Without Calculation – A Reflection on Divine Kenosis*, pp. 38-60.

¹⁸⁵ HALL, FRANCIS JOSEPH. *The Kenotic Theory – Considered with Particular Reference to its Anglican Form and Arguments*, Longmans, Green, and Co.: London, 1898, pp. 222-223. (Reprint by Bibliolife)

¹⁸⁶ *IBID.*, pp. 221-239.

¹⁸⁷ THOMPSON, THOMAS R. *Nineteenth-Century...*, pp. 95-98.

and fell short of actually re-interpreting Christology and the doctrine of God. The liberals resisted speculative inquiries and resisted 'the weedy intrusion of Greek philosophy into the pure soil of the Gospel.'¹⁸⁸ They advocated a shift to a Christology from below and considered the question of divinity only at the end. They believed that more importance ought to be given to the humanity of Christ and this is 'the non-negotiable Christological axiom with which the deity claim must contend.'¹⁸⁹ Though the kenotic theory in the strict sense was rejected by orthodox and liberal theologians, the Divine Kenosis has continued to be a central dimension in the theological debate during the last century.

2.3 KENOSIS AND CONTEMPRARY TRENDS

Though the Kenotic theory was heavily criticized and discarded, the Divine Kenosis continued to evoke a great deal of interest. During the 20 century the focus shifted from an inquiry about God's self-emptying which centered on divine attributes towards an inquiry which was centered on love.

There is a strong consensus among most recent interpreters, that kenosis ...does not mean that Christ stripped himself of his divine attributes in becoming human, but that 'emptying' refers to the manner of self-transcending love that led Christ, not to claim his rightful lordship, but to take on a human existence marked by humility and servanthood, ultimately expressed in his death for others. ...For some modern spiritual writers *kenosis* has been used as a term to refer to the process of self-transcendence (that) called for in authentic conversion of heart.¹⁹⁰

Modern interpretations of the divine kenosis help the human person identify with the person of Christ and at the same time does justice to the New Testament's presentation of Christ who fully shared the human condition.¹⁹¹ Though the metaphysical question has raised difficulties, many contemporary authors continue to hold on to the orthodox view which understands Jesus as both divine and human. They interpret the self-emptying of Christ within the context of love, thus allowing a person to

¹⁸⁸ IBID. p. 100.

¹⁸⁹ IBID, p. 101.

¹⁹⁰ SENIOR, DONALD. "Kenosis", *NDCS...*, p. 584.

¹⁹¹ EVANS, C. STEPHEN. *Exploring Kenotic Christology...*, p. 6.

experience the transformative power of Christ's humility.

Let us now examine the positions of some contemporary theologians. Despite the fact that Søren Kierkegaard was a philosopher we believe that his contribution had some influence on the theologians of the 20th century. This will be followed by highlighting four important theologians – Karl Barth, Sergei Bulgakov, Hans Urs Von Balthasar and Karl Rahner. Finally we shall end with some overall comments related to the understanding of the Divine Kenosis in our contemporary world.

2.3.1 SØREN KIERKEGAARD (1813 - 1855)

Kierkegaard differed totally from the earlier attempt to present Kenosis¹⁹² 'in relation to ...some historical or speculative reconstruction of Jesus' self-consciousness.'¹⁹³ His focus was not primarily on the metaphysical problem or doctrinal debates, but on the Divine Kenosis in its revelation of the very being of God. According to him the Divine Kenosis is a paradox against which all forms of metaphysical speculations and rationalizations were bound to fail. This is because the heart of Christianity was not about an abstract truth, but the person of Jesus Christ.

Christianity is not about abstract truth but about concrete and historical truth, i.e. the narrative of the humble human being Jesus in which we meet God. (Pap. IV C 35) Kierkegaard does not start with the doctrine of the two natures as an ontological given from which one can develop a doctrine of the divine and the human nature. Rather he starts with the enigmatic figure of Jesus Christ just like the gospels tell us about him, in a narrative framework. 'The real issue is that Jesus Christ be presented as he walked and tarried and lived 1,800 years ago.' (Pap. IX A 57; JP 321)¹⁹⁴

According to Kierkegaard, the paradox does not consist in merely juxtaposing two

¹⁹² He was a staunch opponent of both the mediating theologians and the Hegelian understanding of the Kenosis. For Kierkegaard, the human person was not in a position to know God and the idea that the human person was in the process of evolving to divine life was absurd. This put him in conflict with those who were Hegelians as well as the proponents of mysticism.

¹⁹³ DAWE, DONALD. *The Form of...*, p. 157.

¹⁹⁴ VOS, PIETER H. "Working Against Oneself – The Kenotic Character of Kierkegaard's Thought", *Letting Go – Rethinking Kenosis*, (Ed. Zijlstra, Onno), Peter Lang: Bern, 2002, p. 122. The abbreviation 'Pap.' refers to Kierkegaard's diaries: *Seren Kierkegaards Papirer* I-XI, eds. P.A. Heiberg, V. Kuhr, E. Torsting, København 1909-1948, a part of which has been translated as *Seren Kierkegaard's Journals and Papers* I-VII, (Eds. Howard V. Hong - Edna H. Hong - Gregor Malantschuk), Bloomington: London 1967-1978 and is represented by the initials (JP). (IBID., p. 114.)

abstract and opposing realities. Rather it is a concrete reality of Christ who chose to come into the world in order to suffer.¹⁹⁵ This paradox could be defined as being both absolute as well as a divine. The absolute paradox is that God became a real human person and the divine paradox is that this reality is revealed for all to see. The divine does not remain hidden but is deliberately proclaimed in order to declare that the suffering and despised human person is indeed God. This paradox is not limited to the Incarnation, but continues to Christ's death on the Cross and once again, paradoxically it is through the cross that Christ redeems the world.

Christ's emptying unto death on the cross is redemption for the believer. This redemption consists of reconciliation and of Christ's compassion. Kierkegaard uses the metaphor of substitution, not only in the sense of 'taking the place of (reconciliation), but also as 'putting oneself in someone else's position' (compassion). On the one hand Christ as the obedient and righteous takes the place of the sinner. ...On the other hand Christ is so much one with the lowly and suffering that he can put himself in their position completely. It is divine compassion to make oneself quite literally one with the most wretched. (PC 59)¹⁹⁶

Christ's acceptance of the form of a servant is grounded in the total self-emptying love of God. The manifestation of love in humility and suffering is scandalous in nature and we see no attempt to dissimulate it. The self-emptying which began with the Incarnation reaches its climax in the Cross. The cry of the humiliated Jesus on the cross wherein he expressed his abandonment is paradoxically the manifestation of true divinity and power. This love is contrasted against the radical incapacity of the human person to know God and to receive the truth.¹⁹⁷ In the Kenosis, God who freely engages

¹⁹⁵ In *Philosophical Fragments*, we are presented with the parable of a king who falls in love with a poor girl. The love for the girl makes the king suffer. The dilemma for the king is, that if he were to propose to the girl in his splendor, there existed the possibility that her acceptance could be caused by fear or by love. He desires to be accepted out of love and so decides to become like the girl. Therefore he, he actually chooses to become equal to the lowliest of human beings and spends his entire life in suffering, poverty and humiliation so that the girl would accept him out of love. (Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 120-21.)

¹⁹⁶ VOS, PIETER H. "Working Against Oneself ...", p. 128.

¹⁹⁷ Two conventional possibilities of teaching the truth could have been by transforming the human person into someone like God or God could appear in God's glory before the human person. Both these situations were impossible because in the first case the transformation of the person would leave the individual totally changed – he/she would no longer be a person. In the second case, the glory of God would be so overwhelming that the person would forget oneself and be taken up in this vision. Thus both the above mentioned possibilities would destroy the human person.

in self-emptying love, assumes the form of a servant and relates to the human person without destroying his uniqueness.¹⁹⁸ This way of relating elicits a response from the human person and is the starting point for a more authentic Christian existence.¹⁹⁹

The paradox of a suffering God does not stand by itself with Kierkegaard, but is connected with a way of life. Kenosis must take shape in a life of humility and charity in imitation of Christ's paradigm. Imitation of Christ is about a growing conformity with the suffering and humiliated Christ. Kierkegaard describes imitation as a way of self-denial, letting go, carrying one's cross, and dying to the world...²⁰⁰

Kierkegaard's understanding of the Divine Kenosis would influence subsequent theologians. Though he was criticized,²⁰¹ he helped shift the emphasis of the Divine Kenosis from metaphysical and philosophical parameters towards one that focused on a relationship between God and the human person. The humility of Christ as revealed in the Divine Kenosis unites God's love to human finiteness and sinfulness. It defies normal understanding, contradicts rational coherence and is a difficult intellectual proposition. However it is can be comprehended and lived in the context of God's self-emptying love as revealed in the person of Christ.

To Kierkegaard the final measure of God's love is that God loves man for what he is. Kenosis is the link relating the finitude and sinfulness of man to the love of God. ...(His) position on kenosis has wrought a revolution. ...The function and meaning of (the kenosis) were changed. It is no longer a principle of intelligibility. It is the paradox of grace.²⁰²

2.3.2 KARL BARTH (1886 – 1968)

Karl Barth was critical of the kenoticists but at the same time saw the all-pervasive importance of the Divine Kenosis in Christian revelation. His starting point did not

¹⁹⁸ Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form of...*, p. 159

¹⁹⁹ For Kierkegaard Kenosis was a revelation of God and the criterion for the Christian way of life. It was intimately related to a way of life which consisted in an imitation of the humility of Christ where the phenomenon of an 'inverse dialectic' is observed. This is understood as a reality where the positive is immediately present in the negative and vice-versa. (Cf. VOS, PIETER H. "Working Against Oneself ...", pp. 128-133.)

²⁰⁰ IBID., p. 129.

²⁰¹ The criticism was that his position took away any attempt to intellectually probe this mystery any further. He asserted the sovereignty of God and discarding any rationalized attempt to understand the doctrine of God. (Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form of...*, p. 160.)

²⁰² DAWE, DONALD. *The Form of...* p. 160.

consist in delineating the attributes of God and then attempting to understand the Divine Kenosis within these categories. Rather, he understood it as a fact of revelation, and tried to present a doctrine of God from the only source of information that we possess - the actual manifestation of God's self-emptying in Christ.²⁰³

There is no way of knowing God apart from revelation... Revelation is God's self-offering and self-manifestation... (where) God tells man that he is God, and that as such he is his Lord. Revelation tells him something new, something which ... he does not know and cannot tell either himself or other. ...Who and what is at (the point towards) which our attention and thoughts are concentrated, to recognize as God?... From its beginning to its end the Bible directs us to the name of Jesus Christ.²⁰⁴

Two points about the Divine Kenosis are worth mentioning at this stage. In the first place, the self-emptying of God does not diminish God. God is Lord even in humiliation and the divine self-emptying is the highest affirmation of the Lordship of God. The exaltation that is referred to is in fact a tearing away of the veil that obscured the true glory of Christ. The second point refers to the mistake made in separating God's action and God's inner life. In God, being and action is one and the same thing and therefore in revelation, we are presented with the very being of God.

An affirmation of this kind relates the Divine Kenosis to the understanding of the Trinity. Barth has been hailed as the pioneer of the revival of Trinitarian theology for the twentieth century and in his book, *Church Dogmatics* he says:

He reveals Himself *through Himself*. ...If we really want to understand revelation in terms of its subject, i.e., God, then the first thing we have to realise is that this subject, God, the Revealer, is identical with His act in revelation and also identical with its effect. It is from this fact, which in the first instance we are merely indicating, that we learn we must begin the doctrine of revelation with the doctrine of the triune God.²⁰⁵

²⁰³ 'For (Barth), the only source of knowledge of God is revelation. ...He reads the history of theology in terms of a struggle between the knowledge of God given in revelation and the supposed knowledge of him found in human wisdom and experience. When some philosophical idea of God predominates in a theology, the unique notion of God found in revelation is muted or perverted. Such a theology can be said to be dominated by a 'natural theology'. The task of a sound theology is to overcome this dominance. Divine revelation is to be understood in terms of itself.' *IBID.*, pp. 166-67.

²⁰⁴ KARKKAINEN, V.M. *The Doctrine of God: A Global Introduction*, Baker Academic: Michigan, 2004, pp. 125-26.

²⁰⁵ BARTH, K. *Church Dogmatics: The doctrine of the Word of God, Part 1-Vol 2*, (Tr. Bromiley, G. W.), T&T Clark: London, 2004, p. 296. (ee)

The revelation of the eternal intra-trinitarian love is manifest in the Incarnation where Barth uses the parable of the prodigal son in order to speak of the Son of God's journey. The journey of the Son's self-emptying and humiliation reveals to us the journey of God. 'Barth brought the immanent and economic Trinities together and (in doing so) brought history into the triune life of God.'²⁰⁶ The Trinitarian love which is revealed in Jesus Christ manifests the intrinsic relationship between being and action. God is a being in act – and this is revealed in Scripture which manifests to us a God who is not static but dynamic, living, subject to change, vital and responsive.

His doctrine of God which was based on the Divine Kenosis and revealed the Triune God would have to deal with the problem of immutability and change – a problem which could not be successfully addressed by the kenoticists. Barth would do this by providing a different understanding of the attributes (or perfections) of God.²⁰⁷ He indicated that the constant or immutable attributes of God were the dimension of love and freedom. This would be a key to understand the immutability and change in God and is explained in *Part I, Vol. 2* (§ 28) of *CD* which deals with 'The being of God as the one who loves in freedom.'²⁰⁸

Barth would explain divine absoluteness in the absolute freedom to love humanity. The constant or immutable dimension of God's unswerving will to love cannot be destroyed by sin. God can thus enter into any relationship and yet remain unchanged. Kenosis interpreted in this manner reflects the totality of God's freedom and love, thus revealing the fullness of God's Divinity. For Barth:

Kenosis is the divine self-emptying or self-limitation by which God fulfills his will of love for man. Kenosis is the divine self-limitation by which God comes into redemptive relationship with men as men. In response to his love for man, God acts freely to accept existence as a man. But in so doing, God does not become unlike himself. Kenosis is an

²⁰⁶ KARKKAINEN, V. M. *The Doctrine of God...*, p. 127.

²⁰⁷ He uses the word 'perfections' to the word 'attributes' because the word attributes is misleading. Knowledge of these perfections is gained by reflecting upon the revelation of God in his Word. (Cf. DAWE, DONALD, *The Form of...*, p. 169.)

²⁰⁸ BARTH, K. *CD : Part I - Vol. 2...*, p. 257. (ee) This section of *Church Dogmatics* (§28), highlights the being of God as act, as one who love and one in freedom.

expression of the divine loving and the divine freedom. God remains absolute and immutable in his self-emptying in Christ because it is the supreme fulfillment of his will of love for men.²⁰⁹

The contribution of Barth had its limitations.²¹⁰ However we need to highlight his contribution in interpreting the Divine Kenosis in a manner which was coherent for the 20th century. His insistence on beginning any reflection on the doctrine of God in an a posteriori manner and placing the Divine Kenosis within the very being of the Triune God would go on to influence many other theologians in the years to come. The paradigm shift in terms of understanding the attributes of God primarily in terms of love and freedom instead of the 'omni' attributes would also be fundamental in the interpretation of the Divine Kenosis during the 20th century.

2.3.3 SERGEI BULGAKOV (1871 – 1944)

Bulgakov was a Russian Orthodox priest who had earlier been a Marxist teacher of economics. In 1923 he was exiled and spent most of his years as Dean of the Institut Saint-Serge in Paris. His understanding of the Divine Kenosis was 'strikingly comprehensive, extending outside of the framework of the incarnation into the act of creation and even into the inner life of the Trinity.'²¹¹ We shall begin by highlighting his understanding of *Sophiology* and follow it with his position on kenosis within the trinity, creation and finally end with the kenosis par excellence – the Incarnation.

An integral element in the thought of Bulgakov was *Sophiology* because it was the instrument by which Bulgakov both bound and distinguished divine and created reality.²¹² It was at the core of Bulgakov's thought and was condemned for heresy.

²⁰⁹ DAWE, DONALD, *The Form of...*, pp. 171-72.

²¹⁰ There have been some questions related to Barth's understanding of divine freedom which at times lack clarity. Similarly the limitation of the Son in terms of being a member of the Trinity has been problematic. His interpretation of scripture, especially in interpreting kenotic passages has not taken into account historical scholarship. (Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 175-76.)

²¹¹ GAVRILYUK, PAUL. "The Kenotic Theology of Sergius Bulgakov", *Scottish Journal of Theology – Vol. 58/3*, 2005, p. 254.

²¹² 'Sophia united God with the world (and is) ...the divine ground of creaturely existence. ...It does not participate in the inner divine life, is not God and did not pertain to the tri-hypostatic nature of God. It pertained to the divine ousia (essence), though not as a point of origin, but solely a point of reception. Sophia was the ousia's relationship with creating that which was not God. It preceded the act of creation itself because it was the divine love which was able to go beyond itself and love that which has no

Rowan Willian would explain that 'Sofia is the divine nature, God's own life considered under the aspect of God's freedom to live the divine life in what is not God.'²¹³ However one needs to understand the phrase 'sophia is the divine nature' in a nuanced manner because Bulgakov makes a distinction between Divine Sophia and creaturely Sophia wherein the latter was a condescension of the divine into the created world.²¹⁴ Sophia preceded the act of creation and pertained more accurately to God's essence and not to the nature of God. In developing the idea of Sophia, Bulgakov situated the being of God as well as all creation within the ambit of Love and love.²¹⁵

The Divine Love, which is the Divine *Ousia*, was therefore the origin of the diversity and unity of God. However, logically speaking, if there was no other love in God, this Love would either continually be self-replicating or cease to be love in that it would involve only the finitude of the tri-hypostases. It was for this reason that Bulgakov needed to develop a notion of Sophia, not as Love (the essence of God), but as love. "[Sophia] is the love of Love." (Bulgakov, *Unfading Light*, 212)

Sophia enabled Bulgakov to speak of God's love as (being) able to love and then create that which was not God without compromising God's love, which was at the foundation of God. Bulgakov therefore described the Divine Sophia as "God's world, the living being of God" (Bulgakov, *Bride*, 47) which already contained within itself the love which could and did create out of nothing.²¹⁶

Bulgakov emphasized that the Kenosis was 'not merely an event, but the quality of divine life, is rooted in the inner life of the Trinity and becomes evident in the creation and redemption of the world.'²¹⁷ The Trinity is a dynamic reality which consists in each person being engaged in an eternal process of self-giving and self-emptying of the three persons and this self-giving is the source of divine love.²¹⁸ This love of the Father is

existence.' TATARYN, MYROSLAW. "Sergius Bulgakov (1871-1944): Time for a New Look", *St. Vladimir's Theological Quarterly* 4, 1988, pp. 318-19.

²¹³ WILLIAMS, ROWAN. "Three Orthodox Theologians – S.N.Bulgakov", *The Modern Theologians*, (Ed. Ford, David), Blackwell Publishers: Massachusetts, 2001, p. 503. (2nd Ed.)

²¹⁴ Cf. TATARYN, MYROSLAW. "Sergius..."..., pp. 319-20.

²¹⁵ Bulgakov makes a distinction between 'Love' which begins with a capital letter and 'love' which begins with a small letter. 'Love' is the essence of God, and this divine 'Love' gives itself in 'love'. (Cf. BULGAKOV, S. *The Unfading Light*, Moscow: Put, 1917, 212 as quoted in TATARYN, MYROSLAW. "Sergius Bulgakov (1871-1944): Time for a New Look...", p. 319.)

²¹⁶ TATARYN, MYROSLAW. *Ibid.*, p. 319.

²¹⁷ DAWE, DONALD. *The Form of ...*, p.152.

²¹⁸ 'The mutual inter-change has its roots in the Father who is the image of love itself. But since his love is not static or self-

described as being 'ecstatic, fiery, conceiving, active' while the love of the Son, in contrast, is 'sacrificial, self-denying humility of the Lamb of God'. The Holy Spirit is the joy, blessedness and triumph of sacrificial love.²¹⁹ Through a process of kenosis, the three persons of the Trinity become 'kenotically transparent to each other and lose their own selves only to find them in the other.'²²⁰ This mutual self-emptying contains the element of real divine suffering which is 'not the result of external limitation, for nothing can limit the absolute being from outside, but rather is an expression of the reality of sacrificial love.'

For Bulgakov, divine suffering is at the core of divine blessedness. Without the reality of sacrificial suffering, God's bliss would resemble empty and self-centred human happiness. The cross for Bulgakov not only is the symbol of human salvation, but also symbolises the power of mutual self-denial of the three persons in the Trinity. The historical Golgotha... was logically preceded by the metaphysical Golgotha. The Son's historical suffering in the incarnation was the result of his pre-temporal decision to become incarnate and to be crucified. ...Such a decision, to be a real sacrifice, involved profound suffering for God.²²¹

Bulgakov maintained that creation was a kenotic act.²²² As seen in the preceding paragraph, Trinitarian love of its very nature goes beyond itself and hence 'seeks to be realized not only within itself but in another. For this reason divine love becomes the basis of creation.'²²³ Bulgakov agrees to the ontological distinction between the Creator and creatures and hence due to the infinite gap that exists between the two, only the creator's voluntary initiative could bridge the gap between the two. In the kenotic act of creation we see three important aspects: "a) God freely constrains his actions in the

centered, it gives rise through a process of self-giving to the other members of the Trinity. This begetting act of the Son and the Spirit is not a temporal but an eternal act.' (IBID.)

²¹⁹ Cf. GAVRILYUK, PAUL. "The Kenotic Theology of Sergius Bulgakov...", pp. 255-57. The article explains the emptying of the Trinity in the following manner. 'The Father empties himself entirely in the Son with whom He identifies and finds fulfillment. However the Father is not limited by him in any way because the Son shares in the same infinite and unfathomable divine nature. The Son, on his part, empties himself by submitting to be begotten from the Father and by being obedient to the Father. The procession of the Holy Spirit, unlike the begetting of the Son, is not a sacrificial act, but proceeds from the Father and eternally rests upon the Son. The eternal kenosis of the third person of the Trinity consists in divesting himself of his hypostatic self and serving as a 'bond' or a 'bridge of love' between the Father and the Son.'

²²⁰ Cf. GAVRILYUK, PAUL. "The Kenotic Theology of Sergius Bulgakov...", p. 255.

²²¹ IBID., p. 256.

²²² "He was one of the first theologians to use and develop the term 'panentheism' to distinguish his doctrine of the world's ideality in God from pantheism." ROWAN, WILLIAMS. "Eastern Orthodox Theology...", p. 504.

²²³ DAWE, DONALD, *The Form of a Servant...*, p. 152.

world by time and space; b) God limits his power and c) God gives up his foreknowledge in order to preserve human freedom.”²²⁴ The act of creation is thus an expression of love and at the same time one which limits the three persons of the Trinity.²²⁵

The limitation of the Son in the Incarnation²²⁶ is a manifestation of kenosis *par excellence* and is a continuation of creation. *Kenosis* is extended by Bulgakov to interpret God’s relation to the world, and what is more important—within the eternal life of God the Trinity. So much so that incarnation, as we see, is a continuation of creation.²²⁷

The starting point of Bulgakov’s kenotic Christology is an exegesis of Paul’s letter to the Philippians (*Phil. 2,5-11*) which would be seen in conjunction with the prologue of John’s gospel (*Jn. 1,14*), the Nicene creed and the Chalcedonian definition.²²⁸ In the Incarnation and during the life and death of Jesus, we find that the fullness that is potentially present is gradually revealed.²²⁹ In the Incarnation, Christ participated in the

²²⁴ GAVRILYUK, PAUL. “The Kenotic Theology of Sergius Bulgakov...”, p. 257. Gavrilyuk goes on to explain these points by indicating that the transcendent God limits Himself and in a single, supra-temporal act creates the world. By the act of creation and specifically creating human beings with free-will, God chooses to limit his omnipotence. The human being is given independence and is invited to participate in divine grace. However this grace is never imposed, but only offered to the human person as an invitation. The third point of God’s foreknowledge would again indicate a limitation to God’s omniscience where God freely limits his knowledge of the future. This limitation of foreknowledge should not be confused with the eternal knowledge of God where He knows Himself, all things in eternity and all future possibilities. The limitation of God’s omniscience is limited to a voluntary choice not to know what will come to pass in any temporal sequence ahead of time as it would undermine human freedom. (Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 257-59.)

²²⁵ ‘The Father limits himself by becoming utterly transcendent and withdrawing himself from creation. The kenosis of the Son consists in the fact that he, being omnipresent in creation, descends to the level of humanity and becomes Godman in the incarnation. The Holy Spirit, who is the power of all being, also restricts his activity in creation, accommodating his power to the state of individual creatures.’ *IBID.*, p. 259.

²²⁶ Christ’s Kenosis takes place at three levels: the level of nature, the level of hypostasis and the level of infra-Trinitarian being and the relation between the three hypostasis. (Cf. SAKHAROV, NIKOLAI. “Essential Bulgakov: His ideas about Sophia, Trinity and Christ”, *St Vladimir’s Theological Quarterly* 55:2, 2011, p. 193.)

²²⁷ *IBID.*, p. 191

²²⁸ Related to the question of ‘emptying’, Bulgakov argued that the self-emptying did not limit itself to Christ, but went beyond the temporal confines of the Incarnation. ... (It was a) celestial event in the depth of the Godhead, that is, to God’s supratemporal decision to become incarnate. Bulgakov made a difference between divine nature and glory and indicated that in the self-emptying, Christ gave up His glory but not his divine nature. (Cf. GAVRILYUK, PAUL. “The Kenotic Theology of Sergius Bulgakov...”, pp. 260-62.)

²²⁹ At this point it will be important to point out to his understanding of the divine-human dimension in Christ. He

lot of sinful humanity with its limitations and therefore underwent all infirmities and ignorance which were part of the normal human condition.²³⁰ Christ thus engaged in a real emptying where He 'did not simply pretend to be ignorant of the end but truly as God emptied himself of this knowledge. ... (He) renounced his own will and accepted that of the Father.'²³¹

The high point of the kenosis was the death of Christ on the Cross. In it humanity and divinity reached the last limitation – death. The kenosis does not end with the death on the Cross but continued in the Resurrection as well as the Ascension.²³² Even as the glorified Lord, Christ is still humble because he respects man's freedom.²³³ Along with Christ, the Spirit too engages in a process of kenosis and the ultimate fulfilment of the Spirit's kenosis is at Pentecost. The process of kenosis will continue because 'nature is still groaning in travail until it is released from the final enemy, which is death. Kenosis will not end until the Last Day when death is overcome and all things are restored to their harmony with the divine Wisdom.'²³⁴ Bulgakov who is critical about an exaggerated Christocentrism believes that Christology does have a central place in Bulgakov.²³⁵ In the life and death of Jesus, the kenotic pattern is spelt out and through a life in the Spirit, we become a new creation and participate in divine life.²³⁶

rejected any dichotomy of the divine and human whereby some actions pertained to the human dimension of Christ and others to the divine. He believed '*in one person in Christ—the unity of personal life requires the unity of all its manifestations. Bulgakov refuses to "divide" the ministry of Christ into human and divine, but sees it as a single ministry of the God-man. ...Each of Christ's actions is neither human nor divine, but divinely-human— theandric. ...All Christ's miracles, his insight, his spiritual power and other expressions of his high perfection, AS WELL AS all his bodily weariness, lack of knowledge, the sense of God forsakenness, and other expressions of his limitations—ALL should be interpreted as divinely-human.*' (Cf. SAKHAROV, NIKOLAI. "Essential Bulgakov: ...", p. 196.

²³⁰ Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form of a Servant...*, p. 153.

²³¹ GAVRILYUK, PAUL. "The Kenotic Theology of Sergius Bulgakov...", pp. 262. The author also indicates that in Bulgakov's understanding of the kenosis, the Word was subordinate to the Father and the Holy Spirit.

²³² Cf. GAVRILYUK, PAUL. "The Kenotic Theology of Sergius Bulgakov...", pp. 265.

²³³ Cf. DAWE, DONALD. *The Form of a Servant...*, p. 154.

²³⁴ IBID.

²³⁵ He was '*critical of certain kinds of christocentrism in ecclesiology. He believed that if the identity of the Church is made to reside solely in its relation to Christ rather than in the quality of its consubstantial and catholic life in the Spirit, the Church will tend to look for Christ-substitutes – an infallible Pope, an inerrant Bible – or to encourage people to concentrate on an individual relation to the Savior.*' ROWAN, WILLIAMS. "Eastern Orthodox Theology...", p. 504.

²³⁶ Cf. IBID.

Bulgakov was criticized by various theologians,²³⁷ including those from the Orthodox Church. However it cannot be doubted that he was an important theologian in terms of understanding the Kenosis. He was able to expand its understanding from being merely an event towards a manifestation of the very being of Triune God and in effect presenting a world-view wherein all reality constantly has a kenotic dimension.

2.3.4 HANS URS VON BALTHASAR (1905 – 1988)²³⁸

2.3.4.1 Introduction

The debate on kenotic theories during the 18th and 19th centuries was primarily within non-Catholic circles. During the 20th century, an important Catholic theologian who would reflect upon the Divine Kenosis in his theological writings was the Swiss theologian, Hans Urs Von Balthasar. Important persons who influenced his life included Erich Przywara,²³⁹ Henri de Lubac,²⁴⁰ Karl Barth²⁴¹ and Adrienne von Speyr.²⁴² The

²³⁷ His *Sophiology* was interpreted by some as merely creative imagination. The identification of the energy of Wisdom within the Godhead was criticized because he attributed of God was being made into God's essence. His thoughts on God's foreknowledge and free-will were also criticized.

²³⁸ Balthasar was born in 1905, educated by the Benedictines and Jesuits and went on to study philosophy and German literature culminating in a doctorate on German idealism. In 1929 he entered the Society of Jesus but later left the Society in 1950 to continue working with secular institutes. He died in 1988, two days before he was to be made a cardinal of the Catholic Church.

²³⁹ Przywara's *analogy of being* influenced Balthasar. Przywara said that there a radical distinction between essence and existence as contained in all of created reality. This differentiates God who is the Creator (whose essence is to be) from the creature. A succinct expression of this can be found in a text from the Fourth Lateran Council (1215): "As great as may be the similarity, so much greater must the dissimilarity between creator and creature be preserved." Cf. RICHES, JOHN – QUASH, BEN, "Hans Urs von Balthasar", *The Modern Theologians*, (Ed. Ford, David F.), Blackwell Publishers: Massachusetts, 2001 ..., pp. 134, 37. (2nd Ed.)

²⁴⁰ He studied theology in Lyons which was the center of the *nouvelle théologie*. Henri de Lubac whom Balthasar met during his studies of theology gave him a deep love for the Patristic Fathers. [Cf. GARRET, STEPHEN M. "The Dazzling Darkness of God's Triune Love: Introducing Evangelicals to the Theology of Hans Urs von Balthasar", *Themelios: Vol.35/3*, 2010, p. 418. (ee)] The initial part of this article speaks of the formative influences in the life of Balthasar. These include the philosophical, theological and spiritual influences.

²⁴¹ Barth and Balthasar engaged in 'critical yet charitable dialogues regarding a host of theological issues... Balthasar identified Barth's theology as "beautiful" as it stressed the objectivity of divine revelation, namely, God's self-revelation in Christ, and drew our attention to the aesthetic side of existence, including divine revelation.' (IBID., p. 419.)

²⁴² Adrienne von Speyr was a Protestant physican who converted to Catholicism. She received many mystical graces, most of which were related to what Christ as a human soul, underwent on Holy Saturday. (Cf. OAKES, EDWARD T. "He descended into hell: The Depths of God's Self-emptying Love on Holy Saturday in the Thought of Hans Urs von Balthasar", *Exploring Kenotic Christology*, (Ed. Evans, Stephen C.), Regent College Publishing: Vancouver, 2006, p. 231.)

Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola would also have a profound influence on him.²⁴³

Balthasar while stressing the importance of God's glory shining in and through creation, would go on to 'underscore the utter dissimilarity between God and his creation.'²⁴⁴ Of itself, human thought cannot know the absolute transcendent reality of God because God is beyond human comprehension.²⁴⁵ Though the human person has some understanding of love because of the primordial experience,²⁴⁶ it is only by God's divine self-revelation that the human person can comprehend God's revelation as love.²⁴⁷

The content of (God's) action cannot in any essential way be derived from or anticipated a priori on the basis of created nature, because it arises from the Other *as* Other in unfathomable freedom toward his other; no preliminary bridge of understanding can be built on similarity or, for that matter, on identity. The key to understanding the action lies solely in God's presentation of himself to human beings on the stage of human nature, by virtue of the identity of the divine "Author", the divine and human "Actor", and the divine Spirit. Just because God's Covenant is his battle of love *with* sinful man does not mean that this battle of love can be understood and assessed *by* man.²⁴⁸

The life of God, for Balthasar, is characterized by self-donation in the form of kenosis.²⁴⁹ Kenosis is essential in order to understand the paradox of the Incarnation²⁵⁰, would be at the heart of Balthasar's thought and hold a central place in his doctrine of

²⁴³ The defining moment of his life would be at the age of 22, when he would have a life-changing experience during the Spiritual Exercises. (Cf. HENRICI, PETER. "Hans Urs von Balthasar: A Sketch of his Life", *Hans Urs von Balthasar: His Life and Work*, (ed. Schindler, David L.), Ignatius: San Francisco, 1991, p. 11.)

²⁴⁴ Christ is not a prolongation of creation, but brings together the heavenly and earthly, which is thus endowed by grace with a crown... God's revelation in creation prepares the way for his self-revelation in Christ... Christ is the perfection of the form of the world. (Cf. GARRET, STEPHEN M. "The Dazzling Darkness of God's Triune Love...", p. 419.)

²⁴⁵ Cf. RICHES, JOHN – QUASH, BEN, "Hans Urs von Balthasar", *The Modern Theologians...*, pp. 136,138.

²⁴⁶ Cf. O'DONNELL, JOHN. *Hans Urs von Balthasar – His Life and Works*, (Ed. Schindler, David L.), Ignatius Press: San Francisco, 1911, p. 207.

²⁴⁷ LAC, pp. 55-56. (LAC refers to VON BALTHASAR, H. U. *Love Alone Is Credible*. (Tr. D. C. Schindler.), San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 2004. (ee)) '...*The plausibility of God's love does not become apparent through any comparative reduction to what man has always already understood as love; rather it is illuminated only by the self-interpreting revelation-form of love itself. And this form is so majestic that we are led to adore it from a reverent distance whenever we perceive it, even if it does not explicitly command us to do so.*'

²⁴⁸ LAC – p. 70

²⁴⁹ Cf. OLIVER, SIMON. *Love Alone is Credible – Hans Urs von Balthasar as Interpreter of Catholic Tradition*, (Ed. Schindler, David L.), William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, Michigan, 2008, p. 183. (ee) This book is a commentary on the above mentioned book.

²⁵⁰ Cf. OAKES, EDWARD T. "He descended into hell'...", pp. 218-19.

God.²⁵¹ It would reach its greatest intensity on Holy Saturday when God, in sovereign freedom endures the dereliction of godlessness. This was not an arbitrary act of God, but the economic outworking of God's immanent and eternal kenosis.²⁵² The kenotic dimension of love is seen from the early Church whereby created entities participate in the eternal kenosis of the Trinity by continually giving themselves. Reality is kenotic by nature as all things continually move out of themselves, but the defining point of love in created being is only finally made manifest in the light of Christ's love shown on the cross.²⁵³

2.3.4.2 Christology

Balthasar believed that Christ integrates and unveils the true, the good, and the beautiful that constitutes the being of God. He reveals the life of love as found within the eternal processions of the Godhead.²⁵⁴ The self-surrender and death of Christ takes us back to the inner mystery of God.²⁵⁵ Through the Incarnation, life and death of Christ the mystery of God is revealed to us. Balthasar used aesthetic categories to illuminate the mystery of Christ. Obedience to the heavenly Father is an important key to unlock the mystery of Jesus' identity.²⁵⁶ His Christology used the letter of Paul to the Philippians (Phil. 2,5-11), and in this manner the Divine Kenosis became important to his theological enterprise.²⁵⁷

Balthasar's Christology reveals the Triune God. In the Incarnation there was a

²⁵¹ Cf. PARDUE, STEPHEN T. *The Mind of Christ: Humility and Intellect in Early Christian Theology*, Bloomsbury: London, 2013, p. 119. (ee)

²⁵² Cf. OLIVER, SIMON. *Love Alone is Credible...*, pp. 182-83.

²⁵³ OLIVER, SIMON. *Love Alone is Credible...*, p. 185. 'This sign imprinted on nature, however, comes to light only when the sign of absolute love appears: the light of the Cross makes worldly being intelligible, it allows the inchoate forms and ways of love, which otherwise threaten to stray into trackless thickets, to receive a foundation in their true transcendent ground.'

²⁵⁴ Cf. GARRET, STEPHEN M. "The Dazzling Darkness of God's Triune Love" ..., p. 432.

²⁵⁵ Cf. LUCIEN, J. RICHARD. *A Kenotic...*, p. 174.

²⁵⁶ Cf. O'DONNELL, JOHN. *Hans Urs von Balthasar – His Life and Works...*, p. 208.

²⁵⁷ Cf. PARDUE, STEPHEN T. *The Mind of Christ...*, pp. 119-20. Pardue compares the commitment of Balthasar and Moltmann's to making (Phil. 2,5-11) central to their theology. Both agree that the Divine Kenosis must be explained in its Trinitarian dimension. However there are two points of differences – Moltmann argues against divine immutability while Balthasar tries to preserve it. Secondly while both authors link kenosis to the act of creation, Moltmann emphasizes that the God-creation relationship is kenotic while Balthasar tries to explain the inner-Trinitarian relations by using the kenosis.²⁵⁷

self-emptying of the Logos²⁵⁸ and an exteriorization of the Triune God.²⁵⁹ The Sonship of Jesus and His mission only make sense within a Trinitarian context. Within the drama of Christ, lies the supra-drama of the Trinity.²⁶⁰ In the Incarnation, God continues to remain God, but there is a change which goes beyond the mythical and temporal level. The relationship of the three persons is affected and there has been some change. However this change needs to be explained in a nuanced manner so that the Incarnation is understood as a free act of God and is in consonance with the nature of God as self-giving Trinitarian love.²⁶¹

Balthasar makes an important contribution in interpreting the death of Christ and His descent to hell.²⁶² The kenosis of Jesus was not limited to the Incarnation but went on to the point of the Cross. He further interprets the kenosis as continuing in the descent to hell where Christ identifies totally with the sinner, even to the point of God forsakenness.²⁶³ It is not a triumphalist descent to save a select few who had lived upright lives, but assumption of all forms of godforsakenness into the the Trinitarian relationship of love.²⁶⁴

²⁵⁸ Cf. O'DONNELL, JOHN. *Hans Urs von Balthasar – His Life and Works...*, p. 209.

²⁵⁹ Cf. LUCIEN, J. RICHARD. *A Kenotic...*, p. 174.

²⁶⁰ Cf. RICHES, JOHN – QUASH, BEN. "Hans Urs von Balthasar..." , p. 142.

²⁶¹ Cf. OAKES, EDWARD T. "'He descended into hell'...", pp. 241-43.

²⁶² The paradox of various dimensions of the Christian faith is often taken for granted. In this point we find a special paradox which helps us better understand the extent of God's love.

²⁶³ The phrase 'descent to hell' was not part of early creeds but in the course of time became part of the fundamental creedal formula of the Christian faith. Two elements of this 'descent' need to be indicated – its triumphalist tone and the reason given for this descent. Most of the interpretations emphasized that this descent was a triumphal descent by which those who had been waiting in Hades were saved. (We need to take note of the difference between Hades and hell). The descent was an active enterprise by which the triumphant Christ went down and redeemed those who had been waiting to be saved. However those who were condemned to hell continued to suffer eternal condemnation. (Cf. O'DONNELL, JOHN. *Hans Urs von Balthasar – His Life and Works...*, p. 209.)

²⁶⁴ OAKES, EDWARD T. "'He descended into hell'..." , p. 239. '...by virtue of the Incarnation Jesus has assumed in his human nature godforsakenness and has incorporated it, by his descent into hell, into the nature of the Godhead itself. This point comes out especially strongly in the last two volumes of his *Theo-Drama*, as in this passage: "In so far as sin has finally and ultimately been concentrated in the crucified Son, God's final judgment on this sin also proceeds from the Cross. ... This reversal (from judgment to mercy) is no extrinsicist decision of God: it is made possible by the incorporation of godforsakenness into the Trinitarian relationship of love." (*Theo-Drama*, Vol. IV, pp. 233) Thus we see that that Balthasar's Christology not only merits the name 'kenotic' but is perhaps the most radically kenotic Christology of all, for that kenosis has now become an event within the Trinity itself...'

The Christology of Balthasar is related to soteriology because the Cross and the descent are crucial in God's plan of salvation. In the kenosis of Christ we find the fullest expression of His willingness to take up sinful human nature. His descent to hell out of obedience and love is the highest manifestation of self-emptying love.²⁶⁵ Kenosis and redemption are not just two terms which are juxtaposed, but are intrinsically related to each other. Christ through the Incarnation, Cross and descent manifests the totality of the Triune God's and through a variety of ways constantly reminds us that God's very being consists in total self-emptying love.

The word which God addresses to us is a word of love: he utters it in a loud, manly voice in broad daylight, almost menacing, causing man to start out of his dreams and take notice of what he hears – yet it is also a word whispered in the night, soft and alluring, beyond comprehension, a mystery incredible even to the strongest faith, which no creature, however long he lives, will fathom.²⁶⁶

2.3.4.3 Trinity

Balthasar believed that there was an explicit connection between Christological kenosis and Trinitarian kenosis.²⁶⁷ The Kenosis of Christ reveals Kenosis as an event in the intra-Trinitarian life. Love is what characterizes the processions of the Trinity and the pattern of kenotic love amongst the Trinity is one of full expropriation of self toward the other in love. In speaking about the Trinity he states that Kenosis 'is the selflessness of the Persons (when considered as pure relationships) in the inner-Trinitarian life of love.'²⁶⁸

In *Theo-Drama IV*, he explains the same in greater detail when he states that the generation of the Son by the Father is the starting point for all kenosis:

... the Father's self-utterance in the generation of the Son is an initial "kenosis" within the

²⁶⁵ Cf. RICHES, JOHN – QUASH, BEN, "Hans Urs von Balthasar", *The Modern Theologians...*, pp. 141-43.

²⁶⁶ YODER, TIMOTHY J. *Hans Urs von Balthasar: The Pathway to Human Agency*, Loyola University: Chicago, 2013, p. 54. (Dissertation)

²⁶⁷ *IBID.*, pp. 67-68. 'The Incarnation reveals, in full truth, the contours of God's character. Yet, because God's character is a surplus of love and the Incarnation itself is a trinitarian act, there must be a depth of meaning that the Incarnation hints at that is beyond our understanding. ...While the Incarnation is the height of revelation, mystically and eschatologically speaking, the Son's kenosis and suffering in the world is a pale imitation of the force of love, recklessness, and abandon that is achieved within the Persons of the Trinity.'

²⁶⁸ *MP* – p. 35.

Godhead that underpins all subsequent kenosis. For the Father strips himself, without remainder, of his Godhead and hands it over to the Son; he “imparts” to the Son all that is his. ...The Father *is* this movement of self-giving that holds nothing back. ...Inherent in the Father’s love is an absolute renunciation: he will not be God for himself alone. He lets go of his divinity and, in this sense, manifests a (divine) God-lessness (of love, of course). ...The Son’s answer to the gift of Godhead (of equal substance with the Father) can only be eternal thanksgiving (*eucharistia*) to the Father, the Source—a thanksgiving as selfless and unreserved as the Father’s original self-surrender. Proceeding from both, as their subsistent “We”, there breathes the “Spirit” who is common to both: as the essence of love, he maintains the infinite difference between them, seals it and, since he is the one Spirit of them both, bridges it.²⁶⁹

While speaking of the relationship between the immanent and economic Trinity, he affirms the ontological priority of the immanent Trinity.²⁷⁰ The immanent Trinity is understood as ‘that eternal, absolute self-surrender whereby God is seen to be, in himself, absolute love.’²⁷¹ However it is only on the basis of the economic Trinity that we have knowledge of the immanent Trinity.²⁷² The economic Trinity is revealed in the history of salvation in three different moments. The first ‘self-limitation’ is seen in the freedom given to creatures. The second more profound ‘limitation’ in the Triune God is the result of the covenant and the third kenosis is not only Christological, but also Trinitarian. It ‘arises through the Incarnation of the Son alone: henceforth he manifests his Eucharistic attitude (which was always his) in the *pro nobis* of the Cross and Resurrection for the sake of the world.’²⁷³

²⁶⁹ TD-IV, pp. 323-24. (ee)

²⁷⁰ He disagreed with the position of Karl Rahner who said that ‘the economic Trinity is the immanent Trinity’ and vice-versa. His position is clear in TD-III, p. 508 which says: ‘...while, according to Christian faith, the economic Trinity assuredly appears as the interpretation of the immanent Trinity, it may not be identified with it, for the latter grounds and supports the former. Otherwise the immanent, eternal Trinity would threaten to dissolve into the economic; in other words, God would be swallowed up in the world process—a necessary stage, in this view, if he is fully to realize himself.’

²⁷¹ TD-IV, pp. 323. –The immanent Trinity refers to the nature of God considered apart from creation. God-s inner nature (God considered *ad intra*) consists of the eternal relations among the divine Persons of the Father, Son, and Spirit. The economic Trinity is the same Father, Son, and Spirit but considered in relation to creation, God *ad extra*, the Trinity in relation to the events of history. The term economic means having to do with the economy of salvation, God’s ‘household management’ of creation. Balthasar argues that the life, death, and resurrection of Jesus, the Incarnate Son, are historical manifestations of the eternal life of the Son. The economic expresses in history what is eternally present immanently.’ (FRIESENHAHN, JACOB H. *The Trinity and Theodicy: The Trinitarian Theology of von Balthasar and the Problem of Evil*, Ashgate Publishing Limited: Surrey, 2011, p. 108 (as in www.googlebooks.com on 29/05/2015))

²⁷² Cf. GARRET, STEPHEN M. “The Dazzling Darkness of God’s Triune Love...”, p. 425.

²⁷³ TD-IV, p. 331.

The Trinitarian Kenosis is an act of love and this love 'causes real otherness, (indicating that) the Trinity is not a static, ontological emptying but an infinite event of kenotic love between the Persons.'²⁷⁴ This eternal process of self-giving has an element of totality because God in God's self-giving, gives all that God has. The Father holds back nothing and the Son and the Spirit respond by an equal and total self-giving.²⁷⁵

The mystery of the Triune God's love reveals to us the mystery of the human person too who is made in the image of God and is invited to engage in a similar act of total self-emptying love. Just as the Triune God reveals its love through the Kenosis, the human person too is invited to participate in divine life by participating in the mission of the Trinity. The next point shall deal with the points of mission and human participation in divine life.

2.3.4.4 Mission and Participation in Divine Life

The intra-Trinitarian relationship reveals to us three levels of kenosis. The third level is where the theology of mission is manifest and through mission a person participates in the Trinitarian activity of love.

The timeless gift of divinity that the Father gives the Son is the first. The reason for the Son's thankfulness toward the Father is because the Father has fully surrendered all his divine life to the Son. The second level of Kenosis is the Son's gift back to the Father. Finally, the third level of kenotic activity is the Father and Son giving themselves to the world. And all of this is to reveal God's love for the created order and his restoration of that order through kenosis, not through coercive power. It is through the third level of kenosis that Balthasar's theology of mission enters into the drama... Mission is at the living center of Balthasar's action oriented Christology.²⁷⁶

The foundation of human participation in the Trinitarian kenotic mission is rooted

²⁷⁴ YODER, TIMOTHY J. *Hans Urs von Balthasar...*, p. 70.

²⁷⁵ The totality of this self-giving is a kind of 'death' which expresses the extent and depth of love. Death therefore is not a tragic finality but a powerful expression of ecstatic self-gift. *'This total self-giving, to which the Son and the Spirit respond by an equal self-giving, is a kind of "death", a first, radical "kenosis", as one might say. It is a kind of "super-death" that is a component of all love and that forms the basis in creation for all instances of "the good death", from self-forgetfulness in favor of the beloved right up to that highest love by which a man "gives his life for his friends". "Life is only genuinely alive insofar as it ... grows beyond itself, lets go of itself. It is rich only insofar as it can be poor, insofar as it loves.'* (Cf. TD-V, p.84.)

²⁷⁶ YODER, TIMOTHY J. *Hans Urs von Balthasar...*, pp. 46-47.

in an invitation of Divine love.²⁷⁷ Divine love ‘appears in such an overwhelming way that its glorious majesty throws one to the ground, it shines out as the last word and leaves one no choice but to respond in the mode of pure, blind obedience.’²⁷⁸ In this encounter, ‘not only does (man) experience what genuine love is, but he is also confronted with the undeniable fact that he, a selfish sinner, does not possess true love.’²⁷⁹ He realizes that ‘only when we look at the Crucified One in the eye (we) recognize the abyss of selfishness – even of that which we are accustomed to call love’.²⁸⁰

An experience of God’s Divine Love is the foundational experience for a person. An encounter with Christ who manifests Divine Love by being obedient to the will of the Father,²⁸¹ offers an a posteriori understanding of the true nature of love – this in turn leads to a conversion of heart and mind.²⁸²

God interprets himself to man as love in the same way (as a mother): he radiates love, which kindles the light of love in the heart of man, and it is precisely this light that allows man to perceive this, the absolute Love. ...The primal foundation of being smiles at us as a mother and as a father. Insofar as we are his creatures, the seed of love lies dormant within us as the image of God (*imago*). But just as no child can be awakened to love without being loved, so too no human heart can come to an understanding of God without

²⁷⁷ In this Love God meets (man), invites him and elevates him to an inconceivable intimacy allows the ‘finite spirit to understand for the first time what it really means to say that God is the Wholly-Other.’ LAC. p. 57.

²⁷⁸ Cf. LAC, pp. 56-57. Despite the fact that the impact of this Love is extraordinary, the human person retains the freedom to respond to this Love. Though Balthasar indicates that the overwhelming nature of this Love is so great that an individual cannot but respond, such love has meaning only when the ‘gift from the eternal Person to the finite person includes the ability to respond as a finite creature to the infinite.’

²⁷⁹ LAC. p. 61.

²⁸⁰ LAC. p. 66.

²⁸¹ Obedience is essentially love. ‘...if the kingship of the God who reveals himself as love comes to light precisely in the Son’s humble obedience to the Father, then it is clear that this obedience is essentially love. It is certainly the paradigmatic attitude of love the creature must have before God’s majesty, but far more than that, it is the radiant paradigm of divine love itself: precisely in-and only in – the kenosis of Christ, the inner mystery of God’s love comes to light, the mystery of God who ‘is love’ in himself and therefore is ‘triune’.(LAC, pp. 86-87.)

²⁸² In explaining the process of conversion, Balthasar insists on the fact that the sinner who is in need of conversion has some understanding of what true love means. This is explained by the example of a mother and child where the mother who has smiled at the child for many days finally receives the child’s response in love.. ‘She has awakened love in the heart of the child, and as the child awakens to love, it also awakens to knowledge; the initial empty-sense impressions gather meaningfully around the core of the Thou. Knowledge (with its whole complex of intuition and concept) comes into play, because the play of love has already begun beforehand, initiated by the mother, the transcendent’ (LAC. p. 76.)

the free gift of his grace—in the image of his Son.²⁸³

In an encounter with God's Divine Love as experienced in Christ, a person goes through a conversion. This conversion in turn leads to a kenotic spirituality where the central element is a denial of self-love which is the manifest goal of human flourishing. Self-love is transformed into other forms of love which include love for God, self and neighbor. These forms of love are dynamically inter-related and should not be separated. Separating them 'makes them competing objects of love leading to a serious risk of disrupting the balance between God and creature.'²⁸⁴

The transformation in the individual leads to a participation in the Divine mission whereby 'an individual achieves personhood through accepting and enacting his or her mission.'²⁸⁵ Mission is the most essential element of humanity because in mission all aspects of creaturehood are met.²⁸⁶ Such participation is possible through faith which is not merely an intellectual act but an existential surrender of the whole person. It is other-centered and like Christ consists in a radical availability to do the will of God.²⁸⁷ By participating in the concrete mission that each one receives through faith an individual grows in dialogical relation, thus becoming a person.²⁸⁸

Through obedience to the concrete mission that has been received, a person is drawn into the Paschal Mystery. In this way a person is enabled to witness the glory of God which in turn aids him in having a realistic perspective of the world.²⁸⁹ Balthasar believed that a kenotic approach should take into account loving relationships with

²⁸³ LAC, p. 76.

²⁸⁴ Cf. YODER, TIMOTHY J. *Hans Urs von Balthasar...*, pp. 121-124. Self-love is not necessarily a negative concept and Balthasar does acknowledge the importance of self-love. However is only 'a byproduct of that moment when we truly understand what we mean to God. Within this kind of kenotic framework, our identity is no longer threatened by the other, but realized in a 'we' that transcends self-love completely.' (Cf. YODER, TIMOTHY J. *Hans Urs von Balthasar...*, p. 125.)

²⁸⁵ *IBID.*, p. 121.

²⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 111-112.

²⁸⁷ Cf. O'DONNELL, JOHN. *Hans Urs von Balthasar – His Life and Works...*, pp. 213-14.

²⁸⁸ Cf. O'DONNELL, JOHN. *Ibid.*, p. 213. '...for von Balthasar, a Geistessubjekt becomes a person in the concrete, unpredictable mission which he receives from God. Man is created with the faculties of intellect and will but he becomes a person only through the dialogical relation. The supreme dialogical partner is God through whom the person receives the mission.'

²⁸⁹ Cf. RICHES, JOHN – QUASH, BEN, "Hans Urs von Balthasar", *The Modern Theologians...*, p. 149.

others and also demonstrate openness to the Divine. He advocated a fundamental shift from a theology of ideas to a theology of relationships.²⁹⁰ This shift in theology was rooted in the inter-relatedness of the Trinity, the Christological dimension of total self-emptying and the human capacity to accept the revelation of God and respond in freedom. The understanding of Christian life as being intrinsically relational would be rooted in a more nuanced understanding of the Kenosis – an understanding which was strongly highlighted by Balthasar.

2.3.4.5 Conclusion

Kenosis as explained by Balthasar is the paradigm of Divine Love. In the kenosis of Christ we are made aware of the inner mystery of God as consisting in total self-giving. Christ revealed the mission of the Triune God by identifying Himself with His mission. The kenosis evidenced by Christ reveals a primal eternal kenosis within the Godhead and this makes possible all other kenotic movements of God into the world.²⁹¹ He also manifested that kenosis instead of being wholly resigned and passive is courageous, engaging and an apt mechanism for integral liberation.²⁹²

Balthasar does not at any point glorify suffering. Rather he draws our attention to the fact that even in the tragic death on the Cross 'Christ radiates the splendor of God's glory because he is perfectly in tune with the Father's will, obeying the Father even unto death and thereby fulfilling his mission to the world.'²⁹³ To the accusation that kenosis could encourage bondage, passivity and induce an attitude of victimhood, it could be said that Balthasar's interpretation of kenotic love is positive in nature and 'is the only way to safeguard the self on an ontological as well as spiritual level.'²⁹⁴

Suffering is part of the spiritual journey, but is not considered an intrinsic good in

²⁹⁰ One of the fears that Balthasar expressed regarding spirituality was that it should avoid the extremes of 'absorption and autonomy'. In varying degrees they take the practice of kenotic love out of its proper context and thus destroy its power to transform the individual. (Cf. YODER, TIMOTHY J. *Hans Urs von Balthasar...*, pp. 32-35.)

²⁹¹ Cf. GARRET, STEPHEN M. "The Dazzling Darkness of God's Triune Love"..., p. 421.

²⁹² Cf. YODER, TIMOTHY J. *Hans Urs von Balthasar...*, p.41.

²⁹³ Cf. GARRET, STEPHEN M. "The Dazzling Darkness of God's Triune Love"..., p. 421.

²⁹⁴ Cf. YODER, TIMOTHY J. *Hans Urs von Balthasar...*, p. 14.

itself and therefore does not merit glorification. What does merit glorification is love that disposes a person to accept suffering and humiliation. This is why Balthasar does not interpret kenosis primarily in terms as self-sacrifice, but as self-giving.²⁹⁵

Even though the eternal kenosis within the Triune God makes possible all kenotic movement, it must be pointed out that 'human kenosis is qualitatively different from divine kenosis, and the economic revelation of kenosis in Jesus is subtly different from kenosis within the Trinitarian realm.'²⁹⁶ The Divine Kenosis does not reveal to us a God who is primarily absolute power, but a God who is fundamentally absolute love. The selflessness of Divine Love that is expressed in terms of pure relations and total self-giving reveals to us the paradox that power does not consist in holding on but in letting go. Contemplating the divine way of action and being, we too are invited to go out of ourselves.²⁹⁷

Finally it can be said that the paradox of love as revealed in Christ was lived to the fullest by Mary through a life which was kenotic in nature and is used as an analogy for the Church.²⁹⁸ The lives of saints and the example offered to us by them affirms time and time again that an authentic interpretation of kenosis necessarily contains a social dimension and at the same time has respect for divergent spiritual paths. Balthasar's kenotic spirituality is flexible and is capable of dealing with various situations that emerge in following the mission entrusted by God.²⁹⁹ It does not totally solve the apologetic difficulty inherent in the understanding of kenotic love, but helps illuminate for Christians the paradoxical ways of God.³⁰⁰

²⁹⁵ Cf. IBID., p. 15. According to Balthasar's understanding of kenosis, self-giving and not self-sacrifice are constitutive of personhood. Besides this kenosis also includes sacrifice, poverty, struggle abandonment and death. (Cf. IBID., pp. 48-49.)

²⁹⁶ YODER, TIMOTHY J. *Hans Urs von Balthasar...*, p. 53.

²⁹⁷ Cf. LUCIEN, J. RICHARD. *A Kenotic...*, p. 174

²⁹⁸ Cf. RICHES, JOHN – QUASH, BEN, "Hans Urs von Balthasar", *The Modern Theologians...*, p. 147.

²⁹⁹ Cf. YODER, TIMOTHY J. *Hans Urs von Balthasar...*, pp. 92-93. In fact Balthasar's theology demands that each individual receives a specialized mission from God. In this dissertation the author presents the example of John of the Cross, Teresa of Lisieux and Elizabeth of the Trinity in order to explain his point.

³⁰⁰ Cf. OAKES, EDWARD T. "He descended into hell' ..., p. 245.

2.3.5 KARL RAHNER (1904 – 1984)

The last theologian whom we shall present in this section is Karl Rahner.³⁰¹ He belonged to the Society of Jesus and the influence of its charism is evident in his writings. Notable among them was the influence of the Spiritual Exercises.³⁰² He lived during a tumultuous period within the world and the Catholic Church.³⁰³

Rahner emphasized God's self-communication to the human person because he was convinced that God had created the human being so that they may receive God's self in their innermost being.³⁰⁴ He highlighted the importance of human experience and 'resolutely refused to divorce theology and spirituality into separate disciplines because of his conviction that one cannot exist without the other.'³⁰⁵

2.3.5.1 Human Experience as a Starting Point

Rather than using metaphysical speculation Rahner desired to give greater importance

³⁰¹ Karl Rahner was born in 1904 and joined the Society of Jesus in 1922. He underwent the usual formation and was ordained in 1932. He secured a doctorate in theology in 1936 at the University of Innsbruck. In addition to being a professor, he was involved in giving lectures, preaching, giving retreats and writing. He was appointed *peritus* to the Second Vatican Council, named to the Papal Theological Commission and was a recipient of numerous international academic honours. He died in 1984.

³⁰² NOIA, J. A. "Karl Rahner", *The Modern Theologians...*, p. 119. 'The mystical bent of Rahner's theology can in part be traced to his appropriation of the spiritual lessons of the Exercises, with its emphasis upon meditative introspection and direct encounter with Christ in long periods of Scripture reading and private prayer. The soul's experience of God in prayer served as a kind of paradigm for Rahner's theological account of the Christian mystery.'

³⁰³ Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 119-122. The new reality desired to remain faithful to traditional formulations, but wanted to present it in a manner which was coherent with modernity. On the one hand new defensive manuals emerged to block any new creative thought, while on the other hand 'progressive theologians sought to shake the dominance of derivative and unimaginative forms of neo-scholasticism in Catholic theology by welcoming new critical-historical methods to study Scriptures, liturgy, Patristics. Added to this was a more favorable approach to modern sciences as well as a more critical but positive reading of modern philosophers.

³⁰⁴ In presenting Rahner's understanding of the kenosis, we have used three articles by RØSOK, INGVLID. These include a thesis titled *Surrender to Life – A Systematic Theological Analysis of Human Kenosis in Karl Rahner's Thoughts, with Reference to Ignatian Spirituality*, Norwegian School of Theology, 2010 (this will be indicated by the initials *STL*); "Unconditional Surrender and Love – How Spirituality Illuminates the Theology of Karl Rahner", *The Way*, 50/4, 2011, pp. 121-132 (this will be indicated by the initials *USL*) and finally "The Kenosis of Christ Revisited: The Relational Perspective of Karl Rahner", *The Heythrop Journal*, 2012. (indicated by the initials *RPR*). The last article was purchased on <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com> on 31/05/2015.

³⁰⁵ EGAN, HARVEY D. "Theology and Spirituality", *The Cambridge Companion to Karl Rahner*, (Ed. Marmion, Declan – Hines, Mary E.), Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, 2005, p. 49. (This is an edition in iTunes and in future it will be indicated by the Initials *CCR*)

to concrete human experience and existence³⁰⁶ and therefore focused on having an anthropological approach as the starting point of his theology.³⁰⁷ He held that the human person was 'constitutively open to the possibility of hearing God's self-communication. Thus anthropology or reflection on the experience of being human is the condition for the possibility of receiving God's revelation.'³⁰⁸ Once we understood the human person as being open and transcendent to God, there would be a more integrated understanding of anthropocentricity and theocentricity.³⁰⁹

Rahner believed that the human person had the possibility of receiving revelation and responding to it.³¹⁰ He affirmed the reality of a variety of experiences but went beyond particular experiences and searched for the basic experience that expresses the totality of our being.

Rahner goes beyond all these particular experiences and sciences to search the basic experience that expresses the totality of our being. ...What, then, does this experience consist of? It is about the *feeling of self-possession and responsibility*. The human being could want to shift the responsibility for itself and its experiences to something outside of self, but he or she cannot avoid the fact that it is *he/she* who owns the experience, and that *he/she* is the one to perform whatever he/she does, knowingly and willingly. To be subject implies an awareness of the totality of life through all these different experiences. *Subjectivity* is there, co-present in all individual experience as its prior ground,

³⁰⁶ 'While he does not repudiate any portion of the classical theology of God, "neither- does he show much inclination to discuss it in detail. He deploys an extended transcendental argument to disclose in the human experience of God the grounds for explicit belief in him and thus for classical arguments for the existence of God.' NOIA, J. A. "Karl Rahner", *The...*, p. 123.

³⁰⁷ Cf. *STL*, pp. 15-16. 'Rahner mentions three main reasons why such an anthropological approach of theology is necessary. The first is given by the nature of the case, the second relates to the contemporary situation and the third has, most of all, apologetic reasons.'

³⁰⁸ *CCR*, p. 32.

³⁰⁹ *TI* – 9/2, (The quotes are taken from a CD edition released by the Center for Culture, Technology and Values.) 'As soon as man is understood as the being who is absolutely transcendent in respect of God, 'anthropocentricity' and 'theocentricity' in theology are not opposites but strictly one and the same thing, seen from two sides. Neither of the two aspects can be comprehended at all without the other. Thus, although anthropocentricity in theology is not the opposite of the strictest theocentricity, it is opposed to the idea that in theology man is one particular theme among others...'

³¹⁰ God cannot be known like we know other objects. Light is never known directly but only in its illumination of particular, concrete objects. God is the horizon against which all other kind of knowing takes place. As we try to grasp it, it keeps receding. God is not one more element of reality and will always remain the horizon towards which we keep moving. The mystery of God is 'always present but never grasped, always there but never as something we can get into focus, always experienced but never pinned down.' (Cf. KILBY, KAREN. *The SPCK Introduction to Karl Rahner*, SPCK: London, 2007, pp. 11-12.)

although...³¹¹

Even though Rahner considered human experience as the starting point for theological reflection, he did not dilute the gratuitous and transcendent nature of God's grace. In responding to the search of contemporary human persons, he highlighted the coherence, continuity and inter-relationship between the divine purpose and human activity.³¹² For him human experience was not limited to a religious experience as understood in a classical sense but revealed the presence of 'God's suffering and victorious love for us in Christ into every dimension of human life.'³¹³

2.3.5.3 The Transcendental Method

Transcendental arguments³¹⁴ form an important element in the development of Rahner's theology. They 'move beyond philosophical theology into the domain of fundamental theology in that it considers not only the conditions for the possibility of human knowledge of God's existence but also the conditions of human receptivity to a possible divine revelation.'³¹⁵ A transcendental argument has as its starting point not some observable or generalizable feature of the natural order, but the very structure of human knowledge itself.³¹⁶ Ordinarily the term 'transcendental' is understood as something which goes beyond the normal physical experience.³¹⁷ However Rahner introduces

³¹¹ STL, p. 18. This quote includes two quotes from CARR, ANNE. "Theology and Experience in the Thought of Karl Rahner", *The Journal of Religion* - 53, 1973, p. 19) and FCF, p. 30. The italicized words have been emphasized by us.

³¹² NOIA, J. A. "Karl Rahner", *The...*, p. 126.

³¹³ EGAN, HARVEY. "Karl Rahner's Theological Life Life", *Budhi: A Journal of Ideas and Culture* - VIII, 2004, p. 182.

³¹⁴ Rahner spoke of transcendental and categorical experiences while presenting his vision of human beings. They are not necessarily two different experiences, but two different dimensions of our experiencing. Categorical experiences refer to finite and particular persons or objects. Transcendental experience refers to our experience of going beyond all the things we know, choose and love. Rahner defined transcendental experience as that which 'consists precisely in the transcendence beyond any particular group of possible objects or of categories. (Cf. KILBY, KAREN. *The SPCK Introduction...*, p. 8.)

³¹⁵ NOIA, J. A. "Karl Rahner", *The Modern...*, p. 123

³¹⁶ This was against the classical arguments which took for their starting point realities of the natural order. This was in order to elaborate a metaphysical argument which would demonstrate that the natural order is brought into existence and preserved in existence by God. Rahner does not contest this argument but proposes the transcendental argument for its possibility. (Cf. IBID.)

³¹⁷ According to the Oxford Dictionary, the word 'transcendental' indicates a spiritual realm as well as being related to Kantian philosophy. 'Transcendent' on the other hand refers to that which is beyond or above the range of normal or physical human experience.

another meaning 'where he relates the word to a distinct way of understanding knowledge.'³¹⁸

Transcendence is intrinsic in our day to day living and this is possible because of the capacity to question everything. The radical capacity to question forms the very basic make-up of the human person and is indicative of self-presence as well as one's finiteness.³¹⁹ The fact that we have to question indicates our finiteness, but at the same time shows our openness to the ground of our being. This openness is 'an a priori presupposition for the possibility of hearing such a word'³²⁰ and is a necessary condition for the possibility of revelation. Though transcendence is fundamental in all experiences we have the freedom to overlook and evade this experience.³²¹ Rahner contended that a

... readiness to affirm the being of beings discloses that the human mind is structurally oriented to a horizon or backdrop of being. ...The horizon of being appears as limitless, unrestricted, or Absolute Being, and finally as Absolute Mystery.³²²

Rahner thus understood the human being as being grounded in something other than itself and oriented towards God.³²³ Irrespective of whether we are aware or open to

³¹⁸ *STL*, pp. 13-14. According to Kant, the term transcendental refers to 'an investigation of the subject's constitution, of what comes before knowing.' The investigations indicate the transcendental condition of the possibility of experience. This can be called the 'horizon' behind experience. Beyond space and time, we have no way of getting knowledge. Hence the term transcendental as a term for the horizon behind our experience functions as the barrier to any other kind of knowledge. (Cf. *RPR* – p. 1.) Rahner goes beyond the barrier that Kant's understanding generates and transforms the cognitional a priori of Kant into a metaphysical a priori. He goes beyond Kant's transcendental structures of reason which made it possible for sense perception to become knowledge and argued that *the readiness to affirm being* served as a kind of precondition for the knowledge of *anything* at all. (Cf. NOIA, J. A. "Karl Rahner", *The Modern...*, pp. 123-24.)

³¹⁹ 'When we feel that we have to inquire about being, we show the finiteness of our spirit in such a way, however, that the question itself reveals that being is, of itself, self-presence, luminosity, the original unity of knowing and being.' (RAHNER, KARL. *Hearer of the Word*, (Tr. Donceel, Joseph), The Continuum Publishing Company: New York, 1978, p. 30) as quoted in *STL*, p. 20)

³²⁰ RAHNER, KARL. *Hearer of the Word...*, p. 41.

³²¹ *STL*, pp. 19-20.

³²² NOIA, J. A. "Karl Rahner", *The...*, pp. 123-24

³²³ Cf. HOPPÁL, BULCSÚ KÁL. "Karl Rahner's Notion of Vorgriff", *Verbum VI/2*, 2004, pp. 451-59. The word *Vorgriff*, a term which was created by Heidegger was used by Rahner in order to denote the preapprehension of being. Preapprehension is a horizon which gives the possibility to experience the objects of the senses as limited and at the same time gives the possibility to experience the horizon's unlimitedness. (Cf. *IBID.*) Rahner believed that the movement towards the unlimited horizon cannot be grounded in nothingness, but by what he calls 'being in an absolute sense'. God manifests Himself in the depths of the subject, causing awareness of its being and of being as such. (Cf. *STL*, p. 22)

the fact, 'our whole being is directed toward a holy, loving Mystery who is the basis of our existence.'³²⁴ The whole of creation reveals the self-communication of God and 'exists in order to be the recipient of God's free gift of self.'³²⁵ However we always retain the freedom to reject God's self-communication but can never separate ourselves from it.³²⁶ According to Rahner this constant self-communication of God is the experience of grace and is at the heart of human existence.³²⁷

2.3.5.3 Trinity and Christology

Rahner's theology of the *Trinity* consists in his affirmation that the economic trinity is the immanent trinity.³²⁸ The 'external missions of the Son and the Holy Spirit are extensions of the internal processions in God Himself.'³²⁹ The danger of such a position consisted in apparently compromising on the freedom and independence of the Trinity.³³⁰ However Rahner underlines the importance of the 'free decree of God' in the process of self-communication.³³¹

However what does the economic Trinity reveal to the human person about the very being of God? In the first place we come to know that the two basic modes of

³²⁴ EGAN, HARVEY D. "Theology and Spirituality" ..., p. 53.

³²⁵ IBID, p. 52. Rahner uses two terms in order to explain the dynamic inter-relationship between the Creator and creation. The term 'supernatural existential' refers to the emphasis upon grace as God self-communication to every person and 'obediential potency' refers to the human person's natural ability to receive God's self-offer. (IBID., p. 53.)

³²⁶ Rahner believed that whether we realize it or not we are *already* related to God and this relatedness is essential to us. It is part of us, critical in making us who we are and nothing would be possible without it. When we know, will or exercise our freedom we have a dynamism towards God. Any choice of a finite object is at the same time a choice towards the infinite God that is God. When we choose that which is negative, we are still related to God because the freedom to make a choice cannot come without being relatedness to God. (Cf. KILBY, KAREN. *The SPCK Introduction ...*, pp. 2,6.)

³²⁷ Cf. IBID., pp. 52-54.

³²⁸ RAHNER, KARL. "Trinity", *The Concise Sacramentum Mundi*, (Ed. Rahner, Karl), The Seabury Press: New York, 1975, p. 1758. (In future this will be referred to as CSM)

³²⁹ NOIA, J. A. "Karl Rahner", *The...*, p. 128.

³³⁰ The risk of too close an identification of the mission and processions could seem to indicate that the Trinity could not be fully independent of creation and redemption. In traditional theology, creation, incarnation and grace were seen as free acts of God. Rahner's understanding of the Trinity ran the risk of seeing the '*free acts of creation, incarnation and grace as necessary extensions of God's inner self-expression and self-possession.*' Cf. IBID., pp. 128-29.

³³¹ He goes on to explain how the self-communication of God is a mystery and beyond rationalistic speculation. Emphasizing it further he would say that '*the self-communication in question is not only not deducible a priori, since it is a free act of God in fact.*' (Cf. CSM, pp. 1759-60.)

divine self-communication are truth and love. 'As truth, the self-communication takes place in history and is the offer of the free faithfulness of God. As love, it brings about acceptance and opens man's transcendence to the absolute future of God.'³³² This self-communication is revealed in the two missions of the Son and the Spirit. These two missions that are in fact a unity,³³³ and they along with the act of creation are free acts.³³⁴ The essence of the mission reveals to us the kenotic self-emptying love of God leading to an inner transformation within the human person.³³⁵

Rahner maintains that the 'Trinity *ad extra* and *ad intra* are identical, because one would not be speaking of a self-communication of God unless the two missions and the two persons thus there for us, in whom God comes to us, were 'part' of God himself.'³³⁶ The intrinsic connection between the processions *ad extra* and *ad intra* indicates that creation and Incarnation have their possibility with the immanent Trinity.³³⁷ Because of the Trinity *ad extra* as revealed in Christ we have a definitive and complete revelation of the nature, identity and intentions of the Triune God.³³⁸

Moving on to Rahner's *Christology* we shall begin by stating that it needs to be understood within the wider picture of what it means to be human.³³⁹ Rahner develops

³³² CSM, p. 1761.

³³³ Rahner suggests that there is an inter-connectedness between the mission of the Son and the Spirit. '*...the divine self-communication to the world in the Spirit (grace) and the self-communication in the hypostatic union are one and the same free act, because these two communication are each the condition of the other.*' (CSM, p. 1760.)

³³⁴ '*This twofold self-communication of God is really self-communication, in contrast to creation...*' (Cf. CSM, pp. 1760.)

³³⁵ CSM, pp. 1760-61. '*God imparts himself to the finite, needy, sinful creature. And this outgoing, without self-seeking or gain, taking a risk with others because one is great enough freely to be small among others, is precisely what is meant by love, in the sense of the NT agape. ...God's self-communication aims at the inner-most center of the human person and is active there not only as the gift but as the power of the acceptance of the gift.*'

³³⁶ *IBID.*

³³⁷ Cf. LUCIEN, RICHARD. *A Kenotic Christology...*, p. 174. '*Change can only be understood with the trinitarian perspective. The real possibility is the becoming of the Son within the immanent Trinity and this constitutes the transcendental presupposition of change. Creation and Incarnation have their possibility within the immanent Trinity and can be understood only in terms of their relation to the procession of the Word within the Godhead.*'

³³⁸ NOIA, J. A. "Karl Rahner", *The...*, p. 128.

³³⁹ Cf. ENDEAN, PHILIP. "Rahner, Christology and Grace", *Heythrop Journal* – 37, 1996, pp. 294-95. He did not question the truthfulness of Chalcedon which defined Jesus Christ as fully human and fully divine. Rather he reflected on what the definition at Chalcedon meant to the contemporary human person. His Christology was firmly grounded in the historical structure of human knowledge and was definitively and irrevocably realized in a unique person at a

Christology from an evolutionary point of view which begins by stating that the human person is mysterious and open to the infinite. The climax of such a being can be seen in Christ³⁴⁰ who was totally oriented to, given over and taken over by God. Rahner's Christology indicates an anthropology which transcends itself.³⁴¹ 'To be human is to transcend all things to 'go beyond' all things towards God: when this transcendence, this 'going beyond', is carried to its single, highest and most radical instance, then in that case to be human simply is to be God.'³⁴² The ultimate fulfillment of His humanity was his divinity.³⁴³

Explaining the Incarnation, Rahner would say that 'the incarnation of God is therefore the unique, supreme, case of the total actualization of human reality, which consists of the fact that man is in so far as he gives up himself.'³⁴⁴ The total self-giving of Christ and transcendence can be better understood by looking at the meaning of grace. Rahner explains grace as God's self-giving.

The most important thing that God gives in grace is not this or that particular gift, but God's very *self*, and Rahner describes this gift of himself as God's 'self-communication. From this one central gift flow the other more particular things which can also, in a secondary sense, be described by the word grace. As a result of the fact that God gives himself to people and dwells in them, in other words, is that they are gradually transformed...'³⁴⁵

God from the beginning created 'what is other than himself in order to give

particular moment in history.

³⁴⁰ *STL*, p. 32.

³⁴¹ 'Christology is anthropology transcending itself and anthropology is deficient Christology.' This phrase is taken from an article titled *Current Problems in Christology*, that is quoted in the above mentioned article by Philip Endean, Philip where he indicates a critique of Kasper. Kasper suggests that by taking anthropology as the starting point for Christology, Rahner has (despite good intentions) reduced Christology to philosophy. (Cf. ENDEAN, PHILIP. "Rahner, Christology...", p. 292.

³⁴² Cf. KILBY, KAREN. *The SPCK Introduction...*, p. 20.

³⁴³ Such a position was not without its difficulties because it seems to suggest that Christ was one more man and the only difference in Him was a matter of degree. He lived his humanity to its limits and in doing so was divine. However Rahner also insisted in highlighting the uniqueness and absoluteness of Christ. The above mentioned position of Rahner was primarily in order to situate Christ's humanity within the common humanity of all. (Cf. KILBY, KAREN. *The SPCK Introduction...*, p. 20)

³⁴⁴ *TI - IV*, p. 110.

³⁴⁵ Cf. KILBY, KAREN. *The SPCK Introduction...*, p. 22.

himself to it.’³⁴⁶ This self-giving reached its climax in Christ and therefore the Incarnation is not to be considered a turning point in history, but as the high point of history. Thus creation and Incarnation are not disparate acts, but two important moments in the history of the world. Rahner emphasized that the Incarnation was not provoked by human sinfulness and the result of an afterthought.³⁴⁷ Rather it was the peak of the process of God’s self-communication within human history. It is ‘the climax of the process of God’ self-communication that happened *within the total history* of the human race.’³⁴⁸

Christ’s life and death make sense within the broader context of grace.³⁴⁹ The divine revelation and human response are perfect and definitive in Christ.³⁵⁰ In the human reality of Jesus we have the kenosis of God.³⁵¹

Christ reveals to us definitively the commitment of God towards total self-emptying and at the same time the definitive human acceptance of God’s self-gift.³⁵² Christ reveals to us the fulfillment of human transcendence and the uniqueness of Christ lies in the fact that the self-gift of God revealed in Christ is eschatological, unsurpassable and irreversible.³⁵³ The eternal nature of God’s self-gift in Christ is explained by Rahner in the following manner:

³⁴⁶ *IBID.*, p. 28.

³⁴⁷ God is not a particular being but the all sustaining Creator. God does not change and therefore any understanding of the incarnation in terms of God altering plans, say in reaction to creaturely sinfulness, or of God intervening as a creature within the chain of created causes, is impossible. (Cf. ENDEAN, PHILIP. “Rahner, Christology...”, p. 286.)

³⁴⁸ *STL*, p. 31.

³⁴⁹ Rahner has important point related to created and uncreated grace. It was often believed that created grace where a person was transformed by God led to uncreated grace which consisted in the indwelling of God. However Rahner would reverse this and indicate that it was the presence of uncreated grace which transformed the person. The indwelling of the Spirit transforms a person. The consequence of the earlier understanding was that greater emphasis was given to particular gifts while the perspective of Rahner led one to focus primarily on God’s self-giving. (Cf. KILBY, KAREN. *The SPCK Introduction...*, p. 23.)

³⁵⁰ Cf. NOIA, J. A. “Karl Rahner”, *The...*, p. 130.

³⁵¹ EGAN, HARVEY D. “Theology and Spirituality”..., p. 65. ‘...one finds only in Jesus Christ God’s very own self-communication and its perfect acceptance made one by God. Jesus’ human reality is God’s self-emptying, self-expressing Word in the world. From the very moment of his existence, Jesus in his human reality is God’s kenosis – and he now exists eternally as such.’

³⁵² Cf. KILBY, KAREN. *The SPCK Introduction...*, p. 27.

³⁵³ Cf. ENDEAN, PHILIP. “Rahner, Christology...”, p. 291.

Jesus, the Man, not merely was at one time of decisive importance for our salvation, i.e. for the real finding of the absolute God, by his historical and now past acts of the Cross, etc., but – as the one who became man and has remained a creature – he is now and for all eternity the permanent openness of our finite being to the living God of infinite, eternal life...³⁵⁴

Christ found his identity in and through his relationship to the world in which he lived. He became what He was meant to be in his humanity, in a true historical presence by being our brother and affirming our validity as others. His human experience was not different from ours and it was by a process of self-giving that his true identity was revealed. The Christology of Rahner is dynamic and relational in nature underlining the 'idea of self-transformation through an ongoing encounter with the distinctive otherness of Jesus, and in him with all creation.'³⁵⁵

2.3.5.4 Kenosis

Rahner rarely refers directly to the kenosis, but it is a paradigm that is present throughout his writings. Leo O'Donovan indicates it when he says that:

The paradigm (of Rahner's writings), though I do not recall a text where Rahner explicitly notes this, is the kenosis (self-emptying) of Christ as described by St. Paul in the hymn of Philippians 2:5–11. To intimate the dynamics of this experience of self-domination, Rahner strained language to its limits, ringing changes on a range of words at once ordinary and poetic. He spoke of our giving ourselves to God, of surrendering ourselves, of giving or risking ourselves away, of denying ourselves, of no longer really disposing of ourselves, of letting oneself go, of no longer belonging to oneself.³⁵⁶

Rahner's focus while interpreting the kenosis is not so much about the attributes that were relinquished by God, but rather about attitudes such as giving and receiving. Though he may not have too many explicit references regarding the word 'kenosis', we comes across words such as surrender, becoming, abandoning and renunciation with great frequency. These words refer both to God's self-giving as well as the human attitude.³⁵⁷ Kenosis is presented within the context of two perspectives – the self-

³⁵⁴ *TI – III*, p. 44.

³⁵⁵ Cf. ENDEAN, PHILIP. "Rahner, Christology...", pp. 287-88,294. .

³⁵⁶ RØSOK, INGILD. "Unconditional Surrender...", pp. 121-22. (Quoting O'DONOVAN, LEO J. 'On Reading Rahner in a New Century', in *Finding God in All Things*, (Ed. Mark Bosco - David Stagaman), Fordham: New York, 2004, p. 141.

³⁵⁷ There has been some debate whether Rahner sufficiently emphasizes the uniqueness of Christ's total self-emptying

emptying of God and the self-surrender of the human person.³⁵⁸ In order to explain this section systematically we have divided it into three sections: the kenosis of God, human kenosis, and the unity in loving God and the human person.

The *kenosis of God* is revealed in the person of Jesus Christ. Through his humility and obedience he manifested a kenotic attitude. This attitude was primarily rooted in love which was manifest in His deliberate choice to go all the way up to the cross. (*USL*, 121) Various words are used in order to indicate the kenotic attitude of Christ. However for the moment we shall focus on Christ's obedience and self-surrender.

These two attitudes were significant in Christ's kenotic attitude and can be seen in His relation to His Father. (*STL*, 39) Obedience is closely linked to the unity of wills between God and the human person. The unity of Jesus' will and that of His Father was rooted in freedom and this unity manifest itself in Jesus' total obedience to His mission.³⁵⁹ The second attitude was that of self-surrender where Jesus gave himself completely to the Father by accepting His finitude. During the Incarnation and his historical existence, even though he consistently recognized his divine origin, He freely and repeatedly gave it away. The climax of His obedience and self-surrender is revealed in his death on the Cross. (*STL*, 40) Rahner elaborates the obedience and self-surrender in *Foundations of Christian Faith* when he says:

The man Jesus exists in a unity of wills with the Father which permeates his whole reality totally and from the outset, in an "obedience" from out of which he orients his whole human reality; he is someone who continually accepts himself from the Father and who in all of the dimensions of his existence has always given himself over to the Father totally; in this surrender he is able to accomplish due to God what we are not able to accomplish; he is someone whose "basic constitution" as the original unity of being and consciousness is

or merely indicates that it is a model which all Christians are invited to follow. We believe that the answer to this criticism has already been explained in the earlier section where the uniqueness of Christ was elaborated.

³⁵⁸ *RPR*, pp. 2, 6. (As indicated earlier these initials refer to RØSOK, INGVILD. "The Kenosis of Christ Revisited – Relational Perspective of Karl Rahner", *The Heythrop Journal*, 2012, pp. 2, 6. Two other works by the same author have been indicated by initials such as *STL* and *USL* where *USL* refers to "Unconditional Surrender and Love – How Spirituality Illuminates the Theology of Karl Rahner", *The Way – 50/4*, 2011, pp. 121-132. In 2.3.5.4 we shall be placing these initials within the text in order to save space in the footnotes section.)

³⁵⁹ His relationship with the Father was one of complete openness where he increasingly lost himself to the Father. His entire being was oriented towards the Father so as to fulfill the mission that was assigned to Him. (*STL*, pp. 39-39)

to have his origins in God radically and completely, and to be given over to God radically and completely.³⁶⁰

The two important moments in the kenosis of God are the Incarnation and death on the Cross.³⁶¹ In interpreting these two moments, he deals with the issues of God's immutability and change. He maintains the traditional stance that God who has taken the initiative to reach out to the human person remains unchanged.³⁶² However he suggests that in asserting the immutability of God we should not 'lose sight of the fact that what took place in Jesus as *becoming* and as *history here in our midst*.'³⁶³ In explaining the 'becoming' of God he shows the dynamic nature of God. God participates in history and possesses the other by emptying Himself or going out of Himself. Such an emptying or going out results from the fullness of love.

... the basic element, according to our faith, is the self-emptying, the coming to be of God himself, who can come to be by becoming another thing, derivative, in the act of constituting it, without having to change in his own proper reality which is the unoriginated origin. By the fact that he remains in his infinite fullness while he empties himself-because, being love, that is, the will to fill the void, he has that wherewith to fill all – the ensuing other is his own proper reality. ... God himself goes out of himself, God in

³⁶⁰ FCF, p. 254 (as quoted in STL, p. 39.)

³⁶¹ These two moments are intimately linked to Rahner's explanation of descending and ascending Christology. Rahner is cautious in not compartmentalizing the Incarnation and Cross so as to be synonymous with each of these Christologies. He suggests that in Christology from below or Christology of saving history '*the eye of the believer in his experience of saving history alights first on the man Jesus of Nazareth, and on him in his fully human reality, in his death, in the absolute powerless and in the abidingly definitive state which his reality and his fate have been brought to by God, something which we call his Resurrection, his glorification, his sitting at the right hand of the Father. The eye of faith rests upon this man Jesus. He is, in the concrete sense described, the content of the specifically Christian experience, and the experience of saving history*'. On the other hand the decisive element in Christology from above or metaphysical Christology '*is, precisely that it proceeds, as something that is self-evident and does not need any further recourse to the experience of Jesus in saving history, from a doctrine of the Trinity, the Logos, and a pre-existing Son of God. And these assumptions are properly speaking based not upon the experience in saving history of the crucified and risen Jesus, but are made known through verbal teaching by this same Jesus, a teaching which is placed upon his lips and regarded as his ipsissima verba.*' (Cf. TI – 13, pp. 217-218.)

³⁶² Rahner does not offer a direct 'yes' or 'no' answer to the question regarding the change in God. (RPR, pp. 5.) He insists that God can establish something different, but God-self is not subject to this difference. God can create and God can self-empty, but can do so without losing himself in this communication. In *On the Theology of the Incarnation* Rahner says that '*the fact of the Incarnation, which our faith testifies to be the fundamental dogma of Christianity, we must simply say: God can become something, he who is unchangeable in himself can himself become subject to change in something else.*' (TI – IV, p. 114.)

³⁶³ FCF, p. 220. (As quoted in RPR, p. 4.)

his quality of the fullness which gives away itself.³⁶⁴

The God who empties Himself totally in Christ without changing His own proper reality reveals that an attitude wherein the abandonment of oneself is in fact the real essence of the human person. (*USL*, 123-24) In Christ we realize that 'to be, is to abandon oneself' and in the twin dimensions of His kenosis we see an actualization and fulfillment of human nature.³⁶⁵ This was accomplished in the life of Christ and is offered to the human person as a way to follow. 'The Christian, every Christian at all times, follows Jesus by dying with him; following Jesus has its ultimate truth and reality and universality in the following of the Crucified.'³⁶⁶ Christ attained the fullness of His humanity through a life which acknowledged, affirmed and emptied itself for others. We too would find our existence by following the Crucified through an other-centered life where we are oriented towards the 'thou' of other human beings.³⁶⁷

With this explanation on the kenosis of God we now move to the *kenosis of the human person*. 'The human being is constituted to receive God's self-communication.'³⁶⁸ The transcendental method has shown us that there is an *a priori* possibility within the human person to receive divine revelation and be oriented towards the infinite horizon of being. (*STL*, 45) The existential possibility of being able to receive the divine Word and respond to it adequately makes human kenosis a responding act – an act which is undertaken in freedom. (*STL*, 15,20) The conditions for a human kenosis thus consist in the intrinsic makeup of human nature with its openness towards God and towards others as well as the gratuitous self-communication on the part of God. (*USL*, 123)

³⁶⁴ *TI – IV*, pp. 114-115.

³⁶⁵ The human nature of Christ is not only constituted to receive God but also to express God. (*RPR*, p. 6.)

³⁶⁶ *TI – XVIII*, p. 160.

³⁶⁷ ENDEAN, PHILIP. "Rahner, Christology...", p. 288. 'In the Incarnation, the Logos emptied himself into his human nature, which is essentially orientated to the 'thou' of other human beings. If human persons are to find their own existence, they need those who are human with them genuinely to be other, to be different, i.e. precisely not clones. Human beings find their own perfection only in the otherness of those who are human with them, an otherness acknowledged, affirmed and sheerly loved. This applies also to Christ, indeed especially so. Of him too we must say: through the Word made human, loving human beings as others and because they are others, he too attains the fullness of this nature. He becomes what he is meant to be in his humanity, in a true historical presence, only - really only - through his being our brother and affirming our validity as others.'

³⁶⁸ This is a quote from *FCF*, 223 which states that 'God establishes creatures by his creative power insofar as he establishes them from out of nothing in their own no-divine reality as the grammar of God's possible self-expression'. (Cf. *STL*, p. 45.)

Self-surrender and an acceptance of one's finite existence as seen in Christ is fundamental for human kenosis. (*STL*, 42) Self surrender belongs to the very essence of the human being, actualizing the fullness of human nature. It is only by surrendering oneself totally to God that one returns to the self and become genuine subjects. (*RPR*, 7) This awareness of being a true subject and having a presence of oneself is an important aspect of kenosis.³⁶⁹ To know oneself as a subject is also to relate to the world in which one exists. (*STL*, 4,18) The process of surrendering requires the emptying of oneself in order that one's entire existence is encompassed by God's self-offering. (*STL*, 25)

Another element of human kenosis is the acceptance of our finite existence. As we become aware of our finiteness, we become aware of, and search for the infinite and absolute being that might encompass our finite being. (*STL*, 20) The realization that we are dependent on the Absolute Mystery that is the ground of our being, demands a response of acceptance and rejection. The ultimate point of such a decision lies in the moment of physical death, but Rahner argues that the experience of death cannot be restricted to one singular moment or even a few moments. It is an ongoing process where death is not understood in a medical sense, but a theological sense. Death is therefore a daily experience wherein an individual goes through an experience of 'dying in installments' (*STL*, 44)³⁷⁰

The transcendental theology of Rahner offers an optimistic attitude towards the realization of one's finiteness and surrender. (*STL*, 11) It is not an abstract notion which

³⁶⁹ In *Mystical Experience and Mystical Theology* Rahner highlights the importance of self-surrender when he says that. '... radical self-discovery of the subject is possible in the unconditional surrender to the mystery which we call God – a surrender which comprehends the whole of existence...' *TI – XVII*, p. 98.

³⁷⁰ *TI – XVIII*, pp. 169-170. '...death in a theological sense occurs throughout the whole of life and reaches its completion only at the end. Hence, (it includes all) experiences of human frailty, of sickness, of disappointments, of the nonfulfillment of our expectations, and so on. What occurs in all this is part of man's dying, of the destruction of life's tangible goods. In all these brief moments of dying in installments we are faced with the question of how we are to cope with them: whether we merely protest, merely despair (even for brief moments), become cynical and cling all the more desperately and absolutely to what has not yet been taken from us, or whether we abandon with resignation what is taken from us, accept twilight as promise of an eternal Christmas full of light, regard slight breakdowns as events of grace. If in this second way (which cannot by any means be so easily distinguished from the first) we take the cross on ourselves daily, we are accomplishing part of the following of the Crucified, we are practising faith and loving hope in which death is accepted as the advent of eternal life and the following of Jesus, the Crucified, reaches its completion.'

is related to some unknown mystery, but consists in an encounter with the humanity of Christ in the historical Jesus. Jesus through his life and attitudes evokes a radical and concrete challenge and this is a primary key to understand human kenosis. (*RPR*, 9)

By being involved in His life – and death – one is partaking in his surrender, which is to be seen as the only way to the unity with God towards which the human being is always reaching out. In this way self-surrender and human kenosis is for Rahner the transcendental, unthematized constitution of the human being that becomes thematic and radical when confronted with the historical Jesus Christ.³⁷¹

The humanity of Jesus reveals to us the response to the self-gift of God through a life of total abandonment and self-surrender. God is the gift and the giver, God is not dependent on human responses to be God. However in the humanity of Christ we realize that without a human response, the self-communication is not accomplished. Thus we can say that human kenosis like divine kenosis is relational. (*RPR*, 6-7) Rahner explained that the love of God is irreversible and the kenosis of Christ empowers a person to abandon oneself for another.³⁷² There is unity in the two-fold kenotic movement in loving God and loving one's neighbor.³⁷³ Unconditional love for the other is simultaneously understood as being united with God. The unity of this two-fold movement could be explained by saying that:

...there is no love for God that is not, in itself, already a love for neighbor; and a love for God only comes to its own identity through its fulfillment in a love for neighbor. Only one who loves his or her neighbor can know who God actually is. And only one who ultimately loves God (whether he or she is reflexively aware of this or not is another matter) can manage unconditionally to abandon himself or herself to another person, and not make that person the means of his or her own self-assertion.³⁷⁴

Rahner believed that just as there was a transcendental constitution which was

³⁷¹ *RPR*, p. 9.

³⁷² There is some debate whether the Christ event has resulted in an ontological change in human nature. The author seems to indicate that some change has taken place where the event and historical knowledge has actualized the potency which was existed as an offer. She further states that the inner being has been empowered and through the process of abandoning oneself, one dies to one's false self-centeredness and egoism. A person who accepts one's finiteness and surrenders to the mystery affirms God's grace as the only source of fulfillment. (*STL*, pp. 45-46.)

³⁷³ '... the first is the basic surrender, the acknowledging of God as the infinite ground, and the acceptance of our human finiteness leading to death as the final surrender to God. Secondly, through this basic surrender the person is empowered by God's grace, enabling a genuine love for the neighbor.' *RPR*, pp. 10-11.

³⁷⁴ *USL*, p. 128.

intrinsic to a human person in the same way there is a transcendental constitution of love. (*USL*, 127) He believed that 'the love of God and the love of neighbor are one and the same thing, and that, in this way and in this way alone, we understand what God and his Christ are, and that we accomplish what is the love of God in Christ when we allow the love of our neighbor to attain its own nature and perfection.'³⁷⁵ He believed that 'even the explicit act of loving God is borne by the love that takes place in the encounter with the other.' (*USL*, 128) Love is grounded in this encounter with the other and without such an encounter, no transcendental experience could take place.

2.3.5.5 Conclusion

As we come to the end of our presentation of Rahner's theological views it is evident that our effort represents merely a small speck in trying to understand his voluminous works. This is because our attempt has been to present kenosis from the perspective of humility and self-emptying love.

In conclusion it can be said that Rahner regards love as an act of kenosis and in Christ the unity of love was fully realized. He manifested his self-emptying love by concrete acts which culminated in voluntarily accepting death on the Cross.³⁷⁶ Since Christ is the ground of definitive love, anyone who engages in loving one's neighbor is living a life of kenotic love. The grace of God enables us to love and this takes place irrespective of the fact whether we are aware of it or not. Despite the fact that we may be ignorant or reject the self-communication of God, 'God's grace is always and already there as an offer sustaining every positive act, including the surrender to death.'³⁷⁷

It is like a circular move of grace, where God creates our openness just to fill it by emptying himself. The only way to sense this kenotic act is by participating in the kenosis by surrender to it in mute, adoring love.³⁷⁸

There is a progressive evolution of human history and the history of revelation –

³⁷⁵ *TI-IV*, pp. 233-34.

³⁷⁶ *USL*, pp. 129, 131.

³⁷⁷ *STL*, p. 43.

³⁷⁸ *IBID.* p. 46.

both of which are related to each other.³⁷⁹ Christianity is a process where grace is always present in human existence. A person may reject it but it has been and continues to be offered. On the other hand 'the acceptance of the offer is always a matter of growth: it is always already given as something which the human person, has still to make good and appropriate and to bring it to radical actualization in the commitment of their whole existence through the whole length and breadth and depth of their lives.'³⁸⁰

Creation which manifests an essential unity reveals the human person as one who is radically open to reality and not self-enclosed or self-sufficient. The whole movement of creation thus 'reaches its goal in the free and self-conscious human person.'³⁸¹ Jesus' experience is not different from ours and consists in having the same essential nature as other self-conscious subjects in grace.³⁸² The human person is invited to imitate this experience by living a life which 'depends on a gratuitous, permanently transformative initiative which follows its own logic.'³⁸³

CONCLUSION

The Divine Kenosis has played a critical role in the understanding of the Christian faith. The first few centuries indicated the struggle to arrive at the defining element of the Christian faith which understood Christ as being fully human and fully divine. Given the various theological, philosophical and spiritual currents this was no easy task and hence the Fathers of the Church had to make great efforts to present the central dimension of the Christian faith within a Judaic world view at first and later on to the Hellenized world. The theological concepts were taken from the known world and adapted in order to coherently explain the Christian faith.

³⁷⁹ The universal revelation of God' self-giving has been expressed through symbols. Some of these symbols are explicitly religious and others are not. (Cf. NOIA, J. A. "Karl Rahner", *The...*, p. 130.)

³⁸⁰ ENDEAN, PHILIP. "Rahner, Christology...", p. 288.

³⁸¹ SIEBENROCK, ROMAN A. "Christology", *The Cambridge Companion to Karl Rahner...*, p. 234. He makes use of the term 'active self-transcendence' which refers to a real becoming in creation without negating previous stages of the evolutionary process. Rahner's Christology is situated where the two movements from above and below come together. (Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 234-34.)

³⁸² *FCF*, p. 200. (As quoted in ENDEAN, PHILIP. "Rahner, Christology...", p. 290.)

³⁸³ ENDEAN, PHILIP. "Rahner, Christology...", p. 295.

The main point that we have tried to explain in this chapter has been that the historical Jesus, whose humility and self-emptying love was elaborated in the first chapter, was experienced by the Christian community to be the Divine Saviour. He was the revelation of God and definitively manifested the very being of God. The failure of the 18th and 19th century theologians to interpret the kenosis would influence its interpretation of the 20th century. The historical realities as well the development of other sciences would ensure a serious shift in the focus and methodology of theology. This in turn would allow a more appropriate understanding of the kenosis so as to aid the theological reflection of the contemporary human person.

As far as contemporary trends are concerned, it is obvious that we have only dealt with a fraction of theological reflection during the last century. Our attempt has been limited whereby we have tried to show how the kenosis of God transforms a person in order to live a life of self-emptying love. This love is concretely manifested in a life of humility wherein humility entails self-surrender and an acceptance of one's finiteness. The self-emptying love and humility is paradoxically the source of true life and fulfilment. Self-actualization which is proposed in various forms and longed for by the human person consists in participating in the divine kenosis. This participation takes place when the human person can engage in a process of human kenosis.

CHAPTER 3

DIVINE HUMILITY AND HUMAN TRANSFORMATION

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

The full reality of God's love revealed in humility is beyond the grasp of a human person. Being limited we can only grasp what God is, as has been revealed to us in the context of our imperfections. God 'talks to men in the language of men; he does not expect men to talk about Him and to talk to him in any language but their own.'¹ Thus Jesus Christ who is the divine Word became one of us and revealed to us the very being of God. The humble self-emptying love of God is revealed throughout the life of Jesus. However it is during the moments of abject humility and abandonment that God's love manifests its greatest glory.

The earlier chapters provided an historical and theological overview of the Divine Kenosis. This chapter builds upon the same and links the Divine Kenosis to human transformation. Authentic spiritual transformation can only take place through an experience of God's unconditional love as revealed in the Divine Kenosis. The scope of this chapter is transitional in nature whereby it develops on the explanations of the

¹ VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God*, (Tr. Marans, N.), Alba House: New York, 1975, p. 33.

previous two chapters and provides them as a basis for the subsequent chapters in the second and third section. The biblical and theological foundations of the previous chapters will be reinforced with some anthropological explanations in this chapter. These will then form the basis of understanding the transformative role of humility in the foundational experiences of the Society of Jesus as well as the spiritual process proposed to a candidate in the General Examen.

This chapter has three parts – the first two parts further explain the Christological and Trinitarian dimensions of the Divine Kenosis and the last part elaborates the human transformation and participation in the Divine Kenosis. The first is Christological in nature and explains as to how the humility of Christ is a revelation of the impassible love of God. This love was concretely manifested in the humility seen during the Incarnation, the public life, the passion and finally in its most glorious form on the Cross. The second part is Trinitarian in nature. It explains to us that the self-emptying love of Christ reveals the being of the Triune God. The being of the Triune God consists in existing for the other and this existence is characterized by humility, self-emptying love and total self-giving. The humility of each of the Three Persons of the Trinity is explained briefly. Finally we end with some comments on *Perichoresis* where the inter-relatedness of the Trinity will be explained.

The third part represents the transitional phase where we show the consequences of the Divine Kenosis in the transformative process of the person. We begin by explaining that the Divine Kenosis clarifies the goal of the human person. The human person has been made in the image of God and is called to participate in the Trinitarian mystery of love. Such participation is a person true identity and despite the reality of sin and self-love there is a longing to experience the fullness of life by living an authentic existence. We explain how this authentic existence is founded on an ongoing experience of God's love as revealed in the Divine Kenosis and proceeds forward in the degree that one freely accepts this gratuitous love and responds in a generous, conscious and responsible manner. Humility is critical for spiritual growth whereby a person, through a progressive imitation of Christ experiences an ever increasing union with God. This is

concretely manifested in a relationship of humble love towards others and greater authenticity.

3.1 CHRIST'S HUMILITY AND THE REVELATION OF GOD'S LOVE:

3.1.1 HUMILITY AND THE IMPASSIBILITY OF LOVE

What does the humility of Christ reveal about the very being of God? It consists in the revelation of an impassible God whose love is total and eternal. It also reveals a love expressed in poverty and humility bereft of the pomp and splendour that characterizes the displays of the world. It reveals a God who is historically involved and this historical involvement has been revealed in an extraordinary manner on various occasions which include creation, the Incarnation, the public life of Christ and finally revealed itself in all its glory on the Cross. The transversal factor in this on-going revelation of love, especially in the Incarnate Word has as its foundational elements poverty and humility which reveal God's mode of being and expression. God has been revealed and continues to be experienced definitively at a personal and corporate level in Christ who was poor and humble.

As seen in the preceding chapters a lot has been written about the impassibility of God and God's involvement with created reality. Despite God's involvement in human reality, the essential being of God does not change. God has, is and continues to be a being who is the totality of self-emptying love. God's omnipotence is omnipotence to love which is revealed in poverty, dependence and humility.

Dios solo es todopoderoso en el Amor. Es el poder del Amor pobre y humilde, que se sitúa a nuestro lado para establecer una relación capaz de transformar la existencia humana. El amor establece una relación de tal calidad que nos permite ser a, cada uno un yo bien realizado en el encuentro.²

The immutability of God had been interpreted as consisting in various divine attributes. The kenotic theories of the 18th and 19th centuries tried to explain the kenosis within this paradigm but failed. However when immutability is primarily understood

² GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad de Dios*, Sal Terrae: Santander, 2012, p. 159.

within the paradigm of love we have a coherent theological understanding of the kenosis. The unchangeable and constant factor within Christ during the entire history of salvation is love. Christ's self-emptying love was the expression of God's will to love and participate in the human condition. The kenosis reveals that Christ did not engage in an act of self-emptying 'though' he was in the form of God, but rather 'because' he was in the form of God.³

The impassibility of love is expressed in an extraordinary manner on the Cross. The self-gift of God which is the fruit of love and had been manifest all along is taken to its extreme in the supreme self-gift of accepting death on the cross.⁴ The cross was an object of degradation and horror because of the idea that one who was hung on a cross was cursed by God. It is now the symbol of the unlimited nature of God's love and the power of transformation.⁵ The humiliation on the cross is the locus of salvation where, as Barth would indicate, the divinity is most clearly seen.⁶ The impassibility of God's love is revealed in a paradoxical manner. The moment of disgrace becomes the moment of exaltation and the self-emptying love is best manifested in the moment of maximum humiliation.

3.1.2 INCARNATION AND PASSION AS KEY MOMENTS OF THIS SELF-REVELATION

The self-emptying love of God has been manifest in the Divine Kenosis as an on-going process. Two moments which certainly stand out include the Incarnation and the

³ Cf. WILLIAMS, DAVID T. *Kenosis of God*, iUniverse, Inc: New York, 2009, pp. 15, 19, 36. David William gives a brief overview of the understanding of the word 'kenosis' and the problems related to this word. On p. 19 in developing Barth view where 'Christ's self-emptying was the expression of God's will to love', he goes on to show the various objections to this position by Moltmann and Pannenberg who preferred a more existential interpretation of the same. He also suggests a mild re-interpretation of the hymn seen in Paul's letter to the Philippians so that the kenosis is the outcome of God's very being. Precisely because he is the form of God, he takes the form of a slave. '*His very sovereignty is expressed in his servanthood.*'

⁴ '*God's love for us is a kenotic or self-emptying love. This love Jesus images by his total availability, by his mutuality in sharing himself as our equal, and by his complete gift of himself out of love for us unto death.*' MALONEY, GEORGE. *On the Road to Perfection – Christian Humility in Modern Society*, New City Press: New York, 1995, p. 51.

⁵ '*Desde entonces la cruz ha sido el símbolo del; amor hasta el extremo, del hombre y el extremo de Dios encarnado (Jn 13,1). Por eso este instrumento de muerte despierta tanta vida resucitando las existencias sin salida condenadas a disolverse en el abajo, el fuera y el sinsentido de nuestras sociedades.*' GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad...*, p. 23.

⁶ Cf. WILLIAMS, DAVID T. *Kenosis of God...*, p. 70.

Passion. Both these moments are permeated with the humility of God. Some have considered the Incarnation to be the most important event in the mystery of salvation, while others have considered the Passion to be that event. However a proper reflection will reveal that both have a common end which consists in a life of service - a life of self-emptying love.

...to focus the Incarnation on the Passion enables both theories to reach a point where the mind is flooded by the same perfect thought: in serving, in washing the feet of his creatures, God reveals himself even in that which is most intimately divine in him, and manifests his supreme glory.⁷

Self-emptying is revealed at the moment of the Incarnation and is progressively manifest until it reaches its climax on the Cross where we find the perfect model of humility, love and service. The defaced face of Christ by sin continues to be present in the face of our brothers and sisters and can be restored by humble loving service.⁸ The life of Christ which reveals God's impassible love manifests itself in two transversal themes which include humility and obedience/fidelity. These two themes are inter-related and Christ would personify these two attributes and thereby reveal them as constituting the very being of God.

The Incarnation is a moment of humility where we see the willingness of the Word, the second person of the blessed Trinity to become a servant. There is no ontological change in this act, but the change that takes place is relational.⁹ The Incarnation was not a static moment, but part of a voluntarily accepted process which would reach its climax on the Cross. The self-revelation of Christ in the Divine Kenosis could be understood as a process consisting in four stages which were as follows: a) giving up His glory; b) becoming human; c) choosing to belong to a socially inferior class

⁷ MP, p. 11.

⁸ 'To look on the face of a human being is to see a holy face. It is to see the face of the Son of Man himself, Jesus Christ. The image is defaced; but its beauty can be restored by humble, godly love, shining upon its darkness and bringing it into the glorious light of God's presence. Jesus, the Ebed Yahweh, lives in us, loves in us and wishes to serve his broken brothers and sisters through us.' MALONEY, GEORGE. *On the Road...*, p. 80.

⁹ Cf. WILLIAMS, DAVID T. *Kenosis of God...*, pp. 33-34, 93-94.

and d) accepting death in humiliating conditions.¹⁰ The humility of God which progressively revealed itself in the Incarnation and the Passion manifests the self-emptying love of God in a radical sense.

The two moments of Incarnation and the Passion also reveal Jesus' obedience and faithfulness to the will of the Father. In the abandonment of his divine status to become human, he was obedient to the Father. Through His obedience, which was also an act of humility He was united to the Father. Obedience is an authentic indicator of humility and is consistently manifested in Jesus' infancy and public life.¹¹ He grew in submission to the will of the Father and revealed God's love to us through the totality of His self-emptying.¹² Christ's obedience and fidelity is indicative of the attitude of the Triune God.¹³ Jesus' attitude of being meek and humble of heart reveals God's love towards all. The new creation in Christ reveals a God who is concerned about all created reality.¹⁴

3.1.3 THE CROSS AND THE TOTALITY OF GOD'S LOVE.

While the public life of Jesus reveals the self-emptying love of God, there is no doubt that it is the humility during the passion and death that reveals the nature of God's in its totality. It was not an accident or a decision which was forced— it was a choice made by Christ in keeping with His authentic being. In the passion Jesus is left all alone by his disciples. He momentarily felt the absence of His father too. He was subjected by the

¹⁰ Cf. POWER, DAVID N. *Love without...*, pp. 7-8.

¹¹ IBID. pp. 11, 15. The letter of Paul to the Philippians will speak of Jesus being obedient, while Hebrews would go on to say that Jesus learned obedience.

¹² This chapter by George Maloney elaborates the dimension of humility in the life of Jesus. Beginning with the beatitudes he briefly explains six biblical texts. Through all of them, we see that Jesus provides to us the example of true humility and that humility is what constitutes true greatness in the Kingdom of God. (Cf. MALONEY, GEORGE. *On the Road...*, pp. 47-56.)

¹³ Lucien Richard explains how 'Jesus' life was grounded in Godself.' He goes on to show the unity between Jesus and the Father is from the very beginning and is not merely the result of Jesus' humanity. The total submission to the will of the Father and the total acceptance of the Son is the foundation of this unity. The 'community of essence' cannot be rooted only in the experience of the historical Jesus, but 'in a transcendence characterized by self-emptying love.' (Cf. RICHARD, LUCIEN J. *Christ: The Self-emptying of God*, Paulist Press: New York, 1997, pp. 91-92.)

¹⁴ Cf. LUCIEN, RICHARD J. *A Kenotic Christology: In the Humanity of Jesus the Christ, the Compassion of Our God*, University Press of America: New York, 1982, pp. 90-91.

prevailing powers to abject humiliation and a cruel death.¹⁵ All these experiences of Jesus reveal to us the inner being of the Triune God.

...the mystery of Jesus as the one sent by God leads into further reflection on the mystery of God. In particular, it allows us to know what it is to speak of God the Father, who created heaven and earth, or to seek the presence of the Spirit in the world. It is in the story of Jesus that we see the implications of calling him Son, Lord and Word... In his teaching and in his mission, ending in his condemnation and his Cross, the justice and the holiness of God are revealed.¹⁶

The humility of Christ which was revealed in the Incarnation of the Son is ordered to the Cross and hence Christology must be from the vantage point of the Cross. On the cross 'the old concept of God's immutability breaks into pieces and in the Son, God enters and shares in the suffering of humanity.'¹⁷

Christ reveals that genuine humility emerges in openness to the totality of God's gratuitous love.¹⁸ The love revealed by Christ on the cross is a love which is total, absolute and respectful. It does not surrender a part and retain the essential, but self-empties itself of the essential. Such is the love of God. The humility of Christ indicates that God who is humble does not humiliate. God does not infringe on the freedom of the human beings because that would be paternalism. If humility became a duty it would debase a person, result in a system of oppression and distort the image of God in the human person.¹⁹

In the Cross, Christ reveals to us the union between perfect love and perfect humility - in fact they were never separate. Christ reveals to us that there is no true love without humility and there is no true humility without love.²⁰ Christ's kenosis is because God is kenosis – God is an eternal act of self-offering.

¹⁵ Cf. POWER, DAVID N. *Love without...*, pp. 25-27.

¹⁶ *IBID.* p. 58.

¹⁷ *MP*, pp. 22, 33. The last line is a quote by Hans Urs von Balthasar from P. ALTHAUS, *RGG – III*, 1245 where *RGG* refers to *Die Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart* (Tübingen³ 1956-1965.)

¹⁸ Cf. MALONEY, GEORGE. *On the Road...*, p. 24.

¹⁹ Cf. VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, pp. 15, 48, 51, 55, 77, 99.

²⁰ Cf. MALONEY, GEORGE. *On the Road...*, p. 27.

Jesus does not tell us only how man must love, but also and first how God loves. If there is a kenosis of Christ, it is because God, Father, Son, Holy Spirit, is eternally in kenosis, namely in an act of sacrificial offering of self. ...God is what he becomes in Christ. There would be no kenosis of the incarnate Word if the Trinity—and not only the Word—were not in itself Power and Act of kenosis....²¹

The life of Christ which reveals the intra-Trinitarian life indicates true humility and total self-giving love as being integral to the very being of the Trinity. The Incarnation, life and passion of Christ images the Trinity as a community of self-emptying love and humility. The face of God contemplated in Christ definitively reveals to us the humility of the Father and the Spirit.²²

3.2 HUMILITY AND THE TRINITY

Christ poor and humble 'manifests the *anawim* community of the Trinity—persons who empty themselves in a gift of self-sacrificing love to each other.'²³ The Divine Kenosis reveals to us a God who reinterprets the inter-relatedness of love and humility. The self-giving of the Trinity is certainly evident in the Incarnation, but is also manifest in creation²⁴ and hence it would appropriate to understand creation and Incarnation as two separate but inter-related kenotic events within the Triune God.

Creation reveals the character of God. In the Christian vision we cannot separate the mystery of the Incarnation from the mystery of creation. Both are sacraments of God. In both mysteries God has revealed Godself as a loving God. In creating and in the mystery of the incarnation God has freely accepted limitations in the fulfilment of a loving will for fellowship with that which is "other" than God. The love of God in creating and in the incarnation is a kenotic love.²⁵

Since the focus of this paper is not primarily about kenosis and creation, we shall limit ourselves to exploring the relationship between Christ's kenosis and the Trinitarian

²¹ VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, p. 96.

²² Benjamin Buelta explains this by going to the contemplation of Christ poor and humble as proposed in the Spiritual Exercises. Building on the contemplations he indicates that Christ provides a human face to the very being of God and one who contemplates Christ contemplates the humility and humiliation of the Trinity. (Cf. GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad...*, p. 155.)

²³ MALONEY, GEORGE. *On the Road...*, p. 45.

²⁴ Creation reflects the Trinitarian Kenosis and the human person is the crown of this creation. Each person who is made in the image of this Trinitarian God is called to imitate Christ and thereby share in the fullness of Trinitarian life.

²⁵ LUCIEN, RICHARD. *Christ: The Self-Emptying...*, p. 105.

kenosis in so far as it relates to the human being's participation in the same through a life of self-emptying love. In elaborating this point we shall begin by showing how the Trinity has generally been understood as a way of existing wherein one's total existence is for the other. This will be followed by explaining the humility of the Father, the Son and the Spirit – i.e. the three persons of the Trinity. Finally we shall end this part by a brief comment regarding *perichoresis* and inter-relatedness which characterizes the Trinity.

3.2.1 INTRODUCTORY REMARKS - TRINITY AS EXISTING FOR THE OTHER.

The unceasing affirmation of Christianity has been in a Trinitarian God who is revealed in the life, death and resurrection of Christ. 'Jesus Christ is God's revelatory word, God's clearest self-expression. In Christ is revealed what God is like; Christ defines who God is for humankind and for creation.'²⁶ Jesus, at the appropriate time came forth from the ineffable life of the Trinity and put an end to the reign of sin and death by his death on the cross.²⁷ This was the experience of the disciples and the first Christian community saw in the person of Christ an indicator of a personal plurality within the one true God.²⁸

From the very beginning, the experience of Christianity has been belief in a Trinitarian God and this is manifest in the fact that the dogma of the Trinity proclaimed in Rome, 382 was confirmed before the Christological dogma of Chalcedon, 451.²⁹ If the 'trinitarian formula prescribes a plurality of persons in a unity of nature, the Christological formula prescribes a unity of person in a plurality of natures.'³⁰ The

²⁶ *IBID.*, p. 105.

²⁷ David Power in explaining the Anaphora of Basil of Caesarea elaborates the understanding of kenosis as constituting the inner life of the Trinity. The worshippers are invited into the 'heavenly sanctuary of the quietly flowing wisdom and love of the ineffable Trinity'. (Cf. POWER, DAVID N. *Love without...*, pp. 8-9.)

²⁸ THOMPSON, THOMAS R. – PLANTINGA, CORNELIUS JR. "Trinity and Kenosis", *Exploring Kenotic Christology...*, p. 165.

²⁹ Cf. MCBRIEN, RICHARD P. *Catholicism*, Harper Collins Publishers: New York, 1994, pp. 275-294. McBrien offers a brief but sweeping summary of the Trinity in chapter 8. Towards the end of this chapter (pp. 321-326) he agrees with Karl Rahner that the economic Trinity is also the immanent Trinity. '*The Church came to the knowledge of God as triune as it progressively reflected on its experience of the triuneness of God's dealings with us in history. And then the Church concluded that the God whom we experience as triune in history (the 'economic Trinity') must also be triune in essence, i.e., within the inner life of God (the 'immanent Trinity').*'

³⁰ THOMPSON, THOMAS R. – PLANTINGA, CORNELIUS JR. "Trinity and Kenosis", *Exploring Kenotic...*, p. 167.

kenosis of Christ, is an “expression of the eternal relationship between Son and Father, the one who in the Spirit witnessed unto death and the one who in the bestowal of the Spirit crowned that witness by giving him a name above all names.”³¹

Christ’s total self-emptying reveals the Divine Kenosis as the supreme expression of the inner Trinitarian love.³² This love is indicative of an ‘otherness’ of God and this otherness is characterized by a relationship that entails total self-emptying for the other.³³ The Trinity is not a closed circle of perfect beings in heaven, but is dialectically open towards the other. Love which forms this dynamic relationship of the Triune God is not marked by neediness or self-love, but by an overflowing fullness of love.³⁴ Love requires the presence of ‘distinction and unity, otherness and identity and these are eternally fulfilled in the mystery of the Trinity’.³⁵ The following extended but intricate quote reveals how the Trinity cannot be centered in itself, but is necessarily centered on the other.

Each one of the Three Persons is for himself only by being for the two others. The Father can only exist as Father distinct from the Son by giving all of himself to the Son; the Son can only exist as a Son distinct from the Father by being a total gift of love to the Father. The Father does not first exist as a person sufficient unto self and for self: it is the act of begetting the Son that makes him a person. One must thus avoid saying that the Father is “the One who” gives himself; rather he is “Act of” giving self. The same is true of the Son and Holy Spirit. What is thus revealed to us is that the relation of love is the original form of being. Or, to use other words: the core of the being is love, or communion. Every person can only be self, outside of self. Their ecstasy is perfect in this: that the impossibility of withdrawal unto self is absolute.³⁶

There is a deliberate choice of self-limitation in order to totally relate with one another. This self-limitation and uninterrupted self-emptying in love is an eternal

³¹ POWER, DAVID N. *Love without...*, p. 46. This explanation of Trinitarian self-emptying is explained by David Power by using the theologies of Hans Urs von Balthasar and Jürgen Moltmann.

³² *MP*, p. 7.

³³ Cf. LUCIEN, RICHARD. *Christ: The Self-Emptying...*, p. 108.

³⁴ Cf. *IBID.*, p. 109.

³⁵ VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, p. 79.

³⁶ *IBID.*, pp. 79-80. Francois Varillon will state that God is present to Himself only by being present to the other. ‘...the trinitarian mystery reveals, if I dare say so, a higher transcendence which is a deeper immanence. God is present to himself only in the mode of being present to the other. His relation to self is his relation to the other. He can only grasp himself in and through the communication of self to the other.’ (*IBID.*, p. 82)

process, a process which finds its absolute expression on the Cross where there is a totality of other-centered self-giving love of the three persons of the Trinity – the Father, Son and the Spirit.³⁷

3.2.2 THE HUMILITY OF THE FATHER, SON AND SPIRIT

The total self-emptying of the Three Persons³⁸ in the Trinity points to a shared existence where the humiliations and humility of one person is collectively experienced, though in their own distinct manner. Thus the humility of the Son reveals that the Father's and the Spirit's existence too is within the realm of humility. We shall now see the humility of the three persons separately.

3.2.2.1 Humility of the Father

The humility of the Father³⁹ consists in the risk that God took in the process of self-expression in creation.⁴⁰ Instead of making a 'safe' world, God endowed the human person with freedom and became vulnerable to the possibility of sin. The respect for our freedom and the decision not to control the human person is a sign of humble love.⁴¹ God did not create something and leave it aside as a statue in a park, but in the process

³⁷ Cf. WILLIAMS, DAVID T. *Kenosis of God...*, p. 64.

³⁸ In calling the members of the Trinity, 'persons' the early Church chose, the most appropriate denotation available. If we suppose that a person, divine or human, constitutes 'a centre of thought, will, act, love and consciousness then we can broadly say that the three necessary dimensions which constitute a person are the ontological, the subjective-psychological and the relational.' (THOMPSON, THOMAS R. – PLANTINGA, CORNELIUS JR. "Trinity and Kenosis", ..., pp. 174-77.) Given the modern day understanding of the human person where consciousness is intrinsic, there is a misunderstanding which is generally prevalent when we define a person. A coherent way of speaking about the Trinity in today's world is, 'for instance, to speak of three distinct ways of *being* there (in the economy of salvation) and three different ways of *subsistence* (immanently) for the one God.' (CSM, pp. 1762-63.)

³⁹ Jesus who had a unique filial relationship with God taught his followers to address God as Father. (CDT) There is a relationship between the understanding of the Old Testament of God and the New Testament understanding of Triune God where God the Father is Yahweh, "the one who has done things." The CCC-46 in explaining the Creed explains that 'Jesus Christ revealed to us that God is "Father", not only insofar as he created the universe and the mankind, but above all because he eternally generated in his bosom the Son who is his Word...'

⁴⁰ The understanding of Creation as kenosis wherein creation is understood as a work of love is well explored in a book edited by John Polkinhorn. This book contain various articles which look at creation from a kenotic perspective. The article by the editor John Polkinhorn takes 'a middle path between classical theology and process theology, where God interacts with creation but does not overrule its divinely granted freedom to be itself.' (Cf. POLKINGHORNE, JOHN. "Introduction", *The Work of Love – Creation as Kenosis*, (Ed. Polkinghorne, John) SPCK: Michigan, 2001, p. xii.)

⁴¹ Cf. WILLIAMS, DAVID T. *Kenosis of God...*, pp. 146, 155-56.

of creation a relationship was established.⁴² Such a relationship makes God vulnerable⁴³ because the Creator has permitted that the creature's freedom affects the triumph and tragedy of creation to a certain extent.⁴⁴

Human beings who are made in God's image and likeness humiliate the Father when they desire to live in a manner which negates the Father or leaves the Father on the margins of their existence. Each time created reality is abused because of a flawed application of freedom, the Father's humility is manifest.

Humillamos a Dios cuando nos hacemos autosuficientes, y pervertimos la relación con él cuando no dejamos espacio a los demás, especialmente a los más pobres y vulnerables. En vez de asumir nuestros límites y recrear la relación con él, en el paroxismo de nuestra autonomía decidimos que hay que eliminar a Dios mismo.⁴⁵

The Father's humiliation is often caused by a false imagery of creation where creation is understood as a 'serene and effortless activity. There is nothing of the giving of self, and therefore nothing of the authenticity of love. It is almost a trivial activity and its ultimate trivialisation appears when creation is described in terms of the activity of 'play.'⁴⁶ The humility is compounded when the foreknowledge of God⁴⁷ is misinterpreted and God who empties Himself in creation is presented as a God whose

⁴² Cf. GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad...*, pp. 61, 63-64.

⁴³ W. H. Vanstone will speak of the falsity of love in his chapter 'The Phenomenology of Love' where he indicates the indicators of false love. Accordingly any limit set to love and the desire to have some kind of control indicates the presence of false love. An important indicator of false love is an attitude of detachment where detachment is understood as an unaffected self-sufficiency. Therefore the sign of genuine love is the presence of an affective relationship where the other does not leave the person unaffected. (Cf. VANSTONE, W. H. *Love's Endeavour, Love's Expense – The Response of Being to the Love of God*, Darton Longman & Todd: London, 2007, pp. 45-53.)

⁴⁴ Cf. VANSTONE, W. H. *Love's Endeavour, Love's Expense ...*, pp. 66-68. Despite the fact that the freedom of the human person which manifests God's love, results in vulnerability it is important to note that the ultimate reconciliation of all in God is assured in Christ. '*...that world which the Christian sees as created and sustained by its Maker's love, fallen indeed into the bondage of sin, yet emancipated now by Christ, Who was crucified and rose again to break the strangle hold of personified evil, so that the world might be fashioned anew according to God's design and reach its fulfillment.*'

⁴⁵ GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad...*, p. 70.

⁴⁶ Cf. VANSTONE, W. H. *Love's Endeavour, Love's Expense ...*, pp. 60-61.

⁴⁷ If God had foreknowledge and know all that was to take place in creation, then the creation of God would be a vain act. It would be merely the unwinding of a film that had already been produced in God's mind. Creation which is caused by God's self-emptying love is something which is in a process of coming to be. It could be said that '*not all that happens is determined by God but all that happens is encompassed by God.*' (IBID., pp. 65-66.)

creation is condescending and manipulative.⁴⁸ However the central element in understanding the humility of the Father is the unconditional and limitless nature of self-emptying love.⁴⁹ The experience of such a love is the foundation for genuine conversion and transformation.⁵⁰

3.2.2.2 Humility of the Son

The Son reveals the Father and in the person of Christ we have a clear representation of the humility of the Son. In the Son we see the true face of God and in the life of Christ we can contemplate, listen to and embrace the Son.⁵¹ The Son makes a choice to live in poverty and humility and this is seen as a transversal characteristic throughout His life - from His birth to death.⁵² An awareness of the failure of his mission where he was abandoned by all is an important moment in the ongoing humiliation of Christ. A symbolic expression of God's humility as expressed in Christ would be indicated by His thirst. This expression goes beyond the fact of His physical deprivation indicating a more existential longing.⁵³

Christ's death on the Cross and the Resurrection is the locus of transformation. The forgiveness of Christ opens up the gift of the Kingdom and establishes a new relationship with God and with others.⁵⁴ The humility of Christ empowers those who are

⁴⁸ Cf. IBID., pp. 73-74.

⁴⁹ Cf. IBID., pp. 44-45.

⁵⁰ Benjamin Buelta in explaining the love of the Father provides a commentary of the parable of the prodigal son. (*Lk.15,11-32*). The younger son had lost everything, except the love of the Father. Years later when he reflected on the reason of his conversion he would realize that it was primarily caused by an experience of the humility of the Father. (Cf. GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad...*, pp. 77-80.)

⁵¹ Cf. IBID p. 82. In pp. 85-86 he elaborates the humility of Christ.

⁵² We have elaborated this point in the first chapter where the humility of Christ as seen throughout His life, death and passion was explained. From the very onset, humility as revealed in the life and especially in the passion was interpreted from the perspective of love as evident in a quote from Origen. '*¿qué pasión es esta que ha padecido por nosotros? Es la pasión del amor.*' (IBID.)

⁵³ Jesus expresses his thirst on various occasions with the most important being indicated by his cry on the Cross. The cry of Jesus was not merely indicative of physical exhaustion, but one which indicated an experience of no longer having being able to live a relational existence. He had been abandoned by his own and now also felt abandoned by the Father. According to David Williams, death is a point when all inter-relationship stops. (Cf. WILLIAMS, DAVID T. *Kenosis of God...*, pp. 64, 67.)

⁵⁴ Cf. GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad...*, pp. 98, 100, 93.

humiliated in order to find a new identity. They are no longer victims of history, but encounter in the humiliated Christ their vocation to be co-creators with God.⁵⁵ Christ reveals the totality and the vulnerability of self-emptying love. In Christ, God has given everything for the sake of the other without asking for any guarantee of reciprocity. There exists the genuine possibility that this love may be rejected, yet it is unconditionally offered. Due to this we could with certainty affirm that in the humility on the Cross we find the measure of true love.

Christ, the Incarnate Word, discloses to us, at the climax of His life, what word it was that God spoke when 'He commanded and they were created'. It was no light or idle word but the Word of love, in which, for the sake of another, all is expended, all jeopardized and all surrendered. The Cross of Christ discloses to us the poignancy of the creation itself - the tragic possibility that, when all is given in love, all may be given in vain.⁵⁶

3.2.2.3 Humility of the Spirit

The Holy Spirit shares in the inner life of the Trinity and is a gift of ecstatic love for the world.⁵⁷ As the 'third Person, the Spirit is the expression that divine love is inexhaustible and eternally new, that God's capacity as absolute lover is ever greater, ever newer, and ever more fruitful.'⁵⁸ The Spirit has a unique personhood where the Spirit expresses the innermost and outmost being of God.⁵⁹ The humility of the Spirit lies in the fact that despite its uniqueness, it is anonymous and faceless revealing nothing but the Father and the Son. It can also be considered to be nameless because the name used to designate it also refers to the Triune God. The Holy Spirit which is the capacity of eternal love is an epitome of humility and self-effacement whereby its personal identity is constituted in anonymity as the *We* of the Father and the Son.

⁵⁵ Cf. *IBID.*, p. 92.

⁵⁶ VANSTONE, W. H. *Love's Endeavour, Love's Expense ...*, p. 70.

⁵⁷ CCC – 689. '*...In their joint mission, the Son and the Holy Spirit are distinct but inseparable. To be sure, it is Christ who is seen, the visible image of the invisible God, but it is the Spirit who reveals him.*'

⁵⁸ LUCIEN, RICHARD. *Christ: The Self-Emptying of God, ...*, p. 110. Richard Lucien claims that the person of the Holy Spirit has primary function within the Trinity. According to him, '*belief in God the Holy Spirit is belief in the essence of God as ecstatic love: God is God precisely insofar as God is self-gift, as God is Spirit.*'

⁵⁹ As the '*eternal mode, the surprising newness and unending fruitfulness of love,*' the Spirit is the innermost expression of God's being. On the other hand it is also the expression of God's outermost being because of '*the possibility and the reality of God's going outside Godself in love.*' (Cf. *IBID.*)

The essence of God is self-giving love. The inner trinitarian kenosis is the eternal procession of the Son and the Spirit from the Father. The incomparable, immediate characteristic of the Spirit's personality is to be person "from" and "in" the other persons of the Trinity. Here it is possible to speak about the anonymity of the Spirit. It is possible to say that the Spirit is faceless. ... The third Person of the Trinity has no proper name. That which serves as a proper name 'Spirit' could be applied to the entire Godhead. The Spirit as the personal unity of Father and Son personifies the ever-greater fruitfulness and freedom of God's kenotic love. ... The Holy Spirit is the capacity of God to give in love eternally.⁶⁰

The gift of the Holy Spirit is intimately related to the Church because the 'mission of Christ and the Holy Spirit is brought to completion in the Church.'⁶¹ But it must also be stated that if the Church is where the mission of the Holy Spirit is fulfilled, it is also the source of the Holy Spirit's humiliation. The humility of the Spirit can be seen in the weeds (*Mt. 13, 24-30*) that are evident in the ecclesial community that has received the gift of the Spirit. In the history of the Church the mistakes committed are indicative of how often the Spirit has been humiliated. These mistakes are realized centuries later when the Church has asked for forgiveness. Various Popes down the centuries have referred to the disfigured face of the Church which highlights the humility of the Spirit. A recent example of this was the apology of Pope Benedict XVI during the conclusion of the year of priesthood where he referred to the painful instances of abuse.⁶²

The humility of the Spirit is not only limited to individuals, but also extends to unjust structures – some of which have committed atrocities in the name of God. The humility due to the abuse caused by unjust structures within the Church help us better understand the humility of the Spirit as evident in unjust structures in the world at large. All the atrocities committed during the course of history in one way or another point

⁶⁰ LUCIEN, RICHARD. *Christ: The Self-Emptying of God...*, pp. 110-11.

⁶¹ CCC – 737. '*(The Church) is the Body of Christ and the Temple of the Holy Spirit. This joint mission henceforth brings Christ's faithful to share in his communion with the Father in the Holy Spirit. (The Spirit) makes present the mystery of Christ, supremely in the Eucharist, in order to reconcile them, to bring them into communion with God, that they may "bear much fruit."*

⁶² Pope Benedict asked for forgiveness and said that priests ought to realize that their vocation is a gift which is received in 'earthen vessels'. It should make them place greater trust in God and motivate them to greater commitment in order to '*respond to God's courage and humility by our own courage and humility.*' Homily of Pope Benedict on 11th June, 2010. (<http://w2.vatican.va> – as on 23/06/2015)

towards the humility of the Holy Spirit.⁶³

La humillación del Espíritu no es solo el pecado de la Iglesia, sino todas las atrocidades cometidas a la largo de la historia de la humanidad, muchas de ellas en nombre de Dios, de diferentes divinidades o de valores de humanidad que escondían egolatrías personales y de grupo provocadoras de las más grandes masacres y genocidios: campos de concentración, gulags, exterminio de etnias enteras, explotación masiva de obreros y de emigrantes, mercado de mujeres y de niños...⁶⁴

We have seen the humility of the Spirit in the existence of various forms of sin and evil in the world. However the primary element of the Spirit's humility is positive in nature and revelatory of the kenotic love of God. The Spirit is present in creation and redemption and its humility is salvific in nature. Within creation, the Spirit does not act coercively but pervasively respecting the boundaries of creations. The 'presence of the Spirit creates the space in which the "otherness" of creation can emerge.'⁶⁵ Creation which is the result of God's self-limitation is evolving and the autonomy which is necessary for this process to move forward requires the non-intrusive presence of God through the Spirit.⁶⁶

The Incarnation points to the kenosis of the Holy Spirit too because Jesus was filled and led by the Spirit. In the humiliation of Christ, the Spirit too suffered humiliation. Although the Spirit is present on the cross, Jesus cannot come down. The indwelling Spirit binds itself to Jesus' life and death and surrenders itself wholly to the person of Jesus. Despite this surrender it lacks the visible, historical and concrete dimension of the humanity of Christ. The nature of the Spirit is one of being a "vehicle", a "medium of transmission," the eternal "that-by-which."⁶⁷

The salvific activity of the Spirit is constantly present in varied forms of humility.

⁶³ Cf. GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad...*, pp.123-126.

⁶⁴ IBID., p. 126.

⁶⁵ LUCIEN, RICHARD. *Christ: The Self-Emptying of God, ...*, p. 115.

⁶⁶ Cf. IBID., pp. 114-15.

⁶⁷ Cf. IBID., p. 115. The humiliation on the Cross is not only the suffering of the Son, but the suffering of the Spirit too. The Spirit was the energy of Jesus during His public life of Jesus and also led Jesus to the acceptance of the Cross. However on the Cross, the Spirit does not turn Jesus into a powerful man, but participates in the weakness, suffering and death of Jesus. '*The indwelling Spirit binds itself to Jesus. The presence of the Spirit in Jesus is a kenotic presence; this presence reflects the nature of the Spirit within the trinitarian life – the person-gift, the Spirit of God existing in the mode of gift.*'

It is not triumphalist in nature but constantly ‘makes present the powerful powerlessness of God, the hiddenness of God...’⁶⁸ The humiliation of the Spirit is an ongoing process and indicative of the eternal love of God. Whenever the loving self-gift of God is rejected by the human person, the Spirit continues to suffer further – a suffering which paradoxically confirms God’s self-emptying love.

God’s self-emptying in the Spirit involves a suffering that is not the expression of a lack, not a fated necessity, but an expression of God’s kenotic freedom and love. God suffers out of love, which is the overflow of God’s being, the Spirit. The experience of the Holy Spirit issues out of the depths of our redeemed and yet unredeemed world. There is a cry from the depths that is the Spirit’s own cry. The cry for salvation is itself God’s cry inherent in the human yearning for deliverance.⁶⁹

3.2.3 PERICHORESIS – TRINITY AND INTER-RELATEDNESS

Perichoresis means “to contain” or “to penetrate.” It refers to the three Persons of the Trinity as mutually “indwelling,” or “permeating” each other. It intimates a joy, love, and *mutual interpenetration* (cf. John 17:10, 22-23) that is ineffable and indescribable. It attempts to convey how each of the Persons of the Trinity both wholly envelops and is wholly enveloped by the others. A “*perichoretic* sense” must characterize everything we contemplate about the workings of the Trinity. The mystery of *perichoresis* forms the basis of all forms of human communion that stem from and share in the life of the Trinity.⁷⁰

3.2.3.1 Introduction

An important concept in order to understand the relationship of the three Persons of the Trinity is *perichoresis*. Just as *kenosis* has generally been understood as ‘the emptying of the second Person of the Godhead... *perichoresis* refers to the inter-relating of the Persons of the Trinity.’⁷¹ By virtue of their eternal love, their mutual indwelling is to such an extent that they are one whereby we find ‘a most perfect and intense empathy’.⁷² Analogies have been used in order to explain the *perichoresis* but they do not convey the

⁶⁸ IBID., p. 117.

⁶⁹ LUCIEN, RICHARD. *Christ: The Self-Emptying of God..*, pp. 117-18.

⁷⁰ KRILL, PHILIP. *Life in the Trinity: A Catholic Vision of Communion and Deification*, lulu.com, 2010, p. 28.

⁷¹ WILLIAMS, DAVID T. *Kenosis of God...*, pp. 90-91.

⁷² MOLTSMANN, JÜRGEN. *The Trinity ...*, pp. 174-75. ‘*The Father exists in the Son, the Son in the Father, and both of them in the Spirit, just as the Spirit exists in both the Father and the Son. By virtue of their eternal love they live in one another to such an extent, and dwell in one another to such an extent, that they are one.*’

dynamism and creativity of the Trinity.⁷³ They fall short because they refer to a profound mystery of love which cannot fully be grasped by the human person. Though Athanasius, Gregory of Nazianzus and Maximus the Confessor tried to explain the *perichoresis*, it would be John of Damascene who in *De fide orthodoxa* would develop it more thoroughly and consistently. The Latin translation of the word *perichoresis* has generated two kinds of meanings – one static and another active.⁷⁴

Circuminsessio derived from the Latin *circum-in-sedere*, meaning to sit around, and was therefore appropriated by those who preferred to adopt a more passive interpretation of trinitarian relatedness, such as Thomas Aquinas. Others opted for the Latin *circumincessio*, derived from *circumincedere*, which means to move around, a state of doing rather than a state of being.⁷⁵

Perichoresis refers to the relationship which is ecstatic in nature where each person of the Trinity seeks a loving relationship and communion with the other. There is a sense of closeness, reciprocity, intimacy, otherness, synergy and perfect harmony among the three persons. Such a relationship is at the heart of the Trinitarian communion where each person ‘exists only *for, in, and towards* the others.’ The Father, Son and Spirit are not only oriented towards one another, but exist for the other. There is a ‘union of indescribable *interpenetration and mutual participation*. Theirs is an ecstatic relationship of co-inherence’. Each person ‘co-inheres’, ‘participates’ and ‘indwells’ in the other. The Trinity thus reveals to us ‘the mystery of infinite self-possession and total self-gift.’⁷⁶

⁷³ Analogies would include the light of three lamps which permeate one another in undifferentiated light, perfume sprayed into the air, the three dimensionality of physical objects. These analogies are somehow impersonal and do not convey the movement or mutual and reciprocal permeation of each persons with the other persons. The divine dance has also been used to explain the mutual inter-relatedness of the Trinity. (Cf. IBID.)

⁷⁴ Cf. BUXTON, G. *The Trinity, Creation and Pastoral Ministry: Imaging the Perichoretic God*, Paternoster: Milton Keynes, 2005, pp. 129-131. (ee)

⁷⁵ IBID., p. 131.

⁷⁶ Cf. KRILL, PHILIP. *Life in the Trinity: A Catholic Vision...*, pp. 27-29. The phrases in quotes and italics are exact reproductions from the text. Krill goes to explain the total self-gift of the three persons as follows: ‘*God the Father has no being outside His complete self-gift of Himself to the Son, expressed in an act of eternal begetting and generation. Similarly, but differently, the Son has no being other than His grateful and obedient, eternal, and kenotic (self-emptying, self-effacing) self-donation to His Father. The Father does not exist outside his act of giving himself to the Son, nor has the Son any “existence” apart from his Eucharistic disposition of surrender in response to the Father’s begging of Him. Father and Son in their respective identities are held together as infinite and eternally inseparable Persons by the Holy Spirit who, as Himself a separate, inseparable Person, serves within the Triune Communio to facilitate and maintain the mutual self-giving of Father and Son.*’ IBID., p. 23

3.2.3.2 Unity and Distinctness within the Trinity

The *perichoresis* reveals to us in a brilliant manner the unity and distinctiveness of the Trinity 'without reducing the threeness to the unity, or dissolving the unity in the threeness.'⁷⁷ They are three Persons and one Being where their differences as Father, Son and Spirit instead of separating them is what constitutes their unity. The relation between the three persons is one of reciprocal love which is ontic as well as dynamic.

The relations in reciprocal loving between the three divine Persons are onto-relations, for they are relations which belong to what they each are *hypostatically in themselves* as divine Persons and to what they are *homoously together* in their love for one another, in their self-giving to one another and their receiving from one another.⁷⁸

Unity of the Triune God is not primarily based on the general concept of divine substance because that would abolish personal differences. However the unity is primarily formed 'by virtue of their relation to one another and in the eternal perichoresis of their love'. The three Persons are not merely 'three modes of being of one and the same divine subject' but are constitutive of 'differences and unity.'⁷⁹

Each person of the Trinity is limited by the other but this limitedness is overcome by the inter-relationship between the persons.⁸⁰ Due to our fallen state differences lead to disunity and hence communion and otherness are contradictory. However in the Trinity, where each person lives totally for the other, differences are a means of unity and harmony.

In the Trinitarian Life of Divine *Communio*, Father, Son, and Holy Spirit do not experience love and freedom as antithetical. Their communion and their otherness are *mutually perfecting* and perfectly fulfilling of each other. Their relationship assumes and enhances the freedom and distinctiveness of each of the divine Persons. Difference is never division

⁷⁷ MOLTSMANN, JÜRGEN. *The Trinity ...*, p. 175.

⁷⁸ TORRANCE, T. F. *The Christian doctrine of God: One Being Three Persons*, T & T Clark: Edinburgh, 1996, pp. 165-66. (ee) The italicized words are not in the text. The emphasis is ours.

⁷⁹ Cf. MOLTSMANN, JÜRGEN. *The Trinity ...*, pp. 175, 178.

⁸⁰ Cf. WILLIAMS, DAVID T. *Kenosis of God...*, p. 92. Williams indicates that limitation needs to be understood in a nuanced manner. This is because the act of each Person in the Trinity has the total involvement of the other two because they are totally open to each other. Jesus' distinctiveness was not so much in his teachings and acts, but in His total openness to the other.

within the Trinity. Separateness is never separation.⁸¹

The Triune God has from all eternity been a community of loving persons. 'There was never a time when God's identity was anything other than Father, Son and Spirit, forever sharing and mutually surrendering and receiving of their very Persons with each other.'⁸² The three persons do not 'merely exist and live in one another; they also bring one another mutually to manifestation in the divine glory.'⁸³ This glory is revealed on the cross and manifests the heart of the Trinitarian God where 'the perichoretic love that resides within the divine life is at the same time both ecstatic and sacrificial.'⁸⁴

3.2.3.3 *Perichoresis* and the Human Person

Jesus reveals to us that at the heart of all reality is the 'triune community of loving persons, who live for each other (and) communicate with us eternally.'⁸⁵ God loves us with the same love with which he loves himself, 'in the reciprocal love of the three divine Persons for Each Other in the eternal Communion of the Holy Trinity.'⁸⁶ The circular movement of divine light and divine relationships is thrown open in order to include men, women and the whole of creation – this is the meaning of creation, reconciliation and glorification.⁸⁷

Perichoresis is the prerogative of the divine persons because human persons are always external to one another as subjects.⁸⁸ However the identity of the human person is similar to that of the Trinitarian Persons in so far they are incomparable,

⁸¹ KRILL, PHILIP. *Life in the Trinity: A Catholic Vision...*, p. 27.

⁸² *IBID.*, p. 23.

⁸³ MOLTMANN, JÜRGEN. *The Trinity ...*, p. 176.

⁸⁴ BUXTON, G. *The Trinity, Creation...*, pp. 135-36. 'The cross is therefore an intra-trinitarian drama, a dynamic perichoresis of suffering love for the sake of the whole world, an event in which Father, Son and Holy Spirit are all intimately, necessarily, perichoretically involved: "God was in Christ reconciling the world to Himself." (2 Cor. 5,9)'

⁸⁵ MALONEY, GEORGE. *On the Road...*, pp. 52, 66.

⁸⁶ TORRANCE, T. F. *The Christian doctrine of God...*, p. 165.

⁸⁷ Cf. MOLTMANN, JÜRGEN. *The Trinity ...*, p. 178.

⁸⁸ Buxton quotes Miroslav Volf in saying that "'there can be no correspondence to the inferiority of the divine persons at a human level. Another human self cannot be internal to my own self as subject of action. Human persons are always external to one another as subjects.'" So the indwelling of other persons is an exclusive prerogative of God.' (VOLF, MIROSLAV. *After Our Likeness: The Church as the Image of the Trinity*, Eerdmans: Grand Rapids, 1998, pp. 208–213 as quoted in BUXTON, G. *The Trinity, Creation...*, p. 129.)

incommensurable and constituted in their interdependent relationships. The being and becoming of human persons who are made in the image and likeness of the Triune God is thus constituted by a need for relationality at all levels - bodies, hearts, minds, and souls.⁸⁹ The communion, otherness and relationality 'that obtains within the life of the Trinity is the source, goal and form of all human "being-in-relationship."' ⁹⁰

The development of Trinitarian thought which has been enlightened by Christological reflections has helped us have a better understanding of the relational dimension of God as well as that of the human person.⁹¹

Desde la doctrina trinitaria se sugería la idea relacional de la persona,...con la que aparecía como pensable la unidad de la vida divina desde la relación "interpersonal" y esencial de las personas entre sí que existen por sí. En la cristología fue el concepto de persona el que se pudo pensar como "intrapersonal" — a partir de la unión hipostática— mediante la unión personal de Jesucristo que las dos naturalezas no ponían en entredicho.⁹²

⁸⁹ Cf. KRILL, PHILIP. *Life in the Trinity: A Catholic Vision...*, p. 26.

⁹⁰ IBID., p. 26. Krill states that the Trinitarian mystery is the 'divine template for human relationships and not vice versa.' He cautions against confusing Christology with anthropology where communion within God is merely human *koinonia* amplified and expanded.

⁹¹ Clarity regarding the relationship dimension of the Triune God and the understanding of the human person as a relational being took centuries to develop. The New Testament authors spoke of the unity and distinction of the three persons of the Trinity hesitatingly and in an unclear manner. However they were aware of God's revelation as a 'we' and indicated it clearly (Cf. CSM, pp. 1756, 59 & 61) Tertulian was the first to speak of the Trinity as one being and three persons. (Cf. CSM, pp. 1756, 59 & 61) Augustine said that 'God is one essence or substance as well as a trinity composed of three persons (*Trin.* 5.9.10; 7.4.7; 15.22.42)'. (KATZ, S. "Person", *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, (Ed. Fitzgerald, A. D.), William B. Eerdmans: Cambridge, 1999, p. 648. (ee)) He understood 'the relational and dialogical character of the persons in God, but he placed the image of the Trinity in created man completely in the single individual'. (Cf. VON BALTHASAR, HANS URS. "On the Concept of Person", *Communio - XIII*, 1986, pp. 18-19.) He affirmed that the human person was an image of God but would then make a decisive mistake of projecting 'the divine persons into the interior life of the human person and affirming that intrapsychic processes correspond to these persons.' (Cf. RATZINGER, CARDINAL JOSEPH. "Concerning the notion of a Person in Theology", *Communio*, 1990, pp. 447, 453-454.) Hugué of Saint Victor would later on bring in the existential dimension. His definition of the human person as, 'the incommunicably proper existence of spiritual nature indicates that the definition of person does not lie on the level of essence, but existence.' (RATZINGER, CARDINAL JOSEPH. "Concerning the notion of a Person in Theology", *Communio*, 1990, p. 449.) Thomas Aquinas would define person as 'a subsistent individual of a rational nature.' (*ST-1*, Q.29) He followed Boethius's definition of the person as an independent existing substance. However he went beyond the essential dimension of the human person towards highlighting the existential aspect of the human person. The human person is substantially a relational being who by existing as a relational being returns to himself. (*DCT*, p. 231)

⁹² WERBICK, JÜRGEN. "Persona", *DCT*, p. 230.

The understanding that the being and becoming of a human person is realized only through a relationship of love⁹³ tempers the exaggerated individualistic consciousness that promotes mere intra-subjective reflection, creates an autonomous individual and fosters self-centered narcissism. As against the tendency towards narcissistic self-love, the human person is constantly invited to make 'the relatedness which is at the heart of the Trinity the ground of relatedness between (oneself) and all other parts of creation.'⁹⁴

3.3 HUMILITY AND TRANSFORMATION IN THE DIVINE-HUMAN RELATIONSHIP:

We now come to a transitional phase where the preceding point that dealt with the humility of the Trinity is used to understand the authentic nature as well as the spiritual itinerary of a human person. The Divine Kenosis which revealed to us the humility and self-emptying love of the Triune God by manifesting to us the true being of God now reveals to us the true identity of the human person. We can say that an experience of this revelation is the only true foundation for an authentic Divine-human relationship leading to a life long process of transformation.⁹⁵

God is revealed as the totality of self-emptying love and the human person who is made in God's image is called to grow in the likeness of the Triune God. The invitation to participate in the fullness of life by a constant process of self-emptying love is present

⁹³ Krill indicates that 'God is love, but not all "love" is God'. Love is not an a priori reality which corresponds to or is applicable to the Trinity. Rather it is the Trinity that reveals to us the form and substance of love and all that does not resemble or partake of the Trinitarian *Communio* cannot be called love. (Cf. KRILL, PHILIP. *Life in the Trinity: A Catholic Vision...*, p. 24.

⁹⁴ Cf. LUCIEN, RICHARD. *Christ: The Self-Emptying of God, ...*, p. 114.

⁹⁵ The word 'person' as understood in contemporary society is a concept which is primarily a product of Christianity. Even though it had been used in the realm of philosophy, what changed its understanding was the interpretation in the light of Christian scriptures. (RATZINGER, CARDINAL JOSEPH. "Concerning the notion ...", p. 439.) The meaning of this word has its origin in theatre with the word 'persona' being used to signify a mask. The term 'prosopon' which originally meant mask would go on to signify hypostasis in Greek philosophy. It was understood as the individual existence of a particular nature. (MOLTMANN, JÜRGEN. *The Trinity and the Kingdom: The Doctrine of God*, (Tr. Kohl, M.), Fortress Press: Minneapolis, 1993, pp. 171, 174. (ee)) The human being was however not merely an individual, but a person. (BALTHASAR, HANS URS VON. "On the concept ...", pp. 18-19.) The Christian interpretation has always understood the person as not being merely someone who was playing a role, but consisted in its actual reality. (Cf. WERBICK, JÜRGEN. "Persona", *DCT*, 229.)

at all times. However the existential reality of being a creature and being part of a world that is sinful implies that the tendency within a human person is on the one hand towards self-love while the authentic nature on the other hand constantly draws a person towards a life of self-emptying love. This tension is central to understanding human existence. Through openness to the grace of God, an individual is transformed so as to live a life in conformity with one's true being.

In this section we would like to highlight the transformative experience of God's humility in the life of a person. We shall begin with a brief note about the goal of a person. This will be followed by elaborating the existential reality of self-love and the ontological split that characterizes in a human person. This will be followed by the primary source of this transformation – i.e. the initiative of God which consists of a love which is gratuitous and respectful of human freedom. Recognizing and responding to this existential situation in humility by opening oneself to the love of God is the true ground for transformation and new life. The sign of authentic transformation can be seen in a life of humble self-emptying love and faithful service for the sake of others.

3.3.1 THE GOAL OF THE HUMAN PERSON⁹⁶

The goal of a human person who is a historical⁹⁷, spiritual⁹⁸, free⁹⁹ and open¹⁰⁰ is that of a

⁹⁶ The remarks which follow have been taken from the *Concise Sacramentum Mundi*. They have been written by five different authors who are as follows: MÜLLER, MAX – HALDER, ALOIS. "Person – Concept", pp. 1206-13; MÖLLER, JOSEPH. "Man – Philosophical", pp. 1213-1216; SAND, ALEXANDER. "Man – Biblical", pp. 1216-1219; RAHNER, KARL. "Man – Theological", pp. 1219-1225. In order to save on space, the pertinent page numbers will be displayed in the text alongside the initials CSM.

⁹⁷ Human existence has a *historical* dimension and a person realizes oneself in a historical context. (CSM, 1210) The realization of the human person does not take place in one act, but through a series of historical acts (CSM, 1209) and therefore it is important that theological anthropology is always in the light of continued historical experience. (CSM, 1221)

⁹⁸ A person who is historically localized in time and space by his bodily reality is a *spiritual* being. (CSM, 1209) Though a person is multiple and constitutes of body and soul, he is still a substantial unity. (CSM, 1220) A person comes into being through the creative act of God and transcends the material reality towards spiritual corporeality through the continuing creative act of God and the profoundest impulse of the finite reality. (CSM, 1223)

⁹⁹ The human person is endowed with *freedom* and can direct himself towards his true good. (CCC – 1704) A person is not at the mercy of instincts and has the capacity to respond affirmatively or negatively. (CSM, 1215) He has the capacity to have a unique personal history and at the same time can be part of a collective history. (CSM, 1224)

¹⁰⁰ The free person is *open* in order to relate to others and to the ultimate Other. Man knows himself as open to others

becoming a more relational being who is open to all reality and most importantly a relationship with God. The openness to an authentic relationship with God and all created reality is the response to the longing for fulfilment that exists in every human person. In other words we could explain the goal of the human person as a call from the depth of our being to live a Trinitarian life.¹⁰¹ The human person who has been created in God's image is called to live as God lives and to love as God loves.

The trinitarian mystery sheds light on all the paths of human existence. One must "imitate God," as Saint Paul said (Ep 5:1). Be it in our most private personal life or in the exercise of our freedom at the different levels of family, work, the State or international society, it all amounts to this: not to be deluded about what love is. The vocation of man, the meaning of his life therefore, is to live as God lives, thus to love as he loves. Nothing could tear such a desire from his heart.¹⁰²

A person whose goal is to participate in the Trinitarian life would freely desire and participate in the joy and sorrows of others.¹⁰³ An important task of contemporary theology is to reflect on the mystery of the Divine Kenosis in order to know more profoundly the revelation of the Divine Trinity and its revelation of the ultimate destiny of all human persons.¹⁰⁴

3.3.2 THE TENDENCY IN THE HUMAN PERSON TOWARDS SELF-LOVE

The human person is made in God's image and longs for authentic fulfilment. However the existential reality of sin distorts this longing and a person who is created to live as God lives and love as God loves ends up living a self-centered life. The deepest longings of a person are distorted and the primordial tendency of a human person affected by the reality of sin tends towards narcissistic self-love.

and in communion with others is open for something higher. (CSM, 1216) By being open to the self-communication of God man's existence finds its origin and goal.

¹⁰¹ Cf. GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad...*, p. 10.

¹⁰² VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, pp. 81-82.

¹⁰³ Cf. *IBID.*, p. 78. Trinitarian love rightly understood leads to an intense relationship of union and separation. One is not absorbed into the other but maintains one's distinction in unity and otherness in identity.

¹⁰⁴ FR, no. 93. "The very heart of theological enquiry will thus be the contemplation of the mystery of the Triune God. ...From this vantage-point, the prime commitment of theology is seen to be the understanding of God's kenosis, a grand and mysterious truth for the human mind, which finds it inconceivable that suffering and death can express a love which gives itself and seeks nothing in return." David Power indicates that such theological reflection should help us understand better our destiny in the contemporary world. (Cf. POWER, DAVID. *Love Without Calculation...*, p. 3.)

The dimension of self-love characterizes human existence. While acknowledging that there is positive self-love, we are also painfully aware of negative self-love which is narcissistic in nature and an obstacle to authentic fulfilment and union with God. A life which is dominated by narcissistic self-love is not in consonance with our true being and hence there is an ongoing internal tension resulting in an ontological split. Let us now briefly explain narcissistic self-love which is harmful and damaging as well as positive self-love which leads to transcendence.

3.3.2.1 Narcissistic Self-Love

Narcissistic self-love¹⁰⁵ is directly opposed to self-emptying love and leads to a breakdown in relationship within the individual, at a communitarian level and in terms of a person's relationship with the Divine. It is sinful in nature, makes a person self-centered and could be termed as selfishness. This love could be considered to be part of our false self and is not part of our core existence. It is an illusion, is false and emerges from a distorted version of reality. It makes a person a slave to one's desires and makes one believe that all created reality exists only in order to be exploited for one's self-centered fulfilment.¹⁰⁶

Persons with narcissistic self-love have missed the mark or meaning of life and their exaggerated interest in themselves separates them from their real being. They are unable to love and find it difficult to care for their real selves.

(Such) people are basically unable to love anyone, including themselves. Though they appear to love themselves, they actually hate themselves. Again, though selfish people seem to care too much for themselves, in reality they are unsuccessfully attempting to compensate for failing to care for their real selves.¹⁰⁷

¹⁰⁵ A narcissistic personality is characterized by *DSM-IV* (Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders 4th ed.) as follows: '*A pervasive pattern of grandiosity (in fantasy or behavior), need for admiration, and lack of empathy.*' Nine symptoms are indicated and if a person has at least five of the symptoms it could be said that a person is narcissistic. However it is important to remember that the mere presence of traits is not enough to indicate that a person is narcissistic. It is necessary that the traits are '*inflexible, maladaptive and persisting and cause significant functional impairment or subjective distress.*'

¹⁰⁶ Cf. MERTON, THOMAS. *Seeds of Contemplation*, pp. 20-22.

¹⁰⁷ CONN, WALTER E. "Self-Transcendence, the True-Self and Self-Love", *Pastoral Psychology - Vol. 46*, 1998, p. 330. In

Given the fact that they have a sense of entitlement they believe that the whole world was created for them and are unable to relate to others in a fraternal manner. Narcissistic persons believe they are the sum of all reality and judge all according to one's internal reality. They believe that it is justified to deny others their dignity and trample upon the self-respect of others. A person who is trapped in the vicious cycle of self-love will find it very difficult to be open and enter into meaningful relationships.

From a spiritual point of view this form of narcissistic self-love is a form of pride and is diametrically opposed to the Christian virtue of humility.¹⁰⁸ Such persons who are alienated from themselves and others will find it difficult to enter into a profound relation with God. During prayer the individual most probably is only encountering the self- the controllable 'other' and in life he or she does not 'encounter' anyone else. Holiness will be a difficult proposition because the narcissistic needs to have everything under control while the humble knows how to depend on God.¹⁰⁹

A narcissistic person will find it difficult to understand the meaning of radical dependence on God and the interdependence with all of God's creation. The understanding of love¹¹⁰ which will be coloured by one's prevailing existential state would obstruct any form of comprehensive reconciliation resulting in a serious block for any genuine spiritual progress.

this quote he is using Erich Fromm who said that love and self-love are mutually exclusive. The more there is of one element, there is less of the other. Self-love is basically selfishness wherein one fails to take care of one's true self.

¹⁰⁸ Narcissism has as its core an exaggerated attention for oneself. While this is easily apparent when a person keeps highlighting one's success without reference to God or others, it is also evident in failures where a person has an exaggerated focus on the misery that befalls him. The exaggerated attention to misery is another form of narcissism and worse than pride. (Fénelon (*Euvres complètes* VI, Paris 1852, 33) as quoted in CHRETIEN, JEAN-LOUIS. *La Mirada del Amor*, (Tr. Barrera, Pilar Jimeno), Ediciones Sígueme: Salamanca, 2005, p. 13.) '*Contemplar la propia miseria y desesperarse por ello no es ser humilde; es, por el contrario, un resentimiento orgulloso peor que el orgullo mismo.*'

¹⁰⁹ Cf. ZAGANO, PHYLLIS. "Spiritual Wisdom, Narcissism, and "Healthy Humility", *The Journal of Pastoral Counseling – Vol. XXXIX*, 2004, p. 23.

¹¹⁰ Divine Love as seen in the Kenosis of God is the reference point in order to understand genuine love. Self-love engages in false love which sets limits and has a need to control the entire relationship. It has the appearance of being detached, but in fact is only a convenient alibi to avoid genuine inter-relationship. Vanstone makes an interesting observation where he says that detachment is a sign of false love. Authentic love cannot remain detached in the face of suffering. (Cf. VANSTONE, W. H. *Love's Endeavour, Love's Expense – The Response of Being to the Love of God*, Darton Longman & Todd: London, 2007, pp. 45,50 & 53.)

3.3.2.2 Positive Self-Love and Transcendence

All forms of self-love are not negative. Positive self-love is healthy and a proper self-image which is rooted in an understanding that one is the image of God results in healthy self-esteem.¹¹¹ However the search for healthy self-esteem can never be the primary goal of life. It is important for a person's growth in so far as it is founded on the realization that a human person is created in the image of God. This form of positive self-love which is often spoken of within counselling circles is the foundation of human life.

... the goal of the counselor cannot be conceived as building self-love. It is not the goal but the presupposition of all counseling. People do not seek counseling help unless they have a desire to be better off than they are. This desire to be happier is what Jesus meant by self-love. Therefore, self-love, so defined, is the foundation, not the aim, of counseling: indeed, it is the foundation of all human life.¹¹²

Positive self-love is necessary for any kind of transcendence. Every person desires to reach out, to move beyond and to transcend oneself. The 'drive for self-transcendence is the divine life within the human person, and its realization culminates in a personal relationship with God who is Truth and Goodness and Love.'¹¹³ Positive self-love leads a person to go beyond oneself for the sake of the other. One is willing to 'empty' oneself and make willing sacrifices of *legitimate interests* of the self.¹¹⁴ This kind of positive self-love reflects the glory, grace and power of God.¹¹⁵

3.3.3 THE ONTOLOGICAL SPLIT, RUPTURE AND CONVERSION

The present work does not interpret self-love in its positive dimension but relates it to that which is sinful in nature and exists for itself. The reality of sin and self-love results

¹¹¹ Zagano will indicate that in the initial phase of spiritual growth, healing of past painful and problematic memories is necessary in order to gain healthy self-esteem. (Cf. ZAGANO, PHYLLIS. "Spiritual Wisdom, Narcissism, and "Healthy Humility" ..., p. 20.)

¹¹² PIPER, JOHN. "Self-love and the Christian counselor's task", *The Reformed Journal*, 1978, p. 14. In continuation Piper will indicate that self-love or self-esteem is not the goal of counselling but is 'a secondary reflex of a life devoted wholeheartedly to the realization of what is most valuable.'

¹¹³ CONN, WALTER E. "Self-Transcendence, the True-Self and Self-Love" ..., p. 323. This form of self-love is opposed to any form of negative self-love where one has an inordinate desire to fulfil every wish and desire.

¹¹⁴ *IBID.*, p. 324.

¹¹⁵ Cf. PIPER, JOHN. "Self-love and the Christian counselor's task" ..., p. 18.

in a person being centered on oneself in a closed and selfish manner.

3.3.3.1 The Ontological Split

The innate tendency of the human person centered on oneself (on creatures) leads to a ruptured relationship with God, with others and the whole of reality. ...There exists in man, as he now is, an ontological split, which shows up also in his activity, especially in that activity which endeavors to be the most total; namely, moral-religious activity. Not only wrong or sinful activity but our whole moral and religious activity manifests this dichotomy and its tensions.¹¹⁶

While we are aware that self-love is a reality of our lives, we also need to keep in mind that it is not part of the essence of our humanity – it is something extrinsic to our true essence and adversely affects us.¹¹⁷ Self-love enslaves a human person in a vicious circle. It diminishes the awareness of sin leading to a downward spiral culminating in greater alienation, loneliness, emptiness and meaninglessness.¹¹⁸ Rahner while explaining concupiscence would highlight this tension between a person's spontaneous inclination and free act. He indicated that such a tension causes one to experience dualism of matter v/s spirit or essence v/s existence. This is a constant existential experience that is faced by the human person.

In the course of its self-determination, the person undergoes the resistance of the nature given prior to freedom, and never wholly succeeds in making all that man is into the reality and the expression of all that he comprehends himself to be in the core of his person. There is much in man which always remains in concrete fact somehow impersonal; impenetrable and unilluminated for his existential decision; merely endured and not freely acted out.¹¹⁹

The desire to do one thing and end up doing something different leads to an experience of being split within.¹²⁰ The human person who is made in the image and likeness of God and is called to be open to others and to the Divine, experiences a rebellion of the "flesh" against the "spirit." In the depths of our being we want what God

¹¹⁶ SCHOONENBERG, PIET. *Man ...*, p. 30.

¹¹⁷ David Williams makes this point in elaborating the humanity of Christ while speaking about the Kenosis of God. (Cf. WILLIAMS, DAVID T. *Kenosis of God...*, pp. 46-47.)

¹¹⁸ Cf. MALONEY, GEORGE. *On the Road...*, pp. 10, 19.

¹¹⁹ RAHNER, KARL. "The Theological Concept of Concupiscence", *TI – 1 (11)*, pp. 368-69.

¹²⁰ The letter of St. Paul to the Romans indicates the existential tension lived by every individual who desires to do what is good but is pulled towards that which is not desired. (*Rom. 7,21-25*)

wants, but sin makes us live at a superficial level. The discomfort experienced due to the tendency of choosing (voluntarily or involuntarily) that which is not in conformity to the will of God, leads to an experience of being torn up.¹²¹

Since this form of existence and relationship does not correspond with one's true being it is bound to fail.¹²² The disoriented tendency cannot easily be set right and it finds subtle means and facades to continue on the same self-defeating path.¹²³ While a person has the freedom to resist and ignore this moment, he can also humbly accept the invitation by God and move out of self-generated plans which are generally rooted in self-love and disordered desires. The inability to do so will result in a recurrence of pain and suffering which will continue to re-emerge in different ways.¹²⁴

3.3.3.2 Humility and Rupture

The existential realization of the ontological split could be a moment of truth when a person would be able to re-orient oneself.¹²⁵ Such a situation provides the right ground for a person to look into one's life and become aware (even if for a fleeting moment) of one's existential state of sin, suffering and death.¹²⁶ This realization is generally a

¹²¹ Cf. VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, pp. 97-98. Echoing the words of Bernanos, Varillon will say that '*It is not a matter of conforming our will to his, because his will is ours, and even when we rebel against it, it is at the cost of tearing apart our inner being, monstrously scattering ourselves. Our will is united to his since the beginning of the world.*'

¹²² When we speak of a breaking point caused by a ruptured relationship with God, it must be said that this experience is not limited to specific age, circumstances or the spiritual state of a person. It could take place at any time and is dependent on the fact that one's framework of life is no longer meaningful. (Cf. SALVADOR, RUIZ. *Caminos del Espíritu*, EDE: Madrid, 1998⁵, p. 593.)

¹²³ The self-defeating path is one of self-love and pride. Buelta comments that the Fathers of the Church rightly indicated pride as the root of all evil. (Cf. GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad...*, pp. 49.) '*El orgullo establece falsas relaciones con Dios, negando su pecado o no acogiendo el perdón que lo rehace; consigo mismo, devaluándose o estableciéndose en el resentimiento; y con los demás, con actitudes de sumisión, de exclusión o de rapiña para intentar realizar su propia existencia desde la autosuficiencia destructora.*'

¹²⁴ Cf. SATURNINO GAMARRA. *Teología...*, p. 237. "*Está claro que a un proyecto de vida hecho desde uno mismo le corresponde una conversión también planteada desde uno mismo. La persona que fue la creadora del proyecto de vida, es ahora la medida de su conversión. Y el dinamismo espiritual que ahí se encierra no puede traspasar el techo de su propia programación.*"

¹²⁵ The starting point of this process could be varied – sickness, failure, loss of image, etc. The important point in order that this process is initiated is that there is a sense of gratitude – a sentiment which emerges from an experience of being loved unconditionally. A powerful experience of this nature leads to intense desire to respond by offering oneself. (Cf. IBID., p. 237.)

¹²⁶ POPE JOHN PAUL II, *Post-Synodal Apostolic Exhortation Reconciliation and Penance*, (1984) "*The restoration of a proper sense of sin is the first way of facing the grave spiritual crisis looming over man today.*"

prelude to a moment of rupture when God enters into the life of a person and opens ‘the eyes of understanding’ (*Au.* 8) in order to illumines the person so that the person becomes a ‘new creature’ (*2 Cor.* 5,17) who lives a new life in the Spirit (*Gal.* 5, 25) and participates generously in the laboring love of realizing God’s Kingdom (*Eph.* 2,19-22).¹²⁷

A rupture takes place with the past when a person feels an intense need to break out of one’s narcissistic and meaningless world. The existential reality helps to make a person humble, to be open, to move out of oneself, and surrender oneself to the gratuitous self-gift of God. This is a moment of grace when a person who has been enlightened in humility pauses to contemplate the perfect union of humility and love in the Triune God.

Acquiring humility lies in the gift that awaits us when we open the door of our hearts, and stand before him who has always been there. He reveals that his infinite love for us, which is one with that of the Trinity, is also a self-emptying love in which humility and love become one. ...We become humbler still in amazement, as we experience the perfect love and infinite mercy of God in Christ Jesus, who reveals how much more God’s love would still want to make of us, and what instead we have been in our wandering ‘lostness’ to Love itself.¹²⁸

The convergence of Divine humility and human humility is the turning point in the Divine-human encounter.¹²⁹ The moment of rupture could become a blessing if a person allows the humility of God to transform one’s life. The humility of God reveals the eternal, unconditional and unlimited nature of God’s self-emptying love. It would be very difficult for a person to remain unmoved before an experience of authentic love as manifested in the humility and meekness of God. It liberates a person from a life of false self-sufficiency and self-love by providing new meaning to life – meaning which is

¹²⁷ It is necessary to state that this is not an automatic process. It consists in a dynamic relationship between God and the human person where the initiative lies in God’s eternal love and mercy. The human person has the freedom to accept the invitation of God or reject it. He also has the freedom to engage in a response which is superficial, half-hearted or total. While there could be general contours which indicate the divine-human relationship, each relationship proceeds in a unique way. Hence it is important to be sensitive so as to ‘*allow the Creator to deal immediately with the creature and the creature with its Creator and Lord*’ (*SpEx* 15.)

¹²⁸ Cf. MALONEY, GEORGE. *On the Road...*, p. 24.

¹²⁹ In the Divine-human partnership God takes the initiative to invite the human person. Man has to respond. Even the decision to ignore this invitation is a response. The free decision of man in terms of responding to God’s call determines the final reality. (Cf. *CSM*, p. 1207.)

rooted in the humility of the Triune God.

While the transformative dimension of Divine humility during the moment of rupture is evident, the reality of human humility during this same moment of rupture is not so clear – it is a double edged sword. This is because a person on the one hand cannot move out of one's narcissistic self-love without being humble, but at the same time this very humility which leads a person towards God is a gift – it is not something achieved by one's effort.¹³⁰ The dichotomy of human humility was experienced by great saints and spiritual persons who realized that 'only God is humble. Man is not so, except in the fact that he admits being unable of humility.'¹³¹

As long as we walk on earthly roads, humility, though always seen as necessary, must be understood as being far beyond our reach. For the instinct of ownership does not avoid seizing upon it as an object which it enjoys, clothes it with vanity as it takes root and grows, and thus destroys it. Only God, by making us aware of the fact that we cannot be humble, makes us humble. The victory of humility can only be the admission of its defeat.¹³²

3.3.3.3 Divine Love, Conversion and Compunction

An experience of God's humility as well as humble openness goes a long way in transforming a critical period into a privileged moment. A person would be able to grow in maturity to the extent that he can come face to face with himself in this moment of rupture. A genuine mutation takes place with a person being purified and the entire person (in particular the affect) being transformed. The starting point of a new form of existence consists in an acceptance of God's self-emptying love. It leads to a new relationship and is a moment of grace.¹³³ Saturnino Gamarra in explaining the initiative of God's grace in this new relationship says that:

¹³⁰ The great saints and mystics were aware of the subtle machinations of self-love. In the very moment of freedom through humility, it had the possibility to entrap a person in a more intense manner through pride. They unanimously insisted that it is only through a life of constant humility rooted in Christ that the sin of pride can be overcome. Humility of any other kind would easily tend toward becoming masochistic in nature. Only in the humility of Christ who reveals the humility of the Triune God do we understand our true human reality.

¹³¹ VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, p. 53.

¹³² *IBID.*, pp. 54-55.

¹³³ Cf. SATURNINO GAMARRA. *Teología...*, pp. 58, 66, 223, 225 & 229.

Gracia designa ante todo una relación, un encuentro, una ruptura de compartimentos estancos entre lo divino y lo humano. “Gracia significa que Dios se ha abajado, ha condescendido con el hombre; que el hombre se ha trascendido hacia Dios; que, por consiguiente, la frontera entre lo divino y lo humano no es impenetrable. ...El dato fundamental en el cambio de la relación entre el hombre y Dios es el don que Dios hace de sí mismo. Esta auto-donación de Dios, que es llamada *gracia increada*, es el factor radical de la regeneración del hombre nuevo.¹³⁴

The starting point of conversion is in realizing that we have been first loved by God. When we were sinners He loved us and accepted a humiliating death on the Cross for us. (*Rom. 5,8; 1 Jn. 4,10*) The quality of His love is seen in that fact that He loves us as we are, loves us despite our resistance, forgive us and gives us the totality of Himself.¹³⁵ However the fact that we have been loved by God is not enough. It is necessary that such love is recognized by the other. Though authentic love does not *seek* recognition it must be noted that loved *needs* to be recognized. The other has to grasp the meaning of the gift and recognize love as love in order to arrive at the completion of its work.¹³⁶

While speaking about conversion through the recognition of God’s love we need to keep in mind two points related to understanding – a) recognition as a process of understanding b) dependence on understanding for fulfillment. Recognition does not come as a single and decisive event – it is a process.

The recognition of love is not to be through of as a single, simple and decisive psychological event. It is not borne in upon one irresistibly, in a flash; it comes through the free exercise of attention, discrimination and reflection. It is a blessing which is made possible by the presence of love but which is only received in one’s discernment of that presence. Though love is a gift, it needs to be remembered that it is only through a person’s own understanding that the blessing of love reaches its fullness.¹³⁷

The necessity to recognize God’s love for an authentic process of conversion is

¹³⁴ IBID., p. 59. (The quote is from RUIZ DE LA PEÑA, J.L. “Fe cristiana, pensamiento secular y felicidad”, *Sal Terrae* – 77, 1989, p. 338.) The presence of God is *uncreated grace* while *created grace* is the human person who on receiving this gift is divinized and participates in the life of God. (IBID., p. 67.)

¹³⁵ Cf. IBID., p. 223.

¹³⁶ Cf. VANSTONE, W. H. *Love’s Endeavour, Love’s Expense ...*, p. 94. Vanstone says that love *needs* recognition, though it is not *sought*. ‘... (love) works unobtrusively and yet, for the sake of the other, allows the possibility that it will be recognized. When it is so recognized, when the other has grasped the meaning of its gifts and recognized them as symbols of love, then the work of love achieves its triumphant completion of self-giving.’

¹³⁷ IBID. pp. 95-96.

indispensable. While conversion decides the tragedy or triumph of a person's life, it also decides the tragedy or triumph of God's love. Its triumph can be seen when a person celebrates the gift of God's self-emptying love and reproduces in one's life that which has been received.¹³⁸ God waits for the recognition of His self-emptying love because in such a recognition lies the fulfillment of Divine love. It must be recalled that 'the final triumph of the love of God is the celebration of His love within that universe which has received that love.'¹³⁹

The sign of genuine conversion is compunction and gratitude. Compunction is profound sorrow which emerges from an awareness of one's state of fragmentation, alienation and selfishness – in short sorrow for one's sinfulness.¹⁴⁰ There is profound sorrow for having wasted the gift of life and the self-gift of God for false substitutes which are now recognized as deceptions. Sorrow thus experienced manifests itself in 'shame, confusion and tears.'¹⁴¹ A corresponding awareness consists in recognizing oneself as a creature - and that everything one has is a gift from God. It leads to a new relationship which is beyond all forms of human/worldly securities,¹⁴² which is the result of an authentic 'conversion, (comes from) compunction of the heart, (and) produces fruits corresponding to that compunction.'¹⁴³

Genuine compunction leads to true humility. The process described in this point relates to a very delicate moment in the life of a person. It is important that compunction be founded on an experience of the love of God and not on mere awareness of one's sinfulness, misery and suffering. Bereft of this foundation, it would end up creating an even more self-centered person.¹⁴⁴ Genuine compunction leads to true humility because

¹³⁸ Cf. IBID. p. 96. The response contained in the 'coming-to-be' of human love is similar to the foundational love of God. It contains the same dedication, precariousness and tension between form and content, the same un-programmed advance, the same possibility of 'coming right' or 'coming wrong'.

¹³⁹ Cf. VANSTONE, W. H. *Love's Endeavour, Love's Expense...*, pp. 94-97.

¹⁴⁰ Cf. GAMARRA, SATURNINO. *Teología...*, p. 239.

¹⁴¹ *SpEx* 48

¹⁴² Cf. GAMARRA, SATURNINO. *Teología...*, p. 240.

¹⁴³ SCHOONENBERG, PIET. *Man ...*, p. 12.

¹⁴⁴ Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios Espirituales de San Ignacio – Historia y Análisis*, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2009, p. 181.

true humility can only 'come from knowing the superabundance of God's love.'¹⁴⁵ It leads to hope and true self-knowledge.¹⁴⁶ To the degree that a person grows in the knowledge of God there is a corresponding growth in true humility.

...solo puedo conocerme ante Dios, por su luz y en su luz, por tanto, sólo al conocerlo a él, y no lo conozco en verdad más que cuando lo conozco humildemente como mi Creador y mi Salvador, del que depende todo mi ser, incluso el acto mismo de reconocerlo así. De una mirada hacía Dios nace la humildad, y la luz que recibo sobre mí no es más que lunar y reflejada, no una lucidez propia de la que pueda jactarme.¹⁴⁷

3.3.4 NEW LIFE

We have seen that in the Divine-human encounter leading to conversion, God takes the initiative. It is an encounter where the recognition of God's love by the human person leads to compunction and true humility. This leads the person to a transformed existence leading to new life. The concrete expression of new life is seen in a life of love and service.

In this section we would like to elaborate the concrete nature of human response. As a prelude to the response, we would like to highlight two fundamental elements which underlie the divine-human relationship –the gratuitous nature of God's love and God's extraordinary respect for human freedom. We shall then indicate how humility is at the foundation of any new beginning. This will be followed by showing how the concrete manifestation of humility can be seen in the self-emptying love of a person. We shall end with some concluding remarks.

3.3.4.1 The Divine Initiative

Despite the fact that the human person is ontologically open to the Divine, we need to

¹⁴⁵ CHRÉTIEN, JEAN-LOUIS. *La Mirada del Amor...*, p. 13 In this point Jean-Louis quotes Louis Lallemand and the author of the *Cloud of Unknowing* in order to show how the root of humility is the knowledge of God.

¹⁴⁶ Crétien explains that genuine humility generates hope and leads to true self-knowledge. He makes a difference between perfect and imperfect humility where perfect humility comes from knowing the abundance of God's love while imperfect humility comes from merely considering our misery and faults. True humility leads to genuine self-knowledge and the author builds upon Augustine, Bonaventure and Kierkegaard in order to make his point. (Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 13-15.)

¹⁴⁷ CHRÉTIEN, JEAN-LOUIS. *La Mirada del Amor...*, p. 14.

reinforce the primacy of the Divine initiative within the spiritual process of a person. 'We love because He loved us first.' (1 Jn. 4,19) The rupture which leads to new life is a topic which is too vast for this work to explain. However we shall restrict ourselves to two points which are important in order to better understand the charism and spiritual process which we shall elaborate in the later sections.

The first concerns gratuitous love and is related to the gratuitous nature of apostolic works within the Society of Jesus. The second refers to the dimension of freedom because this is again a fundamental element in the candidate's decision to follow the Lord within the context of the Society of Jesus. The choice to enter the Society as well as the spiritual journey proposed requires an ongoing growth in freedom.

3.3.4.1.1 *Gratuitous Love*

Gratuitousness is perhaps the least inadequate word if we want to express the mystery of man and the mystery of God. It includes in its meaning purity of love, freedom, absence of calculation. Grace and gratitude have the same root. Grace is gratuitousness, gratitude is a response of gratuitousness and homage.¹⁴⁸

The gratuitous love of God is what lies at the core of the Divine-human relationship. The Divine Kenosis discloses the heart and substance of this relationship¹⁴⁹ and is seen throughout the Synoptics and Pauline corpus.¹⁵⁰ Christ manifests the gratuitous love of God¹⁵¹ through his life and by the filial and faithful relationship with the Father to the very end. In Christ we come to know of depth of gratuitousness love. It is revealed as consisting in endless forgiveness, limitlessness, freedom and the absence of conditions. While it has often been explained that gratuitousness is respectful of the other and puts no limit or tries to control the other, it needs to be recalled that authentic love also knows how to limit itself and withhold itself. Restrain and renunciation which is for the good

¹⁴⁸ VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, pp. 10-11.

¹⁴⁹Cf. VANSTONE, W. H. *Love's Endeavour, Love's Expense ...*, p. 58.

¹⁵⁰ The Pauline experience resonates with the universal experience of the human person. Paul who was a faithful observer of the Law believed that he had been justified by his own merits. However when he encountered the Risen Lord, he realized that his justification was a totally gratuitous act of God and that it was in the acceptance of this free gift that he experienced true life. (Cf. THOMAS TOBIN. *The Spirituality of St. Paul...*, p. 96.)

¹⁵¹ CCC, no. 1999. 'The grace of Christ is the gratuitous gift that God makes to us of his own life, infused by the Holy Spirit into our soul to heal it of sin and to sanctify it.'

of the other is also an indication of gratuitous love.¹⁵²

That which love withholds is withheld for the sake of the other who is loved - so that it may not harm him, so that it may be used for a more timely service or so that it may mature into a richer gift. A person who loves holds nothing for himself: he reserves nothing as of right. That which he holds, he holds either on trust or as gift. He holds on trust that which awaits its own maturity or the need or capacity of the other to receive it: he holds as gift that which is returned to him in the response of the other who is loved.¹⁵³

The gratuitous love of God does not mean that works are irrelevant. According to Catholic understanding, good works, made possible by grace and the working of the Holy Spirit, contribute to growth in grace, so that the righteousness that comes from God is preserved and communion with Christ is deepened.¹⁵⁴ While there is no doubt that justification is a free gift, one ought to remember that this gift needs to be assumed by the human person.¹⁵⁵ The indication of an authentic conversion will be seen through a person's concrete fidelity to God's divine will.¹⁵⁶ The Catechism of the Catholic Church in explaining justification states that:

...justification is the work of the Holy Spirit and is a grace which establishes co-operation between God and the human person. The Holy Spirit is the master of interior life and justification entails the sanctification of the entire being leading to a participation in the Trinitarian life. The initiative belongs to God and no one can merit the initial grace of forgiveness and justification. The free initiative from God demands man's free response, for God created man in his image by conferring on him, along with freedom, the power to know him and love him.¹⁵⁷

The moment of rupture is a privileged moment in a new relationship with God and with others. However this is not an automatic process or a 'given fact' because the

¹⁵² Cf. VANSTONE, W. H. *Love's Endeavour, Love's Expense ...*, pp. 43-45. 'The external restraint which love practices is often a mark of its freedom from internal limit. Love does not lay down the condition that it must be allowed freedom to express itself, nor limit its activity to those circumstances in which it may freely act. Love accepts without limit the discipline of circumstances. Although it always aspires to enlarge its own activity, it sometimes finds its most generous enlargement in the acceptance of restraint. Love must sometimes express itself in the renunciation of not disclosing itself.'

¹⁵³ *IBID.*, p. 45.

¹⁵⁴ http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/chrstuni/documents/rc_pc_chrstuni_doc_31101999_cath-luth-joint-declaration_en.html

¹⁵⁵ There is no doubt that God takes the initiative in the process of conversion. The call to conversion is an offer of grace and the human person's progressive response is the acceptance of grace. (Cf. *IBID.*, p. 83.)

¹⁵⁶ CCC, 1993.

¹⁵⁷ CCC, 1990-1995. (The quote presents a summary of these five numbers.)

individual at all times retains one's capacity to make a free choice.¹⁵⁸ It is the realization of love by understanding and acknowledging the self-gift of God that the Divine – human relationship is actualized.

3.3.4.1.2 Freedom

Freedom is the power, rooted in reason and will, to act or not to act, to do this or that, and so to perform deliberate actions on one's own responsibility. By free will one shapes one's own life. Human freedom is a force for growth and maturity in truth and goodness; it attains its perfection when directed toward God, our beatitude¹⁵⁹

The most divine trait of the Triune God and the most human trait of the human person is the will.¹⁶⁰ Since we receive our existence from God, God's will is our will from the very beginning of the world.¹⁶¹ The gift of free will always offers us possibility to make a free act¹⁶² and therefore we can either accept or reject the invitation of God.¹⁶³ The possibility of freely responding to God's gratuitous invitation or rejecting it is the fundamental crisis that lies at the core of human existence.¹⁶⁴ In elaborating this point we shall begin by explaining Divine freedom in order to better understand the point on human freedom. Finally we shall conclude with some remarks about the Divine-human relationship.

¹⁵⁸ Exception needs to be made of pathological situations or serious infirmities where a person behaves in a compulsive manner being unable to control oneself or is unaware of one's behavioral patterns. However in the normal course of life a person (taking into account one's conditioned existence) retains the freedom to choose or to reject the gratuitous love of God.

¹⁵⁹ CCC, 1731.

¹⁶⁰ The Trinity sheds light on all human existence and this includes freedom at all levels of our life. Since the three persons of the Trinity lives through and for the other – freedom is created. (Cf. VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, pp. 81, 90.)

¹⁶¹ In an earlier note on the ontological split we have spoken about the union of Divine and human will. (Cf. VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, p. 97.) Though there is a union of will, it does not mean that the human will is absorbed into the Divine will. Rather, being the image of the divine will, the human will contains the freedom of choice and decision.

¹⁶² 'A free act is thus the origin of the proof of God. One must stress this because nowhere on our road to it will we find an argument that compels the mind. Freedom stands at the start, and it is also at the end, therefore along the way. But where there is freedom, there is also reason. If man is free it is because he is rational.' (IBID., p. 22)

¹⁶³ Freedom is not absolute and in an unqualified sense. While man 'is capable of the response of freedom', it must be mentioned that in 'certain aspects of his being man is no more than a part of nature, and exercises no power of choice.' (Cf. VANSTONE, W. H. *Love's Endeavour, Love's Expense...*, pp. 87-88.)

¹⁶⁴ This is the crisis for the human person. The possibility to respond in freedom is what determines the triumph or tragedy of love. (Cf. IBID., p. 92.)

God's freedom has been definitively revealed to us in Christ. His freedom has been revealed in poverty, dependence and humility.

God is sovereignly independent, therefore free. But he is free to love and to go to the extreme of love. The extreme of love is renunciation of independence; at the limit, it is death. God is immensely great and powerful. But his greatness is to be able to do all that love does, even to self-effacement in the humility of the eyes. ...God is such that his riches, his freedom, his power—riches of love, freedom of love, power of love—can only be (and are in fact) translated, expressed, revealed in the poverty, the dependence and the humility of Jesus Christ.¹⁶⁵

God's freedom is manifest in creation which is a free act of going out of oneself – of self-giving.¹⁶⁶ It is also manifest in the Incarnation¹⁶⁷ where we encounter that God who redeems in love, manifests the same freedom in Christ.¹⁶⁸ The climax of this drama of divine and human freedom is the Cross where we find the perfect synthesis of true freedom and love in the revelation of divine self-emptying and a total response of all authentic human yearning.¹⁶⁹ The freedom of God has also been interpreted within an ongoing evolutionary framework. God who is the Creator shares the unfolding course of creation with human beings who are co-creators.¹⁷⁰ The theme of ongoing creation takes into account the freedom of God and that of the human person – *creation ex nihilo* is complemented by the concept of *creation continua*.¹⁷¹

¹⁶⁵ VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, p. 52.

¹⁶⁶ Cf. POWER, DAVID N. *Love without...*, pp. 50-51. Power speaks three dramas within the context of the Divine drama – the drama of freedoms, a drama of power and above all the drama of love. He explains that the freedom of God was to have loved – to have created. Creation is a free act of pure outgoing, of self-giving.

¹⁶⁷ Cf. VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, p. 57. Varillon in explaining divine and human freedom says that there is no contradiction between freedom and dependence. Through the Incarnation, God depends on nature but that does not lessen God. God does not *need* the reciprocity of the human person because God is absolutely self-sufficient. He also remarks about the vulnerability of God in relation to human freedom when he says that 'God is wounded by nothing, but one can wound God.'

¹⁶⁸ Cf. IBID., p. 52.

¹⁶⁹ Power elaborates Balthasar's Christology and speaks of the divine drama as manifest in the person of Christ. In this drama we have '*the conflict between divine freedom and human freedom, lived out by Christ himself in his ministry, passion and descent into hell.*' (Cf. POWER, DAVID N. *Love without...*, p. 50.)

¹⁷⁰ This has led to the emergence of *continuous creation* as an important theme in theology. This theology in the first place emphasizes the flexibility and creaturely causality. It also emphasizes that God can no longer be held totally and directly responsible for all that happens. (Cf. POLIKINGHORNE, JOHN. "Kenotic Creation and Divine Action", *The Work of Love...*, pp. 94-95.)

¹⁷¹ Cf. IBID., p. 95.

Human freedom is rooted in the fact that God has created a person as a spiritual and relational being who is 'marked and conditioned by history. Knowledge and freedom affect and are affected by the personal openness of human reality to the future.'¹⁷² A human person realizes one's true being by participating in Divine life. For this it necessary to be open to the initiative of God's love. An important factor in being united with the Divine is the capacity of reason and free will – these capacities predispose a person to enter into a relationship with God.¹⁷³ The human person who is thus disposed to experience and share in the self-emptying love of the Trinity must seek to imitate the humility of Christ by the right use of one's free will.

As we experience the infinite, emptying, serving love of the indwelling Trinity within us, we too should live for others in self-sacrificing service. Following Jesus means to be washed thoroughly of all our desires for power and domination to live as he lived: as a humble, suffering servant.¹⁷⁴

The humility of God is seen in the freedom given to the human person.¹⁷⁵ 'God has an absolute respect for the freedom of man. He created it, not in order to petrify it, violate it or imposes himself. He suggests, he proposes, he invites.'¹⁷⁶ Respecting this freedom is important for God¹⁷⁷ and therefore God will never manipulate this freedom. The suffering and vulnerability on the Cross is the consequence of this freedom.¹⁷⁸ The flawed use of the gift of freedom is the cause of God's pain and suffering and this suffering reveals the profound nature of God's humility.

¹⁷² LUCIEN, RICHARD. *Christ: The Self-Emptying...*, p. 155.

¹⁷³ Cf. VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, p. 35.

¹⁷⁴ MALONEY, GEORGE. *On the Road...*, p. 53.

¹⁷⁵ 'La humildad se reconoce en la libertad que nos da, y es tanto más profundo cuanto más amplia es ésta. ...Sólo el humilde es libre para sí y, por ende, libre para el otro. Todo aquello que te cierra en ti y te somete a ti mismo no es sino orgullo.' CHRÉTIEN, JEAN-LOUIS. *La Mirada del Amor...*, p. 12.

¹⁷⁶ VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, p. 67.

¹⁷⁷ Chartier locates love as the organizing principle of theology. While speaking of divine actions he states that '*divine action is conceived of as consistently persuasive rather than coercive.*' Cf. CHARTIER, GARY. *The Analogy of Love*, Imprint Academic: Devon, 2007, p. xv.

¹⁷⁸ Freedom reveals that authentic love entails suffering. Even before the Cross, man retains his freedom. Christ on the Cross reveals on the one hand the gift of freedom which is not manipulated, while on the other hand it reveals the vulnerability of God before the gift of this freedom. '*Yet Christ is crucified. Here we see the vulnerability of God and what we dared call his eternal "agony." Love does not manipulate the freedoms it creates. It cannot compel them to love. In letting them create themselves, God accepts the risk of seeing them turn away or turn against him. A love that creates freedoms can only be a suffering love.*' Cf. VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, p. 91.

God is serious with regard to respect and suffering. We cannot come to either one of these two except from a very great distance, and by leaning on our highest experience. In truth, God respects us too much to magically spare us suffering, and he respects himself too much to spare himself the suffering of our suffering. And when it comes to the evil brought forth by our freedom ...how much more demanding at this level the respect and how much deeper the suffering of creative Love! We are here at the heart of the mystery - I say it clearly: mystery - of God's humility.¹⁷⁹

Obedience and freedom coincide in a perfect manner in Jesus. The root of this coincidence is humility. Christ was totally free to love and his humility and freedom was greater in his forgiving love. He revealed to us that manipulated freedom was not love and that any genuine love involved humility and respectful freedom.¹⁸⁰ This is the kind of freedom that a human person is invited to grow into. Through the grace of the Spirit a person is enlightened and empowered. There is a growing degree of freedom leading to choices which help realize one's true being.

3.3.4.2 Humble Response

God's grace allows a person to recognize that a humble surrender to the gratuitous love of God is the only way out of a life of narcissistic self-love and pride. The moment of rupture, rooted in the love of God makes a person open and creates an intense desire to respond by a total self-gift of oneself. This desire is actualized through a concrete vocation where the person who is now a 'new creature' enters into a new realm of relationships. Such a person lives a new form of existence where one's reality is vivified by an abiding sense of gratitude.¹⁸¹

La gratuidad de esta realidad es a todas luces evidente. No podemos pensar que lo que nosotros somos sea el fundamento de la nueva relación con Dios; sino, al contrario, de la nueva relación con Dios somos lo que somos: de la nueva relación con Cristo somos

¹⁷⁹ IBID., p. 94

¹⁸⁰ Varillon here makes an important point by distinguishing between captive freedom v/s freedom which respects and saves. In this part he says that '*humility of God is his mode of being*' and presents Jesus as a model of humility. He goes on to say that '*between being-with and bending-toward there is a chasm. Jesus does not bend towards the sinners: he is with them.*' Bending towards another would be more 'efficient', but that would wound a person's freedom and trample on his dignity. We often want a God who solves our problems immediately – we prefer '*happiness to freedom and (are willing) to accept servile tranquility.*' Jesus does not reveal a 'useful' god understood in the normal sense, but a true Savior. '*Savior of what? Of man? Of what in man? Of that which makes man what he is: freedom.*' (IBID., pp. 112-113.)

¹⁸¹ Cf. SATURNINO GAMARRA. *Teología...*, pp. 225-27.

criatura nueva. Y la nueva relación se nos da en Jesús por la participación de la Pascua. La gratuidad es un hecho.¹⁸²

While the experience of God's gratuitous love is the foundation of new life, humility is the key to progress in spiritual life and keep self-love under check.¹⁸³ Humility is not merely one more virtue but is the key virtue of spiritual life. If charity is the goal of spiritual life, humility is the foundation.¹⁸⁴ It is the means to a true realization of oneself because it allows a person to have a humble appraisal of oneself within the context of God's humility. Relationship thus rooted in humility is the condition of all spiritual gifts.¹⁸⁵ A person participates creatively in God's labouring love by responding generously. Humility and humble service is thus the doorway in order to participate in Divine Life.

3.3.4.2.1 *Humble service of the other*

Humility thus leads to a transformed attitude or behaviour towards others. Identification with the humility of Christ is reflected in 'one's behaviour towards others as one who is mild, meek, not lording it over anyone but always ready to be of service, even compassionately.'¹⁸⁶ There is greater appreciation for the gifts of others on the one hand and an increasing awareness of one's sins and weaknesses.¹⁸⁷ It leads to a freedom and joy in the heart where a person now realizes that to serve others is a privilege.¹⁸⁸ One also understands that humble service of others is the only true way that one can be

¹⁸² IBID.

¹⁸³ Zagano quoting the Fathers of the Church states that without humility and the concomitant fear of God there can be no progress in spiritual life. The article refers to 'healthy narcissism' which is necessary for a beginner. '*True growth and spiritual self-recognition need a little of this warming up, so a period of self-involvement that results in self-recognition is normal and necessary. The self-involvement is often a time of growth, as problematic and painful memories begin to be healed and self-esteem is gained or regained. Until the seeker gains some modicum of balanced self-esteem, there is little possibility for progress in the spiritual life.*' (CF. ZAGANO, PHYLLIS. "Spiritual Wisdom, Narcissism, and "Healthy Humility",..., pp. 20-21, 24.)

¹⁸⁴ Cf. MALONEY, GEORGE. *On the Road...*, p. 30.

¹⁸⁵ Cf. GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad...*, p. 49.

¹⁸⁶ POWER, DAVID. *Love without Calculation...*, p. 7.

¹⁸⁷ Cf. MALONEY, GEORGE. *On the Road to...*, p. 34. Maloney makes this point in order to indicate the opinion of the Fathers of the Church vis-à-vis the following statement by St. Paul, 'be humble toward one another, always considering others better than ourselves.' (*Phil. 2,3*)

¹⁸⁸ Cf. IBID., p. 54. '*If we are humble, we will not exalt ourselves through distorted pride, but we will recognize the privilege to serve others in order to grow more in the likeness of Jesus, our Master.*'

one's genuine self. 'A mystic is always one who undertakes to be self only through another, therefore for the other.'¹⁸⁹ A person who shares in the lives of others lives a life of inter-relatedness, harmony, joy and strength.¹⁹⁰

Humility which is rooted in gratitude leads to generosity and the two (humility and generosity) are intrinsically related. This is not a generosity where a person primarily trusts in oneself. Rather it consists in giving oneself totally for the other, trusting fully and abandoning oneself totally into the hands of God.¹⁹¹ Such generosity cannot remain merely at an abstract theoretical level but in an imitation of the love of the Triune God has to be 'particular' by reflecting itself in concrete historical situations.¹⁹² A person progressively participates in the Paschal mystery through a generous and concrete commitment of one's entire self. There is a gradual assimilation of the attitudes of Christ – most specifically the attitude of humility.¹⁹³

Generosity which is based on humility leads to concrete commitment – commitment which is intrinsically related to gratitude.¹⁹⁴ As we have seen so far,

¹⁸⁹ VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, p. 84.

¹⁹⁰ Buelta says that humility is not weakness, but a strong positive force. It opens up to God, to creativity, to joy and strength. We are not invited to approach the poor with a false sense of sympathy – this would be pride. Rather we are invited to approach the humble in order to encounter in a privileged manner the true face of a humble God. (Cf. GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad...*, pp. 148-49.) '*La humildad nos abre a la comunión con Dios, a la creatividad, a la alegría y a la fortaleza.*'

¹⁹¹ Cf. CHRÉTIEN, JEAN-LOUIS. *La Mirada del Amor...*, p. 18. Chrétien quotes St. Francis de Sales in showing how humility and generosity are indissolubly linked. These two virtues are always together and one cannot be present without the other. Humility without generosity is false humility, while true humility offers the totality of oneself placing one's entire trust in God. Generosity which does not emerge from humility would be conceit and foolhardiness. (Quotes of Francis de Sales are from, *Introduction à la vie devote* III, 5, (Euvres, Paris 1969, 143.)

¹⁹² Cf. CHARTIER, GARY. *The Analogy of Love...*, pp. 15, 63. Chartier is speaking about primarily about divine love which is particular in nature. '*Authentic love must be particular. That is, God's loving action must reflect a divine response to a given situation in the world that is appropriate to that situation. ...Freedom and responsiveness are crucial to love, and divine action can exhibit such freedom and responsiveness only if it is particular.*' He will also say that the understanding that God is love should not be an excuse for complacency and sentimentality.

¹⁹³ Cf. SATURNINO GAMARRA. *Teología...*, pp. 80, 225, 243. It must be pointed out that the assimilation of the attitudes of Christ is very important not the starting point. '*Las actitudes, que siguen siendo muy importantes, no pueden ser el punto de partida de la nueva criatura, sino consecuencia de ser criatura nueva.*'

¹⁹⁴ Cf. IBID., p. 227. Gamarra will point out that the ability to live one's commitment to a vocation from the realm of gratitude will make the vocation a liberating and fulfilling experience. '*La experiencia de gratuidad en el proceso de la vocación lleva a ésta a trascender la visión de la vocación como obligación, como exigencia personal, a superar el narcisismo, a aceptar una misión que trasciende y en la que no se haga pie, a tener la fe como único recurso en los momentos difíciles, a integrar*

gratuitous love is a transversal experience in the entire spiritual process. The inter-relationship between commitment and gratitude has been explained by Gamarra who says:

...se acepta la relación que incluye la integración de la gratuidad y del compromiso: la gratuidad estaría presente en el compromiso y el compromiso estaría presente en la gratuidad. Pero se busca una relación más profunda: que la gratuidad cristiana es compromiso y que el compromiso es gratuidad. Profundizando en lo que son la gratuidad cristiana y el compromiso cristiano se llega a que la gratuidad cristiana se vive en compromiso y el compromiso cristiano se vive en gratuidad.¹⁹⁵

Commitment is manifest in a life of humble service within a particular vocation. The vocation is a specific or particular way by which a person responds faithfully to God's love by being seeking and doing God's will. Faithfulness and humble service would grow in the degree that a person lives from an experience of gratuitous love. In order to understand the authenticity of a person's response we could make use of two indicators: a) the person's faithfulness to God's will and b) commitment to the poor.

Pope Benedict XVI while speaking of fidelity to the will of God said that, 'the "yes" of our will to His will unites our intellect, will and sentiments in the all-embracing act of love.'¹⁹⁶ The two forms of fulfilling the divine will consist in active and passive conformity to God's will.¹⁹⁷ Of the two, passive conformity, compared to active conformity is far more difficult because it means that one accepts all that happens in my life – even those realities that are beyond the control of my will.¹⁹⁸

la disponibilidad como dato esencial de insustituible de la vocación cristiana.'

¹⁹⁵ IBID.

¹⁹⁶ POPE BENEDICT XVI, *DCE*, 2005. [17] (<http://www.vatican.va>)

¹⁹⁷ In every good act there is a combination of a passive dimension as well as an active dimension. Joseph de Guibert suggests that '*passive conformity is a necessary condition for a perfect life inasmuch as he who does not submit to the decrees of Divine Providence cannot love God perfectly and truly.*' However '*active conformity, can be regarded as the true measure of spiritual perfection because it necessarily presupposes passive conformity.*' (Cf. DE GUIBERT, JOSEPH. *The Theology of the Spiritual Life...*, p. 97.

¹⁹⁸ Cf. HAUSHERR, I. *La Perfección del Cristiano*, Mensajero: Bilbao, 1971, pp. 131-34. Passivity is not laziness or false resignation, but is in a certain way active because the individual lets go of one's self and accepts the will of God trusting in God's Providence. Passive conformity consists in accepting events as they emerge. In the debate vis-à-vis active and passive conformity it is important to note that charity is the norm and the focus ought to be on the internal attitude of acceptance of the will of God. We see here a nuanced difference between Joseph de Guibert and I.

Lo que hace santificante a la conformidad activa es la aceptación de tener que hacer la voluntad de Dios significada; lo que hace santificante a la conformidad pasiva es el acto de aceptación que somete el alma al beneplácito de Dios en uno como en otro caso, la renuncia a la propia voluntad por la preferencia de la voluntad de Dios.¹⁹⁹

The attitude of Jesus reveals to us the meaning of fidelity to God's will in its most profound sense. While passive and active conformity are not opposed to each other, purification is more profound and secure in passivity.²⁰⁰ Fidelity to the will of God is a historical and ongoing process. It is a 'process that is always open-ended; is never "finished" and complete; throughout life, it changes and matures, and thus remains faithful to itself.'²⁰¹ The renunciation of one's will and a free acceptance of God's will lead a person to participate in the mystery of God.²⁰²

Along with fidelity to God's will, another important indicator of authentic spiritual process is a life of humble service and humility towards the poor. Humble service towards the poor and humiliated allows a person to contemplate and participate in the very being of God in concrete and historical contexts. The poor who like all human persons are the image of God reveal to us the image of the Triune God and the power of the Holy Spirit. In humble service towards the poor we find a privileged means of serving Christ poor and humble.²⁰³

Todo hombre es imagen de Dios, y en todo nuestros actos no cesamos los unos para con los otros de reconocerla o de ignorarla; pero la imagen más soberana de Cristo humillado y desfigurado es el pobre, el miserable, el humillado. La humildad impone al mismo tiempo venerar y servir a otro hombre en su indigencia como la imagen más perfecta del Señor de los mundos, y tener siempre fortaleza para luchar contra la humillación del otro sin poder resignarse a ello. Humillar a otro es un acto de profanación. La humildad es la

Hausherr.

¹⁹⁹ IBID., p. 147.

²⁰⁰ Cf. IBID., p. 147-48. "*Reconocemos aquí la aplicación de la oración de Jesús en el huerto: 'No mi voluntad, sino la tuya.'* Cristo no sufrió su Pasión por una especie de fatalismo deducido erróneamente: la sufrió aceptándola." While active conformity has great merit, passive acceptance has greater merit because it needs greater abnegation. In it one is shaken up to the very depth of one's being and the protagonist is clearly God.

²⁰¹ POPE BENEDICT XVI, *DCE - 17*, 2005.

²⁰² CCC, 2825.

²⁰³ Cf. GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad...*, p. 149. '*Esta afirmación de Pablo (1 Cor. 1,27-28) nos ayuda a mirar a los últimos, a los humillados de este mundo, como imágenes de Dios, donde puede surgir en medio de la historia no solo el alimento de nuestra contemplación personal, sino el origen de la audacia del Espíritu de Dios en medio de los mecanismos que los aplastan.*'

verdadera grandeza únicamente porque su tarea propia es ensalzar y elevar a los demás con el sacrificio del amor.”²⁰⁴

The two indicators reveal to us that the goal of life is fulfilled progressively through fidelity to God’s will by humble service towards the poor. This was the disposition of Christ and a person is invited to have the same. The more we are able to offer ourselves in the service of the poor and humble the more we grow in humility, freedom and love. A life of humble service towards the other allows us to participate in the life of the Triune God who is present only as being present to the other and exists only for the other.²⁰⁵

3.3.4.2.2 *Configuration in Christ and participation in the Trinity*

As we come to the last point of this chapter we would like to reiterate and further explain the goal of the human person as configuring one’s life in Christ and participating in Trinitarian life. We shall begin by explaining the Christian call to configure one’s life with Christ. This will be followed by showing how the call to configure oneself in Christ is related to participation in Trinitarian life. This participation is not possible without the generous participation of the human person. We shall end by indicating how the response of the human person in the form of totally emptying oneself is what leads to harmony with the Triune God and divinization.

A Christian is called to configure one’s life with Christ who was faithful and obedient to the will of the Father.²⁰⁶ This relationship with the Father overflowed in His day to day life where ‘he went about doing good.’ (*Acts 10,38*) The norm and canon for Christian spirituality has as its foundational basis the person of Jesus Christ.²⁰⁷ Through Christ we are introduced into the mystery of Trinitarian life wherein we share a personal

²⁰⁴ CHRÉTIEN, JEAN-LOUIS. *La Mirada del Amor...*, pp. 24-25.

²⁰⁵ Cf. VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God...*, pp. 79-80

²⁰⁶ The comprehensive realization of a person takes place as a process of God’s gift and human freedom. God’s gift is seen in the Incarnation where God accepted the whole of humanity and Jesus, through the obedience on the Cross, opened the way for us sinners to the Father. In Jesus a definitive self-communication of God has taken place and this is assumed and concretely experienced and lived by the human person. (Cf. RAHNER, KARL. “Jesus Christ – The Meaning of Life”, *TI – 21 (15)*, pp. 2-6.)

²⁰⁷ Cf. VON BALTHASAR, HANS URS. “Teología y Santidad” *Ensayos Teológicos – I*, Madrid: 1964, pp. 287 – 289.

relationship with the Father, Son and Spirit.²⁰⁸

Christian spirituality finds its rightful place in Christ in whom there is a perfect synthesis of the human and Divine.²⁰⁹ This invitation to the human person who has been made in the image and likeness of God to participate in Divine life by configuring oneself in Christ can be seen directly and indirectly all through the Bible and in the Christian Tradition.²¹⁰ The Fathers of the Church from the very beginning reiterated the same with Clement of Rome speaking of participation in God, Ignatius of Antioch and Polycarp saying that the goal of Christian life is to reach Christ and union with God. Down the centuries we find various saints speaking of a configuration in Christ which is experienced as an indwelling of the Trinity.²¹¹

Configuration in Christ refers to a process whereby one's entire being is progressively transformed and there is a new mode of existence which is relational – a relation of total self-emptying love. This relationship is always in the context of the Kingdom²¹² and the Holy Spirit is the cause that effects the transformation to divine

²⁰⁸ Cf. GAMARRA, SATURNINO. *Teología...*, p. 78. '...Este nuevo ser divino 'introduce al hombre en el misterio personal de la vida trinitaria y le pone en relación personal con el Padre de Cristo y con el Espíritu de Cristo.' (The quote is from LADARIA, L. F. *Introducción a la antropología teológica*, p. 150.)

²⁰⁹ Cf. IBID., pp. 292-294. 'Para el Cristiano las espiritualidades humanas jamás podrán separarse del sentido último que les ha dado la figura reveladora de Cristo. ...Cristianamente visto, el punto sintético entre Dios y el mundo y la integración concreta del mundo en Dios están en Cristo.'

²¹⁰ In the OT the book of Genesis reveals that man was made in the 'image and likeness of God.' Though the Jewish tradition could never imagine the human being united to the Divine, some texts in Wisdom literature do make references to the same. (Cf. HAUSHERR, I. *La perfección...*, 1971, pp. 156-57.) In the New Testament it would be St. Paul who would speak of the need to 'be in Christ' and expressed this reality through the use of the word 'koinonia' where one is in communion with Christ. Various prepositions that indicate 'life in Christ' appear 164 times in the in the Pauline corpus. These include being in Christ (*Rom. 8,1-5; 1 Cor. 1,30*), life in Christ (*Rom. 6,5-11; Rom. 8,2*). (Cf. CASTRO, SECUNDINO. *Unpublished Notes*, Madrid: UComillas, 2009-10.) An important text in order to understand this text is *1Cor. 1,9*. In explaining 'life in Christ' as a *koinonia*, Paul would speak of a change which takes place at both an operative and ontological level and this needs to be assumed in one's life. (Cf. GAMARRA, SATURNINO. *Teología...*, 2007, p. 55.) Peter would also say that we participate in divine nature where there is a union of the being of a person and the being of God. (*2 Pet. 1,4*) St. John also spoke of 'being in' a permanent relationship with the Trinity. (*Jn. 10,30; 1 Jn. 1,3*)

²¹¹ Various saints have spoken about an experience of 'an indwelling of the Trinity', 'the Trinity as being the core of one's being', etc. (Cf. GAMARRA, SATURNINO. *Teología...*, pp. 62-64.) This experience is irrespective of the age or background of the individual who went on to experience the fullness of Christ. (Cf. ALVAREZ, TOMÁS. "Crecimiento espiritual y dinámica del Espíritu Santo", *ViRel* - 56, 1984, p. 434.)

²¹² Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Unpublished Notes*, U. P. Comillas: Madrid, 2009-10, p. 106. "El discípulo reproduce la actitud filial de Jesús en su obediencia al Padre y ésta revela la presencia activa y operante del ser paterno de Dios, en que aparece

life.²¹³ Through Christ a concrete assimilation of the human person into the Divine takes place.²¹⁴ With sanctifying grace, a person is a new creature and experiences the indwelling of the Trinity.²¹⁵ The person is transformed and we can recognize a progressive union with God through concrete and deliberate acts.

The transformation of the person would be difficult to understand without the right understanding of the Trinitarian God.²¹⁶ Through our relationship with Christ we too are invited to share the Trinitarian life.²¹⁷ This participation is a grace which makes us truly relational beings who empty themselves totally in the adoration of God and service of our brothers and sisters.²¹⁸ Without the inhabitation of the Trinity which is a historical reality, we would be bereft of union with God and all our acts would be merely accidental.²¹⁹

‘Actual union (with God) is made possible for man by means of acts of the intellect and will, of charity and of faith which works by charity, insofar as man actually thinks of God and loves Him.’²²⁰ Though the primary initiative is that of God, union takes place through a harmonious integration of God’s grace and human co-operation. Imitation of Christ is not a reference to the fulfillment of material aspects, but in living

el Reino.”

²¹³ Cf. HAUSHERR, I. *La perfección...*, pp. 160-162. This transformation is a process – a progression. The Holy Spirit is the author and guide of the spiritual path and transforms, purifies and helps a person to love. (Cf. RUIZ SALVADOR, FEDERICO. *Caminos del Espiritu...*, p. 563.)

²¹⁴ Cf. RAHNER, KARL. “Jesus Christ – The Meaning of Life”, *TI* – 21, p. 7.

²¹⁵ Cf. GAMARRA, SATURNINO. *Teología...*, pp. 64-65. In explaining the indwelling of the Trinity ‘...*Es mucho más que la presencia de inmensidad (o) la presencia operativa de Dios ... Es necesaria la presencia intencional o la forma personal de presencia. Dios está en el justo como lo conocido en el cognoscente y lo amado en el amante. El conocimiento y el amor son los actos por los que dos seres personales se entregan recíprocamente. ... Pero hay algo más: la presencia cuasi formal. Si el justo conoce y ama a Dios ...es porque está siendo actuado, o cuasi-informado, por Dios mismo.*’

²¹⁶ Cf. GAMARRA, SATURNINO. *Teología...*, p. 57.

²¹⁷ Cf. *IBID.*, p. 59.

²¹⁸ The indwelling of the Trinity affects the anthropological dimension in the sense that it effects a new form of relationship. However it is important to remember that this does not mean a new faculty is created because such a faculty already exists in the human person. The human person becomes one’s true self in relationship with God and this reality goes beyond mere presence and affects the operational dimension of the person. (Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 64 – 65.) “*El ser humano llega a ser él mismo cuando participa de la relación con Dios, y desde este perspectiva es inteligible que se presenta la divinización del hombre como humanización.*”

²¹⁹ Cf. GAMARRA, SATURNINO. *Teología...*, p. 62.

²²⁰ DE GUIBERT, JOSEPH. *The Theology of the Spiritual Life*, (Tr. Barret, Paul), London: Sheed and Ward, 1956, p. 75.

the spiritual attitudes of the Lord in concrete ways.²²¹ The vocation of a person is nothing other than an imitation of Christ so as to reproduce in one's own life the image of the Son.²²²

Imitation of Christ and consequent participation in the Trinitarian life is the process by which a person takes on the form of Christ and in this manner becomes truly an authentic human person. The person realizes oneself and the process of realization could be called humanization. Speaking about the invitation to live a life 'in Christ' as understood within an existential and historical context, Saturnino Gamarra indicates that divinization could be understood as humanization.

¿Tiene sentido hoy plantearla, cuando parece ser que el problema actual es el de la humanización del hombre más que el de su divinización? ...La pregunta tiene como razón de ser que a la sospecha común se suma el comportamiento de los teólogos que sienten la necesidad de afirmar con énfasis que el ser humano llega a ser él mismo cuando participa de la relación con Dios, y desde esta perspectiva es inteligible que se presente la divinización del hombre como humanización.²²³

How do we go beyond a literal imitation of Christ and *assume* the form of Christ? A person assumes the form of Christ by participating in the mission of the Triune God²²⁴ and gradually understanding the mystery of Christ in the divine plan of salvation. This leads one to freely live a life in communion with the will of God and imitation is rooted in a profound experience of gratitude – an attitude characteristic of a 'new creature' who is reborn in the Holy Spirit.²²⁵ The person's identity is not lost or dissolved, but divinized in such a manner that a person 'no longer lives for oneself, but lives in Christ and Christ lives in him/her.' (*Gal. 2,20.*)

²²¹ IBID., p. 108. "De este modo, la imitación no recae en la reproducción de gestos materiales, sino que queda fundamentada en la adopción (conformación) de las actitudes espirituales del Señor, principalmente en el momento pascual, y en último término en el hecho de ser asimilado por el amor del Padre que se ha manifestado en él, y que Cristo nos ha revelado al entregarse."

²²² A Christian reproduces the image of Christ by progressively participating in the Risen Lord. (Cf. GAMARRA, SATURNINO. *Teología...*, p. 251.) Though grace actualizes the image, it also requires personal effort and fraternal support. (Cf. RUIZ SALVADOR, FEDERICO. *Caminos del Espiritu ...*, p. 554.)

²²³ GAMARRA, SATURNINO. *Teología...*, p. 65.

²²⁴ ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Unpublished...*, p.111. "Tomar sobre sí la forma de esclavo y los pecados de los hombres, sólo lo puede hacer Dios y en este sentido es inimitable. Pero el traspaso de la misión de Cristo al creyente, por medio de la forma del amor, sí puede convertir al creyente no sólo en tipos para la comunidad, sino su vida entera en ministerio de reconciliación."

²²⁵ Cf. GAMARRA, SATURNINO. *Teología...*, p. 69.

CONCLUSION

In this chapter an attempt has been made to present the humility of the Triune God as the key to understanding human transformation – a transformation which contains significant moments but is primarily an ongoing process. We have elaborated the humility of the Father, Son and the Holy Spirit and also briefly indicated the spiritual process of a person in order to better understand the being and transformative process. The contemplating of the humility of the Triune God helps a person realize his true being, leading to an intense desire to discard a false mode of existence for that which is authentic and meaningful. The deeper a person delves into the mystery of God's humility, the more a person begins to understand the paradox wherein humility leads to life as against pride which leads to death.

We encounter a moment of grace when a person, in a moment of truth experiences an ontological split that allows God to open his 'eyes of understanding'. This leads to a new form of existence within the human person who is now a 'new creature'. The dialectic of this new life is an interplay between an ongoing divine initiative which is gratuitous in nature and respects the freedom of the human person and a generous response on the part of the person. The authenticity of this experience is seen in the humble service for the sake of others and in this manner to progressively configure oneself into Christ – thus participating in the mystery of Trinitarian love.

The spiritual journey where one moves from self-love to self-emptying love is sustained in the measure that one remains rooted in the humble love of the Triune God. Such an experience has been historically repeated down the centuries and is found in a pronounced manner in the lives of various saints who desired to respond by totally emptying themselves for the sake of others. The Holy Spirit inspired these founders with distinct charisms who in turn shared it with other zealous persons.

The next section will move on to a concrete individual and his group who were transformed by the love of God and generously responded by a total offering of themselves. We are referring to Ignatius of Loyola and his first companions. We shall

focus on four important foundational experiences – two of them directly related to Ignatius of Loyola and the other two which pertain to the group of the first companions. The themes developed in the current section will be used to engage in a systematic study of four experiences related to Ignatius and the first companions. This study will be based on four concrete texts - the *Autobiography*, *Spiritual Diary*, *the Spiritual Exercises* and *the Deliberations of 1539*.

The study of these documents attempt to see the centrality and meaning of humility as manifest in these texts. We shall certainly make references to the humble love of a Triune God as revealed in Christ - the subject matter of this section. However our primary focus shall be on humility as lived by Ignatius and his companions. In analysing the experience of Ignatius and his companions we have tried to understand the centrality of humility in each of the experiences. We have also situated humility within the wider spiritual process of moving from self-love to self-emptying love.

SECTION TWO

HUMILITY IN THE FOUNDATIONAL EXPERIENCES OF THE SOCIETY OF JESUS

GENERAL INTRODUCTION TO THE SECOND SECTION

The first section has provided a brief overview of the Divine Kenosis in which we reflected on the love of the Triune God. This love has been revealed definitively in the humility of Jesus Christ. Christ's humility and total self-emptying indicates the very being of God's. Since a person is created in the image of God, he/she like Christ is also intrinsically oriented towards a life of humility and self-emptying love. However the reality of sin has warped the orientation of our desire leading it towards self-love and thus causing suffering and death.

The incompatibility of a life which is oriented towards self-love against our true being leads to an ontological split leading to a moment of truth when a person discovers one's true self through an encounter with God's unconditional and unlimited love. This experience leads to the emergence of a new way of life and the transformed person is a new being. The authenticity of this experience is seen in the attitude of humility which results in a new form of existence which is fundamentally relational. A person desires to respond by relating with the other in order to offer oneself as a self-gift. This desire takes historical shape in concrete choices (or elections) indicating the desire to generously respond to the gratuitous love.

The Society of Jesus founded by Ignatius¹ and his companions enshrines the dynamic experience which has been indicated above. The lives of Ignatius and his companions were re-oriented through a transformative encounter with God's love. Ignatius would be the first to undergo such an experience and in the course of time he would share his experience with others. He was the natural leader of this group and though the process of founding the Society was a collective experience, Ignatius would always remain the leader and mentor of the group. This section makes an effort to explain the the foundational experiences of the Society of Jesus and highlight the dimension of humility as a key element in these experiences.

¹ In future the Society of Jesus would be indicated by the word 'Society'. Similarly St. Ignatius of Loyola will be referred to as Ignatius.

We have chosen to interpret the understanding of the word 'foundational experiences' according to the actual texts available to us. In order to consider a text as a foundational text we have kept two factors in mind: a) that it pertained to Ignatius and the first group of companions who decided to found the Society of Jesus and b) it referred to an actual experience which was lived by them at an individual or collective level. In keeping with these criteria we have chosen the *Autobiography*, *The Spiritual Diary*, *The Spiritual Exercises* and *The Deliberations of 1539*. While there are other important texts related to the foundational phase of the Society, we believe that an indepth understanding of these texts will allow us to grasp the meaning of humility as envisaged by Ignatius and the first companions.

Based on the texts selected, the fourth chapter (*Autobiography*) elaborates the life of Ignatius and indicates how humility was fundamental in his spiritual process. The fifth chapter (*Spiritual Diary*) takes forward the personal process and shows how Ignatius was led to grow in humble love. The sixth contains a detailed analysis of the *Spiritual Exercises* – the fundamental transformative experience for all the early companions. The analysis will show how humility is a transversal theme within the Spiritual Exercise and offers a method of personal transformation whereby a person begins by experiencing genuine compunction for his self-love and moves on to a life of total and humble self-emptying love. The seventh chapter will deal with the *Deliberations* of the first companions and indicate how humility helped them to encounter the will of God at a collective level.

The centrality of humility in the spiritual process of Ignatius and the first companions would go on to be foundational for the nascent Society of Jesus and enlighten generations that would follow them down the centuries.

CHAPTER 4

HUMILITY IN THE *AUTOBIOGRAPHY* OF IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

The life of Ignatius of Loyola (1491-1556) is known to us through various sources. Most of these sources are secondary sources,¹ but we have one direct source which is called the *Autobiography*.² In this chapter we shall elaborate the understanding of humility as seen in the spiritual process of Ignatius. For this purpose we shall limit ourselves to the text of the *Autobiography* and through an analysis of the text look at the centrality of humility in the spiritual process of Ignatius. The life of Ignatius as indicated in the *Autobiography* will be divided into four parts and within each part we shall highlight three aspects – a) the actual humility of Ignatius which helped him to be open and move out of his narcissistic self-love, b) the experience of God’s love in humility and poverty and c) the response of Ignatius to that which had been experienced.

¹ Prominent among the initial sources are a letter by Diego Laynez in 1547 (*FN I*, pp. 70-145.), a summary by Juan Polanco in 1547/48 (*FN I*, pp. 151-256), exhortations by Jerome Nadal at Coimbra in 1561 (*FN II*, pp. 144-159.) and the official biography by Pedro Ribadeneyra in 1572 (*FN IV*).

² This refers to a verbal account of some of the events from the life of Ignatius as narrated to Fr. Gonçalves de Câmara during three periods: 4th August to September 1553; 9th March to 23rd March 1555 and finally on the 22nd September, 1555. The critical edition of this text can be found in *FN I*, pp. 364-507.

Ignatius was born into a noble family³ in the Basque region of Spain in 1491. The family was closely allied with the King of Castille from the beginning of the 13th century and was well known for its military exploits. Their military prowess had been the cause of their glory as well as their humiliation.⁴ The various privileges conferred by the kings over a period of more than 200 years led to economic prosperity for the Loyola family.⁵

The parents of Ignatius were Beltrán Ibáñez de Oñaz and Marina Sánchez de Licona and they were married on the 13th of July, 1467.⁶ They probably had 10 children,⁷ with Ignatius being the youngest.⁸ Since the eldest brother died fighting the French in Italy, the second son Martín García inherited the property and married Magdalena de Araoz in 1498. Three other brothers died in war with one of them believed to have died in Naples, another in the Americas and a third during a crusade while in Hungary. One of them Pero López became a cleric and was close to Ignatius.⁹

Around the year 1506-07 Ignatius was sent to Arévalo to the home of the royal

³ All the first biographers of St. Ignatius reiterate the point that Ignatius belonged to a noble family in Guipúzcoa. However J. Nadal, in his *Adhortationes Complutenses* (FN II, p. 185.) specifies that he belonged to one of the three important families. “*Fué, pues, así el principio. El P. Ignatio era de Loyola, de una de las 3 casas más principales que ay en Vizcaya...*”

⁴ They were famous for their contribution in various battles which included that of Beotibar in 1321, aiding King John I in his fight with Moors, the defense of Fuenterrabia and so on. In recognition of their services, the King had granted them various privileges. However on the other hand the internal clashes with *Gamboinos* and the wars with neighboring towns led them to receive a severe sentence from King Henry IV. They were humiliated by having their fortified castles pulled down and as a punishment Ignatius' great uncle and uncle were exiled to Andalucía.

⁵ Loyalty to the king led to economic gain. It is stated that in 1261 the house of Loyola had great holdings (FD, p.750) and in 1377 the Loyolas were given the right of 2000 *maravedis*. The patronage of the Church of San Sebastian de Soreasu was received by the Loyolas in 1394 and at the time of the marriage between the grand-niece of Ignatius and the son of the Duke of Gandía it was believed that the property of the house of Loyola was estimated to be more than 80,000 ducats with an annual rent of at least 10,000 ducats.

⁶ FD, p. 79. Beltrán died in 1507 and we do not know the exact date of Marina's death though it can be affirmed that she died before 1508.

⁷ Beltrán had at least two and possibly three illegitimate children. (Cf. GARCÍA-VILLOSLADA, RICARDO. *San Ignacio de Loyola – Nueva Biografía*, Madrid: BAC, 1986, p. 48.) “*Lo único que modernamente podemos rectificar es, que de los hijos uno parece espurio o extramatrimonial, y de las hijas, una y acaso dos.*”

⁸ DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. *Ignatius of Loyola – Founder of the Jesuits: His Life and Works*, Gujarat Sahitya Prakash: Anand, 1985, pp. 12-13.

⁹ Pero López was a cleric and had taken part in military campaigns. He took upon an ecclesiastical career with the idea of getting the benefits of the parish of Azpeitia. He was accused of being involved in serious crimes in 1515 and the murder of a priest, García López de Anchieta on the 15th of October, 1518. He journeyed to Rome on three occasions to safeguard his family's interest and died during his last return journey in 1529.

treasures, Juan Velázquez de Cuellar. He spent the next 11 years picking up the necessary skills of reading, writing and decent manners in order to build up a career in the court.¹⁰ Like a typical youth of his times he was fond of various entertainments which primarily included the use of arms and wooing the women of court.¹¹

With these introductory remarks of Ignatius let us now indicate the context of Ignatius during the years preceding his conversion. Ignatius was an ambitious person with an intense desire to make a mark for himself in the court. He hoped that a mentor like Juan would provide him the opportunity to fulfill his ambition.¹² However the decision of Juan to oppose the decision of the young King Charles V¹³ brought about his ruin and during the year 1517, Ignatius who actively participated in the resistance was to witness his fall and absolute disgrace.¹⁴ He shared the humiliation of his mentor and began to doubt his own dreams and ambitions.

Young Iñigo de Loyola had been a witness, step by step, of the gradual moral and economic crumbling of his noble protector. That fall was for him the first major experience and disillusionment which could not fail to have a lasting influence on his future career. The twenty-six-year-old courtier was then entering upon a new period of his life.¹⁵

¹⁰ DE LETURIA, PEDRO. *El Gentilhombre Iñigo López de Loyola*, Editorial Labor: Barcelona, 1941, p. 64. "Don Beltrán había recibido, según parece, entre 1504 y 1507 una invitación de su amigo de Castilla, Juan Velázquez de Cuéllar, Contador Mayor desde 1495 de los Reyes, para que le enviase uno de sus hijos: él lo tendría en su casa como propio, y lo colocaría luego con su favor en la Casa Real."

¹¹ FN – IV, p. 81. "Y comenzando ya a ser moço y a hervirle la sangre, movido del exemplo de sus hermanos, que eran varones esforçados, y él, que de suyo era brisco y de grande ánimo, dióse mucho a todos los ejercicios de armas, procurando de aventajarse sobre todos sus iguales, y de alcançar nombre de hombre valeroso, y honra y gloria militar."

¹² During this period, Juan Velázquez de Cuellar was at the height of his powers and the prospect of a promising career in the court seemed to be at Ignatius' beckoning. The proximity of the Royal Treasurer to the King and his wife, María de Velasco's intimate friendship with the Queen seemed to assure Ignatius of a life of power, wealth, fame and honour.

¹³ Juan Velázquez opposed the will of the young king Charles V who contrary to earlier privileges, desired to transfer the revenues of Arévalo and other Castilian towns for the maintenance of Germain de Foix, the second wife (and now widow) of Ferdinand V. Juan Velazquez refused to accept this decision and stood for the rights of Arévalo and other Castilian towns. The stand-off between the Royal Treasurer and the King ended in absolute disgrace for his Ignatius' mentor. His wife too shared the same fate with the Queen becoming her bitter enemy.

¹⁴ ITURRIOZ, JESÚS. "Años Juveniles de S. Ignacio en Arevalo (1506-1517)", *Ignacio de Loyola en Castilla*, Caja de Ahorros Popular de Valladolid y Provincia de Castilla de la Compañía de Jesús: Valladolid, 1989, p. 57. "Es obvio que en estos momentos difíciles para D. Juan, Iñigo, que contaba con 25 años, fuera muy activo en toda la estrategia."

¹⁵ DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. *Ignatius...*, p. 36.

The disgrace at Arévalo would be followed by another experience of disillusionment. He began to re-build his life with the help of María de Velasco¹⁶, and the Duke of Najera, Don Antonio Manrique de Lara.¹⁷ The kindness of María de Velasco allowed him to depart with 500 ducats and two horses. The Duke who was in need of men who could fight, received him well.¹⁸ In a short time he was to become an important member of the Duke's inner council aiding the duke in resolving sensitive matters.¹⁹ Though he did not belong to the upper echelons of society, he felt sufficiently confident to begin dreaming once again about a career in the court with its trappings of worldly power and glory.²⁰ However this ambition was cut short in a humiliating defeat at Pamplona and the fall from grace of his new mentor, the Duke of Najera.

4.1 THE INITIAL DESIRE TO BE HUMBLE AT LOYOLA

The first phase of Ignatius' life relates to his convalescence in Loyola. We shall begin with a few introductory remarks about the *Autobiography* as well two complementary documents. This will be followed by the general setting related to the first phase. After this background we shall move to the three points which form each stage – Ignatius' actual humility leading to greater openness, an experience of God's revealed in humility and finally the response of Ignatius to this experience.

The *Autobiography* contains a foreword by Jerome Nadal and a preface by

¹⁶ At the insistence of the Queen Germana de Foix, María de Velasco was thrown out of her own palace, had to abandon Arévalo and take refuge with the deranged queen Juana in Tordesillas.

¹⁷ The Loyolas enjoyed a good relationship with the Duke of Najera because he was the protector of the Oñacinos while the Constable of Castilla was the protector of the Gamboinos. Further on the Oñacinos supported the Beamonteses of Navarra who were traditionally supporters of the Castilian kings, while the Gamboinos supported the Agramonteses, who were supporters of the French-Navarrese kings. (Cf. GARCÍA-VILLOSLADA, RICARDO. *San Ignacio...*, p. 115.)

¹⁸ Cf. DE LETURIA, PEDRO. "Al Servicio del 'Rey Temporal'", *Ignacio de Loyola en Castilla...*, p. 76.

¹⁹ He was entrusted one of the important missions that consisted in bring peace between warring groups in Guipuzcoa. His loyalty and prowess in the use of arms too was on display when he took part in the battle of Najera in order to free it from the *Comuneros* and the battle for Salvatierra, Alava (this event is however disputed). (Cf. DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. *Ignatius...*, pp. 36-38.)

²⁰ It must be recalled that there existed an enmity between the Duke and the Constable of Castille, Iñigo Fernández de Velasco. However Cardinal Cisneros had thrown his lot with the Duke and hence things were in his favour as far as the power-equations were concerned. Aligning with the Duke hence improved the prospects of Ignatius. (Cf. DE LETURIA, PEDRO. *El Gentilhombre Iñigo López de Loyola...*, pp. 96-99.)

Gonçalves de Câmara.²¹ The period of dictation coincided with Nadal's efforts to promulgate the Constitutions throughout the Society and Câmara's efforts to overcome vainglory.²²

The *Autobiography* begins with Ignatius admitting that his character was flawed.²³ Though it begins with a historical date which is incorrect, it points towards the moral vice²⁴ of vainglory, a reality which would be present throughout his life.²⁵ As seen earlier, he attempted to resurrect his career once again by working for the Duke of Najera and was sent to defend Pamplona. His character was on display when he convinced the small group of soldiers to put up a defence against an overwhelming French force.²⁶ The foolhardiness would result in a humiliating and crushing defeat at the battle at Pamplona. A canon ball broke one leg and badly damaged the other and in a short time, the garrison surrendered to the French.²⁷ At Pamplona he would suffer the

²¹ RAMBLA BLANCH, JOSEP M^a. *El Peregrino – Autobiografía de San Ignacio de Loyola*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 1990, p. 144. “P. Luis Gonçalves de Câmara... nace hacia 1519 en Portugal (o quizá en la isla de Madeira); desde 1535 estudia algunos años en la Universidad de París; entra en la Compañía en Lisboa el 27 de abril de 1545. Reside en Roma, desde el 23 de mayo de 1553 hasta el 23 de octubre de 1555.”

²² Two points could be highlighted from these two texts. In the text of Nadal it could be suggested that Ignatius began to dictate events about his life once he saw that Nadal was indifferent to the entire matter. Câmara on the other hand wanted to deal with his vainglory and Ignatius used the opportunity to help him deal with his curiosity, his tardiness and his vanity. (Cf. BRUL, PETER DU. *Ignatius: Sharing the Pilgrim Story - A reading of the Autobiography of St. Ignatius of Loyola*, Gracewing: 2003, pp. 9-21.)

²³ Cf. MCMANAMON, JOHN M. *The Text and Contexts of Ignatius Loyola's "Autobiography"*, Fordham University Press: New York, 2013, p. 11

²⁴ Cf. BOYLE, MARJORIE O'ROURKE. *Loyola's Acts – The Rhetoric of the Self*, University of California Press: Berkeley, 1997, p. 22.

²⁵ The central element in this initial phase of the *Autobiography* is vainglory. McManamon while quoting the tradition of the Church indicates that a vainglorious person discerns poorly. Quoting Climacus he would highlight the intimate relationship between vainglory and pride. “John Climacus suggested the intimate relationship between vainglory and pride by comparing them to wheat and bread. Vainglory comprised the raw material from which pride took substance. Because vainglory made one self-righteous, it proved supremely divisive in any Christian community.” (Cf. MCMANAMON, JOHN M. *The Text and Contexts...*, p. 13.)

²⁶ Probably identifying with his father figure Beltran we see his character consisting in a combination of positive and negative traits. On display was his fidelity, loyalty, ability to trust others, chivalric behaviour, detachment and a sense of abandon. At the same time he was strongly self-centered, violent, impulsive, instinctual and lacked the ability to be attentive to reality. (Cf. MEISSNER, WILLIAM W. *Ignatius of Loyola – The Psychology of a Saint*, Yale University Press: London, 1992, pp. 3, 10, 12, 15-17, 21, 24, 38, 40-41.)

²⁷ It has generally been accepted that the artillery went on for a few hours and with Ignatius being injured, the others gave up. However this fact is disputed today with records showing that the bombing went on for three days and though Ignatius was injured on the 20th of May, the surrender of the garrison took place only on the 23rd or 24th. (Cf.

humiliation of a military defeat, be badly wounded in the leg and his pride shattered.

During the period of convalescence he heard that Pamplona had been recaptured and the old dreams and ambitions would emerge once again.²⁸ However news of the Duke's fall from grace once again blocked future possibilities.²⁹ The humiliation and uncertainty that loomed large had him with his back to the wall and there seemed to be no apparent opening. The despair in terms of a future life which he had planned for himself forced him to enter into a realm which he had so far neglected. He was led into a process of interiority and this moment of rupture would in turn become the first stepping stone for a long spiritual journey.

4.1.1 THE ACTUAL EXPERIENCE OF HUMILITY AND OPENNESS TO GOD

The *actual experience of humility* at Pamplona, prepared the ground for the initial desire to be humble. The defeat at Pamplona was a moment of humiliation. His vain desire to gain fame led to an erroneous reading of the situation and consequently affected his judgment.³⁰ (*Au 1²⁻³*) The decision to foolhardily engage in battle revealed to all his inexperience in matters of war. He was taken back to his castle of Loyola in a litter and not as a triumphant hero. (*Au 2²*) One who prided himself in his physical prowess was now dependent on others. The decision to be operated a second time in order to set right a protruding bone (*Au 4*) indicates the deep-rooted vainglory which characterized his character.³¹

FERNÁNDEZ, MARTÍN LUIS. "Rendición de la Fortaleza de Pamplona", *Ignacio de Loyola en Castilla...*, pp. 93-101.)

²⁸ The French commander laid siege to Logroño (at the insistence of the *Comuneros*) and this united all the warring groups. The Duke of Najera defeated the French in a battle that was fought on June 30th by which time Ignatius had overcome the critical period of his illness. (Cf. BRODRICK, JAMES. *St. Ignatius Loyola – The Pilgrim Years*, Burns & Oats: London, 1956, pp. 62-63.)

²⁹ The Duke of Najera was substituted by the Count of Miranda in August, 1521 and this was a severe blow for the followers of the Duke because they lost prestige and authority. (Cf. GARCÍA HERNÁN, ENRIQUE. *Ignacio de Loyola*, Taurus-Fundación Juan March: Madrid, 2013, p. 96.)

³⁰ At Pamplona his behavior was '*spurred by fantasies of invincibility that reflect underlying elements of grandiosity and omnipotence*'. (Cf. MEISSNER, WILLIAM W. *Ignatius of Loyola – The Psychology of a Saint...*, p. 41.)

³¹ The journey from Pamplona to Loyola and the subsequent period is a constant reminder of how deep rooted vainglory was in the life of Ignatius. If the desire for triumph in Pamplona is a representation of vainglory and its ruinous consequences, the pain of the operation reveals his quest for glory even in painful circumstances. There is a

During the period of convalescence he read two books: the *Life of Saints* and the *Life of Christ*. (*Au* 5³⁻⁴)³² They gently opened him to a whole new way of being.³³ Probably for the first time, his body, mind, imagination and desires were engaged in something different from the lifelong ambition to succeed in the court and make a name for himself.³⁴ The reading of the *Life of Christ* and the *Life of Saints* moved him so that he began to have desires to imitate and even exceed the saints in act of humility, austerities and penances.³⁵ In the alternating imaginations,³⁵ he found a qualitative difference between a life of power, pleasure and worldly glory as against a life of humility, poverty, austerity and penance. (*Au* 7¹ - 8⁵) He realized that

When he was thinking of those things of the world, he took much delight in them, but afterwards, when he was tired and put them aside, he found himself dry and dissatisfied. But when he thought of going to Jerusalem barefoot, and of eating nothing but plain vegetables and of practising all the other rigours that he saw in the saints, not only was he consoled when he had these thought but even after putting them aside he remained satisfied and joyful.³⁶

This openness indicated the first moment of an insight into the ways of God and the ways of the world.³⁷ At this stage, he was still centered³⁷ on himself and was oriented

spiritual transference of vainglory as displayed in Pamplona to his family castle. (Cf. BOYLE, MARJORIE O'ROURKE. *Loyola's Acts...*, pp. 26, 30-32.)

³² The *Life of Christ* was the *Vita Christi* composed in latin by the Carthusian Ludolph of Saxony and translated by the Franciscan poet Fray Ambrosio Montesino. The *Life of Saints* was the *Flos sanctorum* which was composed in latin by the italian dominican Jacobo de Varazze. Many Spanish translations existed and one of them had a prologue by the Cistercian monk Gauberto F. de Vagad. (Cf. GARCÍA-VILLOSLADA, RICARDO. *San Ignacio...*, pp. 158-61.)

³³ While it has been often indicated that the conversion of Ignatius took place at Pamplona, there are various authors who indicate that the process of conversion began at Loyola. We too are inclined towards the same because the rupture in his life whereby a new frame of reference enters his life took place at Loyola.

³⁴ The fidelity towards the king was now slowly shifting towards a fidelity towards God. However behind the façade of loyalty towards an outside object, it was still a fidelity towards himself. It was a response to his own ideal. This indicates that Ignatius was still primarily centered on himself. (Cf. MEISSNER, WILLIAM W. *Ignatius of Loyola ...*, p. 40)

³⁵ The fact that he allowed his imagination to imagine himself doing great feats like the saints indicated that he had slowly but gradually entered into a process of internalization. From being a mere spectator, he was now the protagonist of his imagination. (Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. *El Dios Emergente*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2001, p. 223.)

³⁶ *Au* 8,¹⁻³.

³⁷ It would be presumptuous to call him an expert in discernment of spirits at this stage. His experience of different affective states was not even a principle means of discernment within the Christian tradition. At best it could be called the first babbling words of a child who is slowly discovering a new language of communication. (Cf. BOYLE, MARJORIE O'ROURKE. *Loyola's Acts...*, p. 38.)

towards self-love.³⁸ All that he had discovered was that in imitating the humility, poverty and austerities of the saints gave him greater satisfaction. Initiation into the realm of humility at this stage would be primarily motivated by self-love and a desire to superficially imitate the great saints of the Church.

His focus remains on exterior deeds: what he can do to impress a lady of standing or surpass Francis and Dominic. His focus as O'Rourke Boyle observes, remains on himself especially now that he is physically lame and ethically immature. ..Ignatius's moral impairment blinds his judgment; he ponders doing the impossible. When he transfers his bravado from a chivalric to an ascetic context, his zeal for the spectacular is no less pronounced.³⁹

4.1.2 THE HUMILITY OF GOD

He will not cry out, not shout, nor make his voice heard in the street.

(Is. 42,2)

The above mentioned quote from the Song of the suffering servant encapsulates the humility of God who had been constantly knocking at the door of Ignatius' heart. (*Rev.* 3,20) In the divine human-interplay, we find *the humility of God* in God's patience, respect and sensitivity to the personal process of Ignatius. The process of Ignatius' conversion from a life that was motivated by the desire for worldly glory and power towards a life of humility and service would be a slow and long process.⁴⁰ The preparation for this initial phase would take a long time and it would require a lot of patience for the young man in Arévalo to even begin contemplating an alternative worldview.⁴¹

³⁸ IBID. '...Ignatius of Loyola has not yet experienced a true conversion of interior disposition. He is merely exchanging one set of appearances and allegiances for another. Whether in arms or in asceticism, his values remain agonistic. His object is to be observed and praised for excellence: vainglory.'

³⁹ MCMANAMON, JOHN M. *The Text and Contexts...*, p. 19.

⁴⁰ The process of growing in virtue is a life-long process. The most difficult of all vices is that of vainglory. The antidote for this is in the form of humility, contrition and tears by which the person substitutes the love of self with love for God. (Cf. IBID., pp. 14-15.)

⁴¹ It can be said that there was a prior preparation for the first serious moment of rupture in Loyola. In 1515, he was charged with a serious crime (*FD*, pp. 237-38). Later on a foul smell from his nose made people avoid him and it took some time for him to be healed. (Cf. BRODRICK, JAMES. *St. Ignatius...*, pp. 47-48.) Another important moment when his pride would be hurt was in 1519 when he would have to ask the King permission to carry arms to protect himself. (Cf. GARCÍA HERNÁN, ENRIQUE. *Ignacio de Loyola...*, p. 78.)

God gently and patiently tried to make Ignatius see the fleeting nature of riches, power and worldly glory through important incidents during this phase of his life. The first of them would be in the fall of his mentor Juan Velazquez de Cuellar.⁴² This incident though denting Ignatius' confidence on the way of life he had envisaged for himself was not sufficient to turn him towards God. This invitation would still fall on deaf ears and God would have to humbly wait for some more time before Ignatius who desired to model himself on Amadais de Gaul would definitively open himself towards the Divine.

The second moment would be the defeat at Pamplona and the initial period at Loyola. Though he hovered between life and death, God was kept at a distance. He loved his physical attributes and was willing to go to extremes to maintain his external appearance. The near death experiences did not stop him from imagining and day-dreaming about a life of worldly power and glory. (*Au 3¹⁻⁵*) During these moments, God waited patiently and continued to invite him towards a new form of existence.

The preceding experiences had prepared the ground for a more definitive relationship between God and Ignatius. A critical moment of rupture would take place in a gentle manner during the period that he read the books which were offered to him. The books would lead to a different set of imaginations and desires through which God would once again humbly invite Ignatius to a new way of life. God had been waiting on the side-lines and it was only when Ignatius allowed God to enter his life that God began to internally move him and open his eyes of understanding.⁴³ The humility of God would not allow God to engage in any form of force or manipulation. Only when he was tired of his imaginations related to the world, would the Lord gently invite him to

⁴² Summing up the period of Arévalo, Villoslada would say '*Una etapa importantísima de la carrera de Iñigo se ha cerrado bruscamente con aire de tragedia. Montado en uno de sus caballos parte de Arévalo en los últimos días del verano o primeros del otoño en 1517... Atrás quedan sus ilusiones juveniles rotas, sus esperanzas cortesana casi desvanecidas...*' (GARCÍA-VILLOSLADA, RICARDO. *San Ignacio...*, p. 108.)

⁴³ In the Spiritual Exercises there is a meditation called the Two Standards. It provides us an excellent insight into the machinations of the evil spirit as well as the ways of God. In this meditation we are made aware of the universal nature of the evil enterprise where 'every person' is trapped by using specific methods. Similarly we are also made aware of the universal nature of God's salvific plan where once again 'every person' is invited by the Lord in a manner which in keeping with the uniqueness of the person. (*SpEx 137, 141,145*)

something different.

The humility of the Lord is also manifested in the fact that God respected his codes and world-view. At this stage the Lord's invitation to him is not starkly presented as a contrast between good and bad with moralistic overtones. During this phase when his 'eyes were opened a little', (*Au 8⁴*) he was not made to experience his project, codes, desires, etc. as being totally bad. Rather the apparent good of his project was gently placed in contrast against what was truly good, beautiful and desirable.⁴⁴ Instead of desiring that Ignatius came on his knees to a God who was seated on a high throne, we find that God 'descended' to meet Ignatius in the existential situation that he found himself. The loss of narcissistic grandiosity and omnipotence opened Ignatius to God's invitation.⁴⁵ This was a moment when a process of mutation had begun – one in a long series of other moments all through his life.⁴⁶

As we reflect on a significant moment in the life of Ignatius, we can safely assume that the Lord was constantly inviting Ignatius to a new life through various other means. By the time Ignatius had made the choice to leave his home he was 30 years old. It was a period by which time most people of his age would have made a definitive choice regarding their lives. However for Ignatius it was the beginning of a new life. The Lord

⁴⁴ During this time Ignatius began to discern in a very primitive manner. From a primarily physical and instinctual reaction to the events of his life, he began to read and allowed the text to influence him. This was an activity which took him out of his world-view. This was followed by a process of thinking and getting in touch with his feeling. Though at a basic level and in a crude manner, these small steps form the primary phase of a lifelong process of interiorization and reflection. The oscillation of thoughts and corresponding moods that he refers to in no. 8 of the *Autobiography*, are not merely psychological states but are also ontological in character. Ignatius realized that he was not the absolute master of all his thoughts, inspirations and internal motions. 'There is something – someone – behind them.' (Cf. BRUL, PETER DU. *Ignatius: Sharing the Pilgrim Story...*, p. 28.)

⁴⁵ Meissner would indicate that prior to this moment of conversion there was a conflict which took place both the conscious as well as the unconscious level. This would be a lifelong process because authentic religious conversion is a long and painful process. Though his false invincible image was seriously dented, he still needed to experience conversion in many other realms. As he lay in bed the 'old person' in Ignatius was still very active in looking for substitutes for his ideals, ambitions and values. (Cf. MEISSNER, WILLIAM W. *Ignatius of Loyola ...*, pp. 52, 55.)

⁴⁶ Was this a moment of conversion or mutation? If we consider conversion as the final moment of spiritual mutation it can definitively said that this was the beginning of a mutation. The definitive moment of conversion would take place at Manresa. However there is another position which says that Ignatius did not need a conversion because he was already a practicing Christian. What he did experience was a mutation – an internal transformation. (Cf. GARCÍA HERNÁN, ENRIQUE. *Ignacio de Loyola...*, p. 111.)

who had been humbly and patiently waiting for Ignatius to listen to the invitation which had been present from the very beginning would slowly, gently and when necessary, firmly guide Ignatius in emptying himself so that he would go on to become a more fit instrument for God.

4.1.3 THE CONSEQUENCES

The consequence of God's humility manifest in God's gentle and patient invitation led to a radical change of life at an external level. The external manifestation was seen specifically in activities such as continued reading, conversation, writing and praying.⁴⁷ (*Au 11¹⁻⁷*) We observed an important shift in Ignatius who moved out of an existence which was entrenched within narcissistic self-love and entered into a new existence which was relational.

He began to spend time conversing with others members of the household because he believed that it 'benefited their souls.' (*Au 11¹*)

Ignatius's discovery of his existence as a battlefield of opposing spirits led him to a deeper integration of his ...life. The discovery continued to expand beyond himself into his relationships with others. He did not just bide his time during the last phase of his convalescence, but he wanted to share what he had been given.⁴⁸

He also spent time writing 'the essential things from the life of Christ and the saints.' (*Au 11³*) He had been trained for a life in the court and his handwriting was very good. He now spent his time writing down those passages which gave him consolation on sheets of paper.⁴⁹ While the two specific activities mentioned above are indicative of an internal change, it would be naive to believe that this reflected a totally different

⁴⁷ He had already been engaged in reading and praying. To this is added the activity of conversation and writing. Both these activities have an apostolic purpose and are indicative of his future life. The intention of Ignatius is noble, but given the fact that he is still at an infantile stage, these activities lack substance. (Cf. MCMANAMON, JOHN M. *The Text and Contexts...*, p. 20.)

⁴⁸ BRUL, PETER DU. *Ignatius: Sharing the Pilgrim Story...*, p. 30. The period in Loyola is a time when he began to engage in a domestic apostolate. With the passage of time it would take larger dimensions. (Cf. IBID., p. 31.)

⁴⁹ He indicates that the words of Christ were in red color and those of Our Lady and the saints in blue. It must be commented that in the *Vita Christi*, the texts that related to the Bible were in red, and the other texts were blue in colour. (Cf. GARCÍA MATEO, ROGELIO. *Ignacio de Loyola – Su espiritualidad y su mundo cultural*, Ediciones Mensajero: Bilbao, 2000, pp. 52-54.)

frame of reference. There was now an oscillation of projects between wanting to go on a pilgrimage and join the Carthusian monastery or live all his life as a hermit.⁵⁰ (*Au* 12¹⁻²) Despite these noble desires it must be pointed out that in his core, Ignatius was basically the same person – vain, ambitious, proud and courageous.⁵¹

An important decision would be to leave his home and embark on a new way of life.⁵² He would substitute his desire to serve the temporal king by a desire to serve the eternal King.⁵³ The decision to leave home meant giving up all claims of property, money or material benefits of the kind.⁵⁴ It also meant giving up on his ambition to proceed with a career in the court. However having been touched to a certain degree at the affective level, Ignatius left the portals of his house in March, 1522.⁵⁵ It would 1526 before his family would know of him again.

In the phase that has been elaborated, we can observe a definitive rupture with the past. There is no doubt that there were various historical factors which precipitated this process. God who had been constantly inviting Ignatius finally could open his eyes of understanding when Ignatius demonstrated some degree of openness. He had been so full of self-love that the openness did not emerge until the old frame of life was placed against something different. The ability to reflect on his experience allowed him to shift

⁵⁰ Cf. BRUL, PETER DU. *Ignatius: Sharing the Pilgrim Story...*, p. 32.

⁵¹ Cf. MEISSNER, WILLIAM W. *Ignatius of Loyola ...*, p. 60. 'Since he was born and raised in an atmosphere of deep religious belief and a profoundly Catholic culture in which the saints are revered as great heroes of God, Iñigo fantasied himself doing similar deeds. But his mind was still in conflict over these contending ideals – the romantic-heroic and the spiritual – along with their corresponding values, beliefs, and codes of conduct.'

⁵² He was still not familiar in matters related to spiritual life and desired to keep the entire matter a secret. This is not explicitated in the *Autobiography*, but it is affirmed by Lainez and Polanco. (*FN – I*, p. 74.) "...y así, sin otro maestro exterior, ni comunicar su deliberación a otros, se determinó, con pretexto de ir a la corte del Duque de Nájera, de salirse de su casa y totalmente renunciar su tierra y los suyos y a su mismo cuerpo, y entrar en la vía de la penitencia."

⁵³ Though he desired to imitate the *Holy Knights* (saints), the personal code which dictated his way of life continued to be that of the knights from books such as *Amadís*. Only after the 18th number in the *Autobiography* will we see a paradigm shift in his mode of existence. (Cf. GARCÍA MATEO, ROGELIO. *Ignacio de Loyola ...*, pp. 36-37.)

⁵⁴ 'His brother took him from room to room...' (*Au*, 12⁷⁻⁸) The scene has echoes of Jesus' temptations. The elder brother is cast in a diabolical mold and Ignatius who is about to begin on a different way of life is put to the test. (Cf. BOYLE, MARJORIE O'ROURKE. *Loyola's Acts...*, p. 52.)

⁵⁵ We see that the internal process of Ignatius has proceeded from remaining at an imaginative level towards becoming a historical reality. However the process still refers to his own freedom and desire. God still hasn't taken center stage. Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. *El Dios Emergente...*, p. 235).

his desire from something other than that which had obsessed him all his life. God patiently and humbly waited for this moment and when Ignatius laid aside a bit of his pride and was able to have a glimpse of the redemptive value of humility, God lovingly obliged and indicated to him a new path which would lead him to a new life.

4.2 TRANSFORMATION TOWARDS A LIFE OF POVERTY AND HUMILITY IN MANRESA

The period spent in Manresa reveals a double itinerary in the life of Ignatius – an external itinerary, but more importantly an internal itinerary.⁵⁶ While he would be able to set the pace for the external itinerary, God would set the pace for the internal itinerary and through it transform his existence. The external itinerary consisted in the change of cloak,⁵⁷ the two moments of his stay in Manresa,⁵⁸ the various activities in terms of his penances, conversations with various persons, participation in liturgical celebrations, begging, search for accommodation and so on. (*Au 19-37*)⁵⁹ Tellechea provides a good summary of Ignatius' regular activities.

Every day he begged for alms. He ate no meat and drank no wine, even when it was offered. But he did not fast on Sundays and if he was offered a little wine on that day, he would drink it. Each day he attended High Mass, during which time he would read the Passion; in the evening, he would attend sung vespers and compline, which he loved dearly because of the music. Despite the many places where he could have passed the night, he spent hours in prayer either at the hermitage of Our Lady of Viladordis, the Dominican Church, the hospital chapel, or in a nearby cave that he had discovered. He

⁵⁶ Cf. RODRÍGUEZ OLAIZOLA, JOSÉ M^a. *Ignacio de Loyola - Nunca Solo*, San Pablo: Madrid, 2006, p. 59.

⁵⁷ The change of attire is an important event and Ignatius takes great pain in order to explain this process. He speaks about its purchase, how he took it along with him and finally how he put it on, discarding his earlier knightly attire. (Cf. *Au 16⁴⁻⁵, 17³⁻⁵, 18¹⁻²*)

⁵⁸ There is no doubt that the period from the end of March, 1522 to the end of February, 1523 consisted in what is popularly known as the 'sojourn at Manresa.' The chronological sequence of events leads to two possible theories. The first one which follows the *Autobiography*, Ribadeneira and other sources claims that Ignatius descended to Manresa on the 25th of March and remained there until his departure for Barcelona. However there are others which base themselves on Fr. Araoz and other early sources that Ignatius went down to Manresa, but then returned to Montserrat and lived the life of a hermit. After becoming well-versed in the methodical form of prayer he returned to Manresa and from there he proceeded to Barcelona. (Cf. *EI – I*, pp. 147-148.)

⁵⁹ This is the third chapter in the English version of the *Autobiography* (Tr. Parmananda Divarkar) and the external elements are highlighted. However since our focus is limited to dimension of humility within the spiritual process, our interest is primarily in analyzing the internal itinerary. For the moment it will suffice to say that during his sojourn at Manresa Ignatius was known as the 'man with the sack' or 'the holy man.' According to Juan Pascual, within a short time of his stay in Manresa Ignatius was revered as a saint. (*FN – III*, p. 189.)

would also spend time praying before the roadside crosses and would stop to pray wherever the Angelus bell rang. He relied on his Book of Hours and his rosary, as well as vocal prayers, for the source of some of his prayer. He visited the hospitals where he bathed the sick. He confessed and went to Holy Communion weekly. As far as his body was concerned, he punished it with the discipline and hairshirt, but otherwise paid no attention absolutely to its needs.⁶⁰

While these external factors were important in his spiritual process, the internal process was far more critical and consisted in three periods. The first period of nearly four months mainly consisted in consolations. Within a short time of Ignatius' arrival in Manresa, the people looked upon him as a saint.⁶¹ During this period he remained in this state of 'steady joy.' (*Au 20*) The second period began after nearly four months when the first doubts emerged. It had to do with a beautiful image of a creature with many eyes as well as a temptation about whether he would be able to continue living this way of life.⁶² He responded to it firmly and put it away. However oscillations between consolations and desolations was followed by a prolonged period of scruples from his past life which caused him great distress. He was 'convinced that the scruples did him much harm' (*Au 22*), but he could not bring himself to overcome them. The third period consisted in a point of desperation caused by his desolations and the subsequent illuminations. Outwardly he was being venerated as a saint, but inwardly he was going through a period of scruples, desolation and aridity.⁶³ He was getting desperate and reached a point where he contemplated taking his own life many a times by 'throwing himself through a large hole in the room.' (*Au 23*)⁶⁴

⁶⁰ TELLECHEA IDÍGORAS, JOSÉ IGNACIO. *Ignatius of Loyola – The Pilgrim Saint*, (Tr. Buckley, Cornelius Michael), Loyola Press: Chicago, 1994, pp. 183-84.

⁶¹ We have the testimony of Juan Pascual, the foster son of Ines Pascual who narrated how his foster mother encountered Ignatius as he came down from Montserrat. He remembers that his mother and her friends were impressed by the penances of Ignatius. (Cf. GARCÍA-VILLOSLADA, RICARDO. *San Ignacio...*, pp. 205-207.)

⁶² Though the autobiography speaks of one temptation vis-à-vis his perseverance upto the age of 'seventy years' (*Au 20*²), earlier biographers speak of two temptations – the regret for having given away his clothes when he felt cold, and the temptation of the 'seventy years.' (Cf. *FN – I*, pp. 78, 160.)

⁶³ This phase is presented by Gerald Coleman as a phase with four temptations: the temptation of seventy years, the comment by the old woman, the temptation of the scruples and the final temptation to commit suicide. The fluctuating experiences makes him wonder as to, 'what new life is this that we are now beginning?' (*Au 21*³)

⁶⁴ After the first moment in Loyola when Ignatius got out of himself and looked up towards a new horizon, he had returned to a self-centered perspective. His feats were all useless and his desire to conquer God was a total failure. He

Ignatius tried to achieve consolation by imitating a 'saint who went without eating many days.' (*Au 24*)⁶⁵ After a week, Ignatius informed his confessor on Sunday who ordered him to immediately break the fast.⁶⁶ The temporary freedom from scruples did not last long and once again he began to remember his sins (*Au 25*) leading to a disgust for his life with a strong desire to give up the life he was leading.⁶⁷ It was at this moment that 'the Lord deigned that he awake as from sleep' (*Au 25*) and liberate him from the profound desolation that he had been experiencing.⁶⁸ This would be the defining moment of his life and we shall proceed to analyze this enlightenment and freedom in the subsequent three points.

4.2.1 THE ACTUAL EXPERIENCE OF HUMILITY AND OPENNESS TO GOD

The moments of *actual humility* in the experience of Ignatius could be divided into three stages. The first stage began as Ignatius commenced on his journey to Montserrat.⁶⁹ He was sure of what he desired to do regarding the future course of his life. He had it all worked out and did not require the advice of any other person. He was still blind to the ways of the Spirit and ignorant in matters of spiritual life.⁷⁰ This would come to the fore

was caught up within himself and going around in circles. This led to constantly ruminated over his sins and scruples. (Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. *El Dios Emergente...*, pp. 237, 239.)

⁶⁵ This was probably St. Andrew the Apostle or St. Paul the Hermit. St. Andrew bargained with God for an elderly man named Nicholas who had been living in sin. After five days of fasting, an angel told him that Nicholas had been pardoned. (Cf. COLEMAN, GERALD. *Walking With Inigo – A Commentary on the Autobiography of St. Ignatius*, Gujarat Sahitya Prakash: Anand, 2007, p. 55.)

⁶⁶ In this process the ego ideal was being broken down and re-constructed. This struggle is interpreted as an intense experience where unconscious forces are at work. A destructive and punitive super-ego trying with its regressional and instinctual impulses is trying to attack the ego. The external aggression which is now under check because of the aura of being a saint has been turned inwards. (Cf. MEISSNER, WILLIAM W. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, pp. 72-77.)

⁶⁷ We find here a repeat of the temptation which is seen in *Au. 20*, where he is tempted to give up this new way of life. The argument is that it would not be possible to live in such a manner until the age of 70. He has now been tempted in a similar fashion but with a difference. While the temptation in *Au. 20*² is direct, the temptation in *Au. 25*⁶ is extremely subtle and dangerous.

⁶⁸ The realization that he had to get out of himself and situate himself before God and the world would lead to a new awakening. The freedom from his torments would come when he would passively open himself to experience the gratuitous loving mercy of God. (Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. *El Dios Emergente...*, p. 239.)

⁶⁹ The distance he travelled alone was as follows: Navarrete to Logroño (11 kms), Logroño to Zaragoza (174 kms), Zaragoza to Lérida (140 kms), Lérida to Igualda (90 kms). A total of nearly 415 kms was covered during a period of about 18 days.

⁷⁰ In the *Autobiography* Ignatius reveals his ignorance about spiritual matters. He admits that 'he was still blind' (*Au*

during his encounter with the Moor where he would be unsure of himself and incapable of taking a decision.⁷¹ Though the period of convalescence had allowed him to behave less instinctually and he was able to restrain himself, the intensity of his internal conflict cannot be underestimated.⁷² During this encounter Ignatius would experience a double humiliation. On the one hand he would be incapable of taking a decision and had to leave the matter to the mule. On the other hand, he would go away with the feeling that he failed to defend the honor of the Blessed Virgin.

However despite this double humiliation, we do not find any rancor or regrets for having been humble. He moved on to Montserrat and exchanged his sword and garments for a pilgrim's staff and robe.⁷³ Despite this external change, we still find the same self-assured Ignatius who did not want any advice from his confessor and merely wanted to supersede the saints of the Church. Once again he would have to face three kinds of humiliations. He planned to continue immediately to the Holy Land as an anonymous person. However his anonymity would not be maintained and circumstances forced him to stay on for nearly a year.⁷⁴ His act of charity of giving his robe to a beggar was misunderstood. Instead of having people talk about his generosity

14¹) and his desire was not motivated by a fleeting desire to please and gratify God. One gets the impression of an infant who does not do something from conviction, but in order to please the parents. He acknowledges his ignorance when he says that in his transformed behavior he was '*not looking to any interior thing, nor knowing what humility was or charity or patience; or the discretion that regulates and measures these virtues.*' (Au 14⁴). His entire focus was on '*external works because the saints had done so...*' (Au 14⁵)

⁷¹ The encounter with the Moor is an important moment where for the first time we see how Ignatius is no longer the master of his own will, but allows himself to be led.

⁷² This episode of Ignatius' conflict with the Moor is in fact a reflection of an internal conflict within Ignatius himself. Meissner sees this episode as reflecting the Oedipal struggle within Ignatius. '*The Moor had cast aspersions on the virginity of the idealized Mother, who had become the sublimated vessel for Iñigo's repressed and conflicted libidinal impulses...The oedipal struggle is cast against repressed incestuous wishes that are projected onto the Moor, who can then be effectively punished and destroyed as the bearer of such dangerous sentiments.*' Meissner concluded by saying that Ignatius' repressed sexual desires '*remained a vital force in his psychic economy and a source of continuing conflict.*' (Cf. MEISSNER, WILLIAM W. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 62.)

⁷³ Though the process of emptying would be a gradual process, offering his sword in Montserrat was an important moment of self-emptying. The sword symbolized an entire world for him and when he gave up the sword he expressed a desire to give up a world which gave him meaning and fulfilment. Slowly he would realize that to the degree that he progressed in emptying himself, his life would be filled by that which was true, beautiful and eternal.

⁷⁴ Ignatius indicates that he desired anonymity during this period. To construe this apparent desire as a rejection of glory would be a naive interpretation because an avowed proclamation of rejecting glory could actually be a subtle path to seeking glory. (Cf. MCMANAMON, JOHN M. *The Text and Contexts...*, p. 26.)

and acclaiming him as a new Francis of Assisi or Martin of Tours, the focus shifted on to the beggar who was accused falsely.⁷⁵ He realized that he still had to learn a great deal about prayer and due to this he would go back to the mountains of Montserrat.⁷⁶ He would humbly realize that mere external imitation of the hermits and saints of the past was not enough. There would be a great deal about internal matters that would have to be learnt through experience in order to progress in the new life he desired to live.⁷⁷

The third period would provide him a definitive experience of humility. During this period we see humility in its physical, relational and spiritual dimensions. We see humility in its physical form with Ignatius disregarding his physical appearance. He lived an austere life, went begging and depended on the charity of others. (*Au 19¹⁻³*) We also see humility in its relational dimension with his constant dependence on others for advice. His well laid out plans were backfiring⁷⁸ and circumstances forced him to approach other person for assistance. On four different occasions he approached different persons for assistance.

First he confessed his sins again, but found no satisfaction. He sought out spiritual persons who could advise him on his scruples, but found no help. Finally a 'doctor', a university graduate at the cathedral, told him one day in confession to write down every sin he could remember. Ignatius did that, but the scruples returned in an even subtler

⁷⁵ Unlike the usual tunic with a red cross which was typical of a pilgrim, he designed a special garment of sackcloth. This would make him stand out from other pilgrims. He did call himself a 'pilgrim' for the first time during this period, but he was '*a vainglorious pilgrim.*' (Cf. *IBID.*) The data about his cloak makes one suspect the 'tears of compassion' too. While the *Autobiography* presents it as tears of 'compassion' we are more inclined to believe that those were tears of compassion as well as the desire to imitate the saints and heroes of the past. Hagiography, medieval literature and story of great heroes showed them as persons who weep. He was now moving towards a greater degree of identification with what he fantasized during his convalescence in Loyola. At that time only his imagination and fantasies were identifying with the saints and heroes he desired to emulate. Now there is an identification at a corporal level where his emotional responses is similar to the saints and heroes. However from this form of emotional identification to presume a radical conversion would be an unrealistic interpretation. (Cf. BOYLE, MARJORIE O'ROURKE. *Loyola's Acts...*, p. 63.)

⁷⁶ It can be presumed that when he was certain about the departure of Pope Adrian VI and his entourage, he returned to the mountain of Montserrat in order to learn methodical prayer from the hermits and monks, many of whom followed Abbot Cisneros Compendium of the *Ejercitatorio Espiritual*.

⁷⁷ Cf. TELLECHEA IDÍGORAS, JOSÉ IGNACIO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, pp. 160-61.

⁷⁸ From the very onset we see that Ignatius' well laid out plans came undone and were backfiring. '*He was surprised that he had been recognized; surprised at the contrary effect that his generosity had on the life of the beggar; surprised at the tears that came to his eyes; surprised in retrospect at the ironic and humorous consequences of his slavish imitation of the saints...*' (Cf. BRUL, PETER DU. *Ignatius: Sharing the Pilgrim Story...*, p. 40.)

way. He thought that the ultimate remedy might be obedience: he would ask his confessor to command him... The confessor did order him not to concern himself further with any one of his past sins, unless it was a matter of something clear. But since everything appeared very clear to him, he drew no profit.⁷⁹

The humiliation for Ignatius would be more intense because all of them failed in liberating him from the vicious circle of self-love.⁸⁰ This would lead to a regressive attitude of going back to personal efforts. The abject failure of his vainglorious effort⁸¹ would lead him to the third and most important experience of humility.

Ignatius would try to 'manipulate' God by engaging in various acts so that God would be related to him on his own terms. The result would be the experience of a deep ontological split with terrible consequences. Ignatius almost lost his life in the effort.⁸² He went through a terrible experience of desolation and scruples with an inability to break out of the impasse.⁸³ The extent of his frustration and humiliation can be seen in

⁷⁹ IBID., p. 52.

⁸⁰ We see an oscillating movement within Ignatius with an attempt to open himself towards others. However the underlying self-love was still strong and he was unable to definitively break out of the vicious circle. After the four efforts by others to help him, he engaged in four personal efforts and failed in that endeavor as well. Ignatius was up a blank wall with all his efforts and the apparent efforts of others coming to naught. (Cf. IBID., pp. 52-53.)

⁸¹ The repeated use of the pronoun 'he' in the *Autobiography* indicates how the focus was exaggeratedly on himself. It could be said that Ignatius deliberately narrated this in detail in order to emphasize the failure of his personal efforts – efforts that were undertaken directly or indirectly. In order to clarify this point we shall quote from the Spanish text showing the repeated use of the pronoun 'él' which is explicitly mentioned or implied by the verbal conjugation.

- (no. 19) *Él* demandaba limosna cada día. - no *comía* carne, ni *bebía* vino... - *se determinó* dejarlo andar así (el cabello), según su naturaleza, sin peinarlo ni cortarlo, ni cubrirlo...
- (no. 21)...*perseveraba* siempre en sus sólitos confesiones y comuniones cada domingo.
- (no. 22) *empiezo* a buscar algunos hombres espirituales que le remediasen destos escrúpulos...
- (no. 23)...*él* tenía todas aquellas cosas por muy claras – *perseveraba* en sus siete horas de oración de rodillas, *levantándose* a media noche continuamente – no *hallaba* ningún remedio para sus escrúpulos – *se puso* en oración, con el fervor de la cual *comenzó a dar gritos* a Dios vocalmente...
- (no. 24)...*se determinó* de hacerlo, diciendo consigo mismo que ni comería ni bebería...
- (no. 25)...*perseveró* sin meter en la boca ninguna cosa, *no dejando de hacer* los sólitos ejercicios, aun de *ir* a los oficios divinos, y de *hacer* su oración de rodillas, aun a media noche, etc.

⁸² So far the nature of Ignatius's spirituality is rather infantile because he primarily engaged in a literal '...mimicry of the appearance of the ancient ascetics...'. He was learning the true meaning of spirituality through a painful experience. (Cf. BOYLE, MARJORIE O'ROURKE. *Loyola's Acts...*, p. 70.) He believed that a change of clothes, consulting other persons and imitating activities as narrated in the lives of saints was fundamental. At Manresa he realized that fundamental change consisted in an internal transformation – a radical change of one's inner self.

⁸³ Ignatius finds himself crippled internally and we find a similarity between his experience at Pamplona and Manresa. Like Pamplona, he desired to climb the heights of spiritual glory, but is wounded and becomes a cripple. His desire was primarily motivated by vainglory with an exaggerated focus on externals. (Cf. MCMANAMON, JOHN M. *The Text*

the fact that he had recurrent desires to end his life. (*Au 24¹*) St. John of the Cross in the *Dark Night of the Soul*, speaks of an experience which is similar to what was experienced by Ignatius.

...the darkness of the spiritual part is by far the greater, even as darkness is a greater obscurity than that of night. For, however dark a night may be, ...there still remains some light, for the understanding and reason remain, and are not blinded. But the spiritual night, which is faith, deprives the soul of everything, both as to understanding and as to sense.⁸⁴

The humiliation only made him more stubborn. As a last recourse he decided to undertake a fast until his desires were fulfilled.⁸⁵ This experiment was also a failure. He would temporarily find relief on obeying his confessor who ordered him to break the fast.⁸⁶ However within a few days his focus went back to himself and he began to remember his sinfulness and the thoughts of his past began to emerge.⁸⁷ The humiliation of once again entering into a vicious circle was frustrating. He could not proceed further and thought of giving up. This desire to surrender was the point of abject humiliation where the once proud gallant knight who desired to impress God capitulated and accepted defeat. This moment of defeat however would become the moment of grace because it opened him definitively towards God.⁸⁸

and Contexts..., pp. 28-29.)

⁸⁴ *The Essential St. John of the Cross*, (Tr. Peers, Allison E.), Wilder Publications: Radford, VA, 2008, p. 115.

⁸⁵ This was probably St. Andrew the Apostle or St. Paul the Hermit. St. Andrew bargained with God for an elderly man named Nicholas who had been living in sin. After five days of fasting, an angel told him that Nicholas had been pardoned. (Cf. COLEMAN, GERALD. *Walking With...*, p. 55.) Once again, the un-enlightened Ignatius would regress to a reliance on himself. This would precipitate a crisis which was a combination of vainglory and depression. (IBID., p. 29.)

⁸⁶ The decision of Ignatius to obey another person reveals that he is now no longer the master of his own will. The regression seen within a few days reveals to Ignatius that obedience is relative to a person's spiritual process. Unless a person has an experience which has touched the core of one's being, obedience will be a burden and no genuine or lasting transformation would take place.

⁸⁷ Ignatius' remained entrapped in self-love and as long as he keeps looking within he saw no way out. He looked towards God, but he was still blind because his reference point continued to be himself. As long as he did not allow God to illumine his existence, he would remain trapped in self-love. Only when he opened himself to reflect upon himself in the light of God's self-emptying love would he be truly enlightened so as to extricate himself from the deathly vicious cycle.

⁸⁸ We consider this moment to be central in the transformative process of Ignatius – and for that matter any authentic process of transformation. A person can experience humiliations, but the attitude of humility is a gift. Verillon in

Ignatius had been holding on to something which he was incapable of letting go – his past sins. The inability to let go of his past sins would be a humble recognition of two important truths: a) his existential situation as a sinner and b) the impotence to get out of this situation by his own efforts.⁸⁹ However the past sins were a façade for his vainglory. The mercy of God was an obstacle in his attempt to become a saint on the basis of his own efforts. Despite being robed in sackcloth, he was behaving like a peacock – a bird which symbolized vanity, pride, self-reliance and personal glory.⁹⁰ The moment of truth would take place when his abject frustration with his failures led to the thought of giving up. It was at this moment that he became aware of the insidious nature of vainglory and the pathetic state it had left him in. He realized his existential condition as a creature who was being asked to give up a false sense of autonomy and humbly open himself to a loving and merciful Creator.

What seems like an innocuous realization would be the central realization during this experience.⁹¹ He realized that he had done all that within his power, but to no avail

speaking of humility would say that ‘the victory of humility lies in the admission of its defeat’. A person is enlightened on recognizing one’s radical incapacity to extricate oneself from the cycle of sin and suffering. However this recognition is redemptive only when it takes place within the context of experiencing God’s gratuitous and unconditional love. Such enlightenment results in an experience of true life leading to a generous and humble response. An genuine experience of God’s vulnerable and humble love manifests itself in an overflow of love and joy. Bereft of such an experience, an awareness of one’s limit situations could lead to a spiral of dread, fear and death. The reality of existence and the imperative of having to make choices becomes a series of painful obligations that one is condemned to comply with.

⁸⁹ He had been living with a false image of God who he thought had been offended. This was the image of a medieval God which was far removed from the image of God as a loving Father – an image he would discover through his experience. This false image made it difficult for him to believe that God had actually forgiven him. As he continued with his futile efforts to attain God, he crashed against his own incapacity again and again. (Cf. RODRÍGUEZ OLAIZOLA, JOSÉ M^a. *Ignacio de Loyola...*, p. 64.

⁹⁰ Cf. MCMANAMON, JOHN M. *The Text and Contexts...*, p. 35.

⁹¹ Later on the *Autobiography* would go on to speak of the visions and the spectacular graces that would follow this moment of enlightenment. However these visions were the consequence of Ignatius’ moment of humbly entering into the process of emptying his ‘self’. As indicated on earlier occasions we would like to caution against any form of automated process because each experience of being illuminated by God necessarily contains the dimension of human freedom. At the same time we would also like to point out that spiritual life is not something which is a one-time affair, but is an ongoing process. The simplicity of this climatic moment (bereft of all spectacle) is typical of other spiritual experiences in the life of Ignatius. In the next chapter as we deal with the *Spiritual Journal* we will once again see a similar experience where the moment of illumination passes off in an innocuous manner. The spectacular moments either precede this moment or succeed them. The simplicity of these sublime moments can be seen in the

because he was emptying himself of what was secondary but not what was fundamental – i.e. his self. This realization would paradoxically be the moment of learning the mystery of spiritual life. He would experience the greatest enlightenment at the moment of his deepest humiliation – and this humiliation would lead to a total surrender into the hands of God.⁹²

4.2.2 THE HUMILITY OF GOD

But he was pierced for our sins, crushed for our iniquity,

He bore the punishment that makes us whole; by his wounds we were healed.

(Is. 53,5)

The *humility of God* was a key factor in Ignatius' transformation⁹³ and the three different perspectives which we would like to highlight are encapsulated in the above mentioned quote from the Suffering Servant of Isaiah. The first perspective consists in the vulnerability of God in the context of human freedom. The second perspective consists in the solidarity of God with the human person till the very end and the third perspective consists in God's dependence on other dimensions of creation, especially other significant person in the life of Ignatius in order to aid his transformative process. Let us now see these three perspectives of God's humility one by one.

We are created in God's own image and the gift of free will is fundamental to this image. The humility of God is seen in that fact that instead of offering a spectacular and magical formula as Ignatius desired,⁹⁴ God preferred that he open up to the Spirit

rules of discernment which state that the manner in which the good spirit enters the heart of a person who is progressing in spiritual life is like water entering a sponge. (*SpEx* 335)

⁹² The realization that he had to get out of himself and situate himself before God and the world would lead to a new awakening. The freedom from his torments would come when he would passively open himself to experience the gratuitous loving mercy of God. (Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. *El Dios Emergente...*, p. 239.)

⁹³ God's humility is evident in the manner that God dealt with Ignatius during this period. The *Autobiography* in elaborating this relationship offers us two direct metaphors and one indirect metaphor. These include the following phrases: a) 'the Lord deigned that he awake from a sleep' (*Au* 25⁶); b) 'God treated him at this time just as a schoolmaster treats a child' (*Au* 27⁴) and c) the eyes of his understanding began to be opened' (*Au* 32²).

⁹⁴ During this period Ignatius came across as a person who 'was impregnated to the core by Pelagianism and obsessed with notions of doing great things, rather than enduring them or experiencing them. He wanted to achieve sanctity by shortcuts.' (Cf. TELLECHEA IDÍGORAS, JOSÉ IGNACIO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 170.)

through the normal and natural means of his own free will, and in this way 'do his own discerning and make his own decision.'⁹⁵ The experience at Manresa where Ignatius encountered a humble God who respected his integrity and freedom would go on to become an important element in the Spiritual Exercises.⁹⁶

The *Autobiography* reveals to us a God who was with him in his dark moments waiting for him to open himself towards the truth of God's eternal love. God's humility consisted in the fact that not only was Ignatius ignorant of this reality, but that he would repeatedly reject the self-gift of God's gratuitous love.

...todavía Iñigo no ha caído en la cuenta de que lo que Dios le pide no es que sea un Iñigo irreal, puro y magnífico; lo único que Dios quiere es que Iñigo, con sus fuerzas y flaquezas, se deje enamorar, seducir por el Cristo pobre y humilde que le está esperando, y que se convierta en testigo y transmisor de este amor.⁹⁷

The experience of Ignatius reveals a God who humbly participated in the suffering, pain and humiliation of Ignatius. The attitude of God as revealed to Ignatius at Manresa gives an impression of God's near helplessness almost revealing a God who is impotent and powerless to help him.⁹⁸ In this transformative experience, Ignatius realizes that God was with him sharing his situation. The awareness of a God who participated in his suffering and understood what he had been through was far more transformative than any miraculous disappearance of his internal struggle. God in this delicate moment was participating in his suffering and engaging in a relationship which was unconditional and non-manipulative.⁹⁹ An important moment would be the vision

⁹⁵ BRUL, PETER DU. *Ignatius: Sharing the Pilgrim Story...*, p. 54.

⁹⁶ 'If one looks attentively beyond the assortment of directives (of the Spiritual Exercises), what he will see is man, a respect for his freedom and interiority, and a scrupulous concern for the conditions that enhance or prevent this freedom. These are the essential components of the Exercises.' Cf. TELLECHEA IDÍGORAS, JOSÉ IGNACIO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 203. These observations are based on Ignatius' own experiences where he believes that one who desires to follow the path of the exercises with magnanimity and generosity is illumined and moved by divine grace.

⁹⁷ RODRÍGUEZ OLAIZOLA, JOSÉ M^a. *Ignacio de Loyola...*, p. 68.

⁹⁸ However as indicated earlier, the power and omnipotence of God is not to be understood in the worldly sense, but as consisting in the power to love and forgive. God was willing to humble Himself to any extent for the sake of Ignatius' transformation.

⁹⁹ Ignatius realizes that an important element in one's relationship with God is the dimension of simplicity. This too would be an important grace during his moment of illumination. We thus see that after the phrase, 'the Lord deigned that he awake as from a sleep' (*Au 25^o*) there are a series of decisions where Ignatius simplifies things in his life. The

related to the humanity of Christ – a vision which would leave an indelible impression of being called to serve Christ poor and humble.

God's humility is once again manifest in the episode at Manresa where we see God's dependence on various dimensions of created reality.¹⁰⁰ The salvific transformation of Ignatius was not an isolated affair but interlinked and dependent on various persons. These included persons whose were experienced in spiritual life¹⁰¹ as well other members of his family and circle of friends.¹⁰² While redemption is a gift of God, God depends on other persons in order to effect it. The liturgy, contemplating nature,¹⁰³ reflection on what was read in books and so on also aided Ignatius in his transformation. We thus see that God's labouring love being actualized through various elements of created reality – elements which were inter-related to each other.

Underlying Ignatius's experience of the humility of God was a profound experience of God's love. The poverty and humility of Christ's passion and death revealed to him how God had participated in his very passion and suffering. Ignatius discovered that God who had been guiding and teaching him the Divine ways, taught him as a teacher teaches a student. The teacher whom he encountered was not paternalistic or condescending, but one who was extremely respectful, patient and sensitive. God had descended to his level and had spoken to him in a language which could be understood by him. He understood that the authentic image of an omnipotent God consisted in the capacity to be totally loving and forgiving. The mystery of this total love and forgiveness would be revealed in the humility and poverty of Christ.

first thing he decided was to not confess anything from the past (*Au* 25⁸). He decided not to entertain spiritual thoughts if it interfered with his sleep (*Au* 26¹⁻⁴), began to eat meat (*Au* 27¹⁻³) and ended all exaggerations related to physical appearances (*Au* 29³⁻⁴).

¹⁰⁰ God is an independent being and does not depend on any other being for God's existence. However the data of revelation shows us that God brings about redemption in and through others. This was seen at in the mystery of Incarnation and can also be seen in the history of Ignatius.

¹⁰¹ They included Jean Chanon – the holy Benedictine monk at Montserrat, Galacerán Perelló – a Dominican frair, the doctor at the Seo – probably Juan Bocatavi and others.

¹⁰² Other persons on whom God would depend in order to provide him support and strength included members of his family (especially his sister-in-law), some well-intentioned persons at Manresa and others.

¹⁰³ Cf. BRUL, PETER DU. *Ignatius: Sharing the Pilgrim Story...*, p. 72. 'This scene of the greatest of all Ignatius's illuminations did not occur in a Church, but outdoors in natural surroundings.'

4.2.3 THE CONSEQUENCES

The *consequence* of the experience during the sojourn at Manresa left Ignatius a transformed person.¹⁰⁴ It was a defining moment of his life and it would be beyond the scope of this work to provide a comprehensive explanation of the entire experience.¹⁰⁵ This was an intense experience and the consequence can be divided into three segments – an ongoing process of self-emptying as well, the definitive transformative moment of surrender and enlightenment and finally the freedom to live a life of humble service towards others.

4.2.3.1 The three levels of emptying

Ignatius had moved from merely having a desire to appear humble towards actually entering into a process of being ‘clothed in Christ’. (*Rom. 13, 14*) In explaining the consequences we shall show how Ignatius emptied himself at the physical, psychological and spiritual dimensions. In elaborating this point it must be said that we can never speak of one dimension of a person, without referring to other dimensions of a person

¹⁰⁴ GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. *El Dios Emergente...*, p. 238. “Ignacio tenía que llegar al final. Si Ignacio no hubiese agotado sus posibilidades expresivas, sus recursos retóricos ante Dios, siempre habría conservado alguna parcela de su yo no evangelizada, alguna parcela en la que el ‘caballero de las hazañas’ seguiría siendo señor de su feudo. Pero no. Porque las circunstancias le obligaron a agotar el código, la conversión pudo afectar a la totalidad de su persona.”

¹⁰⁵ While there is unanimity among authors that Manresa was a moment of illumination, there are nuanced differences in the content of this illumination. We believe that the magnitude of the experience was so profound that it would be unjust to merely present one perspective as a definitive explanation of this experience. McManamon would speak of it as a moment when Ignatius allowed himself to be healed by the merciful God and proceeded in understanding the movements of diverse spirits. (Cf. MCMANAMON, JOHN M. *The Text and Contexts...*, pp. 30, 35.) Meissner would speak of it as a moment wherein a reorganization of his personality took place when the ego matured to a new level of function. (Cf. MEISSNER, WILLIAM W. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 85.) Brul would point out that the importance in this moment lies in the fact that experience ended in an enlightenment because the polarized struggle led to an internal understanding of the entire sequence – an understanding by which he was able to see the working of the evil spirit. The resolution came through a direct relationship with God, being open to the help of others and firmly responding by going exactly opposite to the evil spirit. (Cf. BRUL, PETER DU. *Ignatius: Sharing the Pilgrim Story...*, pp. 55-56.) We have already indicated the opinions of García de in preceding footnotes where he would speak of the Ignatius’ surrender and humility in the passive openness to God. Tellechea would speak of realizing one’s existence as a creature who was totally dependent on the creature. Marjorie too would highlight that the experience taught Ignatius the means to understand the diversity of spirits and its divine lessons. (Cf. BOYLE, MARJORIE O’ROURKE. *Loyola’s Acts...*, p. 84.) These are some contemporary authors who interpret this important moment in Ignatius’ life. We must acknowledge that there are many other eminent authors who have not been highlighted. However the opinions of the authors mentioned above gives us a glimpse into the profound nature of this experience – an experience which clearly altered Ignatius’ existence in its very core.

because a person is an integral whole. However for the sake of analysing the consequences of this experience in the life of Ignatius we make this division.

The physical emptying of Ignatius began by temporarily cutting ties with his acquaintances in court and physically moved away from his family at Loyola to a different location. The settling of accounts, change of garb, disregard for his appearance were all part of a process of emptying himself at a physical level.¹⁰⁶ However over the course of time, there was a gradual moderation in the life of Ignatius.¹⁰⁷ His experience at Manresa led him to realize that though physical emptying was necessary, it had to be moderated and excesses were to be avoided. A summary of his physical transformation and its future consequence is offered by Tellechea who says:

(At) Manresa people remembered him ...as the man with the young, ruddy complexion who was transformed into a lean and haggard man. Iñigo had ruined his health forever with these excesses of his. We discover a trace of the hard lesson he learned as result of his misdeeds, in the kindness he showed the sick later on in his life, and in the concern he would have for the health of young Jesuit students. He used to say that we render more service to God when we are in good health.¹⁰⁸

During this period Ignatius emptied himself at the affective and psychological level. He moved from being a person whose existence consisted in narcissistic self-love towards becoming a person who humbly learning that authentic existence consists in being open to receiving the self-gift of others in one's life.

As he left home, he wanted to live an isolated life which would lead him to the heights of sanctity.¹⁰⁹ After confessing his sins to Don Channon he decided to proceed

¹⁰⁶ Over a period of time he would realize that the physical excesses were not an end in themselves. Once he realized the relative nature of physical emptying, he got rid of the excesses. The excesses damaged him physically and he never fully recovered from its effects. A good account of his ailments, especially regarding *litiasis bilar* a painful infirmity of stones in the gall bladder is offered by Hernan. (Cf. GARCÍA HERNÁN, ENRIQUE. *Ignacio de Loyola...*, pp. 439-43.)

¹⁰⁷ '...Ignatius is deliberately being shameless, courting personal dishonor and social infamy. Yet his self-humiliation, invested in external appearance, proves not necessarily to be humility. ...With experience, Loyola matures towards moderation. After he begins to be consoled by God and to see fruit in the souls for whom he is caring, he abandons his ascetic extremes.' (BOYLE, MARJORIE O'ROURKE. *Loyola's Acts...*, pp. 72-73.)

¹⁰⁸ TELLECHEA IDÍGORAS, JOSÉ IGNACIO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 185.

¹⁰⁹ He had cut off his ties with his family. He wanted to now live a life where he would isolate himself and relate to on

according to his plan. However very soon, he would realize that his well laid out plans were backfiring¹¹⁰ and there emerged certain recurring patterns of behaviour.¹¹¹ Besides these behavioural patterns, there were other aspects of his past life he could not merely wish off.¹¹² Finally he would break out of this impasse when he would learn to humbly accept the gift of other persons in his life. They would guide him¹¹³ in moving out of his false self-sufficiency and in reconciling his past life. He would learn that the goal of his life could not be realized in isolation and that the only way to progress was through a life of inter-relatedness.¹¹⁴

We now come to the most important dimension of Ignatius' transformation during this period – a emptying of his self. At a time when Ignatius was considered to be at the pinnacle of spiritual life, he was at the lowest because unknowingly he had given into the vice of pride.¹¹⁵ Pride had blinded him and he believed he had a sense of entitlement. Only when he realized that the grace of God is a gratuitous gift received by a humble heart that surrenders and opens itself to God, was he able to experience Divine grace. He realized that the key was not primarily in a physical, emotional, affective or psychological emptying (all of which were necessary), but in an emptying of his self.¹¹⁶

none other than God. Believing that the hermits and saints of the past lived all by themselves, he too contemplated life with the Carthusians, and later on at Manresa lived like a hermit.

¹¹⁰ Cf. BRUL, PETER DU. *Ignatius: Sharing the Pilgrim Story...*, p. 40.

¹¹¹ Cf. IBID., p. 46.

¹¹² After he had settled down to execute the plan of a more ordered life at Manresa, his past caught up with him. (IBID., p. 51.)

¹¹³ Ignatius entered a new phase of inter-relatedness. He felt the need to get out of his narcissistic self-love and relate to others. (Cf. IBID., p. 45) He was humble enough to be open to any source or person who would help him to grow out of himself. We also discover a new Ignatius who displays a remarkable degree of internal freedom. On the one hand he was willing to express his frustration with spiritual advisors who did not help him, but on the other hand was also will to seek the advice of spiritual women. (Cf. MCMANAMON, JOHN M. *The Text and Contexts...*, pp. 36-37.)

¹¹⁴ However the affective inter-relatedness would not be reminiscent of the days in Loyola. The new family into which he was born was no longer one which was made up of filial and blood ties, but one which was based on a shared faith. Loyalty, family honour and kinship would be interpreted differently. The psychological and affective transformation in Ignatius which would be focused on God and God's kingdom would take concrete form in the foundation of the Society of Jesus.

¹¹⁵ O'Rourke interprets the word '*agujero*' as an indication of the pinnacle of pride and vainglory. (Cf. BOYLE, MARJORIE O'ROURKE. *Loyola's Acts...*, pp. 76-80.)

¹¹⁶ Meissner points out that the vision reflects mystical experiences of the highest order. The inner conflict which was leading Ignatius to empty his self was '*being won by the ego. Unconscious elements have been successfully assimilated to the*

When he was willing to empty himself of the self, he would discover that the primary dimension of his life was the spiritual dimension. At Manresa this dimension of his being would be illuminated, internalized and become the operative value system.

At Loyola, Iñigo had undergone an experience which could best be summarized under the rubric of a deepening and broadening of his value orientation. That value-system was highly cathected with libidinal and aggressive elements, permeated with a sublimated set of romanticized masculine sexual ideals, and shot through with highly narcissistic elements. At Loyola Iñigo became aware of and sensitive to another dimension of reality, the spiritual dimension, which from his childhood had remained a significant, but not determining, element in his colourful milieu. During the reflection of his convalescence, this aspect of reality emerged from the background as new and significant. Iñigo gave the values implicit in his new spiritual awareness a tentative acceptance, which grew quickly into an internalized and operative value system.¹¹⁷

4.3.3.2 Surrender and Enlightenment

Ignatius was a new person whose trust and confidence in God was based on gratuitousness. He would be convinced of the abiding presence and guidance of God and would therefore surrender himself totally to the Providence of God. Tellechea in speaking of this moment would say that

...at this moment he realized he was not holding the reins of his life in his own hands, that he could not place confidence in himself. It was then that an unexpected and hoped-for change took place; it was if he had awakened from a bad dream. ...As he recalled what he had learned through experience about different spirits while he was at Loyola, he saw the knots in the tangle and discovered the key to the puzzle. Then, everything fell into place; he had found again his sanity and security.¹¹⁸

The security of riches and worldly power would be replaced by the confidence and security which came from poverty and humility. Christ poor and humble was his new Lord towards whom he had surrendered himself totally. From now on Christ would be the only point of reference in his life. He was confident that the Eternal King to whom he had surrendered his entire being, would not fail him. Such was his new

conscious sphere of ego-activity, and this assimilation has enriched and reinforced the ego and its functioning...' (Cf. MEISSNER, WILLIAM. W. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 82.)

¹¹⁷ *IBID.*, p. 84.

¹¹⁸ TELLECHEA IDÍGORAS, JOSÉ IGNACIO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 194. Tellechea presents this as a crisis of hope, an existential void and a loss of reason. Ignatius is confused and cannot interpret his own experience. This crisis would be a prelude to '*surrendering the citadel of his will.*'

found confidence that he would make the journey to the Holy Land without any money trusting entirely in the Providence of God. (*Au 35-37*)

A reflection on the entire sequence of events illumined Ignatius to the manner in which the Holy Spirit was inspiring him as well as the manner in which the evil spirit had been deceiving him.¹¹⁹ 'He realized that he was in a dialectical relationship not only with with himself and with others, but with Satan and Christ, and with God himself.'¹²⁰ The moment Ignatius became attentive to his existential situation caused by his self-love was for him a moment of enlightenment.¹²¹

In narrating his experience he indicated how God was the main protagonist in the process, while he was merely the instrument who opened himself to this grace. After his sojourn at Manresa, Ignatius was a totally different person because he had been enlightened not only in certain dimensions such as the understanding and will, but in the deepest layers of his being.¹²² Enlightenment thus experienced had humility as its corner stone.¹²³

4.2.3.3 Generous response by humble service

Ignatius was a transformed person with a different orientation.¹²⁴ He would realize that

¹¹⁹ He realized that an important manner in which he had been trapped in a vicious circle was the memory of his sinful past. The constant return to a minute analysis of his since was a very sophisticated but powerful and destructive form of self-love. The corresponding self-abasement that accompanied an exaggerated preoccupation of one's sins was also a very subtle and dangerous form of self-love and pride.

¹²⁰ BRUL, PETER DU. *Ignatius: Sharing the Pilgrim Story...*, p. 50.

¹²¹ Ignatius was learning the insidious character of vainglory as a vice. McManamon here makes a comparative study between Narcissus and Ignatius. Narcissus was so deceived by the beauty of his own image that it ultimately produced a fatal immobility. Ignatius follows a different path and takes refuge at the foot of the cross. The cross is redemptive and heals Ignatius from this exaggerated obsession with himself. (Cf. MCMANAMON, JOHN M. *The Text and Contexts...*, pp. 34-35.) 'He could now discern the evil character of the serpent-like creature. It represents human glory exulting in self-love. He drives off the peacock with his pilgrim's staff. The immobility of Narcissus yields to the journey of a disciple with Jesus to Jerusalem.'

¹²² Cf. TELLECHEA IDÍGORAS, JOSÉ IGNACIO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 200.

¹²³ O'Rourke makes a comparison of the *Autobiography* and Bernard of Clairvaux's *Steps of Humility and Pride* wherein an attempt is made to show how Ignatius has been constantly growing in an awareness of his own vainglory all through his life. While Bernard synthetically explains the steps, Ignatius through a narrative of his life reveals the same. (Cf. BOYLE, MARJORIE O'ROURKE. *Loyola's Acts...*, p. 88.)

¹²⁴ An important indicator of this new orientation is seen in the fact that Ignatius now has no regrets for what he has

the enlightenment at Manresa was not an end in itself, but the point of departure whereby he would once again insert himself into the real world – albeit in a different manner.¹²⁵ The genuine encounter with God filled him to such an extent that it would overflow in his relationship with others. In Christ poor and humble, he had found what he longed for in the depth of his being and desired to communicate this experience with others.¹²⁶ In Manresa he had found a new unity wherein he realized that he was primarily a relational being who was called to communicate to others that which had been received by him.

The Manresa period ends on this note of seeking spiritual persons, showing Ignatius's need for others, both physically in his illnesses and spiritually in his interior life. His life with companions in the future, his efforts at forming and living in community, fall apart if the conditions of its unity are not fulfilled. The basis of that unity is the desire to communicate with those one loves the good things that one has received, and to receive from them the good things that they have received.¹²⁷

A life which was oriented towards self-love would now be based on a love which desired nothing but to empty itself to reveal the glory of God. The fleeting intuition in Loyola where the desire for humility replaced the desire for worldly glory at a superficial level would be firmly established in Manresa. He realized that the grace of God did not depend on what he had done in the past, was presently doing or going to do in the future because God love was eternal, gratuitous and unconditional. The folly of his grandiose self-love which was rooted in pride and vainglory would be recognized.

Ignatius would discover the redemptive nature of humility because it concretely revealed the love of God as well as offered the perfect antidote for vainglory. This experience of God's love in the humility and poverty of Christ would fill his entire being

done in his past life. Rather his regrets are about what he has not done for the Lord this shows a person whose focus has shifted from being centered on one's sinfulness towards the goodness of God. This comment is made when he speaks about the three moments of being close to death. (*Au* 33²⁻³) '*...examining himself carefully and preparing to die, he could not feel afraid for his sins or of being condemned, but he did feel embarrassment and sorrow, as he believed he had not used well the gifts and graces which God our Lord had granted him.*'

¹²⁵ Cf. TELLECHEA IDÍGORAS, JOSÉ IGNACIO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 201.

¹²⁶ Among the five different illuminations that are narrated in the *Autobiography*, the fourth vision refers to the humanity of Christ. This vision would reappear during his visit to Jerusalem and as he walked near Padur. (*Au*. 29)

¹²⁷ BRUL, PETER DU. *Ignatius: Sharing the Pilgrim Story...*, p. 76.

in such a manner that he too would ardently desire to imitate the same. His existence had been transformed and he would constantly desire to live from the gratuitousness to God and generously respond through a life of humble service. From now on his narcissistic self-love would be slowly transformed into a love which joyously emptied itself for others. During the next few years of his life he would discover how the Church which was the mystical body of Christ embodied the humility of God and in such manner revealed to the world the love and mercy of God.

4.3 THE ECCLESIAL DIMENSION IN THE EMERGENCE OF A MATURE HUMILITY

As Ignatius left Manresa, he was a changed person who continued to intensely desire an imitation of the saints. However the motivation had been radically altered and he was going to imitate the saints out of 'the love of his Lord; and no longer the love of himself.'¹²⁸ It would be the beginning of a phase of his life which could be called the pilgrim years. Though he would be a pilgrim all through his life because of a constant desire to know and fulfil the will of God, the years from 1523 when he decided to leave Manresa to 1537 when he apparently gave up the idea of going to Jerusalem were years when he moved from place to place – Jerusalem, Barcelona, Alcalá, Salamanca, Paris, Bologna, Venice and Vicenza.

In trying to understand the growing experience of the humility of God we shall follow the same scheme as in the previous stages. We shall first begin with the actual experiences of humiliation which opened Ignatius towards the humility of God. This will be followed by a reflection of the humility of God as revealed in its universal ecclesial dimension – in the Holy Land, Italy, Spain and France during this period. Finally this part will conclude by highlighting the transformation in Ignatius as a result of his experience of God's humility.

4.3.1 THE ACTUAL EXPERIENCE OF HUMILITY

The actual experience of humility for Ignatius consisted in becoming aware of the

¹²⁸ RAVIER, ANDRÉ. *Ignatius of Loyola and the Founding of the Society of Jesus*, (Tr. Daly, Maura – Daly, Joan – Daly, Carson), Ignatius Press: San Francisco, 1987, p. 415.

situation of the Church which he was called to serve, and to which he belonged. He too like Luther was aware of the difficulties facing the Church, but chose to respond in a manner which maintained the unity of the Church.¹²⁹ An acknowledge of the ecclesial situation from the standpoint of humility led to a different interpretation of the situation – an interpretation where he felt a growing impulse to work towards a transformation based on love, rather than of condescending contempt. Let us now look at the different moments of humility experienced by Ignatius within the ecclesial context.

His first humiliation would be in the Holy Land¹³⁰ where he desired to live and help souls.¹³¹ We can presume that the precarious nature of Christianity in the Holy Land as against the triumphant Church in Spain would most certainly have caught the attention of Ignatius. His desire could not be fulfilled because the Franciscan Provincial ordered him to leave.¹³² The return journey would see a series of humiliations where the first consisted in a shipwreck which left him in Cyprus.¹³³ A conscious decision to travel in poverty and humility would motivate him to give away alms that were received by him in Italy. At one point he was detained by soldiers, questioned and finally let off

¹²⁹ *'De hecho Ignacio y Lutero se parecen en que ambos están convencidos de la necesidad de una reforma profunda de la Iglesia, pero algo que los diferencia claramente es la convicción de Ignacio de que la unidad eclesial debía ser salvada a toda costa. Para Ignacio no se puede hacer una elección "en todo acertada" si ésta supone la ruptura con el cuerpo de la Iglesia. La razón profunda es que nuestra adhesión a Cristo nuestro Señor, esposo, tiene su implicación en la Iglesia, su esposa.'* MOLINA, DIEGO. "Y que militen dentro de nuestra santa madre la Iglesia..." El papel de la Iglesia en el proceso espiritual del sujeto ignaciano" *Manresa* - 315, 2008, p. 161.

¹³⁰ In 1523 only 21 pilgrims sailed for the Holy Land and they were divided into two ships. Ignatius was in the second ship with 8 pilgrims. The reason for few pilgrims was that the island of Rhodes had been captured by the Turks. (Cf. MARTÍN-MORENO, JUAN M. "Jerusalén", *DEI, Mensajero* – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2007, p. 1066.)

¹³¹ Meissner points to the fact that Ignatius 'fierce determination to pursue his aims' is striking. He desired to imitate Christ in every minute detail and only the threat of excommunication would make him change his mind. The decision of the Provincial reveals to us once again the respectful but also rebellious side of Ignatius. On the one hand he obeyed the Provincial, but on the other hand his impulsive behavior made him once again visit the Mount of Olives. (Cf. MEISSNER, WILLIAM W. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 115.)

¹³² This is the first clash with ecclesiastical authority. For the first time he is ordered and despite being 'firm in his purpose' (*Au 46^s*) Ignatius humbly submits to the order of the Provincial. (Cf. COLEMAN, GERALD. *Walking With...*, p. 92.)

¹³³ It is interesting to note that Ignatius offers us few details related to places or itinerary. He was more concerned about the internal process. (Cf. *IBID.*, p. 1068.)

because the soldiers thought he was deranged.¹³⁴ He reached Barcelona by March, 1524.

He realized that in order to help souls, he would have to learn Latin and hence was willing to go through the ignominy of sitting with little children as he learnt Latin.¹³⁵ The desire for ecclesial reform is already evident in various activities he engaged in. These included his efforts to reform convents and works of mercy where the sick and poor were attended.

One area that was especially important to him, and was to engage his energies for many years to come, was the reform of convents of nuns. There was a need for the restoration of their spirit of seclusion and the observance of their religious rule... His efforts to correct these abuses brought him into conflict, and even physical danger, from some of those thwarted visitors. Inigo was particularly involved with three of these convents: the Hieronymites of St. Matthias, the Benedictines of St. Clare (to which Teresa Rejadell belonged) and the Dominicans of our Lady of the Angels.¹³⁶

From Barcelona he went to Alcala where he used to engage in spiritual conversation, gave the Spiritual Exercises and taught Christian doctrine.¹³⁷ However he would have to experience the humiliation of being subject to the Inquisition¹³⁸ by the ecclesial authorities.¹³⁹ They would finally prohibit him from speaking on certain spiritual matters, giving the Spiritual Exercises¹⁴⁰ and ask him wear the dress of a

¹³⁴ The firmness of the ecclesial authorities makes Ignatius more flexible and we see a certain degree of passivity in his behavior. The *Autobiography* indicates a few scenes where he allows himself to be led. The Syrian Christian 'grabbed him tightly by the arm, and he readily let himself be led' (*Au 48*²); in the presence of the captain of the Imperial forces when '...(he) had some sort of impression of when Christ was led away, ...(as) he was led through the three main streets,' (*Au 52*¹) and finally in the presence of the French captain where the soldiers 'took him to their captain' (*Au 53*⁶)

¹³⁵ Cf. DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. *Ignatius...*, pp. 86-87; Cf. GARCÍA-VILLOSLADA, RICARDO. *San Ignacio...*, pp. 258-259.

¹³⁶ COLEMAN, GERALD. *Walking With...*, p. 109.

¹³⁷ During this period Ignatius has had a definitive re-orientation, but the vainglory repeatedly re-emerges in his actions. His decision to go without money is reminiscent of the reckless bravado of Pamplona. The decision to enter a monastery with the intention of reforming it as well as the decision to put on the robes of a religious is indicative of a certain degree of vainglory. (Cf. BOYLE, MARJORIE O'ROURKE. *Loyola's Acts...*, pp. 171-73.)

¹³⁸ Cf. ESTEP, WILLIAM R. *Renaissance & Reformation*, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company: Michigan, 1986, pp. 283-285.

¹³⁹ He was probably arrested due to the influence of Doctor Pedro Ciruelo (*Au 61*⁷) who held the Chair of Thomistic Theology in the university of Alcalá and was responsible for the two women who had gone on a pilgrimage. (Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. *El peregrino de la voluntad de Dios – Biografía espiritual de San Ignacio de Loyola*, BAC: Madrid, 2005, p. 76.)

¹⁴⁰ Cf. IPARRAGUIRRE, IGNACIO. *Práctica de los Ejercicios de San Ignacio de Loyola en vida de su Autor*, Bibliotheca Institutii Historici: Roma, 1946, p. 2.

student.¹⁴¹ He hoped to be exonerated at Salamanca, but the decision was reinforced¹⁴² and though he cleared of any wrong doing, he was asked to speak on spiritual matters only after studying theology.¹⁴³ The *Autobiography* reveals rather candidly the irritation and desperation of Ignatius with ecclesiastical authorities on various occasions.¹⁴⁴

The disappointing judgment of Salamanca forced him to look for new avenues and in 1528 he found himself trudging towards Paris. He was advised to avoid the journey because of the war between Charles V of Spain and Francis I of France.¹⁴⁵ During this period there were many moments of personal humiliation for Ignatius, notable among which was the struggle for money because of his difficult financial situation. Such was Ignatius' situation that though he desired to earn some money by serving some well to do student or professor, he could not find anyone to accept his services because of his physical condition.¹⁴⁶ Finally the generosity of his benefactors of Barcelona and some traders in Flanders helped him overcome the situation.

¹⁴¹ His lifestyle raised the suspicions of the ecclesial authorities who were careful of three tendencies – the *alumbrados*, the Lutherans and the Erasmists. Hernan in his book makes a strong pitch in order to indicate that Ignatius was influenced by the *alumbrados*. While we cannot deny that the various prevailing trends influenced Ignatius in his spiritual process, it would be an exaggeration to conclude that Ignatius was primarily an *alumbrado* albeit smart enough to find his way around ecclesial authorities. At Alcala the meetings organized by Ignatius as well as the external garment of Ignatius and his companions resembled those of the *alumbrados*. (Cf. GARCÍA HERNÁN, ENRIQUE. *Ignacio de Loyola...*, pp. 167-68.)

¹⁴² (IBID., p. 169.) While we agree with the author's observation that the refusal of the archbishop would have been a humiliation for Ignatius causing him to feel hurt, it is difficult to make a conclusive remark that this hurt would not be healed all through his life.

¹⁴³ Cf. TELLECHEA IDÍGORAS, JOSÉ IGNACIO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, pp. 270, 273-75.

¹⁴⁴ Some phrases which indicate this attitude are as follows: 'what benefit these inquisitions bring!' (*Au* 59¹); 'they would burn you too if they found heresy in you.' (*Au* 59²); 'continued teaching and giving exercises' (*Au* 60³) until he was order to stop doing so. (*Au* 62⁴⁻⁶); 'he addressed him (the archbishop) as *you*' (*Au* 63³) and refused to go the college which was recommended by the Archbishop. (*Au* 64²) In his encounter with the sub-prior of the Dominicans, Nicolás de Santos he bluntly '... refused to say anything more than (he) had said, except before his superiors who could oblige him to do so.' (*Au* 66¹) During the trial he challenged his examiners (who were doctors) to condemn him (*Au* 68⁸) on the point as to 'when a thought was a venial sin and when it was mortal.' (*Au* 68⁷) He finally makes his irritation obvious when he curtly told his examiners that he would obey them 'only as long as he was in the jurisdiction of Salamanca.' (*Au* 70⁵)

¹⁴⁵ Cf. TELLECHEA IDÍGORAS, JOSÉ IGNACIO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, pp. 282-83.; Cf. BRODRICK, JAMES. *St. Ignatius...*, pp. 206-207.

¹⁴⁶ Even the '*recommendations of the bachelor Juan de Castro and a Carthusian monk who knew many of the professors did not help.*' (Cf. DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. *Ignatius...*, p. 109.)

There were also prejudices against him at Paris from the beginning to the very end.¹⁴⁷ He gave the spiritual exercises to Juan de Castro, Pedro de Peralta and Amador de Elduayen provoking a fierce reaction within the university. Instead of being hailed as a holy person, on returning to Paris he found a situation which was hostile to him.¹⁴⁸ After this experience he decided to step back and dedicate himself primarily to studies. The doubts regarding Ignatius would never completely be resolved and an inquisition would take place as he was about to leave for Azpeitia.¹⁴⁹

During these years, Ignatius through the actual experience of humiliations opened himself more and more towards the Divine will. As he engaged in a life of helping other souls he understood that an integral element in discipleship consisted in humility. During this period he had a better understanding of the humility of God within an ecclesial context. His experience of the Church and the position of the Vicar of Christ in various parts of Europe were not merely political events, but a profoundly spiritual experience. He realized that his life and mission was meaningful only when it shared in the humility of God within the context of the mystical body of Christ – the Church.

4.3.2 THE HUMILITY OF GOD

I gave my back to those who beat me, my cheeks to those who tore out my beard

My face I did not hide, from insults and spitting.

(Is. 50,6)

¹⁴⁷ Polanco in his biography refers to two moments of contradiction in Paris –at the onset of his studies and at the end of his studies. FN – I, pp. 179, 181. “*Tampoco le faltaron contradicciones en París, aunque por darse más al estudio y menos a los prójimos, no tantas. 15 meses después de llegado a París se comenzó a levantar una, y hacerse proceso contra él delante del inquisidor. Y ésta tuvo ocasión de lo que había pasado con el doctor Peralta y Castro y otro Amador... Estas contradicciones fueron, como digo, al principio y fin de su estudio...*”

¹⁴⁸ Ignatius was not a stranger to suffering and persecution and would not have been unduly perturbed by the danger of physical suffering, he would have certainly been preoccupied with the negative fallout of this event vis-à-vis the students. He was also concerned of the fallout among the ecclesiastical authorities and the professors. With fierce opposition from the authorities, it would be unlikely that the students would be inclined to visit him. Considering the fact that Diego de Govia was influential in the Portuguese court could also have led to negative repercussions at a wider level.

¹⁴⁹ FN – I, p. 180. “*...se hizo otro proceso contra él al fin de sus estudios, ya que él quería partirse, en el tiempo que allí hizo quemar Francisco, Rey de Francia, muchos herejes, que entonces abundaban en París (de los cuales muchos que se reducían había traído Iñigo al inquisidor).*”

In keeping with the words of Isaiah, the Church was being assailed on all sides and faced humiliations as had not been experienced for centuries. In this part we shall highlight two elements related to the ecclesial context where *the humility of God* was manifest.¹⁵⁰ The first would be the vulnerability of the spouse of Christ, i.e. the Church to the whole world. The second would be the doubts raised by the various divisions in the Church in relation to the role of the Vicar of Christ or the Roman Pontiff and the hierarchy of the Church.

The approach to both these realities reveals to us an ecclesial context which appeared humble and vulnerable as against an ecclesial understanding which was triumphalist. In this point we do not intent to enter into ecclesiological, sacramental or theological debates. Our intent is very limited and we shall merely limit ourselves to revealing the humility of the Church with the help of some facts. The humility of the Church which is the spouse of Christ has a direct bearing on the humility of God.¹⁵¹

The Church at the time of Ignatius was vulnerable due to various internal as well as external factors. Externally, it was being torn apart due to theological¹⁵² and political revolts with the most important being that of Martin Luther in Germany and Henry VIII of England. Others such as Calvin and Zwingli also contributed to the general turmoil within the Church. The positions taken by various European kings and emperors made the situation of the Catholic Church very precarious.¹⁵³ The general state of confusion

¹⁵⁰ In elaborating the humility of God as manifest at an ecclesial level, we would once again indicate as pointed out on various other occasions, that we do not necessarily consider humility to be abhorring and something to be rejected. While sin and sinfulness is certainly to be rejected, we continue to hold on to the positive and redemptive dimension of humility. The response to a reality of sin which emerges from self-love and pride lies in accepting a path which is diametrically opposite to it – a path of humility and humiliations.

¹⁵¹ The Church as the mystical body of Christ is holy, but at the same time is composed of weak and sinful persons. The example of the apostles before the gift of Spirit provides us sufficient proof. Besides sinful persons, the Church also consists of structures which need purification and it is the transformative grace of the Spirit which will allow both individuals and structures to be authentic witness of God.

¹⁵² The two major trends in the university of Paris included humanism and Lutheranism. Mysticism also found its place in the atmosphere of the university. The focus seemed to a return to the Gospels and the foundational sources. (Cf. LÉCRIVAIN, PHILIPPE. "Paris", *DEI*, p. 1414.)

¹⁵³ The French King, Francis I was friendly with King Henry VIII of England and was also sympathetic towards other ideologies which were strongly opposed by many professors in the University of Paris. It must be recalled, that Paris which was cosmopolitan in nature was facing a far more serious attack at the hands of the Lutherans rather than the

regarding the ecclesial situation had pervaded intellectual circles, the hierarchy, the nobility and even the common person. Ignatius had first-hand knowledge of the situation through his experiences in various parts of Europe, most notably in Paris.¹⁵⁴

Just as the Church was being humiliated due to external factors, the internal factors did not do much to improve matters. The formation of the clergy left a lot to be desired and many priests and members of the hierarchy were not edifying examples as committed pastors. Religious life too was at a decadent stage and many religious orders and monasteries were in urgent need of reform.¹⁵⁵ The laity was woefully ignorant about Christian doctrine and hence susceptible to manipulation by new theological ideas.¹⁵⁶ The Church which was called to preach in humility and poverty had become a Church of pomp and splendour and reeked of the very worldly values that it desired to challenge.¹⁵⁷

The humility of Christ was manifest concretely in the Roman Pontiff – the Vicar of Christ on earth. Ignatius was aware of the abuses of the Papacy,¹⁵⁸ yet was able to transcend the mere human personality of the Roman Pontiff to see in the figure of the Pope the very person of Christ. For Ignatius the Pope continued the apostolic tradition,

Erasmists. (Cf. BRODRICK, JAMES. *St. Ignatius...*, pp. 260-261.)

¹⁵⁴ Important events during the first year of Ignatius' stay in Paris included the Council of Sens-Paris (1528) where 39 errors of Martin Luther were condemned, the sacrilege of a statue of Our Lady (early June 1528), the condemnation of Erasmus by the Faculty of Theology (23rd June, 1528) and the death of a nobleman Louis de Berquin (who earlier enjoyed royal patronage) for heresy (17th April, 1529). (Cf. FARGE, JAMES K. "The University of Paris in the time of Ignatius of Loyola", *Ignacio de Loyola y su tiempo*, (Ed. Plazaola, Juan), Universidad de Deusto/Mensajero: Bilbao, 1991, pp. 234-236.)

¹⁵⁵ It must be recalled that there had been various attempts at reform. 'The majority of religious orders, despite the disrepute which crippled them, had tried to improve themselves well before the Council of Trent.' Ravier goes on to give a summary of reform efforts by various religious orders. (Cf. RAVIER, ANDRÉ. *Ignatius of Loyola and the Founding...*, p. 53.)

¹⁵⁶ Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 51-53.

¹⁵⁷ Ignatius was well aware of the moral degradation of the Church. His fidelity was not to an ideal Church, but the existential Church and all his attempts at reform would be in the context of the Church as it existed in his time. (Cf. MOLINA, DIEGO. "Y que militen...'", p. 153.)

¹⁵⁸ The system of benefices had caused a great deal of damage in the hierarchy of the Church. However given the fact that the Pope was also a temporal prince, he used benefices in order to attract persons towards supporting him. Pope Paul III who approved the Society of Jesus began his papacy by engaging in nepotism, a common feature among the popes of his time. However it must also be pointed out to his credit that he was instrumental in appointing reform minded cardinals who would take forward the task of reforming the Church. (Cf. RAVIER, ANDRÉ. *Ignatius of Loyola and the Founding...*, pp. 38-40.)

was a symbol of unity of the universal Church and Christ sent people to participate in Christ's mission.¹⁵⁹ The spiritual significance of the Roman Pontiff consisted in the individual's fidelity to the Church – a fidelity which is explicitly manifest through obedience to the Vicar of Christ.¹⁶⁰ The willingness of God to reveal the Divine will through vulnerable and weak human instruments and ecclesial structures is a continuous manifestation of God's humility

Just as the humility of God was manifest in the Vicar of Christ, in the same way it was manifest through various ecclesial authorities. As indicated earlier, the Church is an instrument of the Spirit, but it would be erroneous to identify the action of the Spirit solely with an action of the Church. However it does provide a reference point whereby it is possible to know with greater certainty the will of God.¹⁶¹ The role of ecclesial authorities falls within this ambit – i.e. to effectively aid the process of discernment.¹⁶² Ignatius was convinced that God in God's humility has descended to deal directly with the creature. (*SpEx 15*) At the same time he was also convinced that the same humility of God is constantly manifested through ecclesial authorities who have been given responsibilities within the Church.¹⁶³

Ignatius was always concerned about the double openness - to the Spirit and to

¹⁵⁹ Cf. RAMBLA, JOSEP M. "Del gentilhomme Íñigo a San Ignacio de Loyola: una eclesialidad progresiva", *Manresa* – 331, 2012, p. 119. 'Esta profunda convicción sobre la mediación del Papa para las misiones apostólicas es un aspecto particular de la teología ignaciana sobre el lugar del sucesor de Pedro en la Iglesia. Para Ignacio, la unidad de la Iglesia, esposa de Cristo y animada por el Espíritu, tiene una concentración y visibilización en el sucesor de Pedro y en la Sede Apostólica.'

¹⁶⁰ Ignatius had to deal with 4 popes, all of whom had different temperaments. Despite the enormity of differences in their personality, for Ignatius they were always in the first place Vicars of Christ. (Cf. RAVIER, ANDRÉ. *Ignatius of Loyola and the Founding*. ..., p. 42.) 'La fidelidad al Espíritu en la Iglesia encuentra en la vinculación con el Papa una mayor garantía de esta fidelidad inseparable al Espíritu y a la Iglesia.' (RAMBLA, JOSEP M. "Del gentilhomme Íñigo a San Ignacio de Loyola...", p. 118.)

¹⁶¹ '...la Iglesia no suplanta la acción del Espíritu que nos conduce hacia donde quiere, ni ahorra el esfuerzo personal por llegar al conocimiento de la voluntad de Dios sobre nuestra vida. Pero la Iglesia nos ofrece el marco de referencia dentro del cual podemos "en todo acertar".' (MOLINA, DIEGO. "Y que militen...", p. 157.)

¹⁶² In this context we find that the actions of the Franciscan Provincial in Jerusalem, the various authorities of the Church in Spain, France and Italy, as well as important authorities in the Papal curia, undoubtedly aided Ignatius in the process of an ongoing discernment.

¹⁶³ Cf. MOLINA, DIEGO. "Y que militen...", p. 156. 'Una vez que dicho discernimiento personal se ha realizado, todavía falta un paso más, ya que toda experiencia de Dios personal está llamada a no agotarse en el propio sujeto, sino que ha de tener consecuencias en la vida entera de la persona, que nunca es alguien aislado, sino que vive, celebra y cree en comunidad.'

the Church. While he relied on the personal process of discernment, he also depended on the approval of the Church and the Christian community.¹⁶⁴ He was aware of weakness of ecclesiastical authorities and did not always passively accept their decision.¹⁶⁵ However he progressively understood the mystical dimension of the Church and recognized the ecclesial authorities as instruments of God who were a necessary medium in order to aid the actualizing of a religious experience.

La experiencia religiosa debe ser un convencimiento personal, propio y libre, anclado en lo más profundo de la conciencia; pero la propia experiencia religiosa sólo es tal en una comunidad y en una sociedad. El cristianismo es una religión histórica, vinculada de forma muy precisa a Jesucristo. He aquí una cuestión clave para la eclesiología, en la teoría y en la práctica: ¿de qué modo puede la Iglesia hacer que Jesucristo sea efectivamente contemporáneo a la libertad del ser humano individual, cuando éste, temporal y espacialmente, se aleja cada vez más de Él? Dicho en positivo: la Iglesia, la esposa del Señor, está llamada a ser el *medium* intrínseco del acontecimiento salvífico de Cristo para el hombre de todo tiempo y lugar, aquí y ahora.¹⁶⁶

4.3.3 THE CONSEQUENCES

The *consequence* of Ignatius' understanding of humility within the ecclesial dimension led him to respond generously. The personal experiences of humiliations as well as an awareness of the humility of the Church made him more open to the inspiration of the Holy Spirit and aided him in his spiritual growth. However more important would be an experience of God's humility as manifested in the Church. This resulted in a surrender which was total whereby he and his companions offered themselves to serve the Church in whatever was asked of him and his companions by the Roman Pontiff. In elaborating this point we shall present the itinerary of Ignatius's transformation as manifest through the interactions he had with ecclesial authorities. We shall begin with his confrontation with the Franciscan Provincial in Jerusalem and end with the sentence given by the Pope in his favour during the persecution of Mudarra and Barreda.

¹⁶⁴ Cf. IBID., p. 165.

¹⁶⁵ Ignatius was not blind to the Church's reality, but refrained from any form of cheap or offensive criticism. However he was at all times obedient and respectful to the authorities of the Church. This did not entail a passive and submissive acceptance of what was told to him, but rather entailed a dynamic form of obedience. (Cf. RAMBLA, JOSEP M. "Del gentilhomme Íñigo a San Ignacio de Loyola...", pp. 120, 122.)

¹⁶⁶ MADRIGAL, SANTIAGO. "Vivir hoy en la Iglesia desde el carisma ignaciano", *Manresa* – 331, 2012, p. 142.

In order to better analyse the evolution in Ignatius' understanding of the ecclesial reality, let us begin by presenting certain numbers of the *Autobiography*.

Place	No.	Text
Jerusalem	47	He (Provincial) wanted to show him the bulls giving them power to excommunicate, but he said he did not need to see them, as he believed their reverences; in as much as they had so decided with the authority they had, he would obey them.
Alcalá	59	We would like to know if they have found any heresy in us." "No," says Figueroa, "for if they did they would burn you." "They would burn you too," says the pilgrim, "if they found heresy in you."
Alcalá	62	...as the two pious women returned, the notary came to the jail to read the sentence: he should go free; ...and should not speak about matters of faith until they had studied for four more years, because they had no education. For in truth, the pilgrim was the one who had the most, and that was with little foundation.
Salamanca	63	He set out from Alcalá and found the Archbishop in Valladolid. Faithfully recounting the affair to him, he said that, even though he was not now in his jurisdiction nor obliged to abide by the sentence, still he would do whatever he commanded in this matter.
Salamanca	66	The pilgrim said, "Father, I will say no more than I have said, except before my superiors who can oblige me to do so.
Salamanca	68	... he always said first that he did not know what scholars said about those matters. ... The question was why he, without studies, was deciding that. He answered, "If this is true or not: decide that; and if it is not true, condemn it." But in the end they left without condemning anything.
Salamanca	70	The pilgrim said he would do everything the sentence ordered, but he did not find it acceptable, because without condemning him for anything they shut his mouth so he might not help his neighbours in what he could. ...only that as long as he was in the jurisdiction of Salamanca he would do what had been ordered.
Paris	81	The pilgrim returned to Paris and discovered ...the inquisitor had issued a summons for him. But he would not wait further and went to the inquisitor, to whom he said that he understood he was looking for him, and that he was prepared for anything he might wish, but he would request that he expedite it, because he had in mind to enrol in the Arts course the coming St. Remy's.
Paris	86	As the pilgrim was about to set out, he learned that he had been accused before the inquisitor, with a case brought against him. Knowing this but seeing that they did not summon him, he went to the inquisitor and told him what he had heard and that he was about to set out for Spain and that he had companions: would he please pass sentence. ... he again insisted that the case be carried through to the sentence. As the inquisitor excused himself, he brought a public notary and witnesses to his house, and obtained a testimonial on this whole affair.
Venice	93	In Venice the pilgrim also endured another persecution, with many saying that his effigy had been burned in Spain and in Paris. This business went so far that a trial was held and sentence was given in favour of the pilgrim

Rome	98	Miguel began to give trouble and to speak badly of the pilgrim, who caused him to be summoned before the governor. He first showed the governor a letter of Miguel's in which he praised the pilgrim very much. The governor examined Miguel, and ended by banishing him from Rome.
Rome	98	Mudarra and Barreda then began their persecution.... In the end both of them confessed in the presence of the governor and the legate, that they had nothing bad to say about them, neither regarding their ways nor regarding their teaching. The legate ordered silence to be imposed on the whole affair, but the pilgrim did not accept that, saying he wanted a definite sentence. ...after some months, the Pope came to Rome. The pilgrim went to speak to him and gave him several reasons; thus informed, the Pope ordered the sentence to be given, and it was given in his favor, etc.

The above mentioned numbers of the *Autobiography* reveal that as Ignatius became more focused regarding his mission, the ecclesial dimension became more important.¹⁶⁷ From the first moment when he was satisfied with the word of the Franciscan Provincial (*Au* 47¹) to finally insisting that the Pope order a sentence (*Au.* 98,10) we find that Ignatius has slowly entered into the mystery of the spiritual life of the Church.¹⁶⁸ There is a shift from being concerned about his own project in Jerusalem, to the preoccupation to engage in ministry along with his companions in Alcala and Salamanca, towards the need to complete his studies in Paris and finally a concern for the future of the first companion and the Society of Jesus. As Ignatius' focus was clarified he gradually realized the centrality of the ecclesial dimension vis-à-vis his identity and mission.

A second point in the above mentioned text is the lack of uniformity in details, but a general movement towards greater integration with the Church. The lack of uniformity can be seen in the Ignatius' oscillations. He was harsh and appeared rude before some authorities (*Au* 59²⁻³; 66¹⁻²; 70⁷) but humble and polite towards others (*Au* 47¹; 62⁶; 63³; 68⁵). We also find an inconsistency in Ignatius' approach towards the

¹⁶⁷ The point related to the ecclesial dimensión in the life of Ignatius has been debated by various authors. Rambla in his article indicates that the ecclesial position of Ignatius evolved throughout his life. (Cf. RAMBLA, JOSEP M. "Del gentilhome Iñigo a San Ignacio de Loyola...", p. 111.) Molina in his article seems to disagree with Granero who makes a distinction between Ignatius understanding of the ecclesial reality as a private matter to a more universal understanding of the Church. (Cf. MOLINA, DIEGO. "'Y que militen...'", p. 159.) According to the texts seen in the *Autobiography* we can say that there has been some evolution in Ignatius' ecclesiology. While there is no doubt that Ignatius was always a man of the Church, there is a noticeable shift towards greater integration into the mystery of the Church as an instrument of the Spirit throughout the life of Ignatius.

¹⁶⁸ Cf. RAMBLA, JOSEP M. "Del gentilhome Iñigo a San Ignacio de Loyola...", p. 123.

ecclesial authorities. While in Spain Ignatius was willing to wait until he was summoned by the ecclesial authorities in Spain (*Au* 58⁴; 59⁴; 60¹; 67¹; 67⁶; 68¹), in Paris and Italy he took the initiative and went to meet the concerned authority (*Au* 81²; 86³; 93²; 98⁴; 98⁹⁻¹⁰).

The lack of uniformity needs to be understood within the context of a general movement towards greater integration with the mission of the Church. Ignatius was always concerned about the ecclesial dimension from the days of his youth.¹⁶⁹ The period in Spain manifests to us an Ignatius who was passive in terms of relating his ministry with the overall mission of the Church. Though in Paris the Papal clause would be second option, it would still signal a definitive moment in Ignatius' ecclesial evolution.¹⁷⁰ The inability of being able to go to the Holy Land and a definitive offering to the Pope would be the culmination of a long journey for Ignatius.¹⁷¹

4.3.4 CONCLUDING REMARKS

Ignatius who desired to imitate the apostolic Church¹⁷² by following a path of poverty and humility offers us a reference point for our own lives.¹⁷³ He believed that the only

¹⁶⁹ Cf. RAMBLA, JOSEP M. "Del gentilhombre Íñigo a San Ignacio de Loyola...", pp. 113-14.

¹⁷⁰ The vows at Montmartre were a defining moment in the life of Ignatius and the companions because they went through a similar experience as Manresa. (Cf. RAVIER, ANDRÉ. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 422.) The vows led to the formation of a group and for the first time there is formal reference to the Pope. While the Jerusalem project is an important element in the vows, the primary spiritual import of these vows would be in the ecclesial dimension. Its transcendental values goes way beyond the material aspects and helps us better understand the genesis of the Society of Jesus as well as the special vow of obedience to the Pope. García Madariaga, J. M^a in an article on the 'Papal Clause' of the vows of Montmartre analyses various texts and indicates that there was never any doubt about the papal clause. The nuances of each text has been well analyzed by the author. (Cf. GARCÍA MADARIAGA, J. M^a. "Contenido de la cláusula papal del voto de Montmartre", *Manresa – 188*, 1978, pp. 231-245.) The Papal clause manifests a definitive moment of self-emptying where the future course of his life is surrendered into the hands of the Vicar of Christ.

¹⁷¹ The ecclesial dimension in Ignatius' life is not a reality imposed from above but the culmination of an organic process in the life of Ignatius. Commenting on the *Rules of thinking with the Church*, García de Castro interprets the placement of the carefully redacted text at the end because of an organic schema which is part of the dynamics of the Spiritual Exercises. The conviction which emerges from an internal experience is far more efficacious than that a norm which is imposed from above. (Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. "Iglesia, sentir y sentido en san Ignacio", *Manresa – 332*, 2012, pp. 247, 250.)

¹⁷² Cf. RAVIER, ANDRÉ. *Ignatius of Loyola and the Founding...*, pp. 251-52, 321.

¹⁷³ MADRIGAL, SANTIAGO. "Vivir hoy en la Iglesia desde el carisma ignaciano", *Manresa – 331*, 2012, p. 147. 'el Vaticano II nos ayuda a comprender que «nuestra inspiración comunitaria hunde sus raíces, asimismo, en la experiencia primigenia de Maestro Ignacio y sus compañeros». Es una llamada a revivir la experiencia comunitaria de aquellos primeros compañeros que nos

manner in which the Church would be able proclaim the Good News was in humility because that was how Christ proclaimed the Good News.¹⁷⁴

Just as Christ carried out the work of redemption in poverty and persecution, so the Church is called to follow the same route that it might communicate the fruits of salvation to men. Christ Jesus, "though He was by nature God . . . emptied Himself, taking the nature of a slave" and "being rich, became poor" for our sakes. Thus, the Church, although it needs human resources to carry out its mission, is not set up to seek earthly glory, but to proclaim, even by its own example, humility and self-sacrifice.¹⁷⁵

This desire to imitate Christ's humility is seen in the initial stirrings at Loyola and would continue to make itself manifest in the moment of founding the new order which would be called the 'least' Society of Jesus. Within the period between the first desire and the formal decision to found a new order we can see as to how Ignatius had internalized humility in his life and would live this gift in a specific manner within the Church.¹⁷⁶ The *Autobiography* is Ignatius' way of sharing this gift with others.

Ignatius appreciated the gift that humility represented, and he made it a primary emphasis of his spirituality. It had to be difficult for an individual as conscious of his reputation as Ignatius was to share his failings with friends who admired him. (However) Ignatius did so to help others. Nonetheless, Ignatius had learned to share with discerning discretion and not with scrupulous guilt or false humility.¹⁷⁷

Ignatius went beyond internalizing humility in his own life, and understood it in an apostolic context – as a response to the needs of the universal Church.¹⁷⁸ For Ignatius,

precedieron en la voluntad de crecer compartiendo una misma misión, la de Cristo, y se afanaron por formar un solo cuerpo apostólico.'

¹⁷⁴ The vision of a Church being primarily poor and self-giving as expressed in Vat. II finds its echo in the ecclesiological perspective of Ignatian spirituality. (IBID., p. 14.)

¹⁷⁵ LG, 1,8.

¹⁷⁶ The importance of an adequate internalization can be seen in the failures and success that Ignatius experienced in relation to forming a group of persons. During the period immediately after his return from the Holy Land his attempt to form a group was a failure. A great deal of emphasis was placed in an external display of humility by focusing on their attire – a manner which led the ecclesial authorities to make critical observations. Ignatius' spiritual maturity coincided with the emergence of a stable group in Paris was undoubtedly. Various factors were responsible for this success, but an important factor was undoubtedly the internalization of an experience of poverty and humility in their personal lives.

¹⁷⁷ McMANAMON, JOHN M. *The Text and Contexts...*, pp. 115-16.

¹⁷⁸ The appropriate place for the Church is to be in those situations where there is humiliation, injustice and suffering. In this way it participates in the condition of Christ. The motivation in order to choose such situations lies in a closer following of Christ poor and humble. (Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. "Iglesia, sentir y...", pp. 253, 258.) '*La Iglesia es más*

the apostolic dimension of humility contained a passive as well as an active dimension. The passive dimension consisted in identifying with a Church which shared in the brokenness, vulnerability and suffering of all reality. The active dimension on the other hand consisted in understanding humility as a potent force which would help overcome the scourge of sin and suffering.¹⁷⁹ Ignatius understood humility as a means of creatively responding to the constant labouring love of the Triune God in all creation.¹⁸⁰ This humble response of Ignatius all through his life reveals to us the mystical relationship between an ecclesial context and an authentic participation in the Triune God.

La mística de Ignacio es inseparable de la Iglesia. Para Ignacio la Iglesia tiene una dimensión trinitaria radical: es obra de Dios a través de sus dos “manos”, la misión del Hijo y la del Espíritu. La Iglesia es Cristocéntrica, Esposa de Cristo, y es Pneumatológica, está animada por el Espíritu (cf. Ej 353 y 365). Es, pues, en el mismo centro de su experiencia mística del Espíritu y su unión con Cristo donde vive la realidad de la Iglesia, desde dentro y, por lo tanto, “en” la Iglesia. Desde aquí se comprende su gran amor y fidelidad a la Iglesia, siempre en relación al misterio que le da vida al cual ella nos dirige.¹⁸¹

Ignatius was a realist and like his contemporaries saw the ills that plagued the Church. However his spiritual experience allowed him to transcend the humiliations that manifested itself in the Church to see it as the spouse of Christ. An enlightened reflection of his ecclesial experience would better help him to understand the humility of God – a God who continues to reveal an abiding faithfulness and eternal love through a Church which was at the same time holy and sinful. This mystical understanding would

ella misma en los contextos donde el Cuerpo de Cristo es más maltratado, humillado y ultrajado, e irá perdiendo identidad y sentido en la medida en que por diversas e insuficientes justificaciones vaya alejándose de los contextos de humildad [Ej 167]. ...Por Esposa, una de las mayores responsabilidades que tiene la Iglesia es mantener despierta su dimensión sentiente hacia los lugares de presencia del Esposo, de manera especial donde Éste es maltratado o injuriado en los más pequeños y sencillos.'

¹⁷⁹ Ignatius does not offer an explicit theological foundation to his ecclesiology because he was more concerned about an authentic conviction of belonging to the Church. This deep sense of belonging to the Church does not take away the tensions lived by a believer. (Cf. RAMBLA, JOSEP M. “Del gentilhomme Íñigo a San Ignacio de Loyola...”, pp. 123, 125.)

¹⁸⁰ Participation in the laboring love of God could also mean going against the desire of Church authorities as seen in the case of Francis Borgia. Ignatius went against the decision of the Church authorities who wanted to make Borgia a cardinal arguing that his opposition was in order to be more faithful in following Christ poor and humble. (Cf. MOLINA, DIEGO. “Y que militen...”, p. 164.)

¹⁸¹ RAMBLA, JOSEP M. “Del gentilhomme Íñigo a San Ignacio de Loyola...”, p. 118.

allow Ignatius and his companions to totally surrender themselves in the service to the Church to be sent on whatever mission the Vicar of Christ desired.

4.4 LA STORTA AND IDENTIFICATION WITH CHRIST POOR AND HUMBLE

We now come towards the end of the *Autobiography* where Ignatius speaks about the mystical experience at La Storta.¹⁸² This was a unique experience and is of enormous significance both for Ignatius and the Society of Jesus.¹⁸³ At La Storta Ignatius had a mystical experience of being placed with Christ who identifies with the suffering of all humanity. He was placed by God the Father with Christ carrying the Cross and was granted the grace of being able to participate in the ongoing Passion of Christ.¹⁸⁴ This mystical experience was the fulfilment of his ardent desire as expressed in the specific petition to the Blessed Virgin in the colloquy of the Two Standards¹⁸⁵ - a petition wherein he desired to be 'placed with Christ'.

At La Storta, Ignatius' desire to imitate Christ poor and humble was united in a unique way to the mystery of God's humility and self-emptying love. His life preceding the mystical experience was a preparation for this moment. By this period he had

¹⁸² The experience at La Storta, consists in a mystical experience of Ignatius in a chapel about 14 kilometers from Rome. Though the first written evidence of this experience can be seen in the *Spiritual Journal*, (23rd Feb, 1544), it is believed that this experience took place towards the end of 1537 – probably in the month of October. (Cf. ALFONSO, HERBERT. "La Storta", *DEI*, p. 1091.); (Cf. DIEGO, LUIS DE. "'Vio tan claramente que Dios lo ponía con Su Hijo...'. La visión de La Storta en la vida de San Ignacio y en la espiritualidad ignaciana", *Manresa* – 333, 2012, p. 319.)

¹⁸³ Pedro Arrupe summarizes the main points of the vision at La Storta in an article on the trinitarian inspiration of the Ignatian charism. (Cf. ARRUPE, PEDRO. "Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian charism", *Studies in the Spirituality of the Jesuits* – 33/3, 2001, pp. 22-23.) This article has been recently published in Spanish in the following book: ARRUPE, PEDRO. *Pedro Arrupe, carisma de Ignacio*, (Ed. Mollá Llácer, Dario), Mensajero - Sal Terrae - U.P.Comillas: Bilbao – Santander – Madrid, 2015.)

¹⁸⁴ This event is explained by various persons who formed the early Society of Jesus. Ignatius himself speaks about in the *Spiritual Journal* and narrates it in his *Autobiography*. Hugo Rahner in an important work on the vision of La Storta indicates that the fundamental and important experience for Ignatius was to have been placed with Christ. The other details of what was said and by whom were only complementary to the main grace. (Cf. RAHNER, HUGO. *The Vision of St. Ignatius in the Chapel of La Storta*, (Tr. Brennan, Robert O.), CIS: Rome, 1975, pp. 50-52.)

¹⁸⁵ The colloquy begins with Our Lady but in ascending order is made to the Son and finally to the Father. In the first colloquy to Our Lady the following is said: 'A Colloquy should be made with Our Lady. I beg her to obtain for me grace from her Son and Lord that I may be received under his standard.' (*SpEx* 147) This will be followed by the desire for poverty, insults and humiliations. The next colloquy is made to the Son where the following is said: 'It will be to ask the same grace from the Son, that he may obtain it for me from the Father.' The third and final colloquy is the Father who is the one who grants this grace where the exercitant is invited to 'ask the same grace from the Father, that he may grant it to me.'

already been ordained a priest, but had not yet celebrated his first Mass. In explaining this mystical experience we shall follow the pattern of the previous stages. We shall begin by indicating the actual experiences of humility in the life of Ignatius – experiences that prepared him for this experience. This will be followed by a reflection on the humility of God as revealed in this vision and finally we shall end by analysing the response of Ignatius.

4.4.1 THE ACTUAL EXPERIENCE OF HUMILITY

The period from Ignatius' stay in Azpeitia until his the final offering before the Holy Father was a period of growing humility. Though his plans were failing, what stood out in his behaviour were the choices to live a life of humility and poverty. The focus of this section will undoubtedly be the mystical experience of being placed with Christ carrying the Cross – an experience by which he was led to an ever closer identification with the Kenosis of God. However this peak experience cannot be seen in isolation and has to be seen as part of an ongoing spiritual process. We shall thus elaborate four important moments of actual humility during this period – in Azpeitia, Vicenza, La Storta and Rome. In elaborating these moments we shall dwell at length on the actual experience of La Storta.

On the advice of doctors, Ignatius left Paris in 1535 in order to spend some time in his home town of Azpeitia. Despite being a Master from Paris, he entered Azpeitia dressed as a poor person.¹⁸⁶ His choice to live a life of poverty and be open to humiliations was manifest in the fact that he did not live in his house, but in the Hospital of the Magdalena. This choice was part of a deeply penetrating spiritual intuition which is articulated in the meditation of the two standards.¹⁸⁷ During this period he begged for his food, slept on the floor and wore a hairshirt. His humility was not limited to a

¹⁸⁶ Cf. GARCÍA HERNÁN, ENRIQUE. *Ignacio de Loyola...*, p. 229. '*...entro en España no vestido como maestro o estudiante, sino como pobre, con tela pardilla, la más pobre...*'

¹⁸⁷ José Romero in explain the relationship between the meditation of the two standards and the vision at La Storta as the most penetrating and intuitive meditations – in fact the most important meditation of the Spiritual Exercises. We shall return to this point at a later stage of this section. (Cf. ROMERO, JOSÉ J. "Ser puesto con el Hijo hoy, un Hijo "cargado con la Cruz..."", *Manresa* – 333, 2012, p. 340.

personal witness but took on an active dimension too in the form of an involvement with concrete issues that affected the people. He engaged in educating people in matters related to the Christian doctrine, took steps in order to ensure a better moral life among the faithful and also helped resolve the conflict between the convent and the parish.¹⁸⁸ Despite his weak health as well as the protestations of his brother he gave witness of a life of poverty and humility during his arrival, departure as well as the period of his stay in Azpeitia.¹⁸⁹

Before elaborating the second period in Vicenza, we would like to highlight a few moments in the intervening period which are important to understand the spiritual itinerary of Ignatius. Before reaching Bologna he experienced a moment of intense danger. Going beyond the literal interpretation of this incident, it could be considered as a symbolic representation of his internal struggle between vainglory and humility.¹⁹⁰ Later in Venice he would humbly disagree with Caraffa and this disagreement would lead to various tense moments in the future.¹⁹¹ Finally the decision to abstain from going to Rome with other companions in order to ask for permission to go the Holy Land¹⁹² was an indication of how true humility manifests itself in prudence.

¹⁸⁸ He dedicated himself to teaching catechism and preached to adults in the shrine of the La Magdalena. He also preached on Sundays at the parish Church and many were moved by his preaching. In his attempts to reform the moral fabric he began with his own family and later on asked the governor to enact a law regarding concubinage. He ensured that the Church bells were rung so that the faithful prayed the Angelus, took steps to eradicate gambling and began a foundation which took care of the needs of poor beggars. (Au. 87-89) He also helped resolve the conflict between the convent of the Immaculate Conception and the parish and was one of the signatories of the final agreement. (Cf. DE DALMASES, CÁNIDIDO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, pp. 129-30.) (Cf. FD, pp. 397-460.)

¹⁸⁹ In this part of the *Autobiography* (Au. 87-89) we have five references to his brother who tries to dissuade him from his endeavors. His 'brother sent servants to meet him'; they were 'insistent about taking him to his brother's house'; 'his brother strongly objected' to Ignatius teaching Christian doctrine; 'many came continually to hear him; and even his brother' and finally as he was leaving Azpeitia, 'his brother was very upset, and ashamed that he should go on foot.'

¹⁹⁰ The reference is to an incident related in the *Autobiography* (Au. 91,¹⁻⁵). In Bologna, Ignatius experienced the slippery slope of pride. The *Autobiography* indicates that the path whereby one desires to follow Christ is wrought with perils. (Cf. BOYLE, MARJORIE O'ROURKE. *Loyola's Acts – The Rhetoric of the Self...*, p. 161.) The fall at Bologna reveals the struggle for humility over vainglory. (Cf. MCMANAMON, JOHN M. *The Text and ...*, p. 45.)

¹⁹¹ In order to understand the animosity the letter written by Ignatius to Caraffa is illuminating. (Cf. *Letters of St. Ignatius of Loyola*, (Tr. Young, William J.), Loyola University Press: Chicago, 1959, pp. 28-31.)

¹⁹² Ignatius did not go to Rome because he was apprehensive of Dr. Ortiz (from Paris) and Cardinal Caraffa (Au93⁵) who had been upset with his letter regarding poverty. (Cf. IBID.)

The second period where he chose to live a life of poverty and humility was the time spent at Vicenza.¹⁹³ Being unable to go to the Holy Land, Ignatius, Faber and Laínez went to Vicenza. They stayed in an abandoned monastery situated in the outskirts of the city and decided to dedicate the first forty days wholly to prayer. They chose to beg for food and lived a life of great austerity and prayer. Despite physical hardships, Ignatius received abundant consolations. His internal experience of being united with the poor and humble Christ¹⁹⁴ can be seen in a letter written to Pietro Contarini in August, 1537.

So far, by God's favour we have enjoyed good health, and daily experience the truth of having nothing yet possessing all things; all the things, I mean, that the Lord promised to those who seek first the kingdom of God and His justice. Now, if everything will be added to them who first seek the kingdom of God and His justice, can they who seek nothing but the justice of the Kingdom and His kingdom be lacking; in anything. ...I mean, they who are not divided, they who have both eyes fixed on heaven. May He grant us this grace, He who, when He was rich in all things, stripped Himself of all for our instruction; He who, although in the glory of omnipotence and omniscience and infinite goodness, made Himself subject to the power, the judgment, and the will of the lowliest of creatures, man..¹⁹⁵

In October, 1537 it was evident that their plan to go the Holy Land had failed for the current year and they met in Vicenza to decide upon the future course of action.¹⁹⁶ Ignatius, Laynez and Faber were to go to Rome and it was during this journey that

¹⁹³ After reaching Venice on 8th January, 1537 the companions found accommodation in two hospitals and they devoted themselves to the service of the sick. Later on during their sojourn in Rome the Pope heard them discourse on theological topics and was much pleased. After receiving the permission of the Pope to go to the Holy Land and the permission to receive the sacred orders from any bishop they returned to Venice in May 1537. Since no ship sailed for the Holy Land the members of the group who were not yet ordained were conferred the orders on 24th June, 1537. In order to make use of the time, they then decided to go to the various cities of the Republic of Venice to prepare themselves for their first mass and engage in whatever apostolate was possible. (Cf. DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, pp. 147.)

¹⁹⁴ Cf. RAHNER, HUGO. *The Vision of...*, p. 36.

¹⁹⁵ Cf. *Letters of St. Ignatius of Loyola*, (Tr. Young, William J.),..., p. 31

¹⁹⁶ FN – IV, pp. 265-267. “*Todos los nuevos sacerdotes avían dicho ya la primera missa, si no sólo nuestro Ignacio que le tenía por decir. En esta junta que aquí hizieron acordaron que, pues la esperanza de ir a Jerusalén se les yva cada día acabando más, se repartiesen por las Universidades más insignes de Italia, donde estaba la flor de los buenos ingenios y letras, para ver si Dios nuestro Señor sería servido de despertar algunos mancebos hábiles, de los muchos que en la Universidades se suelen criar, y traerlos al mismo instituto de vida que ellos seguían en beneficio de sus próximos.*”

Ignatius had the famous vision at La Storta.¹⁹⁷ By this time Ignatius had been ordained a priest but had not yet celebrated his First Mass. Despite the fact that he was unsure about his future, he had an abundance of spiritual graces during this period. (*Au 95*³) The vision at La Storta where he was placed with Christ carrying the cross was a moment of confirmation for Ignatius regarding the course of his life.¹⁹⁸

Since the mystical aspects of this vision will be elaborated later, for the moment it will suffice to indicate the actual details of the vision as communicated by different persons. Besides the dimension of Ignatius' humility will also be highlighted. The first written reference to this event can be found in the *Spiritual Journal*. However Ignatius also spoke about this matter to Laynez¹⁹⁹ and Faber who were accompanying him and at a later date to Gonçalves de Câmara. (*Au 96*³⁻⁴) Given the importance of this experience we can safely assume that he spoke about this vision to others. Other persons who were knew about this experience included Nadal,²⁰⁰ Polanco,²⁰¹ Ribadeneira²⁰² and Canisius.²⁰³ The vision has two parts – an auditive part as well as a visual part, both of which are secondary to the primary experience of being placed with Christ carrying the Cross.²⁰⁴

The humility of Ignatius is seen in the fact that this grace is a gift given to him – he

¹⁹⁷ André Ravier prefers to call this vision as a series of vision. He bases himself on the testimony of Laynez who indicated that for several days, Ignatius felt the Father saying, 'I will be favorable...'. (Cf. RAVIER, ANDRÉ. *Ignatius of Loyola ...*, p. 425.)

¹⁹⁸ Pedro Arrupe in the article 'Trinitarian inspiration...' refers to the section related to *La Storta* as 'Acceptance and Confirmation at *La Storta*'. It refers to an acceptance of Ignatius by the Triune God to serve Them and a confirmation of the path that Ignatius desired to adopt to serve Them – a path which consisted in offering themselves to the Roman Pontiff. (Cf. ARRUPÉ, PEDRO. "Trinitarian Inspiration...", p. 18.)

¹⁹⁹ *FN – II*, p. 133.

²⁰⁰ *MNad, XIV*, p. 649; *MNad, V*, p. 136.

²⁰¹ *FN – II*, p. 595.

²⁰² *FN – IV*, p. 268.

²⁰³ *FN – IV*, pp. 946-48.

²⁰⁴ The auditive part consists in the words spoken directly to Ignatius and the dialogue between the Father and the Son. According to Hugo Rahner it seems more likely that the words heard by Ignatius were 'I will be favorable to you in Rome'. He analyses the three possible statements and suggests that this would be the most accurate. (Cf. RAHNER, HUGO. *The Vision of...*, p. 67.) In the dialogue between the Father and the Son we have to rely on the account of Laynez. He said that in response to Ignatius' petition, the Father took the initiative and told the Son, "I want you to take this man for your servant" to which the Son replied by looking at Ignatius and saying, "I want you to serve us." The visual part consisted in a vision where 'it seemed to him he saw Christ carrying a cross on his shoulder and the Eternal Father nearby...' (Cf. *FN – II*, p. 133.)

can only ask for it in all humility.²⁰⁵ Thus he is emphatic in stating that he had been 'placed' by God the Father with Christ carrying the Cross.²⁰⁶ The place where this experience took place was a simple, nondescript and little known chapel.²⁰⁷ The humility which envelops this experience is further augmented by the fact that he was not entering Rome as a triumphant missionary or great reformer, but as a failure. His plans had failed and an uncertain future faced him. (*Au* 97¹) One wonders the future if Ignatius had been able to reach Jerusalem as a spiritual crusader and had engaged in some form ministry! However that was not to be and as he would be on the threshold of founding the Society of Jesus, he found himself as a person whose personal plans and designs had failed.²⁰⁸

The period following the mystical experience at La Storta was also one of humiliation in Rome. Despite the fact that Ignatius was engaged in a fruitful ministry, and the companions were held in esteem,²⁰⁹ they had to face a series of calumnies of which they were exonerated.²¹⁰ Sometime later there was a resurgence of the smear campaign and Ignatius ensured that a judicial sentence was passed against his detractors.²¹¹ Despite the humiliations and persecutions, Ignatius and his companions

²⁰⁵ In this experience, Ignatius could only ardently desire for the grace. However it was the Father who took the initiative and the Son accepted him leading to an inner transformation in him. (Cf. ARRUIPE, PEDRO. *En Él Solo... La Esperanza – Selección de textos sobre el Corazón de Jesús*, p. 15.)

²⁰⁶ Cf. DIVARKAR, PARMANANDA. "La Storta y el carisma jesuítico", *Manresa* – 224, 1988, p. 243.

²⁰⁷ Hugo Rahner in describing this chapel indicates that La Storta is about three hours from the city and 'not far from the road, stood a half-ruined oratory.' (Cf. RAHNER, HUGO. *The Vision of...*, pp. 28-29.)

²⁰⁸ Ignatius has burnt his boats and had almost definitively given up the Jerusalem project. (Cf. DIEGO, LUIS DE. "Vio tan claramente...", p. 325.)

²⁰⁹ After arriving in Rome in November, 1537, the companions of Ignatius, Laínez and Faber began teaching in the *La Sapienza*. From time to time Pope Paul III invited them along with other theologians to hold disputations in his presence. Ignatius concentrated on giving the Exercises to various persons and these included eminent individuals of the Church.

²¹⁰ 'Miguel began to give trouble and to speak badly of the pilgrim, who caused him to be summoned before the governor... The governor examined Miguel, and ended by banishing him from Rome.' (*Au*. 99, 4-5) Writing to Isabel Roser he would say, 'In fact, the affair has taken on such proportions that during eight whole months we have had to undergo the most violent opposition or persecution that we have ever experienced in our lives.' (*Saint Ignatius of Loyola – Personal Writings*, (Tr. Endean, Philip – Munitiz, Joseph), Suffolk: Penguin Books, 2004, p. 150.)

²¹¹ As the second phase of the persecutions began with the smear campaign of Mudarra, Barreda and his friends (*Au*. 98,6), Ignatius took the matter to Cardinal Caraffa who was Pope Paul III's delegate in Rome (*Au*. 98,8) and asked him to formally investigate the case and pass sentence. The adversaries changed their stance and Ignatius was asked to let

attended to those in need by engaging in various acts of mercy in Rome.²¹²

Through personal experiences of humility and humiliation, Ignatius was becoming a person more in tune to the promptings of the Spirit. His plans and desires did fail, but the Papal clause would now be a guiding light for the future. Realizing that it would be impossible to go to the Holy Land, he and his companions offered themselves to the Holy Father in November, 1538.²¹³ The Pope accepted the humble and sincere offering made by them and in a short time began to send them on different missions throughout Europe and other parts of the world. The experience of La Storta was an important milestone in his spiritual journey which would affect him internally and externally. In speaking of his ongoing spiritual itinerary, Nadal said:

Ignatius was following the Spirit, he was not running ahead of it. And yet he was being led gently, whither he did not know. He was not intending at that time to found the Order. Little by little, though, the road was opening up before him and he was moving along it, wisely ignorant, with his heart placed very simply in Christ.²¹⁴

4.4.2 THE HUMILITY OF GOD

The *experience of God's humility* takes on a new mystical dimension in this phase of Ignatius' life. By being placed with Christ at La Storta he was granted a special grace to participate in the Triune God's Passion in today's world. This experience was related to

the matter rest. However Ignatius was firm that a sentence be passed and met the Pope regarding this matter who gave orders to the governor of Rome to conduct an investigation (*Au. 98,10*). In the summer of 1538, the governor began summoning various individuals regarding the case. Providentially all those who investigated him on earlier occasions were present in Rome. Their testimonies and were absolute proof of his innocence and their lives and doctrine were not only free of any error, but were an edifying example of Christian life. Ignatius made copies of the sentence and sent it to all the possible places where the false accusations and rumors would have reached. A letter dated 2nd, February, 1539 that was sent to his brother Martin in Loyola refers to a copy of the same. (Cf. *Letters of St. Ignatius of Loyola*, (Tr. Young, William J.), pp. 38-39.)

²¹² In October the same year, the group had moved to a new house. The winter of 1538-39 was severe and Ignatius and his companions gave aid to nearly 3000 persons. They provided them food, shelter and sleeping places. Besides the material aid, they also instructed them in Christian doctrine and engaged in other priestly ministries. (Cf. DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, pp. 164.)

²¹³ *Beato Pedro Fabro, En el Corazón de la Reforma – «Recuerdos espirituales» del Beato Pedro Fabro, SJ.* (Ed. Albuquerque, Antonio.), Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2000, p. 121. "...ese mismo año en que se dictó sentencia absolutoria a nuestro favor, nos presentásemos como holocausto al Sumo Pontífice Paulo III, para que determinase en qué podíamos servir a Dios, para la edificación de todos los que están bajo la potestad de la Sede Apostólica..."

²¹⁴ FN – II, pp. 251-53.

his vision at Manresa where 'everything seemed new to him.' (*Au 30²*)²¹⁵ Once again at La Storta, his worldview seemed to find new meaning in the redemptive passion of the Holy Trinity. Christ carrying the Cross reveals a God who responds passively and actively to a creation which groans for fulfilment and desires definitive reconciliation. The experience was so overwhelming that with total confidence in God he reverentially and humbly once again made an oblation of himself.

*For now the Lord has spoken, who formed me as his servant from the womb,
That Jacob may be brought back to him and Israel gathered to him;
I am honoured in the sight of the Lord and God is now my strength! (Is. 49,5)*

This text from the Suffering Servant of Isaiah synthesizes the redemptive and reconciliatory mission of Christ and Ignatius' privileged participation in it. In elaborating the present point related to God's humility we shall begin by highlighting how the Cross of Christ reveals the passive and active dimension of Christ's ongoing Passion. This will be followed by a few comments on the specific biblical image of Christ as manifest in the life of Ignatius. Subsequently we shall offer some comments on the centrality of the Cross in order to understand the humility of God. Finally we shall end with some concluding comments related to the Trinitarian mysticism in the vision at La Storta.

The active dimension of God's humility is revealed in a God who participates in the life of the poor, humble, suffering and marginalized in a respectful manner without being condescending or paternalistic.²¹⁶ God's ardent desire to empty Himself in order that all reality may be reconciled in God is constantly seen in word and deed.²¹⁷ It is manifest when food is given to the hungry; water is given to the thirsty; clothes given to

²¹⁵ ALFONSO, HERBERT. "La Storta", *DEI*, p. 1095. '*Aunque es cierto que, juntamente con la gracia de LS., la experiencia del Cardoner en Manresa en 1522 o 1523 está también a la raíz del carisma jesuítico, en realidad LS es, en un sentido profundo, el desplegarse y profundizarse del Cardoner.*'

²¹⁶ A detailed explanation of the humility of Christ during his public life has been offered in the first chapter. This could be expanded whereby one can see the revelation of God who participates in the historical process of the world by having a cursory glance at the entire history of salvation.

²¹⁷ *Col. 1,20; 2 Cor. 5,18-19.* The reconciliation of all through word, but more so through deed (*1 Jn. 3,18*) is also alluded to in the Contemplation to Attain Love which says that '*Love ought to manifest itself more by deeds than by words.*' (*SpEx 230.*)

the naked and the shelter given to the homeless... in fact in any initiative which is undertaken to restore the dignity of the human person as a child of God. Ignatius realized that true discipleship consisted in actively working towards a life of humility which manifest itself in an every deepening relationship with God and commitment towards others.²¹⁸

The passive dimension of God's humility reveals the immensity of God's eternal and gratuitous love and is seen in the fact that God identifies with the human situation of vulnerability. The source of this humility is in the eternal gratuitous love of God which is faithful and empties itself totally for the other without requiring any assurance or guarantee.²¹⁹ Spiritual writers down the centuries have indicated that the passive dimension of God humility is a greater revelation of God's love than the miracles and other signs. The mystical experience of Jesus carrying the cross is in fact the humility of God in its most profound and passive dimension where God in God's love totally identifies with those who endure injustices, insults, sufferings and humiliations.²²⁰

The experience of La Storta confirmed his ongoing spiritual experience which was rooted in the biblical image of Christ who constantly revealed and continues to reveal the true image of God.²²¹ The Incarnation, infancy, public life, Passion, death and resurrection revealed an active and passive fidelity of Christ to the will of God. This fidelity took concrete form in the humility and poverty of Christ. Christ who was thus contemplated by Ignatius in the Spiritual Exercises and on various other occasions

²¹⁸ CSDC, 40.

²¹⁹ Passivity is not laziness or false resignation, but is an attitude of letting go of one's self and accepting the will of God trusting in God's Providence. In a passive conformity to God's will the focus is on both the external acceptance, but more importantly the internal attitude. The internal attitude is one whereby there is a union of God's will and our own will. Such was the attitude of Jesus. (Cf. LIGUORI, ALPHONSUS DE. *Uniformity with God's Will*, (Tr. Thomas W. Tobin), A Lamppost Book: Michigan, 2009, p. 11.)

²²⁰ The identification of God with the human condition has been dealt with in the fourth chapter in 4.1 & 4.2. Further on in the 7th chapter we shall deal with this point once again while elaborating the contemplation of the Incarnation. (*SpEx 101-109*)

²²¹ 'El Cristo de Ignacio es el Jesús pobre, humilde y humillado de los Evangelios.' (Cf. ROMERO, JOSÉ J. "Ser puesto con el Hijo ...", p. 339.) More specifically Ignatius primarily uses the gospels of Mathew and Luke in order to help the exercitant have a deeper experience of Christ poor and humble.

became real and alive in the poverty and humility he encountered in his milieu.²²²

The self-emptying love of Christ which found its maximum expression on the Cross revealed to him the totality of the Triune God's self-emptying love.²²³ The Cross was a privileged moment when this revelation reached its climax because the humiliated Christ hanging on the Cross reveals the glory of God.²²⁴ Paradoxically in the humility of the cross we have the maximum expression of love. Ignatius discovered that Christ who revealed the love of the Triune God was present at La Storta inviting him to identify with the will of the Father just as He identified with the Father.²²⁵

En el camino de Roma, cuando ya Jerusalén resulta imposible, en la Storta, S. Ignacio es puesto con el Hijo cargado con la Cruz. Ahora S. Ignacio sabrá ya para siempre que el camino de la libertad es el camino de la Cruz. ...S. Ignacio es recibido en el ámbito de la Trinidad Santa en cuyo seno se encuentra la Cruz que es el amor hasta el extremo, amor vivido en su vida y hasta el final por Jesús el Hijo.²²⁶

Ignatius discovered that the Cross was not an end, but a gateway into the

²²² The selection of mysteries from the life of Christ help a person better understand the mystical dimension of God's humility in its passive and active dimension. Contemplating the Last Supper, the Passion the Crucifixion and laying of Jesus' body in the tomb is a manner of understanding better the humility of God in its active and passive dimensions. Jesus actively manifests the humility of God through the washing of the feet, in offering Himself totally and sharing bread with one who would betray Him. The arrest of Jesus is an important moment of transition. From an active manifestation of humility we now have a manifestation of the humility of God primarily in a passive manner. Jesus is led through various situations where he is not fully in control of the circumstances. Despite insults and humiliations, nothing can exhaust His self-emptying love. In his humiliated state on the Cross He reveals the paradox of the strength of humility and the weakness of worldly power. The disfigured body of Jesus on the cross which passively identified with the situation of sin, suffering, humiliation and brokenness revealed the impassibility of God's eternal love and mercy.

²²³ Toni Catala highlights the centrality of the Cross, but within a Trinitarian dimensión. Understanding that Christ was sent by the Triune God is in his view a corrective to an exaggerated Christology from below and helps us to become humble. This is because the God revealed to us is a Trinitarian God and only within this perspective can we understand the mystery of Christ's humiliation and death on the Cross. The Cross reveals to us the essence of the life of Christ as one who was faithful to the sufferings of others. (Adaptation and interpretation from CATALÁ, TONI. "El seguimiento de Cristo, "enviado y disponible"", *Manresa* – 333, 2012, pp. 332-35.)

²²⁴ 'El Cristo glorioso es Aquel que se ha manifestado a San Ignacio en La Storta, llevando la cruz en la cual nos ha rescatado, es Aquel que nos ha manifestado sobre la cruz su Corazón atravesado, hoguera de amor.' (Cf. ARRUPE, PEDRO. *En Él Solo... La Esperanza – Selección de textos sobre el Corazón de Jesús*, Mensajero: Bilbao, 1984, p. 24)

²²⁵ 'The eternal Son reflects the beauty of the Father and becomes such an image of the Father that his own perfection is simply the perfection of the Father.' RAHNER, HUGO. *The Vision of...*, p. 86.

²²⁶ CATALÁ, TONI. "El seguimiento de Cristo...", pp. 336.

Trinitarian mystery of humble love.²²⁷ The Eternal Father is always behind the Cross and only in the background of Trinitarian mysticism do we understand the meaning of the grace to be placed with the Son.²²⁸ All reality proceeded from the Father and returns to the Father and only in this mysterious circular course does the Incarnation and the mission of Christ find its meaning.²²⁹ At La Storta Ignatius was invited to participate in the redemptive mission of the Triune God by being united with Christ poor and despised.²³⁰

Ignatius believed that the grace of being able to participate in the humility and poverty of Christ was the greatest blessing. The proud and self-centered knight at Pamplona had been won over by the humble self-emptying love of the Triune God. He was now a priest who was about to embark on a life-long ministry whereby a generous self-offering of himself would be made anew to the Eternal King. His original plans were being slowly transformed in order that they would be attuned to God's plans – plans which would be fructified by being constantly united to the poor and humble Christ.

In the mystically graced soul of Ignatius, who never lost through all the years the trinitarian graces of Manresa, great thoughts and plans were united to a deep unified "going to the Father through the poor Jesus." That is the mystical orientation of his soul. "To be placed with Christ" meant for him the greatest "service of the Father." And all this in an entirely new and elevated sense, now that he had become a priest. Into this mystical interior life with God now comes the Vision of La Storta or better, it simply is born out of this deep union with the trinitarian God.²³¹

4.4.3 THE CONSEQUENCES

Ignatius was confirmed by this experience. It was a grace that he had desired for a long

²²⁷ The two points that animate the Trinitarian mysticism is that the Father is the end and Christ is one who leads to the Father. It would be possible to understand the structure and wording of the Spiritual Exercises only if we placed ourselves in the mystical position of Ignatius and the Trinitarian contemplation. Though the goal of authentic discipleship was the imitation of Jesus, it was in view of being led to the Father. When Ignatius could not pray, it was through the humanity of Jesus that he would make a humble beginning and progress towards the Father. (Cf. RAHNER, HUGO. *The Vision of...*, pp. 79, 83, 88, 90.)

²²⁸ Cf. IBID., p. 91.

²²⁹ Cf. IBID., p. 77.

²³⁰ Cf. RAHNER, HUGO. *The Vision of...*, pp. 92-93.

²³¹ IBID., p. 99.

time. While he was confirmed on the one hand, he was unsure of interpreting it. In elaborating the *consequence* of the vision at La Storta we shall divide it into three parts. The consequences: a) for Ignatius b) for the Society of Jesus and c) for us today.

In the life of Ignatius, the experience at La Storta has a unique significance. On the one hand it is the climax of an experience,²³² and at the same time stands on the boundary between two mystical periods. It was the summary of the past and indicated the threshold of something new.²³³ The experience of being 'placed with Christ' was the final element of a long drawn process of discernment which began with an assurance since the call at Cardoner and offered a light for the future.

Ignatius, so favored with special gifts during those days, begs for that favor of being "placed with the Son," which will be for him a final element in his discernment, an assurance that since the generic call at the Cardoner he has been following the straight road, and a guiding light for the tasks that lie before him. If the Cardoner meant both a point of arrival and a starting point, the same and even more can be said of what is about to happen at La Storta²³⁴.

At La Storta, Ignatius discovered his specific vocation to be a companion of Christ²³⁵ and the Trinity accepted him as a companion. He was accepted into the circle of Trinitarian life and from here was sent out on mission.²³⁶ The meaningfulness of his life would consist in henceforth serving the Divine Trinity through a life of service towards those in need.²³⁷

²³² La Storta is at the end of a specific dimension of Ignatius' journey. His journey would continue for yet another 19 years, but that would be a journey which was less of an individual nature, but one that was intertwined with the history of the Society of Jesus. In that sense it could be said that La Storta is the 'starting-point of the Society Ignatius founded, and at the fountainhead of its inmost spirit.' (Cf. ALFONSO, HERBERT. "La Storta – Its Foundational Significance for Ignatian Spirituality", *CIS*, 1988, p. 84.)

²³³ 'Hence the vision of La Storta stands on the boundary between two mystical periods. It is a milestone on the mystical ascent of the saint's soul. And it all hangs together; the vision of La Storta is not only in its content the beginning of a new life. In its psychological aspects it is also a summary of the past and a guidepost for the future. RAHNER, HUGO. *The Vision of...*, p. 112.

²³⁴ ARRUIPE, PEDRO. "Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism", *Studies* – 33/3, 2001, p. 19.

²³⁵ Cf. DIEGO, LUIS DE. "'Vio tan claramente...'", p. 320.

²³⁶ 'En La Storta Ignacio siente hondamente que su vocación es la de ser compañero de Jesús y que la Trinidad lo acepta para que la sirva como servidor de Jesús. Es el mismo Eterno Padre quien imprime en el alma de Ignacio esta aceptación y le promete su especial protección.' Cf. ARRUIPE, PEDRO. *En Él Solo... La Esperanza – Selección de textos sobre el Corazón de Jesús...*, p. 15.

²³⁷ Ignatius and his companions would engage in a great deal of charity in Rome. In order to get a good account of the kind of Rome that Ignatius and his companions were approaching we have a good summary of Tellechea. (Cf.

The importance of this vision for the Society of Jesus was foundational.²³⁸ At La Storta was born a future life of service and mission of the Society of Jesus.²³⁹ With Ignatius, all those who form part of the Society of Jesus have also been placed with the Son for the sake of service.²⁴⁰ The unique charism of service is found in the very words that form the dialogue between the Father and the Son. A second foundational element of this vision in terms of the Society was the confirmation of the name by which they would call themselves. Ignatius was convinced that the Society was to carry the name of Jesus.²⁴¹ So firm was his conviction that he said that only God could make him change his mind.²⁴²

Thirdly it can be said that the mystical experience of La Storta continues to be significant for each person because it intimately associates a person with Christ's redemptive as it continues even today.²⁴³ It is not a vision for us to stand and contemplate, but is to be a guiding light to help us contemplate the world we live in.²⁴⁴ The constant call to a person who belongs to the Society is basically an invitation to live the descendent dynamic of the two standards in the manner of Christ.²⁴⁵ The grace of La Storta transforms a person by recreating the faculties leading to greater love of the

TELLECHEA IDÍGORAS, JOSÉ IGNACIO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, pp. 394-97.) Ignatius was already living a life of service, but was fearful as he was entering Rome. Due to this he told Laynez that he expected to be crucified in Rome. (Cf. *FN-II*, p. 133.)

²³⁸ ARRUIPE, PEDRO. "Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian Charism", *Studies* – 33/3, 2001, p. 22. The two fundamental elements consisted in the conviction that God had brought them together and that the name of the group should contain the name 'Jesus.'

²³⁹ GC 35, d.2/11.

²⁴⁰ Cf. ALFONSO, HERBERT. "La Storta – Its Foundational Significance ...", pp. 79-80.

²⁴¹ Cf. DIEGO, LUIS DE. "Vio tan claramente...", p. 326.

²⁴² Cf. POLANCO, JUAN DE. *Sumario* –86; *FN* – 1, p. 203ff. as quoted in ARRUIPE, PEDRO. "Trinitarian Inspiration...", p. 22.

²⁴³ Cf. ALFONSO, HERBERT. "The Jesuit/Ignatian Charism – A Personal synthesis and tribute to Fr. P. Arrupe", *Review of Ignatian Spirituality* – 116, 2007, p. 51. 'Ignatius was "placed with the Son", that is, he was intimately associated with Jesus Christ in his redemptive work which is still taking place in the world and in the Church today, to the ever greater glory of God the Father.'

²⁴⁴ GARCÍA, JOSÉ ANTONIO. "Presentación", *Manresa* – 333, 2012, p. 317. He goes on to say that the circumstances in which we live may have changed, but the moot question remains, "Is my desire to be placed with Christ still alive?"

²⁴⁵ The descendent dynamic of the meditation of the Two Standards is not compatible with the upward mobility advocated by the world. According to Romero, this meditation is the most penetrative and intuitive meditation of the Spiritual Exercises. In further elaborating the normal human tendency of unwillingness to participate in the descent of God, he gives the example of Pedro who desired to remain on top of the mount after the transfiguration. (Cf. ROMERO, JOSÉ J. "Ser puesto con el Hijo ...", p. 339.)

Trinity, Christ, others and the Church.²⁴⁶

The mystical experience of La Storta would be the background within which Ignatius and his companions would meet the Pope in order to offer themselves totally for any mission he deemed fit. With his blessings, they would go on to have the deliberations of 1539 where the unique charism they desired to live would be articulated more clearly. Throughout the life of Ignatius as well as the history of the Society of Jesus, the vision at La Storta would be a point of reference. The grace of this mystical experience would continue to illumine Ignatius during his years as general of the Society, throughout the history of the Society of Jesus as well as the life of every single Jesuit to this very day.

CONCLUSION

The spiritual journey until the mystical experience at La Storta allowed Ignatius to have a growing internal experience of how the personal, redemptive and gratuitous love of the Triune God has been manifest in the humility of Christ and continues to be present in a privileged manner in the humility and poverty of the world. The experience would so fill him with gratitude that as a loving response he would desire nothing but an absolute and wholehearted imitation of Christ poor and humble. The desire would be actualized through concrete choices – choices which were arrived at after a process of discernment. As Ignatius progressed in spiritual life, he desired more and more to imitate Christ and welcomed the trials and humiliations that came his way due to his commitment to the Kingdom of God. His desire had been transformed to such an extent that he no longer desired to live for himself but only longed to distinguish himself by imitating Christ poor and humble by labouring under the standard of the Eternal King.

The various phases of Ignatius' life indicate some unique patterns which helped him to move from self-love to self-emptying love. As he went ahead in life, he realized

²⁴⁶ Cf. ARRUIPE, PEDRO. *En Él Solo... La Esperanza – Selección de textos sobre el Corazón de Jesús...*, p. 17. Arrupe in speaking about transformation refers to a quote from Nadal which says, "*que entendamos por su entendimiento, queramos por su voluntad, recordemos por su memoria, y que todo nuestro ser, nuestro vivir y obrar no esté en nosotros sino en Cristo.*" (MHSI - Vol. 90, p. 122).

the subtle ways in which his self-love re-emerged in order to enslave him. At the same time he realized the means of moving ahead on the path of self-emptying love through an ongoing and ever greater openness to the Spirit. The spiritual process we observe in the life of Ignatius reveal two transversal and simultaneous movements. On the one hand we see a great participation of Ignatius in the self-emptying love of the Triune God through a greater imitation of Christ. As he grew in humility, we find the second movement which consists in a widening circle of relationships – a movement by which his world-view became more inclusive.

Ignatius progressively discovered the redemptive value of humility. He had personally experienced the folly and destructive nature of pride and vainglory. The only antidote to it was by going diametrically against it by embracing poverty and humility through a radical imitation of Christ. He also discovered during the course of his spiritual itinerary that genuine humility had an inherent dynamic of being necessarily other centered. One who lived a life of humility longed to empty oneself for the other – and ardently desired to offer oneself as a gift to the other. Such humility was rooted in the very being of God. Ignatius who personally encountered the Triune God was transformed by the experience of God's humble love. This in turn led to a growing desire to offer himself in humble service towards others through fidelity to the mission entrusted by the Church.

The *Autobiography* of Ignatius ends with the initial period in Rome. However the spiritual journey continued until 1556 and during this period we find that there were various moments of humility in his life. He would have to face humiliations from within the Society as well as from outside. The next chapter will deal with the *Spiritual Journal*, a text which shows us that the process of growing in humility continued after the Society of Jesus was founded and he had been elected General. The text reveals how the Lord continued to open his eyes of understanding so as to aid him in his journey of love – a journey which would be fulfilled by a life of humble service.

CHAPTER 5

'LOVING HUMILITY' IN THE *SPIRITUAL DIARY*

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

The previous chapter elaborated the process of Ignatius' growth in humility as seen in the *Autobiography*. We shall now move on to another unique document called the *Spiritual Journal* which reveals to us the profound inner life of Ignatius.¹ This document reveals to us the mystical heights of Ignatius' spiritual experience, the high point of which consisted in the grace of growing in humble love towards God and towards all creation.

At this period of time it occurred to me that my humility, reverence and submission should be not of a man who fears but of a man who loves. So strongly did this impress itself on my soul that with great faith I said, "Give me a lover's humility," and so also concerning my reverence and submission. As I said the words, I experienced new visitations. So also I tried to check the tears in order to attend solely to this loving humility, etc.

¹ Other texts of Ignatius such as the *Autobiography*, *Spiritual Exercises*, *Constitutions*, *Letters*, etc. had been written with an external subject in mind. However the *Spiritual Diary* is written for Ignatius' own eyes. Hence this text gives us a glimpse into the internal realm of Ignatius. (Cf. IGNACIO DE LOYOLA. *Obras Completas* – San Ignacio de Loyola, (Ed. Iparraguirre, Ignacio – Jurado, Ruiz) BAC: Madrid, 2014, p. 271. (6th ed., 2nd print.) 'Nos encontramos delante del escrito que nos introduce más de lleno en el alma de San Ignacio. El panorama es de una grandiosidad de cumbres elevadísimas de la más sublime mística. ... Todavía ofrece otra ventaja no pequeña este singular documento. Al contrario de lo que sucede en los demás relatos, no se cuenta aquí casi ninguna acción externa, ningún hecho que distraiga la atención y oculte en lo más mínimo el interior del Santo. Nada impide aquí el que podamos contemplar su alma a plena luz.' From now this work will be called 'Iparraguirre/Jurado, BAC'.

Later in the day I felt great joy when I remembered this. I resolved not to stop there but afterwards to entertain the same sentiment, viz., that of loving humility, etc., towards creatures, unless on occasions it were for the honor of God Our Lord to conduct myself differently²

This chapter will be a continuation of the previous one and reaffirms the two fundamental elements of our thesis. Firstly, our basic premise that humility is a concrete expression of love and secondly that it played an important and transformative role in Ignatius' spiritual process. This chapter will begin with a general overview of the *Spiritual Diary* and will be followed by a textual analysis of the document. Subsequently the grace of humble love will be elaborated and finally we shall end with some comments of the mysticism of the *Spiritual Diary*.

5.1 THE *SPIRITUAL DIARY* – A UNIQUE TEXT

The immediate subject matter of the *SD*³ is that of poverty⁴ - a crucial aspect of spiritual life and religious life in particular. Ignatius was well aware of the risk involved in any laxity regarding poverty and feared the possible departure from the strict poverty that he and the companions had determined to practice.⁵ The uncertainty stemmed from the fact that while he understood the importance of poverty as a foundational element of the Society, he was also aware of the acute needs of funds and resources within the fledging Society of Jesus.⁶

² *SD*, 178-79. (All the quotes of the *Spiritual Diary* have been taken from IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA. *The Spiritual Diary of St. Ignatius*, (Ed. & Tr. Munitiz, Joseph A.), Inigo Enterprise: London, 1987, p. 67.) The italicized part is our emphasis.

³ Henceforth in the body of the text within this chapter, the *Spiritual Diary* will be indicated by the initials *SD*.

⁴ The imminent possibility of dispersion led to the Deliberations of 1539 and further on to the redaction of the Formula of the Institute where they decided to live a life of absolute poverty. (*MCo-I*, p. 19.) This decision of the first companions would be revised on March 4, 1541 when the companions would decide to accept fixed incomes. (*MCo-I*, p. 36.) Ignatius was unsure whether this decision had led to rescinding the original decision about poverty.⁴ It must be noted that on June, 1541, Pope Paul III through the Bull *Sacrosancte Romane Ecclesie*, (*MCo-I*, pp. 70-77.) had decided to give the Society of Jesus the Church of Our Lady of the Way. This was a Church which had fixed income and the situation that arose from the reception of this Church led to a conflict with the original decision on rents and fixed incomes.

⁵ Cf. IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA. *Ignatius of Loyola – Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works*, (Eds. Ganss, George – Malatesta, Edward), Paulist Press: New York, 1991, p. 219. This book will henceforth be referred as *GM – Paulist*.

⁶ 'En realidad Ignacio está muy necesitado de dinero en el momento de renunciar a tener rentas fijas. Por una parte, desde 1543, tiene la casa en obras, la primera de la Compañía. La habitará en setiembre de 1544, cuando aún no terminada, tiene ya más de

The text that makes up the *SD*⁷ contains Ignatius' notes from the 2nd of February, 1544 to the 27th of February, 1545.⁸ An additional text consists in Ignatius' deliberations on poverty in accordance with the third time of making a sound election.⁹ The *Spiritual Diary* was meant for personal use and hence consists in language which is not easy to interpret. It is well known that Ignatius' style was not easy to understand, and in this text it is more pronounced.¹⁰ The language is difficult because it is primarily a mystical text which linguistically tries to articulate Ignatius' relationship with God.

To study the *SD* merely as a literary text would be a futile exercise. This is because a mystical experience goes beyond the ambit of words.¹¹ Ignatius tried to be as careful in the choice of words, but on various occasions found himself up against the limited nature of linguistic tools.¹² It can be said that Ignatius' experience of God as reflected in the language of the *SD* has two inseparable dimensions which include: a) the question/search of Ignatius on the one part and b) the response of God on the other.¹³

treinta habitaciones. Por otra parte, el templo de la Strada se amplía sucesivamente para dar cabida a un público cada vez mayor. También debe proveer a la alimentación y estudios de numerosos candidatos que llaman a las puertas de la Compañía, la cual, a su vez, a penas tiene personal en activo para su trabajo apostólico y la captación de limosnas.' (THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. *La Intimidad del Peregrino – Diario espiritual de San Ignacio de Loyola, Versión y Comentarios*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 1998, p. 33.)

⁷ The *SD* consists of two sets of pages with the first set of 12 pages containing the annotations of 40 days from the 2nd of February to the 12th of March 1544. The second set of 12 pages contains annotations in a telegraphic mode from the 13th of March to the 27th of February. (Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. "Semántica y mística: el Diario Espiritual de San Ignacio", *Miscelánea Comilla – 59*, 2001, p. 212. fn. 4; THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. *La Intimidad del Peregrino ...*, p. 21.)

⁸ *MCo - I*, pp. 86-158.

⁹ *MCo - I*, pp. 78-81.

¹⁰ Cf. IPARRAGUIRRE/JURADO, *BAC*, p. 271. The authors quote Camillo Abad in indicating that the style of the *SD* is difficult to comprehend. '*Redactado única y exclusivamente para uso del autor, cuajado todo él de frases elípticas, de infinitivos y gerundios encabalgados unos sobre otros, de giros vascos, de palabras más o menos arcaicas o forasteras, produce la impresión de una pieza abigarrada y oscura.*' (ABAD, *Diario Espiritual*, p. 22.)

¹¹ The difficulty in expressing this experience is not always evident to the reader or to the community. The danger of expressing this unique experience is fraught with two principle dangers – innovate the available terms within an language or keep silent. Despite the best efforts of Ignatius, there are moments when he accepts defeat by saying that he the words do not fully express his experience. (Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 228-29.)

¹² Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 222-24. '*Las páginas del Diario desvelan una incesante lucha con el lenguaje para tratar de adecuar término y referente (experiencia) sin que la expresión pase por las exigencias estéticas del símil, la metáfora, la metonimia o el símbolo como pilares fundantes del acto de comunicación. ...Se da, por tanto, en la expresión de Ignacio una preocupación extrema por el lenguaje, tratando siempre de hallar la palabra más adecuada para cada experiencia.*'

¹³ Cf. BARRIENTOS, NELSON. "El Diario Espiritual, lenguaje y experiencia de Dios", *Manresa – 244*, 1990, pp. 310-11. '*La pregunta enviada por Ignacio a Dios y las respuestas dadas por Dios no se pueden separar, son dos sistemas correlativos, en los*

Despite the dialogical and mystical nature of this text it must be underlined that the text fundamentally reveals to the reader the language of God – i.e. God’s manner of communicating and guiding the human person.

As Ignatius approached God during this period, he wanted to be enlightened and confirmed in his election.¹⁴ The language of the *SD* reveals that this confirmation took place through the physical, intellectual, volitional and other spiritual elements that formed part of an overall movement towards humble love. While there is no doubt that the text of the *SD* reveals to the reader the heights of Ignatius’ mystical experience of humble love, it also re-affirms for us the reality of a God who is humble and willingly descends to relate to every human person in a language that is understood by him/her.

5.2 TEXTUAL ANALYSIS OF THE VARIOUS PARTS OF THE SPIRITUAL DIARY

This part of the chapter will analyse the text of the *SD* in order to show how Ignatius grew in humble love. For this purpose the classification of Ignacio Iparraguirre will be used.¹⁵ In elaborating each stage we shall limit ourselves to a textual analysis of the *DS* because we believe that a minute reading of the text offers us important keys to understand the dynamics of humble love. These keys will be elaborated and interpreted in the subsequent part of this chapter.

Each stage of the *SD* will be divided into two parts¹⁶ – a general overview of the stage and the dimension of humility that it manifests. The general overview will

cuales el carácter radicalmente binario atestigua la naturaleza lingüística. Atestigua el carácter dialogal de toda experiencia mística.'

¹⁴ Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. “Semántica y mística...”, p. 211. ‘*En su mayor parte, el DE está constituido por una serie de apuntes de los que se sirve Ignacio con el fin de tomar una decisión acertada en torno al tipo más adecuado de rentas con el que se deberían mantener las casas profesas de la incipiente Compañía de Jesús. Aparece reflejado un minucioso proceso de discernimiento espiritual en el que los diferentes pensamientos, sentimientos y luces intelectuales y espirituales van lentamente configurando la decisión final.*’

¹⁵ We shall follow the division of Iparraguirre because of its acceptance by the two esteemed publications, i.e. *BAC* (in Spanish) and *The Classics of Western Spirituality* (in English). We also believe that the classification serves our purpose as it helps us explain the spiritual process we intend to highlight. Our focus is not primarily an exhaustive analysis of the *SD* but only approach it in so far as it aids us in elaborating our point related to humility.

¹⁶ Stage I will have three parts. We shall begin with a brief note related to a document called ‘the Deliberation on Poverty’ because this document forms part of the election that Ignatius desired to make.

ordinarily follow a chronological sequence of events where we shall highlight the significant points by quoting the actual text. Given the nature of the experience, it would be superficial to merely indicate the event and hence we have made an attempt to include the event and the corresponding external and internal motions. As far as the second part is concerned, our attempt will be to show the role of humility in the progressive movement in Ignatius from a very subtle form of self-love toward greater self-emptying love.

5.2.1 STAGE I: THE ELECTION AND OBLATION TO GOD [1-22]

5.2.1.1 The Deliberation on Poverty:

Ignatius desired to make an election regarding the issue of fixed rents. For this he first engaged in a method of discernment which is proper to the third time of election and this is seen in a document entitled, "the Deliberation on Poverty". The Spiritual Exercises speaking of the third time of election says that a person...

...should consider and reason out how many advantages or benefits accrue to (oneself) from having the office or benefice proposed, all solely for the praise of God our Lord and the salvation of my soul; and on the contrary should similarly consider the disadvantages and dangers in having it. Then, acting in the same manner in the second part, (the person) should consider the advantages and benefits in not having it, and contrarily the disadvantages and dangers in not having it.¹⁷

Desiring only the praise and glory of God and with a tranquil, indifferent and objective attitude, Ignatius wrote down three sets of points: a) the disadvantages of having no fixed income (which are also the advantages of having such income either in part or in whole); b) the disadvantages in having a fixed income (which are also the advantages of having none) and c) advantages and reasons for having no fixed income.¹⁸ Though the Deliberations on Poverty indicate Ignatius using the third time to make an election, a major part of the Spiritual Diary reveal his attempt to make an election according to the second time.¹⁹

¹⁷ *SpEx* 182.

¹⁸ *MCo - I*, pp. 78-83.

¹⁹ Cf. *Ignatius of Loyola – Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works...*, p. 217.

5.2.1.2 An overview of Stage I

The first stage of the *SD* makes reference to the fact that Ignatius was making the election according to the third time. As evidenced in the text we find that Ignatius' election was being influenced by a variety of factors - inclination, being able to see, feelings, tears, devotion and the visitation of mediators. It includes two moments of oblation.

The inclination towards poverty is seen from the 2nd of February 1544 to the 7th. The text repeats the words, '*a no nada*'²⁰ every day [1-4]²¹ and on the 6th he could see the matter with 'considerable clarity'. [5] On the 7th he experienced 'warmth and a remarkable devotion, remaining myself ever more convinced and moved to poverty'. [6] This inclination towards not having fixed incomes is complemented with the gift of tears and devotion when on the 7th, before the Mass to the Trinity he has a great abundance of devotion and tears. 'The two mediators (the Mother and the Son) had interceded for him and he had some sign of seeing them.' [4]

An oblation was made on the 8th when in the morning he 'considered the choices in the election for an hour and a half or more. (He) came to offer what seemed most reasonable, and to which (his) will felt most impelled... (He) desired to make this offering to the Father through the mediation and prayers of the Mother and Son.' [8] In the afternoon he 'once more weighed up the choices for another hour and a half or more, and made the choice for complete poverty. At the same time (he) felt devotion and certain elation... The desire to continue with the election now seemed to be fading.' [10]

On the 9th, 'on reconsidering the choices, it seemed perfectly clear that no income should be allowed (and he) thought the matter was settled.' [11] The fading desire ended with clarity on the 10th as he made 'the offering of complete poverty, (and thus) felt great devotion, and a certain security or assent that the election was well made.' [13]

²⁰ '*a no nada*' indicates '*a no tener nada de renta*' and refers to have no fixed income whatsoever. The other two options are '*tener todo*' which refers to a fixed income without limits or '*tener en parte*' which refers to fixed income limited to Churches or their sacristy. (Cf. IPARRAGUIRRE/JURADO, *BAC*, p.359.)

²¹ The numbers in brackets are taken from *The Spiritual Diary of St. Ignatius*, (Tr. Munitiz, Joseph), Inigo Enterprise: London, 1987.

On the 11th, he felt confirmed because of 'considerable devotion²² and tears ... and (he) seemed to see and feel Him in a dense clarity... - all of which confirmed him in his election.' [14] He prayed to the mediators (Our Lady & the three persons of the Trinity) to 'give him clarity of mind even though (he) spoke of the matter as already settled. Once again he felt considerable devotion and certain fairly clear-sighted intuitions'. [15]

A new oblation was made with many tears, devotions and continuing sobs as he 'formally ratified, endorsed, etc. the offerings of complete poverty.' [16] Once again Ignatius had a 'feeling or seeing in some way the Holy Spirit (and) the question of the election being now answered.' [17] He 'felt great tranquility and security of soul, like a tired man who takes a complete rest (and) ...considering the matter finished, except for thanksgiving (by) a Mass to the Blessed Trinity.' [19]

The process observed thus far would be in keeping with an election according to the third time. After the 11th of February, the process undertaken by Ignatius was more in keeping with the second time of election. The focus would now shift from giving primacy to thought and reason as well as the pros and cons towards greater sensitivity towards the internal experiences of consolation and desolation as well as to the discernment of various spirits.

He awoke on the 12th and offered thanks to God with devotion and tears 'the warmth and intense love' [22] remained with him during the day. For the first time he made mention to a thought regarding having a fixed income only for the Church.²³ However with 'clarity, knowledge and deep devotion he ...most earnestly refused entry to such a suggestion.' [22] He also speaks of 'disturbances from those in the room' [22] and on seeing this point one has the first indications of internal disharmony within the process that Ignatius was going through.

5.2.1.3 Humility and Recourse to Mediators

A text like the *SD* does not lend itself to easy interpretation. However we do see a

²² On the 11th he uses the word 'devotion' eight times in the *SD*.

²³ Iparraguirre presents this text in the body of the *SD*, while Munitiz has it as a footnote.

consistent attitude of humility which is evident in the entire text – an attitude which culminated in being taught that the grace of humble love is superior to other graces. As we shall highlight a specific dimension of humility in each stage of this text, we would like to point that the various dimensions are found overlapping in each stage. However in order to focus on what we consider a dominant aspect in each stage we have made this classification.

The structure of elaborating the dimension of humility will be similar in each stage. We shall begin with an introductory note and a brief remark about the specific dimension of humility. This will be followed by a textual analysis of the stage which will be followed by some concluding remarks.

The first stage reveals to us an Ignatius who at first is engaged in an election according to the third time. He was convinced about the decision but through experience has learned not to be totally reliant on his internal movements. Humbly accepting his limitations, he would depend on mediators in order to approach the Divine Persons and at the same time in order to be confirmed in his internal motions. This dependence on mediators seems surprising given the fact that Ignatius was firmly convinced that God deals directly with the human person.²⁴ However a brief understanding of Ignatius' courtly background reveals to us his understanding of mediators. Santiago Thió de Pol in explaining the meaning of '*acatamiento*' indicates to us the hierarchical society of Ignatius' time.

...la sociedad en que vivió estaba terriblemente jerarquizada. Papas, emperadores, reyes, princesas, condes y duques, por no decir doctores y bachilleres, generales y capitanes, recibían todos un tratamiento propio de su dignidad, tratamiento temeroso o amoroso para el pueblo, según la «gracia» del que lo ostentaba.²⁵

In the course of the *SD* we will find Ignatius taking recourse to various persons. However in this stage we see that Ignatius humbly approaches Our Lady, her Son and

²⁴ *SpEx 15*. The point related to God's manner of directly relating to the exercitant without necessarily being mediated through other persons was an important cause for being suspected by the Inquisition. However in his personal spiritual life we find a great deal of humility in Ignatius who frequently took recourse to mediators.

²⁵ THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. *La Intimidación*, p. 177.

the three Divine Persons in order to be confirmed. His 'increased trust' [1] and 'great confidence' [3] in Our Lady is revealed in initial entries. Both Our Lady²⁶ and her Son were 'ready and willing to intercede with the Father.' [4] The feeling of devotion towards the Father was because it 'seemed to (him) that the two mediators had made supplication.' [6] An important text which gives us an understanding of Ignatius' worldview regarding the mediators can be seen in the following text.

I desired to make this offering to the Father through the mediation and prayers of the Mother and Son. Firstly I prayed her to assist me before her Son and Father. Next I implored the Son that together with the Mother he might help me before the Father. Then I felt within me that I approached, or was taken before, the Father... [8]

The mediators helped Ignatius receive the grace of a visitation of the Father and hence he now felt confident to 'pray to Our Lady, then to the Son, and to the Father, that He might give me his Spirit to assist (him) in (his) reasonings and give (him) clarity of mind.' [15] The grace of this visitation was also granted to him because he 'felt intense devotion and wept on feeling or seeing in some way the Holy Spirit (and thus) the question of the election now answered.'

In the future course of the *SD* we find various moments when Ignatius would in all humility approach different mediators in order to ask for the graces he desired. In the present stage we find that Jesus Christ is an important mediator and as the Second Person leads us into the Trinitarian mystery.²⁷ Ignatius believed that the Son along with Our Lady are privileged mediators. This point is seen on various occasions in the *SD* as well as the *Spiritual Exercises*.²⁸

²⁶ Here he uses the word 'Mother' referring to Our Lady. At this stage we will see that the Son, i.e. Jesus Christ is not presented as the Second Person of the Trinity, but as a mediator. At a later stage, Ignatius will describe Jesus as God and not merely as a mediator.

²⁷ DECLoux, SIMON. "Comentario a las cartas y el diario Espiritual", CIS, 1982, Roma, p. 109. '*En la experiencia ignaciana, Jesús se muestra a la vez como mediador por excelencia, apto para conducirnos a la Trinidad o para ayudarnos a volver desde ella; y como Segunda Persona de la Trinidad, Persona Encarnada. Como mediador, guarda relación con la Santísima Virgen y con los Santos; como Segunda Persona de la Trinidad es igual al Padre y al Espíritu Santo.*'

²⁸ Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. "La Oración de San Ignacio en su Diario Espiritual" *Manresa* – 330, 2012, p. 70. '*En el Diario resulta también muy significativo su recurso a los que llama "intercesores" o "mediadores". En esta función de mediación ante el Padre, une estrechamente a "la Madre y el Hijo, propicios para interpelar al Padre" (De [4]). Vivía lo que enseña al*

Along with the Son and Our Lady, Ignatius would take recourse to ‘the Angels, the holy Fathers, the Apostles and Disciples and all the Saints.’ [46] Thus Ignatius’ relationship with God was not one of a monad who was isolated at the time of prayer, but was an inclusive experience where the mediators had an important role to play.²⁹ The mediators for Ignatius were an important help in order to know the will of God, to receive the corresponding graces and fulfill it in a manner which was best pleasing to God’s divine will.³⁰

5.2.2 STAGE II – ELECTION, OBLATION AND THANKSGIVING [23-44]

5.2.2.1 An overview of Stage II

Iparraguirre divides this stage into three parts with the first part related to a review of the options. This is followed by the third oblation (with the first two in stage – I). This is followed by thanksgiving to God and surprisingly at the end of this process when Ignatius anticipated a confirmation he was looking for, he experienced aridity and loss of confidence.

Ignatius began his review of the election with a sense of remorse for the decision on the 12th to have ‘left the Divine persons on the previous day.’ [23] He decided to abstain from saying Mass to the Holy Trinity and turned to his mediators to help him review the decision. Despite the lack of internal harmony on the 13th, he ‘could feel the Mother and Son to be interceding for (him), and a complete security that the Eternal Father would restore (him) to (his) former state.’ [24] On the next day, i.e. the 14th, he felt ‘great devotion and an exaltation of mind, remarkable and remarkable tranquility.’ [26] Despite not experiencing the presence of the mediators, he found ‘easy access to the Father... and a great security or hope that (he) would regain what was lost.’³¹ [27]

ejercitante en los tres coloquios de los Ejercicios (SpEx 62-63): acudir “a nuestra Señora, para que me alcance gracia de su Hijo y Señor”; “al Hijo, para que me alcance del Padre”, “al Padre, para que el mismo Señor eterno me lo conceda”.

²⁹ Cf. IBID., p. 71.

³⁰ IBID., p. 77. ‘Las mediaciones o los mediadores queridos por Dios no son un obstáculo, sino una ayuda para encontrar y realizar esa voluntad divina, no a nuestro estilo, sino al estilo de Dios; no según nuestros planes, sino según el plan de Dios.’

³¹ Ignatius has had a profound experience where he feels that others are ready to intercede for him. This would one of

In the process of his review, the text related to the next two days [28-35] in the *SD* offers us an interesting insight into his relationship with the Our Lady – especially as a mediator. Though he felt ashamed of himself and felt 'that Our Lady hid from (him)', [29] the 'Heavenly Father shows Himself propitious and kind'. [30] We see the mediators once again aiding him in his review, and though he 'found himself unable to adapt to the mediators' [32] he was able to recognize the 'knots and bonds contrived by the enemy: (and) with great tranquility and peace (could make) the election and offering to the Father of not possessing anything even for the Church.' [34] The review ended with Ignatius' reconciliation with the mediators and a feeling that 'the Father was very propitious.' [35]

The third oblation followed this review because 'it seemed pointless to reconsider the election.' [36] He was 'moved for a while to make (an) offering of complete poverty in our Churches and no longer wished to prolong the matter.' [36] With this determination, he decided to end the matter in two days, 'in which to give thanks and repeat the offering.' [36, 37] He thus finally 'made an election on the matter' [36] and 'made this offering and oblation ... to the Father in the presence of Our Lady, the Angels, etc. ... Then at last, feeling a great satisfaction, (he) rose, devotion and tears continuing all the while, with firm resolve to fulfill the oblation and all that had been offered.' [38]

The second moment of thanksgiving followed the third oblation described above. Though Ignatius did not feel the presence of the mediators, he 'felt considerable relish and warmth.' [39] He considered 'the matter ended... and (as he) rose and turned to the preparation before Mass, (he) thanked His Divine Majesty and offered Him the oblation already made.' [39, 40] After Mass and 'in the chapel and later while (he) knelt in (his) room, (he) wished to give thanks for so many gifts and graces received.' [41] The desire for thanksgiving was complemented with devotion, peace, tears and finally with the 'soul very satisfied, (he) set out having decided to complete the matter tomorrow, before

the various moments when the linguistic tools at his command would not be able to express his experience. Describing this experience he says, "...cannot describe how I saw them as I cannot explain anything else of what happened.' [27]

dinnertime – with thanksgiving, petition for strength, and a repetition of the offering already made out of devotion for the Blessed Trinity, celebrating the Mass in their honor.’ [42]

The 18th of February indicates a second moment of desolation with an experience of aridity and lack of trust. After going to sleep with ‘warmth, devotion and great trust that (he) would find the Divine Persons or grace in them now that (he) was coming to the end’ [43], he awoke on the morning of 13th February in a different state. He felt ‘heavy-hearted and bereft of all spiritual things... and remained during the first half with little or no relish, and moreover uncertain if (he) would find grace in the Blessed Trinity.’ [44] The person who was confident and ‘on fire for the exultation in (his) soul’ [44] would now experience aridity and self-doubt.

5.2.2.2 Humility and Reconciliation³²

On the 13th of February Ignatius would have a humbling experience of feeling separated from the mediators. [20-23] This would lead him through a process that would end in total reconciliation on the 18th. On the 13th of February he wrote:

I knew that I was gravely at fault in having let the Divine Persons on the previous day during the thanksgiving: I wanted to abstain from saying the Mass of the Trinity that I had thought of saying, and take as my intercessors the Mother and Son, that my fault might be forgiven me and I myself restored to my former grace. [23]³³

The paragraph which was crossed out by Ignatius gives us a hint about the possible cause of Ignatius’ fault. In the morning he entertained the thought of having an income for the Church and realized with ‘great clarity and insights, and with considerable devotion’ [23] that it was a temptation.³⁴ Later he was disturbed by some

³² This stage extends from [23-44]. However in order to better understand the spiritual process of humility and reconciliation we shall include three more numbers. Hence this stage will extend from [23-47].

³³ The reference is not too clear, but it seems that Ignatius did not specifically express his thanksgiving and gratitude for the graces that were received to the Divine Persons. The entire context is not too clear, but what is certain is that Ignatius considers that he was found wanting in expressing thanksgiving to the Divine Persons. (Cf. MUNITIZ, JOSEPH. *The Spiritual Diary...*, p. 34, (fn. 18,19.)) Added to this, a paragraph which has been crossed out could offer us clues to the fault of Ignatius. (*IBID.*,p. 34 (fn. 16.))

³⁴ This realization led to ‘*great peace, understanding and thankfulness of heart towards the Divine Persons and also considerable*

disturbance in a room and on one occasion he 'rose from prayer to see if (he) could stop the noise.' [23] During Mass the disturbances continued and though he ended the Mass 'undisturbed... and with the same devotion' [23] he did not give thanks to the mediators or the Divine Persons. The lack of further entries stops us from understanding more completely the fault of Ignatius at this stage.³⁵

The process of reconciliation would be long drawn and Ignatius found himself separated from the mediators. On the 14th he had devotion but 'did not see the mediators in the (usual) way' [26], though he had 'a great security or hope that (he) would regain what was lost, feeling the Son very ready to intercede, and the Saints.' [27] On the 15th the same experience persisted wherein 'no mediators or persons revealed themselves.' [28] He was moved to tears of sorrow because he 'seemed to be putting Our Lady to shame in having to intercede for (him) so often, because of his many failings.' [29]³⁶ Though there was some degree of reconciliation,³⁷ the sense of separation would not go away altogether.

On the 16th Ignatius 'felt unable to adapt (himself) to the mediators.' [32] At this point he makes reference to 'many knots and bonds contrived by the enemy' [34] and this refers 'to the possibility of having funds for a limited purpose.'³⁸ He probably makes this reference because 'after Mass (he) spent an hour considering one set of election reasons, paying attention to the point raised, and also to the income already granted.' [34] Though he felt Our Lady pleading for him during Mass, he still 'felt a

devotion.' [23]

³⁵ We could presume that the fault refers to having entertained the thought of having incomes for the Church or the desire to have a confirmation of the kind he desired or the lack of thanksgiving to the Divine Persons after Mass.

³⁶ We also find a unique text where Ignatius felt that 'Our Lady hid from (him) and (he) found no devotion in her or higher than her.' [29]

³⁷ Despite the separation, Ignatius in all humility approached the Eternal Father. He was confident that 'the Eternal Father would restore (him) to his former state.' [24] He 'seemed to feel the Heavenly Father showing Himself propitious and kind – to the point of making clear that He would be pleased if Our Lady, whom (he) could not see, would intercede.' [30] Ignatius finally felt reconciled to the mediators (particularly Our Lady) because 'before, during and after Mass, (he) felt and saw clearly that Our Lady was very propitious, pleading before the Father.' [31] The same took place during the prayers and the moment of consecration when he 'could not but feel or see her, as though she were (a) portal of grace...' [31]

³⁸ MUNITIZ, JOSEPH. *The Spiritual Diary...*, p. 37. (fn. 31)

certain shame, or indefinable feeling before the Mother.’ [35] As he begged pardon for the day, he ‘felt the Father (being) propitious, without being able to adapt to the mediators.’ [35] On the 17th Ignatius ‘could feel no mediators or any other persons.’ [39] However during this day though he experienced great satisfaction, there were ‘no flashes of understanding or of distinctions.’ [40] On the 18th he ‘felt some warmth, devotion and great trust that he would find the Divine Persons or grace in them.’ [43]

The next day (i.e. 18th) he awoke and ‘remained during the first half (of the customary prayer) with little or no relish, and moreover an uncertainty if (he) could find grace in the Blessed Trinity.’ [44] It then occurred to him that unlike other moments when he approached the Father, he could begin ‘with all the Saints, putting (his) cause in their hands, so that they might pray to Our lady and her Son to be intercessors on (his) behalf before the Blessed Trinity.’ [46] This request to the mediators caused a great flood of tears, many impulses and interior sobs [47] and this in turn led him to feel totally reconciled with the mediators and Divine Persons.

In analyzing these five days we can see that Ignatius was bereft of the usual deluge of visitations from the mediators (Our Lady and the Son) and the Divine persons. Ignatius was unknowingly trying to make the mediators and Divine Persons related to him accordance to his liking. While it can be said that the lack of thanksgiving was a minor issue, the more serious ‘fault’ or ‘knot’³⁹ was that Ignatius was not allowing himself to be led in a manner pleasing to God, but wanted to lead God towards what he desired. This realization would finally dawn on Ignatius at a later stage. [146] In the process of reconciliation he learnt that the visitation of the mediators is a relative matter, while their role in helping a person know and fulfill God’s will was of fundamental importance.

This experience of humility and subsequent reconciliation would teach Ignatius that God ardently desires reconciliation but at the same time cannot be manipulated.

³⁹ The next stage will again further explain this knot that bothered Ignatius. It was related to the kind of visitation that he desired from the Blessed Trinity. The unravelling of the knot would help him understand the unity of essences of the three persons of the Blessed Trinity. [63]

There is no doubt that God ardently desires reconciliation with the human person. However God cannot be manipulated and Ignatius is gently but firmly made to understand this truth. God's humility is also revealed in the fact that in this process God takes the initiative by coming down to relate with him at his level. Despite his subtle self-love and pride, God allows him to continue experiencing various moments of devotion and consolation until the moment of total reconciliation with the mediators and the Divine Persons.

As we conclude this stage we would like to highlight one minor point which reinforces the need for a person to enter into the dynamics of spiritual descent in order to encounter God. We were able to see that on being bereft of visitation from the mediators, Ignatius repeatedly turned to the Father for solace. In return he did experience a limited form of reconciliation. However total reconciliation took place when Ignatius humbled himself and instead of beginning with the Father, began with the Saints [46] who would help him to be reconciled with the ascending mediators culminating in the Blessed Trinity.

5.2.3 STAGE III: OBLATION AND THANKSGIVING [45-64]

5.2.3.1 An overview of Stage III

The third stage is divided into five parts by Iparraguirre. The first part refers to Ignatius' approaching the Trinity through the mediators where he begs to renew his offering.⁴⁰ The second part refers to an oblation (the 4th) and confirmation of the same. In the third part, Ignatius begs God to accept his oblation and in the fourth he determines to give thanks to God. The fifth part refers to the insights into the Holy Trinity before, during and after Mass.

Ignatius approached the mediators after the experience of aridity and self-doubt. Instead of submitting himself passively to this state, he decided to take 'measures to ensure that (he) should not be disturbed until (he) had found the grace desired.' [45]

⁴⁰ The text (in IPARRAGUIRRE/JURADO, *BAC*⁶, p. 307.), only indicates no. 45 and there is no mention of mediators. Mention of mediators can be found in no. 46.

With this end in mind, he 'thought of abstaining for three days in order to find what (he) desired.' [45] While believing that the desired grace would be received, he decided to begin by putting himself in the hand of the saints 'so that they might pray to Our Lady and her Son to be intercessors on (his) behalf before the Blessed Trinity.' [46] In this renewed initiative of Ignatius to be confirmed he elaborately describes the hierarchy of mediators who were approached by him to receive the desired grace. They could be arranged as follows:

Angels - Fathers - Apostles - Saints - Our - Lady - Son - Trinity [46]

The second part consists in the fourth oblation to the Blessed Trinity and was confirmed in a manner which was 'sensibly felt.' [47] The order of mediators was reversed as he expressed his gratitude with 'great and intense affection.' [47] The reverse order is as follows:

Divine Persons - Our Lady and her Son - Angels - Fathers - Apostles - Disciples -
Saints - men and women - all who had helped him. [47]

In the third part, Ignatius begs for acceptance from God by asking the three persons of the Blessed Trinity to confirm him. [48] The subsequent state of Ignatius shows a certain degree of disturbance and we find Ignatius manifesting some signs of confusion. He was not getting what he desired and this is evident when he states that he 'was not weeping, yet not entirely without tears... things were not felt to any great extent... tears were not so copious and abundant... decided not to rest content seeing that confirmation had not been granted... felt angry with the Blessed Trinity... no desire to prolong the deliberation... some slight doubt still occurred... seemed fearful of erring in anything.' [49, 50]

The fourth part reveals Ignatius waking up and feeling differently towards the Trinity with 'peace and great exultation for the intense love experienced in the Blessed Trinity.' [51] He was unsure about the manner of proceeding further but had 'gained confidence and decided to say the Mass of the Blessed Trinity in order to decide later what should be done.' [51] Further on he had more intuitions, 'felt devotion and spiritual

confidence' [51] leading to a decision to say six or more Masses to the Blessed Trinity. We thus see that the anger towards the Trinity had been transformed into confidence and devotion.

The fifth part pertains to great insights into the Holy Trinity. The profound nature of the insight can be gauged by the statement when Ignatius says that '(he) knew that what (he) had then understood could not have (been) learnt in a whole life of study.' [52] The insights were in the realm of 'seeing and feeling' and this is reiterated at a later stage when he says that 'in all this, (he) felt and saw rather than understood.' [54] He also received an insight into the deceit of the evil spirit which made him 'have doubts and feel anger with the Blessed Trinity.' [57] His 'devotion was greatly increased, (he was) quiet and tranquil; (he) wept and had some intuitions.' [58] He no longer needed any confirmation and desired to continue with Masses only for the sake of thanksgiving and fulfillment. [59] The next day, i.e. the 21st he wrote of the 'great and continuous devotion throughout the period of prayer with warm clarity and spiritual enjoyment.' [60] Along with the spiritual intuitions related to the Blessed Trinity, there continued a growing devotion which made him believe that '(he) was not worthy to invoke the name of the Blessed Trinity.' [64]

5.2.3.2 Humility and Enlightenment

Ignatius who earnestly desired to be visited by the Holy Trinity was enlightened during these days regarding the mystery of the Triune God. An analysis of the text reveals to us as to how the experience of humility opened him to this enlightenment - or as he would call it '*inteligencias espirituales*.'

Ignatius felt that he was tied up in knots and as seen in the previous stage 'it seemed to (him) that such things were knots and bonds contrived by the enemy.' [34] However there is a difference between the knot he refers to in the earlier stage and the present one [63] under consideration. While the previous knot could be understood as confusion regarding the issue of fixed incomes, the knot in this stage refers to the confirmation that he sought from the Blessed Trinity. By becoming more humble, he

was enlightened to better understand the mystery of the Triune God and experience the confirmation that he desired.

The following text reveals Ignatius' intense desire to be confirmed by the Holy Trinity. His says:

Later while I prepared the altar and vested, there came to me: "Eternal Father, confirm me"; "Eternal Son, confirm me"; "Eternal Holy Spirit, Confirm me"; "Holy Trinity, confirm me"; "My One Sole God, confirm me." I repeated this many times with great force, devotion and tears, and very deeply did I feel it. [48]

Ignatius' subtle pride is seen in his desire for a spectacular confirmation and the inability to experience the same leads to the manifestation of frustrated behavior. He first wanted each person of the Blessed Trinity and then the Trinity as a whole to confirm Him. However he did not experience such a confirmation and therefore began to doubt his gift of tears considering that '(they) were not so copious and abundant.' [49] His desperation was seen in the fact that he 'decided not to rest content... (since) confirmation had not been granted in this last Mass to the Trinity.' [49] Further on he 'felt angry with the Blessed Trinity... (and) had no desire to prolong the deliberation into the future.' [50] Though the decision was final, he still had 'some slight doubt... (and) was beset in some slight way, and seemed fearful of erring in anything.' [50]

The follow day, i.e. the 19th would be rather different and the starting point of various enlightenments⁴¹ regarding the Trinity. As he awoke he 'had many intuitions or spiritual reminders of the Blessed Trinity.' [51] As he dressed he had 'more intuitions of the Blessed Trinity.' [51] During Mass he had 'very many intuitions about the Blessed Trinity, (his) understanding being enlightened with them to such an extent that it seemed to (him) that with hard study (he) would not have known so much.' [52] The enlightenment regarding the Trinity concerned the operations and generation of the Divine Persons.

⁴¹ We shall be using the words 'enlightenment' and 'insight' interchangeably. While it is true that enlightenment is more specific to the realm of spirituality and insight to the realm of philosophy, we do not intend to enter into a philological analysis of these words at this moment.

In general, the intuitions during and before Mass were concerned with the appropriation in the Mass prayers when mention is made of God, of the Father, or of the Son, etc. with the operations of the Divine Persons, and with the production of the Persons – in all this, I felt and saw rather than understood. [54]

The insights received led him to consider it 'pointless to continue with the Masses to the Blessed Trinity, except for the sake of thanksgiving or fulfillment. (He) had no need for confirmation of what was past.' [59]

On the 21st he had another important moment of enlightenment when, 'once or perhaps a few times, (he) felt spiritual intuitions so great that (he) seemed to understand that almost nothing more could be known on the subject of the Blessed Trinity.' [62] These words indicate that the enlightenment received regarding the Blessed Trinity was truly an extraordinary experience. As seen in the spiritual trajectory of Ignatius during the past few days, he was communicating with the Father.

However his ardent desire was to have a visitation of the Blessed Trinity. On this day, 'during this Mass (he) knew or felt or saw... that on speaking to the Father and seeing that He was One Person of the Blessed Trinity, (he) felt moved to love all the Trinity, especially as the other Persons were all in the Trinity by their very essence...' [63] He felt the same while praying to the Son and to the Holy Spirit and 'when (he) felt consolation (he) was delighted with any one of them, and (he) rejoiced in acknowledging it as coming from all three.' [63]

During Mass Ignatius was allowed to 'know or feel or see' the unity of the Divine Persons of the Trinity. This experience of being enlightened was a deeply humbling experience. Ignatius realized that on giving up the desire for a spectacular confirmation and deciding not to look for further confirmation, he began to have intuitions regarding the Blessed Trinity. The most important intuition was the realization of the unity of the Divine Persons. This meant that the visitation of one person contained the visitation of the other Two Persons. The 'untying of this knot' [63] led to such a profound degree of humility that Ignatius considering himself totally unworthy for this grace 'could not stop repeating to (himself), ... "Who are you? What did you deserve? Why this?' [63]

5.2.4 STAGE IV: CONFIRMATION (CHRIST) AND RECONCILIATION (TRINITY) [65-110]

5.2.4.1 Overview of Stage IV

Iparraguire divides this stage into eight parts where the first and second part refers to confirmation from Jesus and clarity of the same. The third part deals with the recognition of a past error and the fourth relates to a prayer of Jesus where he is willing to conform himself to whatever spiritual way is pleasing to the Trinity. The fifth part relates to the mediation of Jesus and confirmation through visions and the sixth deals with Ignatius' surrender to the divine initiative. The seventh and eighth parts reveal a growing devotion and intense love towards the Holy Trinity.

The first and second part reveals an experience of Jesus who would offer Ignatius 'devotion... satisfaction of soul and shining clarity.' [65] Ignatius believed that 'the greater argument for having complete poverty' [66] was the poverty of Jesus, who was the true head of the Society. The memory of the vision at La Storta [67] 'appeared to be a confirmation.' [67] Later on 'during Mass, there were several feelings of confirmation' [69] and this feeling was further strengthened because he 'could in a certain way feel or see (Jesus) with (his) understanding... (leading to) devotion and confirmation.' [70] The next day he felt that the 'confirmation by the Blessed Trinity... was communicated to (him) through Jesus... (leading to great interior strength and a sense of security.' [73]

The third part shows how he became aware of his error during this period of various confirmations. All along he 'desired the confirmation of the Blessed Trinity, and now (he) felt it was communicated to (him) through Jesus.' [73] During this period of confirmation, he became aware of his error whereby he wanted to dictate to God the manner of the confirmation. On realizing his mistake he 'prayed to Jesus to obtain pardon from the Blessed Trinity (and) felt an increase of devotion, tears and sobs, and the hope of obtaining the grace.' [73]⁴² This petition was repeated later in the day when he 'begged and implored Jesus to obtain (his) pardon from the Blessed Trinity... (leading

⁴² The narration in number [74] gives us an idea of the hectic life of Ignatius during this period. The language of this text takes on a more passive tone with Ignatius being the recipient of graces which are gratuitously given to him. The phrase '*I once more was shown Jesus...*' is but one of the many phrases which can be seen in the text.

to) great confidence for the success of (his) prayer.' [74]

The fourth part highlights the continuing role of Jesus in reconciliation with the Trinity and a growing abandon on the part of Ignatius. Ignatius no longer 'asked for... confirmation, but desired to be reconciled with the three Divine Persons' [76]⁴³ In the *SD* we find this petition yet again on the (26th Feb) when he repeats that he 'begged and implored Jesus to conform (his) will with that of the Blessed Trinity to follow the way that would seem to him best.' [80] The shift in his internal state is seen because he 'no longer had that strife... about the Blessed Trinity... and felt considerable devotion in the Trinity.' [81]

The fifth part [83-91] is a complex text where he tried to express a spiritual movement of reconciliation with the Trinity through Jesus.⁴⁴ During Mass he experienced Jesus not merely as a mediator, but as part of the Triune God. He was not only 'aware of humanity, but of Jesus as being completely (his) God, etc., with a fresh rush of tears and great devotion.' [87] There was a growing devotion towards the Blessed Trinity as described in his experience of entering the Chapel where 'Jesus was disclosed to (him)... or (he) saw him... at the foot of the Blessed Trinity... (leading to) new impulses and tears.' [88]

The sixth part speaks of a changed attitude in Ignatius which follows his experience of reconciliation with the Blessed Trinity. Curiously this part begins with an Ignatius being irritated due to some noise. [93] Despite being annoyed, he celebrated Mass and 'felt a certain impulse, devotion, tears and certain feeling of love that drew (him) towards the Trinity: no bitterness remained over what was past, but great quiet and peace.' [94] He left everything to the divine initiative because he realized that 'it was

⁴³ This consistence of this sentiment is seen in the fact that 'after Mass, (he) had the desire to be reconciled with the Blessed Trinity and implored Jesus for this... (He) felt reassured and neither asked for confirmation nor felt the need for it, nor the need to say Masses for this end – but only to be reconciled.' [78]

⁴⁴ Some texts where this relationship between Jesus and the Trinity is expressed are as follows: 'I made my preparation in my room and commended myself to Jesus, not asking for any further confirmation but that, before the Blessed Trinity, He might do his best service... [82]; I saw, not by natural power, the Blessed Trinity and also Jesus who was representing me, or placing me <before the Trinity> or acting as mediator close to the Blessed Trinity. [83]; it seemed and I could feel within me that He (Jesus) was doing everything before the Father and the Blessed Trinity... [84]'

not (he) who should stipulate the time for finishing and receive a visitation... but whenever the Divine Majesty thought fit and communicated such a visitation.’ [96]

The seventh stage reveals a new found devotion and love towards the Holy Trinity. Though he did ‘feel more moved towards Jesus’ [98], he was covered with great devotion in the Blessed Trinity; (and his) love was much increased’ [99] as he entered the chapel. He had some ‘sensations with Jesus... as though He were (his) guide – but without diminution in the grace (he) was receiving from the Blessed Trinity.’ [101]

The eight stage deals with his growing love of the Blessed Trinity. There is a further shift because he felt that Jesus was ‘not allowing Himself to be seen or felt clearly... (However he) felt that the Blessed Trinity allowed itself to be seen or felt more clearly or full light.’ [105] The intense love for the Holy Trinity could be seen in Ignatius’ Eucharistic celebration and its effect on him is presented in the following table.

Time	State of Ignatius	Trinitarian Experience	No.
He entered the Chapel...	with new devotion and tears,	...always directed to the Most Holy Trinity	[106]
At the Altar once vested	a far greater flood of tears, more sobs, and the most intense love,	... for the Most Holy Trinity.	[106]
(He) wanted to begin the Mass,	(he) felt very great touches and intense devotion...	...to the Most Holy Trinity	[107]
Once Mass had started	...the devotion was so great and the tears so numerous that, as it proceeded, I began to wonder if with more Masses I should not become blind in one eye, for it was aching badly owing to the tears...		[107]
At the end... when I said in prayer, “Placeat tibi, Sancta Trinitas,”	...felt an excess of love; intense tears streamed down my face. Thus whenever during this Mass or before it I had special spiritual visitations,...	...all had for their object the Blessed Trinity, which took and drew me to its love.	[108]
After Mass I unvested and while at prayer before the altar,	I broke into such sobs and flood of tears,	...all directed to love of the Blessed Trinity...	[109]

During the rest of the day the intense love for the Holy Trinity continued. As he was near the fire, '(he) felt within (him) love for the Trinity... (Later) whenever he called to mind the Blessed Trinity, (he) felt an intense love, and sometimes the impulse to weep. The visitations had for their object the name and essence of the Blessed Trinity' [110] The consequence of this was that Ignatius was 'inspired to greater security and no longer wished to say more Masses in order to be further reconciled.' [110] He was deeply satisfied, did not feel the need for more Masses, experienced reconciliation and 'hoped to find joy in the Divine Majesty.' [110]

5.2.4.2 Humility and Growing Passivity

This stage represents an important moment in Ignatius' progressive growth of humility. We see a growing passivity wherein he actively surrenders his will in order to conform it to the will of God. In elaborating this point we shall begin by indicating the shame experienced by Ignatius in terms of his relationship with the Holy Trinity. This will be followed by an experience of total confidence wherein he entrusts himself to Christ. Finally we shall see growing abandonment in the hands of God and greater passivity on the part of Ignatius leading to total reconciliation with the Holy Trinity.

On the 23rd of February, Ignatius' spiritual process would take on a strong Christological dimension which would give him 'considerable devotion and satisfaction of soul together with some indications of shining clarity.' [65] The humility and poverty of Ignatius would have a strong Christological foundation. Reflecting on the dimension of poverty, he considered that the mere fact that Christ was poor was a much stronger argument as against the human reasons being put forward in favor of poverty. 'Since He (Jesus) was the head of the Society, He was a greater argument for having complete poverty.' [66] This argument was for Ignatius a definitive confirmation regarding the issue of fixed incomes.⁴⁵ Further affirmation came through a repeat of the vision at La Storta and he 'remembered the time when the Father placed him with the Son.' [67]

This Christological experience would coincide with Ignatius feeling ashamed

⁴⁵ In the margin of this text, Ignatius added the following words, "*Confirmation of Jesus.*"

about his attitude towards the Holy Trinity. He repeatedly pleaded with Christ in order to obtain pardon for his actions and reconcile him with the Holy Trinity. Such was his feeling of shame that he 'could not turn to the other Persons' [72] and hence he 'prayed to Jesus to obtain pardon from the Blessed Trinity.' [73] After returning from completing his engagements in the city, he again 'begged and implored Jesus to obtain pardon from the Blessed Trinity.' [74] He now 'asked for and sought no confirmation, but desired to be reconciled with the Divine Persons.' [76] After Mass, the desire for reconciliation was intense and Ignatius describes his state as follows:

After Mass, I had the desire to be reconciled with the Blessed Trinity and I implored Jesus for this, not without tears and sobs. I felt reassured and neither asked for confirmation nor felt the need for it, nor the need to say Masses for this end – but only to be reconciled. [78]

The shame and sorrow would be followed by a period where he depended totally on Christ and is seen 'begging and imploring Jesus to conform (his) will with that of the Blessed Trinity to follow the way that would seem to him best.' [80] During Mass he 'felt (he) was being ruled by the Divine Majesty, to whom it belongs to give and withdraw His graces as and when it is most convenient.' [81] Ignatius knew that he was incapable of doing anything on his own and therefore surrendered himself totally and asked Jesus to 'do his best... on (his) behalf in the way that would be most suitable; so that (he) might find (himself) in their grace.' [82] This request was answered and therefore as he was praying he saw, 'the Blessed Trinity and also Jesus who was representing (him), placing (him) <before the Trinity> or acting as mediator close to the Blessed Trinity.' [83]⁴⁶

In the process of being reconciled with the Blessed Trinity, Ignatius realized that Jesus 'was doing everything before the Father and the Blessed Trinity.' [84] A

⁴⁶ At this moment of reconciliation we have an important entry in the diary of Ignatius. '*On feeling and seeing in this way I was covered in tears and love, but with Jesus as the object; and toward the Blessed Trinity, a respect of submission more like a reverential love than anything else.*' We see here three important elements. In the first place it is frequent reminder of the importance of 'feeling and seeing' in a person's relationship with God. The second relates to the role of Jesus in participating within the Trinitarian mystery. Thirdly we have for the first time a shift in the grace desired with Ignatius moving from tears and visitations and using terms such as 'submission' (translated as affectionate awe by Ganss/Malatesta) and 'reverential love' which will later become 'reverential humble love.'

progressive growth in passivity is seen when on the 28th he felt that 'Jesus was disclosed to (him)...' [88] On the 29th during the customary prayer he was 'covered and not allowed to think of sins' [89] and on the 2nd of March he 'felt much helped by a certain grace that (he) felt (he) was receiving.' [94] After Mass Ignatius had an important moment of enlightenment where he was made aware of the importance of allowing God to lead him. He says:

I realized that it was not I who should stipulate the time for finishing and receiving a visitation then, but either then or whenever the Divine Majesty thought fit and communicated such a visitation. [96]

On the 3rd Ignatius 'felt more moved towards Jesus... and drawn to have trust in the Blessed Trinity.' [98] He 'seemed to be under His (Jesus') shadow as though He were (his) guide – but without diminution in the grace (he) was receiving from the Blessed Trinity.' [101] Ignatius desired the visitation of the Blessed Trinity and learned that one cannot receive the same by one's personal effort, but can only allow oneself to be a passive recipient of these graces. He 'had confidence that (he) would find ever increasing grace, love and greater repletion in the Divine Majesty.' [103] This confidence would come to fruition when on the 4th of March he 'felt that the Blessed Trinity allowed itself to be seen or felt more clearly or full light.' [105]

The humility of Ignatius is evident in his growing passivity seen throughout the *SD*.⁴⁷ Within the relationship we see that God takes the initiative and is the active subject within the entire spiritual process.⁴⁸ However the human person is also expected to do all that is possible in order to be receptive to God's will.⁴⁹ Ignatius had used the various human faculties for this purpose and after having exhausted all human possibilities, he now needed to totally surrender himself and listen carefully to the communication from

⁴⁷ THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. "La Experiencia de Dios reflejada en el Diario Espiritual", *Manresa* – 294, 2003, p. 33. '*De hecho, se percibe un claro avance en esta línea mística de la pasividad a lo largo del Diario.*'

⁴⁸ Cf. BARRIENTOS, NELSON. "El Diario Espiritual..."..., p. 317.

⁴⁹ *Journal Spirituel*, (Tr. Giuliani, Maurice), Desclée de Brouwer : Paris, 1959, pp. 35-36. '*Il reste pourtant à expliquer cette étrange alliance de la passivité, sans laquelle il n'est pas de vie mystique, et de l'activité, sans laquelle il n'est pas de « service », puisque le service ignatien suppose la mise en œuvre de toutes les facultés humaines.*'

God. Decloux calls this a moment of total passivity.⁵⁰ From a linguistic point too we find Ignatius using the passive voice in order to describe his experience.⁵¹

While the essential elements of the *SD* are passive in character, the methodological options are within the ambit of Ignatius' active freedom.⁵² The text of this stage clearly reveals to us the portrait of Ignatius as one who actively does all that is possible so as to become passive in order to allow God to use him as an effective instrument for the sake of the Kingdom.

Le Journal dessine, au fil des jours, le portrait intérieur d'un saint en perpétuelle réceptivité des « motions » divines, vivant avec une incroyable intensité le drame de l'« approche » du mystère, sans rien perdre de sa lucidité, de sa maîtrise, de sa force d'action. Il semble que toute sa passivité consiste à s'anéantir dans l'acte du « respect », pour retrouver, plus pures et plus droites, les forces de son intelligence et de sa volonté. L'abnégation est alors si radicale que ce n'est plus lui qui sert Dieu, mais Dieu qui se sert de lui.⁵³

5.2.5 STAGE V: FINAL RECONCILIATION, CONFIRMATION AND SUBMISSION [111-153]

5.2.5.1 Overview of Stage V

This stage has been divided into seven stages with the first part showing Ignatius' complete reconciliation with the Trinity and the second part as a moment of rest. The third and fourth parts reveal to us his experience of the Divine Essence and the Divine Persons as revealing themselves as well as they are reflected in creatures. The fifth part reveals Ignatius' devotion, contentment and growing attitude of conforming to the will of God. The sixth part reveals his spiritual desolation which leads to submit to God and the last part concludes with Ignatius' definitive conclusion and confirmation from God on the 12th of March.

⁵⁰ Cf. DECLOUX, SIMON. "Comentario...", p. 89. *'Ignacio ha hecho ya todo lo que él podía hacer: razonar, buscar la paz interior, ofrecer; y le queda: oír clara e inequívocamente de Dios mismo que decisión ha de tomar. Estamos pues en el momento por excelencia de la pasividad.'*

⁵¹ Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. "Semántica y mística...", pp. 251-52. Ignatius frequently made use of language in order to speak about his spiritual experience. García de Castro offers us various examples where the grammar of the *SD* makes reference to passive expressions as well as passive constructions.

⁵² *IBID.*, p. 253.

⁵³ *Journal Spirituel*, (Tr. Giuliani, Maurice)..., p. 36.

The first part reveals Ignatius' complete reconciliation with the Trinity. This is primarily a gratuitous gift because he received 'much grace... throughout the customary prayer... without (his) labouring to seek for it.' [111] He experienced tears, devotion and 'neither wished nor was capable of looking at (himself), or of remembering the past in order to be reconciled with the Blessed Trinity.' [113] The generous disposition and surrender is seen in his question, 'Where do you wish to take me, Lord?' [113]⁵⁴ During Mass there was an increasing devotion and 'confidence about (his) reconciliation with the Blessed Trinity' [115] which revealed itself as being authentic through the presence of experiences such as 'tranquility... rest of soul... (lack of) disharmony or unpleasantness.' [115]

The second part deals with Ignatius resting after the experience of reconciliation. He states that he found himself 'in the state of a tired man' [115] He rested and the 'repose continued later while (he) sat by the fire' [116] He easily found devotion which 'increased greatly, being most gentle and clear..., (and) drew closer to the Blessed Trinity in greater quiet and spiritual serenity.' [117, 118] After a long drawn spiritual struggle he entered a new experience where despite the fact that he 'wanted to, (he) could not see anything of the past with reference to the reconciliation' [118] and he also began to wonder whether 'the Trinity wanted to make (him) content without visitation of tears.' [119]

The third part relates to an experience of the Divine Essence which Ignatius finds difficult to articulate. During Mass as he pronounced the words '*Te igitur* (he) felt and saw, not obscurely but brightly, in full light, the very being or Essence of God, appearing as a sphere, (and) from this Essence the Father seemed to be going or deriving...' [121]

We observe the paradox of clarity and obscurity in this experience because though at one point 'he could not see nor could he distinguish or have sight of the other

⁵⁴ This question is repeated by Ignatius with an attitude of trust when he says that 'Lord, where am I going, or where... etc.? Following you, my Lord, I cannot be lost.' [114]

persons...;⁵⁵ (later on) after (he) had unvested... the same Being and spherical vision allowed Itself to be seen.' [123] The passivity of the experience can be seen in the fact that 'the Divine Being showed Itself in image to (him)... (and) was drawing it to itself, and showed that it was the same.' [124, 125]

The fourth part takes this vision of the Divine Essence further and indicates how Ignatius finds it reflected in creatures. His understanding was raised to some place 'midway between their (Divine Persons) seat on high and the letter (in the missal).' [127]⁵⁶ The vision of the Divine Essence which resulted by 'looking midway, caused and increased intensity of devotion and intense tears.' [128] Ignatius was still confident that a manifestation would be made at a right time and in a manner of his liking⁵⁷. However he found that 'the visitations were imprecise.' [129]⁵⁸ He gave up his terms and finally decided to surrender himself to the Lord by deciding to 'wait until it was disclosed to (him) and (he) had been visited.' [131]

The fifth part reveals Ignatius' growing devotion and desire to conform his will to the will of God. We see a change in Ignatius' attitude which consists in humility [135] and growing indifference. He wanted 'to try and be content with everything (imploing that that if it were equally to God's glory, He would not visit (him) with tears).' [136] When Ignatius entered the chapel he experienced that 'the two (Blessed Trinity and Jesus) were united or almost united.' [138] He too desired to 'adapt (himself) to the Father, to the Holy Spirit and to Our Lady, but in that direction could find no devotion and no vision.' [140] Ignatius' intense desire as well as his limitation vis-à-vis the will of God can be seen when he says that '(he) conformed himself to what the Lord commanded, with the thought that His Divine Majesty would supply for my defect,

⁵⁵ This phrase was repeated at a later point when he says that though his 'love for the Being of the Blessed Trinity was increased and intense: (he) did not see nor could (he) distinguish any Persons...' [121]

⁵⁶ The footnote in the text translated by Munitiz indicates that this middle region avoids the presumption of 'forcing a revelation of the Trinity, and the despondency of clinging to dead letters: it is a state of true indifference, poised to respond to God's will.' (Cf. MUNITIZ, JOSEPH. *The Spiritual Diary...*, p. 57.)

⁵⁷ In number 130 we realize that he desired 'bring the matter to a conclusion once Mass was finished

⁵⁸ The discomfort of Ignatius is evident in the fact that the visitations were in an imprecise way. At the same time, the visitations ceased mid-way through the Mass and he was also troubled by the heat of the fire with the water thrown in it. [129]

turning everything to good, etc.' [142]

The 12th of March was a significant day and embraces the sixth and seventh part. The sixth part deals with the experience of desolation, submission to God's will followed by consolation. The seventh part describes the definitive conclusion and confirmation from God. The day begins with Ignatius being disturbed because of 'people coming down the stairs... very hurriedly.' [144] He thus had to return to his room 'to adapt (himself) and amid tears recovered (his) composure.' [144] During Mass he had mixed feelings because at the start his 'devotion was considerable (with) impulse to weep... but he was also battling (how) to bring the matter to an end; for (he) could not find what (he) sought.' [144]

The period after Mass reveals a state of desolation which affects his feelings, thoughts and judgment. The following table depicts his general disposition. [145]

<i>General State in the beginning.</i>		After Mass I found myself completely bereft of all help, unable to find delight in the mediators, or in the Divine Persons
<i>Feelings</i>	I felt...	...as remote and separated from them as if I had never felt their influence in the past, or was ever to feel any of it in the future.
<i>Thoughts</i>	Instead I was beset by thoughts...	...now against Jesus, now against another...
<i>Plan of action</i>	a variety of schemes...	... to leave the house and hire a room to escape the noise, to fast, to begin more Masses, to place an altar upstairs...
<i>Desire at the end</i>	Nothing satisfied me...	...and yet I wanted to put an end to the affair with my soul in a state of consolation and complete satisfaction...

The moment of enlightenment was when he examined the desolation and realized that he was subtly 'looking not for more certainty, but for a finishing touch that would be to (his) taste.' [146]

Despite the fact that Ignatius had become aware as to how subtle self-love had been at work in the above mentioned process, he would have to struggle with four more moments of doubt before the end of the day. It would result in a process of reflection and a final decision. The four moments of temptation through different thoughts are

presented in the form of a table in order to show as to how an enlightened examination of the desolation led him out of it.

Thought - Disturbance	Reflection	Awareness	Action	Decision - Consolation
I thought if I were to cease at this juncture, in a state of such exile, later I would not be contented, etc. [146]	Considered whether to conclude now without waiting and searching for further proofs, or whether to say more Masses for them. [147]	Wishing the Lord condescend to my desire & finish in a time of visitation - Aware of my inclination and, God's [147]		Obscurity began gradually to lighten; tears came. As they increased I lost all desire to say more Masses to this end;.[148]
It occurred to me to say three Masses of the Trinity in thanksgiving [148]	It seemed to me to be a suggestion of the evil spirit [148]		I decided to say no more Masses [148]	Love for God increased - tears - broke into spasms - internal satisfaction. [148]
Uncertain if I should conclude at night with a similar flood of tears, if such occurred, or now. [148]	I thought it best to conclude at once - to ... wait for the evening was only to want further proof, when it was not needed [149]		Declaration before God Our Lord and all the Heavenly Court - concluded with the matter - not proceed further. [149]	Interior impulses - sobbed & wept - flood of tears - considered all ended - no more visitations or Masses - finish today. [149]
At table, after 1:30 p.m., - the Tempter ...pretended to succeed in making me doubt. [151]			Suddenly, yet calmly – as if to a beaten enemy – I said to him, “Get to your place.” [151]	Strengthened by tears and a complete sense of security about all I had decided. [151]

The table depicts the eventful 12th of March, 1544 in a synthetic manner. It reveals many aspects of Ignatius' process of discernment which can be better illuminated by the rules of discernment found in the Spiritual Exercises. Finally he closed the matter when he 'considered everything ended, and decided to await no more Masses or visitations.' [149] However as seen in the table, there is one more attempt to disturb him by using a spiritual façade, but Ignatius who now better recognized his own desire to manipulate God so as to receive a visitation or a flood of tears responded calmly and firmly putting

an end to the process. [151]⁵⁹

The seventh part related to the definitive conclusion which takes place without waiting for it to end in a manner desired by Ignatius followed by an experience of God's full confirmation. He was 'strengthened by tears and a complete sense of security about all that he had decided.' [151] Once again he experienced conflicting internal motions which are proper of the Second Week wherein the evil spirit tried 'to put doubts into (his) mind... while he experienced visitations from, and visions of, the Divine Persons and Mediators... confirming (him) on the matter.' [152] The day ended with a visitation of the Blessed Trinity where the 'visitations had no particular or distinct Person for their object, but in general, the Giver of Graces.' [153]

5.2.5.2 Humility and Confirmation

Humility as manifest in this stage shall be by elaborated in the context of the confirmation. The explanation will contain five parts which deal with five different dimensions of humility. The first part will be a continuation from the previous stage where humility and passivity were highlighted. We shall show how Ignatius who had surrendered himself, continued to be led by the Lord. The second part refers to God's humility who through the visions of the Divine Essence allowed Ignatius to participate in the harmony of the Triune God. The third part led Ignatius to humbly realize that all creatures that exist below participated in the Divine Essence. The fourth part deals with a person being invited to humbly empty himself so that the personal will conforms to the will of God. The final part relates to the ultimate confirmation where despite the desire for a spectacular finale, we find a chastened, humiliated but at the same time reverential Ignatius who is confirmed by in his decision.

5.2.5.2.1 *The Passive Dimension of Humility*

The passive dimension of humility is seen at the very onset.⁶⁰ We see a dynamic

⁵⁹ The words "Get to your place" [151] is similar to the words "Wretch! Can you promise me an hour of life?" as seen in the *Au. 20*.

⁶⁰ At the very onset, Ignatius has a dimension of humility which is reflected in his attitude. At the 'preparatory prayer

relationship where there was a constant surrender on the part of Ignatius and a corresponding action by God's in his life. The preamble to his surrender is that God had gratuitously given him 'much grace ...without (his) laboring to seek for it.' [111] His self-offering is seen in the attitude of surrender in which he allowed the Lord to lead him. He kept repeating, "Where do you wish to take me, Lord?" [113] Further on while vesting, he 'offered (himself), very moved and with tears, to be guided and taken, etc., through all these stages, wheresoever He might take (him).' [114] The confidence of having surrender himself is seen when he said, "Lord, where am I going, or where... etc.? Following you, my Lord, I cannot be lost." [114]

5.2.5.2.2 *The Humility of God*

The vision of the Divine Persons that was granted to Ignatius reveals the humility of God. He had 'begun Mass with an interior, humble satisfaction' [120] when the visions began. The first time was when he pronounced the words "*Te igitur*" when he 'saw, not obscurely but brightly, in full light, the very Being or Essence of God, appearing as a sphere, a little larger than the sun...' [121]⁶¹ The unity of the Divine Persons was such that he 'did not see nor could (he) distinguish or have sight of the other Persons.' [121]⁶² Ignatius is more specific about his role as a passive recipient when he narrates the visions that came to him after Mass. He said that as he was unvesting and praying at the altar, 'once more the same Being and spherical vision allowed Itself to be seen.' [123] This vision repeated itself various times during the day. As he visited St. Peter's 'the same Divine Being showed Itself in an image to (him and during) Mass by Cardinal Santa Cruz, (he) experienced the same manifestation and vision...' [124] Finally at night he tries to describe the vision in the following manner:

before Mass, (he) wanted to gain help – and humility – by first addressing Jesus...' [112]

⁶¹ On various occasions Ignatius recounts that the Divine Persons appeared in a circular form or as a sphere. This could be a symbolic way of saying that he experienced God as a being in harmony, perfect and at the same time elusive. (Cf. THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. "La experiencia de Dios...", p. 35.) García de Castro also speaks about the meaning of these words while explaining various words related to the language of mysticism. He indicates that words such as circular, spherical and so on have been used by other mystics such as Tauler and John of the Cross. (Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. "Semántica y Mística...", pp. 235-36.)

⁶² This experience was repeated as the Mass proceeded where he 'did not see nor could (he) distinguish any Persons except that, as (he) said, (he) could see the going forth or derivation of the Father.' [121]

Later at night, several times while I was writing this, the same manifestation occurred; on this occasion the understanding saw something, though by far the most part was not so clear, nor so distinct, nor as big: it was like a fairly large spark; it represented something to the understanding, or was drawing it to itself, and showed that it was the same. [125]

5.2.5.2.3 *The Divine Essence Reflected in Creatures*

As Ignatius humbled himself he realized that the 'Divine Essence was reflected in creatures.'⁶³ For a long time he looked towards the Divine Persons for confirmation and visitations. However on the 7th of March he changed his attention. His attention was to that intermediate space between the Divine Persons on high and the letters of the missal. [127]⁶⁴ The 'visitation seemed to be interior, mid-way between their seat on high and the letter.' [127] Lowering his gaze by 'looking midway caused an increased intensity of devotion and intense tears.' [128] The effect of this change was that the object of visitations was varied and they included 'now the Blessed Trinity, now the Father or Son; at times Our Lady and at others the saints, even individual saints...' [129] The shift in Ignatius from what was above was more pronounced on the 8th when he wrote:

I was shown a great humility not yet to look up to heaven, and the more I shrank from looking upwards, humbling and lowering myself, the more delight and spiritual visitations did I feel. [135]

5.2.5.2.4 *The Conformation of Ignatius' will to the will of God*

The process of election and search for conformation was an attempt by Ignatius to conform his will to the will of God. This required a high degree of humility because only through the self-emptying of his will could his will be conformed to the Divine will. Ignatius speaks about his desire to conform his will with the divine will on earlier occasions as seen in no. [81] However in this part of the *SD* we see a great urge on the

⁶³ In the classification by Ganss-Malatesta he uses this phrase in order to indicate the fourth part of stage V. It goes as follows, "He looks below and sees the Divine Essence reflected in creatures."

⁶⁴ Barrientos while speaking about the language of God makes a distinction between minor signs '*signos menores*' and signs with greater impact '*signos de mayor impacto*'. The experience on the 7th would be a sign of greater impact where God communicates directly to Ignatius and in such a manner corrects the incorrect language of Ignatius. (Cf. BARRIENTOS, NELSON. "El Diario...", p. 318.) '*Hay, en fin, unos signos de mayor impacto que conformarían el lenguaje más directo de Dios. Me refiero a las teofanías directas, que son las visitas localizadas entre «lo alto», que es el lugar de la estancia de la Trinidad, y «lo bajo» que sería la letra del misal o la «fórmula». Son estas muy numerosas y que vienen a confirmar o corregir en un sentido u otro el lenguaje de Ignacio.*'

part of Ignatius to conform to the Divine Will. On the 7th of March as he was vesting he had ‘impulses to weep and also to conform (himself) with the Divine Will that He might guide and carry (him).’ [127] He ‘wanted to adapt (himself) to the Father, to the Holy Spirit and to Our Lady...’ [140] and live ‘like an angel’ [141]⁶⁵ always ready and willing to serve God by doing God’s will. In humility he accepted the difference between God’s will and his own and recognizing his limitedness would say that, “I conformed myself to what the Lord commanded, with the thought that His Divine Majesty would supply for my defect, turning everything to good, etc.” [142]

5.2.5.2.5 *Final Confirmation*

The difference between God’s will and Ignatius’ will becomes evident as we move closer to the moment of final confirmation on the 12th of March. The two tables in 5.3.5.1 indicate that these final moments were far from pleasant. He was irritated by physical disturbance, disturbing thoughts and oscillating internal movements. He ‘could not easily find what he sought’ [144] and ‘found (himself) completely bereft of all help, unable to find delight in the mediators.’ [145] During this moment when Ignatius was desiring an end with a confirmation from on high, he would be struggling with distractions which were banal in nature. However despite the humiliation of ending in a manner which was not to his liking, the entire experience was an eye opener for him vis-à-vis his deeper motivation and the cause of this prolonged uncertainty. He says:

I seemed to be wanting too many signs, and wanting them during certain periods or during Masses ending in my own satisfaction; the question itself was clear; I was looking not for more certainty, but for a finishing touch that would be to my taste. [146]

The process of confirmation reveals a progressive movement in humility which culminates with a union between the will of God and that of Ignatius. The election

⁶⁵ On different occasions Ignatius speaks of having the attitude of an angel. Ignatius’ reference is primarily to the fact that angels are always at the service of God and attentive to God’s will. Larrañaga commenting on the attitude of angels would say, “*La bella imagen de que se sirve el Santo para caracterizar la actitud del alma en adoración mediante este acatamiento y humildad reverencial admirable, no puede ser más expresiva...*” (Cf. LARRAÑAGA, VICTORIANO. *Obras Completas...*, pp. 654.) Ruiz Jurado will speak of Ignatius’ angelic mysticism which is related to being attentive so as to serve God at all times. This is understood as an invitation to serve others without losing sight of the face of God. (Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. “*La Oración de San Ignacio...*”, p. 65.)

which had been made in the very first week of February would finally be confirmed on the 12th of March because Ignatius' fell in to the subtle temptation of self-love.⁶⁶

God who is the Divine Pedagogue would slowly enlighten and educate him. It was understandable that Ignatius would desire a confirmation which was extraordinary because the subject matter was of critical importance for the future of the Society. However God responded to him in simplicity and humility - in a manner which was known but always manifested itself in new and unique ways.

Ignatius used different means in order to know the will of God and God responded definitively fulfilling his request for a confirmation in a manner which once more affirmed the centrality of humility in the divine human encounter. In God's faithful response to the question posed by Ignatius, we find a response which helped Ignatius to grow in humility and trust in God. This is evident in the fact that the final acceptance of the will of God did not take place in a moment of spectacular glory, but in a moment of humility and apparent darkness without the signs that he had been demanding from God all along.

La larga espera de la visita de Dios se traduce para Ignacio en la prolongación de su oración. Y en la ausencia de señales, se siente finalmente impulsado a enfrentarse con la necesidad de tomar una decisión en esas circunstancias, aceptando que, en medio de su noche, la voluntad de Dios está suficientemente clara y que puede aceptar ya, con sosiego y humildad, sin por eso "tentar" a Dios. Y así renunciando a recibir más señales de Dios, Ignacio descubre la necesidad de decidirse, en forma enteramente gratuita, es decir: sin esperar más consolaciones, por el Dios de toda bondad y consolación.⁶⁷

⁶⁶ A question is often asked as to why such a large time gap between the first confirmation on the 8th of February (*'In the afternoon I once more weighed up the choices for another hour and a half or more, and made the choice for complete poverty'* [10],) and the final confirmation on the 12th of March (*'so I made my declaration before God Our Lord and all the Heavenly Court, etc., thus concluding with the matter: I would not proceed further.'* [149]) On the one hand it shows the seriousness of making the election as indicated in the Spiritual Exercises – no. 183, but more importantly shows the importance of an election being related to furthering the union with God. This is why we find that though he made a confirmation on the 18th of February (*'...Before their entire Heavenly Court I made the concluded confirmation <of my offering>...'* [47]) he still did not experience union with God. Finally only when God confirmed him on the 12th of March, did have an experience of harmony and union. (Cf. DECLoux, SIMON. "Comentario...", pp. 83-85, 93, 97.)

⁶⁷ IBID., p. 100.

5.2.6 STAGE VI – A NEW PATH OF AFFECTIONATE AWE, REVERENCE AND HUMILITY⁶⁸ [154-490]

The last stage according to Iparraguirre begins on the 13th of March and ends on the 27th of February, 1545. It covers the longest period and reveals the sublime heights of mysticism in the life of Ignatius. Iparraguirre divides this stage into 10 parts which are briefly described below:

5.2.6.1 Overview of Stage VI

The first and second parts reveal Ignatius' internal state of contentment, peace, affectionate awe and reverence. After the definitive conclusion on the 12th, he took a hiatus for four days.⁶⁹ He 'conformed (his) will to the Divine' [155] revealing a state of mystical union with God. He 'set aside (his) labors... rested... stopped searching... (and his) soul felt content and delight.' [155] Ignatius no longer sought tears, but affectionate awe and reverence, desiring that 'much reverence and affectionate awe should be shown on going to Mass – when (he) had to pronounce the name of God our Lord...' [156] Later he would restrain tears in favor of the grace of affectionate awe, 'convinced that (he) esteemed this grace and knowledge more highly for (his) soul's spiritual advancement than all the other past graces.' [157] The entry on the 16th shows that besides affectionate awe and reverence, Ignatius desired the grace of humility. [159] These graces were no longer limited to the Divine Persons but extended towards 'the altar... (and) the other things used at the sacrifice.' [160]

The third part returns to the theme of confirmation, but in a different manner – i.e. through affectionate awe and reverence. Ignatius experienced the visitation of the Divine Persons and it 'confirmed (his) previous experience with regard to the

⁶⁸ From the 14th to the 27th of March, the words '*acatamiento*, *reverencia* and *humildad*' appear frequently. While '*reverencia*' and '*humildad*' have been translated as reverence and humility; we have different translations for '*acatamiento*'. While Young would translate it as 'respect', Ganss-Malatesta would translate it as 'affectionate awe'. Munitiz would translate as 'affectionate awe.' We shall be using the word 'affectionate awe' as the best expresses the meaning of the word *acatamiento*.

⁶⁹ The comment that he 'took four days to avoid considering any points in the Constitutions' [154] along with the statement 'here I began my preparation and first 'Consideration concerning the missions' [161] once more confirm the fact that during this period the drafting of the Constitutions was a priority for Ignatius.

affectionate awe and reverence.' [162] He realized that this was the 'best of all ways that (he) could be shown and felt that (he) should follow it forever.' [162] Once again during Mass he realized that this grace was a gratuitous gift and he was incapable of getting it on his own. [163] Later he received an abundance of 'knowledge, visitation and spiritual relish... that every time he mentioned God, (he) seemed to be penetrated with an affectionate awe and reverent humility.' [164] The graces continued to be received with frequency during the subsequent days. [165-171]

The fourth part is a deeper realization that affectionate awe is God's gift. The gift of tears continued to be received and he used various words such as – 'gentle flow [169], intense [170], several times [171], copious [172]...' to qualify them. An earlier 'vision of the Divine Being, with the Father as an object, in the form of a circle' [172] reappeared and it was repeated in the entry on the 27th of March. [174] The important realization for Ignatius was that the grace of affectionate awe was a gift because 'not only could (he) feel no interior submission, but (he) could not even find any aptitude that would help (him).' [173] Once he realized this, '(he) experienced the spiritual visitation which caused affectionate awe.' [173] He would also go on to realize that 'it was more perfect to be without tears... and to find, like the angels, internal devotion and love.' [176]

The fifth part adds the gift of loving humility to the mystical graces which were being received. The first time we find the desire for this grace in the entry on the 16th and the entry on the 30th reveals to us that Ignatius had now received this grace. It is our opinion that this experience could be placed among the highest mystical graces received by Ignatius. The subsequent section shall elaborate this opinion in detail. Keeping aside other graces such as the gift of tears, he tried to 'attend solely to this loving humility.' [178] Once again he had the 'vision of the Divine Being in the form of a circle' [180] with growing awareness that the graces received were a gift, way beyond his power to achieve. [181]

The sixth part revealed to him the relation between the above mentioned graces

and being indifferent so as to be faithful to God's will.⁷⁰ The indifference is related to the gift of tears and the understanding received by Ignatius was so delicate that he found it difficult to explain it. [185] All through the *SD* we find a constant gift of tears and hence it important to realize the nature of Ignatius' statement when he says that he 'ought to be equally content if not visited with tears.' [184] Despite being equally content with or without a visitation, he states that when there existed in him 'a lack of disposition and preparation ... or having permitted thoughts that distracted (him) ... it would be better to enjoy no visitations (since) it would be for (his) spiritual profit. [185] The entry on the 3rd shows that he 'felt more content without (tears) and also affection.' [186]

The seventh part speaks about the conformity of Ignatius' will to the will of God. The two numbers are a repeat of what we saw in the beginning of this stage in no. 155. The entries on the 6th of April, 1544 (Palm Sunday) and the 7th indicate that the tears led '(him) to conform (his) will to the Divine.' [188-189]

The eighth part is described as one where there is an infused gift of tears. This period corresponds with Holy Week and hence there are two days without entries. [194-195] During a majority of these days we find the presence of tears. It must be pointed out that during this period Ignatius' manner of writing is telegraphic.

The ninth part deals with the final mystical gift of *loquela*. This is a phenomena which can be seen in the entry on the 11th of May, 1544 and Ignatius says that he 'had sometimes experienced the external *loquela*, and sometimes not, but the internal, more rarely, although on Saturday (he) found it a little more clear.' [222] He is unable to articulate it accurately, but indicates that there was 'within (him) a great harmony accompanying the internal *loquela*, but (he) could not express it.' [222] Ignatius tries to describe this experience by saying that he 'found it resembling... music of heaven.' [224] Despite this mystical gift, he was 'disturbed by someone whistling' [227] and on another occasion had scruples about whether 'the pleasure and delight caused by the *loquela*

⁷⁰ Ganns/Malatesta would relate this part towards fidelity or infidelity regarding God's will. However Iparraguirre presents it as a high degree of indifference.

were due to an evil spirit.' [234] He felt he was being instructed to pay more attention to the meaning of the words and not only to the pleasure and delight. [234]

The last entries in the Spiritual Diary go on from the 29th of May to the 27th of February. They basically referred to entries indicating whether he had received or not received the gift of tears during this period. He often used the letters *a, l, d* in order to indicate the time of having the gift of tears. From the 23rd of August to the 29th he was not well and did not celebrate Mass. From the 4th of October he began to use some more symbols and points in the Diary. The subsequent table indicates the abbreviations used by Ignatius:⁷¹

Symbol	Meaning		Symbol	Meaning
a	Tears before Mass			[after the 4 th of October, the 'a' has dots]
l	Tears during Mass		a	(no dot) tears in one of the three prayer periods
d	Tears after Mass		ä	(two dots) tears in two of the three prayer periods
o	First prayer – customary		ä'	(three dots) tears in all three prayer periods
c	Prayer in the chamber			
y	Prayer in the Church			

5.2.6.2 The Grace of Humble Love

Ignatius realized that his desire was a confirmation for his election, but God desired to instruct him in something more important – the grace of humble love. The period following the 12th of March, 1544 would reveal to us God's manner of instructing Ignatius in this important grace. God's response to an individual takes into account the unique nature of each person and hence Ignatius was led by God in a manner proper to his personality. He was educated into understanding that the grace which was more important than tears, internal movements, physical sensations, intellectual insights and so on was the grace of humble love – i.e. an attitude of humility which emerged from love and in turn led to great self-emptying love.

⁷¹ IPARRAGUIRRE/JURADO, *BAC*⁶, p. 358.

In this part we shall elaborate the understanding of humility as a privileged form of loving by highlighting three elements of the text. We shall begin by showing how Ignatius' spiritual progress after the confirmation of the 12th continued to be influenced by passivity and humble surrender. This will be followed by a comment on the sublime grace of humble love as seen in the text of the *SD*. Finally we shall end with a few notes on humility and gift of tears as well as *loquela* which continued to be constantly present in his spiritual experience.

5.2.6.2.1 *Shift towards Affectionate Awe and Reverence*

Ignatius' passive acceptance of God's will would lead to a shift in his spiritual trajectory indicating a new phase of spiritual growth. With the confirmation on the 12th of March, he found himself in a state where '(his) will conformed to the will of the Divine... and (his) soul felt content and delight.' [155] He was inspired by thoughts about 'reverence and affectionate awe that should be shown to Mass... and the name of God our Lord.' [156] He realized that the 'affectionate awe was due to God our Lord and not the effect of (his) own initiative.' [157] There was also a growing awareness that God desired to lead him on a different spiritual trajectory from what he had been accustomed so far – a way of reverence and affectionate awe. He was 'convinced (and) esteemed this grace and knowledge more highly for (his) soul's spiritual advancement than all other past graces.' [157] The shift in Ignatius' spiritual trajectory is clearly revealed in petition for graces which are different from those seen earlier. The entry on the 16th where he speaks of being confirmed once more in a different manner clearly demonstrates this spiritual shift.

I prayed in my room before Mass for the gifts of submission, reverence and humility; as for visitations and tears, I prayed they might not be given me, if it were equally to the service of His Divine Majesty, or, if they were given, that I might enjoy them with purity of intention – without self-interest. [159]

I refused tears or visitations whenever I thought of them or felt the desire for them. In this way I paid attention to submission first – the visitations coming next – because I judged that to do the opposite, i.e., to pay more attention to the visitations than to submission, would be bad. Thus I was of the same opinion as on Friday last, and felt confirmed in it. [160]

5.2.6.2.2 *The Grace of Humble Love*

The attitude of Ignatius' passivity would now prepare him for the most important grace of the *SD* – the grace of a lover's humility or humble love. On the 17th, Ignatius felt neither 'affectionate awe nor reverence... (and) felt incapable of finding it (though he) wanted to possess or find it.' [163] Later in the day, he was 'provided with such abundance of knowledge, visitation and spiritual relish... (that) he seemed to be penetrated so deeply, with a submission and reverent humility so admirable that they seemed to defy description.' [164] At this point the grace was still of humble reverence and would be repeatedly received on subsequent days. [165-172]

There was a movement in his internal state of passivity on the 26th when he says that 'not only could (he) feel no interior submission, but (he) could not even find any aptitude that would help (him).' [173] Referring to the petition related to the grace of submission he says that he was led to 'infer and recognize that (he) could not be of any assistance to (himself) in the acquisition of this submission.' [173] The depth of his spiritual growth is seen on the 29th when he speaks of a 'special, or rather a most special grace... (due to which) he thought that it was more perfect to be without tears and to find, like the angels, internal devotion and love...' [176] All these experiences would be a prelude to the singular and highest grace of loving humility that would be granted to him on the 30th of March.

Sunday[15] < Mar. 30 > ...it occurred to me that my humility, reverence and submission should be not of a man who fears but of a man who loves. So strongly did this impress itself on my soul that with great faith I said, "Give me a lover's humility," and so also concerning my reverence and submission. As I said the words, I experienced new visitations. So also I tried to check the tears in order to attend solely to this loving humility, etc. [178]

Later in the day I felt great joy when I remembered this. I resolved not to stop there but afterwards to entertain the same sentiment, viz., that of loving humility, etc., towards creatures, unless on occasions it were for the honor of God Our Lord to conduct myself differently... [179] During these periods several times I had the vision of the Divine Being in the form of a circle as before. [180]

Given the importance of this moment it would be pertinent to elaborate this grace

which Ignatius believed was greater than other graces experienced by him.⁷² The importance of humility has been seen in the spiritual trajectory of various saints who unanimously held it in high esteem.⁷³ Ignatius too considered humility to be important in his spiritual journey from his days in Manresa.⁷⁴ This attitude is seen more clearly in his life as a priest where he desired to wait for a year in order to celebrate his First Mass in Bethlehem. The humble and poor Christ filled him with greater devotion than the solemn liturgies in magnificent Churches.⁷⁵ God led him to constantly progress in humility and within this spiritual journey, an important moment would be his abandonment in the hands of God so as to receive the mystical grace of having a humble and loving attitude towards God and towards others. Thió de Pol gives a succinct summary of this journey when he says

...paulatinamente, las gracias místicas desplazan las expectativas y las prácticas ascéticas de Ignacio. Recibe el don de la devoción, de las lágrimas, de la locuela, visiones... Llega a sentirse un niño en las manos de Dios que, a la vez que le inunda de su presencia, no se deja aprehender por él. ... Dios asume el protagonismo y se le manifiesta en diversas partes, como queriendo indicarle que investigue una nueva vía. Acabará descubriéndola: consistirá en un "acatamiento reverente" y una "humildad amorosa", no sólo con respecto a Dios y a las cosas del altar, sino incluso con respecto a todas las personas y criaturas. Así, aunque son innumerables las visitaciones e inteligencias trinitarias, siente ser confirmado definitivamente por Jesús en la medida en que éste le induce a conformarse con la voluntad de Dios.⁷⁶

The new path of humble love required that Ignatius was not distracted by any

⁷² Cf. LARRAÑAGA, VICTORIANO. *BAC*, p. 652, 654.

⁷³ Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. "Gracia de Acatamiento...", pp. 152-53 After offering some notes on the importance of humility as articulated by Teresa of Ávila and John of the Cross, Jurado speaks of the esteem that various saints had for the virtue of humility. He would further on interpret loving humility as the precursor of the definitive encounter with God. '*...el ser humano es, como criatura, absoluta dependencia del Ser necesario, el encontrarse, como criatura consciente e intelectual que es con la verdad de su esencia, querida y gustada, y esto por una luz infusa y una gracia extraordinaria, debe de ser como un anticipo de la seguridad y del gozo del encuentro con la Verdad definitiva en el Amor.*'

⁷⁴ Cf. *IBID.*, p. 150. Given the frequent petition for the grace of humility, Ignatius did not take recourse to any special method of prayer or meditation. The request for this grace was thus part of his regular prayer and the response too was within the usual spiritual experiences that characterized Ignatius' life during this period.

⁷⁵ Cf. THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. *La Intimidad...*, p. 138. '*A Ignacio le aturdió la humildad y la pobreza de Jesús en el sacramento, porque se rebajaba aún más que en la cueva de Belén, amorosamente protegido por María y José. No le valían la magnificencia de los templos y de las custodias, ya que el Señor quedaba en manos de ministros pecadores y groseros, tal como se tenía él mismo. Se debería ser como un ángel, en el ministerio del altar.*'

⁷⁶ THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. "Diario Espiritual", *DEI*, p. 594.

form of self-love and be totally indifferent and disposed to God's will.⁷⁷ This grace would go on to enlighten Ignatius regarding the relative importance of the gift of tears and the visitations as against the primary and more important grace of humble love.⁷⁸ In order to experience this grace of humility, the best way was through love, but at the same time Ignatius accepted the positive value of fear as a pedagogical tool in order to grow in humility and adoration.⁷⁹

The second book of the *SD* primarily deals with Ignatius walking a new path of affectionate awe and loving humility.⁸⁰ Humility was important because it was the cornerstone for other sublime mystical graces – especially those received during the Holy Eucharist.⁸¹ God responded to the petition of Ignatius for humility on the 16th by granting him not only humility, but a special form of humility which was rooted in love. This love was towards God as well as towards all created reality⁸² because all created reality speaks to us about God.

todas las creaturas ... le hablan de Dios, son imagen de Dios: a las autoridades, al templo, a las reliquias, a las cuentas benditas, y a todos sus prójimos, porque en todo acata y reverencia la infinita Majestad de Dios, es el Santo que incendia con su celo al mundo, el Santo de la mayor gloria de Dios⁸³

The experience on the 30th was a further confirmation of the mysticism of service

⁷⁷ RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. "La oración...", p. 74. 'Hay en el Diario una observación de Ignacio que pone en relación este don precioso de "humildad amorosa" con su vida ordinaria: siente que para hallar este don en la misa "es menester en todo el día aprovecharme de ella sin distraerme" SD – [182]

⁷⁸ Cf. THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. "La experiencia...", p. 30

⁷⁹ The fear of God is considered to be a gift and leads Ignatius to a profound reverence and humility. The fear is not because of any offense committed but an awareness of the greatness of the Creator before a simple creature. (Cf. JURADO, RUIZ. "Gracia de acatamiento...", p. 147.) Ignatius uses all possible means in order to be disposed for the grace of God. This disposition also includes the fear of God, though it is always surrounded by a humble love. (Cf. THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. *Intimidad del...*, p. 179)

⁸⁰ *GM - Paulist*, p. 234

⁸¹ Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. "Gracia de acatamiento...", p. 149. 'En los días siguientes quedará claramente confirmada la voluntad de Dios de que ha de procurar conservar, durante toda la jornada, ese estado de humildad amorosa, como disposición o ayuda para encontrar la sublimidad mística de esa gracia en el tiempo del Santo Sacrificio.'

⁸² Cf. DECLoux, SIMON. "Comentario ...", p. 119. 'Ignacio, como es natural, le concede gran importancia, porque parece abrirle a sus ojos un amplio mundo, ya que la reverencia debida a Dios se extiende a todo lo suyo, es decir, en último termino, a todas las cosas creadas.'

⁸³ Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. "Gracia de acatamiento...", p. 154.

where Ignatius would better understanding the fundamental charism of the Society of Jesus – i.e. a charism of union with God through service of others. This is why in speaking about the specificity of a Jesuit vocation he would insist that a desiring candidate ought to remember that he is called to be a loving and humble servant who is always attentive and disposed to serve the Eternal King. William Young, quoting de Guibert would describe this mysticism as:

a mysticism of service through love, more than a loving union, with regard to its general orientation, resulting in a divine action over the human life, total, intellectual and sensible, rather than a mysticism of introversion . . . What stands out in his relations with the Divine Persons and with Jesus Christ is the humble and loving attitude of the servant, the eagerness to discern the desired service in its least signs; generosity in the perfect fulfilment, cost what it may, in a delightful flight of love, but at the same time with a profound sense of the infinite Majesty of God and of His transcendent holiness . . . Towards this loving, magnanimous and humble service all the magnificent infused gifts with which God filled St. Ignatius are focused and converge.⁸⁴

5.2.6.2.3 *Humility and the gift of tears*

Ignatius who had received the grace of loving humility was in a stage of healthy tension. On the one hand we can see his passivity in total submission to the will of God, but on the other hand we see the active dimension in his realization that he too ought to do all that is humanly possible. He realized the gratuitous nature of this gift because ‘at times (he) realized that neither love nor reverence, etc. were in (his) power.’ [181] However he was also aware that in order to receive these grace he too would have to do all that was humanly possible. Thus he says ‘that in order to possess this humility during the sacrifice it is necessary to profit from it all during the day allowing no distractions.’ [182]

Despite the fact that the most important grace to be desired was humility and not tears, Ignatius continued to receive the gift of tears and visitations. He ‘recognized that (he) ought to be equally content if not visited with tears’ [184] and also thought that ‘it was to be best if (he) were not visited by God our Lord.’ [185] The subsequent days saw

⁸⁴ YOUNG, WILLIAM. *The Spiritual...*, p. 10. (quoted from DE GUIBERT, JOSE. *La Spiritualité de la Compagnie de Jésus*, pp. 33, 39, 41, 42.)

him experiencing the gift of tears in an erratic manner.⁸⁵ Between the 10th and 29th we have reference to the grace of *loquela*.⁸⁶ Given the importance of the gift of tears let us now briefly elaborate this further.

There is hardly any parallel in Christian hagiography to the *SD* as far as the gift of tears is concerned.⁸⁷ Within the oriental tradition, great importance is given to tears and the *SD* offers us a glimpse that in the spiritual itinerary of Ignatius, tears have an important place. Various expressions are used in order to describe the phenomena of tears.⁸⁸ The extraordinary nature of Ignatius' gift of tears is well described by de Guibert in *The Jesuits Their Spiritual Doctrine and Practice – A Historical Study*.

That which is most extraordinary and truly disconcerting in the mystical life of Ignatius, especially in what he reveals in his *SD* is the place occupied there by the gift of tears. In the first part of the manuscript, for the forty days from February 2 to March 12, tears are mentioned 175 times, or on an average of more than four times a day... His longer accounts disappear about the end of May, and for the last nine months the diary is only a record, kept in minute detail, of the gift of tears. We should add that the mention of tears is accompanied 26 times by that of sobs (*sollozos*). Fourteen times it is noted that tears prevent the saint from speaking. On March 3, for example, at the beginning of Mass, he has endless pain in his effort to begin and say *In nomine Patris*. Sometimes the abundance of tears is such that he is afraid of losing his eyesight if he continues to say Mass. It is so for February 5, March 4, and again for October 5, 6, 7, and 21.⁸⁹

Though tears are a gift from God they are not necessary for spiritual life. Ignatius' spiritual itinerary indicates a transition from tears towards the grace of humility, affectionate awe and reverence with three days (27th February, 3rd & 8th March) being

⁸⁵ Between the 3rd of April and the 10th of May there were 25 days when he had tears, 12 when he had no tears and on two days there was no entry. After the 29th of May, the entries mainly point to the phenomenon of tears.

⁸⁶ The gift of *loquela* is a special mystical gift received by Ignatius and its meaning remains obscure despite various references to it in the *SD*. Unlike other divine communications which were more simple in nature, the experience of *loquela* could be considered among the exceptions. In Latin, *loquela* refers to 'a divinely granted gift of 'speech', 'language' or 'discourse'. This phenomena is seen in the *SD* from the 11th of May to the 28th of May. (Cf. DE GUIBERT, JOSEPH. *The Jesuits Their Spiritual Doctrine and Practice – A Historical Study*, (Tr. Young, William – Ed. Ganss, George), The Institute of Jesuit Sources: St. Louis, 1986, p. 61) It must also be pointed out that other aspects of the tone, harmony, significance, music, its purificatory function, divine instruction, etc. have been commented upon.

⁸⁷ LARRAÑAGA, VICTORIANO. *BAC*¹..., 641. 'El hecho es tan excepcional en San Ignacio, que pocas veces habrá sido igualado en la hagiografía católica, aun tratándose de los mayores santos contemplativos de la Iglesia.'

⁸⁸ Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 641-644.

⁸⁹ DE GUIBERT, JOSEPH. *The Jesuits Their Spiritual Doctrine ...*, p. 62.

significant.⁹⁰ Despite this transition it must be said that tears are the result of an intense relationship and communication with God.⁹¹ Just as a relationship cannot be forced, tears too cannot be forced and are the graced expression of an encounter with the Divine.⁹² A growing sensitivity to the gift of tears allows one to see that the different kinds of tears reflect different levels of relationship. This is why the structure of the three degrees of humility is used in order to distinguish the various kinds of tears.

... señalamos cómo aplica la norma de la tercera manea de humildad al don de lágrimas. Y, aunque no de modo tan explícito, se dan reflejos del principio y fundamento en sus sentimientos sobre el acatamiento, reverencia y humildad; se observa un paralelismo sorprendente entre el aborrecimiento por los pecados y desórdenes de la primera semana, y su afán de purificación mística y sentimientos de vergüenza y confusión ante las imperceptibles miserias que empañaban la visión de la Santísima Trinidad; se percibe la vivencia de la contemplación de amor en su insistente palpar la acción de la Trinidad en las criaturas.⁹³

5.3 HUMILITY AND MYSTICISM IN THE *SPIRITUAL DIARY*

After the conversion of Ignatius, he manifested a strong desire to be faithful to the will of God. This desire was all the more evident when he had to make an election – especially an election about an issue as important as poverty in the Society of Jesus. As we observe the experience of Ignatius' election and confirmation we realize that humility is a fundamental component in the mystical life of Ignatius. He was able to move out of his self-love and become more other-centered in proportion to his growth in humility. The *SD* reveals to us the intimate relationship between humility and a mystical life where mystical life consists in a transformed relationship with God. This transformed relationship leads to a new existence where a person grows in devotion leading to greater union with God through the service of others.

⁹⁰ Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. "Entorno la gracia de acatamiento amoroso", *Manresa* – 135, 1963, p. 145.

⁹¹ Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. "La Oración...", p. 72. '*Las lágrimas que aparecen en el Diario son generalmente efecto de una vivencia intensamente sentida en su comunicación con Dios. Suelen ir acompañadas de mucha devoción...*'

⁹² Thió de Pol offers the doctrine of tears as indicated in the Spiritual Exercises. He further goes on to offer a more complete summary of a doctrine on tears which include five points. These include: a) Tears can weaken the body and soul; b) a legitimate object of the desire because of the benefit that can accrue through it; c) One needs to be careful about the purity of intention; d) it is inferior to other gifts such as loving humility, locuela and conformation with the will of God; e) with this gift the graces and visitations are imprinted more definitively in a person's memory. (Cf. THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. *La Intimidad...*, p. 213.)

⁹³ IPARRAGUIRRE/JURADO, *BAC*⁶, p. 274.

5.3.1 HUMILITY IN THE DIVINE-HUMAN RELATIONSHIP

The dimension of humility within the context of the Divine-Human relationship shall be elaborated in three points. The first will highlight the humility of Ignatius as well as the humility of God who descended to communicate with Ignatius in a language that was understood by him. Secondly we shall show that the spiritual trajectory of Ignatius consisted in an ascending movement towards greater participation in the Trinitarian life as well as a descending movement towards greater participation in the labouring love of God as manifested in created realities. Finally we shall end with a note regarding the mysticism of humility as an indication of the highest form of mystical union within the Christian tradition.

Ignatius was no stranger to the process of election as a means to know the will of God. However he was also aware that the realization of God's will and the confirmation was a gift from God which one could only passively wait for. The humility of Ignatius is seen in the fact that he joyfully abandoned himself to God and each time he made this leap of faith he was filled with tears.⁹⁴ He realized that God led him through unsuspecting paths towards a new form of relationship which was rooted in loving humility.⁹⁵ Ignatius' humility towards God was complemented by his humility towards all created reality because all created reality reflected in some degree the image of God.⁹⁶ The *SD* reaffirmed Ignatius' experience of the redemptive value of humility wherein he once again understood that a confirmation is a gratuitous gift of God. The joy of such humility strengthened the covenant of love leading to greater harmony with God and with others.⁹⁷

The humility of God on the other hand is seen in the fact that God necessarily responds to a person who desires to make an election and this response opens up new

⁹⁴ Cf. THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. 'Experiencia...', p. 31.

⁹⁵ *IBID.*, p. 35.

⁹⁶ Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. "Acatamiento...", p. 150.

⁹⁷ Cf. DECLoux, SIMON. "Commentario...", p. 97.

horizons.⁹⁸ The response of God is respectful and in a language which is understandable to the human person. In the *SD* we find that Ignatius' entire being is influenced by God in the process of communication. The physical, emotional, psychological, volitional, spiritual and other faculties of his being reveal to him the will of God. The humility of God is also seen in the fact that God patiently continues to respond until the person has received the necessary grace and is transformed so as to conform to God's desire.⁹⁹

The *SD* indicates the ascending and descending dimension of humility as evidenced in the spiritual process of Ignatius. Ignatius is humble as he approached the mediators in order to approach the Divine Persons. He knows that by himself he cannot ascend to participate in the life of the Triune God and hence petitions the various mediators so that he is enlightened to do Their will.¹⁰⁰ However in this process of ascent he once again realized that participation in the Triune God consists in a descent. The shift takes place on the 7th of March when there is a change of direction as he becomes more aware of his mission of being sent to the world.¹⁰¹ This experienced will be reinforced repeatedly during this month until the final confirmation on the 30th of March. [178] Here he realizes that he is being invited to have an attitude of humble love towards all creatures – an attitude which is rooted in the labouring love of the God. This mysticism of descent and service is in harmony with his entire spiritual trajectory as seen in the *Autobiography* and as will be seen in the *Spiritual Exercises*.¹⁰²

5.3.2 NEW LIFE THROUGH AFFECTIONATE AWE, REVERENCE AND HUMBLE LOVE

The *SD* offers us a glimpse of the intimate relation between God and Ignatius – a relationship which revealed new life and a transformed existence. Various words are used to mention this transformed state where the divine invasions into his soul can be seen in his mystical experiences during prayer and the presence of extraordinary

⁹⁸ Cf. BARRIENTOS, NELSON. "Acatamiento...", pp. 317-18.

⁹⁹ Cf. IBID., p. 322.

¹⁰⁰ Cf. THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. *La Intimidad...*, p. 93.

¹⁰¹ Cf. GIULIANI, MAURICE. *Journal Spirituel...*, p. 32.

¹⁰² Cf. DECLoux, SIMON. "Commentario...", p. 118. Decloux indicates the meticulous care taken by Ignatius in order to choose the best means of serving the Lord. This is because the mysticism of Ignatius is one of service where he believed that serving one's neighbor was a privileged means for union with God.

mystical phenomena. These include words such as: infused tears of reverential joy (*lagrimas*), insights (*inteligencias*), visions (*visiones*), visitations (*visitaciones*), touches (*tocamientos*), affectionate awe (*acatamiento*), reverence (*reverencia*), loving humility (*humildad amorosa*), and locutions (*loquela*).¹⁰³

The mystical experiences could be classified under various thematic headings. However it can be said that most of them were Trinitarian in character – the 112 reference offer ample proof of the same.¹⁰⁴ Though we also find it strongly Christocentric, it is primarily Trinitarian because it indicates a consistent effort to participate in the Trinitarian life of total self-emptying love.¹⁰⁵ The text of the Spiritual Diary takes us to the heart of Ignatius and we have here some of the most elevated and sublime mystical experiences. We have a glimpse of the profound and intimate relation to the Holy Trinity and the dynamics of the interior life.¹⁰⁶

We also find it strongly Eucharistic and liturgical because most of the graces are received within the context of the Eucharist or other forms of liturgical celebrations.¹⁰⁷ The mysticism can also be called affective and intellectual because of the constant narrations of internal motions and enlightenments – all of them leading to greater harmony in the life of Ignatius.¹⁰⁸ The humility of Ignatius led him to greater devotion whereby despite the various activities he was engaged in,¹⁰⁹ he experienced an ever increasing ease in encountering God at all times.¹¹⁰ An analysis of the text indicates that Ignatius' prayer reveals the essential characteristics of infused prayer, i.e. simple vision

¹⁰³ GANSS/MALATESTA, *Classics*, p. 230.

¹⁰⁴ Cf. IPARRAGUIRRE/JURADO, *BAC*, p. 271.

¹⁰⁵ Cf. YOUNG, WILLIAM. *The Spiritual...*, p. 3.

¹⁰⁶ Cf. IPARRAGUIRRE/JURADO, *BAC*, p. 271.

¹⁰⁷ Cf. DECLoux, SIMON. "Commentario..." , p. 115.

¹⁰⁸ Cf. IBID., p. 116.

¹⁰⁹ While we know that the *SD* mainly reveals Ignatius' experiences during prayer and Mass, he led a very active life during this period and he was aware of the mystical experiences during the other parts of the day as well. [22, 42, 55, 74, 89, 110, 124]

¹¹⁰ Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. "Experiencia...", pp. 69, 76-77. The *SD* shows that Ignatius was able to experience the presence of God at various times. It also shows how anything could become a theme to communicate with God. We thus see that the various moments of prayer also include moments of sickness, weakness, psychological difficulties, appointments with important personalities, going about the streets of Rome and other apostolic engagements.

and simplicity in experience of God, passivity and knowledge and infused love which indicates the independence of God which is above all our efforts.

Los tres rasgos principales que los teólogos están de acuerdo en considerar como caracteres esenciales de la oración infusa se revelan aquí en cada página: visión simple e intuitiva de las cosas divinas, sin multiplicidad de conceptos ni discursos; pasividad completa del conocimiento y del amor infusos, dados y reiterados por Dios con soberana independencia de todos nuestros esfuerzos. Todos los detalles del *Diario* se encuadran plenamente en estas líneas maestras de la contemplación infusa.¹¹¹

The mystical experience of Ignatius concretely manifests itself in affectionate awe, reverence and humble love. This humility that Ignatius learns during this process is not limited towards God, but to all reality.¹¹² The new way that Ignatius is taught has as its central element humility wherein he as a creature is invited to have the proper attitude towards a loving Creator. This relationship has love as its foundation, and hence the awe is an 'affectionate awe' and humility is 'loving humility.' The nature of this relationship is not primarily in the visitations and feelings that it evokes, but in its gratuitous nature of God who freely showers the human person with God's love and grace. Such is the nature of this experience which results from the attitude of humble acceptance that overflows in an attitude of affectionate awe, reverence and humility.

(Ignacio) descubre y formula que el Nuevo camino, o el don insinuado mediante la variación desde copiosas visitaciones al silencio, es precisamente la actitud de acatamiento, reverencia y humildad (16 de marzo). Por lo tanto el objeto del regalo divino no era la visitación en sí misma, por excelente y gustosa que fuese, sino la conciencia de la separación esencial y de la unión gratuita que implicaba la variación. Ignacio se conmueve y aparta de sí otros dones y gracias para fijarse y aprovecharse de esta nueva enseñanza de Dios. Comprueba que no es obra suya y que tampoco sería capaz de producirla, sino que le viene dada de lo alto. Nota también que esta nueva actitud se expande poco a poco hacia la Eucaristía y hacia las cosas relacionadas con el culto divino e, incluso, hacia toda persona y criatura.¹¹³

Ignatius realized that the election would not be the end of the learning process because he would continue to be taught to walk the path of affectionate awe, reverence

¹¹¹ IPARRAGUIRRE /JURADO, BAC, p. 275. [This is based on a quote from De Guibert, *Mystique ignatienne: RAM - 19*, (1938)]

¹¹² THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. "Diario Espiritual...", p. 594.

¹¹³ THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. *La Intimidad...*, p. 179.

and loving humility. He realized that this was the path which God wanted him to take and that he 'ought to attach a greater value to this grace and knowledge than to all other past graces.' He also was made to learn that 'to walk along this path was to go straight ahead in the service of God our Lord.' In order to transform the internal attitude of Ignatius, the methodology of God was to use an experience of humiliation and desolation in order to open Ignatius' eyes of understanding so that he could be increasingly conformed to the self-emptying love of the Trinitarian God.

Finally it can be said that the *SD* is a good example of Ignatius teaching by his own example and life. What is proposed in the Spiritual Exercises is applied concretely here. In a special way we find Ignatius' using all the three times of election in order to take a decision on the issue of fixed incomes. He also applies other suggestions made in the Spiritual Exercises in order to know and conform himself to the will of God.

The Deliberation and the Diary taken together are a remarkable instance of teaching by example. They show how Ignatius himself applied to the problems arising in his own daily life the principles and procedures which he taught to others in the Exercises. We understand far more concretely what he meant when he wrote of colloquies and triple colloquies, his mediators, spiritual consolation and desolation; and particularly, how in making an Election he flexibly interwove the Third and Second Times (*SpEx* [177 and 176]). His procedure in this is a very authentic commentary on his statement in the Exercises.¹¹⁴

CONCLUSION

Ignatius was slowly discovering that true devotion consists in 'finding God in all things.' Prayer and the Eucharist were privileged moments in Ignatius' ongoing spiritual journey. Ignatius was also open to God's communication at other levels – primary among which were the Church and the community. He had realized this during the course of his life as well as the Deliberations of 1539. The mysticism of the *SD* reveals to us an Ignatius who was highly advanced in spiritual matters and the receiver of abundant graces. Despite this privileged position, he was led by God to once again understand the meaning and importance of humility.

¹¹⁴ GANSS/MALATESTA. *Classics...*, pp. 231-32.

This chapter has offered us a glimpse into the extraordinary mystical life of Ignatius. Within this unknown life, we find that the mystical peak consisted in the grace of humble love. In comparing it with other mystical experiences, it has been considered to be a singular grace which can be compared with the presence of the soul in the 7th mansion as explained by Teresa of Jesus.¹¹⁵ It once more underlines the fact that for Ignatius the grace of humility is primarily a concrete expression of love – Divine as well as human love.

We now move on to another foundational text of the Society of Jesus – the Spiritual Exercises (*SpEx*). Though it was redacted by Ignatius, it draws on various sources of the Christian tradition. The Spiritual Exercises as designed by Ignatius was and continues to be the fundamental experience for anyone desiring to belong to the Society of Jesus. In the next chapter we shall indicate how humility is a transversal theme within the experience of the Spiritual Exercises.

¹¹⁵ Cf. LARRAÑAGA, VICTOR. *BAC*¹, pp. 663-669.

CHAPTER 6

HUMILITY IN THE *SPIRITUAL EXERCISES*

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

The Spiritual Exercises (*SpEx*) of Ignatius are considered to be an invaluable part of Christian spiritual literature and was fundamental in the formation of the first stable group of companions in Paris. During the first years of the Society, Ignatius and the first companions delineated six experiences as essential for a candidate's initial years of formation. The most important experience in order to live the Ignatian charism is the *SpEx*. The *SpEx* is a short but succinct document and the purpose¹ is to provide a method to 'any means of preparing and disposing our soul to rid itself of all its disordered affections and then, after their removal, of seeking and finding God's will in the ordering of our life for the salvation of our soul.' [1]²

¹ Modern authors would interpret the end of the Spiritual Exercises in a wider sense. It is understood as a means to enter into a new relationship with God. Cf. IGLESIAS, IGNACIO. "Elementos instrumentales de la experiencia de Ejercicios Ignacianos", *Manresa* – 236, 1988, p. 242. '*Es reducir y empobrecer los E.E. plantearlos como un método de quitar affecciones desordenadas y de no determinarse por ellas; una especie de cirugía ascética, con la que se extirpa un tumor, que vuelva a reproducirse. El secreto de los E.E. (si se puede hablar así) es desarrollar, dar espacio y aire, a otras affections (los que más se querrán afectar; para más afectarse). Y es que en definitiva lo que está en juego es una 'amistad'. La 'nueva amistad' de Dios con cada ser humano ha de hacerse concreta, experimentable, incluso bajo formas imprevisible que Ignacio... no duda en calificar de abrazo de Dios.*'

² Within this chapter the numbers presented in square brackets [], refer to numbers of the Spiritual Exercise of Ignatius of Loyola. The translation used for this purpose is that of GANSS, GEORGE. *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius*, The

The Exercises point to a unique pathway to God³ and it the *SpEx* was largely responsible for opening Ignatius' eyes of understanding. Through it there emerged in him a profound modesty and humility where he internally understood things human and divine. This experience was in turn shared with the other companions, during the sojourn in Paris. Their lives were transformed and the future of the group was shaped by this fundamental experience. This in turn would influence the lives of others who came in contact with them resulting in the emergence of unique charism within the larger context of a spiritual tradition within the Church.

Though a great deal has been written and said about the *SpEx*, we shall limit ourselves to two tasks. The first task is to show how humility is a transversal theme in the *SpEx* and is constantly present in its different parts and secondly how humility is an integral part of the overall dynamics of the *SpEx*.

We shall begin with a brief note about the disposition of humility that is expected of the exercitant as well as the director and how it is part of the very Principal and Foundation. This will be followed with the development of the attitude of humility in each of the four weeks with special emphasis on the second week where we have two key meditations of the *SpEx* which help us better understand humility as interpreted in the charism of the Society. These include the meditations on the Kingdom and the Two Standards which are two fundamental meditations in order to understand the charism of the Society.⁴ Closely linked to this is the meditation on the three degrees of humility where one freely desires to identify with Christ who is poor and humble.⁵ Finally the

Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 1992.

³ Cf. JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for Mission – A Spiritual Reading of the Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*, (Tr. Brennan, Francis C.), The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 2001, p. 1. '*...the Exercises points out a path open to all human beings who choose to direct their lives toward God...*'

⁴ MNad – V, p. 40. '*Aquí le comunicó N.S. los ejercicios, guiándole desta manera para que todo se empleasse en el servitio suyo y salud de las almas; lo qual le mostró con devoción specialmente en dos ejercicios, scilicet, del Rey y de las banderas. Aquí entendió su fin y aquello a que todo se debía aplicar y tener por scopo en todas sus obras, que es el que tiene aora la Compañía.*'

⁵ VEALE, JOSEPH. "From Exercises to Constitutions – A Spirit in search of a Body", *Constitutions of the Society of Jesus – Incorporation of a Spirit*, Gujarat Sahitya Prakash: Anand, 1993, p. 16. '*...in the course of making the Exercises that it begins to be clear that the freedom (indifference) of the Principle and Foundation is a freedom to desire to be identified with Christ who is poor and don the cross, a desire which is ready to enter into the consequences of doing his work in his way and to share his*

section would end with some concluding remarks on how the attitude of humility is indispensable in order to continue living the *SpEx* in our day to day life.

6.1 THE PREDISPOSITION TO BEGIN THE SPIRITUAL EXERCISES

6.1.1 HUMILITY IN THE ANNOTATIONS

The annotations use different words in order to indicate that one ought to have the attitude of humility when beginning the *SpEx*.⁶ At the onset the phrase ‘understanding the realities profoundly and in savoring them interiorly’ points to the need of humility and cautions against the danger of pride. [2]⁷ Another word is ‘reverence’ [3], where the exercitant is invited to have the attitude of reverence when conversing with ‘God our Lord or his saints...’ [3] Yet another is ‘generosity’ [5], where the exercitant is invited to enter into the Exercises with ‘great spirit and generosity towards their Creator and Lord, and by offering all their desires and freedom to him.’ [5]⁸ The disposition desired here is radical and absolute and is a prelude to the attitude elucidated in the three degrees of humility. The exercitant is expected to offer oneself unconditionally to God and dispose oneself entirely to God’s will. Anything short of a desire of total self-giving would in

experience “since he is the way that leads men to life”.

⁶ Initially Ignatius personally gave the *SpEx* and with experience he felt the need to write the annotations to clarify for the exercitant the attitude that was expected. Of primary importance was the attitude of the exercitant to surrender oneself in all humility and place oneself in the hands of God. ‘Cf. GONZALEZ MAGAÑA, EMILIO. “Anotaciones”, *DEI*, p. 171. ‘...cuando él daba personalmente el ‘modo y orden de los Ejercicios, descubría la necesidad de delinear claramente la actitud del ejercitante para ponerse en manos de Dios...’

⁷ The exercitant is cautioned against the pride of accumulating information which is merely intellectual in nature and hence the grace of internal knowledge and relish is emphasized by Ignatius. This phrase is fundamental in order to understand the spirituality of the Exercises. (Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, Gracewing: Herefordshire, 1998, p.4.) ‘It should be read not as distinguishing between knowledge in an objective sense and the subjective experience of feeling and relish, but between different levels of knowledge: the knowledge that exists solely or largely on the level of intellect, and the felt knowledge which involves the affections. The latter will be referred to in the Exercises as inner knowledge (no. 63, 104, 333). It can be called ‘inner’ in two senses: it belongs to the ‘interior’ (or heart) of the person knowing; and it penetrates beyond the immediately obvious to the ‘inner’ mystery of meaning of the person or truth known.’

⁸ When speaking of generosity it is necessary to briefly speak of Ignatius’ insistence to go against one’s disordered tendencies as seen in nos. 13, 21. This has given rise to a charge of excessive voluntarism, Pelagianism and semi-Pelagianism. However anyone familiar with the entire development of the Exercises find that the underlying spirit of the *SpEx* is one of gratitude where one realizes that everything is a gift of God and all human effort and grace are within the ambit of the gratuitous self-donation to the Trinity. (Cf. ENGLISH, JOHN. *Spiritual Freedom*, Loyola Press: Chicago, 1995, p. 19. (2nd ed.))

itself be a block to experience the graces of God.⁹

An important point related to humility is seen in number 15 where the director is asked to intervene in such a manner that would 'allow the Creator to deal immediately with the creature and the creature with its Creator and Lord.' [15] The choice of words such as 'Creator' and 'creature' indicates the disposition that the exercitant ought to have as the *SpEx* begins. The use of the title 'creature' is significant because through the use of this term, Ignatius situates the human person in relation to God within a context of poverty, humility and absolute dependency. However God takes the initiative in order to enter into a direct relationship with the creature and hence the word 'creature'¹⁰ does not refer to a debased humility, but one which is loving, respectful and redemptive.

The director too is invited to maintain an attitude of humility and be respectful of the exercitant's process. He ought to 'repeatedly recall that God is the real director of the retreat'¹¹ and the primary interaction is between God and the exercitant. In no way should the director try to influence the exercitant and his attitude should be like that of 'a pointer of a balance' [15] The humility of the director ought to be manifest in the interview where he is respectful¹² and adaptive to the situation of the exercitant.¹³ Thus the disposition within which the *SpEx* takes place ought to be one of attentive humility on the part of both the exercitant as well as the director.

⁹ ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios Espirituales...*, pp. 83-84.

¹⁰ This point led Ignatius to have various difficulties with the Inquisition. However so convinced was he of this process that he held on to his position. In fact the report on the Exercises commissioned by the Archbishop of Toledo in 1553 censured this part as 'clearly made by an illuminist.' (*Pol-Chro – MHSI*, vol. 3, pp. 503-24.)

¹¹ GROGAN, BRIAN. "'To Make the Exercises Better': The Additions", *The Way of Ignatius Loyola - Contemporary Approaches to the Spiritual Exercises*, (Ed. Sheldrake, Philip), SPCK: London, 1991, p. 42.

¹² He should also be careful that he does not transmit an impression that he has a low opinion about the subject. (Cf. (Ed.) PALMER, MARTIN. *On Giving the Spiritual Exercises – The Early Jesuit Manuscript Directories and the Official Directory of 1599*, The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 1996, p. 166. 'The director should be careful not to give the exercitant cause to suspect that the director harbors an unfavorable opinion of him, even if he is not behaving particularly well. Rather, he should constantly encourage him to go diligently forward on the path of God's service which he has undertaken.'

¹³ The director ought to be open to different kinds of exercitants and not discriminate against anyone for personal gain. The director also ought to be flexible to different kinds of situations which may arise and in elaborating the different kinds of situations, Michael Ivens presents three groups of persons: a) those who have limited aspirations; b) those with limited mental ability or education and finally c) those who lack the capacity to go beyond the First Week. Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises...*, 1998, p.19.

6.1.2 PRINCIPAL AND FOUNDATION AS A CALL TO HUMILITY

The similar attitude is present in the elaboration of the Principal and Foundation where the goal and disposition of the human person vis-à-vis God, oneself and all reality is indicated. The human person is made aware of the truth of his/her existence and is humbly made to realize that the goal of all reality, including human existence is the glorification of a loving God. It was important for the director to check if the exercitant had understood this fundamental truth in order to proceed further.¹⁴ The awareness of being a creature whose very existence was in the context of God's glory and not personal aggrandizement indicates the importance of having an attitude of humility in order to enter into the *SpEx*.

The realization of being a creature and the attitude of humility that it entails is desired not as one who is a slave, but as one who is a free being. A human person is a creature who as a free being glorifies God and in doing so, shares in God's divine love.¹⁵ This entails that the human person has a responsibility to cultivate the necessary freedom in order to use and not abuse other created reality in order that God is glorified. The attitude of humility would thus allow a person to grow in freedom and lead to a healthy respect for created reality, allowing him to use creation as a means towards the end of glorifying God and at the same times becomes a means for the redemption of all creation.¹⁶

Two qualities proposed in order that this goal is achieved are the qualities of indifference and the magis. Indifference is not a stoical attitude of cold indifference, but a humble desire to seek and find the will of God. It consists in placing oneself totally in

¹⁴ For those who were already advanced in spiritual life, the P&F could be given along with the two exams on the first day. However for those who were less disposed, it would be good to stay with the P&F for two days. (Cf. (Ed.) PALMER, MARTIN E. *On Giving the ...*, pp. 20-21.)

¹⁵ Cf. ENGLISH, JOHN. *Spiritual Freedom...*, p. 24. English agrees that the human person is created to share in the love of God. However in order to share in this love we need to become aware of the fact that we are first recipients of this love. Only an experience of such love gives us an impetus to praise, reverence and serve God.

¹⁶ Cf. ROYÓN, ELÍAS. "Principio y Fundamento", *DEI...*, p. 1492. '*...mientras la creación se presenta como un camino para que el hombre alcance su fin, el hombre se transforma en camino, querido por Dios, por donde la creación entera evoluciona hasta Dios en el Cristo total.*'

the hands of God¹⁷ who is the center of one's life as against all other values which are transitory and relative. This attitude is complemented with that of the magis where the total and inexhaustible capacity for self-emptying love of the human person allows one to continuously progress in spiritual life. The capacity of human freedom manifest in the qualities of indifference and the 'magis' allows a person to progress in an unlimited way towards the call to greater communion with God.¹⁸

Indifference and magis are in keeping with the dynamics of the three degrees of humility which are a prelude to making an election. While the stage of indifference would be more apt for the second degree of humility and the third class of person, the magis would more particularly refer to the third degree of humility.¹⁹ The Principal and Foundation ends with the exercitant being exhorted to an attitude of humility by inviting him to 'desire and choose only that which is more conducive to the end for which (he) was created.' [23]

6.2 THE GRACE OF COMPUNCTION AND SORROW DURING THE FIRST WEEK

6.2.1 THE THREE EXAMENS AS AN EXERCISE OF HUMILITY

During the First Week Ignatius proposes a three dimensional method to help a person in the process of purification and this includes a particular Examen [24], general confession [32] and daily Examen [43].²⁰ George A. Aschenbrenner says that the daily Examen as

¹⁷ IBID., p. 1493. "Ignacio nos da aquí una definición de lo que se entiende por indiferencia: 'colocarse enteramente en manos de Dios'.

¹⁸ ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios Espirituales...* p. 121. 'El 'más' de la docilidad a la voluntad divina, así como el más de la relación positiva del hombre a las cosas, es el horizonte inagotable de libertad, y la llamada a la comunión con un Dios 'siempre Mayor' que, en su amor providente, desea entregarse por completo al hombre [234]. El telón de fondo del más ignaciano es precisamente la imagen de Dios, totalmente Otro y trascendente en su amor, radicalmente desemejante de los pensamientos que el hombre se pueda forjar acerca de él...'

¹⁹ Cf. ROYÓN, ELÍAS. "Principio...", pp. 1495-96. 'La indiferencia del PF presente en la segunda Manera de Humildad, se recoge también en la actitud del tercer Binario, del "que quiere solamente quererla o no quererla, según que Dios nuestro Señor le pondrá en voluntad" [Ej 155].... Pues bien, a este tercer grado de "amor a Dios", inicia la conclusión del texto del PF y concretamente a la dinámica del magis que presenta.'

²⁰ The practical nature of Ignatius' methodology is will be seen on other occasions too. We see here a classic example of Ignatius dealing with the obstacles to human freedom from three perspectives. First of all he deals with concrete and specific issues with the particular Examen. Success in dealing with the major obstacle allows the person to experience a certain degree of freedom. This is reflected in the context of one's overall life and the general confession

well as the other forms of Examen are a...

...very personal, honest, and at times a very subtle experience of the Lord calling in our hearts for deeper conversion to Himself. The matter of the conversion may remain the same for a long period of time, but the important thing is our sense of His personal challenge to us.²¹

The process of the two Examen and the general confession proposed by Ignatius is a method which is strongly Christocentric and hence the attitude which emerges from a faithful application of this methodology is that of genuine humility and unworthiness before the love of God revealed in the Crucified.²²

The particular Examen helps the individual become humbly aware of the presence of a root sin within oneself. However one also realizes that one need not be a constant slave of sin, but by dealing with one root sin at a time, it was possible to live a life of freedom.²³ Polanco would highlight the fact that a person ought to focus on one sin at a time. Even though there would be more than one fault, still 'it was best to engage in single combat with just one or another at a time... Once it had been vanquished or substantially weakened, we can direct this special effort against another.'²⁴

The general Examen in order to make a confession of one's life was another means of growing in humility. A person acknowledges the external influence (both from the good as well as the evil spirit) as well as the influence of one's own freedom and desire on one's thoughts, words and deeds. (*SpEx* – 32,2) An individual becomes painfully

helps a person to grow in freedom and move away from a life that is sinful, broken and oriented away from God. Once a person has taken stock of one's life, is aware of one's sinfulness and has re-oriented one's life towards God, Ignatius presents the daily Examen in order to help the subject progress towards a life of freedom and more authentic discipleship.

²¹ ASCHENBRENNER, GEORGE A. "Consciousness Examen", *Review for Religious*, Vol. - 31, 1972, p. 19.

²² The Examen are not merely techniques in order to be conscious of oneself and engage in a process of introspection. They are proposed within a frame of reference which is Christological and though it may be adapted by various groups, the presentation in the Exercises is within a context of following Christ and living for His Kingdom.

²³ The root sin and the root grace are linked whereby the energy expended in the root sin is channelized towards the root grace. (Cf. COUTINHO, PAUL. *Just as You Are*, Loyola Press: Chicago, 2009, p. 46.) 'Each person has one root sin, and all of his or her sins are an expression of that root sin. But amazingly when we find our root sin, we will also find our root grace. Our root grace is the same energy of our root sin channelized in a positive direction. The root sin and root grace are linked.'

²⁴ Cf. (Ed.) PALMER, MARTIN E. *On Giving the Spiritual Exercises....*, p. 127.

aware of the consequences of a life that is centered on self-love. The general Examen and confession was an aid to help a person move out of one's narcissistic mode of living and take responsibility for one's life.²⁵ A thorough examination of one's thoughts, words and deeds would help a person reconcile oneself into the Paschal Mystery of God²⁶ and the continued participation in this sacrament helps a person to persevere in an attitude of humility and docility towards God.

The daily Examen is yet another means of growing in humility where the focus shifts from the obstacles of daily life, towards a general awareness of the constant presence of God. Two important attitudes that the daily Examen attempts to foment in the individual are those of gratitude and humility in order to respond more generously to the love of God. The person begins the daily Examen with a sense of gratitude to God humbly realizing that despite all that the human person achieves, God will always be the primary reality of our lives.²⁷

The second step wherein the individual asks for the grace of illumination in order to 'know (one's) sins and rid oneself of them' again requires the attitude of humility and poverty. The individual knows that that one can only be enlightened on realizing one's poverty and humbly by opening oneself to the gift of the Spirit.

...we begin the Examen with an explicit petition for that enlightenment which will occur in and through our own powers but which our own natural powers could never be capable of all by themselves. That the Spirit may help me to see myself a bit more as He sees me Himself. ...The stance of a Christian in the midst of the world is that of a poor person, possessing nothing, not even himself, and yet being gifted at every instant in and through everything. ... Only the truly poor person can appreciate the slightest gift and feel genuine gratitude. The more deeply we live in faith the poorer we are and the more gifted; life itself becomes humble, joyful thanksgiving. This should gradually become an

²⁵ Cf. CHÉRCOLES, ADOLFO M^a. - RAMBLA, JOSEP M^a. "Examen de Conciencia", *DEI*, p. 844. "El examen en San Ignacio, no es un ejercicio narcisístico-culpublizador, sino un tomar conciencia de la propia responsabilidad frente a la realidad desde la escucha a Dios."

²⁶ *IBID.*, p. 849. "... el examen ignaciano que es una experiencia de fe y de profunda conversión abre de modo particular a la persona que lo practica a recurrir como pobre al Padre misericordioso y a la intercesión de la comunidad de la que se siente deudor por sus pecados. El sacramento de la reconciliación es el gesto del Padre y la acogida de la comunidad que hallan en el misterio de la muerte y resurrección de Jesús su manifestación y su fuerza."

²⁷ GALLAGHER, TIMOTHY M. *The Examen Prayer – Ignatian wisdom for our lives today*, New York: The Crossroad Publishing house, 2006, p. 60.

element of our abiding consciousness.²⁸

The third step is an illumined reflection on one's thoughts, words and deeds with an earnest desire to know how God has been present to the person and how he/she has responded to God's invitation. This reflection is enlightened by the gift of the Spirit.²⁹ Humility lies in recognizing that the primary question is one of faith where the individual asks oneself, "what has been happening in us, how has the Lord been working in us, what has He been asking us. Only secondarily are our own actions to be considered."³⁰ When actions take center place, there is danger that "the sense of response in our activity is lost. We become self-moved and motivated rather than moved and motivated by the Spirit."³¹ In order that a person may be sensitive to the movements of the Spirit, it is essential that a person progressively cultivates a deep sense of humility and gratitude.

The fourth step is one of compunction for one's sinfulness, a grace which is proper of the first week of the Exercises. It is not a narcissistic sense of guilt, which would be a façade for self-love, but a contrition which is in the context of love, gratitude and wonder.³² Such an experience which is motivated by faith, humility and courage helps the individual to move to the fifth step where the individual desires to progress in the path of self-emptying love. With hope and trust a person offers the next day or time period to the Lord and closes with the prayer of the Our Father.

At this point in the Examen there should be a great desire to face with renewed vision and sensitivity as we pray both to recognize even more the subtle ways in which the Lord will greet us and to hear His Word call us in the existential situation of the future and to respond to His call with more faith, humility and courage.³³

²⁸ ASCHENBRENNER, GEORGE A. "Consciousness Examen...", p. 17.

²⁹ Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, p. 159.

³⁰ ASCHENBRENNER, GEORGE A. "Consciousness Examen...", p. 18.

³¹ Cf. *IBID.*, p. 18. It must be pointed out that Aschenbrenner laid the emphasis of the examen on becoming aware of God's presence in one's life, underplaying the role of actions. However this has not always been the perspective of different authors regarding the importance of actions and awareness. Lately the emphasis has shifted towards prioritizing awareness over actions.

³² Cf. GALLAGHER, TIMOTHY M. *The Examen Prayer...*, p. 88.

³³ ASCHENBRENNER, GEORGE A. "Consciousness Examen...", p. 20.

During the first week of the *SpEx* the two Examens and the preparation for the general confession are followed by meditations related to sin and God's mercy.³⁴ The grace of conversion that is demanded by the exercitant during these meditations is intimately linked to an attitude of humility. As a person reflects on sin and its consequences, both at an individual and personal level, we find that there is constant reference to the dangers of pride as well as an invitation towards humility. This theme continues to be reflected in the additional directives that are given by Ignatius at the end of the first week. Let us now briefly analyze the five meditations proposed by Ignatius³⁵ and see how humility is a dominant theme in all of them.

6.2.2 SINFULNESS AND HUMILITY IN THE FIRST MEDITATION

In the first meditation,³⁶ Ignatius asks the exercitant to use the three faculties of the soul; the memory, the intellect and the will in order to ask God for what is desired. In this case it would be 'shame and confusion about myself' [48] and is proper of one who is humiliated and shamed. The three examples; the sin of the angels, the sin of Adam and Eve and the mortal sin of any particular person are radically different, but have a common thread – they point towards the human person's radical dependence on God. Disobedience and rebellion is the rejection of one's dependence on God and the search for a vain self-sufficiency.³⁷

Ignatius invites the exercitant to reflect on the movement away from the love of

³⁴ Sin and its consequence are contemplated historically and not merely metaphysically. While we meditate on sin and its consequences, it is always in the context of the loving mercy of God. The point to be kept in mind is that there can be no profound sense of God's mercy without a profound sense of sin." (Cf. MICHAEL IVANS, *Understanding the ...*, p. 43.)

³⁵ The five meditations could be adapted according to the 'age, physical or mental disposition, and temperament' [72]. The Latin Vulgate translations adds that 'if the director thinks it expedient for the exercitant's spiritual profit, other meditations can be added here, for example, on death, other penalties of sin, judgment, and the like...' (Cf. GANSS, GEORGE. *The Spiritual Exercises...*, p. 158.)

³⁶ ENGLISH, JOHN, J. *Spiritual Freedom...*, p. 56. 'Ignatius calls the First Exercise of the First Week a meditation and, as it true whenever he introduces a new method of prayer, he explains it in detail. Meditation is the application of the memory, intellect, and will to revealed truths.'

³⁷ Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, pp. 181-82. "Tres pecados radicalmente diferentes..., unidos no obstante por un mismo denominador común: que los tres alteran, en su misma raíz, la relación de dependencia creatural de Dios."

God leading to sin.³⁸ Thus the very first sin speaks of the angels who ‘fell into pride’ [50]. Pride led them to misuse their freedom and they were ‘hurled from heaven to hell.’ [50] Pride leads to the fall of any created reality and the two standards will indicate how pride is the gateway to all other vices. The consequence of pride is the human desire to be autonomous from God leading to the ‘negation of praise, reverence and service [50, 52, 58, 59]... (and) is destructive of our relationship with ourselves and with the world.’³⁹

The antidote to pride and its consequences is the attitude of humility. In the invitation to the exercitant we have a synthesis of the humility of God, the humility of the human person and the transformative process in the human person. As the individual begins to internally feel the compunction caused by sin, he is invited to ‘converse’ with the kenotic Christ who reveals the humility of God. The three questions, “What have I done for Christ? What am I doing for Christ? What ought I to do for Christ?” [53] have been highlighted by various authors. While it is appropriate to evaluate oneself with these three questions, we need to keep in mind that the preamble to these questions is equally important. The preamble to these questions as seen in the colloquy reads as follows:

Imagine Christ our Lord suspended on the cross before you, and converse with him in a colloquy: How is it that he, although he is the Creator, has come to make himself a human being? How is it that he has passed from eternal life to death here in time, and to die in this way for my sins? (*SpEx* – 53)

Humility is thus founded on an experience of Christ who on the Cross reveals to the exercitant the eternal love and mercy of God.⁴⁰ The conversation with the crucified Christ makes the exercitant more aware of the painful consequences of his self-centered

³⁸ MARTINI, CARLO. “Ejercicios e Historia de la Salvación: Pecado y Redención”, *Los Ejercicios de San Ignacio a la luz del Vaticano – II*, (Ed. Espinosa, Clemente), BAC: Madrid, 1968, p. 111. ‘Parece que esta meditación tiene como fin mostrar el movimiento del pecado, que tiende a huir del amor salvífico de Dios y a oponerse a él... Esto es lo que San Ignacio presenta continuamente, indicando el esquema de reflexiones que deberían hacerse sobre la materia... En todas estas expresiones está subyacente la idea general de que desde el principio está el plan del amor de Dios, el comienzo de la salvación, que queda frustrado de alguna manera por el hombre. Este parece ser el elemento sustancial en esta meditación.’

³⁹ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding the...*, p. 44

⁴⁰ A dominant theme during the first week is one of mercy. God is to be approached as a God of mercy and as one who lovingly invites a person towards conversion. (Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding the...*, p. 43.)

life as well as the joy of God's merciful love spurring a person towards a transformation of heart.⁴¹ There is an awareness of the contrast between God's love and one's own sinful response. This in turn aids an exercitant to respond by having a humble disposition and openness towards the transformative power of the Spirit.

Humility is always the response to the mystery of being loved. It helps to explain the greatest lovers – the saints. (They) ...thought they were the greatest sinners, that is, nonlovers. They were so overwhelmed with the intensity of the love they received that what others might consider a slight offense, they felt was a refusal of grace. Ignatius leads us to this point of view in the *Exercises*.⁴²

6.2.2.1 Personal Sin and Humility in the Second Meditation

The second meditation invites the exercitant to now 'reflect' on personal sin.⁴³ In developing this meditation, the third point is directly focused on helping the exercitant grow in humility. It invites the exercitant to 'reflect upon (oneself), by using examples which humble me' [58].⁴⁴ The third and fourth point uses the technique of comparison in order to experience the grace of 'growing and intense sorrow and tears for my sins.' [55] The third point is a comparison with other created reality – human beings, angels, saints, creation and finally oneself where one realizes and is convinced that one is 'a sore and abscess from which have issued such great sins and iniquities and such foul poison.' [58]⁴⁵

In the next point the exercitant continues to reflect on sin and sinfulness, but this

⁴¹ Ignatius at this crucial moment does not want that the awareness of sin and its consequences make a person become more guilt-laden and centered on oneself. Rather he wants the person to be transformed by an experience of the self-emptying love of God.

⁴² ENGLISH, JOHN, J. *Spiritual Freedom...*, p. 60.

⁴³ The verb 'mirar' in its various variations is used seven times. The exercitant is invited to not just reflect as seen in the translation of Ganss, but is called upon to look critically and introspect on the reality of sin and its vicious circles as experienced personally. (Cf. GARCÍA HIRSCHFELD, CARLOS. "Los cinco ejercicios del pecado en el texto ignaciano", *Manresa* - 252, 1992, p. 321.)

⁴⁴ The technique of comparison allows the exercitant to become aware of one's true condition. It helps a person to be in touch with reality and undoes the false sense of grandiosity and pride. The contagious nature of sin in so far as it affects the totality of the person is underlined in the fourth and fifth examples of the third point. (Cf. GARCÍA HIRSCHFELD, CARLOS. "Los cinco...", pp. 323-24.)

⁴⁵ This point is similar to the seventh step of humility of St. Benedict where one not only confesses that he is inferior and a common wretch, but believes it to be so. Here Ignatius too presents the same points in a more concrete manner where a person compares himself with other created reality and realizes that he is the worst of all.

time contrasts his sinful reality against God's goodness.

The sense of sin is heightened as the exercitant relates his or her personal sin to a growing understanding of the nature of sin as an offence against God and his creation, and the exercise culminates in thanksgiving for the mercy of God leading to the intention of amendment.⁴⁶

The experience of the mystery of God's mercy and love effects a genuine conversion in the person.⁴⁷ The exercitant is once again invited to reflect on himself keeping in mind 'God's wisdom, God's omnipotence, God's justice and God's goodness' [59]. The experience of God's goodness leads to 'an exclamation of wonder and surging emotion.' [60]⁴⁸ This final exclamation is paradoxical considering the fact that in the third point the exercitant was considering himself as a 'sore and abscess.' A person who has thus grown to be humble after having a better appraisal of oneself and of God, would with a deep sense of gratitude 'conclude with a colloquy of mercy' [61]. The humility of the grateful exercitant is further reinforced in the determination to amend one's life 'with His grace.' [61]

6.2.2.2 Humility in the remaining meditations of the day

The third meditation is an invitation to 'dwell on those points where (one) felt greater consolation or desolation, or had a greater spiritual experience.' [62] The preparatory prayer and preludes are similar to the previous meditations. However unlike the early colloquies which were to Christ and God our Lord, we now have a triple colloquy which includes Our Lady, the Son and finally the Father. The exercitant asks for three graces related toward experiencing a greater degree of humility. These graces affect the entire person so as to detest and leave behind one's past life in order to embrace a new life in Christ. These graces indicated in [63] of the Spiritual Exercises are presented in the following table:

⁴⁶ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding the...*, p. 55.

⁴⁷ Cf. GARCÍA HIRSCHFELD, CARLOS. "Los cinco...", p. 324.

⁴⁸ The awareness of the mercy of God is fundamental. God's mercy is manifested in Christ as well as through creation and this leads to an ever growing reverence for the mercy of God. This prepares the exercitant for the colloquy where the individual reunites oneself with God and re-establishes one's relationship with God.

	Sentiment	Insight	Content	Goal/End
First Grace	...feel	an interior knowledge	of my sins	...an abhorrence of them
Second Grace	...perceive	the disorder	in my actions	... to detest them, amend myself and put myself in order.
Third Grace	...have	a knowledge	of the world	... in order to detest it and rid myself of all that is worldly and vain.

The three graces represent a widening circle of humility by which a person progressively comprehends the reality of sin and its consequences. The goal is not mere sorrow, but a deeper knowledge of the standards of the world and the standards of Christ in order to choose that which is in keeping with the third degree of humility. The fourth meditation [64] is a repetition of the third meditation to deepen the graces that have been received. The final meditation is on hell [65]⁴⁹ where the person is invited to apply the five senses in order to become aware of the terrible consequences of sin. However in this meditation too, in keeping with the general trend of the earlier meditations one ends in a profound sense of gratitude because ‘he has shown me, all through my life up to the present moment, so much pity and mercy.’ [71]

6.2.2.3 The additions as an aid to grow in humility

The Additions⁵⁰ [73-90] proposed by Ignatius are not ends in themselves, but suggestions towards helping the exercitant be centered on the material at hand and prevents the person from being dissipated. They are divided into three parts with the first five dealing with prayer [73-77], the next four with the general atmosphere of the day [78-81] and the last nine with penance [82-90]. The five points that deal with prayer are in order

⁴⁹ This meditation invites us to think about the role of fear in the meditations of the first week. The changed concept of hell in today’s time conflicts with the understanding of God who is love and mercy. Fear may provide temporary results, but any permanent change can only take place through love. The central point is not the graphic depiction of hellfire, but the freedom of the human person whereby he/she can reject God’s invitation to salvation and wholeness. (Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, pp. 223-227.)

⁵⁰ Cf. TEJERA, MANUEL. “Addiciones”, *DEI*, p. 84 The Directory would suggest that “...if conveniently possible, on the same day after supper the Additions should be explained so that the exercitant can begin to use them in the making the first exercise at the following midnight (which begins the third day).” ((Ed.) PALMER, MARTIN E. *On Giving...*, p. 12)

to help the individual be centered on Christ and open oneself to the graces of God.⁵¹

Ignatius uses two images to indicate the attitude the exercitant ought to have – that of a knight who is shamed and a sinner who is in chains before the supreme and eternal judge. The primary sentiment and attitude that one ought to desire and cultivate is that of being ‘shamed and humiliated’. [74] In the third point the exercitant is once again asked to enter the contemplation or meditation after making ‘an act of reverence and humility.’ [75] A point to be noted is that even while speaking about the need to maintain an attitude of humility, Ignatius reminds the exercitant of the generous love of God. He invites the exercitant to ‘think how God our Lord is looking at me’ and to recall the ‘numerous gifts and favors’ received from the king. [74-75]

The next set of additional directives refers to the general atmosphere of the day. Ignatius is aware of the weakness of human nature which easily gets distracted and hence recommends four prohibitions in order to help the exercitant to grow in openness to God’s communication and grace. The four areas which the individual is invited to pay attention include thoughts, light, laughter and sight. Laughter [80] and sight [81] are incidentally two points which were indicated by St. Benedict as the 10th and 12th step in his twelve steps of humility. Steps to avoid thoughts related to pleasure and happiness [78] as well as the closing of doors and windows to deprive oneself of light [79] are not ends in themselves, but means towards assisting the exercitant to feel the shame and sorrow of a humiliated knight.

The largest section in the additional directives refers to penances which deal with the body.⁵² The three kinds of penance, i.e. penances of food, sleep and the discipline

⁵¹ The first and second point deal with the moment a person goes to sleep and wakes up. These are significant moments because one affects the unconscious dimension while another affects the beginning of the active day for an individual. The following three points deal with prayer and the underlining factor in all the three points is that prayer is a sacrament moment of encounter with God. Each moment of prayer is a unique and historic encounter in which God takes the initiative and the human person is invited to be aware of the all-pervasive presence of God. (Cf. TEJERA, MANUEL. “Para adentrarse en la experiencia de Ejercicios: las adiciones [73-81]”, *Manresa* – 271, 1997, pp. 121,124.)

⁵² The body is not merely a superficial dimension of a person, but is the means of engaging in an existential dialogue with God and the world. Ignatius through his own personal experience understood the danger of being drawn by instinctual living as well as the exaggerations of physical penances. Hence he advises that ‘exterior penances (be the)

point towards a self-emptying of some sort. A cursory glance of spiritual life in any tradition shows the positive value of renunciation and is never an end in itself, but for some greater value.⁵³ Penances understood merely as repressing desires is not related to self-emptying love. However when it is a manifestation of the person's deep longing for God it is an effective antidote to the pleasure principal that often motivates human behavior.⁵⁴

Applying these additional directives to the larger invitation to self-emptying love, it can be said that the sign of love is when one is willing to give up not what is superfluous, but something which is essential.⁵⁵ Priority given to internal disposition over external manifestation is a pointer towards the process expected of the exercitant. The external self-emptying through the privation of food, sleep and the physical pain of discipline is important and necessary. However far more important is the internal disposition to empty oneself of one's own self-love, self-will and self-interest. Ignatius indicates that the purpose of exterior penances are chiefly 'to satisfy one's past sins; overcome ourselves and seek and obtain some grace or gift...' [87]

The second observation [88] refers to further instructions regarding the first, second and fourth directives. The observation regarding the fourth directive is a safeguard against engaging in public acts of devotion which could lead to spiritual pride or ridicule. The next observation [89] is significant in order to understand better Ignatius' concept of humility and its relation to what is proposed by St. Thomas Aquinas who presents the virtue of humility and magnanimity as complementing each other and

fruit of the former, (i.e. interior penance).' [82] so that the body recovers its harmonious equilibrium in order to be a more appropriate instrument in order to achieve its original purpose. (GIULIANI, MAURICE, *La Experiencia de los Ejercicios Espirituales en la vida*, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander: 1991, p. 48.)

⁵³ TEJERA, MANUEL. "Adiciones...", p. 88. "Toda ascesis, también la deportiva o cualquiera otra que no sea de componente religioso, hay que considerarla desde una perspectiva positiva, de crecimiento, aunque comporta una dosis de renuncia. La ascesis no se asume por sí misma, es para algo."

⁵⁴ GIULIANI, MAURICE. *La Experience...*, p. 48.

⁵⁵ In inviting the exercitant to engage in penance, Ignatius advises great discretion and precaution so that the subject is not harmed. Sheldrake in quoting from the Directory would say that the director should keep in mind the different temperaments. (Cf. SHELDRAKE, PHILIP. *The Way of Ignatius...*, p. 43.) 'Depressed people should not be driven too hard. Fragile people may need to be handled with care. Some may have to be summoned to greater austerity, tempered by gentleness and affability. Today's director must be sensitive to individual needs.'

not being opposed to each other.⁵⁶ He cautions against easily giving into despair and deciding that the 'human being cannot endure penance' or on the other hand being immoderate and engaging in 'excessive penance'. [89]

Ignatius does not focus on a philosophical discourse, but on the practical nature of having the right balance in order to help the exercitant 'find what he or she desires'. [89] It is important to note that while Ignatius believed in the human use of reason and judgment while making the necessary changes, he also invites the exercitant and director to be humble in order to realize that the ability to gauge the right measure of penance is God's grace who 'often enables each of us to know what is right for ourselves.'⁵⁷

6.3 THE 2ND WEEK: KNOW, LOVE AND FOLLOW CHRIST IN THE KINGDOM MEDITATIONS & INFANCY NARRATIVES

6.3.1 THE CALL OF THE ETERNAL KING TO POVERTY AND HUMILITY

The second week begins with the contemplation of the Kingdom of Christ and is a moment of transition from the purgative phase to the illuminative phase.⁵⁸ The experience of giving up one's self-love and discovering a new self-image in the love and mercy of God leads one to desire an imitation of Christ poor and humble. This exercise gives the exercitant a new self-image which is based on a new relationship. This relationship leads to an ever growing desire to imitate Christ leading to greater union with Him and a more generous participation in His mission

The exercise gives the exercitant a new self-image. No longer the shamed knight of the

⁵⁶ Elaborating this he would say that: "... a twofold virtue is necessary with regard to the difficult good: one, to temper and restrain the mind, lest it tend to high things immoderately; and this belongs to the virtue of humility: and another to strengthen the mind against despair, and urge it on to the pursuit of great things according to right reason; and this is magnanimity. Therefore it is evident that humility is a virtue. (*STh.*, II-II q.161.)

⁵⁷ Cf. SHELDRAKE, PHILIP. *The Way of Ignatius...*, p. 50.

⁵⁸ The Annotations reveal to us the Ignatius' division of the *SpEx* into the classical stages of purification, illumination and union. While giving instructions about the use of the rules for Discernment of spirits he says, '*For ordinarily the enemy of human nature tempts under the appearance of good more often when a person is performing the Exercises in the illuminative life,[8] which corresponds to the Exercises of the Second Week, 3than in the purgative life, which corresponds to those of the First Week.*' [10] The illuminative and unitive ways takes place during the second, third and fourth weeks where the life of Christ is contemplated. The day of contemplating the Kingdom is a day of relative repose with only two periods of prayer recommended for the exercitant. (Cf. GANSS, GEORGE. *The Spiritual Exercises...*, p. 159.)

First Week, the exercitant is now the knight restored to friendship and established in the relationship which will be the basis of the remaining weeks of the Exercises – a relationship in which the intimacy of personal union and participation in Christ's mission in the world are inseparably combined. And it is within the climate of positive feeling, even enthusiasm, thus engendered that the exercitant is introduced to the theme of union with Christ in the paradoxical values of poverty and humiliation.⁵⁹

The contemplation could be understood as a parable which is based on Ignatius symbolic world⁶⁰ where he uses the imagery of a good king in order to lead a person towards a contemplation of the Eternal King.⁶¹ The first and the second parts are intimately related to the journey of Ignatius from a life centered on himself towards a life where he emptied himself out of love for the Lord and others.⁶²

The first part of the text which is related to the temporal king is for the sake of 'applying (them) to Christ our Lord.' [95] It consists of two preludes and three points [91-94] and these include the grace 'not to be deaf to his call, but ready and diligent to accomplish his most holy will.' [91]⁶³ as well as the disgrace and humiliation of a knight who will not respond to such a 'generous and kind' king. [94] The humiliation at this point will be qualitatively different from the humiliation desired when imitating the Eternal King [98] where the first is still part of the purificatory stage, while the second form of humiliation is already part of the illuminative and unitive stage.

The comparison between the temporal king and the Eternal King is not a straightforward comparison where Ignatius through the right choice of words would indicate that the following of a good temporal king is not the same as following the

⁵⁹ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 77.

⁶⁰ The stories of chivalry and gallant knights played an important part in shaping Ignatius' imagination. A brief text from *Prosistas Castellanos del siglo XV*, BAE, Madrid, 1959 can be seen in the article "Ignacio de Loyola y el humanismo." (Cf. GARCÍA MATEO, ROGELIO. *Ignacio de Loyola y su mundo cultural*, Mensajero: Bilbao, 2000, p. 381.) The same capacity for imagination would later on be oriented towards the Eternal King and the power of this imagination would fire his zeal to imitate the poverty and humility of Christ.

⁶¹ GARCÍA HIRSCHFELD, CARLOS. "La Parábola del Rey Temporal", *Manresa* – 263, 1995, p. 124.

⁶² The first part refers to his early life where he desired to be the outstanding knight in the service of an ideal king while the second part refers to the period after the convalescence in Loyola when he wanted to imitate the knights of Christ by making offering of great magnanimity and generosity.

⁶³ This is a repetition of the fifth annotation which refers to the spirit of generosity and that of the magis from the principle and foundation. Time and time again, Ignatius will return to this point in varying form all along the Exercises.

Eternal King. By placing the texts in parallel columns, we shall see the differences.

Temporal King	Eternal King
<p>I will observe how this king <u>speaks to all his people</u>, saying,</p> <p>“My will is to conquer the whole land of the infidels. Hence, whoever wishes to come with me has to be content with the same <u>food I eat, and the drink, and the clothing</u> which I wear, and so forth. So too each one must <u>labor</u> with me during the day, and keep watch in the night, and so on,</p> <p>so that later each may have a part with me in the <u>victory</u>, just as each has shared in the toil.” [93]</p>	<p>He calls to them all, and <u>to each person in particular</u> he says:</p> <p>“My will is to conquer the whole world and all my enemies, and thus to enter into the glory of my Father. Therefore, whoever wishes to come with me must <u>labor</u> with me,</p> <p>so that through following me in the <u>pain</u> he or she may follow me also in the <u>glory</u>.” [95]</p>

The text cited above indicates four differences between the call of the temporal king and the Eternal King. The first is that the call of the Eternal King has a uniquely personal dimension because the King calls ‘each person in particular’. Secondly, the external details of food, drink and clothes which identify one with the temporal king are absent in the call of the Eternal King who desires the person ‘must labor with (Him)’. In the third point the Eternal King indicates the ‘pain’ that following Him entails. Finally the temporal king promises a share in his ‘victory’ while the Eternal King assures that one who follows Him in pain will also follow him in ‘glory’.⁶⁴

The Eternal King explicitly indicates that the path of discipleship by which the Father will be glorified is a path of ‘pain’ and ‘labor’. The pain, suffering, humiliation, death and resurrection of Christ which will be contemplated at length during the third and fourth weeks are anticipated at the start of the second week.⁶⁵ Discipleship thus

⁶⁴ The four points indicate that the call of the Eternal King is not primarily concerned with the external facets but requires an internal configuration to participate in the laboring love of God. It also indicates that the call is an invitation to share in the ongoing passion and resurrection of the Lord in one’s given context.

⁶⁵ The initial phase of a spiritual journey where a shift takes place in the foundation of a person’s life from oneself towards God is expressed in this meditation. This contemplation is often called the second foundation of the Spiritual Exercises. (Cf. FLEMING, DAVID. “Reino”, *DEI*, p. 1562.)

consists in offering oneself ‘wholeheartedly for this labor.’ [96] A person who has been purified through an experience of God’s gratuitous love would gratefully respond by showing ‘greater devotion and distinguish themselves in total service to their eternal King.’ [96]⁶⁶

This offering takes concrete form through an abiding ‘wish’, ‘desire’ and ‘decision’ [98] of the individual to imitate Christ in ‘bearing all injuries, and affronts, and any poverty, actual as well as spiritual.’ [98]⁶⁷ The choice to thus imitate Christ necessarily involves a choice to live a life of poverty and humility whereby one is detached from material goods and accepts one’s radical dependence on God.⁶⁸ Christ lived a life of material and spiritual poverty and is the model for one who desires to imitate Him. During the succeeding weeks the exercitant will be invited to contemplate the mysteries of the life of Christ and progressively identify oneself with Christ poor and humble. The life of a person is thus configured so that through a life of personal poverty and humility one participates in the laboring love of God.

6.3.2 THE CONTEMPLATIONS OF THE SECOND WEEK AND HUMILITY

The exercitant with the generous spirit of the oblation enters into the contemplations of the second week which can be divided into three parts: a) the infancy and hidden life of Jesus; b) the 4th day when the exercitant begins the process of the election with the two standards, the three classes of persons and the three degrees of humility and c) the public life of Jesus.⁶⁹ Four key themes make up this week and these include the

⁶⁶ The ‘greater devotion’ is the spirit of the *magis* and consists in going against one’s normal ‘human sensitivities and against carnal and worldly love.’ [97] Though sensitivities or sensuality is sometimes understood as an excess of carnal pleasures such as food, drink or sex; however it has more to do with human longings, attachments, inclinations and so on. (Cf. GANSS, GEORGE. *The Spiritual...*, p. 161.) One who feels a growing desire to live by the spirit and wishes to imitate Christ the Eternal King, there will be a desire to go beyond the natural love which is ‘carnal and worldly love’ and make offerings of great worth.’ [97]

⁶⁷ What needs to be kept in mind is that at this state Ignatius is not speaking about a choice between following or rejecting the Eternal King. The choice has been made for the Eternal King and the point being made is about ‘making offerings of greater worth and moment’. The use of the word ‘greater’ indicates that here it is not a comparison of opposites, but a contrast between the first and second degrees of comparison.

⁶⁸ Cf. GANSS, GEORGE. *The Spiritual Exercises...*, p. 161.

⁶⁹ Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 162-63.

Trinitarian setting, the hidden life of Jesus, the fidelity of Jesus towards the will of the Father and poverty and humility as key elements in following Christ.⁷⁰

Before moving on to the humility in the infancy narratives it is necessary to briefly speak about two points – contemplation as a method of prayer and the petition of the second week. The method of contemplation⁷¹ as explained by Ignatius is extensively scriptural.⁷² It is much more than mere imagination, but a manner of evangelization where one goes beyond a literal reading of the text in order to understand the underlying meaning.⁷³ It consists in a gradual assimilation into the mystery God through the concrete experience of the humanity of Christ.

The contemplations contain a petition and during the second week the exercitant asks for the grace of ‘an interior knowledge of Our Lord, who became human for me, that I may love him more intensely and follow him more closely.’ [104] The internal knowledge is not achieved through one’s will power, but by being open to the grace of God. The various contemplations allow a person to progressively participate in the mystery of God’s self-emptying love.⁷⁴ They affect the core of the person, lead to an altered state of existence and brings about greater harmony and love. The repetitions of

⁷⁰ Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding the...*, pp. 88-89.

⁷¹ This form of prayer is more affective in nature and is more suitable who have purified themselves, are advanced in spiritual life and already enjoy a certain degree of union with God. (Cf. GANSS, GEORGE. *The Spiritual Exercises*, pp. 162, 165)

⁷² Ignatius began to use scriptural texts while convalescing in Loyola from the *Vita Christi* and the *Flos Sanctorum*. He had copied nearly 300 pages from these books and would later on use them while giving the *SpEx*. The scriptural texts were mainly telegraphic in character and were used in order to help the exercitant experience an individual encountered the Lord. Over the centuries there have been many advances in biblical studies and this leads to a question regarding the continued use of the scriptural texts proposed by Ignatius. What can be highlighted is that scripture study which engages with the text from a historical, literary and theological point of view is primarily contemplated upon from a theological point of view within the Spiritual Exercises. (Cf. BUSTO, JOSÉ RAMÓN. “Exégesis y contemplación”, *Manresa – 250*, 1992, pp. 115, 119.). Therefore in any adaptation of the scriptural texts is important to maintain the theological viewpoint.

⁷³ Cf. BUSTO, JOSÉ RAMÓN. “Exégesis y contemplación...”, p. 118.

⁷⁴ The petition that refers to internal knowledge goes beyond the external deeds and words of Christ and is related to the very being of God. As a person grows in internal knowledge through the contemplation of the mysteries of the life of Christ, there is a growing desire to identify, assimilate and unite oneself with Christ through a process of personal self-emptying. The loving initiative of God aids this self-emptying process in the person with its fulfillment being found in an identification with Christ through a life of discipleship and service. (Cf. TEJERINA, ÁNGEL. “Petición de la contemplación de la Encarnación”, *Manresa – 278*, 1999, pp. 347-49.)

these contemplations further assist the transformation of one's entire being so as to be able to participate in the humble love of God.⁷⁵

Ignatius went through a similar process of self-emptying. In the initial phase he gave up his family as well as his riches. He progressively moved on to a more mature understanding of the kenosis of Christ. The contemplations ignited his imagination changing the sensible and affective dimensions of his being. His eyes of understanding were opened to the mystical dimension of the Cross wherein the poor and humble Christ assimilates and participates in all forms of human sufferings.⁷⁶ These contemplations would aid Ignatius in his spiritual process making him ardently desire an imitation of Christ by choosing a life of poverty and humility.

The various contemplations or considerations proposed during the second week reveals a growing attitude of humility culminating in the 'Three Ways of being humble.' [165-68] The three sections that make up the second week consist in the infancy and hidden life of Jesus, the meditations and considerations related to the election and the public life of Jesus. The infancy narratives begin with the Incarnation and Michael Ivens explains the gist of this contemplation in the following manner.

Ignatius proposes the Infancy Contemplations in a way that accentuates the themes of poverty and humiliation introduced in the Kingdom Exercise and presented now not as abstractions, but as embodied in the person of Jesus and his parents, and in their hard and precarious circumstances. In these circumstances the exercitant is invited to see the first steps of a descending journey of love which begins in the heart of the Trinity and will

⁷⁵ Through a repetition of this petition, the object of the individual's desire shifts towards God's eternal love, gives meaning to one's life and results in a growing transcendence of one's self-centered love so as to live a life of apostolic service. The petition speaks of a desire for an internal knowledge or '*conocimiento interno*' and this knowledge is a grace and gift which is gratuitously received. This internal knowledge affects the person to such a degree that there is an existential transformation in the person (Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Los Ejercicios...*, pp. 344, 348) . '*...Se refiere así a una experiencia en el Espíritu por la que el hombre se siente afectado por la gratuidad de un amor que le viene dado y que le abre la puerta a la penetración ulterior en aquel mismo misterio que se le desvela y regala. De tal modo que su libertad, de resultas de tal experiencia, queda comprometida existencialmente en una dinámica que le desborda, hasta el punto de no poder dejar de amar aquello que le es mostrado, y que de ahora en adelante se constituye en el fundamento de la vida del sujeto que comienza a conocer.*'

⁷⁶ Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Los Ejercicios...*, pp. 349 - 353. '*...conocimiento que debió sufrir a su vez la transformación de la imagen proyectiva del deseo hasta alcanzar la madurez de la interpretación correcta del misterio kenótico-descendente en que aconteció la salvación...*' IBID., p. 351.

conclude on the Cross.⁷⁷

6.3.2.1 The Incarnation

The title of the first contemplation is that of the 'Incarnation' where one is invited to contemplate the love of the Triune God within the history of salvation.⁷⁸ God's responds to humanity which is 'in such great blindness, ... (and) are dying and going down to hell.' [102] The composition of place invites the exercitant to contemplate the humility of the Triune God in Christ's descent [106,3] as well as the humility of the human person as reflected in the Blessed Virgin Mary. [106,4] The contemplation is in fact a synthesis of two important moments in the history of salvation – the Incarnation and the Annunciation. These contemplations together reveal God's salvific plan coming to fruition in a historical and concrete reality.⁷⁹

If on the one side we have the self-emptying of God, on the other hand we have the self-emptying of the human person as revealed in the surrender of Mary towards the communication from God. Her generosity, surrender and humility is contrasted to the attitude to other persons⁸⁰ in the world who are 'blind', 'dying' and 'going to hell.' Towards the end of the contemplation, the exercitant is invited to consider 'Our Lady

⁷⁷ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding the...*, p. 89.

⁷⁸ Arzubialde has an elaborate explanation about the theology of the Incarnation within the context of the Trinity's project of salvation. He says that the nucleus of this contemplation consists in the love of God as a response to the human situation. The nature of love is such that the human situation moved God to act in a manner that is self-emptying. The contemplation presents the humility of God who descended to become human and further descended to the extremities of hell. There is a gradual process of kenosis, where the fullness of God's self-emptying love is revealed on the Cross and through it all reality is reconciled with God. (Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, pp. 304-309.)

⁷⁹ Cf. KOLVENBACH, PETER-HANS. "No Ocultéis la Vida Oculta de Cristo." *Decir...al Indecible – Estudios sobre los Ejercicios Espirituales de San Ignacio*, (Ed. Iglesias, Ignacio), Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 1999, p. 78. 'Karl Rahner subraya la feliz asociación de la contemplación de la encarnación con la de la anunciación. Desgajar del relato de la anunciación la verdad de la encarnación del Verbo de Dios significa caer fatalmente en el peligro de debilitar esta verdad, que es esencialmente comunicación, para convertirla en una especulación abstracta puramente metafísica. Gracias a esta estrecha asociación, la contemplación de la encarnación de Dios conserva su carácter existencial y nos impulsa a avanzar realmente en un conocimiento concreto de este misterio.'

⁸⁰ The reference here is to the entire world and is not limited to specific geographical or situational factors. The word 'diverse' is used twice and irrespective of the diversity of persons their existential situation is the same. "some in peace and others at warm some weeping and others laughing, some healthy and others sick, some being born and others dying, and so forth." (*SpEx* 106)

humbling herself and giving thanks to the Divine Majesty.' [108] The attitude of Mary's humility and a sense of gratitude for having been chosen by the Lord is presented to the exercitant as attitudes to be emulated.

Just as Mary conserved everything in her soul, (Lk: 2, 19.51) the exercitant is invited to do the same by contemplating the mysteries of the life of Christ. Through the constant contemplation with its repetitions and application of senses, the exercitant grows in internal knowledge and transformed, thus entering into a profound personal and existential relationship with Christ.⁸¹

The first contemplation ends with a colloquy to the Trinity and the Blessed Virgin Mary. [109] Ignatius uses two titles for Mary which are indicative of his relation when he uses the words 'Mother' and 'Lady'. It indicates a filial devotion as well as a reverential relationship with Mary. The same reverential attitude is seen when the exercitant is invited to humbly 'beg' for favors and desire to imitate 'Our Lord.' The imitation that the exercitant desires is the humility of God as revealed in the fact that Our Lord has humbled Himself 'to become a human being.'

6.3.2.2 The Nativity of our Lord

The second contemplation deals with the Nativity of our Lord. After recalling the history and the composition of place, we are presented with the three points. The first and third point in this contemplation invites the exercitant to dwell on poverty and humility. In the first point, the exercitant begins by considering the 'persons' in the scene and then considers oneself as a 'poor, little and unworthy slave' who is 'serving ...their needs ...with all possible respect and reverence.' [114] Further on in the third point, the exercitant's attention is focused on poverty, difficulties, insults and humility. [116]

⁸¹ TEJERINA, ÁNGEL. "Petición de la...", p. 48. 'O sea, el conocimiento que suplicamos es interno, porque el ejercitante, repasando en su corazón, como María, las palabras y acontecimientos revelados, comprende mejor, progresivamente, los misterios, en una especie de "anamnesis" operante y transformadora. Es, pues, íntimo, profundo, sentido, gustado, iluminante [2,3,5], unificador de niveles del ser humano." Conocimiento, que, como consecuencia, se irá haciendo cada vez más propio de cada cual, potenciador de la relación personal ya existente entre el ejercitante y su Señor Jesucristo.'

In the *Third Point*, the exercitant is asked to 'behold and consider what the different persons are doing; for example, journeying and toiling, in order that the Lord may be born in greatest poverty; and that after so many hardships of hunger, thirst, heat, cold, injuries, and insults, he may die on the cross.' [116] Ignatius does not condition the exercitant with too many details, but provides sufficient information in order to help the exercitant enter into the mystery of Christ.

In the contemplation on the Nativity, Ignatius makes generous use of the text available in chapter nine of the 'Life of Christ' by Ludolph of Saxony wherein the poverty and humility of Christ is highlighted.⁸²

Capítulo 9. Cristo, con escasez, establo y padecer, predica pobreza, humildad y mortificación: Has visto el nacimiento del Príncipe lleno de santidad. Has podido ver en ellos una pobreza muy estrecha. Esta virtud es la piedra preciosa del Evangelio, que solo se compra vendiendo todas las cosas. Es el cimiento primero de todo edificio espiritual. Es el camino de la salvación. La humildad es el cimiento y la raíz de la perfección; sus frutos son múltiples, aunque ocultos. Has visto bien una profunda humildad. No desdeñaron el establo, el pesebre, el heno, las demás cosas vulgares, para darnos ejemplo de perfecta humildad. Sin esta virtud no hay salvación, porque ninguna obra con soberbia puede agrandar a Dios. La humildad merece que nazcan las virtudes, que se conserven, que lleguen a su madurez. Sin la humildad, ni las virtudes son virtudes.⁸³

Ignatius does not give a similar reflective passage to the exercitant, but gives some points that he considers important and wants the exercitant to visualize, listen and consider the scene in order to 'reflect and draw spiritual profit' from the contemplation. He further on wants the exercitant to personalize the contemplation whereby the person realizes that the humility of God was 'for me.' [116] This methodology allows a shift of the objective knowledge of God's humility towards a real internal transformation within the individual so that one would be motivated to imitate Christ in poverty and humility.

Finally speaking about this contemplation, it is important to make a comment about the very Nativity of Christ as a manifestation of humility. The French school

⁸² The entire chapter is a beautiful explanation of the virtue of humility wherein the author makes use of quotes from saints Bernard, Anselm and Chrysostom in order to develop his point. (Cf. DE SAJONIA, LUDOLFO. *La Vida de Cristo - I*, (Tr. Del Río, Emilio), U. P. Comillas - IHSI: Madrid - Roma, 2010, pp. 80-81.)

⁸³ *IBID.*, p. 80.

would speak of the four forms of lowliness that are revealed in the child Jesus – small in stature, abject poverty, dependency on others and submission.⁸⁴ Through the contemplations, the exercitant is invited to enter into the mystery of the humility of God as revealed in the vulnerability, fragility and passive submission of the child Jesus to the circumstances surrounding His birth.⁸⁵

It is necessary to note that despite the choice of contemplations where the humility of God is prominent, at no point of time did Ignatius desired to understate the divinity of Christ. The child who was born in poverty and humility is always the second person of the Blessed Trinity – the Word who became flesh.

Para Ignacio, Cristo es siempre “el Verbo eterno encarnado” [109.130], “la segunda persona” [102]. Nunca disocia a Jesús de la plenitud de su ser trinitario, que le envía a nuestro mundo para nuestra salvación. Sin duda, el Jesús histórico es el que nos permite llegar a Cristo nuestro Señor; en los gestos y las palabras de Cristo histórico es siempre Cristo en su gloria el que es contemplado. Por eso el uso de la denominación *Niño Jesús* es restringido.⁸⁶

This perspective of Ignatius becomes clearer when we see that from the contemplation of Jesus being found in the temple, the title used for Christ is no longer ‘el Niño’ but ‘Cristo Nuestro Señor.’⁸⁷ However until the exercitant begins this contemplation, we have three more contemplations – the presentation in the temple, the flight into Egypt and the child Jesus obedient to His parents. [132, 134] Additional contemplations for this period include the visitation of our Lady to Elizabeth, the shepherds, the circumcision, the three kings and the return from Egypt. [263, 265, 266, 267, 270] Before moving on these contemplations Ignatius proposes the third, fourth and fifth contemplations of the day and focus on the application of senses.

⁸⁴ Cf. KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. “No ocultéis ...”, pp. 82-83.

⁸⁵ Much later when Jesus is apprehended in the garden, once again we find the passive dimension predominating. The passive dimension is closely related to the humility of God because in passive acceptance, one is no longer in control and is led by the will and desire of others. However, it is through faithful obedience even in such a situation, that spiritual maturity is manifest.

⁸⁶ KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. “No ocultéis...”, p. 83.

⁸⁷ Kolvenbach makes an important point when he says that until Jesus is found in the temple, he is referred to as the child Jesus. The passive dimension of Christ predominates during this period. (Cf. *IBID.*)

6.3.2.3 Other contemplations before the fourth day

Other contemplations during this period are heavily influenced by the Lucan narrative.⁸⁸ The passages are a constant interplay between the glory of God and the poverty and humility of the revelation of God in the infancy and hidden life of Jesus. The following table indicates the constant paradox that the exercitant is invited to contemplate in the mysteries of the life of Christ.

No.	EXALTATION	HUMILITY
263	1 st point: ... "Blessed are you amongst women, and blessed is the fruit of your womb."	2 nd point: ... (Canticle on humility): "My soul magnifies the Lord!"
264	3 rd point: ... a multitude of the heavenly army saying: "Glory to God in the heavens."	2 nd point: ... and wrapped him in swaddling clothes and laid him in a manger."
265	1 st point: ... for this day is born to you the Savior of the World... 3 rd point: ... The shepherds returned, glorifying and praising God	2 nd point: ... they found Mary and Joseph and the Infant lying in the manger.
266	2 nd point: ... was called Jesus, which was called by the angel before he was conceived in the womb.'	3 rd point: ... his mother, who felt compassion because of the blood which was flowing from her Son.
267	2 nd point: ... they adored him and offered him gifts: gold, frankincense, and myrrh.	3 rd point: ... they went back by another way to their own country.
268	3 rd point: ... and spoke of him to all who looked for the redemption of Israel.	1 st point: ... they offered for him "a pair of turtledoves and two young pigeons."
269		1 st point: ... flee into Egypt 2 nd point: He arose by night, and departed for Egypt.
270	2 nd point: ... went into the land of Israel	3 rd point: ... Because Archelaus... was reigning in Judea, he retired to Nazareth.
271	1 st point: ... advanced in wisdom, and age, and grace	2 nd point: "Is not this, surely, the carpenter?"

⁸⁸ While many scenes are from the *Vita Christi* where of the 20 scenes, Ignatius adopts 11. Moving on to the text it must also be pointed out that there are six phrases which are not biblical, and of these only two belong the *Vita Christi* confirming the point that Ignatius made use of other Latin texts. (Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, pp. 640-641.)

Within the paradox of exaltation and humility, the obedience of Christ to the will of the Father is an underlying theme. Along with Christ's obedience and faithfulness, we also have the obedience of Mary followed by the obedience of the kings, of Joseph and finally ends with the obedience of the child Jesus to 'his parents' [271] as well as to His Heavenly Father.

Like the various characters in the contemplations, the exercitant too is invited to know, love and follow the obedience of Christ as presented in the paradoxical mystery of exaltation and humility. It is important for the exercitant to have an internal knowledge of this mystery as well as the above mentioned attitude as the process of election commences on the 4th day. The selection and placement of various contemplations have the election as an end in mind. There is a method in the selection of infancy narratives and they help the exercitant enter into the dynamics of Divine descent and ascent.⁸⁹

Dos intenciones de fondo aparecen con un cierto relieve en este esquema. La primera la conocemos por los números [101-106]. La Encarnación es la obra de la Trinidad que se abaja a la indigencia de la situación humana [106] para llevar a cabo la obra de la redención. Es un movimiento descendente del Verbo eterno encarnado [107-109] hacia la suma pobreza, los trabajos... oprobios, hasta dar en la muerte de cruz [116]. Y el retorno hacia Dios en cambio, es un ascenso creciente por la obediencia y sumisión de a los mandamientos, "siendo él en obediencia a sus padres" [135], y en definitiva a sus Padre, Dios [271, 272, 134 y 135]. Entre estos dos polos dialécticos, en que se articula la salvación, hallamos el resto de los misterios de la Infancia.⁹⁰

6.4 THE TWO STANDARDS, THREE KINDS OF PERSONS AND THE THREE DEGREES OF HUMILITY IN THE CONTEXT OF MAKING AN ELECTION

The fourth day is an important moment in the second week – in fact in the entire dynamic of the *SpEx*. On this day Ignatius proposes two meditations and one consideration in order to assist the individual to be better disposed towards making an election. We shall now see as to how humility is the most important factor at this critical juncture when the individual makes a definitive and concrete commitment to Christ.

⁸⁹ These dynamics can be seen in the contemplations where for example the contemplation of the Incarnation invites the exercitant to contemplate the poverty and humility of the Triune God, while the contemplation of the visit to the temple reveals the obedience and submission the Child Jesus.

⁹⁰ ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, p. 641. (In this he also quotes FLIPO, C. *Les mystères du Christ dans les Exercices de Saint Ignace*, p. 217.)

It has been said that the three meditations/considerations are designed to affect the intellect, will and heart.⁹¹ While we can broadly make the above mentioned distinction, it must be stated that the three meditations have a close sense of unity and harmony about themselves.⁹² The dynamics of these meditations/consideration are arranged in order to affect the person so that it would finally culminate in an ardent desires to imitate Christ by living a life according to the third degree of humility. This desire would be the right disposition to make a proper election.

6.4.1 THE PREFACE

The preface on the fourth day of the second week invites the exercitant to consider a life of greater evangelical perfection. Though we could speak of various states of life, numbers 134 and 135 refers to two states. These include the observance of the commandments and that of the search for evangelical perfection – i.e., life in the world and religious life.⁹³ However the *SpEx* is not exclusive and the exercitant is invited ‘to come to perfection in whatsoever state of life God may grant us to elect.’ [135] This understanding has been affirmed by the Second Vatican Council⁹⁴ where the meaning of perfection has been defined in the following manner:

Thus it is evident to everyone, that all the faithful of Christ of whatever rank or status, are called to the fullness of the Christian life and to the perfection of charity; by this holiness as such a more human manner of living is promoted in this earthly society. In order that the faithful may reach this perfection, they must use their strength accordingly as they have received it, as a gift from Christ... The classes and duties of life are many, but holiness is one—that sanctity which is cultivated by all who are moved by the Spirit of God, and who obey the voice of the Father and worship God the Father in spirit and in truth. These people follow the poor Christ, the humble and cross-bearing Christ in order

⁹¹ “*Meditación encaminada a la completa ordenación del entendimiento...; Meditación encaminada a tomar el pulso a la voluntad...; estas consideraciones tienden a la ordenación del corazón...*” (IPARRAGUIRRE/JURADO, BAC⁶, pp. 182, 185, 187.)

⁹² Cf. CORELLA, JESÚS. “Dos banderas y maneras de humildad como experiencia unitaria de pobreza de espíritu.” *Ejercicios Espirituales y mundo de hoy*, (Ed. García-Lomas, Juan Manuel), Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 1992, p. 156.

⁹³ That division, used by Christ while responding to the rich young man (*Mk 1,17-27*) was the common interpretations during the time of Ignatius and continued until the present time. However this opinion has been qualified with modern interpretations and a more actualized understanding has been offered by Vatican II.

⁹⁴ Cf. GANSS, GEORGE. *The Spiritual Exercises...*, p. 166.

to be worthy of being sharers in His glory.⁹⁵

The election deals with a secondary choice and not a fundamental choice because the fundamental choice has already been made in the oblation at the end of the first week.⁹⁶ The preface [135] without indicating the specific path to be taken invites the exercitant to desire an attitude which was more consonant with the third degree of humility. These desires could pertain to choices which were taken either before the *SpEx* and are now affirmed, or could lead to new choices within the process of the Exercises. They could also be a moment of initiating a process of decision making which would be confirmed over a period of time.⁹⁷

6.4.2 THE MEDITATION ON THE TWO STANDARDS

The title of the meditation “A meditation on two standards, the one of Christ, our supreme commander and Lord; the other of Lucifer, the mortal enemy of our human nature” is rather elaborate and explains the content that would follow. This meditation comes to us from the tradition of the Church, but it had been made more succinct and pertinent to the *SpEx* by St. Ignatius. In this section we shall limit ourselves to the centrality of humility in this meditation and its overall importance in the election and the dynamics of the *SpEx*. We shall begin by explaining the title and a textual analysis of the meditation. This will be followed by an explanation of the dynamics of this meditation. Finally we shall end by indicating the theological significance of this meditation.

6.4.2.1 Title & Textual Analysis

The title of the meditation indicates spiritual combat with an apocalyptic background.⁹⁸

⁹⁵ LG, 41-42.

⁹⁶ The fundamental choice, i.e. to give up a life of self-love and live a life centered on Christ and the Kingdom is an existential choice for any good Christian and the process of the election would be to confirm this fundamental choice and probably make critical choices for life in the context of deepening this fundamental choice.

⁹⁷ At this point of time, the focus is not so much on the election, but on the person of Christ in order to have the right attitude or the ‘mind of Christ’ (*Phil 2,5*). As there occurs an internal transformation and configuration of the person in Christ, there will be also be a growing tendency towards making choices which are consonant with the mind of Christ.

⁹⁸ Cf. LOSADA, JOAQUIN. “El Contenido Teológico de las Dos Banderas”, *Manresa* – 226, 1986, p. 45. ‘Las raíces de la ... meditación se encuentran en la ideología apocalíptica que envuelve los orígenes cristianos. Basta recordar que la contraposición de las dos ciudades, Babilonia y Jerusalén, aparece ya en el Apocalipsis cristiano, que cierra el Nuevo Testamento, esquematizando el

In this combat the two camps are diametrically opposed to each other with no neutral position.⁹⁹ There is no place called ‘no man’s land’ and therefore a person would have to choose one of the two standards. The title indicates that one is called to meditate the standard of Christ who is the ultimate leader.¹⁰⁰ Lucifer is presented not merely as any enemy, but as the ‘mortal’ enemy of human nature who desires to destroy the person totally.¹⁰¹ The setting of this meditation¹⁰² is stark and absolute with one standard leading to death and total annihilation with the other leading to life and fullness. With this background Ignatius presents the two standards and humility is presented as the key to a life of virtues, authentic and in keeping with one’s true vocation.¹⁰³

Moving on to the preludes we find that the first prelude uses historical memory and the second prelude uses the faculty of imagination in order to prepare the exercitant for the petition which forms the third prelude. The petition is a continuation of the general petition of the second week which desires to know Christ in order to love and follow Christ by having an insightful understanding of Christ’s standard of poverty, insults and humiliations. The insight is not limited to Christ’s standard, but consists of also understanding the standard of the deceitful life proposed by the evil one – that of

combate escatológico (Apoc. 1 7-21), que desembocará en el Reino de Dios. Hay, pues, que comprender lo que es la Apocalíptica para poder alcanzar en toda su profundidad el simbolismo de la meditación y su sentido teológico.’

⁹⁹ RAHNER, KARL. *Meditaciones sobre los Ejercicios de San Ignacio*, Herder: Barcelona, 1971, p. 165. “Nunca podemos tomar nuestra decisión desde una posición neutral.”

¹⁰⁰ The title that is given to Christ indicates the image that Ignatius wishes the exercitant to have. The two titles ‘Sumo Capitan’ and ‘Señor’ indicate that Christ who is presented here is the head of all His soldiers and that He is Lord of the entire world. Satan on the other hand is an intruder who has come into a space which belonged to Christ. (Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. “Eranse una vez Dos Banderas...”. *Observaciones lingüísticas al texto Ignaciano*, *Manresa* - 67, 1995, pp. 155-156.

¹⁰¹ Cf. LOSADA, JOAQUIN. “El Contenido Teológico...”, p. 51.

¹⁰² Though the standards of the two are totally different, there exists the risk of the evil appearing under the guise of good. Hence Ignatius would recommend that the second set of rules for discernment could be given during the second week. (*SpEx* 328-36)

¹⁰³ While detailing the two standards, it would be important to highlight the anthropology that forms the basis of Ignatius’ worldview. We find this indicated in his explanation about thoughts in the context of a good general Examen. It says “I assume that there are three kinds of thoughts in myself. That is, one kind is my own, which arises strictly from my own freedom and desire; and the other two come from outside myself, the one from the good spirit and the other from the evil.”[32] The two standards refer to the two sources from outside – the good and the evil spirit; sources which have become an integral part of one’s life and having an important influence on one’s freedom and desire.

riches, honor and pride. An insight into *both* these insights helps the exercitant enter more deeply into the mystery of God.¹⁰⁴

<p>[104] <i>The Third Prelude</i> will be to ask for what I desire.</p> <p>Here it will be to ask ...for an interior knowledge of Our Lord, who became human for me,</p> <p>that I may love him more intensely and follow him more closely.</p>	<p>[139] <i>The Third Prelude</i>. It is to ask for what I desire.</p> <p>Here it will be to ask ...for insight into the deceits of the evil leader, ...and for help to guard myself against them; and further, ...for insight into the genuine life which the supreme and truthful commander sets forth, and grace to imitate him.</p>
---	---

An insight into the standard of Christ is a grace and does not come about merely by personal effort. Only God can help a person understand how love that leads to humble submission is paradoxically the means to exaltation. The difficult nature of this insight is clearer when we realize that humility was not valued within philosophical categories. Aristotle had not known Christianity and would therefore not understand the paradox of how the highest elevation consists in absolute self-emptying love. The meditation of the two standards presents the descent and humiliation of God as an antidote towards the worldly impulse of ascent and pride.¹⁰⁵

Moving on to the body of the meditation we see that it has two parts and is so structured¹⁰⁶ that it forces the exercitant to make an election.¹⁰⁷ The first point makes use

¹⁰⁴ The original word used by Ignatius is 'muestra' which is not really 'set forth' as seen in the translation by George Ganss. It could be better understood as 'revealed' or 'manifested'.

¹⁰⁵ '... el pensamiento occidental no sólo no concede un puesto a la humildad, sino que la considera como una traba inútil y deformadora, dentro del concierto de la vida civil, contrapuesta por defecto a la magnanimidad. Ya en la filosofía griega, que forjó el «pensar y sentir» de Occidente, no existía un lugar para esta virtud.' Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. "Raíces de teología espiritual en las dos banderas." *Manresa* - 221, 1984, pp. 291-293.

¹⁰⁶ In the first part there are three points which will help the exercitant have an insight about the standard of Satan and the second part has three points providing an insight of the standard of Christ.

of the faculty of the imagination to become aware of the terrible reality of sin and its consequences and already indicates the basic point of the meditation. The contrast of the physical position of the two is striking: Christ is 'low' on the ground, while the enemy of human nature is on a 'high throne'. Further the internal structure of the texts reveals the consequences of one's desire for elevation, and the beauty of lowliness.¹⁰⁸

	Standard of Satan [140-142]	Standard of Christ [143-146]
<i>Title</i>	...leader of all the enemy	...Christ our Lord.
<i>Place</i>	...great plain of Babylon	...great plain near Jerusalem
<i>Action</i>	...seated on a throne	...takes his place
<i>Description</i>	...fire and smoke – horrible and terrifying.	...lowly, beautiful and attractive.

The second point refers to those who make up the collaborators in the enterprise. Human persons cannot be collaborators, but are victims of the machinations of Satan and other 'uncountable devils.' However in the case of Christ, those who are invited to be collaborators are persons such as 'apostles, disciples, and the like.' And finally we are reminded of the universal nature of both these standards whereby all are included in the salvific plan of God as well as the plan of sin, suffering and death devised by Satan. Let us now have a comparative analysis of the two standards from the point of view of the Christian vocation.

	Standard of Satan	Standard of Christ
<i>Manner</i>	...he summons	...chooses
<i>Kind</i>	...uncountable devils	...so many persons, apostles, disciples, and the like
<i>Area</i>	...throughout the whole world, without missing any provinces, places, states, or individual persons.	...throughout the whole world - ...among people of every state and condition.
<i>Purpose</i>	-----	...to spread his doctrine

¹⁰⁷ Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. "Erance una vez dos banderas..." *Manresa* - 263, 1995, p. 152.

¹⁰⁸ The reference is to an self-elevation which is caused by pride where one wants to affirm oneself totally marginalizing God. Satan rebelled against God, desiring to affirm himself as against God, but fell from grace.

The words that differentiate the attitude of Satan and Christ are mainly – ‘summons’ and ‘chooses’. A person who operates from a position of power would ‘summon’ others and thus display an attitude of pride and superiority. On the other hand Christ is humble and ‘chooses’ His disciples. They are granted the freedom to respond or reject the invitation. However Ignatius would presume that one who is growing in the illuminative way cannot but be touched by the humble call of Christ whose invitation is in fact a sign of His love and respect for human freedom. The call of Christ is that of the Incarnated Lord who shares the human condition and makes the invitation as an intimate friend.

La presentación quiere resaltar la accesibilidad y el atractivo; un Cristo cercano, que abaja su grandeza de “señor de todo el mundo” para relacionarse con aquellos que envía como con amigos. Hay aquí, sin duda, un recuerdo implícito a las palabras de Jesús en la última Cena: “No os llamo ya siervos, porque el siervo no sabe lo que hace su amo; a vosotros os he llamado amigos, porque todo lo he oído a mi Padre os lo he dado a conocer” (Ju. 15,15). El Cristo de la meditación de dos Banderas es el Cristo amigo.¹⁰⁹

6.4.2.2 The dynamics of the standard of Christ and that of Satan

If the first point referred to the position from where Christ and Satan operate, the second point indicates the manner in which the two deal with their collaborators. The third and final point indicates the manner in which this combat actually takes place. This is not a combat which merely takes place out there, but is one within which the exercitant is a participant. The two standards are directly and simultaneously present in the exercitant.¹¹⁰ An active participant is aware of both the strategies which are at work within oneself and therefore makes a petition so as to freely choose the banner of Christ.

6.4.2.2.1 The standard of Satan

The three steps of Satan by which an individual (or collective groups) are entrapped have been indicated as riches, honor and pride.¹¹¹ The goal of the method is in order to

¹⁰⁹ LOSADA, JOAQUIN. “El contenido teológico de las dos banderas”, *Manresa* 226, 1986, p. 51.

¹¹⁰ GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. “Eranse una vez dos banderas...”, *Manresa* - 67, 1995, p. 159.

¹¹¹ This point is not an original discovery of Ignatius. It dates back to the tradition of the Church from early times with specific contributions by St. Augustine, John Cassian, and various other Fathers of the Church. (Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, pp. 383-384.)

generate in the individual 'surging pride' because from pride it is easy to 'entice (a person) to all other vices' [142].¹¹² Though generation of pride is the goal, the starting point is riches which refer to all those elements which give us some form of apparent security.¹¹³ Since it is not intrinsically linked to the core of a person, it appears to have an objective character and therefore the deception is difficult to detect.¹¹⁴ When Ignatius speaks of riches, he is not merely speaking of material riches, but all that leads the human person to affirm oneself overlooking God¹¹⁵ and this could include both spiritual and material forms of riches.¹¹⁶

The second step is that of honor which is more difficult to get rid because of its relation to fear. Added to this is the fact that honor is a far more internalized reality which is intimately linked to the core of a person – to the identity of a person.

Pero de ésta segunda tentación es más difícil desprenderse. Una determinada posición social, un cierto influjo literario, una reputación científica coartan mi libertad más que la situación económica. La posibilidad de perder mi reputación me llenará del temor de perderme yo mismo con ella. Esto significa que me aferro a las cosas de ese mundo, que quiero hacerlas prevalecer a toda costa, incluso frente a Dios.¹¹⁷

The final step of pride enslaves the very being of the human person because it consists in taking "a stance in relation to God, (which consists) in the refusal to give

¹¹² The Fathers of the Church would speak of eight or nine different spiritual vices or passions which are divided into three categories – passions of the body, mind and the soul. Pride and vainglory are considered to be the passions of the spirit, are considered to be the core of all passions which have an all pervasive influence. "... nos encontramos (las pasiones relativas al espíritu) ante el núcleo esencial de las pasiones, con una gran facilidad para contaminar al resto – hasta tal punto que podemos decir que todas tienen algo de ellas." (RIVAS REBAQUE, FERNANDO. *Terapia de las enfermedades espirituales en los Padres de la Iglesia*, San Pablo: Madrid, 2008, p. 135.)

¹¹³ Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 109.

¹¹⁴ Cf. RAHNER, KARL. *Meditaciones...*, pp. 168-69. Rahner would also go on to say that the means used to tempt the human person are not sinful in themselves and their ambivalent nature makes it difficult to uncover the deception. '*Las cosas propuestas a elección son, en sentido neutral, no peyorativo, ambivalentes: pueden servir para esto o para aquello, están dotadas de una cierta plasticidad, esperan que el hombre les dé su signo y sentido últimos. El enemigo de Dios, el padre de la mentira y asesino del hombre, utiliza desde el principio esta ambivalencia objetiva como primer paso para la tentación, imponiendo estas cosas a nuestro interés.*'

¹¹⁵ Cf. CENTELLES VIVES, JORGE. "Valor social de 'dos banderas'", *Manresa* - 218, 1984, p. 71.

¹¹⁶ We can infer this point from the fact that Ignatius in his counter to riches would recommend poverty, beginning with spiritual poverty. He placed heavy emphasis on spiritual poverty and only when it was for the glory of God, to desire and choose material poverty.

¹¹⁷ Cf. RAHNER, KARL. *Meditaciones...*, p. 168.

praise and reverence (thus leading to) a tendency, in however subtle a way, to try to establish oneself as absolute."¹¹⁸ Once a person has affirmed oneself without taking into account the absolute dependence on God, it then leads to a warped form of existence leading to all forms of evil.¹¹⁹ The three steps are related to the desire of a person and exist in an increasing degree of intensity. Riches, honor and pride could be understood as three forms of desires: a desire to possess, desire to be valued and a desire to be.¹²⁰

6.4.2.2.1 *The standard of Christ*

After inviting the exercitant to understanding the technique of the evil one, Ignatius now invites the exercitant to understand and recognize the technique of Christ¹²¹ which consists in poverty, insults and humiliations. This is Ignatius' greater interest because the new decision, or the affirmation of an old election is more in consonance with following Christ and His standard.

The focus of the meditation is not equally divided between the two standards. The dynamics of the standard of Satan is primarily to lead the exercitant towards a greater adherence of Christ. At no point is the Christological focus of the process compromised, and once the tactics of Satan have been uncovered, Ignatius would invite the exercitant to be on one's guard against the machinations of Satan while desiring more ardently the standard of Christ.

The standard of Christ is repeated three times in quick succession – twice in the third point and once in the colloquy. Let us now place the three references to the three standards in the form of a table and analyze the text to understand the dynamics being proposed by Ignatius.

¹¹⁸ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 109.

¹¹⁹ Though pride is primarily defined in relation to God, it is intrinsically related to others and social structures. (Cf. CENTELLES VIVES, JORGE. "Valor social...", p. 72.)

¹²⁰ "...no cabe, pues, ignorar que entre los tres estadios de la tentación propuestos por san Ignacio, media una gradación de intensidad. ...descubrimos en el proceso mental de san Ignacio una tríada que pudiera formularse así: querer poseer, querer valer, querer ser." (RAHNER, KARL. *Meditaciones...*, pp. 168-168.)

¹²¹ All the three points will begin with the word 'consider' and the reference to Christ is always as 'Christ the/our Lord' signifying the relationship with Christ who has been considered in the meditation of the Kingdom.

	[146,1-4]	[146,5-7]	[147, 1-3]
<i>Address</i>	Christ to all his servants and friends whom he is sending	(a summary of the two standards)	... (by the exercitant) to Our Lady
<i>Method</i>	...by attracting them	...(one) in opposition to (another)	...beg to obtain for me grace ...
<i>First step – Want poverty</i>	First to the most perfect spiritual poverty and also, if the Divine Majesty should be served and should wish to choose them for it, even to no less a degree of actual poverty,	...the first, poverty in opposition to riches;	...and first, in the most perfect spiritual poverty; and also, if his Divine Majesty should be served and if he should wish to choose me for it, to no less a degree of actual poverty;
<i>Second step – desire reproaches or contempt</i>	...and second, by attracting them to a desire of reproaches and contempt,	...the second, reproaches or contempt in opposition to honor from the world;	...and second, in bearing reproaches and injuries, that through them I may imitate him more, if only I can do this without sin on anyone's part and without displeasure to the Divine Majesty.
<i>Third step - humility</i>	... since from these results humility.	...and the third, humility in opposition to pride.	
<i>Final goal</i>	...aid all persons	...induce people to all other virtues...	...be received under His standard...

The text that is seen in the table below shows a clear movement both in terms of the content as well as the method. The first two points deal with what has been indicated earlier regarding the fact that the initiative is always from Christ. The grace of God opens the 'eyes of understanding' of His servants and friends. This helps a person see the sublime and attractive nature of Christ's standard. From this initiative of the Divine, we have a second movement which consists in the response of the exercitant. The exercitant who has been illumined, desires to participate in the salvific plan of God and therefore 'begs' Our Lady to be placed under the standard of Christ.

The schema presented by the Two Standards and these include poverty,

insults/reproaches and humility helps us better understand the total response of a person to the call of Christ.¹²² A person is invited to begin with poverty of spirit, desire actual poverty wherever appropriate, then move on towards an intense desire for reproaches and injuries and finally a life of humility through which a person identifies with Christ. Let us now see these three steps in detail and understand the inter-related dynamic within them.

6.4.2.2.1.1 Spiritual Poverty

The process begins with spiritual poverty which is a grace that one asks for.

Se ha de ...pedir la gracia de la pobreza de espíritu, que es la auténtica pobreza radical, desde la raíz de sí mismo, que me libere de mis aficiones desordenadas y me abra a los valores del Reino, que son, ante todo, de tipo relacional.¹²³

The form of poverty consists in an awareness of one's radical dependence on God for one's existence and is based on true knowledge of oneself.¹²⁴ However poverty thus explained is not limited to an awareness of one's true nature, but is primarily based on the God who through the Kenosis reveals God's true being as consisting in poverty and humiliation. It is the experience of the love of God revealed in Christ that is the authentic motivation for freely accepting poverty.

Poverty which is bereft of a transcendental dimension of love and which does not involve a free decision leads to human degeneration, anger, suffering and death. Corrella has a good explanation of how poverty can be motivated by the standard of Christ as well as the standard of Satan. The poverty that the exercitant is invited to live within the context of the *SpEx* is rooted in love and is redemptive in nature.

¹²² The standard of Christ consists in leading the exercitant towards an attitude of humility – which is the final goal since it is the gateway to all other virtues. This takes place when the understanding of the person is illumined, the will is strengthened and the heart is radically transformed – in other words when there is a transformation of the entire person.

¹²³ CORELLA, JESÚS. "Dos banderas y maneras de humildad como experiencia unitaria de pobreza de espíritu", *Ejercicios Espirituales y mundo de hoy*, (Ed. García-Lomas, J. M.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 1992, pp. 162.

¹²⁴ José Calveras would indicate that the cause of disorder in a person is the lack of knowledge about oneself. The individual needs to be humble and deal with the ignorance at various levels and would have to act simultaneously so that various dimensions of one's being are affected. (Cf. CALVERAS, JOSÉ. "¿De que humildad se habla en las dos banderas?", *Manresa* - 34, 1933, p. 13.)

La pobreza verdadera, fruto de una opción por amor. Podrá suceder que esa opción consista en una aceptación consciente de una situación impuesta de pobreza. Otras veces esa opción buscará un desposeimiento radical menos predeterminado. Pero de una u otra forma, siempre es una decisión deseada, vivida como acceso a Jesús y su Reino.

Por eso está pobreza no es la pobreza forzada, fruto de una injusticia que esclaviza y deteriora hasta la degradación y la muerte a tantos seres humanos. Esa pobreza que engendra odio y deseos de revancha. Tal pobreza debe ser raída de la faz de la tierra, porque nada tiene que ver con la bandera de Jesús. Al contrario, esa pobreza es el subproducto engendrado por la bandera de satanás. Viene producida por la codicia de riquezas, que desestabiliza el justo acceso a los bienes de la creación, y hace imposible la pobreza evangélica compartida y deseada que prepara el camino a un amor fraterno.

Hay que distinguir estas dos pobrezas, que corresponden una a cada una de las dos banderas, para disipar posibles malos entendidos respecto a la pobreza proclamada por Jesús y tan crucial en el proceso de los ejercicios ignacianos.¹²⁵

6.4.2.2.1.2 Actual Poverty

Though spiritual poverty is considered most authentic and radical, it must be pointed that actual poverty is also strongly emphasized by Ignatius.¹²⁶ Actual poverty includes both spiritual and material poverty¹²⁷ and its emphasis is seen in two of the three statements of this meditation as highlighted in the third row of this table. As indicated in the preceding paragraph, Ignatius desired that material poverty should be only 'if his Divine Majesty should be served and if he should wish to choose me for it...' [146,147] Ignatius on various occasions reiterated that actual poverty endured for the sake of Christ is a grace. This thought is beautifully expressed in a letter to the Jesuits at Padua who were suffering real deprivation because of being insufficiently supported by its founder Andrea Lippomani. Ignatius in this letter states:

I call (actual) poverty a grace because it is a very special gift from God. Scripture tells us

¹²⁵ Cf. CORELLA, JESÚS. "Dos Banderas y Maneras de Humildad...", p.163.

¹²⁶ There is a great deal written about the importance of spiritual poverty – insisting on its enormous importance, almost to the extent of overlooking the radical dimension of actual poverty. It is true that Ignatius insisted on spiritual poverty and wanted the exercitant to choose it only 'if the Divine Majesty should be served' [146]. However a closer reading of this meditation as well as the meditation of the three classes of persons [149 - 157] as well as the consideration of the three degrees of humility [165-168] leaves one with no doubt about the critical importance that Ignatius placed on actual poverty. In the second meditation and third consideration which forms this key trilogy in the Spiritual Exercises, Ignatius will invite the exercitant to ardently desire and ask for the grace of actual poverty. (Cf. CENTELLES VIVES, JORGE. "Valor social...", pp. 69-70.)

¹²⁷ RAHNER, KARL. *Meditaciones...*, p. 171. "Por pobreza hay que entender aquí, en último análisis, la capacidad de desasimiento, la indiferencia fundada en la confianza en Dios."

that “poverty and probity are from God” [Sir. 11:14]; and how much God loves it has been shown us by his only-begotten Son, who came down from his heavenly seat and chose to be born and brought up in poverty. He loved it not only in life – suffering hunger and thirst, having no place to lay his head – but even in death, choosing to be stripped of his clothes and deprived of everything, even of water for his thirst.¹²⁸

We have thus seen that the awareness of spiritual poverty as well as the grace of actual poverty in the context of the love of God revealed in Christ is the first point in the standard of Christ. Poverty thus explained is intimately related to humility and in fact both poverty and humility from a biblical point of view mean the same thing.¹²⁹ They have their source in the eternal love of God which has been historically revealed in the person of Christ.¹³⁰ The humility of God was revealed in the Kenosis of Christ and manifest concretely in poverty. Humility and poverty emerge from a similar attitude and are expressed relationally and materially.¹³¹

6.4.2.2.1.3 Insults

The second step in this process consists in a desire for reproaches and contempt or injuries. Though not much has been written about this point, it is important to understand that in the cultural context of Ignatius, honor was considered important.

Es preciso tener en cuenta que en el mundo Ignaciano, por ejemplo, en su concepción del ideal humano del caballero medieval, esta identidad social se identificaba con la vida por antonomasia del hombre. El honor equivalía a la vida y perder el honor era perder la vida.¹³²

The concept of honor was central to the identity of a knight.¹³³ Therefore the

¹²⁸ *LI*, p. 203. (*To the Members of the Society in Padua: 7th August, 1547*)

¹²⁹ J. Dupont in “Les Béatitudes” gives us a clear explanation regarding the insistence of the Fathers of the Church in considering ‘poor in spirit’ as ‘humble.’ The Qumran texts which were discovered in the last century explain the position of the Father of the Church because ‘the poor in spirit’ are the humble. The word ‘anawim’ contains the etymological meaning of the word ‘humble.’ “*La palabra hebrea “anawim” (que nosotros traducimos por ‘pobres’) contiene en ella (la humildad) su valor etimológico: se trata de hombres ‘curvados’, ‘abajados’, ‘humillados’; la actitud de alma a la que reenvía la precisión ‘en espíritu’ es la de la humildad interior.*” (based on a quote in ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. “Raíces de teología espiritual en las Dos Banderas”, p. 307.)

¹³⁰ Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, p. 393.

¹³¹ Cf. CORELLA, JESÚS. “Dos Banderas...” p. 162.

¹³² ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. “Raíces de teología espiritual en las Dos Banderas...”, p. 297.

¹³³ Ignatius had known of two types of honor that was desired by the people of his time. Two social groups desired to

desire for insults was counter-cultural to Ignatius world-view. This desire helps the exercitant to be more precise regarding his election and is an important aid in prioritizing the available choices. The exercitant is invited to focus on his/her desire. [146]¹³⁴ This point will be reinforced various times during the next meditation of the Three Classes of Persons. In the colloquy we see a shift from a 'desire of reproaches and contempt' as indicated in the third point [146] to actually 'bearing reproaches and injuries.' This shift is an indication of a growing degree of humility within the exercitant.¹³⁵

The desire for honor is a strong motivating factor and is related to our need to be accepted, affirmed and esteemed. This is a valid need, but one needs to know as to what is moving a person towards this need. When the movement takes place by marginalizing God and establishing it on one's false self-sufficiency we have a situation in which the person is ensnared.¹³⁶ The meditation of the two standards presents a methodology whereby the internal knowledge which is enlightening a person is converted into an effective pedagogy so that the exercitant can be better disposed to free oneself in order to make the best possible election. In order to facilitate that, Ignatius advocates the use of the technique of defense as well as offense whereby a person is not satisfied with merely accepting insults, reproaches and the like, but invites the exercitant to intensely desire and long for the same.

En este punto como en todos los demás, no se contenta el Santo con quedarse en la defensiva, sino que acomete la ofensiva. No se contenta con excitar en el ejercitante la paciencia necesaria para llevar resignadamente las afrentas y menosprecios, mediante la consideración de que los tiene bien merecidos por su nada y su maldad y los muchos pecados cometidos merecedores del infierno eterno, como lo practican generalmente los autores ascéticos; sino que quiere lanzarlo a desafiar los espantajos del oprobio y

go up the social ladder and these included the old nobility as well as the neo-rich who had amassed wealth from the new lands that they had discovered. On the other hand there was the honor of a noble knight which was the lingering heritage of the middle ages and was on the decline. Ignatius whose imagination had been fired by the life of gallant and noble knights aspired before his conversion for this second kind of honor.

¹³⁴ Cf. CALVERAS, JOSÉ. "La humildad ...", p. 98.

¹³⁵ There is quite a difference between desiring insults and bearing them when they come. Believers can deceive themselves into thinking that they can bear insults. Christ goes beyond this to urge the Christians to even desire them.(Cf. ENGLISH, JOHN. *Spiritual Freedom...*, p. 153.)

¹³⁶ Cf. IBID., p. 156.

menosprecio que intimidan a su amor sensual y mundano, y con ello le ponen trabas para que entre decididamente por el camino del mayor servicio divino y para semejante arrojó no bastan las consideraciones depresivas fundadas en el propio conocimiento.¹³⁷

The desire for insults and reproaches is inspired by a desire to imitate Christ and hence one is attracted to what is repugnant.¹³⁸ The attitude of such a person who is motivated by love for Christ reveals a transformed heart. Such transformation reveals a level of humility which is in tune with the third degree of humility.

Para acabar de poner en relieve que la humildad de que se habla en el programa de Cristo en la meditación de Dos Banderas es humildad de corazón, nos detendremos ahora en la consideración directa de la tercera manera de humildad, declarando cómo encierra en sí perfectísimamente los tres escalones de las Dos Banderas y cómo todo en ella suena a humildad de corazón.¹³⁹

The very fact that the individual is inclined towards imitating Christ and wants poverty, both spiritual and actual; as well as desires insults and reproaches is an indication that the person already has the attitude of humility and does not need to make a specific petition for humility. He believes that it is the logical outcome [146] in a person who has begun to love and desire poverty for the sake of Christ. By reflecting on one's own experience,¹⁴⁰ contemplating the life of Christ, and doing the meditations proposed by the *SpEx* a person becomes more open to the grace of God. This grace helps a person to grow in freedom leading to an increasing desire to share in the humility of Christ through concrete choices. An ardent desire thus experienced is the disposition expected of the exercitant through this meditation.

6.4.2.2.1.4 Humility

Let us now come to the third and final step/point of the standard of Christ – humility. Humility spontaneously emerges within a person who has emptied himself of riches,

¹³⁷ CALVERAS, JOSÉ. "La humildad...", p. 103.

¹³⁸ Cf. CORELLA, JESÚS. "Dos banderas y...", p. 156.

¹³⁹ Calveras makes a distinction between humility of thought and humility of the heart, wherein these forms of humility are different but parallel to each other. He further states that the three steps in the Two Standards perfectly express the attitude of the Three Degrees of Humility. (Cf. CALVERAS, JOSÉ. "La humildad...", pp. 97-102.)

¹⁴⁰ LOSADA, JOAQUIN. "El contenido...", p. 53. 'La "historia" que se pretende meditar en su realidad actual comprendida como historia de salvación.'

embraced poverty and has turned his back on worldly honors and desires insults and reproaches in order to imitate Christ.

De una pobreza así aceptada surge, sin embargo, espontáneamente la «humildad»; con ésta viene la apertura y libertad del corazón, que sigue su camino sin mirarse a sí misma, sin pensar en la recompensa; que toma conciencia de ser, y así y no de otro modo, rica: rica en Dios mismo.¹⁴¹

In this meditation, the understanding of humility is not elaborated and Ignatius prefers to leave the exercitant with a terse statement indicating its importance. What is surprising is that in the colloquy where the exercitant is invited to pray to Our Lady, to the Son and the Father, there is no mention of humility. There are two reasons for the same and they can be presented as follows.

(First Explanation) La explicación obvia era ésta: puesto los dos primeros escalones, el tercero viene solo... Se sigue por su propio peso, no hay ni que pedirlo. Por eso, la artillería, en la oración y en la decisión personal, hay que ponerla en los dos primeros. Y si se urge un poco, incluso sólo en el primero, en la suma pobreza espiritual, con la disponibilidad real, en lo que al ejercitante se refiere, a la pobreza actual. Ahí es donde se juega uno todo el recorrido, porque, puesto en serio en él, se desencadena por su propia dinámica el proceso de los tres. Este es el carácter decisivo, crucial, de la pobreza en el seguimiento de Jesús.

(Second Explanation) Pero sin quitar lo dicho, existe otra explicación, que nos remite al tema de la presente comunicación. Y es que el tercer escalón es el contenido total y único del coloquio [168] de la consideración de las Maneras. Ahora sólo se pide humildad, y por eso no se pedía aún explícitamente en Banderas.¹⁴²

This is the reason that one has to look at the meditation of the Two Standards as being intrinsically related to the consideration of the Three Degrees of Humility and it is there that Ignatius elaborates the understanding of humility. However despite the brief description of humility in this meditation, it outlines one of the core theological processes from the spiritual point of view as observed in the *SpEx*. While it would be difficult to provide an exhaustive exposition of humility at this point, let us briefly look at the radically new understanding that this meditation reveals to the exercitant.

The text of this meditation presents humility as the greatest of all virtues and a

¹⁴¹ RAHNER, KARL. *Meditaciones...*, p. 172.

¹⁴² CORELLA, JESÚS. "Dos Banderas...", pp. 158-59.

key to spiritual life.¹⁴³ This perspective coincides perfectly with the doctrine of the Eternal King.¹⁴⁴ As a matter of fact, in the initial stage, the meditation of the Eternal King and the meditation of the Two Standards were fused together.¹⁴⁵ The text states that humility along with poverty and reproaches would lead to all other virtues – ‘from these three steps they should induce people to all the other virtues.’ (*SpEx* – 146⁶)¹⁴⁶ It must also be emphasized that though we have three steps or points with humility being highlighted as the third step, the attitude of the third degree of humility (*SpEx* – 167) is present in all the three steps.

There is no doubt that the meditation invites the exercitant to recall how the experience of poverty and humility has been a transversal theme so far in the *SpEx*. However this meditation goes beyond being a mere summary and has a central role to play in the dynamics of the exercises.

...su indudable originalidad textual, transparentada en la riqueza de simbolismos y en la fuerte articulación estructural, y su centralidad en el proceso de los Ejercicios hacen sospechar que nos encontramos ante algo más que un mero resumen que recuerde al ejercitante el camino que ha recorrido hasta este momento...¹⁴⁷

The dimension of humility as presented in this meditation is central in the entire spiritual process and is the key factor in order to make a genuine election.¹⁴⁸ Only an internal knowledge of the ‘genuine teaching of Christ’ [164] would allow a genuine transformation to take place within the individual. Such a transformation would allow a

¹⁴³ CALVERAS, JOSÉ. “La humildad...”, pp. 16-17. ‘...la humildad entendida como la plena entrega y sujeción al servicio y voluntad de Dios, enseña el mismo Santo Tomás que es la primera entre las demás virtudes morales después de la justicia legal... la humildad es puerta o escalón para todas las demás virtudes, porque dispone la voluntad a guardar en todas las materias el orden de la razón sancionado por Dios.’

¹⁴⁴ IBID., p. 14.

¹⁴⁵ Cf. GANSS, GEORGE. *The Spiritual Exercises...*, p. 167.

¹⁴⁶ It must be pointed out that though there is a progression that is evident in the three steps, they are not to be understood as being mutually exclusive and chronological. Rather there is a unity of the three steps, and all of them collectively help a person grow in virtues. This can be deduced from the phrase where Ignatius emphasizes that humility is the result of ‘all three steps.’

¹⁴⁷ LOSADA, JOAQUIN. “El contenido teológico...”, p. 42.

¹⁴⁸ The theological understanding that the exercitant gains in this key meditation as explained in this section is developed using the insights offered by an article by Santiago Arzubialde. He explains this meditation from the point of view of spiritual theology in an exhaustive article in the magazine *Manresa*. (Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. “Raíces de teología espiritual en las dos banderas”, *Manresa* – 221, 1984, pp. 291-319.)

person to move beyond a superficial following of the Eternal King and allow one to be wholeheartedly and generously committed to Christ. This commitment would be translated in concrete choices through the election, thus effecting an ongoing configuration with Christ poor and humble.

6.4.2.3 Theological Significance

6.4.2.3.1 *The Standard of Satan – Sin and Enslavement*

The human person is in a position to understand that the means to participate in the salvific plan of God is humility. This is because it has been revealed to us in the Incarnation.¹⁴⁹ The tendency of human desire which had been distorted by self-love would not have allowed the human person to grasp this eternal truth. The history of salvation reveals that the human person has always desired to put himself at the same level as God – a desire to affirm oneself by marginalizing God and glorifying oneself. Desire is neutral in itself and in normal circumstances would tend towards God.¹⁵⁰ However since we exist within a broken world, it has been enslaved to such a degree that it is motivated by an absolute need for ascent. This in turn has led it to be sucked into a vicious spiral of the standard of Satan which begins with ‘riches, then honor and finally pride.’ [143]

The consequence of the standard of Satan is that the original vocation of the human person as a free being called to love and serve others is replaced by a person whose ‘capacity to know the truth is darkened, and his will to submit to it is weakened.’¹⁵¹ The individual is no longer free and the desire tends to acts in a manner which is motivated primarily out of self-love. There is no limit as far as this desire to ascend is concerned and the three steps culminating in pride is the point from where ‘the enemy entices (a person) to all the other vices.’ [142] A person who lives by this standard disobeys God and destroys the image of God within oneself. Such a life which

¹⁴⁹ Without this revelation in Christ, humility was an attitude which needed to be despised and discarded. Aristotle would indicate that ‘undue humility is more opposed to pride than vanity is; for it is both commoner and worse.’ [Aristot., *Nic. Eth.* 1125a.30–34]

¹⁵⁰ “...in the far reaches of the human heart there is a seed of desire and nostalgia for God...” (FR, 24)

¹⁵¹ VS, 1.

is enslaved to disordered affections leads to a person closing in on oneself.¹⁵² The process of the preceding days has helped the exercitant become aware of the negative spiral of the standard of Satan. There is an experiential knowledge of two realities. These include the reality of sin and enslavement as well as the desire to be entrapped by the temptation of ascent which leaves God on the margins.

An understanding of sin and its consequences as well as the standard of Christ leads to a strategy which is defensive as well as offensive. On the one hand there is a petition for an internal knowledge of the standard of Satan and on the other hand there is a petition for an internal knowledge of the standard of Christ.¹⁵³ A special moment in this awareness is the contemplation of the Incarnation, where one begins to better understand the logic of love as manifested in the Triune God who descended in order to share in the human condition. This descent enlightens the human person and helps one to slowly understand the paradoxical nature of humility as being the means of salvation.

6.4.2.3.2 The Descent of God – Love and Humility

The goal of this meditation is to help the exercitant go beyond the stage of indifference and have a preferential love for humility so as to fully participate in the descent of God. However this choice would remain at a superficial level if the exercitant does not have an internal knowledge of the God's descent who shared in the human condition through a life of poverty and humility.¹⁵⁴ The more an exercitant understands the unconditional and limitless descent of God as revealed in Christ, the more stronger will the person's desire be to choose that which aids in a greater imitation of Christ.

The descent of God is a perplexing reality and only by the grace of God can one understand this mystery of love. The contradiction between the absolute nature of

¹⁵² Cf. SCHOONENBERG, PIET. *Man and Sin...* p. 20.

¹⁵³ In keeping with the technique of Ignatius we see both a defensive as well as an offensive strategy. The petition for internal knowledge once again underlines this strategy.

¹⁵⁴ CALVERAS, JOSÉ. "La humildad...", p. 103. '*...la humildad que propone San Ignacio al ejercitante en las Dos Banderas y las tres maneras de humildad no es la resignación a pasar oprobios y menosprecios, porque los tiene bien merecidos, sino el deseo y amor de la humillación, prefiriéndola de su parte a los honores y estima de los hombres, sólo por amor de Cristo que de ello le da ejemplo, abrazándola primero por él.*'

human desire to ascend against the unconditional and limitless descent of God would be difficult for the human person to understand, if not for the gift of faith.

...Dios ha descendido hasta lo más bajo como medio para manifestar su salvación. Este dato escandaloso, que trasciende nuestro análisis anterior, es el que no logramos comprender y el que siempre nos deja perplejos... Por una parte nos encontramos con el ascenso incondicionado del deseo y, por otra, con el descenso sin límites de lo "incondicionado". He aquí el abismo de contradicción ante el que se encuentra la libertad humana. En su horizonte aparece, de pronto, el gesto encarnatorio de Dios, que se vacía de sí mismo, como oferta de salvación.¹⁵⁵

In the first chapter the humility of God has been indicated at various moments in the Old Testament. However it has been definitively expressed in the Incarnation when God expressed His love by becoming human. This mystery of love expressed itself in its totality on the Cross. The fact that God left God's divine condition and took on the form of a slave (Phil, 2.7-8) reveals a new set of values. The humility of God thus revealed in the kenosis of Christ is a manifestation of God's 'absolute love'¹⁵⁶ – a love which is unconditional and personal. The motive for the descent of God by accepting poverty and humility is an abiding love towards the human person.

The Incarnation introduces a new dynamism in the human reality which is salvific in nature and makes the human person a new creation. The revelation of God in poverty and humility radically alters every aspect of human existence. The human person who was motivated by self-love, now ardently desires to imitate the self-emptying love of Christ by living a life of poverty and humility. Repetition of this meditation four times on the fourth day and continuing with other contemplations, meditations and considerations related to the same theme, helps the exercitant to understand the motive behind the descent of God, become aware of its salvific function and by desiring and choosing humility, share in the very being of God.

6.4.2.3.3 The Human Vocation and Humility

The exercitant understands that his vocation is not a privatized, internal and emotional

¹⁵⁵ ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. "Raíces de teología...", pp. 303-04.

¹⁵⁶ Balthasar when speaking about the sovereignty of God indicates that God is not 'absolute power' but 'absolute love' - a love which is manifest in total abandonment. (Cf. VON BALTHASAR, HANS URS. *MP*, p. 29.)

experience, but is an invitation to a new form of solidarity within human society. The total self-giving of the Triune God as well as the total self-emptying of Christ reveals to us our authentic vocation and invites us to imitate the same. The internal knowledge thus gained helps one to move away from the narcissistic and flawed sense of self-sufficiency so as to grow in a radical openness towards others. The openness towards others is intimately linked to the surging love for Christ and concretely manifests itself in Christian charity.

Se puede afirmar que el amor a Dios implica en sí mismo el amor a los hombres, porque el hombre, al amar al padre en Cristo, ama lo que Dios ama y como Dios ama. Según esto, el amor a Dios lleva en sí mismo implícito el amor a los hombres; y la razón de esta unión indivisible es más profunda que decir que el amor a Dios conduce o dispone al amor del prójimo, y también que quien ama a Dios debe cumplir su mandamiento de amar al hombre.¹⁵⁷

The internal knowledge from the meditation on the two standards leads to a life of humility which manifests itself an attitude of greater charity. A person has a surging desire to emptying oneself for the sake of the other. The person becomes more patient and meek realizing that the only way towards genuine life is to move out of one's narcissistic self-love towards a love where one empties oneself totally for the other. There is a better appraisal of human inter-dependence leading to a profound sense of gratitude. There is a growing understanding that the only means of salvation is through a participation in the humility of God – a participation that takes place through a life of charity and self-emptying love.

Esta actitud encarnatorio de Dios es la única que capacita especialmente para ver lo divino en el hombre. Porque la humildad, que atañe propiamente a la reverencia con que el hombre se somete a Dios, hace que el hombre se someta a su prójimo en consideración a lo que hay de Dios en él.¹⁵⁸

The above mentioned process of having a constant attitude of humility is in keeping with the true vocation of the human person whereby one slowly dies to oneself

¹⁵⁷ GAMARRA, SATURNINO. *Teología espiritual...*, p. 135.

¹⁵⁸ ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. "Raíces de Teología...", p. 312.

in order to find true life in Christ.¹⁵⁹ Rediscovering one's true vocation leads to a transformed relationship with God as well as a new form of solidarity with others which is based on love and Christian charity. A person realizes that the lower a person descends to love and serve others the higher is the elevation as far as one's true identity as a being created in God's image and likeness is concerned.

6.4.2.3.4 True Ascent and Transformation through Humility

Definite choices which are in keeping with one's vocation would lead to greater union of one's understanding, will and affect (heart) with that of Christ and lead to a new form of existence. Such a transformed existence in Christ has humility as the central virtue and reveals a new paradigm of values which motivates the individual to freely empty oneself for the sake of God.

...cuando el hombre se encuentra ante esta doble alternativa: ante la encrucijada de la libertad que le obliga a tener que elegir, y ante el sistema de valores que Dios le presenta como algo "no-natural", sino percibido en la fe como contradictorio de todo otro valor, debe entender que la humildad es una auténtica elevación. ... porque además, una vez muerto a sí mismo, penetra en el misterio insondable del amor personal al Verbo encarnado que le capacita para amar a sus hermanos como el mismo Dios les ha amado...¹⁶⁰

Paradoxically Christian charity leads a person to humble oneself for the sake of the other.¹⁶¹ The basis of understanding humility as a central component in any spiritual journey and the salvific process has a firm Christological foundation. The response of the human person who desires and chooses humility is relevant only in so far it is an imitation of Christ with the intention of creating a new humanity which is based on Christian charity.

The meditation of the Two Standards is a very dynamic meditation and hence

¹⁵⁹ IBID., p. 318. "...la inclinación del deseo a la autoafirmación al margen de Dios... va radicalmente en contra de la vocación original del hombre en Cristo que se manifiesta progresivamente en la dependencia filial del Padre y se expresa y vive, de un modo especial, en la solidaridad con los demás hombres en el bien."

¹⁶⁰ IBID., p. 314.

¹⁶¹ However it must be remembered that humility in itself has no value and does not in any way elevate a person. It finds its meaningfulness in the fact that God's covenant with humanity has been through Christ who emptied himself for our sake, thus revealing God's eternal love.

Ignatius would recommend that the person repeat it four times on the fourth day. The meditation indicates a definitive shift in the internal process of the exercitant towards the future. It is related to the first week as well as the third and fourth weeks which are to follow.¹⁶² This meditation is crucial in order to achieve the goal of the Exercises and to re-discover one's true vocation to share in God's love.¹⁶³ It aids the exercitant to make a new election or confirm a past election by being rooted in the humility of Christ.

Humility helps in the overall transformation of the person – i.e. the understanding, will and heart.¹⁶⁴ Ignatius desired this kind of transformation in the person because he knew that a transformation which comes from a deep rooted experience of humility would be lasting and fruitful. He wanted a person to be free from sin but did not desire any dimension of the human person to be violently annihilated. Rather he desired a transformation of the entire person – and most importantly a transformation of a person's desire. He wanted it to be transformed in such a manner that the entire person - understanding, will and heart would desire and choose that which would give greater glory to God.¹⁶⁵

The meditation on the two Standards takes place at a time when the exercitant has left behind a life of sin and experience a sincere desire to follow the Eternal King. The knowledge of the true doctrine of Christ¹⁶⁶ leads towards a desire to more radically

¹⁶² There is reference to the first week as far as the standard of Satan is concerned, but it is only to indicate that the exercitant ought to remain vigilant and as a means to motivate the exercitant to progress in a life of virtues – especially the virtue of humility. The invitation to imitate Christ who was poor and humble will continue in the third and fourth weeks where the dynamics of the Exercises leads to a greater identification with the unconditional and limitless descent of God.

¹⁶³ The goal of the Exercises is presented as consisting in three different points which are interlinked – getting rid of disordered affections, choosing that which would better glorify God (election) and union with God. Humility is central in order to achieve all three ends and the lack of humility will adversely affect the dynamic process of the Spiritual Exercises. Humility helps a person to become aware of one's disordered affections and opens one to God and others. The knowledge of one's radical dependency on God and others helps one to discover one's true vocation leading to choices which are in keeping with one's true identity as being made in God's image

¹⁶⁴ The understanding which has been enlightened all through the first week and later on during the contemplations of the life of Christ, also affects the will and the heart. Experiential knowledge is important in order to transform the desire of a person.

¹⁶⁵ We shall elaborate the point concerning the transformation of desire in the last chapter.

¹⁶⁶ In this meditation as well as the note before the consideration of the three ways of being humble, we have a

imitate the 'supreme and truthful commander' [139]. The meditations and contemplations have given the exercitant an insightful understanding of true life and at the same time made one aware of the dangers that this new way of life entails. The invitation to be rooted in humility works as a bulwark against being easily entrapped by the standard of Satan. This radical shift which is rooted in Christ poor and humble would be reinforced and taken forward in the meditations, contemplations and considerations in the next few days and weeks.

6.4.3 THE THREE CLASSES OF PERSONS¹⁶⁷

6.4.3.1 Introduction and Relevance

The last meditation on the fourth day is of the 'Three Classes of Persons' which is a parable of three persons, each of whom has acquired 10,000 ducats¹⁶⁸ who are desirous of 'discarding the burden and obstacle' that the attachment to this money provokes in order 'to save his or her soul and to find God our Lord in peace' [150]. Continuing with the comparative style of the previous meditation, it presents three types of persons in order to show the varying levels of freedom that affect a person who desires to make an election.

The placement of this meditation at the end of the day leads one to compare it with the 'application of senses', which is generally placed at the end of the day. In a certain manner it is such a meditation because it invites one to integrate into one's life the doctrine of the Two Standards.¹⁶⁹

reference to 'doctrine'. In the Two Standards, the one who is sent is called upon to 'spread his doctrine' while the third note before the Three Ways of Being Humble speak of being 'lovingly attached to the genuine teaching of Christ our Lord.'

¹⁶⁷ The title in the translation by George Ganss needs to be explained further. The actual translation indicates "Tres Binarios de Hombres" where 'binarios' does not necessarily mean 'classes'. In the *DEI*, Antonio Alburquerque quoting P. Leturia indicates that it signifies a composition of body and soul or more simplistically groups of two. (Cf. ALBURQUERQUE, ANTONIO. "Binarios", *DEI*, p. 230.)

¹⁶⁸ 10,000 ducats was a big sum of money. In 1532, Ignatius writing to his brother Martín García de Oñaz indicated that for 'maintenance, tutors, and other academic needs... fifty ducats a years, properly provided, will suffice.' (Cf. *LI*, p. 4.)

¹⁶⁹ CORELLA, JESÚS. "Dos banderas..." *Ejercicios Espirituales y mundo de hoy...*, p. 160. 'La meditación de tres Binarios ocupa

The relevance of this meditation has been debated from the very beginning. While it was generally proposed to the exercitant as the final meditation on the fourth day and focused on strengthening the will of the person, there have been divergent opinions regarding its application. Polanco in his directory would indicate that if the individual does not manifest the necessary disposition for an election, this meditation can be repeated

...if it is obvious that he is more inclined to the commandments and shrinks from the way of the counsels, then he is not properly disposed and there is no hope of his making a good election... They should be told to repeat the meditations on the Three Classes of Men and the Three Modes of Humility, and to try to dispose themselves to beg God for abandonment to him, asking (as said above) that if it is equally or more pleasing to God, he might incline them to desire to choose the counsels over the commandments.¹⁷⁰

However, not everyone is convinced of the importance of this meditation. Despite doubts about its utility, most commentators would prefer to include this meditation because it is part of a progressive dynamic in the Spiritual Exercises.¹⁷¹

6.4.3.2 Significance of the word 'querer'

The meditation is a humble acknowledgement of the need of God's grace in order to have a total transformation of one's affective dimension. The exercitant is invited to will and desire only 'that which is more to the glory of the Divine Majesty and the salvation of my soul.' [151] The desire to transform one's affective world is seen by the repeated use of the word 'desire' in this meditation. The Spanish equivalent for desire is 'querer' and Ignatius uses this word various times with the word 'querer' appearing 7 times in no. [155]

El Tercero *quiere* quitar el afecto, más así le *quiere* quitar que también no le tiene afección

en la jornada ignaciana el lugar del quinto ejercicio, es decir, el que en los días de contemplación ordinaria está previsto para la aplicación de sentido. En realidad es algo equivalente, porque en ella se intenta integrar en mi vida, con mi sensibilidad interior, la vera doctrine de Banderas.'

¹⁷⁰ (Ed.) PALMER, MARTIN E. *On Giving the Spiritual Exercises...*, pp. 136-37.

¹⁷¹ Some directors do not consider this meditation necessary. However if a person has a specific problem which is proving to be an obstacle in having the necessary freedom and indifference, then these directors find it relevant. (Cf. IGLESIAS, IGNACIO. "Los tres binarios de hombres: texto y forma de exposición y reflexión bíblico-teológicas." *Manresa* 226, 1986, pp. 57-58)

a tener la cosa adquirita o no la tener, sino *quiere* solamente *quererla* o no *quererla*, según que Dios nuestro Señor le pondrá en voluntad, y a tal persona le parecerá mejor para servicio y alabanza de su divina majestad. Y, entre tanto, *quiere* hacer cuenta que todo lo deja en afecto, poniendo fuerza de no *querer* aquello ni otra cosa ninguna, si no le moviere sólo el servicio de Dios nuestro Señor; de manera que el deseo de mejor poder servir a Dios nuestro Señor le mueva a tomar la cosa o dejarla. [155]

The central point of this meditation is a strong desire to transform the 'affect'¹⁷² by getting rid of that which manipulates a person and takes away his freedom to do the will of God.¹⁷³ This transformation does not take place primarily through will-power or force, but by the grace of God.

...No es voluntarismo. Ha pedido la gracia y podrá pedirla con más insistencia en los coloquios. ...No hemos de olvidar que las fuerzas para dejarse guiar exclusivamente por lo que el servicio de Dios nuestro Señor exige, son dadas por el mismo Señor... Sólo le mueve en su elección el deseo de mejor poder servir a Dios. Se rige en su vida por el fin que tiene muy claro: servir a Dios. Lo demás es relativo...¹⁷⁴

The desire in different persons varies and this can be seen by analyzing the verb 'querer' as it appears in the meditation. While referring to the first person it is seen that the person 'wanted to' get rid of the thing (*querría*), but puts it off until the time of his death. Such a person is aware of the attachment, but has no motivation. The second person desires to get rid of the attachment (*quiere quitar el afecto*), but wants to manipulate God to do it according to his desires. He does not allow God to work in him and lead him, but wants to indicate how God should behave. The third person is one who has reached a level of freedom and indifference and in all humility is willing to do anything in order to get rid of it, (*quiere solamente quererla o no quererla, según que ...tal persona le parecerá mejor para servicio y alabanza de su divina majestad*) so long as it is for the greater glory of God.

¹⁷² (Cf. IGLESIAS, IGNACIO. "Los tres binarios....", p. 58.) '*El punto, pues, central de esta meditación es la AFECCIÓN, ... más correctamente el impedimento de la afectación, es decir, el impedimento que hay en que la afectación no sea ordenada.*'

¹⁷³ In the note [157], the phrase '*extinguir el tal afecto desordenado*' is used. Ignatius does not indicate that the object of attachment ought to be eliminated. Rather the attachment to the object ought to be transformed so that the person is no longer attached to a created reality, but totally and freely attached to Christ the Lord. Thus the crucial factor is not to eliminate the affective desire within the person, but to transform it.

¹⁷⁴ ALBURQUERQUE, ANTONIO. "Binario", *DEI*, p. 235.

6.4.3.3 Humility and Transformation

Given the fact that a person is in the illuminative phase of the *SpEx* it is more likely that a person would find himself in the second stage of spiritual life and be moving towards the third stage. The purgative experience of the first week as well as the repetitions of the meditation on the Two Standards have helped a person to become aware of one's primary attachments which impede one in following the Lord. The continuous reflection on one's own life in the light of Christ, has helped the exercitant become aware of the areas of inordinate attachments.

El artificio de la parábola, con la simple disposición de sus materiales, pretende descubrir las larvadas motivaciones que pueden estar enquistadas en un determinado modo de actuar, envuelto en los mejores deseos. Para este descubrimiento no se necesita tiempo. No fue muy larga la historia que Natán le contó a David sobre el hombre rico y la oveja del pobre. Pero fue suficiente para que David abriese los ojos.¹⁷⁵

However the process of purifying one's disordered affections is not as simple as it seems to be and there is need of a high degree of humility in order to allow the process to reach its proper end. This is due to the fact that in the second class of person, the person is in greater danger of living a life of self-deception, dissatisfaction and mediocrity. The person is looking for rationalizations in order to remain with the attachment, overlooking the end which consists in desiring only the glory of God.¹⁷⁶ The key towards a real transformation in a person is to deal with the affective dimension so that a person takes concrete steps in responding generously to the call of the Eternal King.¹⁷⁷

Ignatius was a keen observer of human behavior and wanted to know what actually moved or motivated a person.¹⁷⁸ He realized that the will is moved when the internal knowledge touches the affective dimension of the person. So as long as the

¹⁷⁵ Cf. IBID.,..., p. 237.

¹⁷⁶ Cf. IBID., p. 233.

¹⁷⁷ An experience of Christ aids in the transformation of one's affect. We have seen this from the beginning of the colloquy of the first meditation [53]. What takes forward the transformative process within the exercitant is an experience of Christ and hence this meditation, is part of a process of growing adherence to Christ.

¹⁷⁸ IGLESIAS, IGNACIO. "Los tres...", p. 60. '*Para Ignacio, sagaz observador en sí mismo de las fuerzas que "mueven" un alma, es esencial y decisivo saber quién o qué nos mueve, porqué o por quién nos movemos.*'

affect was not influenced, the internal knowledge would remain at the level of pious intentions, but would not be translated in concrete decisions. In order that the affective dimension is touched, the person with great humility makes the petition to move from 'insights' regarding the Two Standards towards being indifferent and free so as to 'choose' with God's grace, that which will give 'more glory to the Divine Majesty and (aid) the salvation of my soul.'¹⁷⁹

A proper understanding of indifference would lead to an attitude whereby the person would be free to do away with the object of attachment. He would be disposed to do the will of God because what motivates him is no longer the object in itself, but the love of Christ. The freedom which results from a new affective relationship with Christ provides such strength to the will, that the person is willing to let go other 'apparent securities' and confidently surrender oneself in the hands of God.

The meditation is a humble reminder that indifference and freedom does not come easily. The exercitant is reminded of this fact in a note [157] which speaks about possible 'repugnance against' actual poverty.¹⁸⁰ The exercitant is invited to 'beg for it and plead for it' [157, 3] in all humility so that one is chosen by Christ to live a life of actual poverty.¹⁸¹ It is possible that at this state a person may not yet have the necessary indifference to enter into a sincere election. Hence the exercitant is invited to 'to beg the Lord in the colloquies to choose oneself to serve him in actual poverty (even though it is contrary to our lower nature).'[157, 2]

This meditation helps us realize that Ignatius desires the exercitant to be more and more rooted in Christ. (*Col.* 2,7) From his own experience he knew how a disordered affection would ultimately gravitate towards created reality leaving aside the Creator. This is why he would invite the exercitant to continue with the process of self-emptying

¹⁷⁹ *IBID.*, p. 63. '*Lo que no es voluntarismo sino humilde petición de una gracia que debe serme dada de arriba.*'

¹⁸⁰ In the meditation on the Two Standards, spiritual poverty is praised. However in this meditation as well as the Three Degrees of humility, the exercitant is invited to ardently desire actual poverty.

¹⁸¹ During the Deliberations of 1539 we see that at a given moment, the early companions were unable to decide on the theme of obedience to one of their own and hence they made a deliberate decision to obey one of their own. A reference to this point is made further on in the chapter.

whereby one's disordered affections are emptied and transformed so as to engender greater adherence to Christ.¹⁸² This ongoing process becomes more rigorous through the subsequent contemplations of the public life of Jesus and the consideration of the Three Degrees of Humility. These contemplations and considerations prepare the exercitant to make a sincere election.

6.4.4 THE THREE WAYS¹⁸³ OF BEING HUMBLE

A fundamental consideration within the *SpEx* is 'The Three Ways of Being Humble'. This consideration can be given to the exercitant along with the meditations on the Two Standards and the Three Classes, or on the following day if it seems preferable, after the meditation on Christ's departure from Nazareth and his Baptism. As indicated in the book of the Exercises, he should ponder them throughout the day. However, he should at the same time meditate on one or two mysteries of Christ's life on that day just as on the others.¹⁸⁴

6.4.4.1 Preliminary Notes

The goal of this consideration is to help the exercitant finally have the disposition indicated in the third manner of being humble. For this end one is invited to ponder the Three Manners of Being Humble, "through the day outside meditation, even at specific moments during the meditation, using the triple colloquy from the Two Standards".¹⁸⁵ Along with the focus on this consideration, the exercitant is invited to continue contemplating the mysteries of the public life of Christ. Before moving on to an explanation of the Three Manners of Being Humble, let us briefly place some observations regarding the contemplations proposed by Ignatius at this stage.

The image of Christ that is presented in the scenes of the public life of Christ is

¹⁸² Cf. IGLESIAS, IGNACIO. "Los tres binarios...", p. 60.

¹⁸³ The title of this consideration is presented as '*maneras*' and it could be translated into kinds, modes, manner, degrees or species of being humble. An insightful interpretation comes to us from Pedro Ortiz who in his notes refers to this topic as 'Three kinds and degrees of love of God and desire to obey and imitate and serve His Divine Majesty.' (Cf. GANSS, GEORGE. *The Spiritual...*, pp. 173-74.)

¹⁸⁴ (Ed.) PALMER, MARTIN. *On Giving the Spiritual...*, p. 335.

¹⁸⁵ IBID.

that of 'Christ the Pantocrator' – full of power and majesty. Ignatius presents us with two sections¹⁸⁶ of contemplations from the 5th day to the 12th day on the public life of Jesus.¹⁸⁷ This image may seem to contrast with that of the infancy narratives where we have two fundamental representations of Christ with the first one as being majestic and fulfilling His mission and the second one as being poor and humble.¹⁸⁸ Despite the fact that the image of the Pantocrator seems to contrast with the petition to know, love and follow Christ poor and humble, both these dimension are present in the Christology that is presented by Ignatius.¹⁸⁹

The power and majesty of Christ our Lord is always in symphony with the kenosis of Christ which is manifest in poverty, insults and humiliations. The contemplation of the life of Christ during the second week oscillates between the supreme glory of the *Kyrios* and the self-emptying love of the *Kenosis*.

...existe una perfecta coincidencia entre la cristología que subyace a estos misterios de 2^a Semana y la que aparece en el Llamamiento del Rey Temporal. Esta oscilaba entre dos polos contrapuestos: la suprema *Gloria del Kyrios*, revetido del poder divino [95³], que llamaba, y la *kénosis* de los "trabajos" (la pobreza, los oprobios y humillaciones) en que ésta naturaleza divina se encarnaba bajo los velos de la condición humana [98].¹⁹⁰

The presentation of the contemplations is centered on the person of Christ and the narratives assist the exercitant in better knowing, loving and following Christ.¹⁹¹ The person is invited to enter into a deeper relationship with Christ by focusing on one contemplation during the day [159] without losing sight of one's attachment by faithfully

¹⁸⁶ *SpEx* 158,161,273-285.

¹⁸⁷ It consists in a total of 16 scenes and 27 texts. Five of them are related to miracles, while the others are related to the vocations of the disciples, sending them on a mission, giving instructions and so on. It is important to note that the various scenes have not been selected randomly, but follow a specific criterion. They coincide with the image of Jesus that Ignatius wants the exercitant to contemplate so as to aid the process of making an election. (Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios Espirituales...*, p. 643.)

¹⁸⁸ Cf. KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. *Decir... al "Indecible"...*, p. 88.

¹⁸⁹ "Detrás de este panorama de grandeza humano-divina queda dibujada 'la majestad crucificada de Dios', en palabras de H. Rahner, con la que el individuo se siente interpelado a comprometer su vida." (ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, p. 646.)

¹⁹⁰ *IBID.*, p. 647.

¹⁹¹ Christ is the central figure in all the contemplations and other characters have secondary relevance. Christ is an active agent who is obedient to the will of the Father and through his words and deeds reveals the glory of God. In secondary characters are presented as befitting their human condition and are used to further reinforce the image of the glorified Christ. (Cf. *IBID.* pp. 644-45.)

doing the particular examination of conscience twice a day. [160] An enlightened understanding through the Two Standards, growing affective freedom and indifference through the Three Kinds of Persons and contemplations of the life of Christ will create a disposition which is consonant with the third degree of humility – a disposition which is necessary to make a sincere election.

Humility is the objective for one who does the *SpEx* and is the central virtue for one who desires to follow Christ.¹⁹² Love is the motivating force of such humility and the exercitant is invited to progress in a way of life where this experience of love manifests itself in humility. The consideration of the three degrees of humility is critical to the dynamic of the *SpEx* because it is a summary of all that has been proposed so far and is a preparation for the third and fourth weeks.

Todo el camino recorrido ha sido preparación para elegir: "ordenar la vida sin determinarse por afección alguna que desordenada sea"; "quitar de sí todas las afecciones desordenadas y después de quitarlas buscar y hallar la voluntad divina", Pero ahora se hace resumen de lo experimentado y se proyecta para avanzar e hace resumen de lo experimentado y se proyecta para avanzar.¹⁹³

Precisely before the person proceeds to make the election, Ignatius places this consideration on humility. He thus reveals to the exercitant the indispensable nature of this attitude in order to engage in a fundamental activity of the *SpEx* – i.e. the election.

In this section we shall deal with this consideration from four different perspectives. We shall begin by a few introductory remarks and these will be followed by explaining the understanding of humility as represented in the text. Further on we shall indicate the role of humility in transforming the exercitant to be better disposed towards making the election. We shall end this section with some concluding remarks.

6.4.4.2 Introduction

This consideration is strategically placed at a crucial juncture in order to reinforce the importance of the kind and degree of humility in order to make the election. Along with

¹⁹² Cf. FULLHAM, LISA. "Humildad", *DEI*, p. 957.

¹⁹³ ROYÓN, ELÍAS. "Las tres maneras de humildad en la dinámica del seguimiento de Jesús", *Manresa -226*, 1986, p. 71.

the Two Standards and the Three Kinds of Persons, this consideration forms a composite unit and though it is placed on the 12th day, it forms part of the exercitant's consideration from the 5th day.¹⁹⁴ Though there are differences in this way this consideration is titled, it primarily refers to three ways of loving God.¹⁹⁵

Humility is in fact nothing other than the love of God, but to call this love 'humility' is to pinpoint especially the quality of other-directedness in love, love as a handing oneself over in trust, letting God be Lord of one's being.¹⁹⁶

The centrality of loving humility has been elaborated in the preceding chapter where we analyzed the Spiritual Diary and in the next chapter related to the Deliberations of the First Companions we once again see this dimension being affirmed. However at this stage we limit ourselves to the *SpEx* where the exercitant is invited to go through a process whereby he has moved from a *state of desires* as seen in the Principle and foundation towards an state of *being actually disposed* to doing the will of God – a state which is in consonance with the third degree of humility.¹⁹⁷

The condition of the possibility of such an actual disposition depends on a personal relationship with Christ. Any personal relationship is always humble, because bereft of the dimension of humility a relation stops being authentic and personal. This is affirmed by the example of Jesus who became humble in order to lovingly relate with humanity.¹⁹⁸ All the three degrees of humility manifest a certain level of personal love,

¹⁹⁴ The Directory of Polanco suggests that the exercitant could devote two or three full hours to thinking about this consideration on the 5th day. Besides this, the exercitant could spend other moments too during the following days until the election considering the Three Manners of Humility. (Cf. (Ed.) PALMER, MARTIN E., *On Giving...*, p. 136.)

¹⁹⁵ RAHNER, KARL. *Meditaciones sobre...*, p. 188. '*San Ignacio se refiere propiamente a tres grados de amor de Dios, pero él no emplea la palabra "amor" sino con gran reserva y, en general, habla más bien de humildad, de generoso servicio de Dios.*'

¹⁹⁶ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 123.

¹⁹⁷ Cf. ROYÓN, ELÍAS. "Las tres maneras de...", p. 75. The fourth day articulates the desire within the exercitant. In the three degrees of humility we see a moment of greater identification with what was desired. '*...se sintetiza aquí el deseo de identificación con Cristo, que prepara para 'buscar la voluntad divina en la disposición de su vida'. Resumiendo, pues, las contemplaciones de la vida de Jesús, la petición constante de 'más amarle y seguirle', la oración confiada a la Señora para ser recibido debajo de la bandera de su Hijo y Señor, han preparado este momento de plenitud en el proceso de identificación.*'

¹⁹⁸ Cf. CORELLA, JESÚS. "Dos banderas y maneras de...", p. 162. '*En realidad toda relación personal tiene que ser humilde, porque si no lo es, dejará pronto de ser relación personal). Y a su vez, esta relación humilde con los demás genera de por sí actitudes de pobreza. Jesús se hizo pobre para poder entrar en relación fraterna con nosotros; se hizo muy pobre, para poder entrar en relación con los más pobres.*'

but there is a qualitative difference in each of them where the “three kinds of humility can be characterized as ‘love of creature’, ‘love of the servant’ and ‘love of the friend’.”¹⁹⁹

The pedagogy of the *SpEx* does not consist in enforcing change from outside. Rather it tries to transform a person from within so that the growing personal love for Christ radically transforms the exercitant to such an extent that there is an affective identification with Christ.

Ignacio desea que el ejercitante centre su seguimiento a Jesús en la afectividad; en ese estar en continuo proceso de identificación con la persona de Jesús, hasta poder llegar a vivenciar su estilo de vida como provocador de felicidad y a exclamar con Pablo “vivo yo, ya no yo, es Cristo quien vive en mí.” (*Gal. 2,20*)²⁰⁰

The key to making a good election where one commits oneself totally to Christ by desiring poverty, insults and humiliations is ONLY possible when one has experienced the love of Christ, is affectively moved by His poverty and humility and personally experiences the call to collaborate with Him.²⁰¹ The various meditations and contemplations of the *SpEx* have been preparing the person to be affectively disposed for the election and the Three Manners of being Humble is the end of the preparatory process.²⁰² The personal love for Christ results in such an affective transformation that the person ‘begs to be chosen’ (*SpEx* – 168) to live a life of ‘poverty *with* Christ...; contempt *with* Christ; (and) ...further, desire to be regarded as a useless fool for Christ...’ (*SpEx* – 167)²⁰³

6.4.4.2 Structure of the Text

Using the comparative style, Ignatius presents three ways of being humble – one which

¹⁹⁹ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, pp. 123-24.

²⁰⁰ ROYÓN, ELÍAS. “Las tres maneras...”, p. 70.

²⁰¹ IBID., p. 71. Royón repeatedly insists that what allows a person to make a sincere election is when one allows oneself to be affectively influenced by Jesus. However it is not enough to have an attraction towards the standard of Christ, but there is a dialectical movement in terms of desiring and rejecting. This dialectical is presented here in very clear terms and one can identify with Christ only if there has been an affective identification.

²⁰² Cf. FULLAM, LISA. “Humildad”, p. 957.

²⁰³ The focus is on the preposition ‘*with*’ in the third degree of humility which is the ideal disposition of the exercitant. The emphasis is not on suffering or a superficial imitation of Christ, but on being poor *with* Christ and scorned *with* Christ. (Cf. ENGLISH, JOHN. *Spiritual Freedom*, p. 171.)

is 'necessary', a second which is 'more perfect' and the third way which 'is the most perfect'. The three ways are presented in a table below:

	Degree	Disposition	Goal
First Way	'...is necessary for eternal salvation...'	'...lower and humble myself as far as is in my power...'	'...never reach a decision... which binds me under mortal sin.'
Second Way	'...is more perfect than the first...'	'...not desire or feel myself strongly attached...'	'...never reach a decision to commit a venial sin.'
Third Way	'...is the most perfect.'	'...desire and choose poverty... (and) contempt with Christ...; regarded as a useless fool for Christ...'	'...in order to imitate Christ our Lord better and be more like Him here and now...'

The exercitant necessarily ought to have a disposition according to the first kind of humility for eternal salvation. Ignatius uses the technique of explaining this disposition by using a positive as well as a negative clause.²⁰⁴ It demands an enlightened submission to the will of God wherein one is aware of the relativity of all created reality.²⁰⁵ Despite an emphasis on the Law, the fundamental attitude is one of love and obedience and involves consequences whereby one would even be willing to give up one's life instead of violating a commandment. [165] The Autographed Directory of St. Ignatius makes it clear that if the exercitant's disposition is limited to the first kind of humility, he/she is not fit to make the election.²⁰⁶

The disposition required for the second form of humility is more perfect than the first and Ignatius uses the linguistic technique of a positive as well as a negative clause as seen in the previous paragraph.²⁰⁷ This point once again highlights the necessity of an attitude of indifference within the exercitant – an attitude which was highlighted in the

²⁰⁴ The positive clause is seen when one affirms fidelity to the law and the negative clause is when promises not to commit any mortal sin. (Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 124.)

²⁰⁵ The first as well as the second ways indicate the relative value of all created reality – including the relativity of one's own life. This awareness helps a person to be faithful to the will of God. (Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, p. 434.)

²⁰⁶ Cf. (Ed.) PALMER, MARTIN. *On Giving...*, p. 9.

²⁰⁷ In this stage, the positive clause consists in having an attitude of indifference, while the negative clause consists in not committing any venial sin. (Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 124.)

Principle and Foundation as well as the meditation of the Three Classes of persons.

La segunda manera resume la actitud ignaciana de la indiferencia, ya expuesta también en el Principio y Fundamento. Incluso la conexión textual es total. En la entrada de las elecciones deberá encontrarme 'en tal punto que no quiero ni me afecto más a tener riqueza que pobreza, a querer honor que deshonor, a desear vida larga que corta.' [166]. En el Principio y Fundamento se delineaba esta actitud como proyecto, que era necesario alcanzar, ahora deberá ser ya realidad, si se pretende continuar hacia adelante en materias de elecciones.²⁰⁸

The indifference at this stage is motivated by a personal transforming love of the exercitant towards the Lord and not merely a dispassionate emotional sensation. The freedom that emerges from this form of indifference is transformative in nature and is the minimum requirement in order to make the election.²⁰⁹

The third kind of humility is the most perfect form of humility which embraces the former two kinds of humilities as well. The words 'I desire and choose' is what distinguishes this kind of humility from the earlier forms. Here a person does not remain indifferent, but makes a choice which is motivated by an intense desire for an identification with Christ who is poor and humble. It goes beyond the point of overcoming one's disordered affections and moves a person to make a choice – a choice which is animated by the *magis*.²¹⁰

Throughout the *SpEx*, there have been various indications of humility being the manifestation of love. At this juncture the expression is so clear and sublime that the words humility and love can be interchanged seamlessly. Humility, as presented in this third degree is a new category which is the result of a person who is moved by love that

²⁰⁸ ROYÓN, ELÍAS. "Las tres maneras...", p. 73.

²⁰⁹ The Autographed Directory of Ignatius indicates that if the person has not reached the second degree of humility he is not ready for the election. (Cf. (Ed.) PALMER, MARTIN. *On Giving...*, p. 9.)

²¹⁰ Cf. ROYÓN, ELÍAS. "Las tres maneras...", p. 74. The *magis* which animates a person consists in a personal love for Christ as well as an experience of the salvific dimension of humility. Humility thus rooted in Christ is the source of fullness, allows one to overcome the repugnance of insults and is the key to profound freedom. '*...en estas contemplaciones, jalonadas siempre por –el m'as amarle y seguirle–, el ejercitante experimenta el atractivo – consolación – por la persona de Jesús pobre y humilde y comienza a vivenciar la pobreza y la humildad como valores que pueden dar sentido y felicidad a su vida. Jesús empieza a considerarse como valor absoluto que despierta ilusión, 'las otras cosas sobre la haz de la tierra' adquieren un valor relativo y son amadas desde Jesús.*'

has been gratuitously received so as to give up one's indifference.²¹¹ Such a person has an ardent desire to imitate Christ in the most intimate manner and therefore longs for poverty, insults and humiliations. A passionate love for Christ is the only motive that leads one to desire identification with Christ on the cross. This disposition of total love and surrender leads the exercitant, to 'beg to be chosen' [168] for this third degree of humility.

En la tercera manera de humildad se vive aquel amor a la cruz del Señor que ya no busca motivos objetivos. Presupone que quien sigue siempre al Señor y Maestro amado, el crucificado, escándalo y locura para el mundo, esta tal se halla en el buen camino. En el fondo, no quiere seguir otra ruta que la incondicional imitación de Cristo, siempre con aquella discreción que, en concreto, tiene constantemente presente la mayor gloria de Dios...²¹²

6.4.4.3 The disposition of humility and election

The three degrees of humility present to the exercitant in a nutshell the spiritual journey that any human person undergoes – from being in the image of God towards the likeness/configuration in God.²¹³ A person who lives a life in the Spirit cannot but be affected by the person of Christ and experiences a transformation of one's desire.²¹⁴ The transformed desire generates in the exercitant an intense longing to desire, choose and elect that which will glorify God. The election thus becomes a moment when one deliberately empties oneself of one's own self-seeking desires in order to 'desire and choose' in a concrete manner that which leads to a greater imitation of Christ.

The right disposition helps the exercitant make a sincere election and by doing so,

²¹¹ Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 125.

²¹² Cf. RAHNER, KARL. *Meditaciones sobre...*, p. 191.

²¹³ The author of this quote goes on to show the spiritual process that emerges due to an internal dynamism and leads to a free election based on love leads to three important moments in one's spiritual journey. The three moments which help the exercitant to be re-integrated into the salvific plan of God also leads to new form of inter-relationship with one another. (Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, pp. 439-40.) 'S. Ignacio describe así, en las tres maneras de Humildad, todo el camino espiritual que lees dado recorrer a la libertad desde la imagen que plasmó Dios en el momento de la creación [23] hasta la obediencia amorosa del Hijo [167] por la que el hombre recibe en sí la semejanza de la vida filial en el Espíritu.'

²¹⁴ The transformation of desire is not merely a one-time affair, but an ongoing process. We see this in the life of Ignatius where he grew in humility and love all through his life. However there is a moment when a paradigm shift takes place in one's life so as to radically alter one's existence. This would lead to a specific election by the exercitant, and will also influence the consequent choices that one makes all through the journey of life.

participates in the self-emptying love of God. The understanding of the standard of the world can no longer manipulate the exercitant and the love for the crucified Christ overrides all other arguments that for the person 'to live is Christ and to die is gain.' (*Phil. 1,21*) The self-love that had characterized one's mode of existence has been deliberately and definitively transformed by God's grace. What motivates a person is a passionate love for the Crucified with an ardent desires to empty himself for the sake of Christ, and in such manner participate in the descent of God.

El tercer grado de humildad contiene ciertamente un audaz amor al Señor crucificado, que ya no busca motivos objetivos; y precisamente por esto, tan enteramente se confía a las disposiciones indeducibles del amor divino, que se distancia todavía más de sí mismo. El amante de Cristo crucificado sale enteramente de sí, se deja del todo; no retorna sobre sí, no piensa en sí; queda firme bajo la cruz. ...El hombre de la tercera manera de humildad prescinde por completo de sí y se pone, como imitador de Cristo, a disposición incondicionada de Dios.²¹⁵

The third degree of humility consists in the total self-emptying love of the exercitant who 'begs', 'desires and chooses' poverty, insults and humiliations with Christ who was poor, insulted and humiliated. A deep transformation has taken place in the individual who desiring to imitating Christ's filial relationship with the Father, abandons oneself like Christ in in the hands of the God and only desires to choose that which will give glory to God. Through this act of total self-emptying love for the sake of Christ, one shares in and enters into the kenosis of Christ.²¹⁶ This is an appropriate disposition that Ignatius expects of the exercitant as one embarks on final phase of making an election.

6.4.5 THE ELECTION

We now come to the moment of the election. The election as proposed by Ignatius is a unique contribution to the history of spirituality and is a key moment in the encounter between God and the human person.

El punto central de los Ejercicios es la elección. El encuentro fundamental con Dios es encuentro con un Dios que elige... (Es un Dios) que, con una incomprensible libertad en

²¹⁵ Cf. RAHNER, KARL. *Meditaciones sobre...*, pp. 191-192.

²¹⁶ Cf. ENGLISH, JOHN. *Spiritual Freedom...*, p. 174.

su elección, desciende hacia el elegido para requerir de él, por encima y a través de toda “inquietud” y cualquier “afán”, el servicio a sus fines imprevisibles.²¹⁷

There is no fixed day when the election can be made, though the process begins on the 5th day of the second week.²¹⁸ Just as there is no definite date as to when a person ought to begin an election, there is no specific date when the election ought to be completed.²¹⁹

With these preliminary remarks let us now try to understand the election as proposed by Ignatius in the *SpEx* and the centrality of humility in taking this process forward. We shall begin with some introductory remarks which will be followed by the actual process of election as proposed by Ignatius. We shall then look at the role of humility in this process and end with some concluding remarks indicating its relevance for the present as well as its significance for the future.

6.4.5.1 Disposition and subject matter

The disposition required for this delicate process has been indicated in the preceding sections. Along with the disposition of humility, indifference and freedom, one is also expected to have grown in one's capacity for discernment.²²⁰ The spiritual maturity that is expected of the individual in order to make the election consists in an internal attitude of humility which will allow the exercitant to better co-operate with divine grace so as to be more faithful to the will of God.²²¹ At the onset we also need to clarify that election has little to do with extraordinary phenomena such as revelations, visions, etc.²²² Rather

²¹⁷ VON BALTHASAR, HANS URS. *Hans Urs von Balthasar - Textos de Ejercicios Espirituales*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2009, p. 207.

²¹⁸ Cf. SAMPAIO COSTA, ALFREDO. “Elección”, *DEI*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2007, p. 726.

²¹⁹ DOMÍNGUEZ MORANO, CARLOS. *Psicodinámica de los Ejercicios Ignacianos*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2003, p. 222. ‘No asigna Ignacio un día determinado para la elección tal como suele hacerlo en el resto de los temas que propone. Y es que una elección no puede llevarse a cabo en el día que quisiéramos asignar previamente en una agenda. Ni tampoco se podrá dar por concluida la elección en un plazo previamente determinado. De alguna manera, ninguna elección se puede llevar a cabo de modo total ni, como veremos, queda nunca garantizado plenamente lo que se haya hecho posible elegir.’

²²⁰ Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 128.

²²¹ Cf. KING, NICHOLAS. “Ignatius of Loyola and Decision Making”, *The Way Supplement - 24*, 1975, p. 49.

²²² Cf. CALVERAS, JOSÉ. “Buscar y hallar la voluntad divina por los tiempos de elección de los Ejercicios de San Ignacio”, *Manresa - 15*, 1943, p. 252.

it takes into account the normal means of Divine revelation and the inherent capabilities of the human person in order to explain the Divine-human discourse.

The subject matter for an election could also vary with the only pre-condition being that it ought to be indifferent or good in itself [170] and motivated by the *magis* where the person desires to better serve Christ our Lord.²²³ The concrete situation that comes within the ambit of an election can be divided into two areas – that which are permanent in nature (such as priesthood, marriage, religious life...) and those which are transitory (such as the use of temporal benefices, etc.) As a matter of fact we can have an election where no new decision is taken, but only affirms an earlier decision leading to the reformation of one's actual state of life. [189]²²⁴ Irrespective of whether the subject matters is limited or not to extraordinary moments in the life of a person, it provides a prototype to the exercitant in order to deal with situations that emerge in day to day life.

As Ignatius' own decisions show, the approach to election in the *SpEx* provides a paradigm for these decision's, so that by following the principles and methods of the *SpEx* a person may within the stream of daily life make a decision of the same quality as an election made in the special and normally unrepeatable situation of the *SpEx*.²²⁵

6.4.5.2 Humility during the three times to make an election

With these two brief observations about the disposition and subject matter let us now look at the election as revealed in the *SpEx*. The *SpEx* will speak of three 'times' to make an election where time does not refer to a chronological moment,²²⁶ but a moment which is 'characterized by a certain kind of evidence of God's will and by a mode of decision-

²²³ It does not necessarily have to be a totally new decision, but reinforcing a decision that has already been made. However the process of an election should lead to greater commitment and freedom whereby the original vocation surfaces leading to greater faithfulness and generosity. (Cf. ENGLISH, JOHN. *Spiritual...*, pp. 200-201.)

²²⁴ The process of elections is never totally terminated, but is an ongoing dynamic. A person is forced to constantly make choices which either help a person to tend towards one's original decision or away from it. (Cf. DOMÍNGUEZ MORANO, CARLOS. *Psicodinámica...*, pp. 224-25.)

²²⁵ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 131.

²²⁶ Cf. COSTA, ALFREDO SAMPAIO. "Elección", *DEI...*, p. 727.

making on our part corresponding to this evidence.'²²⁷ There are two ways by which the will of God is revealed to us – direct and indirect means where the first and second times refer to direct means and the third refers to indirect means.²²⁸

6.4.5.2.1 *First Time*

The first time of election is when there is a direct experience where the election presents itself to the individual, rather than the individual making an election. [175] The Consolation without Preceding Cause [330] has often been identified with this experience and is a privileged moment when the person knows and feels the will of God in a manner that cannot be doubted.²²⁹ There is a great degree of passivity in this manner of making an election where the entire initiative being with God. The person on his part realizes his unworthiness and in all humility accepts this experience with an abiding sentiment of gratitude.

This experience which is not as rare as is often understood to be²³⁰ stands out for the conviction that it generates within the recipient. The primary experience of an individual could be followed by a secondary experience²³¹ and Ignatius would therefore advise caution suggesting that the exercitant ought to consult the director.²³² The certainty of the experience is highlighted by Ignatius when he repeats the same idea twice through the phrase, 'without doubting or being able to doubt' [175]. It is an intense experience and unifies the entire person in a manner which is life changing and

²²⁷ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 135.

²²⁸ Cf. CALVERAS, JOSÉ. "Busacr y hallar...", p. 256.

²²⁹ Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, pp. 457-59. '*En tal experiencia privilegiada, no tan excepcional como a primera vista pudiera parecer, Dios da a sentir y conocer al hombre su voluntad de modo genérico y global, con frecuencia en radical discontinuidad con lo sentido o vivido por el individuo con anterioridad. Este tiempo privilegiado del Espíritu es el de la pura libertad, y por eso mismo el momento privilegiado para elegir.*'

²³⁰ The two examples that Ignatius gives us an indication of the kind of experience that he wishes to speak about. It may not be a phenomenon that is part of one's daily life, but to be cynical and skeptical of the occurrence of such an experience would also be unrealistic. Abraham Maslow in his theory would also indicate that most individuals have at some point of their lives experienced a peak experience. (Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, p. 459. ; ENGLISH, JOHN. *Spiritual Freedom...*, p. 203.)

²³¹ It is also important to distinguish between the actual experience and the afterglow where the desires which emerge during afterglow may not necessarily be the will of God.

²³² Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 136.

leads to a deep sense of humility. Elaborating this experience, Ignatius would say:

...It often happens that our Lord moves and drives our soul to one action or another by opening the soul up, that is, by speaking inside it without the din of words, lifting the soul wholly to his divine love, so that even if we wished to resist his impression, we could not. This impression of his which we receive must be in conformity with the commandments, the precepts of the Church, and obedience to our superiors, and entirely filled with humility, for the same divine Spirit is present in all this.²³³

6.4.5.2.2 *Second Time*

The second time consists in an election where a person observes the internal movements of consolation and desolation. It involves a certain familiarity with the internal movements of spirits and a sincere search for the will of God through a contemplation of the mysteries of Christ, prayer, meditations and so on.²³⁴ This process is not as instantaneous as the first time, is a long drawn process which could be stressful and the person would need a director who is empathetic, experienced and understanding.²³⁵ However the director needs to keep in mind annotation [15], and maintain a respectful and objective distance from the exercitant.²³⁶

The confirmation of the election is not an easy process because of the oscillation of diverse experiences, both of which may converge at one and the same point. A case in point would be the vocation of Jerome Nadal who made the Spiritual Exercises under Fr. Domenech in November 1545. While having to make an election he experienced diametrically opposed experiences which converged on one and the same point.

Las dos experiencias de consolación o desolación y de discreción de varios espíritus pueden intervenir en un mismo caso, y contribuirán a hacer la elección más cierta y segura, si ambas coinciden en un mismo resultado. Ejemplo de vocación resuelta por ambas experiencias a la vez, y precisamente en su parte negativa de aversión e

²³³ *LI*, p. 22.

²³⁴ Cf. SAMPAIO COSTA, ALFREDO. "Elección"..., p. 728.

²³⁵ In explaining this time, we can see that the essence of the second time is discernment of spirits which does not consist in a dry application of rules, but a dynamic attentiveness to internal movements. (Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 137.)

²³⁶ The director ought to remain like a 'pointer of a scale in equilibrium' [15]. At this point of the Spiritual Exercises, there is a serious danger of the exercitant desiring to look for help and depend on the director for this critical phase. Thus the director ought to be careful of not being too distant and remote, and at the same time not being too interfering in the spiritual process of the exercitant. (Cf. DOMÍNGUEZ MORANO, CARLOS. *Psicodinámica...*, pp. 230-31.)

incitaciones del espíritu malo, es la vocación del P. Jerónimo Nadal en los Ejercicios que hizo en Roma bajo la dirección inmediata del P. Doménech por noviembre de 1545.²³⁷

As the exercitant goes through these process, he/she needs to remember that not all experiences of consolations are from the Spirit and not all experiences of aversions are a sign of the false spirit. The delicate and subtle nature of the internal experiences makes the attitude of humility absolutely essential. One needs to ask for the grace of God in order to help understand and decipher these experiences because of the subtle nature of these movements.²³⁸ The duration of this process cannot be determined with certainty and one needs to have a great deal of patience. The integration, union and harmony that emerges in a person through this form of election is not received from above/outside as seen in the first time. Rather it is the result of an active and personal awareness of the internal movements of diverse Spirits and a generous response to the same.²³⁹

6.4.5.2.3 *Third Time*²⁴⁰

The third time of election takes place when there is lack of clarity vis-à-vis the decision that one desires to make.²⁴¹ There is greater use of reason, because of the underlying assumption that it is possible to know the will of God through the proper use of reason.

The Third Time establishes a basic principle; our rational faculties, converted and graced, are capable by themselves of finding God's will, and that to do this is not absolutely necessary to experience movements of the Spirit. The Third Time has been described as

²³⁷ Calveras indicates from the very writings of Nadal as to how he had an experience when consolation attracted towards an election. Later on the experience of contrary internal movements were an affirmation of what he being attracted towards. (Cf. CALVERAS, JOSÉ. "Buscar y hallar...", p. 262.)

²³⁸ There is no doubt that the grace of God (*una singular gracia de Dios*) helped Nadal to see clearly the will of God. The same grace and light of God helped Ignatius to understand the spirits that gave rise to scruples about his past life and helped him

²³⁹ Cf. DOMÍNGUEZ MORANO, CARLOS. *Psicodinámica...*, p. 230.

²⁴⁰ In the directory of Polanco it is clear that making the election in the second time is superior to the third time. However if there is some doubt about the spirit that moves the exercitant in making the election, then even after the election has been concluded in the second time, it can be tested by the two modes of the third time. (Cf. (Ed.) PALMER, MARTIN, *On Giving...*, pp. 139-140.)

²⁴¹ This does not mean that there are no internal movements. What is suggested is that the internal movements are not strong enough or are insufficient to help a person engage in a process of discernment. (Cf. SAMPAIO COSTA, ALFREDO. "Elección"..., p. 729.)

the time of 'ordinary grace.'"²⁴²

The lack of emotions does not mean that it is a cold calculated process but rather it is a harmonious use of reason along with other human faculties in order to know the will of God.²⁴³ The dispositions that have been indicated earlier such as indifference, freedom and the attitude of humility continue to be relevant here. However Ignatius in explaining this time would use the word 'tranquility'. He explains it further by saying that tranquility is 'when the soul is not moved one way or other by various spirits and uses its natural faculties in freedom and spirit.' [177]²⁴⁴ It must also be pointed out that the use of reason does not exclude the experience of consolations or desolations.

Es mucho de advertir que no se excluye en este tercer tiempo las consolaciones... El ejercicio libre y tranquilo del entendimiento, para ponderar las razones en pro y en contra, es incompatible con la intromisión de pensamientos venidos de fuera; que a esto se reducen los espíritus varios; pero no encuentra estorbo, antes ayuda, en la consolación, cuando en medio de la paz y alegría de espíritu que esta induce, las luces sobrenaturales ayudan a descubrir el verdadero valor de las razones del mayor servicio divino...²⁴⁵

The two modes of making an election within the third time are as follows:

6.4.5.2.3.1 First Mode of the Third Time

Ignatius presents six points as far as the methodology is concerned. It relates to the object, disposition, petition, the advantages and disadvantages, reflecting on one's inclination and finally the presentation of the election to God. Within the six points, Ignatius clearly indicates the necessary motivation and disposition needed to make an election. In the second, third, fourth and sixth point Ignatius would repeatedly insist on the need to have the right motivation and be focused on the end that motivates one to

²⁴² Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding the...*, p. 138.

²⁴³ DOMÍNGUEZ MORANO, CARLOS. *Psicodinámica...*, p. 232. '*Pero, si bien este tiempo tranquilo es, como se ha dicho, un elegio de la razón natural, ello no implica que este modo de elegir sea resultado de un mero raciocinio frío y calculador.*'

²⁴⁴ The explanation of tranquility indicates two pre-conditions: indifference and an inclination towards that which is more perfect. In the absence of this predisposition, it would be advisable that the person does not go ahead with the election. (Cf. SAMPAIO COSTA, ALFREDO. "Elección...", p. 729.)

²⁴⁵ CALVERAS, JOSÉ. "Buscar y hallar...", p. 265.

make the election.²⁴⁶

Speaking of the necessary disposition, Ignatius would insist on the need of indifference [179²] without being inclined towards one thing or the other.²⁴⁷ One is also expected to have an attitude of humility and this is emphasized in the third point. The person realizes the process can only be taken forward only with the grace of God and therefore the exercitant ‘begs God our Lord’ to ‘move (the) will’ and enlighten ‘the mind’ (*SpEx* – 180). And finally the indifference indicated earlier should be translated into an internal freedom so that without being affected by disordered affections, the person can ‘consider and reason’ the advantages and disadvantages out of ‘having’ or ‘not having’ something. [181]

6.4.5.2.3.1 Second Mode of the Third Time

Unlike the first mode which made greater use of reason, this mode is more intuitive.²⁴⁸ It consists of three imaginative scenarios²⁴⁹ which are bracketed by the ‘First Rule’ and a final ‘Note’. The first rule summarizes the centrality of humility within the spiritual process as had been indicated in the preceding section. The exercitant is invited to recall that the only authentic experience which should be the motivating force of an election is the humble ‘love’ of God that ‘descends from above’. The unconditional descent of the absolute²⁵⁰ transforms the absolute desire to ascend and moves a person to make a choice ‘solely for the sake of our Creator and Lord’. [184] In the ‘third’ and ‘fourth’ rule the imaginative scenarios stress the centrality of humility when one is placed in a situation

²⁴⁶ The end is repeated by Ignatius on various occasions from the very beginning. The various instances are as follows: The second point [179] – ‘*keep as my objective the end for which I am created, to praise God our Lord and save my soul*’, ‘*praise of God our Lord and the salvation of my soul*.’; third point [180] ‘*more to his praise and glory*’; fourth point [181] ‘*solely for the praise of God our Lord*’; sixth point [183] ‘*if it is conducive to his greater service and praise*.’

²⁴⁷ Though he invites the exercitant to be indifferent and be like the ‘pointer of a balance’, the person is invited to be inclined towards that which is the end – i.e., that which will be ‘perceived to be more to the glory and praise of God our Lord and the salvation of (one’s) soul.’ [179³]

²⁴⁸ Cf. SAMPAIO COSTA, ALFREDO. “Elección...”, p. 729. ‘*El tercer tiempo de elección comprende dos modos diversos, uno más racional y otro más intuitivo*.’

²⁴⁹ The three scenarios include a) advice being given to a person for whom you desire all perfection [185]; b) being at the point of death; c) the scenario of judgment day.

²⁵⁰ This point has been explained in the section that deals with the theology of the Two Standards.

that highlights human limitedness. The human person is aware of the finite nature of one's existence and it is from this standpoint that one is invited to take a decision.²⁵¹ Once the decision is made, Ignatius invites the exercitant to follow point six of the first method [183] and 'make the election and offer it to God our Lord.' [188]

The last point in the election refers to 'amending and reforming one's own life and state.' [189] It is an indication that the *SpEx* can be adapted to people who may desire some form of spiritual renewal or an activity which is part of the structure of religious life.²⁵² It however need not become a routine procedure, but can be a time of grace aiding the person to grow in one's commitment to the Lord. Without being exclusive, this method is that of the third time and a proper understanding of the disposition, process and method 'equips the exercitant to deal with the ordinary decisions of life.'²⁵³

6.4.5.3 Concluding Remarks

So far we have had a brief overview of the election and let us now end by dealing with a few pertinent questions. We shall start by offering a short summary of how the centrality of humility before, during and after the election. This will be followed by indicating how the election is a privileged moment of encounter between God and the human person and it is through concrete actions which are consonant with the will of God that one grows in greater union with God (and others).

6.4.5.3.1 Humility in the election and Transformation

So far we have tried to show explain how the attitude of humility is of paramount importance before, during and after the election. Before the election there is a consistent growth in the exercitant vis-à-vis the virtue of humility.²⁵⁴ The actual process of election

²⁵¹ A similar methodology was used in the first week, and in both the cases the love of God was the source of transformation. However while in the first week we do observe an element of the fear of God, in this stage we observe that it is primarily the love for God and an intense love to be with Christ that motivates the exercitant to make a choice.

²⁵² Cf. GANSS, GEORGE. *The Spiritual...*, p. 179.

²⁵³ IBID.

²⁵⁴ The contemplations on the life of Christ are selected keeping this criteria in mind and the meditations and considerations, especially those immediately preceding the elections are in order to help the exercitant have the right

can only be taken forward if the exercitant has a consistent attitude of humility.²⁵⁵ The consequence of such an authentic election is the emergence of humble love and a generous spirit within the exercitant who longs to be with Christ poor and humble. The love which was focused on oneself and one's self-seeking desires is transformed and a person desires only the praise, service and glory of Christ our Lord.

Through the election, the exercitant has made a radical shift in one's mode of existence and moved beyond a critical threshold whereby there is a progressive emptying of one's self-love, self-will and self-interest. The person has grown in freedom and is able to make an enlightened choice which opens him/her towards the future. One does not wallow in the misery of the past nor have illusory imaginations of the future, but through concrete choices unites experiences union with God.²⁵⁶ It is true that freedom as understood here is qualified, because there are various external and internal factors which continue to affect us.²⁵⁷ Thus the certainty of a decision that it indicates is not an absolutely empirical certainty, but a justifiable certainty which is based on sufficient reason.²⁵⁸

6.4.5.3.2 Election as a moment of Divine-human encounter

Through the election, there is a convergence between God and the exercitant who is already in the unitive way of life. The election results in a circular process of transformation-election-transformation where the concrete choice affects one's relationship with God, with oneself and with other created reality. There is a concrete personalization and acceptance of the will of God, leading to greater union with God.

disposition towards entering into this delicate process.

²⁵⁵ We have consistently shown how in all the three times as well as the two modes of the third time, the attitude of humility is imperative. One is aware that this process can only be taken ahead with the grace of God and therefore the attitude of humility is needed in order to allow one to be enlightened and strengthened during this period. Furthermore humility is also necessary for the purpose of receiving a confirmation.

²⁵⁶ Cf. ROBERT, SYLVIE. "Union and Election," *The Way Supplement* - 103, 2002, p. 110.

²⁵⁷ With the emergence of the science of psychology we are now aware of the various sub-conscious motives that affect our decision making. Ignatius was not aware of this science, but was aware that there were many factors beyond our capacity. (Cf. DOMÍNGUEZ MORANO, CARLOS. *Psicodinamica...*, p. 219.)

²⁵⁸ "Ignacio acreditaba que era posible por medio de un discernimiento hallar la voluntad de Dios con una certeza justificable." (Cf. SAMPAIO COSTA, ALFREDO. "Elección", p. 733)

There is no longer any divergence between God's will and ours and in and through the gift of human freedom, there is a union of wills (where will is not understood in a restrictive manner)²⁵⁹ so that in and through the life of the exercitant God is praised, served and glorified.

During the Election ...the individual has accepted God's transforming gift within their own will; their freedom has been liberated; they can choose in true freedom, in other words in covenant relationship. It is precisely in their wills that they are united with God.²⁶⁰

This kind of union of wills is more than a restful looking at God face to face ...it is essentially active. This union with God, therefore ...includes the world that the Creator has entrusted to humanity. ...A person who has experienced this kind of union with God lives out of a transfigured consciousness.²⁶¹

6.4.6 THE GOLDEN RULE OF SPIRITUAL LIFE – SELF EMPTYING LOVE [189]

The Second Week of the Spiritual Exercises ends with Ignatius propounding a *Golden Rule* for life in the Spirit.

For everyone ought to reflect that in all spiritual matters, the more one divests oneself of self-love, self-will, and self-interests, the more progress one will make. [189]

This statement encapsulates the central idea of our thesis and at this stage we would like to highlight three points. In the first place the placement of this statement is highly significant because at this stage the exercitant is exactly midway through the Exercises. Secondly the transformative process is at a crucial stage wherein Ignatius expects the person to have been affectively influenced to be rightly disposed to make concrete choices for the praise, service and glory of God our Lord. Thirdly, the disposition indicated in this statement is the right preparation for the next phase of the Spiritual Exercises where the exercitant is invited to be *with* Christ in His passion and the resurrection. The election is a concrete participation in the laboring love of God within one's personal context. This participation leads to a more radical imitation of Christ resulting in an ongoing configuration in Christ.

²⁵⁹ Cf. ROBERT, SYLVIE. "Union and Election", pp. 106-109.

²⁶⁰ IBID., p.107.

²⁶¹ IBID., p.108.

6.5 THE THIRD WEEK

The exercitant begins the third week with a growing love and desire to enter into the mystery of Christ's self-emptying by further moving out of one's self-centered and narcissistic existence. With this disposition a person contemplates the Passion of the Lord – contemplations that manifest in the most sublime manner the reality of self-emptying love.

...desde una mirada prospectiva, el 'salir de sí' será la mejor disposición para adentrarse en la Pasión del Señor, en la que va a contemplar la expresión más sublime de lo que significa el salir de sí – de Jesús – para someterse plenamente a la voluntad de su Padre.²⁶²

The third week as well as the fourth week consists in the unitive way of spiritual growth where the person contemplates the life of Christ from within. The contemplations help the exercitant participate in the Passion of God in a very real sense through the humanity of Christ.²⁶³ The third and fourth weeks are 'closely related ... to the grace of confirmation of the election, confirmation being understood now as a verifying of the choice but as a strengthening of the chooser.'²⁶⁴ Even when the person does not look for a confirmation, the dynamics of these weeks help the exercitant enter into a greater identification with Christ.²⁶⁵

With the above introductory remarks let us now try to understand as to how humility (especially the humility of God) is the central theme of the contemplations of the third week. We shall begin with some observation of the text and certain characteristics of the contemplations. This will be followed by highlighting the Kenosis of Christ and the humility of God as seen in three considerations [195-197]. Finally we shall end with some concluding remarks which will also deal with the ongoing transformation of the exercitant.

²⁶² GARCÍA ESTÉBANEZ, ALBINO. "Tercera Semana", *DEI*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2007, p. 1701.

²⁶³ ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, p. 499. 'Nos hallamos, pues, de lleno en la 'via unitiva'. Hay un aumento de elementos unitivos: 'dolor con Cristo doloroso, quebranto con Cristo quebrantado [...] pena interna de tanta pena que Cristo pasó por mí [203]. Se acortan las distancias respecto de la humanidad de Jesús. Se contempla el misterio, pero no ya desde fuera, sino desde dentro, en comunión con los sentimientos de Jesús.'

²⁶⁴ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding the...*, p. 146.

²⁶⁵ Cf. SHELDRAKE, PHILIP. *The Way of Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 103.

6.5.1 HUMILITY AS SEEN IN THE TEXT OF THE THIRD WEEK

During the third week the focus is on the Passion of the Lord and Ignatius primarily makes use of select Johannine and Lucan texts. The distinctive nature of the selection and presentation could lead one to call it the 'Passion according to St. Ignatius.'²⁶⁶ The petition during this week is a return to the petition of the first week [48, 55], but with a difference whereby where the focus is no longer on sin, but on Christ who suffers for our sins [193, 203].

The present petition, however, even while returning to that of the First Week, at the same time subtly develops it, in that attention now centers more upon Christ for himself, and the sentiments are more those of friendship. The cause of confusion, regret, and grief is not so much that my sins have merited my death, as that they are the cause of Christ's death.²⁶⁷

The petition of the exercitant who contemplates the Passion consists in asking for a more internalized and participatory form of relationship. This in turn leads to a greater commitment towards the person of Christ resulting in a deeper form of unitive prayer.²⁶⁸ The Passion reveals the eternal salvific plan of God within human history and it is precisely the Cross which helps us understand the course of human history (and vice versa).²⁶⁹ The absence of indicators which are related to time indicate that the exercitant is invited to participate in the Paschal mystery of Christ which is both historical and beyond history.²⁷⁰

The entire text consists of two blocks which consist of two contemplations and a brief directory. In the first contemplation there are three preludes and six points. The first three points consist in the classic invitation to see, hear and observe as to what the

²⁶⁶ Cf. KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. *Decir...*, p. 93.

²⁶⁷ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 151.

²⁶⁸ Cf. SHELDRAKE, PHILIP. *The Way of...*, p. 105. The exercitant is invited to contemplate the Passion of Christ as though it were being undergone in the present. Moving towards the second contemplation the grace being prayed for becomes more intense. The contemplations of the third week contain the mystery of sin of the First Week and the meaning of the incarnation and the labors of Christ which were contemplated in the Second Week.

²⁶⁹ VON BALTHASAR, HANS URS. *Textos de...*, p. 225. '*El vía crucis del mundo y el de nuestro Señor se abren y se espejan mutuamente. La marcha de la historia sólo se entiende proyectándola sobre el horizonte de la pasión de Cristo; y viceversa...*'

²⁷⁰ Cf. KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. *Decir...*, p. 94.

characters do. The next three points contain the word 'consider' whereby the exercitant is invited to contemplate these mysteries from a specific point of view.

Tres pasos escalonados en los que el verbo 'considerar' designa una mirada del corazón que se deja impresionar por la imagen que contempla. Considerar significa ponderar afectivamente y ahondar a través de los sentimientos en el 'sentido último' que se oculta bajo la epidermis de los acontecimientos, para quedar afectado por él.²⁷¹

The exercitant participates in the Passion of Christ in a personalized manner because of a realization that the Passion was 'for me' [197] [203]. The personalized dimension should however not lead to a private form of spirituality, but leads a person to commit oneself concretely.²⁷² The colloquy that follows in [199] is a sincere dialogue where the exercitant desires to commit oneself definitively through identification with Christ poor and humble. The Christology is no longer one of the Pantocrator as highlighted in the second week, but one of Christ's humble descent and exaltation as revealed in the humanity of Christ.²⁷³

Moving on to a general observation of the contemplations it can be said that they focus on the humanity of Christ and are presented in an ordered manner.²⁷⁴ During these contemplations 'the divinity hides itself' [196] and the humility, poverty, vulnerability, injustice and suffering is what stands out. The texts are not static, but have a dynamic character with the frequent use of the words 'from... to'.²⁷⁵ The only time that

²⁷¹ ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, pp. 500-501.

²⁷² Such a commitment which is in keeping with the third degree of humility is beyond all forms of superficial sentimentalism and consists in an ever greater assimilation into the crucified and risen Christ. (Cf. *IBID.*, p. 100.)

²⁷³ Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, pp. 501-02. The humanity of Christ reveals to us the mystery of the Word and also emphasizes that the way of identification is necessarily through the concrete reality of one's body. The material dimension of human existence is underlined and through the contemplation of the Passion one enters into the mystery of Incarnation-Descent as an expression of the human reality of love. The participation of God in human reality also points to the Trinitarian project whereby God's love is manifest in history in a free and unconditional manner.

²⁷⁴ *IBID.*, p. 652. "...en el centro de la escena está siempre la imagen, la humanidad de Jesús."

²⁷⁵ '...from Bethany to Jerusalem.' [1920, 192, 289]; 'from the supper to the garden...' [200, 201, 290]; '...from the Garden to the house of Annas...' [291]; 'from the house of Annas to that of Caiaphas...' [292]; '...from the house of Caiaphas to that of Pilate...' [293]; '...from Herod to Pilate...' [295]; '...from the house of Pilate up to the crucifixion...' [296]; '...from the raising of the cross until Christ expired...' [296]; '...taking down from the cross to the burial in the sepulcher...' [298]. The title of this work indicates that the dynamic character elaborated in the *SpEx* is present in the spiritual itinerary of each person who desires to live the charism of the Society of Jesus.

an exception is made is when the exercitant is invited to contemplate Christ on the Cross, i.e. the fifth day. Here instead of using the preposition 'to', Ignatius uses the word – 'until'. The contemplations reveal the humility of God in an active and passive manner, with the decisive moment being Jesus' arrest in the garden.

Desde el punto de vista *estilístico* llaman la atención dos detalles: En los números [289] y [290] es Jesús quien actúa y toma la iniciativa. A partir del número [292], precisamente del arresto, los verbos principales o pasan a la pasiva ("se dexa besar", "es llevado") o bien él pasa a ser el sujeto paciente de las acciones que otros ejercen sobre él ("lo llevan atado", "se burlan de él"). Jesús queda ya definitivamente a merced de los acontecimientos.²⁷⁶

Despite the fact that God's humility is manifest in an active and passive manner, we must constantly remember that the humility of Christ reveals to us a God who does not surrender to the forces of sin, injustice and evil but confronts it through His actions and His silence.²⁷⁷ The humility of God as seen in the actions, the silence, the apparent passivity and the final act of love on the Cross are in fact the manifestation of God's power. The Cross, which is the ultimate form of humiliation reveals to the exercitant the wisdom of God which is beyond all human understanding – the faithfulness of God's love revealed in Christ.²⁷⁸ The contemplation of this love cannot but further transform the exercitant to desire nothing but to be *with* Christ who is poor and humble, in a real and concrete manner.

Mary too plays an important role towards the end of this week when she is present at the foot of the Cross [297] and later on when the body is taken down from the Cross [298]. She who has always been humble in surrendering to the will of God, is again invited to share in the humility of Christ by being made to see her own innocent son killed before her very eyes. Mary accompanies the exercitant and helps the person enter more deeply into the Paschal mystery.²⁷⁹ The third week contains a total of five

²⁷⁶ ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, p. 652.

²⁷⁷ KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. *Decir...*, p. 99. '...cierto, el Señor es arrastrado al matadero, pero no cesa de protestar con su palabra y con su silencio contra la injusticia de que es objeto...'

²⁷⁸ Cf. RAHNER, KARL. *Meditaciones...*, p. 226.

²⁷⁹ Cf. SHELDRAKE, PHILIP. *The Way...*, pp. 112-13.

notes which provide instructions that deal with the details of the contemplation.²⁸⁰

Finally before completing this section, it would be necessary to make a note on the use of the word '*esforzarme*'²⁸¹ which may be construed as 'will-power'. However it does not refer to will-power, but a humble recognition that even at this stage of the Spiritual Exercises, it is perfectly possible that a person may experience some form of resistance to enter into the mystery of the Passion.²⁸² The language of the text does not expect the exercitant to strain oneself but does expect the commitment of the entire person. It is possible that the exercitant during these contemplations experiences aridity or a sense of being blocked.²⁸³ However the fundamental experience would be one of God's eternal love revealed in the person of Christ who labored for me.

Jesus' Passion is significant for us because he wishes it for us out of love, wishes it at the level not of instinct (which recoils) but of will, where he freely accepts it. In the human will of Jesus, the wish and the freedom of God break into history in an act of sublime love.²⁸⁴

6.5.2 KENOSIS IN THE THREE CONSIDERATIONS [195, 196, 197]

During the second week the exercitant began the process of election by contemplating the call of the Eternal King. This was followed by the humility and poverty of the Incarnation and finally ended with the image of the Pantocrator during the public life of Jesus. The focus in the third week goes back to the first part of the second week²⁸⁵

²⁸⁰ The exercitant is invited to follow the pattern of the second week and continue with two contemplations, repetitions and application of senses. [204] The director is also given the freedom to modify the number of days of the 3rd week [206] and adapt the contemplations according to age, disposition and temperament. [205] Two points from the additions [2,6] are repeated and other physical and psychological details are provided to maintain the spirit of compunction.

²⁸¹ "...y aquí comenzar con mucha fuerza y *esforzarme* a doler, tristar y llorar..." [195]; "...*esforzándome*, mientras me levanto y me visto, en entristecerme y dolerme de tanto dolor y de tanto padecer de Cristo nuestro Señor." [206]

²⁸² Cf. KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. *Decir...*, p. 98.

²⁸³ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 152.

²⁸⁴ IBID.

²⁸⁵ This does not mean that during the second half of the second week, the humility of God was not the subject of one's consideration. On the contrary, the second half too would invite the exercitant to have the same underlying perspective of the humility, poverty and descent of God. However this is done contemplating the glory of God as revealed through the words and deeds of Christ – i.e. having the image of the Pantocrator before one's eyes.

whereby one is invited to contemplate the Suffering Servant of Yahweh.²⁸⁶ In order to facilitate this process, Ignatius proposes three considerations [195, 196, 197] which delineate the process through which the person opens up to the grace of God and allows the heart to be touched and transformed.

6.5.2.1 The First Consideration – Humanity of Jesus [195]

The first consideration refers to the humanity of Jesus and points to the desire of Jesus to go through the humiliation of the passion. The humanity of Christ is a constant factor throughout the exercise and it is in this very humanity that one experiences the profound nature of God's personal love. The humanity reveals the desire of Christ to suffer *for me* who at the beginning of the Last Supper said that he had 'eagerly desired to eat this Passover before (he) suffered.' (*Lk. 22,15*) This desire is concretely seen in the life of Christ who reveals a God who instead of waiting for the sinner to return takes the initiative and through the Passion and death on the Cross reconciles the sinner with God.²⁸⁷ The humanity of Christ is a definitive sign of God's eternal love and reveals to the exercitant the very kenosis of Christ.

La pasión, en la mente de Ignacio, es un gesto libremente elegido que se despliega en múltiples episodios. Por él Dios pone de manifiesto su deseo de comunión. No es un acontecimiento fortuito y fatal, sino el misterio incomprensible de la sabiduría misteriosa del amor que, en el colmo de la debilidad más extrema, en el 'despojo' de la Kénosis total, expresa y pone de manifiesto la omnipotencia de su amor de Dios (1 Cor 1,18); sabiduría y locura al mismo tiempo.²⁸⁸

6.5.2.2 The Second Consideration – the Divinity hides itself [196]

The second consideration which states that 'the divinity hides itself' is an invitation to incorporate oneself into the very kenosis of Christ – a mystery of self-emptying love in

²⁸⁶ KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. *Decir...*, p. 96. 'El Pantocrátor es el Siervo sufriente.'

²⁸⁷ Hans Urs von Balthasar too speaking about the relationship between God and the human person would underline the fact that God does not merely wait for the sinner to return, but goes out in search for the sinner. It is this desire and search on the part of God that effects the descent of the Incarnation leading to the final descent of the Son into the abyss of abandonment that the sinner experiences. This is the extent of the God's longing for the human person and it concretely manifests in an actual emptying for the sake of a humanity which is sinful and broken. (Cf. VON BALTHASAR, HANS URS. *Textos de...*, pp. 225-26.

²⁸⁸ ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, p. 503.

which the 'divinity hides itself.' The entire life of Christ reveals the glory of God, but it is more pronounced and revealed in its fullness in His Passion and humiliating death on the Cross. However this glory is not one of spectacular power which annihilates the other, but is one which empties itself in order to save the other. Just as authentic love leads the divinity to 'hide itself' for the sake of the other, the exercitant too like Christ is invited to be incorporated in the life of the divinity by participating in the kenosis of the divinity which 'hides itself'.

In the ...Third Week we ask to be sorrowful with Christ sorrowful: what is at issue is a sense of identification. In fact we pray that we may be incorporated into the very kenosis which was the predominant feature of Jesus' life. We pray for a real participation in the radical self-forgetfulness for which he prayed and which bore fruit in his resurrection and in our redemption in Him.²⁸⁹

On the Cross, Christ experienced a sense of total abandonment. He was physically, emotionally and spiritually exhausted and it in this moment that we see the immensity of Divine love. This is why it is said that precisely when the divinity is hidden, Divine Love is exalted to its highest glorification. Love revealed in such a manner reveals the Triune God who through an act of total self-emptying for the other, eternally triumphs over all forms of sin, suffering and death. The humiliating death on the Cross reveals to us the omnipotence of God's love that reestablishes forever the relationship between the God and the human person. The Cross thus becomes the space where the divinity is hidden, but paradoxically becomes the very place where the glorious and triumphant Trinitarian love is revealed.²⁹⁰

6.5.2.3 The Third Consideration – He suffers for my sins [197]

The third consideration invites the exercitant to personalize the previous two considerations by becoming aware of 'how He suffers all this for *my* sins'. [193] The kenosis of Christ which the exercitant has been invited to consider in the previous two numbers is now given a personal and particular dimension. The exercitant realizes that

²⁸⁹ McNAMARA, BRIAN "Jesus' prayer in Gethsemane: Interpretation and Identification", *The Way Supplement* – 27, 1976, p. 86.

²⁹⁰ Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, pp. 504-05.

the passion and crucifixion of Christ is 'for me', and the more a person enters into this mystery of love that the Kenosis of God reveals, there is a growing desire to participate in the same and thereby become an instrument of God.²⁹¹

The personal relationship has progressed during the preceding period and the ongoing and progressive participation in the kenosis of God is seen in specific moments of the Spiritual Exercises. The first meditation, i.e. the meditation of the Eternal King and the election are specific moments. In fact the colloquy of the first meditation [53] and this consideration [197] exactly similar, with one minor addition in the second which shows the spiritual progress that the exercitant would be expected to make. The person is not merely asking a question expressing a desire, but based on an election which has been made, shows a definite inclination towards wanting to 'suffer' with Christ.

[53]	What ought I to do for Christ?
[197]	What ought I to do <i>and suffer</i> for Him?

The desire to *suffer with* Christ is concretized through the election and this election needs to be referred to the Cross.²⁹² The election is more internalized and personalized when the person considers it in the context of the Cross which is the permanent manifestation God's love and the freedom of the human person.²⁹³ The exercitant who identifies with the self-emptying of the Logos on the cross will experience autonomy and freedom which is necessary for participating in the self-emptying love of God.

El sacrificio de la cruz... es el acto más propio y originario del Logos. Pero lo que el Logos realiza en su dimensión de creatura no lo hace menos libremente, ya que, cuanto más cercana de Dios está una creatura, tanto es más autónoma, libre y dueña de sí.²⁹⁴

²⁹¹ Cf. VON BALTHASAR, HANS URS. *Hans Urs Von Balthasar - Textos...*, p. 236. 'De este 'pro me', tan fuertemente acentuado, salta inmediatamente la pregunta: 'qué debo hacer por Cristo' [53]; pregunta que sólo comienza a tener posible respuesta cuando incomprensiblemente suena la llamada al seguimiento [95], cuando el pecador, instrumento inútil, por la sola gracia de la Cruz (¡no de una sinergia cualquiera!), contra toda expectativa, debe hacerse instrumento útil al Señor [...]'

²⁹² "La elección necesita ser refrendada desde la cruz, porque es a Cristo crucificado, - escándalo y locura, en expresión paulina - a quien el ejercitante sigue desde su elección." TEJERA, MANUEL. "El proceso espiritual de la tercera semana", *Manresa* - 329, 2011, p. 329.

²⁹³ Cf. RAHNER, KARL. *Meditaciones...*, p. 227

²⁹⁴ IBID. p. 229.

The spiritual process manifests a growing centeredness in Christ and a more passionate love for the Cross. Through these contemplations one does not merely engage in pious considerations, but in a firm and concrete manner affectively participates in the kenosis of God.²⁹⁵ This participation which leads one to an inversion of values leads to a progressive emptying of self-love and greater discipleship with Christ's descent who totally emptied Himself on the Cross.²⁹⁶ It is the growing experience of God's love 'for me' as experienced through a dialogue with Christ on the Cross that leads to concrete choices which manifest an emptying of one's self-love, self-will and self-interest [189].

Para el ejercitante, el encuentro con Cristo en la cruz, que se muda hacia nosotros en un movimiento kenótico, de abajamiento, produce un efecto de alegría salvadora, activa, y de apertura para corresponder al amor de Dios manifestado en la cruz. Deja así abierta una pregunta – ¿qué debo hacer por Cristo?– que dispone al ejercitante para escuchar su voz a través de las contemplaciones de los misterios de la vida de Cristo. El encuentro dialogado con Cristo en la cruz le conducirá a restaurar la vida y a salir de sí mismo.²⁹⁷

During the entire process from the very beginning to the end, it is the grace of God that impulses the exercitant to participate in the kenotic process. The human person desires to 'descend' with Christ to that which would lead to greater glorification of God. This 'descent' is not something mechanical but is rooted in love and is possible only through the gift of the Spirit.²⁹⁸ The ardent love of Christ who being Divine descended to become human reveals to us God's passionate and personal love. This experience of God's immense and personal love moves a person to empty oneself for the sake of the other and in so loving, results in a restoration of the human person to one's true and original state.²⁹⁹

²⁹⁵ Cf. TEJERA, MANUEL. "El proceso...", p. 330. '*No se trata de hacer una contemplación simplemente piadosa de la pasión y muerte del Señor. Se trata de acoger su invitación y seguirle en su camino descendente, asumiendo su estilo de vida, con una fuerte adhesión afectiva al Cristo sufriente.*'

²⁹⁶ IBID., p. 336. '*No hay elección cristiana, ni hay reforma de vida sin éxodo. El cristiano vive centrifugado, su centro de gravedad no está en él mismo sino en el Señor Jesús y su Reino.*'

²⁹⁷ Cf. TEJERA, MANUEL. "El proceso...", pp. 331-332.

²⁹⁸ Cf. VON BALTHASAR, HANS URS. *Textos...*, p. 231.

²⁹⁹ Cf. RAHNER, KARL. *Meditaciones...*, p. 228. "*...el amor es el único acto, fundado en la naturaleza humana, en que el hombre se abandona, para salir de sí mismo y así conquistarse verdaderamente, el amor, y sólo él, es la renuncia originaria.*"

6.5.3 PROGRESSIVE IDENTIFICATION WITH CHRIST AND PURIFICATION OF SELF-LOVE

Ignatius does not glorify sin and suffering, but through the contemplation from the very First Week helps the exercitant enter into the mystery of God's love. This transforms a person leading to greater harmony with God, with others and oneself generating a desire to 'divest oneself of self-love...' and respond generously to the Crucified Lord.³⁰⁰ The contemplations of the third week specifically help the person become more rooted in the love of God leading one to become more compassionate so as to suffer *with* Christ.³⁰¹ A progressive experience of the humanity of Christ on the Cross helps the exercitant to recognize the true nature of God and at the same time one's true nature as a human person. The cross becomes a place of genuine encounter by which the exercitant, who has been enlightened and empowered by the Divine Kenosis responds by generously emptying oneself of one's self-love for others.

Dios le ha mostrado al hombre el camino encarnatorio del amor. De ahí que el *padecer-con*, no es un sentimiento inferior ni morboso, sino la expresión de la "comunidad con lo ajeno", la solidaridad encarnatoria propia de Dios en su amor al hombre; y el modo de "salir de sí" para que se ponga de manifiesto la *agápè* de Dios, que es lo ajeno al hombre. Esto es lo que Ignacio suplica una y otra vez, y lo que acontece en la comunión con Cristo doloroso y quebrantado [203]; que la historia encuentre el camino de la *comunidad humana* como la verdadera salvación ofrecida de parte de Dios.³⁰²

The process of moving from self-love to self-emptying love is an ongoing process and though this week is considered to be part of the unitive way, it takes forward the purification of one's self-love – albeit in ways that are subtle, passive and hidden. The exercitant contemplates the passive dimension of spiritual life in Christ who during the passion was no longer fully in control of himself, but was led by others.³⁰³ These

³⁰⁰ Cf. TEJERA, MANUEL. "El proceso espiritual...", p. 333. Tejera in his article speaks about the transformative character of the contemplations from the very first week. He underlines the fact that the strength to follow the Lord wherever He calls a person comes from a passionate love which is rooted in the mercy and love that has been gratuitously received. This helps a person to rebuild a life that has been destroyed by sin in order to generously respond to the invitation of the Lord. '*Sólo el amor apasionado por aquel que nos ha salvado lleva a ir con él, hasta donde él nos quiera llevar. El encuentro con el crucificado –el gran signo de la misericordia de Dios–, desde la realidad del pecado y la experiencia de misericordia, lanza al ejercitante hacia la reconstrucción de la vida y a actuar, como respuesta al "qué debo hacer por Cristo".*'

³⁰¹ Cf. KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. *Decir...*, p. 98.

³⁰² *IBID.*, p. 509.

³⁰³ In an earlier point it has been indicated that the arrest of Jesus in the garden is a turning point of the Passion

contemplations also point to the stage of passive purifications that a person has to go through in the process of spiritual life.

...there are emotions that might look like compassion, while quite fundamentally diverging from it – feelings, for example, containing little commitment, or sense of personal indebtedness, ...of paralyzed feeling and sheer laboriousness. Behind these might lie a reluctance to contemplate the Passion at debt, or a frustrated desire for immediate satisfaction. ...In interpreting the Third Week experience, it must also be borne in mind that at this stage it would be normal for an exercitant to enter the spiritual suffering of passive purification or the ‘nights of the soul’.³⁰⁴

The purifications which take place during this period are very subtle and the exercitant would have to frequently take recourse to the rules of discernment of spirits. At the same time the director ought to be very attentive to what the internal movements that the exercitant is going through.³⁰⁵ Through the purifications the exercitant is more aware of the need of an ongoing personal kenosis to grow in compassion and thereby enter into the Paschal mystery – a mystery which is founded on the kenosis of the Word of God.³⁰⁶

Finally it could be said that the third week of the Spiritual Exercises is a reminder to the exercitant of the need of a constant self-emptying, because of various levels of resistance to participating in the Kenosis of the Word.³⁰⁷

Contemplating the Passion of Jesus can be an excruciating experience. The grace that we seek is a deeply felt sense of the suffering of our Lord for us. This desire can cause interior pain for two reasons. The first is our natural fear of our own possible sufferings for Christ. The second arises from our close union to the person of Jesus Christ suffering.³⁰⁸

Despite the various difficulties of this week, we paradoxically find that while on the one hand the person encounters various forms of resistances he also encounters an

narratives. The vocabulary used as well as the contemplations during this week help us understand how Christ was led by others, though he never lost his freedom to love and empty Himself.

³⁰⁴ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 148.

³⁰⁵ Cf. *IBID.*, p. 149.

³⁰⁶ Cf. KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. *Decir...*, p. 99.

³⁰⁷ “...esta compasión, según expresión del P. Fessard, requiere una ‘eterna Tercera Semana’ porque, en el fondo de sí mismo y hasta en el sufrimiento, el ser humano busca realizarse a sí mismo.” (KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. *Decir...*, p. 99.)

³⁰⁸ ENGLISH, JOHN. *Spiritual Freedom...*, p. 223.

ease in contemplating and identifying with the Passion. This is because all human persons have personally experienced suffering and pain in varying degrees. The image of Jesus who goes through the agony of the garden helps a person handle pain and loneliness.³⁰⁹ The third week is not a time to look for theological answers or conceptual clarity about the Kenosis of God and human participation but to actually *be with* Christ who was humiliated and crucified and continues to suffer the Passion in today's world.

Ignatius allows the director to be flexible³¹⁰ but is insistent that the exercitant contemplates the five episodes of the Passion and death as well as go through the entire Passion as a whole. [209] The focus is not on the exercitant's sinfulness, but on the image of the Suffering Servant who reveals the Kenosis of God. In contemplating this image, the exercitant concretely experiences an inversion of values³¹¹ that had been seen from the very beginning and strongly underlined through the meditation of the Eternal King, the Incarnation and the Two Standards and more concretely through the election. The ever growing identification *with* the descent and humiliation of Christ crucified will be vindicated in the glorious triumph of the fourth week when the power of God's love will definitively overcome sin and death.

6.6 THE FOURTH WEEK

The Fourth Week of the *SpEx* is a brief text which deals with the Resurrection and the Contemplation to Obtain Love.³¹² Though some have doubted its importance, it is generally considered as the culmination of an intense and profound spiritual process.³¹³

³⁰⁹ Cf. IBID. p. 224.

³¹⁰ The total number of contemplations is variable, the number of the days that make up this week can be adapted and the actual subject matter for the contemplations as well as the colloquy can be adjusted according to the situation of the exercitant.

³¹¹ TEJERA, MANUEL. "El proceso...", p. 336. '*Cristo, con su vida en descenso, kenótica, invierte los valores de la vida. Porque en el seguimiento de Cristo, como indica san Juan de la Cruz 'el subir es abajar y el abajar es subir'.*'

³¹² It is textually the shortest week of the Spiritual Exercises. The brevity is surprising given the fact that this is the second half of the Paschal Mystery. Equally surprising is the silence about this week in the directories. (Cf. GUILLÉN, ANTONIO. "El proceso espiritual de la Cuarta Semana." *Manresa* – 79, 2007, p. 127.)

³¹³ TEJERA, MANUEL. "La cuarta semana en la dinámica de los Ejercicios Espirituales", *Manresa* – 233, 1987, p. 315. '*Esta sobriedad del texto ha dado lugar, en muchas ocasiones, a una escasa valoración práctica de la cuarta semana a la que algunos, por otra parte, consideran la más importante por ser punto de convergencia de todos los Ejercicios.*'

The text consists in an elaborate meditation on the apparition of the Risen Lord to His Blessed Mother which is followed by an indication to continue with the various apparitions until the Ascension. This is followed by a meditation called the Contemplation to Attain Love³¹⁴ where the exercitant is invited to re-live the spiritual process of the entire month and at the same time prepares the person to take forward this experience in one's day to day life.

A great deal has been written about this week with experts commenting specially upon the *CTOL*. However the focus of our paper is on the dimension of humility and its centrality in the foundational experience of the *SpEx*. Therefore in this section we shall indicate how humility is a key element in experiencing the grace of the fourth week as well as a defining element in the experience of the *CTOL*. We shall begin with some introductory comments regarding the Fourth Week and the *CTOL* and follow it up with an explanation as to how humility is critical for both. Finally we shall make some concluding remarks related to the spiritual process of the fourth week and its continuation in one's day to day living.

6.6.1 THE JOY OF THE RESURRECTION AS A VINDICATION OF HUMILITY AND POVERTY.

During this week, the main characteristic is the element of joy.³¹⁵ An experience of the exaltation of Christ who as the Apostles' Creed states 'descended to the dead' results in a joy which is transformative. This point is highlighted in the first consideration which invites the exercitant to 'consider how the divinity... now appears and manifests itself... through its true and most holy effects.' [223]. Without dedicating too much time on a theological interpretation, Ignatius would be more interested in inviting the exercitant to contemplate the effects of this experience on various individuals and groups.

In the time of the apparitions and of the apostolic Church, these might be summarized under three heads: effects in individuals (e.g. hope, vision, joy, love), in the Church (the building of the community), in the world (the progress of the reign of God through the

³¹⁴ In future this meditation will be called *CTOL*.

³¹⁵ Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 162.

mission of the apostles).³¹⁶

This does not mean that suffering is over, but takes on a new meaning where it is understood to be a necessary element in order to grow and experience joy and happiness.³¹⁷ The exercitant has grown in an internal knowledge of the Two Standards by contemplating the life of Christ whereby the victorious exaltation of humility is a historical and experiential reality. Thus the petition of the exercitant is to participate in the joy of the Risen Lord – a participation which confirms the election of the Exercitant and opens the person to the workings of the Holy Spirit.

El ejercitante pide humildemente la gracia de participar en la Gloria y el gozo del Cristo Señor, Salvador de la historia. Es aquí donde habría que recordar la interpretación de los comentaristas que ven en la cuarta semana una intencionalidad de participación gozosa, amorosa, unitiva con Cristo resucitado. Esta participación gloriosa, en la dinámica de los Ejercicios lleva a la confirmación de la elección del ejercitante.³¹⁸

The exercitant humbly acknowledges that he has personally experienced a resurrection in his own life by becoming aware of the effects wrought about by the grace of God in the form of an increase in faith, hope and love.³¹⁹ He therefore humbly petitions to participate in the joy of Christ and thereby be united more intimately with God.³²⁰ The Resurrection heralds the eschatological age which manifests the fidelity of God and the triumph of Divine love in the history of salvation. However the eschatological reality is not limited to history understood in general terms, but reveals its presence in the actual history of human persons. The Spirit that grants them the gift of faith and love, has empowered them to abandon themselves totally into the hands of

³¹⁶ IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 166.

³¹⁷ Cf. GUILLÉN, ANTONIO. "El proceso espiritual...", p. 128. Guillen also says that in order to experience the joy of the Resurrection one would have to have entered into the contemplations in a profound manner. '*Es evidente que sin el inmenso amor a Jesús cultivado en las contemplaciones de su vida y pasión, no habría posibilidad de sintonizar con la felicidad del Resucitado.*'

³¹⁸ TEJERA, MANUEL. "La cuarta semana en la dinámica de los Ejercicios", *Manresa* – 233, 1987, p. 319.

³¹⁹ In the rules of discernment [316] we find that consolation from God can be identified by its effects of '*every increase in faith, hope and charity, and every interior joy...*' The grace proper of the fourth week is this kind of consolation where the person experiences '*tranquility and peace in its Creator and Lord.*'

³²⁰ TEJERA, MANUEL. "La cuarta semana..", p. 319. '*...se trata de una gracia que la mayoría de los autores sitúan en la vía unitiva, el ejercitante sólo puede disponerse a ella pidiendo humildemente esa participación en el gozo de Cristo resucitado que ve en su propia resurrección la entrada de la humanidad en el reino de Dios.*'

God who recreates and once again makes them whole in Christ.³²¹

6.6.2 MARY AS THE MODEL FOR EVERY CHRISTIAN

Incidentally Ignatius only elaborates one contemplation, i.e. the apparition of the Risen Lord to His Blessed Mother.³²² Mary is the link between the third and the fourth week because the last contemplation of the third week and the first contemplation of the fourth week is based on her.³²³ Mary is not presented here merely as a pious individual, but a person who had a crucial role to play in the history of salvation.³²⁴ This is why, Ignatius in the composition of place would invite the exercitant to imagine two places – ‘the holy sepulcher... (and) the place or house where Our Lady was...’ [220]³²⁵

Mary is the prototype of the faithful and what happens to all Christians who follow Christ under the banner of the Cross. The experience of Mary is the climax of the spiritual process that a believer goes through.

...no puede extrañar que la figura de María simbolice en este momento el culmen de todo un proceso espiritual... Con la aparición a María nos hallamos, por consiguiente, ante el fundamento teológico del discernimiento específico de la 4ª semana: el sentir a la Iglesia como la esposa de Cristo, conducida por el Espíritu de Dios a partir del momento de la Ascensión.³²⁶

The exercitant is invited to continue growing in the attitude of Mary, an attitude which is revealed as she sings the ‘Magnificat’ celebrating God’s glory and power that has been revealed in her humility and low standing. (*Lk. 1,46-55*) Ignatius wants the exercitant to pray like her and hope like her. She who humbly surrendered herself in the hands of God, teaches the exercitant the true meaning of hope and trust in God. She teaches us that trust does not consist in expecting God to do what one desire, but in

³²¹ Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, pp. 540-541.

³²² Though this apparition is not found in Scripture, it was a long held tradition that the first apparition was to Mary. It is also found in chapter 70 of the *Life of Christ* by Ludolph of Saxony who quotes many sources from tradition in order to support his claim. (Cf. GANSS, GEORGE. *The Spiritual...*, p. 182.)

³²³ Cf. GUILLÉN, ANTONIO. “El proceso...”, p. 133.

³²⁴ Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, pp. 164-65.

³²⁵ In fact he would further develop this composition by inviting the exercitant to imagine the various parts of the house ‘such as a room, an oratory, and the like.’

³²⁶ ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, p. 548.

emptying oneself in order to be open, attentive and grateful to a loving and humble God who takes the initiative to encounter us.

Esperar no es aguardar que ocurra lo que yo deseo, sino aguardar a Dios, que no sé por dónde vendrá, pero que siempre se dejará reconocer a su paso. Es presencia viva del Dios vivo, que se basa en el amor ya sentido y conocido, y que por tanto, dura más y llega más lejos de lo que nosotros en cada momento somos capaces de entender y procesar. Es memoria honda de los beneficios recibidos a lo largo de nuestra vida y confianza mantenida en el Regalador de ellos. Es no cejar en la confianza desatada y consolidada ya por una serie de experiencias inolvidables que el corazón conserva.³²⁷

Mary's humility which revealed itself from the Annunciation where she surrendered to the invitation of God and culminated in the ultimate surrender of seeing her Son dead on the Cross is exalted as she is the first to receive the gift of the Spirit. Mary is the symbol of the Church and her participation in the descent of God and exaltation is the symbol of the Church and a prototype of the experience to every believer.³²⁸ By contemplating her experience, the exercitant is invited to enter into the dynamics of the fourth week whereby one realizes that the path of humility, a path chosen by Mary is vindicated through a participation in the joy and fulfillment of the Resurrection.

Moving on the actual text of the contemplation we find that Ignatius uses two important words '*alegrar*' and '*gozar*'. These words are an invitation to participate in the joy of the Lord – a call to be united to the Lord and not merely restricted to an individualistic experience.³²⁹ The joy which is the result of having *been with* Christ in His humiliation and death is now transformed into true reverence and adoration.³³⁰ The first note indicates the subject matter of the contemplation for the week, whereby the exercitant is invited to proceed through the mysteries up to the Ascension. [226] The

³²⁷ GUILLÉN, ANTONIO. "El proceso espiritual...", p. 134.

³²⁸ TEJERA, MANUEL. "La cuarta semana...", p. 322. '*María es la primera que recibe el Espíritu como don de Cristo resucitado... María es así la figura de la Iglesia y lo que en ella acontece, acontece también a la Iglesia y en cada uno de sus miembros.*'

³²⁹ Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, pp. 165-66.

³³⁰ There is here a brief explanation of how the exercitant/believer enters into contact with the source of all consolation. There is Trinitarian and Pneumatological dimension to this experience where the person now lives in the Spirit which is a gift that has been gratuitously received. This therefore leads one to a profound attitude of adoration and reverence. (Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, p. 552.)

exaltation of Christ where the divinity is no longer hidden and the glorified body never overlooks the wounds on the Cross, indicating that it is the humanity of Christ which has now been transformed and appears in its glorious state.³³¹

The exercitant who has moved towards contemplative simplicity in his prayer would require little material to sustain an hour's prayer. In keeping with the flexibility of the methodology of the *SpEx* Ignatius presents four notes indicating as to how the contemplations could be adapted according to the situation of the exercitant.³³²

6.6.3 CTOL AND PARTICIPATING IN THE SELF-EMPTYING LOVE OF GOD

The *CTOL* (Contemplation to Obtain Love – *SpEx* 230-237) is the last contemplation of the *SpEx* and it is believed that to have its roots in Ignatius' personal experience at Manresa. Despite the fact that this is an important contemplation there has been a certain degree of confusion regarding its relevance and position.³³³ It is a very important contemplation which summarizes the experience during the entire month³³⁴ and helps the exercitant continue living the experience of the Exercises in day to day life.³³⁵ The person recalls the importance of the attitude of humility as he/she revisits the central graces of the *SpEx* acknowledging with deep gratitude the process of growing in an internal knowledge of the 'goodness with which God has surrounded him.'³³⁶

'The Spiritual Exercises are not a series of prayers to say as an office. They form an organic

³³¹ GUILLÉN, ANTONIO. "El proceso...", p. 138. 'En ninguna de las 'apariciones' había permitido el Resucitado a sus discípulos olvidarse de la catástrofe del Viernes Santo.'

³³² Ignatius proposes four exercises a day. He would also take into account the likelihood of fatigue at this stage. (Cf. IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding...*, p. 168.)

³³³ Some consider the *CTOL* to be an independent prayer and propose it during the 2nd or 3rd week making it part of the election. (Cf. BUCKLEY, MICHAEL. "The Contemplation to Attain Love", *The Way Supplement* - 24, 1975, p. 92.). Its placement was doubted by some while others raised questions whether it was a contemplation at all. However it must be affirmed that the earlier companions of Ignatius were firm that it was indeed part of the fourth week and was integral to the unitive way.

³³⁴ Cf. IBID., "The Contemplation...", p. 95.

³³⁵ "Los EE no se terminan en la CAA. Se prolongan y se profundizan en ella. La CAA no es un 'ejercicio' más, el último. Es 'el ejercicio' permanente." (IGLESIAS, IGNACIO. "La Contemplación para alcanzar amor en la dinámica de los Ejercicios Espirituales", *Manresa* - 233, 1987, p. 384.)

³³⁶ BUCKLEY, MICHAEL. *The Contemplation...*, p. 95. Ignatius understood spiritual life as a process and this is borne forth in the *Autobiography*, in the *Constitutions* as well as the *SpEx*. Keeping this in mind it could be said that the *SpEx* as well as the *CTOL* constitutes a method leading to an ongoing spiritual process.

sequence of meditations and counsels, moving through the entire span of a man's life appropriated in prayer and choice, as he attempts under the influence of God to harmonize his personal history with the movements and intentions of the life of Christ. Each meditation within the Exercises develops from an initial request in the preludes to the final grace experienced and articulated in the colloquy... So also the purpose of the Contemplation for attaining Love is developmental. It immediately aims at an elevation of consciousness, a growth in awareness, that kind of total human perception and experience which Ignatius called 'interior knowledge', which caught up understanding, sensibility and feeling.'³³⁷

The exercitant recognizes the spiritual journey where the 'eyes of understanding were opened' by God who revealed that God is love and that one's true being consists in a growing attitude of habitual generous self-giving.³³⁸

Moving on to the actual structure of the *CTOL* we can observe that it begins with two preliminary observations. These observations summarize the history of salvation as well as the personal salvific history of the exercitant. In it one can see a 'unity of three movements – interior knowledge or realization, love or affectivity, service or action – (these goals) constitute the full goal of the contemplations of the goodness from God.'³³⁹ This is followed by four points which summarize the entire process of the *SpEx*. All four of them are based on humility where the humility of God invites the exercitant to progressively humble oneself and proceed along the path of self-emptying love.

In the first point, [234] the exercitant humbly acknowledges that everything is a gift. God who is love longs to empty Himself for others and the individual can only in gratitude accept this gift of God's self-donation. In the second point [235] the exercitant is aware of the participation of God in creation and the history of humanity.³⁴⁰ Creation and the mystery of the Incarnation reveals God's descent and self-emptying. The exercitant is invited to become aware of how he has been 'created in the likeness and

³³⁷ *IBID.*, pp. 94-95.

³³⁸ IGLESIAS, IGNACIO. "La Contemplación...", p. 376. '*Todo el camino será la re-velación de su rostro, Cristo. (Felipe, quien me ve a mí ve al Padre' Jn, 14,19) La CAA nos revelará su nombre: Dios es Amor. (1Jn 4:8,16) No sólo ama sin reservarse. (Rom.3,2) Es Amor. ...La liberalidad inicialmente ofrecida [5] como disposición de entrada, se traduce en indiferencia [23], esto es, neutralización de las mociones humanas para dejar paso a las del Espíritu, y acabará consolidándose como disponibilidad habitual [234].'*

³³⁹ BUCKLEY, MICHAEL. *The Contemplation...*, p. 96.

³⁴⁰ Cf. ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. *Ejercicios...*, pp. 572-73.

image of the Divine Majesty' [235].³⁴¹ The third point recalls God as humbly laboring in me and in all reality. God's love is constantly at work and the awareness of this reality is the foundation of all discernments. Discernments and proper elections help a person to participate in God's laboring love.³⁴² The fourth and final point is one where the person definitively moves away from self-love and lives a life rooted in Christ. This new way of live is an enlightened way of living whereby the exercitant is aware that all good comes from God. [237] Such an awareness is an antidote to any form of pride or vainglory.

The *CTOL* is a transition from realizing that God is good to me towards a realization that God is in fact good in Himself. One begins to love God for God's goodness to me, but moves on to love God because God is worthy of being loved in Himself. There is a growing attitude of self-emptying love which is based on gratitude and leads to joyful surrender.³⁴³ The joyful surrender of oneself is a process which is spiral and total, leading to the simplification and integration of the entire person.³⁴⁴ This form of integration is founded on self-emptying love, leads to an intimate union with God and is manifested in generous service involving the totality of the person³⁴⁵. In this way a person lives a life where he/she is a contemplative in action and in such a manner participates in the self-emptying love of God.

CONCLUSION

During this entire chapter we have seen how humility is a transversal and critical component of the *SpEx*. It is a necessary precondition in order to begin the *SpEx*, is fundamental during the entire period of one month and is necessary in order to continue

³⁴¹ The human person realizes that the source of one's existence is God. God is one 'who dwells in (oneself)... makes (a person) His temple... (because) of being created in God's likeness and image...' [235]

³⁴² Cf. BUCKLEY, MICHAEL. *The Contemplation...*, p. 102.

³⁴³ Cf. *IBID.*, p. 103.

³⁴⁴ IGLESIAS, IGNACIO. "La Contemplación...", p. 375. 'Ha sido un proceso en espiral, en el que todos los elementos (Dios, hombre, cosas) están presentes siempre, en todas las fases y se van retomando continuamente desde un nuevo ángulo de contemplación, que en la CAA alcanza su grado máximo de profundidad y de simplificación a la vez.'

³⁴⁵ DÍEZ-ALEGRÍA, JOSÉ MARÍA. "La Contemplación para alcanzar amor", *Manresa* -87, 1951, pp. 191-92. '...precisamente por ser el amor que en nuestra Contemplación se pretende una totalidad y una cumbre, parece quedar superada la cuestión de sí lo que en ella predomina es el amor de la unión o el de servicio. Es precisamente la fusión lo que aquí se busca más que nada.'

living the graces at the end of the *SpEx*. During the course of the *SpEx* humility takes on various shades and allows a person to progressively move from the purgative stage towards the illuminative stage finally towards the unitive stage.

It can be said that humility as understood within the first week is not the same as humility during the second week or for that matter the third and fourth week. During the first week there is greater emphasis on the humility of the person in terms of recognizing one's identity as a creature who has been gratuitously loved. This becomes a more enlightened form of humility during the second week. A person enters more deeply into the mystery of God's love. This love reveals itself in a humble and respectful manner towards the human person. God's self-emptying love manifests itself in total humility and poverty during the third week and the exercitant participates in this mystery of love by contemplating the passion and death. The exercitant participates in the joy of the fourth week by contemplating the vindication of God's humility and self-emptying love in the form of the Resurrection narratives. The entire process of humility culminates in the *CTOL* where the person who has grown in humility harmoniously participates in the laboring love of God.

The *SpEx* is the fundamental experience for one who desires to live the charism of the Society of Jesus. This was seen in the life of Ignatius and the first companions. The centrality of this experience led Ignatius as well as the companions to insist on this experience for all candidates desirous of entering into the Society. This was because the *SpEx* contains the tools to grow out of one's disordered affections towards becoming 'humble and meek' (*Mt. 11,29*) like the Lord. The freedom thus experienced would help an individual to generously and totally give himself in follow Christ poor and humble.

The *SpEx* offers a method in order to help the spiritual growth of an individual – a method in which humility is a fundamental element. Just as humility plays an important role in aiding the spiritual process of an individual, in the same way it helps a group grow out of its disordered affections in order to respond collectively to the invitation of God.

The next chapter will deal with a text that highlights an important process of the nascent Society of Jesus. This text is called the 'Deliberations of 1539' and refers to a series of deliberations for a period of three months. During this period Ignatius and the first companions realized two critical factors in order to progress as a group. The first related to the humble recognition of their own self-love and the second was related to the importance of the virtue of humility in order to faithfully and generously respond to the will of God. The next chapter which is incidentally the last chapter in this second part of foundational texts, will highlight the centrality of humility as seen in the 'Deliberations of 1539'.

CHAPTER 7

HUMILITY IN THE DELIBERATIONS OF 1539

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

The previous section had indicated the role of humility in shaping the spiritual journey of Ignatius and its centrality in the Spiritual Exercises. With the course of time, Ignatius and his companions would realize that a privileged way to know the will of God as well as to grow out of one's self-love, self-will and self-interest both at an individual and communitarian level was to use the method of deliberation. The importance of deliberations in a person's individual experience would go on to take a more communitarian character with Ignatius engaging with other companions in order to better know and fulfill the will of God. The awareness of this method in order to better participate in the Divine Kenosis would be a slow and life long process.

Though its origins can be seen immediately after the conversion of Ignatius at Manresa it would go on to become more sophisticated as the years went by. As Ignatius fine-tuned the art of doing the will of God through greater familiarity with the process of discernment, he realized that 'deliberations' were indispensable. He also realized that humility was a critical element in the process of deliberations. In this chapter we shall focus on the Deliberations of 1539 where we shall explain how humility was an essential precondition in order to enter into a process of discernment, deliberations and decision.

Though the Deliberations of 1539 are significant, it must be pointed out that the

use of ‘deliberations’ as a method had its antecedents in earlier experiences. We shall begin by highlighting the deliberations undertaken by Ignatius during the initial years after his conversion. Later on we shall elaborate how Ignatius and his companions engaged in various forms of deliberations in Paris and in Italy. Finally we shall analyze and interpret a document known as the Deliberations of 1539 where we have details of a significant process of discernment undertaken by Ignatius and his companions.¹ In analyzing this text we shall see how humility was indispensable for spiritual process.

7.1 IGNATIUS’ INITIAL YEARS OF BEING INDIVIDUALISTIC AND SOLITARY

During the initial phase of Ignatius’ conversion he was keen on being alone and desired to pursue his new way of life in a solitary manner.² This is seen in the fact that he often thought of going to ‘Jerusalem barefoot, and of eating nothing but plain vegetables and of practicing all the other rigors that he saw in the saints’ (*Au 8*). He had also ‘instructed one of the household servants who was going to Burgos to get information about the rule of the Carthusians’. (*Au 12*). This desire to be solitary would take on a more communitarian character in Manresa with Ignatius feeling a strong need to communicate his interior world with others. He realized that deliberations were a better and more divine means to serve God and one’s neighbor.

En los primeros años posteriores a su conversión, digamos desde que sale de Loyola (1521) hasta que llega a Paría (febrero 1528), Ignacio puso su empeño “ascético” necesario, tal vez en los comienzos, en una manera de entender el seguimiento del Señor Jesús “solo”; interpretaba la cercanía de los otros como una amenaza potencial para poder vivir su plena confianza en Dios [*Au 35*]. ...La conversión de Ignacio al otro y al grupo fue lenta. En su empeño por “ayudar a las ánimas” [*Au 26, 45, 50*] fue dándose cuenta de que en

¹ Ignatius was the leader and mentor of the group. He was elder than all of them and his spiritual depth and experience made them look up to him. However the various accounts that are available to us indicate to us an Ignatius who rarely imposed his will on the others, but was humble and gracious to participate in a process of discernment with others whenever the situations so required.

² Cigoña makes a difference between deliberations and dialogue. Deliberations are superior to dialogue and generally results in unanimity if there is a common openness to the Spirit. Dialogue generally will lead to majority. He goes on to give two examples from the *Autobiography* about dialogue – the incident at the fortress at Pamplona and the incident with the doctors at Loyola. (Cf. FERNÁNDEZ DE LA CIGOÑA, RAMÓN. “La deliberación comunitaria en la autobiografía de S. Ignacio”, *Manresa* – 177, 1973, p. 388.)

grupo la ayuda era mayor y, por tanto, más divina.³

The change in Ignatius' perspective is evident in his attempt to create a community on his return from Jerusalem. During the two years he was in Barcelona he devoted himself to studies and other apostolic activities such as 'spiritual conversations and works of mercy for the poor and the sick.'⁴ He felt 'desires to associate some persons into his companionship'⁵ and through the Spiritual Exercises he attracted his first companions Calixto de Sa, Juan de Arteaga and Lope de Cáceres. They were joined by a French youth named Juan Reynalde in Alcalá.⁶

This communitarian experiment ended in failure when Ignatius was ordered to learn theology before engaging in any further spiritual ministry in Spain. As he arrived in Paris he once again began his attempt to form a community. Despite his studies, he continued with his spiritual activities. He gave the Exercises and three students responded to him and these included Juan de Castro, Pedro de Peralta, and Amador de Elduayen.⁷ This led to a radical change in their lives and caused difficulties for Ignatius who later on decided to focus on his studies. [Au 78] It was during this period that he began to share a room with two other students Peter Faber and Francis Xavier.⁸

Before moving on to the next phase it would be important to reflect on Ignatius' efforts during this period. What we do observe is that Ignatius engaged in a great deal of spiritual conversation. We find this in Loyola where he 'conversed with members of the household' [Au 11]. Later on he 'conversed with spiritual people' in Manresa and

³ GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. "Los Primeros de París: amistad, carisma y pauta", *Manresa – 308*, 2006, pp. 253-54.

⁴ DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 88.

⁵ FN-1, p. 170.

⁶ DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, pp. 89, 96.

⁷ The academic demands were great and Ignatius had limited time for spiritual activities. However he took every opportunity for spiritual conversation and giving the Spiritual Exercises. The three individuals who would undergo a radical change included Pedro de Peralta, studying for his Masters, Juan Castro, then teaching at the Sorbonne, and Amador de Elduayén, a Guipúzcoan like Iñigo, who also studied in Sainte Barbe. We find Ignatius making efforts to be in contact with the earlier group of companions in Spain. (Cf. MEISSNER, WILLIAM W. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, pp. 142-43.)

⁸ While Ignatius did not engage in an active ministry we know that besides the three Spaniards indicated, he worked with other students too. They frequently met at a Carthusian convent, conversed on spiritual subjects, went to confession and received Holy Communion. (Cf. DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, pp. 113-114)

Barcelona [*Au* 21, 34, 37]. On his return from Barcelona he continued with the same practice and dedicated his time in giving the Spiritual Exercises to various people.

There is no doubt that from the very beginning he desired to help souls [*Au*-45] and this is seen in his activities during his stay in Barcelona, Alcala, Salamanca and the initial years in Paris. However it does not seem that he engaged in deliberations as understood in the later years of his life.⁹ He took decisions for himself and advised his companions as to what they ought to do. The fact that this method did not help the nascent communities remain together in a cohesive manner is obvious from the fact that the first two groups ended up fragmented with the individuals going their own way.¹⁰

7.2 LEARNING THE ART OF 'DELIBERATIONS' IN PARIS

7.2.1 DELIBERATIONS AND THE FORMATION OF A STABLE GROUP

The third group of companions¹¹ would begin with Peter Faber and Francis Xavier and would persevere going on to form the nucleus of the Society of Jesus. Various reasons have been offered for the sustenance of this group and primary among it was the shared experience of the Spiritual Experience.¹² The personality of Ignatius also helped them in forming themselves into a well knit group.¹³ He was a man with immense experience and much older than the others and in this was a mentor for the first companions.

⁹ Deliberations as seen later would consist in participating in a well thought out method that contained a specific a process. Through this method the group could have greater facility in finding and fulfilling the will of God.

¹⁰ An important element for deliberation is that the group needs be open to the one true Spirit. This helps them to listen to God and come to a common conclusion. The first group formed by Ignatius lasted for less than 10 years and the second which also failed because of Ignatius impatience better prepared him for the Deliberations during the latter part of his stay in Paris, Venice and Rome. (Cf. FERNÁNDEZ DE LA CIGOÑA, RAMÓN. "La deliberación comunitaria ...", pp. 389-90.

¹¹ We do not desire to present the three groups as disappearing abruptly. Ignatius was in contact with the companions from Spain and tried to get them come to Paris. He was also in contact with the three students who made the Spiritual Exercises with him in Paris. Castro entered a Carthusian monastery near Segorbe and Ignatius paid him a visit during his visit to Spain in 1535.

¹² The companions of Ignatius did not immediately make the Spiritual Exercises as in the other cases. It was only after a period of knowing one another for some years that in 1534 the six companions of Ignatius made the Spiritual Exercises. The long gestation period apparently helped them to reach a level of maturity in order to assimilate better the experience of the Exercises.

¹³ Cf. GARCÍA HIRSCHFELD, CARLOS. "Origen de la comunidad en la Compañía de Jesús. Una experiencia humana y religiosa en un grupo universitario del siglo XVI", *Manresa* – 248-9, 1991, p. 394.

Ignacio ha conocido ambientes “seculares” de alto rango (Loyola, Arévalo, Nájera, Valladolid); ha recorrido parte de Europa a pie; ha conocido otros dos centros universitarios de gran prestigio europeo (Alcalá y Salamanca); ha visitado Tierra Santa con todas las dificultades y los elementos propios de una peregrinación de la época; ha sufrido tres procesos inquisitoriales con estancias en la cárcel incluidas; ha acompañado a gente y dado ejercicios...¹⁴

Besides the long duration of companionship along with the two fundamental factors mentioned above there were other reasons for the perseverance of the group. These would include the fact that they spent time to converse with one another, participated in the sacraments of confession and Holy Communion, engaged in similar studies, frequently met to share a meal in the lodging of one of the companions, shared expenses and slowly began to be united in their desires to dedicate themselves in a life of apostolic service in poverty and humility. These were the factors that united the companions and led them to pronounce their vows on the 15th of August, 1534 in Montmartre. Polanco speaking of the vows and lifestyle during this period would say...

Ahora estos compañeros determinados como es dicho, estando ahí Iñigo se establecieron en su propósito y conservaron en este modo. Primeramente todos ellos hicieron *voto* en Sta. Maria de Monte Martyrum *de dedicarse al servicio del Señor en perpetua pobreza. Y cada año, el día* de Sta. María de Agosto, confirmaban *este* su *voto*, yendo allá todos juntos, después de se haber confesado y comunicado. El 2º medio era de la conversación de unos con otros, juntándose no sólo el día de la confirmación, pero *entre año*, aunque ellos vivían en diversas partes, ahora en *casa de uno*, ahora *de otro*, comiendo juntos en caridad y tratándose: donde nacía mucho amor de unos para otros, y ayudándose y escalentándose unos a otros en lo temporal, ultra de lo espiritual de virtudes y letras, porque quién dellos abundaba en lo uno, quién en lo otro. El 3º medio era de frecuentar los Santos Sacramentos de confesión y comunión. El 4º de la oración a que se daban, y del mismo estudio, que era de cosas sacras, en el cual todos se aprovecharon no poco, con la divina ayuda, enderezándolos todos a gloria de Dios y ayuda de los prójimos.¹⁵

The above mentioned text from Polanco indicates that the group that was being formed in Paris engaged in a great deal of deliberation. They spent a lot of time with one another and in the decision making process the entire community was involved to a greater or lesser degree. The time spent together helped them to grow under Ignatius' guidance towards a life of apostolic service. This charism was rooted in a spiritual

¹⁴ GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. “Los primeros...”, p. 264.

¹⁵ FN – I, p. 184.

experience of Ignatius and subsequently of the other companions and manifested itself in total adherence to Christ. ¹⁶ Their deliberations in Paris manifested itself in apostolic solidarity, openness to the Spirit and mutual support and inspiration for one another.¹⁷

The collective dimension of their deliberations is seen in the writings of the first companions. Ignatius would underline the collective process in relation to their future by the use of phrases such as ‘they had all determined what they would do...’[Au-86]. Faber would indicate that the same attitude prevailed and this can be seen in the narration related to the vows where he said that ‘*todos tenemos la misma determinación...*’¹⁸ Polanco as seen in the earlier quote would also point to the same attitude when he said that ‘*ahora estos compañeros determinados como es dicho.*’¹⁹

For the companions the method of ‘Deliberations’ was integral to their way of proceeding from the period at Paris. This would be articulated in a concrete manner during the vows of Montmartre.²⁰ Such was the import of this event that the companions would repeat it the following years.²¹ This event was symbolic because it helped form a common desire²² and at the same time indicated an apostolic discernment which was not rigid but radical and open. The process emerged from openness to one another wherein they listened to their own call and the call that was experienced by others. ²³ Though they came from diverse backgrounds with different personalities and

¹⁶ GARCÍA HIRSCHFELD, CARLOS. “Origen de la comunidad...”, p. 395. ‘*La manera cómo evoluciona en Ignacio la idea de servicio, desde el servicio a una dama hasta el deseo de emular a los santos, escapa al propósito de lo que actualmente intentamos. Pero sí habría que resaltar que en la experiencia espiritual de Ignacio la manera cómo vive su amor y su adhesión a Jesucristo estará en el origen de ese deseo de servicio que mueve su vida.*’

¹⁷ KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. “En el 450 aniversario de los votos de Montmartre”, *Selección de escritos (1983-1990)*, Provincia de España de la Compañía de Jesús: Madrid, 1992, p. 35.

¹⁸ *En el Corazón de la Reforma – Recuerdos espirituales» del Beato Pedro Fabro, SJ*, (Ed. Alburquerque, Antonio), Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2000, p. 118.

¹⁹ FN – I, p. 184.

²⁰ The number of companions who took the vows would be 10 (including Ignatius), though the group consisted of 12 to 14 persons. (Cf. FI - 1, pp. 100, 102.) ‘*Y entre otros, al tiempo de la partida del P. M.º Ignatio de París, que fue acabado su estudio, porque la tierra le era contraria a su estómago, serían hasta 14 ó 12 los compañeros de París,... Pero destes, dos se hicieron frailes... (y de) los otros, que fueron 9, quedamos en París a cumplir los estudios...*’

²¹ GARCÍA HIRSCHFELD, CARLOS. “Origen de la comunidad...”, p. 401.

²² Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. “Los primeros...”, p. 269.

²³ Cf. KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. “En el 450...”, pp. 34-35.

temperaments, it did not stop them from being united in desire and will to follow a Christ poor and humble.²⁴ The process of participating in the deliberations that led to the vows at Montmartre would have gone a long way in bringing about a union of desire, will and spirit.

7.2.2 VOWS AT MONTMARTRE

The vows at Montmartre are indicative of how Ignatius and the first companions were learning the art of deliberating in order to know the will of God. As they grew in learning to know the will of God, there was a corresponding emptying indicating a growing humility. Ignatius and the companions realized that the awareness and fulfillment of the will of God was not an individual enterprise, but required the participation of others. They also realized that it was only within an ecclesial context that they could be more faithful to God's will. Their process of self-emptying and a growing attitude of humility would be crucial in deliberating with his other companions leading to the vows on the 15th of August, 1534.

The vows as indicated from the accounts of Laínez, Polanco and Ignatius show us how the process of deliberation was becoming more subtle. They help us better understand the importance of having an attitude of humility and self-emptying in order to be more faithful to the will of God. This will be seen in the formulation of the vows at Montmartre wherein without compromising their central spiritual desire, they grew in having a more conducive attitude towards collectively knowing and fulfilling the will of God. The attitude of the community in future would be characterized by one of prayerful reflection and humility.²⁵

The three earliest texts which speak of the vows at Montmartre are those of

²⁴ The desire to follow Christ as experienced by the companions was similar to that of Ignatius. It was mediated through the Spiritual Exercises. (Cf. GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. "Los primeros...", p. 266) However though we can be certain that Ignatius was guiding them towards this Christological experience (Cf. KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. "En el 450...", p. 33.) it was a free and voluntary desire of each one to be part of this common endeavor.

²⁵ Cf. GARCÍA HIRSCHFELD, CARLOS. "Origen de la comunidad...", p. 400. '*Toda situación comunitaria, en adelante, será preparada en un clima de oración, de búsqueda desinteresada y humilde. Puesto que están decididos a "ir adelante" necesitan fortalecerse interiormente.*'

Láinez, Polanco and the Autobiography.²⁶ The three texts indicate the fact that the decision to take the vows was a collective exercise. The text of the *Autobiography* [85] clearly shows the communitarian process through the use of two phrases – ‘*ya habían decidido*’ and ‘*habían determinado también*’. Láinez [36] would use the phrase ‘*nuestra intención*’ three times. These phrases clearly point to a process of deliberation which was followed in order to know the will of God and accordingly take a decision. Polanco would go further and his text would indicate a convergence of desire as well as the fact that they had even voted during their deliberations when he used the following phrases; ‘*ellos entonces parece tenían más especial inclinación*’ and ‘*en caso que no pudiesen pasar, votaron de representarse al papa...*’

Speaking of the vows,²⁷ we find that the first vow referred to a life of poverty wherein they dedicated themselves to helping souls. While the text of the *Autobiography* is conspicuous by an absence about the vow of poverty, the text of Láinez shows an inherent progress. While this part of the text [30] is part of the narration that refers to the period in Paris, the subsequent number [36] refers to the period in Italy. As they are in Italy, they recall the vows of Paris and it is here that the vow of poverty is presented in a qualified manner. Poverty is understood in the context of serving God and one’s neighbor. It is made more specific by highlighting the ministries of preaching and serving in hospitals.²⁸

²⁶ An important source for us is the testimony of Simon Rodrigues. However we have decided to limit ourselves to the earliest texts. Despite being a posterior text, Rodrigues gives us a detailed account of the vows at Montmartre. His explanation regarding the desire of the companions and the communitarian process of coming to a decision indicates clearly that Deliberations were already part of the way of life within the group. It also offers us an account of the points which were apparently decided unanimously and the differences in the group regarding the Jerusalem project. (Cf. *Simón Rodrigues – Origen y Progreso de la Compañía de Jesús*, (Ed. Alonso Romo, Eduardo Javier), Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2005, pp. 55-59.)

²⁷ The texts available to us make reference to poverty and the journey to Jerusalem. No mention however is made of the vow of chastity. Though this vow is not formally included in the text ‘*it is clear that all were resolved to observe it. At least Ignatius and Favre had made the vow of chastity in a private form. All promised it in 1537 before their priestly ordination.*’ (DE DALMASES, CÁNIDO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 121.)

²⁸ The flexibility that the process of Deliberations can be seen in the way they dealt with the vow of poverty. Keeping in mind the importance of studies for their future apostolic endeavours they decided that the vow of poverty would not be applicable as long as they were students and until they had returned from Jerusalem. (Cf. GARCÍA HIRSCHFELD, CARLOS. “Origen de la comunidad...”, p. 400.)

Laínez	Polanco	Autobiography
<p>[30] ... haber hecho voto de dedicarse al servicio del Señor, en pobreza, comenzando desde el tiempo dicho;...</p> <p>[36] Y porque nuestra intención (era) dedicarse en pobreza al servicio de Dios nuestro Señor y al provecho del próximo, predicando y sirviendo en hospitales, etc.;</p>	<p>[55]...todos ellos hicieron voto... de dedicarse al servicio del Señor en perpetua pobreza...</p>	---

While the vow of poverty seems to be rather clear in terms of its scope, the vow of going to Jerusalem would be rather complicated. Let us first look at the texts:

Laínez	Polanco	Autobiography
<p>[36] ... hicimos voto algunos años antes que nos partiésemos para executar nuestra intención, de andar, si pudiésemos, a los pies del Papa, Vicario de Cristo, y demandarle licencia para ir a Hierusalem; y si hubiese oportunidad, para quedar allá aprovechándonos, si nuestro Señor fuese servido, y a otros fieles o infieles; y si no hubiese oportunidad de ir allá a Hierusalem dentro de un año, o yendo, de quedar allá, explicamos en el voto que no era nuestra intención obligarnos, más a ir, sino tornar al Papa y hacer su obediencia, andando donde nos mandase.</p>	<p>[55]... A lo que ellos entonces parece tenían más especial inclinación, era a pasar en Jerusalem, y después predicar, si hubiese lugar, a los infieles, o morir por la fe de Jesucristo entre ellos. Y así hicieron todos voto de ir a Hierusalem (si dentro de un año después de llegados podían pasar allá), a donde pensaban encomendarse a Dios para determinarse qué debían hacer, no sabiendo lo que Dios quería allá; y a esto último más se inclinaban. En caso que no pudiesen pasar, votaron de representarse al papa, como Vicario de Cristo, para que su Santidad los enviase donde pensase que sería Dios más servido.</p>	<p>[85] Por este tiempo ya habían decidido lo que iban a hacer: ir a Venecia y a Jerusalén y allí gastar su vida en provecho de las almas, y si no obtuvieran el permiso para permanecer en Jerusalén, volverían a Roma y se presentarían ante el Vicario de Cristo par que los emplease donde considerase que fuese mayor gloria de Dios y provecho de las almas. Habían determinado también, que esperarían un año la embarcación en Venecia, y que si aquel año no salían naves para Levante, quedarían libres del voto de Jerusalén y se presentarían al Papa, etc.</p>

The vow details the plan of the first companions to go to Jerusalem, while allowing for later eventualities. The details indicate various factors and these include:

- a. The decision to go to Jerusalem as a unanimous one
- b. The aim of this vows not merely personal devotion, but was taken with a view to helping souls – both Christians and non-Christians
- c. Only on the condition that they were granted permission, would they stay on in Jerusalem

- d. They decided on a time frame in order to execute this plan – 1 year
- e. In the eventuality of not being able to remain in Jerusalem, they decide to come back and offer themselves to the Roman Pontiff.²⁹

Besides the above mentioned points we find three specific points related to the methodology and these include the need for unanimity, flexibility and the importance of ecclesiastical approval.³⁰ While the vow of going to Jerusalem indicated various facets of this emerging group as seen in the points mentioned above, we would like to highlight three specific points.

In the first place it was centered on Christ and the Christocentric spirituality is obvious from their desire to go to Jerusalem. Secondly they were oriented towards a specific form of mission and this could be seen in their desire to help souls, both Christian and non-Christian without fear of losing their lives. Thirdly the dimension of obedience considered the role of the Vicar of Christ as vital for the group. The centrality of the Roman Pontiff in the very existence, direction and confirmation of the group is revealed in these vows. While various interpretations could be made regarding the points highlighted so far, let us limit our focus on the elements that concern the central theme of this paper –the process of self-emptying love and humility.

7.2.3 EVIDENCE OF COLLECTIVE SELF-EMPTYING LOVE AND HUMILITY

The vows reveal a significant advance in the process of self-emptying both at an individual and collective level. The first seven companions who took the vows in 1534

²⁹ The importance of the Roman Pontiff in terms of their mission to save souls is evident from the fact that they decided that on their return they would not continue as a group of friends as before, but would place themselves at the disposal of the Pope. They have given up their will or they have self-emptied themselves of their own wills and desire that Christ through his vicar on earth use them to take forward His mission.

³⁰ The importance of highlighting the methodology is due to the fact that this method would become more refined during the Deliberations of 1539. The first point related to unanimity where unanimity need not be understood merely from a legalistic point of view but that they were united in mind and heart. This unanimity of desire was the consequence of a long drawn process and involved three dimensions which were Christocentric, sacramental and ecclesial. The second point related to the fact that one needed to be flexible and open to the inspiration of the Spirit. This is seen in their flexibility in matters of poverty wherein they qualified it as not being applicable as long as they were engaged in studies or made the journey to Jerusalem. As time went by they would be more and more convinced that discernment consisted in living the tension of concrete decisions, but at the same time being open to the promptings of the Spirit. The third point consists in the desire for ecclesiastical approval because through it they could be more certain of being faithful to the will of God.

experienced a process of self-emptying. Through the vows of poverty, they had given up the careers which they hoped to pursue when they first arrived in Paris. They had also given up their family and possessions in order to follow this new way of life. The decision not to join any other religious order would result in greater trust and confidence in God.³¹ Though they were inclined to go to Jerusalem, they gave up their freedom by leaving the final decision to the Roman Pontiff. Thus as a group, they were emptying themselves of their ambitions, affective links to their family, the possibility of acclaim for their academic achievements and any apparent secure future by deciding not to join any new religious order.

The vows also reveal a progressive growth in the attitude of humility. They realized that each one of them was not self-sufficient and needed the assistance of other members of the group. Besides material matters, they also realized that their individuality was meaningful only by being open to others and sharing in the lives of other companions.³² The various texts indicated earlier reveal their activities as a group. A regular and intense sacramental life as well as a firsthand knowledge of the social and historical situation of the Church would further help them grow in their attitude of humility. It must be pointed out that in the process of being able to deliberate and collectively make a choice of take the vows, the personality of Ignatius was important. He helped form a cohesive group and led them through the experience of Spiritual Exercises aiding them in making a total self-offering of themselves for the Eternal King and His Kingdom.

This process was not quick, but slow and through these slow halting steps they would experientially learn to have the attitude of the third degree of humility or the third degree of love. This experience would be institutionalized in the Formula of the Institute and the Constitutions. During the period in Paris, through their contact with Ignatius and subsequently through the Spiritual Exercises their eyes of understanding

³¹ FI -I, p. 185. *'...siendo como eran personas de letras y entendimiento, estar así inciertos y suspensos, no era sin gran providencia de Dios que, sin ellos saberlo, los guardaba para tanto grande obra de su servicio y gloria.'*

³² Cf. KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. "En el 450...", p. 35.

would be slowly opened.³³ They would experience the love of God, in Christ poor and humble and would be transformed to such an extent that they would ardently desire to imitate and follow Christ by participating in His laboring love.

The import of this moment and the joy that it generated in the first companions would be immense. They had experienced great joy in emptying themselves for the sake of Christ and would return to reiterate the vows the following years. Despite the fact that Ignatius was not with them, the spirit of the vows of Montmartre would continue to animate the group. The practice of deliberations would continue to be present in their decision to leave for Venice and later on during their sojourn in Italy wherein they would have to take important decisions keeping in mind the unique historical situations that would be encountered.

7.3 'DELIBERATIONS' IN ITALY

The general sentiment among the companions was that of joy for having participated in a process of deliberation and having collectively discerned the will of God.³⁴ They had decided to leave Paris on the 25th of January, 1537 for Venice but had to anticipate their journey because war had broken out between Charles V and Francis I in August 1536.³⁵ Despite various hardships, they were full of joy and enthusiasm.³⁶ They spent time in 'silent prayer alternated with the singing of psalms and spiritual conversations.'³⁷ After a journey of fifty-four days they reached Venice on January 8th, 1537.

During the period between January 1537 and March 1539, there would be three

³³ Cf. KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. "En el 450...", p. 33.

³⁴ Cf. *Simón Rodrigues – Origen y ...*, p. 63. '...de esta manera salieron de París, entregados y confiados en la gracia y providencia de Dios, con tanto alborozo y gozo espiritual que parecía que no ponían los pies sobre la tierra...'

³⁵ They were advised by their well-wishers to refrain from the journey, but they persisted in their decision and left in two groups. They came together at Meaux and decided to continue the journey to Venice. During this journey they came across soldiers, persons who had left Catholicism and faced physical hardships.

³⁶ *IBID*, p. 66. 'Dos o tres días después de la salida de Meaux, llenos de inmenso fervor y de gran alegría por el viaje iniciado...'. In the same number Rodrigues speaks about the failed attempt of two persons to dissuade one of the companions from continuing. As the two left the companion, Rodrigues once again refers to joy and enthusiasm. '...como los dos no consiguieron desviar al padre de su propósito, así tampoco consiguió él desviarlos de su forma de vida. Con gran dolor, acaban dejando al padre y vuelven a París, mientras los compañeros prosiguen con entusiasmo su camino.' *IBID*, p. 67.

³⁷ DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 143.

important moments of deliberations wherein they would have to make a choice vis-a-vis their future. The first in January 1537, consisted in deciding to serve in hospitals until they could make the journey to Jerusalem; the second in May 1537, would be to continue serving the sick and preparing themselves for their first Mass because of the unavailability of any ship and the third in September 1537, would be to spread themselves to various universities of Italy.³⁸ We can also presume that there would have been moments of deliberation among the companions when they faced the persecution of Mudarra and others during the year 1538.

7.3.1 VENICE – FIRST DELIBERATIONS AND HUMBLE SERVICE OF THE SICK

The first deliberation took place as soon as they arrived in Venice. They had more than two months at their disposal³⁹ and hence they deliberated as to what they ought to do. All the early writings indicate that it was a collective decision that they would devote themselves to the service of the sick. A textual analysis reveals the deliberation that took place. The various phrases which are used are as follows: “*nos dividimos*”,⁴⁰ “*se dividieron para servir*” (Au.-93), “*repartiéronse por los hospitals*”,⁴¹ “*determinaron de repartirse por los hospitals*”⁴² and “*determinaron gastar este tiempo, parte en seroer a pobres en algunos hospitals y parte en ir a Roma a recibir la bendición del Papa*”.⁴³ While Laínez, Polanco and the Autobiography do not use the word ‘determine’, the texts of Ribadeneira and Simon Rodrigues includes the same.

Ribadeneira in developing this decision would indicate as to how it was the beginning of the tradition within the Society⁴⁴ to take up low and humble tasks and this would be institutionalized in the General Examen as well as the Constitutions. The

³⁸ Cf. GARCÍA HIRSCHFELD, CARLOS. “Origen de la comunidad...”, pp. 403-04.

³⁹ They arrived on the 8th of January and only on the 16th of March would they leave for Rome.

⁴⁰ FN – I, p. 110.

⁴¹ FN – I, p. 190.

⁴² RIBADENEYRA, PEDRO DE. *Vida de Ignacio de Loyola*, Espasa-Calpe: Madrid, 1967, p. 84. (3rd. ed.)

⁴³ Cf. *Simón Rodrigues – Origen y ...*, p. 75.

⁴⁴ RIBADENEYRA, PEDRO DE. *Vida de Ignacio...*, p. 84. ‘*Aquí comenzaron a ejercitarse con singular caridad y diligencia en los más bajos y viles oficios que había, y a consolar y ayudar a los pobres en todo lo que tocaba a la salud de sus almas y de sus cuerpos, con tanto ejemplo de humildad y menosprecio del mundo...*’

decision of five of them to go to the hospital of Sts. John and Paul and the others to the hospital of the Incurables in order to serve the sick indicates a group which ardently desired to live and experience the third degree of humility. They were well accomplished masters from Paris and had before them the possibility of engaging in a variety of activities such as preaching, going into a secluded place for prayer, studying, etc. However the choice of working in the hospitals is indicative of the enormous importance that was attached to conserving and growing in the attitude of humility. It would be this same attitude that would inspire them to make the journey to Rome in poverty in order to get the permission of the Pope.

7.3.2 VENICE – SECOND DELIBERATIONS AND A LIFE OF POVERTY

The second moment of deliberation took place after the companions had returned to Venice by the 31st of May, and participated in the feast of the Corpus Christi.⁴⁵ However during the year 1537 not a single ship sailed for the Holy Land and thus there was no possibility of fulfilling the vow that year. By the 24th of June, seven of the companions were ordained to the priesthood and decided to disperse in the cities around Venice in order to assemble quickly if any opportunity should arise.⁴⁶ All of them had the faculty to celebrate their first Mass any day after the 5th of July. It is at this time that the second important deliberation would take place in Italy and this consisted in going to some solitary place in order to prepare for their first Mass and at the same time wait until the pre-determined period of one year lapsed.⁴⁷

Going by the textual accounts of the first companions we can see that the deliberations consisted in ensuring that they prepared themselves well for their First Mass. The *Autobiography* makes no mention of the deliberation that took place and only

⁴⁵ Hirschfeld would consider the second moment of deliberations as taking place in May 1537. According to him the companions deliberated and decided to wait a year more to see if they could make the pilgrimage to Jerusalem. However considering the confusion regarding the interpretation of the vow to wait for a year, and doubts regarding the intensity of the deliberations we have not developed it as a separate point of the deliberations.

⁴⁶ DE DALMASES, CÁNIDIDO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, pp. 146-47.

⁴⁷ The fact that the companions agreed to wait '*acordaron de esperar*' is only highlighted by Ribadeneira, while the other early writers only indicate that the vow taken in Paris was confirmed by the companions. During this period they continued to be involved in apostolic activities. (*FN – I*, p. 118.; *FN – I*, p. 193.)

indicates that the companions dispersed themselves in the region around Venice (Au-94). However other accounts of the early companions contains phrases that reflect the deliberations and they are as follows: “...porque con los pobres teníamos que hacer, y no nos pos podíamos así preparar de decir la prima misa, acordamos de salir de Venecia,...”; “...y para aparejarse mejor y llegar con mayor reverencia al sacrosanto sacrificio de la misa..., determinaron de apartarse y recogerse todos...” (Ribadeneira, p. 86) and finally Simon Rodriguez would say that “Mientras tanto, determinaron recogerse durante tres meses poco más o menos en algunos lugares solitarios, de dos en dos o de tres en tres, para en ellos, mediante la oración y la meditación, prepararse para decir sus primeras misas”⁴⁸

They looked for places that would offer them solitude in order to prepare themselves for their first Mass.⁴⁹ Desiring to imitating Jesus who spent 40 days in the desert before he began his public ministry, they too decided to spend a similar time in solitude.⁵⁰ During this period their way of life was consonant with the desire to live a life of poverty and humility. Ribadeneira in narrating their way of life in the hermitage would say:

Estaba esta ermita en el campo, fuera de la ciudad, y había quedado así yerma y mal parada del tiempo de la guerra que no muchos años antes se había hecho en aquella tierra. Aquí se recogieron, y para no perecer del frío y humedad, metieron un poco de paja, y sobre ésta dormían en el suelo. Salían dos veces al día a pedir limosna a la ciudad; pero era tan poco el socorro que hallaban, que apenas tornaban a su pobre ermita con tanto pan que les bastase a sustentar la vida, y cuando hallaban un poquito de aceite o de manteca (que era muy raras veces) lo tenían por muy gran regalo. Quedábase el uno de los compañeros en la ermitilla para mojar los mendrugos de pan duros y mohosos que le trían y para cocerlos en un poco de agua, de manera que se pudiesen comer,...⁵¹

They continued imitating Christ’s public ministry and went out to preach when

⁴⁸ An interesting comment by Simon Rodrigues in this process of deliberation is the system of lots. Once the decision had been made and possible solitary places had been found, they used lots in order to decide the places that each one of them would be going. (Cf. *Simón Rodrigues – Origen y ...*, p. 90.)

⁴⁹ They also inquired from others regarding the availability of such places in the vicinity of Venice. “y para este fin tomaron información de personas que conocían bien aquella tierra sobre algunos lugares solitarios y conformes a lo que pretendían...” (Cf. *IBID.*)

⁵⁰ Cf. GARCÍA-VILLOSLADA, RICARDO. *San Ignacio de Loyola...*, p. 428. He would indicate that it was not a decision taken by Ignatius unilaterally, but a collective decision. “...les vino al pensamiento la idea de imitar a Cristo en retirarse 40 días a la soledad.”

⁵¹ RIBADENEYRA, PEDRO DE. *Vida de Ignacio...*, p. 87.

they had completed 40 days of solitude, prayer and contemplation. They were joined by Codure and then they began preaching in the plazas of the town inviting people to a conversion.⁵² In this way they began their public ministry in a manner which was akin to that of Jesus who after he had spent 40 days in the desert began his public ministry. (*Mt. 4,1-17; Mk. 1,1-15; Lk.4, 1-19*) Ribadeneira speaking of the public ministry of the companions would indicate that though they were not fluent in Italian, they exhorted the people to a conversion of heart leading to great spiritual fruit.⁵³

The companions have been growing in an experiential knowledge of the joy and fulfillment of a life of poverty and humility. Through such a life, they experienced greater imitation of Christ poor and humble and such an imitation would go on to become the foundational charism of the Society of Jesus. The small hermitage of San Pietro in Vivarolo which was in a dilapidated state without doors and windows was a humble setting wherein the companions hoped to spend their time of solitude. The humble lodging along with inclement weather and the frugal meals made their life rather difficult. Paradoxically the humble settings and hardships that they experience was in contrast to the joy that they experienced during this period.

This was a period of great consolation and Ignatius recalling this period would say that,

Durante aquel tiempo que estuvo en Vicenza, tuvo muchas visiones espirituales y muchas casi ordinarias consolaciones, lo contrario de cuando estuvo en París; sobre todo cuando empezó a prepararse para el sacerdocio en Venecia y para decir misa. Durante todos aquellos viajes tuvo grandes visitaciones espirituales, como aquellas que había tenido estando en Manresa." (*Au – 95*)

Ribadeneira would highlight the consolations during this period when he indicated that Ignatius rarely left the hermitage during this period because of the immense tears of consolation that he received.

"...Ignacio el que de ordinario se quedaba a hacer este oficio, porque de la abundancia de

⁵² IBID.

⁵³ IBID.

lágrimas que de continuo derramaba tenía casi perdida la vista de los ojos, y no podía sin detrimento de ellos salir al sol y al aire.”⁵⁴ (Rib., p. 87)

Ignatius along with the companions through their lives were imitating Christ poor and humble. Their own experience helped them understand albeit with halting steps the mystery of participating in the mystery of God through a life of humility and poverty. The joy that they experienced moved them to further desire the same through a radical imitation of Christ. This led them to start preaching after 40 days of solitude. We can well imagine that their lack of knowledge vis-à-vis Italian⁵⁵ would have made them a laughing stock among the crowds. However their knowledge, devotion and enthusiasm would have edified the crowds. We see here a clear reference to the third degree of humility wherein the love of Christ led them to joyously desire and embrace humiliations and insults.

7.3.3 VICENZA – THIRD DELIBERATION AND OBEDIENCE

The third moment of deliberation would take place around October 1537 at Vicenza when the companions were reunited. The small hermitage in its dilapidated state was where they met to deliberate.⁵⁶ By this time all the companions, with the exception of Ignatius and another companion had celebrated their first Mass. Since there was no possibility to go to the Jerusalem that year because the ships sailed in June, they deliberated in order to decide on their future course of action. They decided to divide themselves and go to different universities of Italy with the twin purpose of getting young university students to join them and also to ‘observe whether any focus of Lutheranism was forming in these centers.’⁵⁷

⁵⁴ RIBADENEYRA, PEDRO DE. *Vida de Ignacio...*, p. 87.

⁵⁵ IBID., p. 88. ‘Y sin duda, quien entonces mirara el lenguaje de aquellos padres no hallara en él sino toscas y groseras palabras, que como todos eran extranjeros y tan recién llegados a Italia, y se daban tan poco al estudio de las palabras, era necesario que ellas fuesen una como mezcla de diversas lenguas...’

⁵⁶ “A fines de setiembre convocó a todos sus compañeros... Quería comunicársela a sus compañeros y al mismo tiempo deliberar con ellos sobre lo que deberían hacer mientras se cumplía el año de espera de la navegación. No es fácil imaginar, cómo pudieron todos acomodarse en aquel mísero y destartalado eremitorio, sin puertas ni ventanas, de San Pietro in Vivarolo. Pero ...allí se establecieron para orar y deliberar.” (Cf. GARCÍA-VILLOSLADA, RICARDO. *San Ignacio de Loyola ...*, p. 431.)

⁵⁷ DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 149.

Most of the early companions speaking of this period in Vicenza would use the word deliberations. Four of the first companions indicated the process by using phrases such as '*decidieron ir a Roma*' (Au. – 96); '*deliberamos de repartinos*';⁵⁸ '*determinaron de repartirse*'⁵⁹ and '*determinaron los Padres*'⁶⁰. Ribadeneira explaining the deliberations in detail says:

En esta junta que aquí hicieron, acordaron que, pues la esperanza de ir a Jerusalén se les iba cada día acabando más, se repartiesen por las universidades más insignes de Italia, donde estaba la flor de los buenos ingenios despertar algunos mancebos hábiles, de los muchos que en las universidades se suelen criar, y traerlos al mismo instituto de vida que ellos seguían en beneficio de sus prójimos; y con este fin, a la entrada del invierno, repartieron entre sí las universidades de Italia de esta manera...⁶¹

7.3.3.1 Two important decisions at Vicenza

Two important decisions of the companions during these deliberations are important for understand the growing humility within the group. The first related to obedience towards one member and the second to the identity of the group wherein they decided to call themselves 'the company of Jesus.'

The group decided to go to Rome, Bologna, Sienna, Ferrara and Padua and decided to obey one of their own companion who would serve as superior during this period. Ribadeneira speaking of the arrangements says, '*La manera de su gobierno era éste: a semanas tenían cargo el uno del otro, de manera que el que esta semana obedecía, mandaba la siguiente.*'⁶² Simon Rodriguez would also make mention of this decision when speaking about this period when he said,

...en esas ermitas o lugares solitarias, por primera vez, comenzaron los padres a querer virir en obediencia, aunque voluntaria. Mientras andaban de dos en dos o de tres en tres, uno era superior del otro durante una semana, y guardaban esta voluntaria obediencia

⁵⁸ FN – I, p. 120.

⁵⁹ FN – I, p. 194.

⁶⁰ *Simón Rodríguez – Origen y ...*, p. 93. During these deliberations all the companions were not present because two of them were sick and had to be hospitalized. These included Francis Xavier and Simon Rodríguez and despite the fact that they were not present, the decision taken by the others would be binding on them too. (Cf. GARCÍA-VILLOSLADA, RICARDO. *San Ignacio de Loyola ...*, p. 431.)

⁶¹ RIBADENEYRA, PEDRO DE. *Vida de Ignacio...*, p. 90.

⁶² IBID.

con tanta veneración como si hubieran hecho voto de ella.⁶³

During this period they also decided on the name by which they would refer to themselves – the company of Jesus. The centrality of Christ in their life was reflected in the decision by the group to have none other than Christ as their head and they understood their personal and collective vocations as being merely in the service of the Eternal King. Polanco narrates the Deliberations of Vicenza in the following manner:

El nombre es la Compañía de Jesús, y tomóse este nombre antes que llegasen a Roma, que tratando entre si cómo se llamarían a quien les pidiese qué congregación era esta suya, que era de nueve o diez personas, comenzaron a darse a la oración y pensar qué nombre sería más conveniente; y visto que no tenían cabeza ninguna entre sí, ni otro propósito sino a Jesucristo, a quien sólo deseaban servir, parecióles que tomasen nombre del que tenían por cabeza, diciéndose la Compañía de Jesús"⁶⁴

The deliberation to decide on the name of Jesus as the title of the group provides insights into their way of functioning. The orientation of the group was Christocentric and their conversation and reflections were within a prayerful atmosphere.

Ignatius was the natural leader of the group but was respectful towards the opinions of others and allowed them to participate as equals in the deliberation. The process of decision making at Vicenza indicates their intense desire to follow Christ poor and humble by having the same attitude towards one another within the group.

7.3.3.2 Humility as reflected in the deliberations

The lifestyle of the companions in Vicenza was one of poverty and humility. The hermitage was symbolic of the life they desired to lead and the vulnerability and discomfort experienced by them allowed them to share in the humility of Christ. The decision to go to the universities reinforced the dimension of humility. They understood that the mission they desired to engage in could not be achieved by only a small group of friends. Genuine discipleship consisted in going beyond a superficial manifestation of humility and expressed itself through openness towards others. Their concern regarding

⁶³ *Simón Rodrigues – Origen y...*, pp. 91-92.

⁶⁴ *FN- I*, pp. 203-204.

false teachings and errors in the universities led them to realize in all humility that the Church that they were called to serve was not primarily a triumphant and perfect reality, but one which was in need of constant reformation. In their obedience to a member of the group, they gave themselves up in humble submission to the will of another. Finally in their decision to have no other name but that of Christ they expressed their desire to no longer live for themselves, but live and die for Christ who became a poor and humble person for our salvation.

These are the important moments of deliberations as seen in the period preceding the Deliberations of 1539. They indicate an evolving process wherein the first companions grew in an experiential knowledge of collectively knowing the will of God. The three moments of deliberations that have been elaborated in this section are not exclusive in nature. We can safely assume that there were other moments when the companions engaged in deliberations. Two moments have been briefly indicated at an earlier stage: the decision to wait until June, 1538 in order to go to Jerusalem and the decision to return the bills of exchange on realizing that they could not go to the Jerusalem. There are enough indications that the group did deliberate before taking a decision. A third moment would have been the response to the persecution unleashed due to the calumnies of Mudarra in 1538.

The life of Ignatius reveals a transition from being rooted in self-love towards a life that emptied itself for others. Within this transition there were two stages. In the first stage, he moved from being self-centered towards helping souls primarily by individual effort.⁶⁵ A second shift would take place with a more communitarian approach where the will of God was discovered and fulfilled in a collective manner. This second shift would be more prominent during the final years in Paris and the initial years in Italy. This would culminate with the heights of mysticism during his final years

⁶⁵ The self-sufficiency that characterized Ignatius's life would be questioned during his experience in Loyola where the apparent pleasure of self-love would gently but definitely give way to a desire of an other-centered love which would result in joy, peace and contentment. Though he had surrendered himself to the gratuitous love of God his world view was still limited towards understanding his identity in terms of a one-to-one relations with Christ. The outflow of this relationship was revealed in his efforts to 'help souls' on an individual basis.

in Rome.⁶⁶

The collective dimension through which one participated in God's salvific plan was slowly but surely being learnt by Ignatius. Within this process of spiritual growth, the attitude of humility continued to have a foundational and transversal significance. This would be confirmed in the Deliberations of 1539 where Ignatius and his companions would learn how humility was a necessary precondition in order to discover and faithfully fulfill the will of God.

7.4 THE DELIBERATIONS OF 1539

The Deliberations of 1539 is a group of three documents which contain the deliberations of the first companions. These include the *Deliberatio Primorum Patrum, De obedientiae voto fciendo* and *Determinationes Societatis*.⁶⁷ They provide firsthand information of the deliberations that took place during a period of three months from March 1539 to June 1539. It indicates how Ignatius and his companions went through a process of discernment in order to found the Society of Jesus.⁶⁸

This section shall begin with some general facts of the Deliberations such as the actual date, authorship and intent. Further on we shall speak about the general context within which the Deliberations were held as well as the precipitating cause. After the introductory section we shall look at the methodology that was adopted and this will be followed by the content that makes up the Deliberations. Finally this section will conclude with some remarks vis-à-vis the dimension of humility and the institutionalization of a foundational experience of Ignatius and the companions.

⁶⁶ It could be said that both these stages are important and valued in the spiritual process. However the second stage reflects a more profound degree of spiritual maturity. As indicated in the preceding footnote, the first stage can be better understood within the realm of a Christocentric perspective, while the second stage is more Trinitarian in nature. These two stages are not mutually exclusive, but complement each other. We shall elaborate more in the final conclusion of our work.

⁶⁷ MCo- I, pp. 1-14.

⁶⁸ Cf. CONWELL, JOSEPH. "Deliberaciones 1539", *DEI*, p. 549. '...describe es el proceso de discernimiento a través del cual Ignacio de Loyola y sus compañeros peregrinos decidieron fundar la CJ. Concretaron así de forma más precisa la naturaleza de la llamada de Dios a ponerse a disposición del Papa, y marchar donde él les enviase. Transformó un grupo de compañeros de estructura muy elemental, que reconocía solamente a Jesús como su cabeza, en una organización de estructura bien trabada.'

7.4.1 DATE AND AUTHORSHIP OF THE DELIBERATIONS

The exact date of the deliberations has been disputed because of varying dates in the accounts of Laynez, Polanco, Ribadeneira and Ignatius.⁶⁹ Lainez indicating this event would say, "*Pasado el año 37 y el principio del 38, después de la quaresma nos congregamos todos en Roma...*";⁷⁰ Polanco who depended a great deal on Láinez would say, "*Pasado el invierno, después de la cuaresma, año de 1538, se juntaron todos en Roma...*"⁷¹ Ribadeneira concurred with their view when he said, "*Después de haber movido los pueblos por donde habían andado, y despertado las gentes a la devoción y piedad, mediada cuaresma del año de mil quinientos y treinta y ocho todos los padres se vinieron a Roma, donde Ignacio estaba, y juntáronse en una casa...*"⁷² However the copy of the Deliberations indicates that the event took place in 1539 with the document commencing with the following: "*1539. En tres meses. El modo de ordenarse la Compañía.*"⁷³

Experts are more inclined to consider 1539 as the correct date because the dates of Lent, Holy Week and the period of Easter coincide with 1539. Besides, the persecution caused by Mudarra and others during 1538 would not have given them the conducive atmosphere necessary for the Deliberations. The fact that Láinez, Polanco and Ribadeneira date these Deliberations to 1538, indicate that they began this process before the 25th of March.⁷⁴ The process thus began towards the end of the season of Lent and was completed on 24th of June, the feast of John the Baptist.⁷⁵

There have been diverse opinions about the authorship of the Deliberations. We must recall that during this period, there were persons besides the eleven signatories of

⁶⁹ GONZÁLEZ, LUIS. "La deliberación de los primeros compañeros", *Manresa* - 240, 1989, p. 232.

⁷⁰ *FI - I*, p. 124.

⁷¹ *FN - I*, p. 197.

⁷² RIBADENEYRA, PEDRO DE. *Vida de Ignacio...*, pp. 95-96.

⁷³ *MCo.-I*, p. 1.

⁷⁴ The first day of the Julian calendar was the 25th of March, the day of the Annunciation. With the Gregorian calendar the first day changed to the 1st of January.

⁷⁵ The 25th of March was an important date for Ignatius and the companions. It was on this date in 1522 that Ignatius hung his sword and began a new way of life. Around the same time, the first companions began a new way of living their friendship by engaging in the Deliberations.

the documents of vows.⁷⁶ The presence of these persons indicates that they already had a small group of companions who lived with them, but were not yet part of the official group of companions. The text of the deliberations was written by a person who was part of the deliberations and the indications point to Juan Coduri, Peter Faber or Ignatius. While Luis Gonzalez maintains that it is written by Peter Faber,⁷⁷ Conwell is inclined to believe that all contributed to the Deliberations, but it was written by Coduri.⁷⁸ The manuscript available to us today reveals that it was written by Antonio Estrada who lived with them during this period. It is not a forgery but a copy of the original documents with the author trying to imitate the signatures of the first companions as well.⁷⁹

7.4.2 CAUSES FOR THE DELIBERATIONS

Two factors precipitated the Deliberations and these included the certainty that they would not be able to make the journey to Jerusalem as well as the petitions to the Pope who requested the services of the companions. By the 9th of January, 1539 they had already completed two years since their arrival in Italy and during those two years no boat sailed for Jerusalem. Hence it was evident to them that it was not the will of God that they make the journey to the Holy Land. On the other hand the calumnies had been investigated and sentence had been passed on the 18th of November declaring them innocent. Subsequently between the 18th and the 23rd of November, Ignatius and the companions offered themselves to the Pope.⁸⁰ Within a short time various requests from

⁷⁶ GONZÁLEZ, LUIS. "La deliberación de...", p. 236. Quoting Schurhammer on p. 227 he says: '*Los compañeros que se encontraban reunidos en Roma eran ya algunos más: Francisco de Rojas, Antonio Araoz, sobrino de Ignacio, Bartolomé Ferrao, Estrada. Pero en la Deliberación sólo tomaron parte los diez primeros que firmaron por este orden: Juan Coduri, Diego Láinez, Alfonso Salmerón, Nicolás de Bobadilla, Pascasio Bröet, Pedro Fabro, Francisco Javier, Ignacio de Loyola, Simón Rodríguez y Claudio Jayo. Se añade uno más, que firmará, por cierto, el primero, "Cáceres".*'

⁷⁷ IBID., p. 237. '*Por crítica interna me inclino más por Fabro, porque denota en su autor su espíritu muy observador, detallista, piadoso y con tendencia a interpretar benévolamente las actitudes de las personas y los sucesos.*'

⁷⁸ CONWELL, JOSEPH. "Deliberaciones...", p. 549. '*Todos los diez compañeros tomaron parte en el hecho y en la redacción del documento, aunque es posible que haya sido escrito por Juan Coduri.*'

⁷⁹ Cf. GONZÁLEZ, LUIS. "La deliberación de...", p. 237.

⁸⁰ *EppIgn - I*, p. 132. (Translated in *LI*, pp. 32-34.) In this letter Peter Faber in responding to Diego de Gouvea speak of why he cannot directly entertain the request to go to the Indies. He explains that the companions had already offered themselves to the Pope and further on indicates the reasons for the same. Later on he gives an account of the various

Kings, Cardinals and Bishops began to reach Pope Paul III requesting their services.⁸¹

Dalmases gives a brief account of some companions who had to leave:

During those days, some other companions, in addition to Broët and Rodrigues who were destined to Siena, had to leave Rome. According to the desires of Ennio Filionardi, called the cardinal of Sant' Angelo, apostolic legate in Parma and Piacenza, the pope had sent to these two cities Favre and Laínez, who departed on June 20. In July, Codure went to Velletri and Bobadilla to Naples.⁸²

The immediate context is highlighted in the beginning of the Deliberations and we are told that the group knew of the impending dispersion. They were in fact longing for this moment when they would be sent by the Pope on various missions. Due to this they decided to take a good deal of time in order to deliberate about some fundamental elements of the future of the group.⁸³ Besides the immediate context which has been explained, the text deals with two fundamental issues which were deliberated - the continuance as a group and the issue of obedience to one of their own. It also indicates, though in a succinct style, various other issues and these would include the reception of new candidates, poverty, mission, catechism and other details would be highlighted in the Determinations – the third document. This is the basic outline of the Deliberations and we shall try to understand the inner dynamics after a brief note about the methodology.

7.4.3 DELIBERATIONS WITHIN THE DYNAMICS OF SELF-LOVE AND HUMILITY

The Deliberations are related to the second and third time of election as presented in the Spiritual Exercises. The arguments were not presented as in a debate, but following the scholastic method a point was proposed and objections as well as reasons in favor were

requests that were made for the companions.

⁸¹ On 19th of March, Bröet was asked by the Pope to go to Siena with a companions of his choice to reform a monastery. With the imminent split of the group, the companions felt that the time had come for them to deliberate on the future of the group.

⁸² DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. *Ignatius of Loyola...*, p. 169.

⁸³ "...quod etiam summis desideriis expectabamus, ut citius ad prefixum et precogitatum a nobis finem vehementerque desideratum perueniremus, decreuimus per multos ante separationem dies inter nos conuenire et tractare inuicem de hac nostra uocatione ac viuendi formula." *MCo - I*, pp. 1-2.

presented. Finally conclusions were drawn and reasons were given.⁸⁴ Luis González would make a distinction between discernment and deliberation where discernment is a process to know the will of God and deliberation is a process to take a decision.⁸⁵ Speaking of the deliberation as being a synthesis of the second and third time of election he would say:

Creemos que en el caso de los primeros compañeros la deliberación tiene un doble sentido: porque no sólo disciernen la voluntad de Dios, sino que toman decisiones y conclusiones vinculantes, aunque en la expectativa de una última decisión papal; por otra parte, proceden por el método del tercer tiempo de elección, fundamentalmente a base de razones “pro” y “contra”, aunque se espera continuamente la “configuración” interna a través de una experiencia de consolaciones espirituales en forma de paz, unanimidad, consuelo y alegría personal y comunitaria.⁸⁶

Let us now observe the method followed by the companions in greater detail by dividing it into six parts.

7.4.3.1 The Context and the Question

The companions realized that the process consisted in a delicate but rigorous interplay between divine grace and human effort. Hence they humbly placed their entire trust in God and did all that was humanly possible in order to fulfill the will of God. The method thus followed would be an important contribution in the area of communitarian discernment in the history of the Church.⁸⁷ It must be kept in mind that the deliberations were not about the goal of their life but about the means to achieve it.

The Deliberations begin with the companions taking stock of their existential

⁸⁴ St. Thomas Aquinas in the Summa Theologica would emphasize the importance of both reason and the will in the process of making a choice. “...that act whereby the will tends to something proposed to it as being good, through being ordained to the end by the reason, is materially an act of the will, but formally an act of the reason.” (STh., I-II q.13 a.1)

⁸⁵ Cf. GONZÁLEZ, LUIS. “La deliberación...”, pp. 241-42.

⁸⁶ IBID., p. 242.

⁸⁷ CONWELL, JOSEPH. “Deliberación...”, p. 549. ‘La deliberación de los primeros compañeros, que tuvo decisiva influencia en la historia y vida de la Iglesia, es todavía hoy de gran importancia como modelo de discernimiento comunitario para conocer la voluntad de Dios.’ However it must be stated that deliberations have existed from biblical times and all through the tradition of the Church. The monastic tradition, medieval Popes, and other religious groups engaged in deliberations. ‘Between August 1534 and March 1539, the companions held no less than thirteen deliberative reunions.’ (Cf. DUMEIGE, GERVAIS. “Communal Discernment of Spirits and the Ignatian Method of Deliberation in a General Congregation”, *The Way Supplement* – 20, 1973, pp. 57-58.)

situation. They accepted the fact that they were a heterogeneous group and imminent dispersion faced them. Once they took stock of their situation they articulated the necessary questions in a very explicit manner.

After meeting for many sessions, there was a cleavage of sentiments and opinions about our situations. While we all had one mind and heart in seeking God's gracious and perfect will according to the scope of our vocation; nevertheless, regarding the more readily effective and more fruitful ways of achieving God's will for ourselves and others, we held diverse views. [*Delib.* 1,b]⁸⁸

7.4.3.2 The Initial Disposition of humility

Once they had 'made a decision' (1.c) they agreed to apply a method through which each person would let go his personal will and desire. In the company of others they would be aided to be individually and collectively open so as to know and fulfill the will of God. With confidence that God would not turn away a humble petition, they adopted the following means in order to proceed ahead.

We settled on this that we would give ourselves to prayer, Masses, and meditations more fervently than usual and, after doing our very best we would for the rest cast all our concerns on the Lord, hoping in him. He is so kind and generous that he never denies his good Spirit to anyone who petitions him in humility and simplicity of heart; rather, he gives extravagantly, not holding back from anyone. In no way, would he who is kindness itself desert us; rather, he would be with us more generously than we asked or imagined. [1.c]⁸⁹

We began therefore to expend every human effort. We proposed to ourselves some questions worthy of careful consideration and forethought at this opportune time. Throughout the day, we were accustomed to ponder and meditate on these and to prayerfully search into them. At night each one shared with the group what he judged to be more appropriate and helpful, with the intention that all with one mind would embrace the truer way of thinking, testing and commended by the more powerful reasons and by majority vote. [2.d]⁹⁰

Some points that stand out in this initial method included trust and hope in God,

⁸⁸ The text of the Deliberations is taken from the translation by Toner, Jules which is available in *Studies*. In future all texts in square brackets [] are taken from this text and have been indicated by the initials *Delib.* (TONER, JULES. "The Deliberations That Started the Jesuits", *Studies – Vol. 4*, 1974, p. 185.) The initials *Delib.* will only be used when we have a text of the Deliberations of 1539 that is quoted verbatim. Given the fact that Toner also interprets this text, we shall be using the normal style of quoting while referring to Toner's commentary.

⁸⁹ *Delib.*, p. 186.

⁹⁰ *Delib.*, p. 187.

an attitude of humility, an eye for detail and finally the participation of each person. The companions were confident that God who is 'kind', 'generous' and 'extravagant'⁹¹ would enlighten them. When speaking of the nature of God, the words 'kind' and 'generous' is used two times. On the other hand they needed to have an attitude of 'humility and simplicity' among themselves. They realized that 'the principle that all their hope of finding God's will together, must rest ultimately on God's overflowing kindness: (because) he who is so good will never refuse the desire of those who have done what lies in them and who pray to him with simplicity and humility of heart.'⁹²

In the opening paragraph they describe themselves as 'spiritually infirm and feeble men', but were confident that God 'never denies his Good Spirit to anyone who petitions him.' Along with immense trust in God, they went about doing all that was humanly possible in order to open themselves to the inspiration of the Spirit. Their plan had an eye for detail and they posed precise questions, which would be 'pondered and meditated' upon during the entire day. The time of their meeting was fixed and 'each one shared'⁹³ in the group in a manner that the group could 'with one mind embrace the truer way of thing.'

7.4.3.3 Presence of self-love and measures to overcome it

The first question regarding the continuance of the group was unanimously decided and they moved on to the second point which dealt with the issue of obedience to one of the members of the group. They persisted 'in prayer and thought for many days without hitting upon any satisfactory resolution' [5.i]⁹⁴ They had hit a road-block and the method used so far was not sufficient to help them move forward in their deliberations, but their determination and confidence remained the same.' The realization of subtle self-love

⁹¹ In 7.4.3.3 there are various occasions when some words and phrases which appear in the body of the paragraph have been placed within inverted commas. The corresponding number of the Deliberations is not given because they have been taken from the quotes which have already been numbered.

⁹² *Delib*, p. 186.

⁹³ The individual members were not expected to share all that they had been reflecting and meditation upon. They were expected only that which the individual judged to be more appropriate and helpful. We can also presume that not all that was discussed was written down, but only that which the author considered to be inspired and pertinent.

⁹⁴ *Delib*, p. 195.

which was probably obstructing their progress made them think of means to overcome the impasse. They therefore made some changes in the method in order to make it better and would deliberate on the choice of one of the options. The three options were proposed:

...Would it expedite our discernment if we all went away to some hermitage for thirty or forty days, giving ourselves over to meditation, fasting and penance, so that God might listen to our desires and mercifully impress on our minds the answer to our question? Or should three or four undertake this enterprise in the name of all with the same intent? Or would it be better if none of us went to the hermitage but all remained in the city, devoting half of every day to this our one principal occupation and the rest of the day to our customary work of preaching and hearing concerns, more suitable for meditation, reflection, and prayer. [5.j]⁹⁵

After discussing these possible courses of action (they) decided to opt for the third choice and decided to stay on in the city. In order to further prepare themselves, they decided to take some more measures which would allow them to be more open to God's inspirations in order to help the group discern better. The three preparations included:

The first preparation: Each would ready himself beforehand, would take time for prayer, Masses, and meditation in order to strive for joy and peace in the Holy Spirit regarding obedience, laboring as much as he could to have a predilection for obeying rather than commanding when the consequent glory of God and the praise of his majesty would be equal.

The second preparation: None of the companions would communicate with any other about the matter at issue or inquire about his reasoning on it. The point of this preparation was to prevent anyone from being persuaded by another and, therefore, biased more toward obedience [by vow to one of their own number] or the contrary. This way each would desire as more advantageous only what he derived from his own prayer and meditation.

The third preparation: Each one would think of himself as a stranger to our group who would have no expectation of joining it. Thinking this way he would escape being carried by his emotions more to one opinion and judgment; rather, as if a stranger, he would speak his thought to the group about having or not having obedience, would by his judgment confirm and recommend what he believed would be for God's greater service and would more secure the Company's lasting preservation. (*Delib.* – 6.l)

Earlier on they had spoken about total trust and confidence in God and now were made to realize that they were not totally free to respond to the inspiration of the Spirit.

⁹⁵ *Delib.*, p. 196.

Hence in order to better respond to the Divine initiative they humbly and firmly accepted to make changes for a better interplay of the Divine initiative and human effort at a communitarian level. They humbly realized that though ‘it is God alone who can show them his will and who will certainly do so if they do their best’⁹⁶ they too need to be freely disposed to respond generously. All the three points dealing with the preparations contain the twin dimensions of God’s grace and human effort. The search for adequate conditions in order to facilitate the process of Deliberations is elaborated in detail.

An important element in this detailed explanation is the over-riding desire of the companions to have the right disposition by having an attitude of indifference.⁹⁷ This was a tacit acceptance of the fact that some of the companions did not have the right disposition to go through the process. In such a situation the Spiritual Exercises suggests the use of the choosing the opposite in order to overcome this tendency towards one choice.

...if by chance the exercitant feels an affection or inclination to something in a disordered way, it is profitable for that person to strive with all possible effort to come over to the opposite of that to which he or she is wrongly attached. [*SpEx* – 16]

In keeping with this principle, we see a suggestion that the companions try to ‘obey rather than command’ [6,1]⁹⁸ as much as they could. Beside the fact that this would help them to come to a state of indifference which is a precondition to any form of discernment it would also help in overcoming disordered affections that could be present in the group. Along with the reasons mentioned above, it would also help the companions to engage in the process from an experiential point of view as was the case

⁹⁶ Cf. TONER, JULES. “The Deliberations ...”, p. 185.

⁹⁷ The Principle and Foundation in the Spiritual Exercises while speaking of Indifference states that: ‘Human beings are created to praise, reverence, and serve God our Lord,’ and... other things on the face of the earth are created for the human beings, to help them in the pursuit of the end for which they are created. ...To attain this it is necessary to make ourselves indifferent to all created things, in regard to everything which is left to our free will and is not forbidden. ...we ought to desire and choose only that which is more conducive to the end for which we are created.’ (*SpEx* 23)

⁹⁸ *Delib*, p. 197.

during their ministries to various universities of Italy.⁹⁹

The second and third point seems to indicate that the decision making process was being influenced by members of the group and the companions were not able to reflect on the question at hand in an indifferent manner. Hence the method being proposed is rather radical in nature wherein it was decided that 'none of the companions would communicate with any other' and further on 'each one would think of himself as a stranger to the group.' What emerges in this text is that despite the differences of opinion, all the members were desirous of knowing and fulfilling the will of God. The acceptance of these additional rules is a tacit acknowledgement of their lack of indifference and they hoped that by improving the method they would be able to better dispose themselves to knowing and fulfilling the will of God.

7.4.3.4 Humility and the adoption of new measures

The application of new procedures helped them to achieve their end. The text of the Deliberations commenting on the method indicates the following:

With the foregoing spiritual dispositions, we arranged to assemble all prepared on the following day. Each one was to declare all those disadvantages which could be brought against obedience [by vow, to one of our group], all the reasons which presented themselves and which anyone of us had found in his own private reflection, meditation, and prayer. What he had gathered, each in his turn was to make known.[7,m]¹⁰⁰

On the next day we argued for the opposite side of the question, each one putting before the group all the advantages and good consequences of such obedience which he had drawn from prayer and meditation; each one took his own turn to present his reflections, sometimes showing the positive values of obedience, sometimes reducing the alternative to an impossibility. [7,o]¹⁰¹

The companions met and based on their own prayer, reflection and meditation presented the disadvantages of the proposition. The reasons include those related to the Church, religious life and those that affect the person at an individual level. The

⁹⁹ They had some experience of obedience during their ministries in various universities of Italy when each one of them was supposed to be superior for a week would have given them some experience, but apparently this experience was not sufficient in order to create in them the right disposition.

¹⁰⁰ *Delib*, p. 201.

¹⁰¹ *Delib*, p. 203.

following day in similar fashion the advantages of obedience or the disadvantages of not obeying were presented to the group. Two points that need to be highlighted regarding the manner of presenting the arguments and the participation of the companions.¹⁰² These include the respect for each person as well as the responsibility of each person.

These two dimensions can be seen in two phrases seen in the text. The text states that the companions decided that 'each one was to declare' the advantages or disadvantages. Further on it states that during the actual process 'each in his turn' shared with the group the reasons for or against the proposition. This point of total participation is in consonance with the humble disposition that is expected of each member of the group. Total participation is based on the precondition that God communicates with each person irrespective of one's spiritual, moral, academic or ecclesiastical standing.¹⁰³ Along with the fact that humility is seen in accepting the importance of each person, we are also reminded that every individual ought to humbly communicate that which has been divinely received with the other members of the group. This is a responsibility of each person in order to better and more accurately understand the will of God for the group.

7.4.3.5 Election through unanimity

The final decision on the vow of obedience was to take some more time. After many days of discussion, they finally took a unanimous decision regarding the vow obedience to a member of the group.

During many days, from this side and that, we worked over a mass of data related to the resolution of our problem; we examined and weighted the more forceful and important reasons and took time as usual for prayer, meditation, and reflection. By the Lord's help, we did at last, not [just] with a majority judgment but without a single dissenting voice,

¹⁰² During the discussions, the reasons for and against were not strictly presented in the style of a debate with arguments and counter arguments. Rather the reasons were presented in a prayerful atmosphere where there was a genuine attempt to know the reasons for and against in order to be faithful to the will of God. No attempt was made to rush through the reasons with sufficient time being set apart for the discussion. As a person was presenting his reasons, the others tried to understand and substantiate the same with a genuine spirit of indifference.

¹⁰³ This attitude is in keeping with the annotations seen at the start of the Spiritual Exercises. Ignatius was firmly convinced of this fact and went to extreme lengths in order to maintain this point. (*SpEx 15.*)

come to this conclusion... [8,q]¹⁰⁴

The first point that strikes us is a confirmation of the process. It takes place in so far as there is a constant interplay between the grace of God and human effort. The confidence that the companions had placed in God when they began this process is validated with the decision that is finally taken. With the Lord's help they did take a decision which was unanimous. Despite the enormous human effort, the companions were convinced that it was primarily the grace of God which had helped them to take the decision. The human effort in terms of a well-structured methodology was only a means to aid them in taking a decision which was consonant to the will of God.

Two more points emerge in the manner of coming to a final decision. The first relates to the calm and deliberate manner of proceeding and the second refers to the importance of unanimity when taking a decision. The text indicates that all the reasons were carefully 'examined and weighted' and that the process was not completed in a hurried manner. The fact that the decision was reached 'without a single dissenting voice' indicates total unanimity among the companions. This unanimity that characterized the final decision gave greater credence to the fact that this was indeed the will of God.¹⁰⁵

In future they would try to take decisions based on unanimity, though it would not be always possible and when they would be faced with situations involving split opinion, they would have to further modify the method in order to be able to know the will of God in a situation where there was a split decision. Such a situation would confront them immediately and they would have to take a decision without delay. They had faced a similar situation in Paris regarding the vow to go to Jerusalem and now were

¹⁰⁴ *Delib*, p. 205.

¹⁰⁵ It would be too rigid a stance to state that only unanimity reflects the will of God. We have stated that unanimity gives greater credence to the will of God as against a split opinion. However we believe that just as the state of unanimity most likely reflects the will of God, it could also be influenced by other extraneous factors. Hence one needs to be cautious about making absolutistic statements. This can be seen in the life of Ignatius wherein the decision to go to Jerusalem was a unanimous decision, though the decision to stay on or return was not unanimous. Historical evidence shows that that was not necessarily the will of God. In the same manner there have been other decisions based on split opinion which has been validated by history as being the will of God.

confronted with a matter which involved a split opinion.

7.4.3.6 Election by majority vote

After the decision on the vow of obedience, the subsequent eleven decisions were taken in a unanimous manner. However when they wanted to make the 'teaching of children for forty days and for one hour daily a formal vow 'obliging the members under pain of mortal sin', [12]¹⁰⁶ they met resistance and despite their efforts had to humbly accept failure regarding unanimity in decision making. Bobadilla refused to sign and hence they had to modify the method in order to come to a decision. They finally decided as follows:

It was clarified and decided that in all these discussions of business, whatever their importance, that the opinion of the majority would be binding; however, as they had done up to the present, they would take three days for the more important questions and they would not decide anything until the third day when they would adopt the opinion of the majority; those signing this new rule made it clear that, in their opinion, it would not be right for someone who differed with the others to lose his right to vote. [13]¹⁰⁷

The companions realized that it would not be possible to have unanimity at all times. They were individuals from different backgrounds and as indicated in the introduction of the text, they were a heterogeneous group. Therefore differences of opinion were bound to emerge and they had to take this into account.¹⁰⁸ The ideal would continue to take unanimous decisions based on reasons presented regarding the propositions.¹⁰⁹ However reasons given would not always be convincing and given the fact that they had now decided to form themselves into a group, certain decision would have to be taken rapidly.

¹⁰⁶ MCo-I, p. 12. '*...Die veneris ante pentecostem eiusdem anni ab omnibus, dempto Bouadilla, conclusum fuit et confirmatum, quod ille articulus qui est de docendis pueris per quadraginta dies, vt supra, et per unam horam, caderet sub votum formale, obligans ad peccatum mortale...*'

¹⁰⁷ MCo-I, p. 7.

¹⁰⁸ They were no longer a group of friends, but had decided to become a religious order. Hence certain decisions had to be taken within a determined time frame and hence they would decide to accept the opinion of the majority.

¹⁰⁹ In speaking about the reasoning that characterized the Deliberations, Toner is of the view that agreement with a conclusion does not mean that one agrees with the reasoning. "*A true conclusion may follow from true or false premises, from correct or incorrect reasoning... God can lead our minds to the conclusion truly in accord with his will despite our mistaken understanding of principles and facts, despite our faulty reasoning processes.*" (Cf. TONER, JULES. "The Deliberations ...", p. 189.)

The entire process came to an end by the 24th of June, 1539 and they would then begin the process of formally petitioning the Holy Father to confirm their way of life by approving them as a religious order. The process of institutionalization would continue until the death of Ignatius and extend into the subsequent years. During this entire period, the method that was used for the Deliberations would work as a useful tool in order to help them constantly discern the will of God. Let us now try to understand as to how the dimension of humility was a fundamental element in taking this process forward.

7.4.4 THE TEXT OF THE DELIBERATION AND HUMILITY

7.4.4.1 Unanimity followed by an awareness of disordered affections

At the very onset, the companions manifested an attitude of humility. They knew that though they 'all had one mind and heart in seeking God's gracious and perfect will', they 'held diverse views.' [1,b] Such diversity was to be expected of 'spiritually infirm and feeble men' like them because the apostles and other perfect persons with whom they 'cannot be remotely be compared', too had 'opposing ways... and ...conflicting judgments.' [1,b] However they were confident that the Lord would 'never deny his good Spirit to anyone who petitions him in humility and simplicity of heart.' [1,c] The attitude observed in the preparatory phase of the Deliberations is one of humility and total confidence in God.

This attitude continues as they deliberated on the first question whether they ought to remain united as a group. During these deliberations, one of the reasons for continuing as a group was their firm conviction that God had brought together men who were 'so spiritually weak'. [1,b] The passive attitude on their part allowed God to work through them. The second reason consisted in realizing that individually their fruitfulness would be very limited, while 'united spiritual strength is more robust and braver in any arduous enterprise...' [3,f]

The second question was where the group would be forced to deepen its attitude of humility because of an actual experience of humiliation. Despite 'persisting in prayer

and thought for many days' [5,i] they were not able to proceed further. They realized that they still did not have the right disposition and lacked the necessary indifference and internal freedom to engage in this process. The humbling experience of becoming aware of their state opened them further to God and hence they 'put (their) hope in the Lord and started to cast about for better ways of working out such a solution.' [5,i]

The three additional points in order to help them proceed reveals to us the state of the group and the need for them to progress in humility in order to better know the will of God. They realized that they were not adequately indifferent and disposed to engage in the process both at an individual as well as a collective level. Therefore new suggestions were proposed whereby 'each and every member of the group' would be expected to do his part so as to help 'resolving the impasse'. [6,1]

The first point consisted in employing both spiritual and human means in order to prepare themselves. Acknowledging the fact that there was some resistance to the vow of obedience because it consisted in submitting one's will to that of another, the companions decided to make a concerted effort to grow in humility by 'laboring as much as he could to have a predilection for obeying rather than commanding.' [6,1]

The companions did not stop at the first step but went two steps further. They decided that 'none of the companions would communicate with any other about this matter' and that 'each one think of himself as a stranger to (the) group.' [6,1] Internal movements, emotions, the capacity of reason and other factors that aid discernment needed to be motivated by the purity of intention. The fact that the companions had to add these points was a tacit acknowledgement that their intention needed to be purified further and they were still not disposed with the degree of indifference that was expected of the group.

It is believed that Peter Faber was the redactor of the Deliberations and in keeping with his personality, he probably presented the proceedings of the Deliberations in the most gentle and positive manner that he could possibly present. However this does not

take away the fact that the period of Deliberations was one of intense activity¹¹⁰ with moments of strong disagreements. The first point indirectly indicates to the lack of disposition and the presence of strongly divergent view points within the different members of the group.

If the first point gives us an indication of the lack of disposition at an individual level, the second and third points indicates that the state of the group was far from ideal. We can presume that some kind of disordered affection was noticed by the companions and hence we have a second point which was in order to ‘prevent anyone from being persuaded by another and, therefore, biased more toward obedience or the contrary.’ [6,l] Similarly it was probably being observed that disordered emotions were interfering with their process of reflection and hence they decided to go to another extreme and adopt the attitude of a stranger. In this way one ‘would escape being carried by his emotions more to one opinion and judgment.’ [6,l]

The fact that the companions could not make any headway would have been a humiliating experience. They had great desires to offer themselves totally for the Church by engaging in teaching, catechesis, reforming the clergy and monasteries, edifying other by a life of austerity, acts of mercy and so on. However here they were face to face with their own internal limitations where they were unable to decide on a vow of obedience. The humble acknowledgement of their own limitations would lead them to modify the method that had been worked out wherein they once again reaffirmed their trust in God and did all that was humanly possible to become receptive to the inspiration of the Spirit. Once again we see how an experience of actual humiliation allowed them to grow in the virtue of humility, thus opening them to the illuminative and transformative grace of God.

7.4.4.2 Humility as the key to resolving the question of obedience

The first part of the text of the deliberations offers reasons for and against the vow of

¹¹⁰ As a matter of fact, we find a brief summary of the entire process where the text reveals that the process was ‘*not without long vigils, much prayer and labor of mind and body.*’ [9,r]

obedience and they were expressed in a brief manner. None of them was elaborated at length and are merely indicative of the discussion which took place. While speaking of the reasons against obedience, the arguments seem to raise fears regarding the freedom to live their charism, being forced to accept an existing rule and the difficult to recruit new members. [7,n] However while commenting on the reasons in favor, they indicated that it would help fix responsibility, help the group in its perseverance and help keep the group alive. A key number in order to understand the role of humility in these Deliberations is number [7,p].

The above mentioned points indicate two strong sentiments within the group. On the one hand they were convinced that their way of life was something unique and they did not in any way desire to compromise on it. The dimension of apostolic service as a way of living their vocation to be religious was a new introduction in the understanding of religious life and their genuine concerns are seen in the objections raised regarding obedience. At the same time, there was an ardent desire to persevere as a group and increase the number of candidates who would follow their way of life. However the crucial reason for them to take the decision in favor of obedience would be the intense desire to live in accordance with the third degree of humility.

The importance of this reason is seen in the fact that while the other reasons are presented in a brief and succinct manner, the reason that highlights the relationship between obedience and humility is elaborately explained. The two fundamental advantages of obedience consisted in an 'uninterrupted life of heroic deeds and in heroic virtues.' [7,p] In both these dimensions of spiritual life, i.e. deeds and virtues, the text focuses on influencing the will and judgment of the individual in order to be free to do the will of God.

The first part of the Deliberations [7,p] focuses on deeds where the reasoning proceeds as follows:

...one who truly lives under obedience is fully disposed to execute instantly and unhesitatingly whatever is enjoined him, no matter to him whether it be very hard to do or engenders embarrassment and ridicule and public humiliation. Such would be the

case, for example, if I were bidden to walk through the streets and avenues unclothed or in strange attire. Although such an order may never be given, nevertheless, so long as any one is readier for such acts by denial of his own will and judgment, he is always acting heroically and growing in merit. [7,p]

The link between obedience and heroic deeds is two dimensional – functional as well as anthropological and these two dimensions are inter-linked in order to help a person live a life of self-emptying for the sake of mission. The functional dimension is seen when obedience is linked to mission and the disposition that it so engenders in the person leads one to be willing to do ‘whatever is enjoined him.’ The totality of a person’s self-offering through obedience is revealed by the words ‘fully disposed’ and promptness through the words ‘instantly’ and ‘unhesitatingly’. However the efficacy of obedience is not merely limited to its functional role, but transforms the person. Spiritual growth is not primarily because of extraordinary tasks, but because of a sincere self-emptying of one’s ‘own will and judgment.’ Thus each time a person obeyed he would be ‘acting heroically’ and ‘growing in merit.’ The uninterrupted living of such an understanding of obedience leads to an effective participation in the mission of Christ leading to a progressive and continuous configuration in Christ.¹¹¹

Obedience is also linked to heroic virtues, especially the virtue of humility.

A like line of reasoning is: nothing so casts down all pride and arrogance as does obedience; for pride makes a big thing of following one’s own judgment and will, giving way to no one, pursuing grand and extraordinary projects beyond one’s reach. Obedience diametrically opposes this attitude: for it always follows the judgment of another and the will of the other, gives way to all, and as much as possible is joined with humility, the enemy of pride. [7,p]

We are at one of the most delicate and illuminating moments of the Deliberations. The reasoning reverts back to the two standards of the Spiritual Exercises where Ignatius indicates that one who is afflicted by pride is susceptible to all other vices. In the Spiritual Exercises, the way to counter the tendency towards pride is by intensely desiring and living a life of humility. In this text we see how the same is said of obedience which ‘diametrically opposes (the) attitude’ of pride. [7,p] Further on the

¹¹¹ The various phrases in this paragraph refer to number. [7,p].

vow of obedience is intimately 'joined with humility' thus showing how the clinching argument for the vow of obedience was its ability to foment further the key attitude of humility. [7,p] Obedience is not an end in itself, but becomes meaningful in a larger framework wherein humility is a fundamental element.

7.4.4.3 Obedience and its relationship to pride and humility

The importance of obedience in affecting the judgment and will needs to be highlighted. The two contrasting consequences of the diverse orientations of the will and judgment are presented here. When the judgment and will is dominated by pride and self-love, it leads to a false sense of self-aggrandizement. A person has a false sense of omnipotence and pursues 'grand and extraordinary projects beyond one's reach.' [7,p] On the other hand humility leads to a proper awareness of oneself whereby one trusts fully in the grace of God, but is also aware of human endowments and practical realities. The judgment and will of a person who is obedient is dominated by the virtue of humility and leads to greater self-emptying love resulting in spiritual growth and apostolic fruitfulness.

The conflict between pride and grandiose self-seeking plans against obedience and humility which is expressed in this paragraph has an interesting phrase – 'pursuing grand and extraordinary projects beyond one's reach.' [7,p] It is well known that Ignatius wanted persons with grand desires and therefore grand and extraordinary projects were not necessarily anathema for him. However he realized through his experience that grand and extraordinary projects cannot be achieved alone, but only in collaboration with others.

Pride leads to absolute self-sufficiency and a false sense of omnipotence. Ignatius himself had gone through this experience during the initial years of his conversion during which he desired to engage in great works for the glory of God. However he was not obedient to anyone and was mainly all by himself. He had 'grand and extraordinary projects' [7,p] and went about trying to achieving it. However very soon he became aware of his folly and in humility elicited the help of others. The other companions too

had great desires and ambitions and would go through experiences similar to that of Ignatius. They too would realize that the grand and extraordinary projects which they desired to achieve, although good and noble in themselves could only be achieved in humility which would be fostered by obedience.

The Deliberations thus are a humble recognition of the companions regarding their true status. They were men with great desires who were zealous about doing great things for Christ. However experience had taught them that by themselves they were easily prone to error and self-seeking activities. Overt and subtle pride made a person over-confident about one's personal process of discernment and could easily skew the process leading to decisions which were erroneous. However a process whereby one is engaged in the company of others is a more accurate, secure and divine way of knowing the will of God. Obedience to an individual was thus a safeguard against pride and self-love allowing the individual and the group to grow in the attitude of humility so that they could be effective instruments of Christ and His Kingdom.

7.4.4.4 Ongoing Tensions and Humility as the way forward

The learning process of the companions would continue further. The text indicates that they felt they had found the right method in order to deliberate when it says, "we followed the order of discussion and procedure described above.'[9,r] While we can assume that they provided for a majority decision from the very onset as it evident in the previous number (8,q) where the text indicates the joy of having made the decision on the vow of obedience with unanimity, they would actually face such a situation when Bobadilla actually refused to sign the document which would make the teaching of children for forty days a formal vow.¹¹²

The decision of Bobadilla was an important moment in the process of the Deliberations. Such was its import that the author of the Deliberations mentions him by

¹¹² This incident took place on the 23rd of May and from then on Bobadilla's signature no longer appears on the documents.

name¹¹³ when he says,

The Friday before Pentecost, all, with the exception of Bobadilla, concluded and decided that the above article which is concerned with the teaching of the children for forty days and for one hour each day, would fall under a formal vow... [12]

This is the first time there is no unanimity of the group and it gives a brief glimpse of the intensity and dramatic character of the Deliberations. It must be said that these 'friends in the Lord' were generally of one mind and heart in most aspects. However on an issue where they had to take a formal vow, there was no unanimity. The consequence for the group was that they were forced to modify the rules for decision making.

It was clarified and decided that in all these discussions of business, whatever their importance, that the opinion of the majority would be binding; however, as they had done up to the present, they would take three days for the more important questions and they would not decide anything until the third day when they would adopt the opinion of the majority; those signing this new rule made it clear that, in their opinion, it would not be right for someone who differed with the others to lose his right to vote. [13]

An analysis of this number would give us an insight of the inner dynamics of the group at this point. In the first place it reveals that the companions themselves felt that some points were of greater importance while others were of lesser importance. The lack of information regarding unanimity as far as the binding nature of a majority decision was concerned, leaves one wondering whether this was a split decision. The limitedness of a split decision is recognized by the group and hence they agree that 'they would not decide anything until the (third) day when they would adopt the opinion of the majority'. [13] The last line where reference is made to someone losing 'his right to vote' is another indication of the tense situation which existed. The fact that this phrase is present in this text indicates that there could have been some suggestion to take away the voting rights of one who disagreed with others.

The tone of the text is interesting. It begins with the use of rather strong and stiff

¹¹³ While the author of the Deliberations refers to the nationalities of the various companions, at no point of time does he give the names of those who participated in the Deliberations. We infer this from the signatures. However the only time that the presumed author Peter Faber reveals a specific intervention by name is when he indicates that Bobadilla refused to accept the formal vow to teach children catechism for 40 days.

words such as 'it was clarified and decided'; 'whatever their importance' and 'would be binding.' There is an absolutist and inflexible tone to these phrases with a clarity and firmness regarding their way of proceeding that contrasts with openness to the finding a methodology in the earlier deliberations regarding obedience. However the middle of this number presents a more flexible and mellowed tone where it is decided that for important questions 'they would not decide anything until the third day'. It is further softened and qualified with the group deciding to uphold the right to vote of a dissenting voice.

The text modifying the methodology indicates that the process of deliberation required a delicate balance between obedience to a Superior and obedience to the group. The text also reveals fault lines within the group pointing to the possibility of a clear split. Bobadilla's signature is not seen in subsequent documents and it is suggested that he was forced to make his solemn profession in 1541. Whatever be the case, the subsequent *Determinations* consisted only in seven companions.

The group realized that the way forward would be one of humble acknowledgement of their status as persons who had differences of opinion and despite their best efforts; there would be moments consisting in a lack of union of minds and hearts. They realized that theirs was not an ideal group which was perfect in every manner, but a group of weak, frail and vulnerable men who would not be able to proceed further without the grace of God. They had given up or emptied themselves of their careers, ambitions, their affective relationships by giving up their families and now through the vow of obedience to a Superior and to the majority decision of the group, they were also giving up their will and judgment in order to become more free and perfect instruments in participating in Christ and His Kingdom.

CONCLUSION

The process of institutionalization would continue and would be refined time and time again over the next 17 years. Through experience Ignatius had realized that the will of God was best fulfilled through a deep sense of humility and radical openness towards

others. Though he had been authorized to redact the Constitutions, he made it a point to engage in a consultative process. This was in order to ensure that the foundational experience of humility that united the first companions for a life of apostolic availability would be appropriately institutionalized in the text that was being redacted.

The Deliberations of 1539 provided Ignatius and the Society important and practical tools in order to take forward the process of communal discernment. The pattern that was evolved during these months would in turn provide a more authentic spiritual foundation for future generations who would desire to share in their charism by joining the Society of Jesus. This method would continue to be refined during subsequent years while the Constitutions were being finalized. The Deliberations would also provide important indicators for other moments of communal discernment, especially the General Congregations.

With this chapter we come to the end of the second part of our work. We have analyzed four foundational texts of the Society of Jesus and tried to understand the meaning, the centrality and transversal nature of humility in each of them. All of them invited us to understand humility as a being rooted in love, emphasized its redemptive dimension and invited a person to respond generously through humble service. Humility thus understood is modelled on an experience of Christ poor and humble leading to an ever greater participatin in the humble love of the Triune God.

The next section will deal with one specific text which encapsulates this foundational experience for a candidate who desires to join the Society of Jesus. This text is called the General Examen and is an institutionalization of this foundational charism of humble love leading to humble service. It consists in a set of guiding principles for the candidate as well as the examiner at the time of a person's admittance into the Society of Jesus. Far from being a technical and legal text, it is a spiritual text which succinctly explains the uniqueness of the Society of Jesus. It also highlights the spiritual process that a person is invited to traverse within the Society of Jesus at an individual and collective level.

SECTION THREE

**HUMILITY IN THE 4TH CHAPTER OF THE
GENERAL EXAMEN**

GENERAL INTRODUCTION TO THE THIRD SECTION

The General Examen is a document which is placed at the beginning of the Constitutions. It is meant for those who examine candidates desirous of joining the Society and at the same time is meant to enlighten candidates regarding the charism and essential elements of the Society of Jesus. The General Examen¹ is not merely a dry bureaucratic document with clear rules and regulations for the candidate as well as the examiner, but is also a profoundly spiritual document whereby the unique charism and spiritual doctrine of the Society of Jesus is elucidated.

The *GE* contains the collective experience of Ignatius² and the first companions. Unlike other parts of the Constitutions where the influence of Polanco is evident, the language of the *GE* is typically Ignatian.³ The text is further explained through other writings of Ignatius⁴ as well as those of other companions such as Jerome Nadal⁵ and Diego Laínez.⁶ Besides the explanations by these two important Jesuits who were companions of Ignatius, numbers [138-203] of the Constitutions deals with the examiner, the candidate, impediments to admission as well as the manner of dealing with one who

¹ We shall refer to the General Examen as GE.

² RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. "Constitutiones", *DHCJ – I*, p. 931. 'El texto del Examen muestra su clara paternidad ignaciana por la intensidad de motivaciones espirituales perfectamente enlazables con los Ejercicios Espirituales, con evidentes referencias al seguimiento evangélico de Cristo. Siendo una síntesis que obligaba a condensar la presentación del pensamiento y espíritu del fundador, reviste particular importancia para la Orden.'

³ Antonio describes to us the first manuscript of the Examen and the reasons why he believes that the text α is a copy of a text which has been lost. The different texts are explained in fn. 12. He concludes the paragraph by saying that though the actual calligraphy is that of Fr. Miguel Botelho, the language of the text is Ignatian. "El lenguaje es ignaciano." Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. "La composición de las Constituciones de la Compañía de Jesús", *AHSI – 84*, 1973, p. 231.

⁴ Directives regarding the examination of candidates can be found in various letters of Ignatius. During the course of this work we shall occasionally refer to these letters. However at this point it is important to note that a letter by Polanco (on behalf of Ignatius) to Simon Rodrigues in 1547 and another to Laynez in 1552 gives us important insights into the mind of Ignatius regarding the first probation.

⁵ In 1554, Nadal who was sent as a visitor to Portugal and Spain explained the Examen in a series of *platicas* in Alcalá. (*MNad – V*, pp. 48-82) On another occasion in 1557 when he was in Spain he commented on the General Examen and this document is titled *In Examen Annotationes*. (*MNad – V*, pp. 131-205.) Later on the Examen was an important point in the *Scholia in Constitutiones*. (J. Nadal, *Scholia in Constitutiones*, (Ed. Ruiz Jurado, Manuel), Facultad de Teología: Granada, 1976, pp. 1-51.)

⁶ Diego Laínez, the second General of the Society too commented on the Examen in a series of exhortations in Rome during the summer of 1559. (Cf. DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. "Le esortazioni del P. Lainez sull'Examen Constitutionum." *AHSI 35*, Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu: Roma, 1966, pp. 132-185.)

has been admitted. Yet another document is called 'Rules for the Examiner'.⁷

The MHSI indicates the presence of various manuscripts related to the *GE* - four important texts include texts 'α', 'A', 'B' and 'D'.⁸ The final text contains a total of eight chapters which are divided into two parts.⁹ The style of the text is one that follows a pattern of moving from that which is general, towards the more personal, finally ending in details and particulars. While the text develops in a progressive manner, the structure is not linear in nature, but is spiral with a constant return to core themes. The repetition of these core themes gains depth because they recur time and time again during the course of the eight chapters.

Among the eight chapters, the fourth chapter of the General Examen is considered to be a masterpiece of the Society's spirituality. It provides us a method and an outline in order to understand the spiritual process proposed to an individual desirous of joining the Society. Due to its significance we have decided to elaborate this chapter as

⁷ *MCo - IV*, pp. 404-410. These are primarily a collection of corrections made by Ignatius in an earlier redaction. (Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. "Probaciones" *DHSJ*, p. 3236.) "*Hay un Oficio del Examinador (Regulae, 404-410) donde se recogieron las correcciones hechas por Ignaciao una redaccion precedente.*"

⁸ The oldest extant document is a manuscript that contains the Declarations of the Examen. (*MCo - I*, pp. 248-258) which is dated to the year 1546. Besides this there exists another document which is equally old and is part of an Index (*MCo.-I*, pp. 230-231) prepared by Polanco. The second document is a copy of the original Examen which has been lost. This was written by Miguel Botelho who reached Rome in October, 1547 and this document which is considered as the first text of General the Examen has been designated as text 'α'. This text is Ignatian and contains a few corrections made by Ignatius and one correction of Polanco. The second text has been named as text 'A' and is a contemporary of text 'a' of the Constitutions. Therefore this text could be dated to the period from 1549 to the first half of 1550. It was intended to be placed as the fifth chapter of the first part of the Constitutions and this can be seen in text 'a' of the Constitutions. (*MCo - II*, p. 142.) The next document, text 'B' was a copy of the previous text and presented to the First Fathers who passed through Rome during the months of November-December, 1550 and January, 1551. This text could be called the definitive text and there are nearly 12 places where the text has been corrected by Ignatius personally. (*The text 'A' of the Constitutions contain more than 220 corrections (140 in the Constitutions and 80 in the Declarations). Some of them were done after 1551 - after the First Fathers had passed through Rome. Text 'B' of the Constitutions too would have many corrections, though not as many as text 'A'.*) Two more texts need mention - texts 'C' and text 'D'. Text 'C' was prepared for the first General Congregation in 1558 and took into account the corrections suggested by Ignatius. Text 'D' was a new copy and was prepared for the fourth General Congregation in 1594. (Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. "La Composición...", pp. 224, 228, 231.; Cf. CORELLA, JESÚS. *Constituciones...*, p. 44; Cf. JURADO, RUIZ. "Constituciones", *DHSJ*, p. 930.)

⁹ The first part contains four chapters wherein the first chapter deals with general matters with special reference to the unique features of the Society. The second deals with impediments and third chapter deals with matters that the examiner ought to question the candidate. The fourth chapter shall be explained in detail within this section of our work. The second part contains chapter five to eighth and are particular examens.

the last part of our work. In elaborating this chapter we shall analyse its different parts and try to explain them in the overall process of growing in humility and self-emptying love.

Aldama divides the chapter into two parts and indicates no. 90 as the point of division.¹⁰ In our exposition we shall make a slight variation in keeping with the end of this chapter and therefore divide this text into four parts which are as follows: a) giving up material possessions; b) growing in affective freedom; c) self-emptying and d) humble love for the Cross. This division is in based on the exhortation by Laynez to the Jesuits in Rome in 1559 who divides the text into three parts.

In questo capo si tratta in che modo si risponde alla vocazione, cioè obligandosi et havendo propósito fermo di far tutto quello che Dio Benedetto ricerca da lui in tal vocazione... Et questi punti tutti si possono ridurre a tre capi, secondo che egli deve far queste tre cose: Prima, perfecta renunciacione de' parenti; 2^a della robba; 3^a di se stesso; et di queste tre cose si trata in questo capitolo. Et queste tre renunciacioni si fondano nell'autorità evangelica.¹¹

The division of this chapter in the present work is as follows:

Section	Number	Content
SECTION ONE	[53-59]	Renunciation of Temporal Goods
SECTION TWO	[60-62]	Renunciation of Relatives
SECTION THREE	[63]	Fraternal Correction
	[64-79]	The Six Principal Experiences
	[80-90]	In the House of Probation
	[91-100]	Account of Conscience, Vows and Stability
SECTION FOUR	[101-103]	Love of the Cross & Union with God

Chapter eight will elaborate sections one [53-59] and two [60-62]. Chapter nine will deal with section three [63-100] and the tenth chapter will explain the fourth section

¹⁰ Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory Commentary on the Constitutions*, (Tr. Owen, Aloysius, J.), Gujarat Sahitya Prakash: Anand, 1989, p. 40. 'The division occurs at [90], where the candidate is asked whether he wants to observe what has been said and explained up to that point. The impression is that the following paragraphs [91-103] were added later, as a sort of appendix.'

¹¹ DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. "Le esortazioni del P. Lainez sull Examen Constitutionum." *AHSI*. 35, 1966, p. 163.

[101-103].

The chapters have been elaborated in keeping with a consistent structure. Each point begins with an introductory note followed by an explanation containing three perspectives. Firstly we have an explanation of the numbers in the context of the tradition of the Church. Secondly we offer an analysis of the text as well as an interpretation of the same. Thirdly the concerned point is explained by highlighting its application in the life of Ignatius. Once the various points of a section have been explained we shall conclude by explaining how the entire section aids the candidate in progressively growing in humility and self-emptying love.

CHAPTER 8

1ST & 2ND STAGE – GIVING UP POSSESSIONS AND AFFECTIVE DETACHMENT

...In the Spiritual Exercises the election is followed by the third and fourth week, the cost and glory of discipleship; in the General Examen, this confirmation that an election has been made is followed by one of the most profound descriptions of this cost ever written by Ignatius, the great fourth chapter of the General Examen.

(Michael Buckley)¹

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

The kenotic process as outlined in the 4thGE² is progressive in nature moving from the external elements which have their corresponding internal dynamics to elements which are more internal in nature. We will be explaining the kenotic transformation as consisting in a process with three stages. This chapter deals with the first and second stages of the kenotic process.

The first part of this chapter deals with the process of giving up temporal goods and the second part with growing freedom vis-à-vis affective attachments. These two stages are a prelude to a more profound level of emptying – the emptying of the self. In elaborating these stages we have followed a similar structure. We have begun by

¹ BUCKLEY, MICHAEL. 'Freedom, Election, and Self-Transcendence: Some Reflections upon the Ignatian Development of a Life of Ministry', *Ignatian Spirituality in a Secular Age*, (Ed. Schner, George), Wilfrid Laurier UP: Ontario, 1984, p. 77.

² 4thGE refers to the fourth chapter of the General Examen.

showing how the invitation to give up temporal possessions or affective separation is rooted in the centuries of Christian spiritual tradition. This will be followed by a textual analysis and interpretation of the corresponding section. Finally we shall explain the kenotic process pertaining to the specific stage by illustrating it as seen in the life of Ignatius and his companions.

8.1 GIVING UP TEMPORAL GOODS [53-59]

The discipleship expected of a candidate becomes concrete with a series of steps proposed to the candidate. The gradual process of emptying begins with the renunciation of temporal goods and the first seven numbers are related to this theme. In this section we shall begin by offering a historical overview of various religious orders that expect a candidate to give up temporal goods. After situating this point in the context of the tradition of the Church we shall present a textual analysis of these numbers. This will be followed by the interpretation of the same as observed in the early Society and further on in various GCs. We shall end with some comments in so far as they are related to humility and the process of self-emptying love.

8.1.1 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The invitation to authentic discipleship has always been presented in contrast with the desire for temporal goods. The different religious orders have emphasized this at the very onset and have justified their insistence that the candidate give up temporal goods on the basis of Scripture. In elaborating this point we shall present the various points of view in three parts – the first related to the early rules of religious life, the second related to monastic orders and the third to the mendicant orders and the Modern Devotion.

The need to be prudent and humble while relinquishing one's possessions was emphasized in the Rules of Basil and Augustine. Question 5 in the Rule of St. Basil relates to the relinquishment of property. The answer to Q. 5 begins with two quotations from the Gospels indicating the need to sell possessions in order to follow the Lord. (*Mt. 19,21; Lk. 12,23*) The striking feature of this rule is that the candidate is asked to dispose

his possessions in a diligent manner.³ The Rule of Augustine deals with the question of possessions and places it within the context of harmonious living within the community.⁴ On entering religious life a person does not reject possessions, but offers them to become ‘the property of the community.’ (RA 4) The Rule invites the person to have the right attitude at the moment of giving away one’s possessions. At the same time the person is asked to have the right attitude even after the possessions have been given away. (RA 5-7)⁵ In this Rule, the focus is not so much on getting rid of possessions, but in sharing them in order to build up harmonious relationships within the community. Van Bavel’s in interpreting nos. 3-7 states that Augustine’s invitation to share one’s possessions is rooted in love which transforms our egoism into an existence which is other-centered.

Augustine’s reflections on love for one’s neighbor start from a very realistic standpoint: love begins from below, love begins with giving, with sharing what we possess. Sharing material goods in common belongs to the first phase of love. This is a first realization of openness towards others, a first form of living together. For, by so doing, we give notice that we no longer wish to live for ourselves or to acquire goods only for our own purposes.

Giving up our own possessions has the aim of eliminating our egoism and our selfishness, our craving for domination and power; it is precisely these distorted loves which hinder

³ Cf. *The Rule of St. Basil in Latin and English – A Revised Critical Edition*, (Tr. Silvas, Anna M.), Liturgical Press: Minnesota, 2013, p. 85. The act of giving up one’s possessions is a sacred act. The person ‘ought not to esteem lightly and give up the things that belong to him as he pleases, but should as far as possible assess all things with the utmost diligence, since henceforth they are consecrated to the Lord, and should dispose them reasonably as far as it can be done...’ The rule goes on to say that if a person’s possessions are being taken away unlawfully, he should resist up to a point and refrain from bringing this matter before secular judges. The Rule is balanced and nuanced and with regard unpaid debts (Question 196). A person who is indebted at the time of admittance is liable for payment of debts, but if at the time of his departure he entrusted all his possessions to his relatives, neither he nor his brothers ought to have scruples.

⁴ The focus is on having ‘one mind and heart’ (Acts 4:32). This is highlighted explicitly in Rule nos. 2 & 8 and the intervening numbers indicate the manner of living a harmonious community life. Nos. 2-8 forms a strong compact unit which shows the candidate that the renunciation of possessions is not an end in itself, but for the sake of a more harmonious living. All quotes from the rule of Augustine have been taken from *The Rule of Saint Augustine*, (Tr. Canning, Raymond), Image Books: New York, 1986. This book has an introduction and commentary by Tarsicius J. Van Bavel, OSA.

⁵ The Rule states that a poor person ‘ought not to strive in the religious community for what they could not obtain outside... nor consider themselves fortunate because they now receive food and clothing which were beyond their means in their earlier lives.’ [RA, 5] On the other hand, one who has renounced his possessions ‘should not give themselves airs ... (nor) look down upon their brothers who have entered the religious community from a condition of poverty.’ [RA, 5-6]

people from coming together in authentic community. Selfishness keeps us locked up in ourselves; love, on the other hand, makes us break out of the grip of our own ego.⁶

The fourth book of John Cassian's *Institutes* relates to new candidates who desired to enter the monastery. The title of the chapter incidentally called them 'renunciants'. Cassian in speaking about those received into the monasteries of the Tabennisiots and Egyptians says that a new comer should not be allowed to bring anything with him.⁷ The monastery should also not receive anything from a person being admitted because of the danger of pride for the new comer.⁸ Another succinct text related to the renunciation of possessions is seen in the Third Conference of Abba Paphnutius. After speaking about the three callings, he speaks of three renunciations which are progressive and moving towards that which is more spiritually oriented. Referring to the process of renunciations he says that:

These three renunciations are progressively more spiritually oriented, moving from contempt of worldly wealth to the rejection of vicious activities and dispositions to, lastly, the turning away from everything present and visible. The first two may be translated as bodily renunciation and renunciation of heart, or as the renunciation of what belongs to others and the renunciation of what belongs to oneself. The third is an internalization of the first two.⁹

The monastic orders insisted on the renunciation of temporal goods because of its importance in helping them live the vow of stability. The 87th chapter in the *RM* which speaks about the admittance of a person into the monastery spoke of the importance of giving up one's possessions for the sake of perseverance.¹⁰ In detailing the entry of a

⁶ VAN BAVEL, TARSICIUS J. *The Rule of Saint Augustine – With Introduction and Commentary*, (Tr. Canning, Raymond), Image Books: New York, 1986, p. 51.

⁷ The motive was in order to aid the newcomers perseverance. . . '...if some amount of money, however small, lay hidden on his conscience; rather, when the first disturbance arose for any reason whatsoever, he would be encouraged by the security of that sum and would flee the monastery as fast as a whirring slingstone.' Cf. *John Cassian: The Institutes*, (Tr. Ramsey, Boniface), The Newman Press: New York, 2000, p. 80.

⁸ Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 79-80.

⁹ *John Cassian: The Institutes*, (Tr. Ramsey, Boniface)..., p. 114. This quote is part of an introduction by the translator. The three renunciations are elaborated in Ch. VI. (*IBID.*, pp. 123-124.)

¹⁰ After the Rule has been read to a new comer, the abbot speaks about his possessions and the liberty of using it. He says that 'it is not expedient for you to be settled here for the sake of God while your possessions remain elsewhere... because through your craving for them, your possessions located outside might possibly entice you, seduced by the devil, out of the monastery.' Cf. *The Rule of the Master*, (Tr. Eberle, Luke), Cistercian Publications: Michigan, 1977, p.

person into a monastery it speaks of various means by which a person no longer has ownership of his possessions.¹¹ The *RB*¹² in chapter 58 emphasizes the importance of perseverance and stability. The end of this chapter points to the fact that once a person belongs to the monastery he ought not to have any possessions.

If he has any possessions, he should either give them to the poor beforehand, or make a formal donation of them to the monastery, without keeping back a single thing for himself, well aware that from that day he will not have even his own body at his disposal.¹³

Monastic orders such as the Cistercians and Carthusians would further stress the importance of giving up one's possessions in order to be faithful to the purity of monastic life. The Cistercians could not possess property and therefore introduced the concept of lay brothers to take care of the land. The 15th chapter of the *Exordium Parvum* spoke of how lay brothers and not monks should be in charge of landed property which was needed it for self- support and to take care of rich and poor guests.¹⁴ The *Statutes of the Carthusian Order* expected the novice before making his profession 'to entrust to the Prior all the money and other possessions he may perhaps have brought with him, so that not he but the Prior, or someone appointed by the Prior, may take care of them.'¹⁵

Moving on to the mendicant orders, the *RF* asks the Minister Provincial to welcome a candidate with the exhortation 'to go and sell all that he has and give it to the poor; but if he cannot do this his good will shall suffice.' [RF: 4] The next point asks the

253.

¹¹ Chapter, no. 88 speaks about delaying the admission of brothers so that they can reflect about stability. In it we are given a summary of the four options before a person with possessions. 'When there has been presented to the new brother by the Rule through the abbot all the foregoing about committing himself to stability, whether by disposing of his possessions as alms or as a gift to the monastery, or by a document of guaranty under penalty or, if he is unknown by a sworn promise, let such still be granted a period of two months to deliberate with themselves...' (Cf. *IBID.*, p. 256.)

¹² Cf. *IBID.*, p. 8. For a long time it was presumed that the *Rule of the Master* depended on the *RB*. However the work of Dom Augustin Genestout in 1938 changed this perspective with a new theory stating that the *RB* depended on the *Rule of the Master*. A third theory points to a common source for both these texts. Whatever be the debate we would like to state that there are various similarities (with some chapter being verbatim) between the two texts.

¹³ *The Rule of St. Benedict – In Latin and English with Notes*, (Ed. Fry, Timothy), The Liturgical Press: Minnesota, 1981, pp. 269-270. Further details about the issue of possessions which can be received by sons of nobles are dealt in chapter 59. The attempt through these rules is that the candidate does not have the opportunity of possessing anything.

¹⁴ http://www.ocso.org/index.php?option=com_docman&Itemid=116&lang=en (as on 06/10/2015)

¹⁵ <http://transfiguration.chartreux.org/statuts-en-2.htm> (as on 6/10/2015)

Minister and friars 'not to be solicitous about his temporal goods' [RF: 5] and would expect the candidate to dispose of his possessions 'as the Lord shall inspire him.' [RF: 5]¹⁶ The Friars were not sedentary but went out to preach and labor. The possibility of income led the Rule to have some instructions regarding wages earned by the friars.¹⁷ The primitive Constitutions of the Dominicans in 1241 expected the novice to be free of all his debts and place his entire possessions at the feet of the prior.¹⁸

The *Modern Devotion*¹⁹ spoke of persons living in community but without belonging to any particular religious order. In explaining the four salient features of the Modern Devotion, John Van Engen indicates that the first point was that they were 'pious persons who lived together and in common.'²⁰ They did not make a vow of poverty, but pooled their resources and lived in common. It was a voluntary gathering of the devout and following the Pauline maxim (2*Thes.* 3,10) they worked for a living and were self-sufficient.²¹

8.1.2 THE TEXT AND ITS INTERPRETATION

The central elements related to temporal goods are dealt in [53] with the other numbers functioning as corollaries to this central point. The words used by Ignatius help us better understand the progressive explanation of the text. Number [53] focuses on '*temporal goods*' which include what one '*expects to receive*', '*debt and obligation*' and '*possessing*

¹⁶ No.1 in the Rule speaks of the vows uses the word 'without property' instead of 'poverty.' '*This is the Rule and Life of the Friars Minor, namely, to observe the Holy Gospel of our Lord Jesus Christ, living in obedience, without property, and in chastity.*' (Cf. ESSER, CAJETAN. *Rule of St. Francis*, Herald Press: Illinois, 1977, p. 21.)

¹⁷ [RF, 20] exhorts the friars to 'work faithfully and devotedly'. As payment they were allowed to 'receive whatever was necessary for the bodily support of themselves and their brethren; excepting coin and money.' [RF, 21a] They could however have no ownership of property because the security was only in the Lord. They would also have no legal claim to a wage and could ask only for what was needed for sustenance. (Cf. *IBID.*, p. 40.)

¹⁸ http://www.op.org/sites/www.op.org/files/public/documents/fichier/primitive_consti_en.pdf (as on 7/10/2015)

¹⁹ We shall refer to the *Devotio Moderna* as Modern Devotion in this work.

²⁰ Cf. *Devotio Moderna – Basic Writings*, (Tr. Engen, John Van), Paulist Press: New York, 1988, p. 13. However unlike Franciscan poverty, for them poverty and the voluntary giving up of temporal possessions for the sake of the community was not an end in itself but only a means to live a devout life by frequenting the parishes, being obedient to the ecclesiastical authorities and living a life of humility and love and the pursuit of virtues.

²¹ *IBID.*, pp. 13-16.

goods' [53].²² The subsequent numbers move on to further explain specific points related to 'goods' [54, 55]; 'money' [57] and 'benefices' [59]. Let us now analyze each number separately.

8.1.2.1 The Text

8.1.2.1.1 *The Inspiration and End*

The first number [53] deals with the inspiration, the end and pre-condition of giving up temporal goods. The inspiration is situated in Scripture as well as the example of the first companions.²³ The three scriptural texts remind the candidate of Christ's call to be perfect (*Mt. 19,21*) and having an inclination towards '*pious and holy causes*'.²⁴ The inspiration is also situated in the example of the first companions 'who joined themselves together' in order to found the Society. Ignatius who was the author of this text manifested his humility in presenting all the first companions as models who could inspire the candidate.

The end or goal of [53] is to empty oneself of all temporal goods for the present and at the same time '*removing from themselves all hope of ever possessing those goods at any time*.' Three verbs are used to show the manner of achieving this end – '*distribution*', '*renouncing*' and '*disposing*'. This refers to what one has or hopes to receive. Ignatius who was always more interested in the underlying motive insisted on having the right disposition to engage in this form of emptying. He therefore expected the candidate to '*be persons already detached from the world and determined to serve God totally*.' While the actual mode of giving away one's temporal goods could be done in a flexible manner,²⁵

²² A note regarding the use of italics. In the subsequent three chapters we have indicated the words, phrases or sentences from the GE in italics so that they stand out from other texts.

²³ Both these texts were added in 1550. (*MCo – II*, p. 40.)

²⁴ Laynez in commenting upon this passage offers many biblical quotes related to renunciation. He explained this point by stating that there were three ways of renouncing and these included: a) before entering the Society; b) one year after entering the Society and c) more than a year after entering the Society. He also quotes Cassian and Basil in explaining his point. (Cf. DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. "Esortazioni...", pp. 163-65.)

²⁵ The text has to be read in consonance with CN-32 in order to know the actual status of renouncing personal property. He has to make a promise to renounce personal property after the completion of the first year of probation, in keeping with the superior's mandate. This is a promise and now a vow. However property has to be renounced before final vows, unless the general decrees otherwise.

the essential pre-condition of having the right inspiration and motivation was indispensable.

8.1.2.1.2 Explanatory Numbers

The subsequent numbers [54-59] indicate the manner of giving up one's goods, money and benefices.²⁶ The *GE* invites the candidate to distribute the goods among the poor [54] or in deserving cases among relatives. [55] Moving on to money, the candidate is instructed not to have money with himself or with a friend.²⁷ [57] Regarding benefices, Ignatius recommends a procedure similar to goods.²⁸ [59] The two declarations [56, 58] qualify the point related to distributing goods among relatives and keeping a record of what had been brought by the candidates.

Ignatius understood the pitfalls of spiritual life and hence proposed safeguards in order to make this process a truly spiritual process. Bereft of these safeguards there existed the risk of this becoming a subtle exercise in self-love. He went beyond the superficial dimension of the act and paid attention to the underlying motives. The attention and concern can be seen in the reasons offered for choosing to give one's goods to the poor or to one's own relatives. The underlying reasons can be seen in the table below:

Distribute goods among the poor (instead of relatives):

- to follow more perfectly the evangelical counsel
- divesting oneself of disordered love of relatives
- avoid disadvantage of disordered distribution which proceeds from the aforementioned love
- help them persevere in their vocation with greater firmness and stability

²⁶ There is a specific order in giving up one's temporal goods. In the first place a person should pay his debts. If there are no debts, the person should distribute it among the poor. However if the relative of a person are poor, it could be distributed among them. (DE DALMASES, CÁNIDIDO. "Esortazioni...", pp. 164-65.) '[4] ...Il modo di fare questa distribution è: primo, soddisfare a' debiti, et presto; ma non ci essendo debiti, s'ha da distribuire a' poveri... [5] Si i parenti fussino poveri, si distribuirà a loro. ...Percioché l'avanzare la robba a' parenti impedirà che il cuore loro si vadia unendo tuttavia più con Dio, et se gli darà più commodità di peccare... Quei che hanno benefitii, prima deveno procurare che si amministrino, et bene; 2^e che si renuntiino secondo il dovere et parere dell'huomo da bene, eletto per tal consiglio.'

²⁷ He is supposed to give it distribute it among the poor or hand it over to the person in-charge within the house who would make a note of all that is brought by a candidate.

²⁸ This text was absent in text 'α' and 'A'. (*MCo – II*, p. 48.)

Distribute goods among relatives because of equal or greater need or other just considerations:

- ...because of the danger that flesh and blood may draw candidates to err in such a judgment, they must be content to leave the matter in the hands of one, two or three persons of exemplary life and learning (...chosen with the superior's approval.)

8.1.2.2 Interpretation of the Text

The point of giving up temporal goods was debated during the early GCs.²⁹ In GC 2, it was resolved that goods left to the Society were to be distributed in the same province where they were given and that referees were to be appointed for the distribution of goods. [GC 2 – D: 23, 73] The abdication of good was a point debated in the third, fifth and seventh GCs. It was felt that the abdication of goods after the 1st year of probation was harsh. However given the fact that it was not a vow, but merely a promise in order that the person perseveres, the Superior General was asked to work out practical details in this matter. [GC 3 – D: 19] However a candidate could not abdicate goods without permission once he had made the vows. [GC 5 – D: 59] During the seventh GC with Fr. Acquaviva as General some norms for abdications and administration of possessions were prescribed. The period allowed was four years which could be prolonged by the General. [GC 7 – D: 17]

Regarding the age of renouncing possessions it was decreed that 'ours are bound to renounce their possessions as soon as their age and the law of the land permits.' [GC 15 – D: 8] Accordingly these rights and renunciations would be valid even if according to the will of the superior, it was made before or after the 4 year period. The twenty-second GC had decreed that one who was abdicating goods could not keep part of it for a pious cause and goods that came after vows of the 2nd year remain with the religious institute – unless it was some patrimony where special goods were received with a special intention. [GC 22 – D: 31, 32] Though the issue of temporal goods would be the cause of debate in various GCs, its apostolic end was constantly reaffirmed by the universal Society on various occasions. GC 34 has reaffirmed the importance of a life of actual poverty where the gratuitous participation in apostolic endeavors helps us to be credible

²⁹ GC refers to General Congregation. The Society of Jesus convokes a GC in order to elect a new General or to deal with matters that are long lasting and important. (Co – 677, 680.)

witness of Christ and His mission.

Our poverty is apostolic because it witnesses to God as the one Lord of our lives and the only Absolute; it distances us from material goods and frees us from all attachment so that we can be fully available to serve the Gospel and dedicate ourselves to the most needy. In this way poverty is itself a mission and a proclamation of the Beatitudes of the Kingdom.

Poverty is the unequivocal condition of our credibility. In the face of the attitudes and values that dominate the mentality of the world today, the radical exercise of evangelical poverty becomes a countercultural witness to the value of gratuity which St. Ignatius praised so much. By this gratuity we profess the boundless and freely bestowed love of God who gave his Son for us in the total emptying of the Incarnation and the Cross. By our poverty we also show that we as persons and as “body” consider ourselves the “least Company” which lives from God and for God rather than putting its trust in material goods, since the powerful love of the Lord acts through our littleness. [GC 34 – D:9/4-6]

8.1.3 THE EXPERIENCE OF IGNATIUS IN GIVING UP POSSESSIONS

The candidate is at an important phase of his spiritual process. So far he experienced strong desires to follow the Eternal King. He is now informed about the actual cost of discipleship where his love to follow Christ has to be expressed in action. The humility and process of emptying in this phase shall be indicated by linking it to the original experience of Ignatius and the companions as well as outlining the internal dynamics by highlighting appropriate words and phrases.

Ignatius was a man given to the ‘follies of the world.’ (*Au 1*) At a definitive point in his life he decided to commit himself to God. These thoughts affected him for some time until he made the concrete choice of leaving his house. Speaking of this moment the *Autobiography* states that ‘...he mounted a mule, ... and ...went on to Navarrete.’ (*Au 13*). In doing so he had left behind the ‘hopes (that) had been placed in him by the people and (all) he could achieve.’ (*Au 12*) He had also left behind his own dreams of life in the court and worldly progress. Ignatius had not made any vow of giving up his possessions but we find that his actions correspond to the spiritual meaning behind this form of renunciation. We would like to highlight three moments where we see him leaving behind his possessions – the initial period after his conversion, the years in Paris and the following years and finally his definitive stay in Italy.

Immediately after his conversion at Loyola he decided to go to Nájera where he felt indebted to some persons and at the same time some money was owed him.³⁰ (Au 13) After leaving Najera he went to Montserrat where he gave up his sword, dagger and clothes.³¹ (Au 17⁵, 18¹) Further on he gave up his possessions in Barcelona where he was about to embark for Rome. During this episode he felt scrupulous of taking anything with him and on the advice of his confessor agreed to take some biscuits for the journey. Such was his sensitivity that he left the remaining money on a bench on the shore.³² (Au 36^{1,9}) A similar attitude was seen in giving away the 'six or seven ducats which had been given him for the passage from Venice to Jerusalem.'³³ (Au 40⁴) During his sojourn in Holy Land he gave up his possessions in the form of a knife and a pair of scissors in order to enter Mount Olivet. (Au 47⁴⁶) On his return to Venice, he received 'fifteen or sixteen *giulii* and a piece of cloth.' (Au 50²) The money was given to beggars until he was left with nothing.³⁴ While in Alcalá he went to aid the poor with the help of things by Don Diego.³⁵

Ignatius' attitude towards money would be more nuanced during his stay in

³⁰ 'He collected the money and arranged that it be distributed among certain persons to whom he felt indebted, with a part for a statue of Our Lady that was in ill repair, so it could be repaired and handsomely adorned.' (Au 13)

³¹ 'He arranged with the confessor to have his mule taken in charge, and his sword and dagger placed in the Church at the altar of Our Lady ... and stripping off all his garments he gave them to a beggar; he dressed himself in his chosen attire and went to kneel before the altar of Our Lady.' (Au 17⁵, 18¹)

³² He was leaving behind his trust in temporal goods and trusting in the providence of God. Due to this he refused to take a companion and at the same time was scrupulous of taking biscuits for the journey. 'When he went to obtain the biscuit, great scruples came over him: "Is this the hope and faith you had in God who would not fail you?" etc. This was so powerful as to trouble him greatly; at last, not knowing what to do because he saw probable reasons on both sides, he decided to place himself in the hands of his confessor. So he told him how much he wanted to seek perfection and whatever would be more to the glory of God, and the reasons that caused him to doubt whether he ought to take any provisions. The confessor decided that he should beg what was necessary and take it with him. As he begged from a lady, she asked where he was planning to travel ... At last, having the biscuit, he went on board. But at the shore he found he had five or six blancas left from what he was given begging from door to door (for he used to live that way); he left them on a bench that he came across there by the shore.' (Au 36^{1,9})

³³ Though he accepted the money, he felt scrupulous and believed it indicated lack of trust in God. Hence he decided to get rid of it by giving it to the poor and not to any acquaintance. 'He finally decided to give them generously to those who approached him, who were beggars usually.' (Au 40⁶)

³⁴ 'One day, whilst going through his devotions in the principal Church of Ferrara, a beggar asked him for alms and he gave him a *marchetto*, which is a coin of five or six *quatrini*. After that another came, and he gave him another small coin that he had, somewhat larger; 5 and to a third he gave a *giulio*, having nothing but *giulii*. The beggars, seeing that he was giving alms, kept coming and so all he had was finished.' (Au 50^{4,5})

³⁵ 'Wrapping them all in a sheet, the pilgrim put them on his shoulders and went off to aid the poor.' (Au 57⁸)

Paris. He realized the need for money and had to beg for money. Later he was forced to leave the house where he stayed due to lack of money. (*Au* 73⁵) His attempts to serve a master were futile and on the advice of a Spanish friar went to Flanders on one occasion to England in search of alms. These visits were fruitful. (*Au* 76¹²) However we observe Ignatius ruing the lack of money because he could not bring Calixto, Cáceres and Arteaga to Paris. (*Au* 79¹⁰) Despite comments from some quarters he was willing to pay one escudo³⁶ 'in order to receive the baccalaureate, "to take a stone,"' (*Au* 84²) During his stay in Azpeitia, he was involved in some putting an end to gambling and ensuring that the poor were taken care of 'officially and regularly'. (*Au* 88⁵, 89²)

On his return to Italy, he was without any money and on 'Entering Bologna he began to beg alms, but not one small coin did he get though he sought everywhere.' (*Au* 91⁷) During his stay in Venice, his companions made the journey from Paris in poverty. (*Au* 93³) Later they received the Pope's blessing for the journey to Jerusalem as well as money for the same. On being unable to make the journey, the money was returned to the donors.³⁷ While in Vicenza they continued living a life of poverty and 'two of them went out every day to beg for alms.' (*Au* 94⁵) In Rome, the first companions were engaged in various acts of mercy and aided a city which was in the grips of a severe famine. The Society would be officially founded in 1539 and the issue of poverty and fixed or stable incomes would continue to be the cause of serious debate. The seriousness of this matter can be understood by looking at the Spiritual Diary of Ignatius.

The life of Ignatius during the initial years after his conversion, his years as a student in Paris and finally as Superior General of the Society offer insights into the understanding of the call to give up temporal goods. From an attitude of total rejection and repugnance towards temporal goods, we find Ignatius travelling in order to get money during the period of his studies. At a later stage we see Ignatius taking

³⁶ In the *Autobiography* he comments that those who were poor could not 'take the stone'.

³⁷ 'The companions returned from Rome with drafts for 200 or 300 *escudos*, which had been given to them as alms for the journey to Jerusalem. They did not want to take anything except in drafts; later, not being able to go to Jerusalem, they gave them back to the donors.' (*Au* 93⁶⁷)

advantage of money and temporal possessions in order to engage in great apostolic benefit. In this part of the 4thGE, we can firmly see the imprint of Ignatius's experience. While keeping in mind the charism of the Society, the instructions also take into account the spiritual maturity of the candidate. The exhortation to give up temporal goods is to aid the candidate's growth in indifference and freedom – qualities which are necessary for living the apostolic charism of the Society.

8.1.4 HUMILITY AND GIVING UP TEMPORAL GOODS – FIRST STEP

The text helps us understand that the act of giving up one's temporal possessions goes beyond a legalistic or juridical requirement. Without discarding this fact it could be said that the renunciation of temporal goods is part of a four levelled process which goes back and forth all along the spiritual journey of a person. The first level pertains to the candidate in question - in terms of his growth in freedom and indifference. The second level refers to Society where the candidate augments the availability of the Society's for mission. The third level involves an ecclesial dimension where the act of giving up temporal goods manifests a greater witness of belonging to a Church poor and humble. Finally the fourth level relates to the universal salvific plan of God where the deliberate rejection of the standard of the world gives way to true redemption wrought through trust in God and by embracing the standard of Christ.

In the first place, the renunciation of temporal goods is necessary for the candidate to begin an authentic spiritual journey. In Scripture we see various statements by Christ about the incompatibility of having temporal goods and at the same time desiring true life in all its fullness. Irrespective of which religious order or way of life the candidate desires, detachment from temporal possessions is an absolute requirement. This is all the more pertinent when one desires to belong to a religious order. The condition of the possibility of being able to give up one's temporal possessions points to the presence of a profound experience of God leading to trust, determination and detachment.³⁸ Bereft of such an experience the act of renunciation will become another

³⁸ This can be confirmed by the following text which related to the first companions: *'those received into it should be*

sterile exercise in self-love and pride.³⁹ On the other hand the presence of a truly divine experience makes the person more humble because he realizes that all he does is a poor response to the immense love of God. In the course of giving up one's possessions (which could include money, personal objects, inheritances and so on), the candidate is expected to go through different stages⁴⁰ with each of them reaffirming the redemptive joy of self-emptying love.⁴¹

Intertwined with aiding the candidate in his personal spiritual process of growing in humility and self-emptying love is the Society's ability to be faithful to its apostolic charism. The Society of Jesus is made up of its members and in the measure that its members are indifferent and free, the Society too can be faithful and committed to its apostolic responsibilities. The freedom and availability on being detached from temporal goods translates in promptness towards any mission that is entrusted. The Society's humility is seen in the manner it respects the freedom of the candidate. The candidate is free to dispose off his temporal goods in the manner that he is inspired – except in the case of deciding to distribute it among his family and relatives.⁴² The decision of the Society not to insist or influence the candidate in order to receive temporal goods which belonged to him in a licit manner is indicative of the trust in God and insistence on freedom and indifference.⁴³ The decision not to take advantage of the

persons already detached from the world and determined to serve God totally...' (GE 53²)

³⁹ Due to this the candidate is cautioned against '*disordered love*', '*disordered distribution*' (GE 54³⁻⁵) and the possibility of '*erring in judgment*'. (GE 55²)

⁴⁰ These stages could also include matters which can be settled by at an individual level. However it could also include more elaborate activities such as a family reunion, meeting a lawyer, going to a notary's office, making an official declaration and so on. Irrespective of the occasion, every small act of renunciation is valuable. The quantitative dimension is insignificant and irrespective of the size, amount or volume of possessions, the mere fact of emptying oneself for the sake of Christ and His mission is sufficient motive to move ahead

⁴¹ The life of the candidate would be like the life of a person who is progressing on the path of virtue. The good spirit '*stirs up courage and strength, consolations, tears, inspirations, and tranquility. He makes things easier and eliminates all obstacles, so that the persons may move forward in doing good... (On the other hand the evil spirit) cause gnawing anxiety, to sadden, and to set up obstacles. In this way he unsettles these persons by false reasons aimed at preventing their progress.*' (SpEx 315)

⁴² Even in the case of the latter, the candidate is free to leave the matter in the hands of persons he chooses (with the approval of the Society) from within or outside the Society. (GE 55⁵, 56¹)

⁴³ The text of 1550 is nuanced about fixed incomes. It explains why the candidate should not precipitate the giving up of income and further on suggested that this income could be used for studies. However the candidate was not to be

temporal goods of the candidate for its own ends was edifying for the candidate, other members of the Society and wider society at large. Finally the insistence on emptying oneself of reliance on temporal goods was the apt foundation for a person to live his life in the Society. Ignatius believed that a Society which was founded on such persons would be truly faithful and fruitful in fulfilling its mission.

The Society was founded at a time when the Catholic Church was accused of avarice. Ecclesiastical authorities, religious orders, monasteries and other institutions were in need of reform.⁴⁴ The decision of the candidate to give away his temporal possessions to the poor was in keeping with the identity of the Church which was called to serve the poor and humble by giving witness of the same. The two scriptural texts quoted in [53⁴⁻⁵] contain the word ‘*poor*’ and the candidate is expected to have a preferential love for the poor (*GE 54*²³) – an attitude expressed while giving away one’s possessions. Not only does the candidate reflect the love for the poor by giving away his possessions to them, but by voluntarily accepting poverty indicates his longing for the same. Besides actual poverty, the spiritual poverty of the candidate reflects the spiritual poverty of an authentic Church whose only trust lies in the providence and mercy of God. In this manner the process of giving up one’s possessions is transformed into a moment of grace for the universal Church.

God ‘*wishes all men to be saved and to come to the knowledge of the truth.*’ (1 Tim 2:4) This is the universal salvific will of God and in Christ this is being fulfilled. Christ through the Incarnation, Passion, death and Resurrection reveals to us the true being of God. His poverty and humility allows us to glimpse the enormity of God’s self-emptying love. The human person who is created in God’s image shares in the same existence and through a life of self-emptying love grows in conformity to Christ and thus increasingly participates in the very being of God. The candidate’s gesture of giving up one’s temporal possessions may seem to be a small act against the overwhelming salvific

given any preferential treatment. This part was deleted in the next draft of 1556. (*MCo – II*, p. 46.)

⁴⁴ The same could be said today with Vatican II inviting religious orders to renew themselves by adapting their founding spirit to the modern times. Vatican also reaffirmed the understand of the Church as being in constant need of reform in its decree on religious life, ‘*Perfectae Caritatis*’.

act of God in Christ. However this small gesture is significant because of the love involved in it and not so much because of the quantity of temporal goods involved. The inspiration for such an act is the experience of God's love and an intense desire to respond to such love. In the decision of the candidate to empty himself of his temporal possessions, he unites the desire of the Society, the Church and the entire universe to give up that which is ephemeral and passing for that which is true and eternal. The emptying of temporal goods by the candidate unites him and all those related to him with the total self-emptying love of Christ leading to furthering God's universal salvific plan.

We have so far elaborated the four different levels involved in the act of giving up temporal possessions. The internal dynamic is not compartmentalized or rigid but is dynamic and flexible with a constant interplay of one level with the other. The concrete process of giving up one's temporal goods has a ripple effect which goes back and forth. Just as the candidate's decision is related to other levels, the responses of the other levels influence the candidate too. While it could be said that at this stage the candidate is expected to give up his temporal possessions in the form of money, goods, inheritances, etc. this process would be repeated at later stages wherein temporal possessions would take on different contours. Spiritual life is an ongoing and life-long continuum and giving up one's temporal possessions is but one important part of the entire process.

8.2 AFFECTIVE DETACHMENT [60-62]

After elaborating the process of giving up temporal goods, Ignatius moves on to speak about affective detachment. Once again Ignatius is more concerned about the internal dimension and therefore highlights the fact that affective separation goes beyond physical separation and is more concerned about internal realms of the human person. The degree of separation ought to be more in the early stages of religious life. However this detachment ought to continue during the latter years too.⁴⁵ We shall now move on

⁴⁵ ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory...*, p. 45. '*...more important than physical separation is affective detachment, and this continues to be true even after the early stages of religious life.*'

to explain the importance of affective separation as seen in the tradition of the Church. This will be followed by a textual analysis and finally we shall offer a few comments on the ongoing spiritual growth of a candidate.

8.2.1 AFFECTIVE SEPARATION IN THE TRADITION OF THE CHURCH [60-62]

The primary justification to distance oneself from the family was found in Scripture and in the *GE* we find two scriptural quotes.⁴⁶ The tradition of the Church recommended the separation of an aspiring candidate from his family in order help him to earnestly enter into the new way of life that religious life offered.

The *RP* instructs the examiner to ask the candidate if 'he can renounce his parents and spurn possessions.'⁴⁷ In the *Rule of Basil*, questions 4 & 5 (Long Rule – 8 & 9) deal with the renunciation of parents, relatives and those with bodily kinship.⁴⁸ In the *Institutes* of Cassian we have the example of Abba Paternutus who was presented as a model for detachment from family relationship.⁴⁹ In Cassian's fourth book of the *Conferences* Abba Paphnutius speaks about three renunciations and while speaking of the second renunciation interprets the word 'kinsfolk' as 'the former way of life and behaviour and vices that have been related to us from our birth by a connection as it

⁴⁶ *Mt. 19, 29; Lk. 14,26.* A third biblical text is an interpretation of *Rom. 6,11* where the text says that the candidate 'should be as one who is dead to the world and to self-love and who lives only for Christ our Lord...' (*GE 61³*)

⁴⁷ *Pachomian Koinonia – Vol. II*, (Tr. Veilleux, Armand), Cistercian Publicans: Michigan, 1981, p. 153.

⁴⁸ While speaking about renunciation, the Rule responds to the question, "Is it necessary to renounce everything?". In responding it states that there is need to renounce 'even the bodily kinship of blood and things which can specially hinder his purpose...' The answer further goes on to quote *1 Cor. 4,15* which speaks about true parents as being those who led a person to the faith. Further on the person is asked to be focused on the Lord and 'must look neither to the affection of parents, ...nor to any human delight.' The issue of parents and relatives is also spoken of in the context of property where the person who has been denied his rightful share should 'protest and denounce those who deny what belongs to him...' However it would not be appropriate to take this matter before secular judges because 'the sanction of piety forbids us...' (Cf. *The Rule of St. Basil in Latin and English – A Revised Critical Edition*, (Tr. Silvas, Anna M.), Liturgical Press: Minnesota, 2013, pp. 83-85.)

⁴⁹ *John Cassian – The Institutes...*, pp. 92-93. He was indifferent to his son who was 'purposely neglected, clothed in rags rather than garments, and so covered and marred with filth as to shock rather than delight his father whenever he would see him.' The text continues narrating the hardships of the son in order to show the absolute detachment of the father. Finally the father is asked to throw his son into the river and Abba Paternutus does the same. However brothers who had been purposely stationed saved the child.

were of a certain affinity or consanguinity.’⁵⁰ In speaking about family matters at the time of admission, the RM⁵¹ and RB⁵² speak about the protection to be offered to sons of noblemen and the need of a sworn promise that their son would not be a future beneficiary of any inheritance.

The choice to join a religious order is made by the candidate, but is not made in a vacuum or isolation. Though the language and examples used by Cassian would appear hard, it tried to be faithful to the fundamental axiom that a person could not serve two masters. The call to be indifferent towards family members or situations did not mean a rejection or hatred towards them but an invitation to be primarily oriented towards God. With this end in mind we need to understand the call to turn away from one’s family, friends, relatives or affective groups. Affective renunciation was not an end in itself, but a means to commit oneself more freely for the Lord. Given the enormous influence of affective relationships in a person, one needs to understand the call to renounce family and affective relationships in a nuanced manner – a point which is underlined by Ignatius in the text of the GE.

8.2.2 THE TEXT AND ITS INTERPRETATION

Considering the importance of one’s family upbringing in the light of modern psychology, this text could appear archaic. However it needs to be read within the wider perspective of a person’s spiritual process of renunciation as well as in conjunction with the CN. In explaining the text and its significance we shall first speak about the end followed by the means adopted to help the candidate grow in an affective separation from his immediate family. Ignatius does not recommend affective separation from one’s family to stoically live a life in isolation. Rather this separation is in order to be affectively attached to that which charity requires of him.

⁵⁰ *John Cassian – The Conferences*, (Tr. Boniface Ramsey), Newman Press: New York, 1997, pp. 123-25. The relationships with our earthly parents and reminiscent of the old man and now we gaze towards the heavenly Jerusalem. ‘...having left the house of our former parent, who we remember has been our father from the time of our birth according to the old man, when ‘we were by nature children of wrath like the rest,’ we shall turn our mind’s gaze to heavenly things...’

⁵¹ Cf. RM..., pp. 267.

⁵² Cf. RB..., pp. 271-272.

The end of the candidate choosing to affectively separate himself has as its primary end a continued focus and progress in one's spiritual life. Given the fact that a candidate was new to this realm, greater attention had to be paid towards this initial phase of his spiritual journey. The candidate was expected to grow in relating to others in a spiritual nature where he grew in loving others '*with that love which rightly ordered charity requires.*' (GE – 61³)

With this end clear, Ignatius elaborated various means to achieve this end. The means could include any form of '*oral or written ...communication from friends or relatives... which tended to disturb rather than help*' (GE 60¹) the candidate. In keeping with Ignatius' pedagogy, he immediately moves on to the more specific question and asks the candidate regarding oral communication. The candidate is asked '*whether he would be content not to converse with such persons...*' (GE 60²) Further on the candidate is asked about written communication. He is asked whether he would be content '*not to receive or write letters, unless on some occasions the superior judges otherwise...*' (GE 60³)⁵³ The negative tone of this text is deceptive because we find that the freedom of the candidate and his personal process being carefully protected.

Given the intensity of affective relationships, we find that Ignatius is more gradual in dealing with this restriction and therefore divides this process into three parts. These include references to other persons, to the candidate in general and finally to the attitudes expected of the candidate. Regarding written communication the candidate is asked if he would leave the matter '*to the one charged with this matter.*' (GE 60³) In the next number the candidate is told that '*...he should take care to put aside all merely natural affection for his relatives and convert it into spiritual.*' (GE 61³) However for those '*who are in greater danger of some disorder in natural love, as novices might often be*' (GE

⁵³ This point was carefully dealt in GC 34 which recommended a prudent but healthy balance in the relationship with the world. '*Although entrance into the novitiate should entail a real separation from the life previously led in the world, superiors should nevertheless provide that the novices, while consistently maintaining a spirit of recollection, should have sufficient social contact with their contemporaries (both within and outside the Society). Likewise the necessary separation from parents and friends should take place in such a way that genuine progress in affective balance and supernatural love is not impeded*' (CN – 53) The matter related to letters was more complex and GC 34 abolished the part which suggests that the letter written to a novice would be shown to him subject to the discretion of the person in charge.

61²) the method of *agere contra* is advocated and the candidate is advised to say that '*they did have parents or brothers and sisters*'. (GE 61¹) This phrase where the candidate is asked to speak of his parents and relatives in the past tense was criticized and has been abolished in GC 34.

8.2.3 AFFECTIVE SEPARATION IN THE LIFE OF IGNATIUS

The process of affective separation is more complex than giving up temporal goods. In explaining the manner of dealing with family relations and affective bonds we shall continue with the procedure of the previous point. We shall look at the manner of dealing with family and affective relations in the life of Ignatius by commenting upon a letter written by him to his brother as well as upon the case of a young man named Cesar Ottaviano. Subsequently we shall present the dynamics and effect of affective separation as elaborated in the first step.

8.2.3.1 The Letter to his brother Martin in 1532

In order to understand the mind of Ignatius regarding affective separation we shall look at a letter written by Ignatius to his brother Martín García de Oñaz in June, 1532. In it he writes about the daughter of Martin (we do not know which of his five daughters) and about arrangements for his son Millán to study in Paris.⁵⁴ After the usual salutation he explains at length the advantages of sending his son to study in Paris.

Once the practical issues have been addressed, Ignatius moves on to the part which is more spiritual in nature where he speaks about the reason for not being in contact for a prolonged period. In explaining the part which relates to our topic we shall begin by explaining the normal criteria adopted by Ignatius while relating or communicating to anyone – be they family members or otherwise. This will be followed by the personal process of Ignatius' wherein the relationship with his family underwent a transformation.⁵⁵

⁵⁴ *EppIgn – I*, p. 77.

⁵⁵ In the letter, the order is in the reverse with Ignatius first speaking about his personal process and then going on to

Ignatius accepts that it was *'now a good five or six years that (he) would have written'*.⁵⁶ However he gives two reasons for not communicating: a) because of his studies and conversations and b) he did not believe that his letters *'would result in any praise and service of God our Lord'* or that it would spiritually comfort them.⁵⁷ While continuing to maintain his physical relationship with his family and relatives, his letter shows that his greater focus is in a new found relationship in the Spirit. He believed that authentic discipleship cannot be consonant with a divided heart where one loved the family and God equally. This is explained in the following phrase:

I am able to love a person in this life to the extent that he is striving to go forward in the service and praise of God our Lord; for a person does not love God with his whole heart if he loves anything else for its own and not for God's sake.⁵⁸

The *'service and praise of God'* is thus the key phrase for Ignatius and his existence has only this end in mind. This overriding focus of his life to serve and praise God is seen in his understanding of charity which consists in *'the love by which we love the Lord our God for his own sake and all other things for his sake...'* His desire is that such charity be the foundation of his relationship with his family. The relationship with the family is not as before and its transformed nature is expressed in his desires *'to see intensely present in (himself), relatives, and friends this genuine love and strenuous effort in the service and praise of God our Lord, so that (he) might love and serve you ever more...'* He concludes the letter with an exhortation to be concerned about building up the riches in heaven and asks him to act accordingly.⁵⁹

speak about the transformed motive in order to communicate by writing or conversation.

⁵⁶ All the quotes in the next three paragraphs are from *LI*, pp. 4-7.

⁵⁷ This second point of spiritual benefit is expressed in a rather complicated phrase where he says that *'...or that it would give comfort to my kin according to the flesh in such a way that at the same time we would also be kin according to the Spirit and assist one another in the things that will last forever.'* Ignatius wants to say that he was not sure that his letters would comfort his kin in a manner that was beneficial from a human point of view which was at the same time be spiritual.

⁵⁸ *LI*, p. 5.

⁵⁹ *IBID.*, p. 6. *'...I beg you by the reverence and love of God our Lord to strive with all your strength to win honor in heaven, remembrance and fame before the Lord who is to be our judge, by using earthly goods, since he has left you with an abundance of them, to gain the goods that are eternal – by giving good example and sound instruction to your children, servants, and relatives; by bestowing holy words on one person, just punishments on another (yet without anger or rancor); by granting to one your*

He offers a justification for his long absence in engaging in any form of communication. He begins by expressing his surprise that his brother would have found the long hiatus strange because *'serious wounds are treated with one type of salve at the start of a cure, another in the middle, and still another at the end.'* In stating this Ignatius admits that the existing mode of relating to his family was not conducive for the end he desired for his life. As he indicated, the reorientation was a process with a start, a middle point and an end. At the start he needed a remedy which consisted in total separation from his family, and as he had grown in indifference and equanimity, he could then slowly return towards relating with his family. In explaining this point further he uses various biblical texts. Further on he explains his own spiritual process of affective separation by using the example of St. Paul.⁶⁰

8.2.3.2 Ottaviano Cesari

The case of Cesari Ottaviano reveals to us that dealing with affective relationships was not a simple affair.⁶¹ Ignatius' correspondences with the Duke, the parents, with the mother's confessor and with Ottaviano reveal the complexities involved in this case.⁶² In

house's patronage, to another money and property; by doing much good to poor orphans and needy.' This sentence by Ignatius is a classic example of his combination of the use of spiritual instruction followed by concrete ways of implementing the instruction. He is aware of the wealth and position of his brother and without condemning any of these attributes, asks him to use in to serve and praise the Lord by offering concrete examples.

⁶⁰ The biblical texts are related to Paul's spiritual process and include the following: (2 Cor. 12,7), (Rom. 7,23), (Gal. 5, 17), (Rom. 7,15. 19) and (Rom. 8,38-39). While the text indicates Ignatius' struggle with some disordered affection, we could also apply the same in the wider understanding of Ignatius' disordered affections in terms of how he related to his family, relations and the acquaintances during his worldly life.

⁶¹ Cf. PADBERG, JOHN W. "Ignatius, the Popes and Realistic Reverence", *Studies*- 25/2, 1993, pp. 28-30. He belonged to a well-connected family in Naples and his father was secretary to the Duke of Monteleone. Given the fact that Ottaviano's parents, especially his mother opposed his joining the Jesuits, he fled to Sicily and entered the Society there. Once a Jesuit, his mother wanted him in Naples and she petitioned the local superior and Ignatius for the same. Ignatius believed that Ottaviano's return to Naples would be harmful for his vocation and hence delayed sending him. The mother appealed to Pope Julius III who appointed a commission of three cardinals which included Carafa. Ignatius decided (against his liking) to grant the young Jesuit permission to visit Naples despite the peril that he foresaw. Ottaviano did go to Naples and a short while after Ignatius' death, left the Society.

⁶² Eight letters which are related to this case have been published in *Ignatius of Loyola – Letters and Instructions*, Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis. While some letters are specifically for this case, others are referring to it in passing. These include Nicolò Cesari (father) on 13th August, 19th November 1553 and 2nd February, 1556; Signora Cesari (mother) 28th January, 1554; to Jerónimo Doménech on 18th July, 1555 and to Ottaviano on 10th May, 1556 and 7th June, 1556.

the responses to the father and mother Ignatius is respectful but firm. He tells the father that the Rector as well as Ottaviano have *'justifiable fears that (Cesari's) coming to Naples might occasion him grave temptation.'*⁶³ Besides he too *'would be failing in (his) duty'*⁶⁴ as Superior General and therefore *'could not in good conscience order Ottaviano (to Naples) so long as he has such well-grounded fears.'*⁶⁵ After speaking about the local rector, Ottaviano and himself, Ignatius shifted to Nicolò's responsibility as a Christian father. He told him that the decision of Ignatius would be obvious to him *'if (he) stripped (himself) of that natural feeling which is so often opposed to the true love of charity with which children ought to be loved.'*⁶⁶ Ignatius then gently chides the parents for putting obstacles in a vocation which was rather clear.

If Ottaviano, were loved in this fashion, neither you nor his lady mother would seek, for your own consolation according to the flesh and blood, to put your son in danger of grave loss according to the spirit, as it would be for him to be disturbed in his vocation, which many signs show with great clarity to be from God our Lord.⁶⁷

Ignatius understood that the mother was strongly attached to Ottaviano and hence addressed her directly. Referring to her insistence he said that *'his mother would certainly not leave him in peace at Naples if she will not do so even in Sicily.'*⁶⁸ He put the vocation of their son in perspective by stating that *'she is not the first mother to have a son in religious life... and should be satisfied to know that he is well, advancing in studies and virtue.'*⁶⁹ The pedagogical value of this separation is seen in Ignatius' counsel to wait *'until he is more a man; then, when he no longer fears opposition, (because then) it will be easier for him to be sent back to Naples.'*⁷⁰ In his letter three months later, he agreed to send the son to Naples for some time in the future so as to console the mother, but refused to do immediately because of the strong possibility of this decision having adverse

⁶³ LL, p. 439.

⁶⁴ LL, p. 440.

⁶⁵ LL, p. 441.

⁶⁶ LL, p. 440.

⁶⁷ LL, p. 440.

⁶⁸ LL, p. 441

⁶⁹ LL, p. 441.

⁷⁰ LL, p. 441.

consequences.

....And any time we decided to bring him to Rome, this is what we would do – let him stay over for a few days in Naples and then continue his journey. But since it would be wrong to force Ottaviano's will or unsettle his mind by placing him in greater danger than he can easily endure, we will have to see his state of mind and will before determining whether he is to come.⁷¹

Two months later Ignatius wrote a letter to the mother. He was sympathetic to the health of the mother, but clearly states that it was the responsibility of every person to be obedient to the will of God placing it superior to human will. Ignatius' view of family relationships is clear in the response where he respectfully tells her that his decision will be based on the firm conviction of being primarily faithful to God's will. He was also convinced that the decision to send Ottaviano at this point would be against the divine will and capitulation in favor of *'something disordered and sinful.'*⁷²

...if in any way I could serve and console you without going against the will of God our Lord, I would be most eager to do so. However, a person of my profession cannot choose to comply with the will of a human being over God's will – something that not only a religious but every layperson should be far from doing. And since I believe that it would be against God's will to place the young man in danger, I cannot acquiesce in having him come to Naples at present – not until he himself is stronger and Your Ladyship more at peace and content with your son's choice⁷³

Eighteen months later in July, 1555 Ignatius asked Jerónimo Doménech, the Provincial of Sicily to send Ottaviano to Rome where there would be *'no fear of his being coerced by His Holiness or anyone else. There was no need for him to visit his mother in Naples...'*⁷⁴

The commission of three cardinals recommended that Ottaviano visit his mother. Ignatius believed that the decision lacked validity and felt very uncomfortable about allowing Ottaviano go home for a short period. However in February, 1556 Ignatius informed Ottaviano's father that *'once the winter was over, in order to give satisfaction to his*

⁷¹ *LI*, p. 448.

⁷² *LI*, p. 466.

⁷³ *LI*, pp. 465-66.

⁷⁴ *LI*, pp. 585-86.

*lady mother, we have decided to do so as soon as possible...'*⁷⁵ He also adds a word of caution requesting '*his mother and (the) whole household (to) encourage him in his vocation rather than the contrary...'*⁷⁶

Ignatius wrote a few letters to encourage Ottaviano in his vocation, but the reunion with his family had taken place before he was sufficiently strong in his vocation. Before Ignatius' death, Ottaviano requested to leave the Society. Less than two months before his death, he urged him to '*preserve (himself) in fear and love of God.*'⁷⁷ However he was not to persevere and a short while after the death of Ignatius, he left the Society of Jesus.

8.2.4 HUMILITY AND AFFECTIVE SEPARATION – SECOND STEP

Ignatius recommends a certain period of affective separation in order to help the transformative process within the candidate. There is no suggestion of affective annihilation and the candidate is advised to convert his natural affection to that which is spiritual. It is recommended that '*he should take care to put aside all merely natural affection for his relatives and convert it into spiritual.*' (GE 61³) In explaining the dynamics of a rightly oriented spiritual affection rather than remaining at an affection which is merely natural we shall follow the outline of the first stage. We shall begin by indicating the dynamics and effect of affective separation at the level of the candidate, followed by the Society, the Church and finally in the context of God's universal salvific plan.

8.2.4.1 The dynamics and effect in the candidate

The candidate would find affective separation more difficult than giving up temporal goods. While both would engender resistance because of attachments, the difficulty caused by affective relations is more because while temporal goods are extraneous to the person, affective relations are more intrinsic to the person.⁷⁸ Irrespective of the epoch

⁷⁵ LI, p. 632.

⁷⁶ LI, p. 632.

⁷⁷ LI, p. 677.

⁷⁸ Any form of affective separation or change within relationships leads to a difficult process of adjustment. The causes could be natural or extraordinary. Separation caused due to change of work place, the commencement of a

that we have lived in, the bonds of familial and affective relationship have always been strong. With the growth of psychology in the last century, the positive appraisal of the family and affective relationships has helped change the earlier negative perception vis-à-vis spiritual life.⁷⁹

Affective transformation takes time and is a complex process because the human person is undergoing a transformation in terms of realizing who constitutes the significant other in his life. Instead of parents, friends or relatives, it is Christ who is the significant other and is the primary focal point of one's affective life. There is a new way of relating with others whereby one is '*dead to the world and self-love*' (GE 61³) – i.e. relating in a natural manner towards a new way of '*living only for Christ our Lord*' – (GE 61³) i.e. relating to others in a spiritual manner. The new relation consists in a transformed person who has a new goal by which everything is geared towards the praise and service of God.

Ignatius was aware that such freedom and availability was not an automatic effect, but a long drawn process as seen in Ottaviano's case. He therefore expected the candidate to humbly accept the need for physical separation, be willing to allow others decide his destiny and submit to whatever time and process was necessary for such separation. Such separation was in keeping with the apostolic charism of the Society and proved to be fruitful in the proximate as well as distant future. Its proximate fruitfulness was because the public manifestation of being physically and affectively separate from one's loved ones offered witness to the centrality of God in the life of each person. The

new relationship, addition to a family, separation or caused by causes such as war, natural disasters, accidents, etc. are difficult to address. The loss of property or temporal goods is easier to deal with, but the separation or loss to affective relationships is far more difficult. The fact that in the case of a candidate it is a voluntary separation does make it easier. However the realization of a greater good gives a person the strength to embrace this separation.

⁷⁹ Instead of looking at affective relationships as a danger, the last few GCs have a more balanced view about affective relationships – a view which is in tune with the original text of the GE (if understood correctly). This is why GC 31 recommended that novitiate should no longer be in an isolated place, but was to be in a place where the '*novices' probation could be conducted according to the life proper of the Society.*' [GC 31: D. 8/22] While maintaining due separation, the novices formation should foster rather than crush human values. Hence '*care must be taken to prevent the novitiate's being so remote from reality that novices' difficulties are there overlooked rather than solved. The more the novices are stimulated to assume responsibilities with prudence and discerning charity, the more successfully will they acquire spiritual maturity and more freely will they adhere to their vocation.*' [GC 31: D. 8/23]

candidate manifested to the whole world, the freedom, joy and redemptive value of such separation. The fruitfulness in the distant future could be seen in that it helped the candidate to grow in freedom and availability so that the Society could confidently send a person to any place trusting that the formed Jesuit would know how to deal with affective relationships – even when it involved persons from his own family.⁸⁰

8.2.4.2 The dynamics and effect in the Society

The affective separation aids the Society's in being faithful and fruitful in its mission. The invitation to be affectively separate from the family for a certain period of time is not in order that it functions as an exclusive group which is separate and autonomous. Rather the restriction imposed is in order to better grow into a wider circle of interdependence and enhanced relationships. The family has always been the primary seed-bed of vocations and the Society with an attitude of gratitude and humility requests the family to collaborate in strengthening the vocation of the candidate. History has shown that a relationship of mutual respect and humility has led to many families becoming benefactors of the Society and collaborating actively in its mission.

The primary advantage of affective separation for the Society is in forming persons who are free and available for mission. Considering the fact that the Society's charism is basically an apostolic charism, it is fundamental that its members be available for whatever mission is assigned to them. In taking forward the mission assigned to a Jesuit, an important component is the element of discernment. In order to engage in a process of ongoing discernment, affective separation is critical. It helps a person to be indifferent and remain focused on one's primary goal, i.e. the praise and service of God while making a choice. The commitment of individuals of this caliber positively effects the Society's particular and universal mission.

Such affective separation leading to detachment results in better harmony within the Society. The presence of members who do not have an inordinate affective

⁸⁰ The spiritually mature Ignatius would go on to be apostolically involved with members of his own family or old acquaintances on various occasions. However the freedom, clarity and availability for Christ's mission helped him re-interpreted those old relationships in new light leading to greater glory, praise and service of God.

attachment towards persons outside the Society will lead to the right form of internal relationship and aid in building healthy apostolic communities. This spirit fostered by the Constitutions led Ignatius to call the first group as 'friends in the Lord.' The first companions had not annihilated their affection towards their natural family, but through an internal transformation converted it towards their spiritual family.

From times immemorial, the human person has been a social animal and cannot live without society. The intent of affective separation is not to create a person who is individualistic and can live life by being independent of society at large. Rather it is in order to help create an individual who knows how to relate with others in a Society wherein the end has been redefined and the various gamut of social relations are ordained in order to praise, glorify and serve God our Lord.

The technological revolution that forms part of our society today has had an immense influence on social and affective relationships and hence one needs to understand this invitation of affective separation in a new light. Just as it offers us new possibilities of giving witness to Christ and His mission, it also presents new challenges and dangers in terms of the candidate's formation and spiritual growth. The pressure and influence of social media, groups of friends and the traditional ties to family and relatives during the initial years of formation, especially during the second probation need to be discrete and limited because of its importance for the entire life of a Jesuit. The time of experiences during the novitiate is one of intense internal movements and hence the adverse influence of affective attachments could seriously disturb the foundational phase of a Jesuit's life.

8.2.4.3 The dynamics and effect in the Church

Moving on to the dynamics and effect of the candidate's affective separation on the Church we can say that it was immense. The Society was born at a time when ecclesiastical offices and benefices were given away on personal and family considerations. On various occasions, decisions on these matters did not involve spiritual discernment but was limited to personal affections. As against such a decadent

culture, the decision to voluntarily separate oneself from relationships which were limited to natural or sanguine affections was important in giving witness to a different way of being the Church. The decision of the candidate to look for the appropriate affective relationship with one's family and loved ones helped in creating a model Church. Communities which were fast becoming multi-cultural were defined by having a right relationship among themselves wherein Christ was the head and the members formed the body. In such communities the celebration of the Eucharist became more meaningful and the Church truly lived the Trinitarian mystery of love.

The years following the foundation of the Society were ones of tremendous missionary expansion. There was need of persons who were willing to separate themselves for life from their families and loved ones in order to proclaim the Good News. More and more persons were necessary in lands which had not known the Christian faith. The Society was greatly helped by such missionaries who left the shores of their countries never to see their loved ones again. This availability greatly helped spread the Christian faith and in turn made the Church truly universal. At present we live in a globalized world with frequent needs to engage in apostolic activities cutting across countries and cultures. An affective detachment from one's own family, loved ones, ethnic group, culture or country in order to respond to the needs of the Society's universal mission is the need of the hour.

8.2.4.4 The dynamics and effect in the universal plan of salvation

The act (or rather series of acts) of the candidate has an important role in the universal salvific plan of God. The humble and insignificant act of an individual helps in the overall transformation of the family from being a set of relationships which is based on sanguine relationships, towards a new relationship which is primarily founded on the gratuitous love of God as revealed in Christ. The family thus becomes a model of the Triune love where the affections and inter-relationships are primarily based on the self-emptying love of the Triune God. Given the fact that the family or close knit groups form the basis of human life, the realm of our existence is modelled and transformed by an experience of the inter-relationship within the Trinity.

While contemplating the mystery of the Incarnation we see how the Second Person of the Blessed Trinity, voluntarily offered himself to become human in order to respond to the needs of the world. In the same way the candidate participates in the Incarnational mystery in the present moment by offering himself to work under the standard of Christ and help realize the Kingdom of God. The gesture of the candidate has consequence that goes beyond the Church and affects the world at large. This is because we live in a society which is pluralistic and multi-religious. The decision to voluntarily restrict one's affective relationships influences people of other faiths and cultures. It also solicits a similar response from others in varying degrees and leads to an ever greater harmonious society where all are nourished by God love and lovingly empty themselves for others.

CONCLUSION

The two stages of kenotic transformation are not easy processes and Ignatius does not dissimulate the difficulties involved. However the starting point of inviting the candidate to enter into this process is always a reminder of its salvific value in terms of the glory of God and the fulfilment of the individual. This in turn is intimately related to the consequences in the Society, the church and the world at large. Given the importance of the internal process Ignatius repeatedly highlights the need to internalize the external acts of giving up temporal goods and affective separation.

The tendencies of self-love is far stronger than we imagine and hence we see Ignatius strongly advocating the strategy of *agere contra* – i.e. choosing the opposite of what one instinctly desires. While some may accuse Ignatius of going overboard in his suggestion, it must be said that this pedagogy was part of the tradition of Christian spirituality and Ignatius has experienced the fruitful benefits of the same in his own life. We see how he grew in internally understanding the wisdom of these kenotic processes and the illustrations from his own life confirm the same.

Ignatius based the kenotic process in keeping with the unique apostolic charism of the Society. His focus was not primarily stability or an individual grow in sanctity, but

consisted in helping the candidate grow in inner freedom so as to be available for mission. However the reference point for concretely taking the necessary steps that entailed this kenotic process would always be a growing love for Christ and a greater participation in the Trinitarian love. The text combines firmness with the necessary flexibility leading to a creative tension which combines that which is ideal with the actual realistic situation. We could conclude by saying that the first two stages provide a method in order to help the candidate grow in greater freedom and responsibility in order to respond more generously to the Eternal King.

CHAPTER 9

3RD STAGE – EMPTYING OF ONESELF

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

The stage now shifts to a more important phase in the process of emptying – the emptying of oneself. After giving up temporal goods and separating oneself from affective relationships, the candidate is now invited to empty himself totally. As usual, emptying or giving up something is always in the context of gaining something greater. The process of voluntary self-emptying wherein the candidate gives up his own judgment in favor of the superior's, is in order to grow in humility, internal freedom and trust in God. The following three points deal with three different means to help the candidate empty himself of his self-love. These include: a) fraternal correction [63]; b) the primary and secondary experiences [64-90]; c) account of conscience, vows and stability [80-100].

The combined effect of these three points on the candidate will now be elaborated. The method followed will be similar to what was adopted in the first and second stages. Given the fact that there are three facets in this phase of self-emptying, we shall deal with the historical introduction and textual analysis of each point separately. However since the three share a common goal and are part of an inter-related process through which the candidate concretely understands the redemptive value of emptying oneself, we shall offer a combined conclusion. In it, as in the previous stages we shall elaborate

the overall dynamics and effect of these three points on the candidate's growth in humility and self-emptying love.

9.1 FRATERNAL CORRECTIONS [63]

The *GE* has a brief note on fraternal corrections – no. 63. This is a sensitive point where one ought to pay attention to the underlying of motive of such an exercise. The purpose of fraternal correction is solely with the purpose of growing in spiritual love. The candidate is asked whether he would be willing to have his errors pointed out and would he in turn help others in their spiritual growth. Let us now look at the history of corrections in the tradition of spiritual life and follow it up by a textual analysis of the same.

9.1.1 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The pedagogy of corrections was part of a candidate's formative process from the origins of religious life. In the *RP*, various corrective instructions which deal with prayer, work and community life were suggested.¹ The *Rule of Basil* also instructed on how one ought to correct another. In responding to a question regarding the method of correcting a sinner, various biblical quotes are offered. [Q. 16] Precaution is suggested while commenting on the motive and manner of correcting another. The disposition while rebuking and receiving correction is elaborated by giving the example of a father who is a physician who attends to his ailing son. [Q. 23-24]² The Rule indicates the fruits by which it would be know that the rebuke has been out of sympathy or merely to vent his

¹ The tone is rather harsh and there is constant reference to the word 'punishment' and not 'correction'. '[8] *If it happens that during the psalmody or the prayer or in the midst of a reading anyone speaks or laughs, he shall unfasten his belt immediately and with neck bowed down and hands hanging down he shall stand before the altar and be rebuked by the superior of the monastery. He shall do the same also in the assembly of the brothers when they assemble to eat.* [9] *When by day the trumpet blast has called (the brothers) to the synaxis, anyone who comes after the first prayer shall be punished in the manner described above and shall remain standing in the refectory.* [10] *At night however, more is conceded to the body's weakness and anyone who comes after the third prayer shall be punished in the same manner both in the synaxis and at meal time.* [14] *If any one of them forgets anything and hesitates in speaking, he shall undergo punishment for his negligence and forgetfulness.*' The focus of punishment is not so much on one's internal life, but on the lack of compliance with established rules. (Cf. *Pachomian Koinonia – Volume Two*, (Tr. Veilleux, Armand), Cistercian Publications Inc.: Michigan, 1981, pp. 146-47.)

² *The Rule of St. Basil in Latin and English...*, p. 131.

own wrath.³ The *RA* has an elaborate instruction regarding fraternal correction. Though the context is related to chastity, it could be applied to other situations as well.⁴ He goes so far as to say that after the first admonition, a person cannot remain silent.

Call him to order with due firmness. Do not think that you are acting out of ill-will in doing this. On the contrary, you would be at fault if by your silence you allow your brothers to meet their downfall, when by speaking you could set them on the right path.⁵

In the fourth book of the *Institutes*, Cassian speaks about various kinds of corrections and these include even physical corrections when necessary.⁶ However specific instruction regarding fraternal corrections can be seen in his eighth book related to the spirit of anger where he says that one cannot be blind to a brother's wrongdoing. However what matters is the process and inspiration. The person who engages in fraternal correction ought to take care that he himself does not fall into the vice of wrath.

He should strive to cure a wrongdoing brother, if need be, in such a way that, while bringing relief to one who is perhaps laboring under a rather slight fever, he does not get angry and bring upon himself the more baleful malady of blindness, so that as he sees the speck in his brother's eye he does not see the beam in his own eye. For it behooves the one who wishes to heal someone else's wound to be healthy and untouched by any disease or illness, lest the gospel saying be applied to him: "Physician, heal yourself first." And how will a person see to remove the speck from his brother's eye if he carries about a

³ Question 191 indicates that the chief criterion of one who rebukes with sympathy is that '*he conducts himself with mercy*', is '*afflicted and saddened in the same way towards every sin*' and thirdly he himself '*observes that rule*'. [Q. 191] Question 193 suggests that one who reprimands merely for the sake of venting one's own vice, ought to '*be censured... (and) shown the way to amend himself through the practices of the disciplined life...*' [Q. 193] (Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 123,275-77.)

⁴ The person is expected to warn his brother for a provocative look. If he continues, he should '*consider him a sick person in need of treatment*' (*RA* 4/8) The issue has to be dealt with firmly and if the person '*does not wish to listen to your warning, then first advise the superior so that he and the brother may talk the matter out in private*'. (*RA* 4/9) If this does not resolve the issue that '*without his knowledge, others must be brought in*.' (*RA* 4/9) At a later stage the Rule also speaks of the need to use harsh words for the sake of fraternal correction. (*RA* 6/3) (Cf. *The Rule of Saint Augustine...*, pp. 17-18, 22.)

⁵ *IBID.*, p. 17.

⁶ After speaking other kinds of corrections and repentance, the 16th chapter of the 4th book goes on to speak of physical punishment in case of necessity. '*...3. But other faults, which we commit indiscriminately and which we also view as quite reprehensible, are corrected not by that spiritual punishment we have described but by blows, or they are purged by expulsion. These include loud altercations, open contempt, blatant contradictions, fierce and reckless departure, familiarity with women, anger, quarrels, dissension and disputes, daring to have one's own work, being contaminated by avarice, the desire for and the possession of superfluties that other brothers do not have, excessive and clandestine eating, and things like these.*' (Cf. *John Cassian: The Institutes...*, p. 86.)

beam of wrath in his own eye?⁷

The *RM* draws much from Cassian and chapters 12 to 14 deal with corrections, penances and excommunications.⁸ The deans were expected to report an incorrigible brother who is '*contumacious or proud or given to murmuring or disobedient*' (*RM XII*¹) to the abbot.⁹ He was excommunicated from the community and is reincorporated only after adequate penance has been done.¹⁰ Moving on to the *RB* we see that at the very onset corrections are suggested for one who does what he likes. The abbot too is expected to '*fear God and keep the Rule in everything he does.*'¹¹ (*RB-3*⁷) Regarding the correction of a specific brother, it recommends that if a person is disobedient, stubborn or proud, '*he should be warned twice privately by the seniors.*' (*RB-23*²) If the person does not reform, he should be excommunicated.¹²

The *RF* when speaking of the Ministers asks them to '*visit and admonish their brethren, and humbly and charitably correct them; not commanding them anything that is against their own soul and (the) Rule.*'¹³ (*RF-34*) Further on the Ministers are expected to be charitable and kind towards friars who cannot observe the Rule spiritually. (*RF-36*)

In the Primitive Dominican Constitutions, the novice master was expected to correct the novices when they are negligent. (*PDC XII*) During their period of probation, the '*Master (is expected to) hear their faults outside the chapter and, as far as*

⁷ Cf. *John Cassian: The Institutes...*, p. 196.

⁸ Cf. *The Rule of the Master...*, pp. 149-158. Though we shall refer to chapters 12 – 14, the preceding chapter, i.e. no. 11 deals with the deans where instructions regarding their vigilance over those given to their charge is explained in detail.

⁹ Cf. *IBID.*, p. 149.

¹⁰ Excommunication has various stages and this include isolated from the table, from the oratory, from engaging in conversation with others, in work and in certain cases physical punishment which could end up in expulsion from the monastery. '*If the excommunicated brothers show themselves so arrogant that they persist in the pride of their heart and refuse to make satisfaction to the abbot... they are to be confined and whipped with rods to the point of death and if the abbot so please, be expelled from the monastery.*' (Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 152-53.)

¹¹ *The Rule of St. Benedict...*, p. 181.

¹² This number adds that in such a decision, the concerned person ought to '*understand the nature of this punishment.*' [*RB 23*⁴] It the person is incapable of understanding, it is recommended that he '*undergo corporal punishment.*' (*RB 23*⁵) (Cf. *IBID.*, p. 221.)

¹³ Cf. CAJETAN, ESSER. *Rule of St. Francis*, Herald Press: Illinois, 1977, pp. 25-26.

possible, instruct them carefully regarding their behavior and correct them in a charitable manner.’¹⁴ Chapters 21, 22 & 24 give details about corrections regarding ordinary faults, grave faults and the ‘most grave’ fault.¹⁵

The *Modern Devotion* also emphasizes the importance of fraternal correction. Engen in introducing this movement speaks of four distinguishing characteristics and the third consisted in the practice of fraternal corrections. It consisted in ‘open confession of faults, continuous admonition of others, and readings to accept such admonition.’¹⁶ The goal of such correction was ‘a matter of humility and edification and therefore central to developing spiritual life.’¹⁷ It was in keeping with the monastic chapter of faults, but raised suspicion among the clergy because of the possibility of substituting the confessional. Though it was disconcerting to the average person, the practice of fraternal correction ‘became one of the distinguishing marks of these congregations.’¹⁸

As we come to the end of the historical background we see that the practice of fraternal correction was deeply engrained in the spiritual tradition of the Church. It was rooted in scripture and was interpreted in keeping with the specific charism of the particular group. It was fundamental for the spiritual growth of the individual as well as the overall spiritual health of the concerned group/community.

Time and again concern regarding the motive has been strongly expressed. This was in order to ensure that charity and fraternal concern were the inspiration to engage in this practice. Fraternal correction was intrinsically linked to the virtue of humility indicating its centrality for harmonious spiritual growth within the individual as well as the community. In the subsequent points we shall see echoes of this practice in the life of Ignatius and the instruction of the *GE*.

¹⁴ http://www.op.org/sites/www.op.org/files/public/documents/fichier/primitive_consti_en.pdf (on 15/10/2015)

¹⁵ ‘The most grievous fault is the incorrigibility of one who does not fear to admit his guilt, but refuses the penalty. Of such a one our father Augustine commands that, if he does not leave of his own accord, he should be expelled from your society.’ (IBID.)

¹⁶ *Devotio Moderna – Basic Writings...*, p. 17.

¹⁷ IBID.

¹⁸ IBID.

9.1.2 THE TEXT AND ITS INTERPRETATIONS

9.1.2.1 The Text

The text related to fraternal correction remained basically unchanged from the very beginning.¹⁹ Right from the onset the motivation for inquiring about the candidate's willingness related to fraternal correction has been understood in terms of love and the desire for perfection.²⁰ The three fundamental points consist in asking the candidate if he was willing:

- a. To allow others manifest his errors/defects to the superior.
- b. To correct others
- c. To be corrected by others.

The text in elaborating this point lays emphasis on internal attitudes, more than external details. It invites the candidate to focus on the attitude of humility that ought to characterize such an activity. He is invited to realize that he needs the assistance of others for the sake of '*greater progress in spiritual life and especially for his greater lowliness and humility.*' (GE 63¹) The attitude expected of the candidate is further elaborated towards the end of this number where he is exhorted to engage in this exercise '*with due love and charity (and) for the greater glory of God.*' (GE 63²) It had been realized that the inability to acknowledge one's faults and ask pardon from others was a serious obstacle to, progress in spiritual life.²¹

9.1.2.2 Interpretation of the Text

The success of fraternal correction as a spiritual pedagogy depends on faithfulness to the motivation and harmonious inter-relationship of the three groups, i.e. the candidate, the

¹⁹ The four texts of are basically same. The text of 1556 has added the phrases '*greater progress in spiritual life*' (GE-63¹) and '*anyone who knows them outside confession.*' (GE-63¹) (Cf. MCo – II, pp. 52-53.)

²⁰ AICARDO, JOSÉ MANUEL. *Comentario de las Constituciones de la Compañía de Jesús – II...*, pp. 277-78. '*...En las cuales se pone el fundamento de toda esta materia, que es el amor y deseo de la perfección y de ser ayudado a ella; se establece la corrección mutua evangélica...*'

²¹ This point had been seen in the earlier tradition of the Church. In *Sex Dubitorum* we find a phrase which suggests that if one who had hurt others was unable to ask pardon, he should be sent out. '*R. 14 – Quien vbiere hecho iniuria o sinrazón a otro, pidale perdón, y él désele; donde no quieran hazerlo de corazón, que se echen de casa.*' (MCo – I, p. 276.)

Superior and other members of the community. Hence we find various GCs frequently insisting that fraternal corrections was intrinsic to the Society's governance. Speaking of fraternal correction within the Society, Aicardo says:

En esto se funda todo el gobierno de las Constituciones, donde ni una sola vez se apela al fuero judicial, ni en el inquirir las culpas, ni en el poner las penas, ni aun en el mismo acto de la expulsión de los indignos...Las Constitutions no hablan de tribunales, ni de jueces, como no hablan de cárceles y cepos; más el tenerlos alguna vez, no es contra ellas, como no lo es tampoco el empleo de esos castigos.²²

Despite the charitable understanding in the beginning, this number met with various difficulties from within and outside the Society. Some interpreted the text as indicating that all fraternal correction had to be done through the Superior. Due to this the Society was accused as being neither faithful to the exhortation of Scripture (*Mk. 18, 15-17*) nor respectful of the personal reputation of the person. Aldama explains that this problem was due to a wrong interpretation of the gerund 'manifesting' (*descubriendo*).²³ He says that:

...in the original Spanish text the first two actions ("aid in correcting and being corrected") were conditioned by the third ("manifesting one another"). In other words, the correcting is not to be made directly, brother to brother, but through the superior, with each one manifesting the faults of the other to the superior so that he may correct them. This reading is based on a false interpretation of the gerund "manifesting" (*Descubriendo*) as if it were necessarily a modal gerund: "by manifesting." ...in the language of Ignatius the gerund can perform very different functions, including that of substituting for other verbal forms. Here the gerund "descubriendo" is used as an infinitive. Its Latin translation is "ac manifestare."²⁴

The early fathers and the GC's while speaking about this text constantly invited the reader to place greater emphasis on the spiritual meaning of this text. Laynez explained that fraternal correction was understood in the context of greater self-

²² AICARDO, JOSÉ MANUEL. *Comentario de las Constituciones de la Compañía de Jesús – II...*, p. 274.

²³ The Spanish text goes as follows: '*siendo él mismo y cada uno de los otros contento de ayudar a corregir y de ser corregido, descubriendo el uno al otro con debido amor y caridad...*' (GE 63²)

²⁴ ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory...*, pp. 46-48. In order to refute the allegation that direct fraternal correction was dissuaded in this text, Aldama goes on to analyze the Latin translation, the explanations of Láinez, Ribadeneira and other early Jesuit sources.

abnegation and renunciation of oneself.²⁵ He justified it on the basis of Scripture and the tradition of the Church. Further on he specified that it was outside the realm of confession and lamented that there were two principal reasons for the loss of vocations - the sins of the flesh and negligence in fraternal corrections.²⁶

The point related to fraternal correction was debated during various GCs. Decrees 32-34 of the 6th GC elaborated at length about how a superior ought to act on receiving the report of a person's fault. These decrees reiterate the fact that

...Ours yield any right whatsoever that would otherwise be theirs not to have anything revealed that is damaging to their reputation; and they grant permission to all to report to the superior anything known about them, even serious faults, seeing that, for the sake of greater humility and spiritual progress and in order to be better known to and better guided or helped by the superior, they themselves have expressly agreed to this and have made the judgment that for them this is more useful for the greater glory of God and the good of their soul. [GC VI – D/32.2]

This decree underlines the spiritual dimension of fraternal correction and indicates that a person should not wait until information is requested, but that he should be forthcoming in offering it especially if 'this has been clearly prescribed by the superior.' [GC VI – D/32.5] This should be done with charity and love and if there is possibility of imminent loss to a third party, then each one 'not only can, but is bound immediately to make a fatherly denunciation, reporting these matters to the superior, so that he may provide prudently and in secret both for the good of the subject and for the good of religion as well.' [GC VI – D/32.7]²⁷

The GCs of the last century have repeatedly stressed that fraternal correction should be motivated by charity. GC 27 has a long explanation about the responsibility of reporting a matter which has come to light outside confession to the superior. [GC 27 –

²⁵ DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. "Esortazioni...", p. 166. 'Seguiva quell punto della renuntiatione di se stesso et abnegatione propria, et circa a questa abnegatione si danno in questo Examine da N. Padre molti utilissimi documenti. L'uno è che ciascuno voglia che tutti i suoi difetti sieno referiti da altri a' superiori etc.'

²⁶ IBID. 'Duoi peccati sono causa della perdition di molti, cioè, il peccato della carne et la negligentia circa la correctione fraternal; et i flagella universali che manda Dio, sono mandate per questa negligentia.'

²⁷ The following decree (no. 33) refers to the manner a superior should act on receiving a report of someone's fault. The next decree (no. 34) is a short explanation about the manner of making known the aspect of fraternal correction to novices.

D/62.2] Underlining decree 32 of GC VII, it once again repeats that such information should ‘proceed only from a motive of charity and be carried out in a manner that evinces love and charity.’ [GC 27 – D/62.5] The last few GCs have consistently highlighted the fact that the Jesuit is a sinner, prone to faults and in constant need of fraternal correction.

The Complementary Norms in explaining this number repeat the basic intent of the *GE* in a language which is more apt to today’s context. It begins by explaining the purpose of fraternal correction and cautions against revealing anything divulged during confession. The Norms highlight the fact that one has an obligation to manifest to the superior if there is something which may ‘cause serious harm to the common good or imminent danger to some third party.’ It reiterates the role of the superior and occasions when the information could be given to the higher superior. Finally it exhorts the superiors to be balanced in dealing with reports about the faults of others and act with prudence by investigating the matter well and taking a proper decision.²⁸ (CN 235/1-5)

9.1.3 FRATERNAL CORRECTION IN THE LIFE OF IGNATIUS

The text in the *GE* is succinct and continues to hold a pre-eminent place within the individual and community’s spiritual process. We have looked at the text and its various interpretations down the centuries culminating in the elaborations offered by the Complementary Norms. As seen in other texts, this too emerged and was refined by the experience of Ignatius and his first companions. In order to understand the role of fraternal corrections in aiding a person we shall briefly analyze two letters written by Ignatius – the first written to Nicolas Bobadilla in 1543 and the second to a scholastic Antonio Barandão in 1551.

9.1.3.1 Letter of Ignatius to Nicolas Bobadilla (1543)

The context of this correspondence deals with Ignatius’ insistence on receiving regular letters from other Jesuits. Besides the regularity of these letters, he insisted that they

²⁸ The person whose fault has been highlighted ought to have a chance to defend himself and in case of false calumny, the one who reported falsely should be reprehended or punished.

ought to be written in a specific format. Ignatius was insistent that the *'main letter ought to be written out twice: after being written the first time and corrected, it should then be copied or handed over to another to copy a second time, so as to avoid the disadvantages of unconsidered writing.'*²⁹ Besides expecting thoroughness in the text of the letter, he expected the letter to contain two parts – the main letter which contains *'any matters that are at all edifying'* and anyone wishing to give further information *'should write as fully as he wishes on separate sheets or in a separate letter.'*³⁰ Though this letter offers us more insights into the personality of Ignatius, the relationship with Bobadilla and the Society's way of governance we limit ourselves to the realm of fraternal correction. We shall pay attention to the tone and manner of Ignatius as well as his attitude of humility in dealing with a sensitive matter and relating to a companion who was unique in many ways.

At the onset the tone is one of *'a certain fraternal correction'*³¹ where Ignatius expresses his gratitude for being corrected and indicates that he too would engage in a similar spiritual exercise. After reminding Bobadilla about the agreement among the first companions, he humbly acknowledges *'his poor and mean native understanding'* and clearly states that he does not intend *'setting up (himself) as a universal norm.'*³² He is not authoritative but polite when he appeals to the generally accepted principle in indicating that the manner and frequency of writing letters was *'what we all had agreed upon.'*³³ After these introductory remarks he moves on to deal with more specific issues.

The tone continues to remain charitable even as he moves on to the more specific matters raised by Bobadilla related to the use of certain words and expressions.³⁴ The annoyance of Ignatius is obvious, but he continues to maintain a polite but firm tone. He

²⁹ *LI*, p. 95.

³⁰ *LI*, p. 95.

³¹ *LI*, p. 94.

³² *LI*, p. 95.

³³ *LI*, p. 95.

³⁴ The first refers to the use of the word *'expedir'* instead of *'expender'*. Ignatius clarifies that he had indeed used the word *'expender'* and the error was due to the copyist. However he apologized for the fault and explained that he *'did not personally check the final version but relied on someone else, since it was not a main letter that was to be shown to others.'* The second referred to the use of the phrase *'palace of the King of the Romans'* instead of writing *'court of the King of Romans.'*

begins by accepting his mistake in the use of some words which were supposedly considered to be a *'blunder'*. However he expected Bobadilla to exercise prudence and would have hoped that *'when (he) saw people laughing, (he) would stop showing (the letter) around.'*³⁵ Now that the corrective had been made in the subsequent letters, he hoped that Bobadilla would *'show this (corrected) letter around too.'*³⁶

He now moves from the level of textual correction and stylistic presentations towards the central point of fraternal correction – i.e. in having the right internal attitude to fulfil the apostolic end of the Society. Ignatius requested Bobadilla to have the right attitude of obedience and humility for his own spiritual growth. He explains this primary end when he states that:

Actually, I was not so much anxious to correct the phrasing of your letter as desirous of your own entire perfection – assuming, of course, that a part of that perfection consists in your humbling yourself and obeying the one into whose hands you made a vow of obedience.³⁷

At the same time he explains to Bobadilla the apostolic end of these letters when he says that *'numerous friends and acquaintances who learn we have received letters from the Society's members want to see these letters and enjoy reading them.'*³⁸ While fraternally correcting Bobadilla, Ignatius is able to frame the matter in a larger picture where correction is not merely a personal affair but is related to the larger apostolic goal of the Society.

Ignatius treads cautiously in correcting Bobadilla in a matter which was delicate but at the same time critical – i.e. the understanding of obedience and humility. He combines his own openness to correction as well as his willingness to grow in humility and obedience while exhorting Bobadilla towards the same. In the third part of this letter Ignatius deals with Bobadilla's rather harsh accusation that these details insisted

³⁵ *LI*, p. 95.

³⁶ *LI*, p. 96.

³⁷ *LI*, p. 96.

³⁸ *LI*, p. 96. This was the reason that Ignatius insisted on a separation of the letter into what could be read by others and what was meant for private reading.

by Ignatius were a waste of time (no. 6) and that no one is edified by reading these letters (no. 7).³⁹ Ignatius counters this by quoting Bobadilla's own testimony⁴⁰ and those of others such as Doctor Ortiz, Fray Francisco and Doctor Picart of Paris.⁴¹ He then goes on to chide Bobadilla of going back to writing letters exactly the way he wrote them earlier. Regarding the lack of time, Ignatius tells him that he reads and re-reads Bobadilla's letters and was willing to '*cut out whatever (was) superfluous and make whatever adaptation*'⁴² was needed so that Bobadilla could find time to read his letters.

This letter on fraternal correction ends with a profound attitude of humility on the part of Ignatius. He was open to correction and '*therefore begged of (him) by the love and reverence of God our Lord to write how (he) thought (Ignatius) could best write.*'⁴³ The second part of no. 7 reveals that Ignatius (despite being General) does not take an authoritarian approach but says that he '*(has) repeatedly asked and implored (him) and now implores (him) once more in the Lord.*'⁴⁴ Further on Ignatius humbly acknowledges his limitation as General and indicates that he was willing to cast his vote for Bobadilla as General. On his part he expressed how he would '*prefer to remain lowly and be free of this burden*'⁴⁵ (of being General).

This letter gives us a good indication of Ignatius' understanding of fraternal correction. In the first place Ignatius makes it clear that he wants information about the person as well as the apostolic activities. The purpose of this communication in the form of letters was in order to better govern the Society and inform as well as edify friends, acquaintances and collaborators about the Society. His attitude is that of a companion

³⁹ *LI*, pp. 96-97.

⁴⁰ *LI*, p. 96. '*I recall that you received my letter and answered with considerable edification and satisfaction.*'

⁴¹ *LI*, p. 97. While speaking that the letters were not to be shown to anyone and sundry, he speaks of how all who read it were edified. '*... thought you would show them to a few people who would take them in good part, as I have learned has been the case so far with all the others to whom I have sent this same main letter (unless I am deceived by what they write me) – even Doctor Ortiz and his brother Fray Francisco, and Doctor Picart of Paris.*'

⁴² *LI*, p. 97.

⁴³ *LI*, p. 97.

⁴⁴ *LI*, p. 97. Ignatius says that he considers himself unworthy. Despite of having given Bobadilla instructions about the manner of writing letters, Ignatius request him to do the best he can. '*...Write the best way you can ... or however you think best.*'

⁴⁵ *LI*, p. 97.

and this is reflected in the tone of the letter. As far as Bobadilla is concerned, Ignatius is respectful, considerate, polite, humble, flexible and loving. He is not overbearing, authoritarian, paternalistic or overtly judgmental. While at some times his tone is aggressive and ironical, we prefer to interpret this letter as one that demonstrates profound love and affection towards Bobadilla.

The letter also indicates that the process of fraternal correction is not one-sided but consists in a healthy inter-relationship which is mutually enriching. Just as Bobadilla was invited to greater obedience, humility and love, Ignatius used this opportunity in order to remind himself of the need to grow in the same virtues. He acknowledges his imperfections and asks Bobadilla to help in his spiritual process so that together they could *'better serve Him and praise His holy name.'*⁴⁶

9.1.3.2 Letter of Ignatius to Antonio Barandão (1551)

This letter was written to a Portuguese scholastic 'who had accompanied Simão Rodrigues to Rome. The replies form a complement to the advice that Ignatius had written to Urbano Fernandes, the new rector at Coimbra.'⁴⁷ The letter begins by listing the 16 questions from Barandão and the answer to these questions follow. For our purpose we shall limit ourselves to questions 8, 9 and 10. After indicating the questions we shall offer a summary of the response given by Ignatius. The three relevant questions are as follows:

8. In hearing confession of members of the community, should he question them even about matters not related to sin? In which cases should he ask the penitent's permission to tell the superior about what was said in confession?

9. How should he deal with the superior regarding the temptations experienced by others? Should he report them in full even if some of them may be over and past?

10. Should one correct an imperfection noticed in an individual member of the Society, or leave him with the delusion that it is no imperfection?⁴⁸

⁴⁶ *LI*, p. 98. This is the concluding part of the letter.

⁴⁷ *LI*, p. 339. This text is part of the introduction to each letter offered by the editors of this book.

⁴⁸ *LI*, p. 340.

Ignatius responds to the eight question in two parts. In the first he says that the confessor *'sometimes may and should ask questions about venial faults.'*⁴⁹ Regarding the second part, he begins by *'stressing the importance of the superior being aware of everything that is going on in the subject.'*⁵⁰ The goal of such information is in order to assist the superior in providing each subject what he needs and avoid placing him in situations of danger. The confessor *'discreetly and taking into account the matter and particular circumstances, may ask permission to tell the matter to the superior (when he believes that) the afflicted person will receive help...'*⁵¹

Regarding the ninth question, Ignatius emphatically states that *'the superior ought to be fully informed about everything, even things over and past.'*⁵² The purpose we presume is the same as above where the spiritual welfare of the person and apostolic good is kept in mind. However Ignatius reminds the concerned person to be cautious about purity of intention during fraternal correction when he says that such information is necessary, *'provided that ill-will plays no part and that due charity toward the neighbor is maintained.'*⁵³

The response to the tenth question contains two parts. Ignatius does not categorically state that one ought to correct the imperfection of the other. In the first part he highlights three grounds which make for fruitful correction: a) on the authority of the person who gives it, b) his love and perception of this love and c) the manner of communication where the other person does not feel threatened. While explaining the third ground for fruitful correction Ignatius expresses caution when he says that;

Correcting others is thus not for everybody. Moreover, no matter how a person gives an admonition, deeming that it will lead to the person's amendment, it is better not to state things too forthrightly, but indirectly under some pretext; for one sin can engender another – the sin originally committed may incline a person not to accept the alms of correction well.⁵⁴

⁴⁹ *LI*, p. 343.

⁵⁰ *LI*, p. 343.

⁵¹ *LI*, p. 343.

⁵² *LI*, pp. 343-44.

⁵³ *LI*, p. 344.

⁵⁴ *LI*, p. 344.

In the second part, he once again indicates that fraternal correction under any circumstances is not an absolute need. He says that when a person is more preoccupied with the faults of others, *'the less likely he is to dwell within himself and look at his own faults, and so the less progress he will make.'*⁵⁵ Only when a person has grown in perfection by living a life free from disordered affections, *'our Lord enlarges his heart to help others as well as himself.'*⁵⁶ He goes on to give a detailed procedure in the next number (no. 11).

This number is a summary of the attitude and method to be applied while engaging in fraternal correction. He begins by recalling his experience with the First Fathers when he told them that the two ways they could help him in his spiritual progress was *'firstly by their own perfection and secondly by drawing his attention to anything they judged was not according to God.'*⁵⁷ In explaining the attitude, method and persons in order to better engage in fraternal correction Ignatius offers us the following procedure:

OUTLINE: *...they should follow this procedure:*⁵⁸

- Preparation: *Their admonition should be preceded by prayer*
- Place: *...then, if they still thought and judged the same in the presence of the Lord, they should tell him about it privately – a procedure he himself follows now.*
- Person: *...who can correct: To do this well, Our Reverend Father said that it would be a great help if the superior entrusted this duty to certain of his subjects – the priests, for example and persons who gave edification.*
- Process: *If someone has to express an opinion, he should take care...*
 - *First to place himself before the Lord, so as to know and decide what he ought to do;*
 - *then he should courteously*
 - *tell the person if he deems it will do him good;*
 - *...if not, he should tell the person's superior.*

⁵⁵ *LI*, p. 344.

⁵⁶ *LI*, p. 344.

⁵⁷ *LI*, p. 344.

⁵⁸ *LI*, p. 344. The words in italics are taken directly from the text and the division of the paragraph has been made by us. In continuation Ignatius would speak of the advantage of an admonitor as well as the benefits of having vice rectors. Fraternal correction is intimately linked to the role of superiors and we shall make a few more observations while speaking about the role of the Superior.

With this outline we come to the end of this section. We will not be elaborating the dynamics of humility and spiritual growth at this point, but shall do so at the end of the section which deals with the emptying of oneself.⁵⁹ Let us now move on another important aspect of the second probation – i.e. the six experiences which form part of the novitiate.

9.2 THE PRINCIPAL AND SECONDARY TESTING EXPERIENCES [64–90]

Experiences or experiments can be seen from the very beginning of religious life. They generally had the twin purpose of testing a candidate and helping him to experientially understand the charism of a specific religious order. The Society of Jesus was no exception and six principal experiences and other secondary experiences were proposed for the novice which shall be elaborated in this point.⁶⁰ In keeping with the previous structure, we shall begin with a historical background followed by analysing the text and its interpretation. Finally we shall look at the relevance of these principal and secondary experiences in a variety of apostolic settings during the time of Ignatius.

9.2.1 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The history of experiences or testing⁶¹ in religious life can be traced back to the very beginning. Ignatius in the *GE* offers us a detailed list of six experiences or tests as well as other testing experiences that ought to be given to a candidate. However we find that other religious orders also had detailed instructions for their candidates. Probably they did not compartmentalize it as clearly as Ignatius, but the persons responsible for the formation of newcomers were clear about the kind of tests and experiences that a candidate had to be subjected. The reason for such clarity was the direct relationship

⁵⁹ AICARDO, JOSÉ MANUEL. *Comentario de las Constituciones de la Compañía de Jesús – II...*, pp. 275-298. Aicardo illustrates the manner of fraternal correction in the early Society by offering various examples in the second volume of his monumental work on the Constitutions.

⁶⁰ This division is based on the text of the *GE* which states that ‘... before (a candidate) enters the house or college, or after his entrance, six principal testing experiences are required, in addition to many others which will be treated in part later...’ (*GE* – 64¹)

⁶¹ The traditional word used from the beginning of religious life was that of testing. The two words ‘experience’ and ‘testing’ were used interchangeably and in this point the word ‘testing’ will be understood in the same manner as ‘experience.’

between the tests/experiences and the charism of the religious order.

The goal of the Pachomian monasteries was to live a cenobitic life and the monks 'saw themselves as a *koinonia* – a single brotherhood.'⁶² The three principal activities which helped them live this goal consisted in prayer, work and life in a community. They therefore had an elaborate set of rules which dealt with these three dimension of their lives.⁶³ The testing and experiences undergone by Pachomius gives us an idea of what each new candidate was expected to go through. During the encounter with his master Palamon, Pachomius offered himself and began to practice asceticism with his master which is described as follows:

They practiced the *asceticism* together and gave time to prayers. Their work consisted of spinning and weaving hair sacks. In their work they toiled not for themselves but they remembered the poor, as the Apostle says. If when the old man was keeping vigil, he saw that sleep was weighing them down, they both went out to the sand [field] of the mountain. Then they carried [sand] in baskets from one place to another, giving the body labour in order to stay awake for prayer... Seeing his obedience in everything and his progress in endurance, the old man rejoiced at his salvation.⁶⁴

The Rule of Pachomius begins with matters that need to be given to an uninstructed person.⁶⁵ The ability of the candidate to be prompt for various activities such as prayers, meals, work, sleep and so on was an important factor. While no explicit experiences and tests are outlined, we can deduce that instructions given to the candidate and his ability to live them had two purposes: a) they were to test the candidate's suitability for the monastery and b) in order to instruct him.⁶⁶

⁶² KING, PETER. *Western Monasticism – A History of the Monastic Movements in the Latin Church*, Cistercian Publications: Michigan, 1999, p. 25.

⁶³ Most of the rules ascribed to Pachomius have survived. They focus on organizational matters and though they are not as all-embracing as the Rule of Benedict, they are rather detailed in order to give us a good insight about the general functioning of the monastery and the manner of testing a new comer. (Cf. *IBID.*, p. 23.)

⁶⁴ *Pachomian Koinonia – Vol. I*, p. 302.

⁶⁵ This first part which is called the 'precepts' is preceded has a foreword by Saint Jerome.

⁶⁶ There are two moments when the Rules indicate that the candidate need to be instructed – nos. 49 & 139. In no. 49, after the necessary inquiries, the Rule states that '*...if they see that he is ready for everything, then he shall be taught the rest of the monastic discipline: what he must do and whom he must serve, whether in the synaxis of all the brothers or in the house to which he is assigned, as well as in the refectory. Perfectly instructed in every good work, let him be joined to the brothers.*' The next rule (no. 139) states that every member ought to memorize something of the Scriptures and in case of an illiterate

The Rule of Basil is more explicit with question six specifically asking about the kind of testing that ought to be applied for new-comers.⁶⁷ The various tests suggested for a new comer are not articulated as in the GE, but are more concrete than the Rule of Pachomius. The tests are geared towards greater humility, stability and promptness. Once again the goal of these tests which include physical work, fraternal correction and a disciplined life were to see if the person was suitable for monastic life. The tests and the underlying attitudes are highlighted in the following text:

...Thus let it be discerned at length whether he readily carries out *every bodily labour* enjoined on him and inclines himself assiduously to a *more disciplined life* or if he is questioned about *some shortcoming* of his, whether he is not at all put out to declare it, and when a remedy for his fault is assigned, whether he accepts it agreeably, and whether with all humility, without any embarrassment he inclines himself to the more *menial and lowlier tasks*, if reason so requires, and will not permit himself to submit disdainfully. When, therefore, he has been shown by each of these proofs to be of firm mind and stable purpose and prompt disposition, it is fitting then that he be received.⁶⁸

Before the final incorporation the Rule further states that the person should have engaged in 'arduous tasks which are seen to be held in opprobrium by the worldly'⁶⁹ and whether he freely, generously, faithfully, energetically and promptly carried them out without desponding at the unpleasantness of them.⁷⁰ The Rules further qualifies the testing in keeping with the spiritual level of the person. In the case of a person who was already progressing in spiritual life the Rule does not elaborate further. However for those who had experienced a recent conversion the Rule advises caution without being becoming alarmist. It states that

...we should direct (such candidates) into suitable forms of discipline and test their resolution through time and strenuous labours, so that if we do discover some steadying effect in them, they may be safely admitted. Otherwise they should be sent away while

person offers details about how an uninstructed person could be made to learn. (Cf. *Pachomian Koinonia – Vol. II*, pp. 153, 166.)

⁶⁷ 'Q: Ought we accept all who come to us, or only after testing and of what kind should that testing be?' This question pertains to the Short Rules and can also be found in the Long Rules as no. 10. (Cf. *The Rule of St. Basil...*, p. 87; Cf. *The Asketikon of St. Basil the Great*, (Tr. Silvas, Anna), University Press: Oxford, 2005, pp. 193, 195.)

⁶⁸ *The Rule of St. Basil...*, p. 87. (The italics have been added.)

⁶⁹ *IBID.*, p. 89.

⁷⁰ Cf. *IBID.*

they are still outside and the test will not have been to the detriment of the community.⁷¹

The Rule underlines the fundamental necessity of testing the candidate for humility when it says that ‘a common means of testing all (is) whether they are disposed to undergo every humiliation without shame, so that they accept even the most menial tasks.’⁷² This was more important when ‘someone of higher social rank aspires to humility in the likeness of our Lord Jesus Christ.’⁷³ Special effort ought to be made so that the person has to do some task which is particularly distasteful to outsiders in order to know whether he truly offers himself totally to God.⁷⁴

In the fourth book of the *Institutes*, Cassian speaks about how someone who is to be received into a cenobium is tested. Speaking about the means of testing it is said that:

...whoever seeks to be received into the discipline of the cenobium is never admitted until, by *lying outside* for ten days or more, he has given an indication of his perseverance and desire, as well as of his humility and patience. And when he has *embraced the knees of all the brothers* passing by and has been *purposely rebuked and disdained* by everyone, as if he wished to enter the monastery not out of devotion but out of necessity, and has been visited with numerous *insults and reproaches* and has given proof of his constancy, and by putting up with *taunts* has shown what he will be like in time of trial, and when the ardor of his intention has been proven and he has thus been received...⁷⁵

The methods used for testing a person are related to the person’s capacity and actual growth in humility. Every test aids the person’s spiritual growth and the *Institutes* as well as the *Conferences*⁷⁶ tell the candidate of the centrality of humility in order to progress in spiritual life. The *RM* recommends that the new brother/candidate who enters the monastery should be tested for two months. The background of the text in

⁷¹ *The Asketikon of St. Basil...*, pp. 194-95.

⁷² *IBID.*, p. 195.

⁷³ *IBID.*

⁷⁴ Cf. *IBID.* ‘But it is especially necessary when someone of higher social rank aspires to humility in the likeness of our Lord Jesus Christ, to prescribe for him some task that is reckoned particularly distasteful to those outside and to observe whether he presents himself to God with full assurance as a worker who has no need to be ashamed. (2 Tim. 2:15)

⁷⁵ *John Cassian: The Institutes...*, pp. 79-80. (The italics have been added.)

⁷⁶ The 17th *Conference* which speaks of the three kinds of monks gives us a more elaborate explanation about the instruction of monks, their formation and the process of growing in a life of virtues. Though the end of a monk is the kingdom of God and the goal is purity of heart (*Conf. I/IV*), humility is the foundation and teacher of all virtues. (*Conf. 15/VII*). (Cf. *John Cassian: The Conferences...*, pp. 542-543.)

chapter 88 is indicative that the tests are primarily in the context of the candidate's commitment to stability. After the abbot has explained the *Rule* to the candidate and explained the point related to stability, there follow a period of tests for two months.

The text is as follows:

When there has been presented to the new brother by the Rule through the abbot all the foregoing about committing himself to stability ...let such still be granted a period of two months to deliberate with themselves, meanwhile working with the brothers, content with the *common measure of food* and the *discipline of excommunications* according to the Rule, so that such a one may make a trial of the monastery's way of life and himself be tested by the monastery. Let him deliberate with himself whether he should stand fast with God or freely go back to the devil.⁷⁷

Further on the *RM* has another chapter for someone who 'comes fleeing' from the world.⁷⁸ The Rule recommends that such a person should be tested for one year. He should not be readily believed and the abbot should pretend to refuse him residence. The testing is similar to the above mentioned quote. An important factor in this chapter is the constant reference to overcoming one's self-will.⁷⁹

The *RB* has many similarities with the *RM*. The point related to testing is found towards the end in chapter 58. The description of tests for candidates is not as elaborate as the *RM* and the description of the senior monk who is to take care of the candidate is more fraternal and benign. Given the fact that perseverance, stability and obedience were important for monastic life, the tests and instructions were appropriately

⁷⁷ Cf. *The Rule of the Master...*, p. 257. The text goes on to speak about custodians and supervision of such candidates throughout the day and night. 'During these two months they are to be in the custody of the brother... The presence of the custodians will ensure supervision of their coming and going in the monastery, and if at any time and anywhere they absent themselves from the community of the brothers, the custodians will take care to look for them lest they perhaps get a head start, making off without taking leave but taking something stolen.'

⁷⁸ This relates to Ch. 90. However there is some difficulty in understanding the difference between the candidates addressed in Ch. 88 who 'has already turned to God or is still of the world, and asks the favor of being accepted into the monastery' and in Chapter 90 who 'comes fleeing from the world to the service of God in the monastery and declares that he wishes to become a monk...' We are inclined to believe that the second category of persons would be unknown persons or fugitives. (Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 257, 260.)

⁷⁹ Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 260-267. The actual phrases related to testing are as follows: '...To test him let difficulties be made, and to ascertain his obedience let him be told in advance about things contrary and repugnant to his will. Let daily fasting be held up to him. Furthermore, from the reading of the Rule and from what the abbot says let him understand this: that to say: 'I want this and I reject that, I like this and I hate that,' is allowed to no one in the monastery, so that self-will be not chosen and indulged...'

construed. The text related to tests is as follows:

Do not grant newcomers to the monastic life an easy entry, but, as the Apostle says, *Test the spirits to see if they are from God.* (1 Jn. 4:1) If someone comes and keeps knocking at the door, and if at the end of four or five days he has shown himself patient in bearing his harsh treatment and difficulty of entry, and has persisted in his request, then he should be allowed to enter and stay in the guest quarters for a few days. After that, he should live in the novitiate, where the novices study, eat and sleep.⁸⁰

The monastic orders which emerged in the 11th century such as the Carthusians and Cistercians did not deviate in great measure from the *RB*. The Cistercians ‘sought to follow the Benedictine Rule and to create an organization that would maintain their understanding of these observances.’⁸¹ The Carthusians in their *Statutes* refer to the need of testing in the chapters related to the novice and the novice master. Chapter 8 while speaking about the novice repeats the text of the *RB* about testing the spirits (1 Jn. 4:1). The following chapter points out that the novice-master ought to carefully examine and test the candidate in order to verify whether the candidate would be able to withstand the demands of such a life.

Let the Novice-Master be careful and vigilant in the reception of novices and put quality before number. For to become a Carthusian in fact as well as in name the mere wish is not sufficient; in addition to love for solitude and for our life, a certain special aptitude of mind and body is required, from which the existence of a call from God can be known. The Novice-Master, to whom it belongs in the first place to examine and test the candidates, is to be attentive to these signs.⁸²

With the rise of the mendicant orders, there emerged a new charism within religious orders. The tests during the period of probation were again in keeping with this shift. The Franciscans as well as the Dominicans were mendicant orders whose life was not confined to the walls of a monastery. The mystical experience on 24th February, 1208 led Francis to embark on ‘the life of a poor, itinerant preacher proclaiming a

⁸⁰ *The Rule of St. Benedict...*, p. 267.

⁸¹ BRUUN, METTE BIRKEDAL. *The Cistercian Order*, Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, 2013, p. 26. However with the passage of they would ‘incorporate and refine prevailing spiritual ideals and expressions’ going on to becoming one of the most influential and popular monastic groups of the 12th century.

⁸² <http://transfiguration.chartreux.org/statuts-en-1.htm> (as on 21/10/2105)

message of penance and peace.’⁸³ The Franciscan charism would consist in witnessing and proclaiming the Gospel – a charism which became a strong force of renewal in the Church.⁸⁴ The Dominicans had a specific charism as preachers and hence were designated as the Order of Preachers.⁸⁵

Given the revolutionary character of these two orders, it was necessary that the tests and experiences of the candidates were appropriate to examining and forming them. The *RF* (both the old and new Rule) does not outline any specific tests for the candidates. However the second chapter which deals with candidates does speak about the period of probation and ‘at the end of the year of probation ...be received into obedience whereby they promise to observe this life and rule always.’⁸⁶ The Dominicans were on the other hand clearer on this matter and in the chapters related to those who could be received and probations (Chs. XIII. & IV), instructions regarding tests are given. Before profession a period of probation of six months was fixed and the tests/experiences during this period were as follows:

We have decided on a period of probation lasting six months or longer, as the prior sees fit, so that the one accepted may make trial of the austerities of the Order and the brethren learn his character, unless perchance someone mature and discerning enough chooses to forego this probation and offers himself at once for profession.⁸⁷

Further on detailed questions regarding the candidate’s aptitude for preaching are dealt with in chapter XX of Part II. Though this part pertains to the candidate before he

⁸³ *Francis and Clare – The Complete Works ...*, p. 4.

⁸⁴ Francis and his companions were dedicated to living the Gospel life and with a simple Rule made of a few gospel texts and few helpful prescriptions embarked on a life of missionary work. Their work also extended to Syria and Africa. (Cf. *IBID.*) Cajetan while in order to explain this new charism says that the ‘beginnings were so ...unspeakably new that it was quite difficult, as the Order was then conceived, to fit into the life of the Church of that day.’ (Cf. *ESSER, CAJETAN. The Rule and Testament...*, p. 4.)

⁸⁵ The bull of approbation by Pope Honorarius confirmed the revolutionary character of the order whereby it was entrusted with the mission of preaching. (on 21/10/2015 - <http://opcentral.org/blog/the-bulls-of-approbation>) The text of this approbation is self-explanatory: ‘*He who ever makes his Church fruitful with new offspring, wanting to make these modern times measure up to former times and to propagate the Catholic faith, inspired you with a holy desire by which, having embraced poverty and made profession of regular life, you have given yourselves to the proclamation of the Word of God, preaching the name of our Lord Jesus Christ throughout the world.*’ (as on 21/10/2015 - <http://www.op.org/sites/www.op.org/files/public/documents/fichier/lcoenglish2012.pdf>)

⁸⁶ Cf. *Francis and Clare...*, pp. 110-11, 138-139.

⁸⁷ (as on 21/10/2015) http://www.op.org/sites/www.op.org/files/public/documents/fichier/primitive_consti_en.pdf

can enter the ministry, we find that care was taken in order to ensure that those who entered the ministry were well prepared for the same. The candidate was examined, others with whom he was living were examined and after information had been gathered, the major superior decided ‘whether those brothers shall continue their studies or be allowed to preach with other preachers who are more experienced, or even be permitted to exercise the office of preaching by themselves.’⁸⁸

9.2.2 THE TEXT AND ITS INTERPRETATION

Let us now move on to the six principal testing experiences and other subsidiary testing experiences proposed by Ignatius in the *GE* for any candidate who desired to enter the Society of Jesus. In order to textually analyse the six principal and subsidiary testing experiences we shall place them in the form of a table by indicating the actual test, the description and remarks related to this test and finally the spiritual motivational purpose of these tests in different columns. After this has been presented in the form of a table, we shall look at its interpretations by various GCs and finally end with its interpretation by various contemporary authors. The same method shall be followed for the secondary testing experiences.

Before moving on to analyse this text we would like to make a note about the flexibility of these testing experiences and the freedom given to the Superior. Ignatius reminds the reader that these experiences are means to achieve an end.⁸⁹ This end primarily consists in experientially understanding the charism of the Society and growing in perfection through the cultivation of fundamental virtues leading to total self-emptying love. The freedom given to the Superior is indicated through two sets of words which include: a) that ‘*these experiences may be advanced, postponed, adapted, and in some case replaced by others*’ (*GE* 64²); b) it may done so ‘*according to persons, times, and places, with their contingencies.*’ (*GE* 64²)

⁸⁸ IBID.

⁸⁹ CN – 46. in explaining the purpose of the experiments says that the experiments ‘*must place the novices in those circumstances wherein they can give evidence of what they really are and show how they have made their own the spiritual attitudes proper to our vocation. New experiments, of the sort that would fulfill this purpose today, ought to be prudently and boldly pursued.*’

9.2.2.1 The Text of the Six Principal Experiences

No.	Experience / Test	Additional Remarks	The Purpose
1	The Spiritual Exercises ⁹⁰	For one month, a little more or less... According to the capacity of the persons...	Examining his conscience, thinking over his whole past life and making a general confession, meditating upon his sins, contemplating the events and mysteries of the life, death, resurrection, and ascension of Christ our Lord, exercising himself in praying vocally and mentally...
2	Serve in hospitals	For one month... The candidates take their meals and sleep in it or in them, or serve for one or several hours during the day, according to the times, places, and persons. Help and serve all, the sick and the well, in conformity with the directions they receive...	...in order to lower and humble themselves more, thus giving clear proof of themselves to the effect that they are completely giving up the world with its pomps and vanities, so that in everything they may serve their Creator and Lord, crucified for them.
3	Making a pilgrimage ⁹¹	Another month... ...without money, but begging from door to door at times...	...in order to grow accustomed to discomfort in food and lodging. ... for the love of God our Lord, ... through abandoning all the reliance which he could have in money or other created things, may with genuine faith and intense love place his reliance entirely in his Creator and Lord.
4	Low and humble offices	...after entrance into the house, - with all diligence and care...	giving a good example of himself in all of them.
5	explaining the Christian doctrine or a part of it in public	...to boys and other simple persons - or of teaching it to individuals, - as opportunity offers	... what seems in our Lord more profitable and suitable to the persons.
6	...further by preaching or hearing confessions, or in both together,	- accordance with the times, places, and capacity of each.	... the candidate, who now has been tested and found edifying

⁹⁰ CN – 46, §2 indicates that ‘...of all the experiments they are the chief and fundamental one. (Hence) they ought to be well prepared for, made at the most advantageous time, and presented in all their force and spiritual vigor.’

⁹¹ The second and third experiments are flexible and the superior is given the freedom to decide. ‘both of these months may be spent in one or more hospitals, or both in making a pilgrimage, as may seem better to the candidate’s superior.’ (GE 67³)

In this part of the *GE* we have some more instructions which are related to the experiences which extend from no. [71] to no. [79].

[71]	Chronological sequence of the testing experiences.
[72]	Status of a person during this period
[73-79]	Information/Testimonies after the experiences

Regarding numbers [71] – [72] we would like to offer a brief note. Number [71] is divided into two parts. The first part has been adapted to the new Code of Canon Law and the person undergoes all the experiences within the novitiate.⁹² However during the origins of the Society there was a great deal of flexibility regarding the actual moment and mode of making the experiences. The second part deals more specifically with scholastics as understood during the period of Ignatius.⁹³ The next number [72] refers to the status of a person during the second probation which when read in conjunction with CN-6 and Co. [511] A,⁹⁴ understands that the novice is also part of the Society. Given the fact that our work deals with the spiritual dimension of the *GE* we believe that this note is sufficient for these two numbers.

Numbers [73] – [79] are related to testimonies after the experiences. We shall merely highlight some of the noteworthy words or phrases which indicate the importance attached to this part of the experiences.⁹⁵ Ignatius insisted that the request

⁹² CIC - 648 §1-3. '§1. To be valid, a novitiate must include twelve months spent in the community itself of the novitiate, without prejudice to the prescript of can. 647, §3 (A major superior can permit a group of novices to reside for a certain period of time in another house of the institute designated by the superior). §2. To complete the formation of novices, in addition to the period mentioned in §1, the constitutions can establish one or more periods of apostolic exercises to be spent outside the community of the novitiate. §3. The novitiate is not to last longer than two years.' In CCEO the rules related to a novitiate can be found in canons 455-461. (ee)

⁹³ However this has also been streamlined with the present process of formation being more specific regarding the period of the novitiate, time of studies and the structure of the tertianship.

⁹⁴ Co. 511 A 'The Society, in the broadest sense of the term, includes all those who live under obedience to the superior general. Thus it comprises even the novices and the persons who, desiring to live and die in the Society, are in probation to be admitted into it under one of the other categories of membership about to be described.'

⁹⁵ We may recall that the method of reviewing any activity was intimately related to the Ignatian pedagogy. It can be found repeatedly in the Spiritual Exercises, in the life of Ignatius, the Spiritual Journal and in the process of discernment and Deliberation by the first companions and so on. This is now applied to the key experiences which form the foundation of a Jesuit's life.

for testimonies '*should be diligently observed.*' (GE 73¹) The content and form of the testimonies are expected to be given by keeping in mind '*the end which the society seeks.*' (GE 73²) The testimony is expected from a responsible person and whenever possible from more than one person,⁹⁶ including persons from the public domain.⁹⁷ Besides this it also recommended that '*as far as it deems expedient, other reports*' (GE 78¹) could be gathered.⁹⁸ The seriousness of this matter is such that in the absence of testimonies '*the reason ought to be investigated with great diligence.*' (GE 79¹)

These testimonies helped the overall apostolic mission of the Society at two levels. At one level it helped discern if the candidate was fit for the Society and prepared him live the Society's charism. At an early stage an unsuitable candidate could be asked to leave and a fitting candidate rightly understood his vocation. At another level it helps the candidate as well as the Society grow in humility. By allowing non-Jesuits and lay persons to be collaborators and formators in the Society's mission the Society publicly discards false self-sufficiency and humbly acknowledges that it can only fulfil its mission in collaboration with others. The testimonies allows non-Jesuits to be better acquainted with the charism of the Society and effectively collaborate in bring these apostolic ventures to fruition.

9.2.2.2 Interpretation of the Six Principal Testing Experiences

9.2.2.2.1 Introduction

The six testing experiences introduced in the *GE* were totally unprecedented in the history of religious orders. Unlike the prevailing tradition where the novitiate was primarily confined to the monastery, the novitiate of the Jesuits contained testing

⁹⁶ This include '*the one who gave the Exercises*' (GE 73²), '*the directors or the one who has charge*' (GE 74¹) of the hospital, '*from one or several dependable persons*' (GE 75¹), '*all in the house*' (GE 76¹) and in the case of places where the candidate has taught Catechism, preached or heard confessions, '*he should bring testimony from those places where he stayed for some time or from public persons.*' (GE 77²)

⁹⁷ Expectedly the longest note can be found in the testimony related to the fifth experience. Ignatius knew the advantages as well as the dangers that formed part of the ministry of preaching and confessions. He was keen that those who joined the Society were not found wanting in pastoral care, sacraments, erudition, orthodoxy and eloquence. More importantly he desired that the Jesuit by their very life edified the people they interacted with. An edifying life gave greater credence to the pastoral activities of preaching and confessions.

⁹⁸ This text appears only in the texts of 1556 & 1594. (*MCo – II*, pp. 62-63.)

experiences which were outside the confines of the monastic walls.⁹⁹ Given the new charism that the Society presented to the world, its novitiate structure used the old traditional methods but at the same time was innovative and daring. Of special mention were the testing experiences which were a radical departure from other novitiates of the day.

One characteristic aspect of the spiritual training given by Ignatius (was) the daring of the tests or experiments to which he subjected his novices and young religious, (as well as) the strict safeguards to shunt away from them what could turn them from the true spirit of their vocation. ...In (such) a religious novitiate ...(one found) a great deal of daring and a considerable amount of novelty.¹⁰⁰

The testing experiences were based on the experiences of Ignatius and the first companions. This point is underlined on repeated occasions within the text. The goal of the companions was to imitate an apostolic way of life and this desire found concrete expression in the form of various experiences during the period stretching from their days in Paris to the days of the Deliberations in Rome (1539).¹⁰¹ O'Leary points out that the pattern of formation was not only the outcome of the experience of the first companions, but was in large measure a re-enactment of the experience of Ignatius and the early companions.¹⁰²

The goal of these experiences had been defined on various occasions. In a preliminary document to the Constitutions, (*Fundación de Collegio – 1541*)¹⁰³, Ignatius offers us an explanation for such varied and long experiences. He states:

⁹⁹ This point is stressed by Jaer and Buckley. Buckley would however make an interesting observation where he says that Jesuit novitiates in later centuries would return to the practice followed by other orders. '*...they constituted a radical departure from the practice of formation in other religious orders at the time as well as from the more enclosed Jesuit novitiates that would emerge in succeeding centuries.*' (Cf. DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together...*, p. 30; BUCKLEY, MICHAEL. "Freedom, Election...", p. 80.)

¹⁰⁰ DE GUIBERT, JOSEPH. *The Jesuits: Their Spiritual Doctrine...*, pp. 102-03. He goes on to explain the surprise that exists even today to see a pair of Jesuit novices going by themselves to serve in the hospitals or making their way along the road as poor pilgrims.

¹⁰¹ Aldama has a succinct account of the experiences of the First Companions during this period. He briefly comments about Ignatius' own life as a pilgrim and then indicates the experiences of the first companions in Paris, Venice and Rome. (Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory...*, p. 50.)

¹⁰² Cf. O'LEARY, BRIAN. *Sent into...*, p. 42.

¹⁰³ The MHSI, *MCon - I* has placed two documents on the foundation of colleges, one which was drafted in 1541 and the second which was drafted in 1544 in parallel columns. (Cf. *MCon - I*, pp. 49-65.)

La causa que nos ha movido a hazer mayores esperiencias y a tomar más tiempo que en otras congregaciones acostumbran tomar, es que si alguno entra en monasterio bien ordenado y bien concertado, estará más apartado de ocasiones de peccados, por la mayor clausura, quietud y concierto, que en nuestra Compañía, la qual no tiene aquella clausura, quietud ny reposo, mas discurre de vna parte en otra. Yten, vno que tenga malos hábitos y sin perfección alguna, vasta perfeccionarse en monasterio así ordenado y concertado; mas en nuestra Compañía es necesario que primero sea alguno bien experimentado y mucho probado antes que sea admittido; porque después discurrendo ha de conuersar con buenos y con buenas, y con malos y con malas, para las quales conuersaciones se requieren mayores fuerzas y mayores esperiencias, y mayores gracias y dones de nuestro Criador y Señor.¹⁰⁴

Nadal in his exhortations in 1561 would outline the twin objectives clearly when he said that the end of the experiences consisted in two principal ends: a) to instruct the candidate in the manner that Ignatius was instructed by the Lord and b) to test the candidate.¹⁰⁵ Just as the experiences have these two objectives in general, Jaer and other authors would say that each experience has its own particular end. They were like ‘a kind of practicum for the lesson of the Two Standards and initiate the novice into the personal, community, and apostolic demands of Jesuit life.’¹⁰⁶ In the course of this explanation we shall highlight the purpose of each testing experience.

Underlying the objectives explained above, the fundamental objective was to progress in accordance with the golden rule of spiritual life as seen in the *SpEx*. [189]. The person was aided in the concrete ‘renunciation and abnegation of one’s own self – (of) one’s self-love.’¹⁰⁷ Without discounting the utility in testing the candidate, the ‘experiences (were designed to) help (the candidate) grasp that spirit (of the Society) and to live out certain specific, permanent elements of it.’¹⁰⁸

¹⁰⁴ MCo. I, p. 60.

¹⁰⁵ MNad – V, p. 380. ‘La razón general destas experiencias es que por aquí llevó nuestro Señor al Padre Ignacio, a quien tomó por ministro desta vocación, y por aquí le exercitó, y éste fue su noviciado. Lo 2º, porque la probación es probar a uno si es bueno para nuestro instituto, si se ensaya bien en él. Tiene la Compañía oración y trato desto; danse al novicio exercicios para ver cómo se halla en la oración y cuán hábil es para las cosas espirituales. Occúpase la Compañía en obras de charidad, en servir a los pobres, en descurrir por una parte y por otra para aprovechar a los próximos. Pruévae para esto el que desea la Compañía en servir hospitales, en peregrinar, y así en los demás. Assí que pruevan cómo se hallan en aquellas cosas en las quales an de vivir siempre.’

¹⁰⁶ DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 30.

¹⁰⁷ ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory...*, p. 50.

¹⁰⁸ DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 30.

9.2.2.2.2 *The First Experience – Spiritual Exercises*

The primacy in the novices' formation should be given to the Spiritual Exercises, since of all the experiments they are the chief and fundamental one. Let them, therefore, be well prepared for, made at the most advantageous time, and presented in all their force and spiritual vigour. For it is by means of them that the novices are introduced into the heart, as it were, of their vocation, so perceiving its distinctive grace that they are able to bear witness to it. [GC 31 – D8/15]

Among all the experiences, 'the Exercises were the most important. If (the young candidates) were truly mortified in their passions and solidly founded in abnegation, they would have no difficulty in finding God in everything.'¹⁰⁹ Laynez attributed the *SpEx* to the great things that Ignatius was able to achieve and showed how the Apostles and the great saints of the past also engaged in spiritual exercises. He also highlighted that the manner that God deals with the candidate in the *SpEx* (directly and as a teacher deals with a student) is the normal manner of God's relationship with the human person.¹¹⁰ Nadal spoke at length on the *SpEx* during his exhortations of 1561. Besides repeating the two general goals of the experiences, he would highlight two other specific goals: a) its role in teaching us how to prayer – a point where he reinforced the apostolic charism of the Society; b) its role in preparing the candidate to participate in other experiences.¹¹¹

The description of the *SpEx* as seen in this text reveals to us that it is not a complete definition because it does not speak about the election.¹¹² However it is presumed that a person has already made an election and therefore the focus remains centered on helping the candidate acquire the necessary tools in order to be disposed towards the most important element in spiritual life – the gift of devotion. O'Leary

¹⁰⁹ DE GUIBERT, JOSEPH. *The Jesuits: Their Spiritual Doctrine...*, pp. 86-87. De Guibert makes this comment in the context of explaining the meaning of prayer. Devotion for Ignatius consisted in the ease in finding God and hence he was not a proponent of regular long prayers. Guibert reinforces this perspective of Ignatius by extensively quoting from a letter which was written to Francis of Borgia in July, 1549.

¹¹⁰ Cf. DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. "Esortazioni...", p. 167. '...Dio benedetto fa con noi come il maestro con il suo scholar, il quale, quando vede che lo scholar ha bene imparata la lettione, gliene dà un'altra, altrimenti non...'

¹¹¹ Cf. *MNad – V*, pp. 380-83. In no. [153] Nadal emphasises the role of the *SpEx* in instructing a person in prayer and other spiritual matters, he would reiterate that it helped in testing the candidate.

¹¹² Cf. DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 30.

explains the problematic with the use of the word 'devotion' in the English language because it does not fully explain the meaning of the Spanish word.

The Spanish word *devoción* is problematic. The English equivalent fails to convey all that Ignatius implied by its use. For him devotion is not a vague sentiment or a warm feeling, still less anything that we might name as sentimentality. It is the experience of finding God. In the *Autobiography* he describes the maturing of his own religious experience with precisely this term: '*... his devotion, that is, his ease in finding God, was always increasing, now more than ever in his entire life. At whatever time or hour he wanted to find God, he found him.*' (Aut - 99)¹¹³

Various authors stress the *centrality of devotion* in the pedagogy of the *SpEx* while explaining the purpose of this first experience. The gift of devotion is indispensable for Jesuit life and bereft of a profound experience of God in the *SpEx*, it would be futile to expect any serious progress in the candidate.¹¹⁴ Buckley explains that ease in finding God takes place through the development of affectivity, intentionality and purpose. The following table better explains his position on these three levels of finding God:¹¹⁵

One "found God" in his <i>affectivity</i>	...when the signs of the Spirit were experienced in the union of the candidate's <i>sensibility, feelings, and emotional life</i> with God...	... as one was drawn through desire or sorrow or love into God.
One "found God" habitually in his <i>intentionality</i>	...when the <i>imaginative or conscious horizon</i> of a person's life possessed God as its unthematic context or atmosphere...	...in which all other things were located, understood, and evaluated.
One "found God" in <i>purpose</i>	...through the <i>pure intention</i> to serve him in all things, through the dynamic conferral of <i>unity and orientation</i> to everything else in life...	...as it was integrated into this radical purity of heart and into this drive towards God

The *SpEx* was a school of discernment where a person became more sensitive to the presence of God in one's own life as well as to the presence of God all around.¹¹⁶

¹¹³ O'LEARY, BRIAN. *Sent into...*, pp. 45-46.

¹¹⁴ IBID., p. 46. O'Leary would comment that a candidate who is unable to experience God in the Spiritual Exercises would find it very difficult to experience the same in day to day experiences.

¹¹⁵ BUCKLEY, MICHAEL. "Freedom, Election...", pp. 81-82.

¹¹⁶ IBID., p. 82. '*To find God was to possess both this interpersonal unity with God on the levels of affectivity, consciousness, and choice and to read these experiences as a language through which God could guide the person more deeply into his own working in the universe.*'

Different authors coincide on the understanding that the *SpEx* are a school of prayer¹¹⁷ where prayer is interpreted as continual ‘devotion.’ Through the *SpEx* a person has been initiated into a new mode of communicating with and being aware of the abiding presence of God. This experience which was limited to the confines of the house would be reinforced and confirmed in the experiences that follow. It provided the proper spring-board in order to move into the other experiences because the spiritual foundation had been established.

The centrality of the *SpEx* as the fundamental experience for the Society and the primary means in order to grow in self-abnegation and humility has been re-emphasized today by various GCs and the Holy Father. During moments of doubt, it has offered insights aiding the Society in order to maintain its faithfulness to the charism of the Society. It constantly teaches us the importance of and indicates the method of growing in familiarity with God in order to lead a life of service.

A constant criticism of the Society has been the absence of regular long hours of prayer. This issue was brought up in the 28th GC and the Congregation responded by stating that while asceticism should be cultivated and fostered, ‘the sure path of self-denial leads to highest perfection and is wonderfully suited to the apostolic way of life.’ [GC 28 – D.21] The point emphasizing continual self-abnegation and humility was reiterated in GC 31 which said:¹¹⁸

¹¹⁷ Aldama explains it as a ‘school of prayer’. (Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory...*, p. 52.); Jaer would explain it as an experience which leads to purity of conscience and helps him find God in prayer and life experiences (Cf. DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 31.) and de Guibert speaks of the various methods of prayer as initiating the candidate to live his life as a Jesuit (Cf. DE GUIBERT, JOSEPH. *The Jesuits...*, p. 86.) Schooling the candidate in a life of prayer where prayer is understood in the wider context of a person’s ability to progressively experience the presence of God in everything is therefore the primary goal of the *SpEx* for a candidate.

¹¹⁸ GC 31 emphasized the importance of the *SpEx* in various decrees. We have already highlighted D-2 & D-8 at an earlier point. In D-14 it points out how the *SpEx* are both the heritage of our spirituality and the school of our prayer. It speaks of formal prayer and clarifies the understanding related to discernment. The same decree would speak of being rooted in Christ and going against our self-love in order to be unite to the Triune God and wok for the salvation of men. [GC 31 - 14/4] – ‘*The Jesuit apostle goes from the Exercises, at once a school of prayer and of the apostolate, a man called by his vocation to be a contemplative in action. For the closer and more firmly we bind ourselves to Christ, denying self-love in our association with His salvific work, the more fully do we adore the Father in spirit and truth and the more effectively do we bring salvation to men.*’

This familiarity with God depends on self-denial, a spirit of recollection, and peace of mind. In these times it not infrequently happens that conditions of life are such as to engender, even unconsciously, a certain disquiet or anxiety of mind which makes a life of prayer more difficult despite good will. All therefore need to understand how, in addition to a living faith, emotional balance, humble acceptance of oneself, trust in others, and freedom of mind constitute for each one virtually fundamental conditions for the enjoyment of true and familiar converse with God. [GC 31 – 8/17]

Further on GC 32 in the 11th Decree explained that the *SpEx* helps us grow in inner freedom and respond effective to the demands of our mission. This takes place because the *SpEx* ‘deepens self-abnegation ... (and) unites us to Christ crucified, and thus to the poverty, humiliations, and sufferings by which he saved the world. ...the Spiritual Exercises, lie at the heart of our Jesuit vocation.’ [GC 32 – D.11/209] Its historical and spiritual significance in order to assist the Society and many others was summarized in GC 34 which said that the *SpEx* ‘helps us to initiate and to progress in a life of prayer, to search for and to find God in all things, and to discern his will, making faith more personal and more incarnate.’ [GC 32 – D.3/21]¹¹⁹

9.2.2.2.3 *The Second and Third Experience – Hospital and Pilgrimage*

Given the fact that the second and third experiences were linked and interchangeable from the very beginning we shall deal with these two experiences together.¹²⁰ Both were part of the experiences of the First Companions during their sojourn in Italy before the final decision to found the Society of Jesus. Let us now look at each of these experiences separately.

¹¹⁹ Pope Benedict in his address to the Society on 21st February, 2008 reiterated the importance of the *SpEx*. by speaking of how he personally benefited from it and exhorted the Society to reserve special attention to the ministry of the *SpEx*. He eloquently described the importance of the *SpEx* in the Society’s existence when he said that ‘...the Exercises are the fountain of your spirituality and the matrix of your Constitutions, but they are also a gift that the Spirit of the Lord has made to the entire Church: it is for you to continue to make it a precious and efficacious instrument for the spiritual growth of souls, for their initiation to prayer, to meditation, in this secularized world in which God seems to be absent.’ (Cf. (Eds.) PADBERG, JOHN W. – O’KEEF, MARTIN D. – MCCARTHY, JOHN L. *For Matters of Greater Moment – The First thirty Jesuit General Congregations*, The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 1994, p. 825.)

¹²⁰ Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory...*, p. 51. In the Deliberations of 1539, within the second set of conclusions we see that the period of testing was fixed at 3 months. While one month would be for the sake of the Spiritual Exercise, the remaining two months were for the pilgrimage and/or hospital experience. ‘...si debeant insumi duo menses toti in peregrinatione, vel totti in seruicio hospitalis vel singuli unicuique ministeriorum, etc.’ (MCo. - I, p. 12.)

The purpose of the experience in the hospital¹²¹ was to grow in the spirit of humility and self-effacement so as to participate totally in the Society's fundamental option of complete availability for humble service.¹²² A person offered oneself completely in order to imitate Christ who became a servant for others.

During this experience the novice cultivates a spirit of humility and self-effacement... This experience involves an opening to the apostolic life, since these are *the others* who call forth my generosity and my capacity for self-giving. This gift of one's self must not, however, be perfected through deeds of glory, but rather by imitating Christ, who became the servant of all.¹²³

Identification with Christ who became a servant leads the candidate to care for those in the hospital thus embodying in his life the kenosis of Christ.¹²⁴ The encounter with Christ poor and humble in the *SpEx* leads them to work in an objective situation of social emptiness¹²⁵ 'in order to have a new solidarity with the victims of society (by embracing a life of lowliness and humanity).'¹²⁶ The invitation to embody the kenosis of Christ during the hospital experience in order to prepare the candidate for Jesuit ministry is eloquently explained by O'Leary who says that:

¹²¹ The hospital of that period were not like hospitals as understood today. Simão Rodrigues while speaking about their work in the hospitals would say, 'In the hospitals they waited on the indigent, made the beds, swept the house, cleaned out whatever was soiled, washed the pots of the poor who were sick, carried away the bodies of the dead honourably prepared for burial, dug their graves and buried them in a religious manner.' (Cf. *A Brief and Exact Account: The Recollections of Simão Rodrigues...*, pp. 45-46.) The cause of this terrible situation of the hospitals in Italy had to do with the invasion in 1494 of Charles VIII. His troops had brought syphilis, the dreaded "morbus Gallicus," to the unprotected country. It spread rapidly and caused devastation. The hospitals were often places where these plague-stricken people were left to die. (Cf. SCHURHAMMER, GEORGE. *Francis Xavier, His Life and Times - Vol. 1: Europe*, The Jesuit Historical Institute: Rome, 1973, pp. 298, 304-309.)

¹²² Cf. DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 31. With this experience, the candidate opened up to the apostolic life of the Society and served all who were in the hospital by '*sharing the life of the sick and healthy alike, assisting and serving all.*'

¹²³ IBID. Jaer makes it a point to show how this experience is linked to the meditation of the 'Two Standards' where a person shows a preference for humble service as against a worldly desire for honor and prestige. He would therefore insist that it would be impossible for one to sustain this kind of life '*unless supported by a contemplative impulse that suffuses this service with a genuine sense of communion with the Lord.*'

¹²⁴ Cf. BUCKLEY, MICHAEL. "Freedom, election...", pp. 82-83. '*...they were sent for a very specific purpose: to embody in their lives, in their care for these outcasts, that kenosis which is the life of Christ. Humiliations for Ignatius are not embarrassments before a slight or before an act of contempt. They are objective situations of social emptiness; they are the slights and the contempt themselves.*'

¹²⁵ O'LEARY, BRIAN. *Sent into...*, p. 47. '*They were to find the poor Christ in these people just as they had found him in the contemplations of his life when making the Exercises. They were to be the compassionate, healing Christ ministering to the broken, dying Christ.*'

¹²⁶ BUCKLEY, MICHAEL. "Freedom, election...", p. 83.

...novices needed to embody in their lives the kenosis of Christ, through obedience, charity and humiliations. Christ had already emptied himself to become one with the lowliest of humanity. They in turn were to do what Christ had already done, to empty themselves of their natural clinging to honour and prestige in society, to leave aside even their natural sense of modesty and decency as they related to people whose sickness often carried a severe moral stigma. ...As well as a severe test, the hospital experiment was an effectual apprenticeship to Jesuit ministry.¹²⁷

The pilgrimage was the third important testing experience and was intimately linked with Ignatius' life. It consisted in inviting the candidate to have a spiritual understanding of life as a pilgrim and at the same time achieving the twin purpose of getting accustomed to poverty and discomfort as well as to have growing trust in God. Ignatius believed that a person ought to be physically tough in order to deal with the rigors of an apostolic life. He wanted them to experience actual poverty and undergo physical hardships.¹²⁸

The goal of helping the candidate's grow in trust and confidence in God was equally important and was part of a spiritual process. While it began by aiding the candidate in understanding how God was provident and lovingly provided for his needs, he was also invited to understand how God took care of all reality. Through a life of actual poverty he was invited towards a deeper level of spiritual poverty. In this pedagogy we find echoes of the Spiritual Exercises where a person is led from experiencing the personal love of God during the Principal and Foundation as well as the First Week towards an experience of the laboring love of God in the Contemplation to Obtain Love.

With the passage of time, Ignatius had a nuanced understanding of these experiences. In keeping with his method of using means for the desired end, he carefully considered the utility of these two experiences and this consideration can be seen in a letter from Polanco on January 17, 1554. In this letter he indicates that these two

¹²⁷ O'LEARY, BRIAN. *Sent into...*, p. 47.

¹²⁸ In a document in 1541 related to founding colleges he said that a person who could not remain without food and drink for a day was not fit to be in the Society. We believe that this position was nuanced in the course of time, but the basic need of physical toughness for the sake of mission was generally considered a necessary quality. '*...porque quien no sabe estar o andar un día sin comer y mal dormir, no parece que en nuestra Compañía podría perseverar.*' (MCo I, p. 54.)

experiences are in order to further test a vocation which is doubtful because in the case of a firm vocation, these two experiences adversely affect the physical health of the novices.¹²⁹ An example of such a decision was Nadal who was not sent to the hospital or the pilgrimage. On the other hand we have the example of Guillermo Postal who was sent on a pilgrimage to test his abnegation and humility.¹³⁰

Along with the above mentioned reasons, another reason which related the importance of these experiences to the Society's charism was that they prepared the candidate for ministry. As seen in the explanation so far, Ignatius did not look at the pilgrimage as an exercise akin to what was found in monastic orders. He expected a Jesuit to relate to various kinds of persons in the course of his ministry and for this end, he was trained to 'adjust, (by putting) aside his likes and dislikes, his pride and prejudice, his squeamishness and fastidiousness. He (was expected to) meet life in the raw and find God amid its often harsh realities.'¹³¹

9.2.2.2.3 Fifth and Sixth Experience – Preaching & Hearing Confessions

We move from the third to the fifth experience because the fourth experience of 'low and humble tasks' will be elaborated in the next point where secondary testing experiences will be explained. These two experiences were a kind of apprenticeship and had no specific purpose other than to minister to the needs of the people.¹³² It reminded the

¹²⁹ *EppIgn – VI*, p. 203. (As quoted in DE GUIBERT, JOSEPH. *The Jesuits...*, p. 103.) 'It is not his custom often to carry into practice these two tests of the pilgrimage and the hospital, unless with those who are already half-dismissed from the Society. Experience has shown that the good men exhaust themselves by giving themselves to it with too great fervor, suffer much, and fall ill. Therefore with those who are good and edifying he makes little use of these tests. With the others, it does not seem much better to send them to serve in the hospitals, at least in the name of the Society, because they usually make a bad impression. On the other hand, he does use the pilgrimage with these, reckoning that either they will go away under God's care or, if they do come back, they will return humbled and helped.'

¹³⁰ 'En el caso de Nadal, encontramos...que, de hecho, las experiencias de la peregrinación y el hospital han sido substituidas por los 'oficios humildes', como se dirá más tarde: trabajos en la cocina; el huerto, el refectorio...' In this same section Jurado gives us the example of Guillermo Postal, another novice who was sent on a pilgrimage during which Ignatius desired to test his humility in being able to give up his own judgment. His insistence regarding the validity of some strange prophecies revealed the lack of humility and abnegation leading to his ultimate exit from the Society. (Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. *Orígenes del Noviciado en la Compañía de Jesús*, Institutum Historicum: Roma, 1980, pp. 17, 23.)

¹³¹ O'LEARY, BRIAN. *Sent into...*, pp. 48-49.

¹³² Cf. *IBID.*, p. 50. 'There is no longer any mention of an ascetical purpose, or even of the spiritual growth of the novice. The focus is simply on ministering to the needs of people.'

candidate that all belonged to an apostolic body which had a special preference for the poor.¹³³

Despite the fact that there is no mention of ascetical practices or spiritual processes, these experiences invite a person towards greater self-abnegation and humility. The text indicates that the fifth experience consisted in '*explaining the Christian doctrine ...in public to boys and other simple persons.*' (GE 69¹) Ignatius' realized that this fulfilled two ends: a) a pastoral need of attending to the spiritual and catechetical needs of the simple and humble people; b) aided the Jesuit in progressing in the virtue of humility. Ignatius envisaged a Society where most of its members would be persons of high learning and hence the involvement in the task of preaching in public to humble and rustic persons was necessary.¹³⁴

We come to the end of the primary experiences which take place during the period of the second probation. These testing experiences are meant to instruct and test the candidate in so far as being able to live the Society's charism. It needs to be strongly emphasized that these experiences do not end with the two years of the novitiate, but are expected to form part of the Jesuit's lifestyle all the days of his life. Over the years they have proven to be an effective means for apostolic fruitfulness and sustained progress in the virtues of humility and self-abnegation.

9.2.2.3 Text of the Secondary Testing Experiences

The secondary testing experiences were not as varied as the primary experiences. Though numbers [80] and [82] are exceptions, these instructions could be considered as further explanations of the fourth experience which speaks of the candidate being employed in '*various low and humble tasks.*' (GE 68¹) It continued the ongoing process of testing the candidate as well as helped him experientially understand the Society's charism. The experiences were restricted to the house of probation and the candidate was expected to continually grow in virtues, especially the virtue of obedience. In this

¹³³ Cf. DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 32.

¹³⁴ The importance of these experiences can be seen in the fact that Ignatius asked the Fathers in the Council of Trent to teach catechism to children and hear confessions. (Cf. *LL*, p. 130.)

manner, the candidate grew in an ever greater identification with Christ who was totally obedient to the Father – an obedience which led to the humiliating death on the Cross.

These secondary experiences were more flexible than the primary experiences and therefore the end had to be explained clearly to the superior. Ignatius in these numbers repeatedly emphasizes the end of these experiences which consisted in the continual growth in obedience leading to humility and total emptying love. In analyzing this text we shall begin by giving an outline of these numbers. We shall begin with number [81] which speaks about lifestyle in a house of probation. These will be followed by highlighting some significant phrases in the remaining numbers in order to better understand the end of the testing experiences. Finally we shall end with a few comments related to the extraordinary clarity of these numbers in better understanding the charism of the Society.

The numbers which deal with these secondary experiences and their purpose as lived out within the precincts of the house of probation are presented in a table below.

No.	Test/Experience	Additional Remarks	End/Purpose
[80]	Permissions, sacramental life, learning and preaching ¹³⁵	... instructions about regular confession and the Holy Sacrament... ... priest will also observe other ordinances or constitutions of the house... ... all learn Christian doctrine and some should preach...	(Though not explicit, the end is to help the person grow in <i>obedience</i> . The reference to 'permission' in order to go out as well as obedience to the confessor and rules, reinforce the importance of obedience.)
[81]	House of probation - lifestyle	...food, drink, clothing, shoes, and lodging will be what is characteristic of the poor... ...persuade himself (to take) what is worst in the house ... reach the same point (as the necessity and bodily wants of the <i>Society's first members</i>), or to go farther in the Lord	...for his greater abnegation and spiritual progress and to arrive at a certain equality and common norm among all

¹³⁵ The point regarding learning Christian doctrine was introduced into the text of 1550 and the explicit prohibition regarding temporal coadjutors was introduced in texts of 1556 & 1594. (Cf. *MCo – II*, pp. 64-65.)

[82]	Door-to-door begging for three days before vows ¹³⁶	...before professed make their profession or coadjutors take their vows or scholastics become approved... ...imitating the <u>Society's earliest members.</u>	Able to <u>humble</u> themselves more and make greater spiritual progress, giving glory to his Divine Majesty. More disposed to practice begging when they are so commanded, or find it expedient or necessary when they are traveling through various parts of the world. ¹³⁷
[83]	Low and humble tasks in the house	... come down to details. ... working in the kitchen, cleaning the house, and all the rest of these services.	... tests of <u>humility</u> and <u>abnegation</u> of oneself. ... take on more promptly those that offend his sensibilities more, if he has been ordered to do them..
[84]	General obedience to the cook	do the cooking or help him who is doing it, if he should not do this, neither, would he show <u>obedience</u> to any other superior, 'In no manner, therefore, ought one to consider whether it is the cook of the house who gives the order or its superior, or one person rather than another.	with great <u>humility</u> he must obey the cook... by showing him always complete <u>obedience</u> since genuine <u>obedience</u> considers, not the person to whom it is offered, but Him for whose sake it is offered; and if it is exercised for the sake of our Creator and Lord alone, then it is the very Lord of everyone who is obeyed... ... <u>obedience</u> is not shown either to these persons or for their sake, but to God alone and only for the sake of God our Creator and Lord.
[85 – 88]	Ordered by the cook and other officials	the cook should not request his helper to do this or that, but that he should modestly <u>command</u> him by saying, "Do this" or "Do that" [D], This same attitude applies to the other lowly duties when someone is helping in them, and likewise in the same manner to the subordinate officials [E] who, receiving their authority from the superior, govern the house.	By commanding him or saying, "Do this" or "Do that," he will show more clearly that he is speaking as Christ to man, since he is commanding in His place. The person who <u>obeys</u> ought to consider and heed the order which comes from the cook, or from another who is his superior, as if it were coming from Christ our Lord, so that he may be entirely pleasing to his Divine Majesty.

¹³⁶ It refers to those who are to be professed and hence is not about the novitiate. This has been modified and CN-128/5 states that they '...are to spend some time in ministries among the poor and marginalized.'

¹³⁷ This is further explained with the statement that 'For our profession requires that we be prepared and very much ready for whatever is enjoined upon us in our Lord and at whatsoever time, 'Without asking for or expecting any reward in this present and transitory life, but hoping always for that life which lasts for all eternity, through God's supreme mercy.' (GE 82⁷⁸)

[89]	Obedience to the infirmarians	observe <i>obedience</i> with great integrity not only toward his spiritual superiors but also and with equal humility toward the physicians and infirmarians One who is sick should, by showing his great humility and patience, try to give no less edification in time of illness	the former work for his complete spiritual welfare and the latter for that which is corporal. ...for the greater glory of God.
[90]	Willingness of the candidate to be entirely obedient.	asked whether he is willing to be entirely <i>obedient</i> in everything which has been stated and explained here, to perform and fulfill all the penances which will be imposed on him for his errors and negligences, or for one thing or another.	For the surer achievement of everything hitherto stated and for the candidate's own greater spiritual progress

The general movement within this text points towards greater obedience, abnegation and humility. The invitation to such a spiritual process is rooted in the experience of the First Companions. We have highlighted the above mentioned words by putting them in boxes (humility & abnegation), underline/italicized (obedience) and italicize/box (First Companions). The text in no. [90] offers us a key in order to understand the preceding text because in it the candidate is asked '*whether he is willing to be entirely obedient in everything*'. (GE 90¹) The central point is therefore the ability to be empty oneself totally in order to be obedient in everything. However the goal is not obedience for its own sake. It is a means in order to have a growing love for poverty and humility in order to better identify with Christ poor and humble.

The attitude of desiring that which fosters humility as articulated in the 3rd degree of humility is seen in various phrases and these include: '*he should persuade himself that it will be what is worst in the house*' (GE 81¹); '*take on more promptly those that offend his sensibilities*' (GE 83²) However Ignatius who was well versed with human behavior realized that such an attitude was not easily forthcoming. He indicates that in order to foster such an attitude the cook '*should not request the helper to do this or that, but that he should modestly command him.*' (GE 85¹) Ignatius expects the others officials of the house to behave accordingly. (GE 87)

Besides the key phrases indicated above, the text has a plethora of words which indicate a continuous process and movement. The word '*greater*' is used five times and the word '*more*' eight times. Ignatius understood that at an initial stage, the candidate had to be aided in order to cultivate the attitudes humility and self-emptying for the sake of other. However once the superior realized that the candidate had internalized the attitude of humility out of love for its spiritual value, it could be moderated. Due to this in a Declaration he states that '*at the beginning one is aided more by being commanded than by being requested.*' (GE 86¹)

The text stands out because of its the use of phrases with direct references between the virtues proposed and its Christological or Divine origin. On two occasions he uses the term '*Divine Majesty*'; on eight occasions the term '*Lord*' is used; on six occasions the word '*God*' is used; twice the word '*Christ*' and on two occasions '*Creator and Lord*'. Despite the fact that the candidate is called to follow Christ poor and humble by making concrete choices for the sake of a greater identification with Christ, in the background the candidate is placing himself in the service of the triumphant Christ. The Christ of the meditation of the Eternal King and the Two Standards is the person for whom the candidate would be offering himself.

Finally we end with two phrases related to instructions vis-à-vis the cook and they indicate the new level of existence and inter-relationship that the candidate is invited towards.¹³⁸ The request/order of the cook and the response go beyond a relationship which is merely natural towards a transformed relationship which is spiritual. The candidate who has emptied himself of his affective bonds is already relating at a more transcendental level where the encounter with the humble cook becomes a privileged moment of encounter with God. This new relational dimension

¹³⁸ The idea of obedience to the cook was original. Aldama indicates that Salmerón question the use of the word 'command', '*...on the grounds that Sacred Scripture also shows God as requesting and that more love is shown in asking than in ordering. Ignatius' reply, addressed to Polanco, was: "Both are good, asking and commanding. Nevertheless, in the beginning, it helps one more to be commanded than to be asked. But despite this, if you think something should be changed, change it."* Polanco wrote declaration D [86], making use of Ignatius' words and softening some of the expressions in number [85].' (Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory...*, p. 56.)

which results from obedience is evident in two phrases which are as follows: a) ‘...obedience is not shown either to these persons or for their sake, but to God alone and only for the sake of God our Creator and Lord’ (GE 84⁵); b) ‘the person who obeys ought to consider and heed the order which comes from the cook, or from another who is his superior, as if it were coming from Christ our Lord, so that he may be entirely pleasing to his Divine Majesty.’ (GE 85⁴)

9.2.2.4 Interpretation of the Secondary Testing Experiences

The purpose of these secondary testing experiences which are consonant with the fourth experience ‘was to confirm once more the general movement towards abnegation and humility in the witness of one's life.’¹³⁹ This purpose is achieved by helping the person have the right attitude of obedience. (GE 90¹)¹⁴⁰ The methodology used to achieve this end has its roots in the Spiritual exercise with Ignatius using the method of repetition in order to help the candidate internalize what has been experienced during the Exercises as well as the second and third experiences.¹⁴¹

Though these numbers basically deal with humble and low tasks within the house, we do find three numbers which could be considered exceptions: a) permission, confessions and preaching (GE 80); b) the lifestyle of the house (GE 81); c) begging for three days (GE 82). In all of them, the dimension of humility stands out as an important virtue. The house as described in this text indicates that it ought to be peaceful, well ordered in sacramental life, having a studious atmosphere as well as dedication to

¹³⁹ BUCKLEY, MICHAEL. “Freedom, election...”, p. 84.

¹⁴⁰ The text related to obedience ‘in everything which has been stated and explained...’ (GE 90²) It further goes on to speak about penances for errors and negligences. In explaining penances, Laynez clarifies that the Society is not to have jails or whippings or penance by force. He further cautions that though penances may be necessary they should not be done with the motive of revenge, humiliating words should be avoided and that the superior should ensure that it is accepted in the right spirit. (Cf. DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. “Exortación...”, pp. 32.)

¹⁴¹ Buckley indicates that the second, third and fourth experiences are similar to the repetitions of the SpEx. ‘The repetitions in the Exercises are, in a very genuine sense more important than the initial contemplations. They are prayer, often without images or concepts, in which the exercitant rests within the grace which has found him. The petitions are much deeper—because much more simple experiences of interior knowledge. The same deepening is provided for in the experiments...’ (Cf. BUCKLEY, MICHAEL. “Freedom, election...”, pp. 83-84.) O’Leary further explains this in the context of the low and humble experiences of the fourth experiences when he says: ‘It is a repetition in a quieter, less dramatic, more familiar context (the Jesuit house) of the earlier experiences. In this way a deepening of experience is built into the sequence and structure of the experiments in just the way that it is built into the Spiritual Exercises.’ (Cf. O’LEARY, BRIAN. *Sent into...*, p. 50.)

Christian doctrine. It ought to provide an environment where virtues such as poverty, humility, self-denial and obedience could be fostered.¹⁴² The instruction to beg for three days may not be always possible in today's situations, but the theological perspective of doing everything '*for the love of God our Lord... (and) the service and glory of God*' (GE 82) in order to grow in humility, poverty and other virtues is equally valid.¹⁴³

The secondary testing experiences consisted in a person's interaction with low and humble offers during which he interacts with the cook, the infirmarians and other officials of the house. Ignatius places great importance to the internal attitude that ought to characterize the attitude of the candidate. Instead of giving practical details, he dwells at length on the great virtues that the candidate is expected to cultivate and these include poverty, self-denial, patience, edification, integrity, obedience and humility.¹⁴⁴ An atmosphere of lowliness, triviality and monotony was a better atmosphere in order to grow deeper in these virtues.¹⁴⁵ Ignatius was aware of the danger of the house becoming a safe haven where a superficial form of piety was encouraged.¹⁴⁶ He was careful in

¹⁴² Cf. DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 33.

¹⁴³ Jurado in speaking about the adaptation of the pilgrimage insists that the goal of such experiences should not be forgotten. Quoting Laynez he insists that the goal of Ignatius and the first companions was to imitate the apostolic way of life and therefore the experiences should maintain focused on ensuring that the candidate grows in attitudes which were proper to an apostle of the Good News. '*Se ha intentado sustituirla con alguna experiencia semejante como trabajo en fábricas o en el campo, algo que llevase consigo pobreza, abnegación, servicio y abandono en las manos de Dios. Habría que tener en cuenta la finalidad indicada a estas pruebas en las Constituciones. El P. Diego Laínez, en sus explicaciones sobre el Examen, las relaciona con la vida apostólica de Cristo y sus Apóstoles y con las enseñanzas del Evangelio. Son una confirmación de que en el Instituto de la CJ los primeros compañeros de Ignacio desearon imitar la vida apostólica. Ellos mismos hicieron experiencia de ellas en París y Venecia. Se trata, por tanto, de probar en estas experiencias la aptitud y disposición del novicio a lo que ha de ser la vida de misión en la CJ, a la vez que de crear en él las actitudes correspondientes a un apóstol evangélico.*' (Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. "Probación" DHCJ..., p. 3237.)

¹⁴⁴ Aldama has an extensive explanation on the three great virtues, poverty, self-denial, humility and obedience as they appear in this part of the text. '*After an introductory paragraph on the life of cloister, piety, and the regular observances of the novitiate ([80]), the candidate is made aware of the necessity of three great virtues: poverty ([81-82]), humility and self-denial ([83]), and obedience ([84-89]).*' Jaer would add the virtue of confidence in God to it. '*He (Ignatius) explains how it is necessary to exercise ourselves in poverty above all (81-82), humility, self-denial (82-83), and confidence in the Lord through obedience (84-90).*' (Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Understanding...*, pp. 52-57; Cf. DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 33.)

¹⁴⁵ Cf. O'LEARY, BRIAN. *Sent into...*, p. 49. '*The very lowliness and even triviality of the tasks to be performed within one's own local community, the monotonous daily routine of duties, can often test obedience, charity and generosity more than apostolic enterprises. To serve our brothers can be harder than to serve the poor or the outcast. It is less likely to bring much gratification, still less excitement or matter for self-congratulation.*'

¹⁴⁶ Cf. DE GUIBERT, JOSEPH. *The Jesuits...*, p. 104. In speaking about the importance of the external experiences he

ensuring that the structure and routine of the house was designed in such a manner that they aided in testing and instructing the novices in these virtues. Let us now look at the three virtues of poverty, obedience and humility as highlighted by some well-known commentators in these numbers.

Poverty consists in the manner and measure to be observed in the use of things. It does not simply refer to denying ownership of things, but the appropriate use of the things which are in keeping with the vow of poverty.¹⁴⁷ Due to this it was necessary to regulate the use of things in the house in a manner that helped a person actually experience the life of a poor.¹⁴⁸ However the important point about poverty does not lie in the externals or the quantifiable matters, but in the attitude of the candidate and the spiritual motivation for the same.¹⁴⁹ Ignatius reiterates this motivation when he speaks about the experience of begging for three days. Besides the practical utility that this experience had for the apostolic needs of the Society, it helped 'a candidate (go) against the common manner of human thinking, (so that he) may be able in God's service and praise to humble (himself) more and make greater spiritual progress, giving glory to his Divine Majesty'¹⁵⁰

Obedience is a fundamental virtue within the charism of the Society and the example of the cook offers to us the basic doctrine of Ignatian obedience. This idea would be elaborated at length in various letters, (especially the letter to the Jesuits of

elaborates the caution exercised by Ignatius about superficial piety in an environment which is closed and sheltered.

¹⁴⁷ Aldama indicates that the attitude ought to be one the Franciscan understanding wherein a person used things in the manner a poor person would use things. Ignatius quantifies this understanding of poverty and suggests that if a college could afford to spend four escudos per student could be considered a fixed income. Further on in a letter to Laynez he lays down detailed rules of how poverty ought to be practised. (Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Understanding...*, pp. 53-54.)

¹⁴⁸ We find that Ignatius does not engage in offering many details as seen in earlier Rules. However he is concrete enough to include the basic elements of life such as 'food, drink, clothing, shoes, and lodging...' (GE 81¹)

¹⁴⁹ He therefore invites the candidate to 'persuade himself that it will be what is worst in the house, for his greater abnegation and spiritual progress and to arrive at a certain equanimity and common norm among all.' (GE 81²)

¹⁵⁰ In matters of begging Ignatius was not in favor making a nuisance of oneself or behaving in a manner which was spectacular. In this matter which was humiliating, Ignatius expected the candidate to be discrete. (Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Understanding...*, pp. 54-55.)

Portugal in 1553) and the Constitutions.¹⁵¹

True obedience looks not at who it is that gives the orders, whether he is the superior or the cook, whether he has certain qualities or not. It looks to God alone, “considering the matter with sound understanding” (that is, understanding it accurately and without error) and believing that in the cook or the superior one obeys God alone ([84]). The inference is not very clear at first sight, so an explanation is given in the next paragraph ([85]), where we read that the cook as well as the superior gives orders in the place of Christ.¹⁵²

The two paragraphs related to the cook are primarily geared towards offering a practical and theological understanding of obedience. They are devoted towards helping the candidate understand the meaning of such obedience and cultivating an attitude proper to a Jesuit. They explain ‘the essential communication between obedience and humility... communicating to the candidate the whole perspective of faith that is at the root of the fundamental practice of obedience in the Society.’¹⁵³

The virtues of poverty and obedience are linked to that of humility. This virtue is a defining as well as a transversal theme all through the fourth chapter culminating in an identification with Christ poor and humble. The secondary testing experiences repeatedly invite the candidate to grow in humility and every number explicitly or implicitly refers to it. Though the low and humble tasks are presented in the context of obedience, the underlying and primary purpose is to help the candidate grow in the way of Christ which is the way of humility.

Buckley explains the experiments by using the meditation of the Two Standards indicating that the pedagogy of the primary and secondary experiments consists in aiding the candidate move from growing in devotion (the goal of the *SpEx*) towards total

¹⁵¹ Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Understanding...*, pp. 56-57. This understanding of obedience is in keeping with the more detailed treatise on obedience to the Jesuits of Portugal on March, 26, 1553. In this letter he exhorts the Jesuits to obedience to the superior because of ‘*his place and authority... and would like all to practice recognizing Christ our Lord in any superior...*’ As the letter progresses he outlines the different levels of obedience which include the execution of what is commanded, the surrender of wills and the finally ‘*a complete and perfect oblation of himself (where) in addition to his will, (he) offers his understanding. This is ...the highest degree of obedience.*’ (Cf. *LI*, pp. 412-421.)

¹⁵² *IBID.*, p. 56

¹⁵³ Cf. DE JAER, ANDRE. *Together for...*, p. 34. Explaining this perspective of faith he would say: ‘*Obedience must above all be clearly understood in this light. It is a spiritual option freely chosen with God’s grace. It cannot really be comprehended solely as if it had only a human aspect. Authority - no matter who is in command - is always exercised in the name of Christ.*’

involvement in ministerial life. In this movement the candidate begins by a contact with Christ in the Exercises and is then schooled in Christ's standard through the testing experiences. These experiences lead to an ever growing union with Christ poor and humble through a life of actual poverty, obedience and humility. In his article he explains this profoundly spiritual process by relating the dynamics of growing identification with Christ through an imitation of His poverty and humility during the various experiments in the following manner:

There is a profound pedagogy at work here... These experiments move from devotion, the ability to find God in all things, through experiences which call upon humility, abnegation, and poverty, and to engagement in the ministerial life of the Society. They embody in their structure the same pedagogy which the Two Standards indicated as the critical education in discipleship. They are patterned on the life and ministry of Jesus.

(In) the Spiritual Exercises "there are three stages: the first, poverty against riches; the second, reproach or affront against worldly honour; the third, humility against pride, and by these three stages they are to lead human beings on to all the other virtues." These "tres escalones" constitute the interior dynamic of the second, third, and fourth experiments: in one, poverty is more emphasized, in another, humiliations; but they both exist in all three with varying degrees of intensity.¹⁵⁴

The starting point of this process is an experience of Christ in the *SpEx* and in this experience, one chooses the Standard of Christ to live according to the way of Christ. This way is one of poverty and humility wherein the candidate learns that 'the worth of his life (is) not by his possessions or by a context of prestige and popularity, but by the love and grace which God holds him.'¹⁵⁵ The gratuitous love of Christ experienced in poverty and humility during the *SpEx* is the beginning of a unique salvific experience.

As this experience is repeated again and again the person's desire is transformed and he lovingly participates in situations of poverty and humiliation. The principal and secondary testing experiences make him a person whose life is moved by a love which empties itself for others. The testing experiences are thus the starting point of a life-long journey whereby a person experientially grows in poverty, obedience and humility within the specific apostolic charism of the Society of Jesus.

¹⁵⁴ BUCKLEY, MICHAEL. "Freedom, election...", pp. 84-85.

¹⁵⁵ IBID.

9.2.3 TESTING EXPERIENCES IN THE APOSTOLIC LIFE OF THE EARLY SOCIETY

Ignatius and the First Companions had gone through various testing experiences and these experiences have been highlighted during the course of this work.¹⁵⁶ Let us now see how these experiences had a direct bearing on the apostolic goal of the Society. In continuation we shall highlight the utility of these experiences in the apostolic mission of the Society during its initial years. The demands of the mission reinforced the need of testing experiences and helped in its process of institutionalization.

The three letters we shall analyze are as follows: a) Ignatius' letters to the Fathers of the Council of Trent (1546); b) Letter to Antonio Araoz regarding the Society's activities in and around Rome (1547); c) Letter to the members of the Society leaving for Germany (1549). In analyzing these letters we shall limit ourselves to show the relevance of the testing experiences in the actual apostolic works that the first Jesuits were engaged in.

9.2.3.1 Ignatius' letters to the Fathers of the Council of Trent (1546)

This letter was written to Laínez, Salmerón and Jay who were in Trent on the order of Pope Paul III. While in Trent, they were asked to engage in the diverse ministries that the Society was engaged in. On 1st August, 1546 Faber died and was replaced by Peter Canasius¹⁵⁷. Ignatius divides this letter into three parts. In the first part which relates to dealing with others, he gives instructions about how they ought to speak, listen, discuss and dispose oneself.¹⁵⁸

In the second part where he outlines some points regarding helping souls we have references to the testing experiences of the novitiate. In the very first number he outlines the main purpose of their stay in Trent by saying:

For the greater glory of God our Lord, our main purpose during this stay at Trent is, while

¹⁵⁶ The flexibility of Ignatius in terms of these testing experiences can be understood by looking at the three individual cases of Guillermo Postel, Jerónimo Nadal and Benito Palmio elaborated by Ruiz Jurado. (Cf. RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. *Orígenes del Noviciado ...*, pp. 16-27.)

¹⁵⁷ Cf. *LL*, p. 128.

¹⁵⁸ Cf. *LL*, pp. 128-29.

trying to live together in some decent place, to preach, hear confessions, and give lectures while teaching children, giving good example, visiting the poor in hospitals, and exhorting our neighbors – according as each one possesses this or that talent for moving all the persons we can to devotion and prayer...¹⁵⁹

Points number 2, 3 and 4 are further explanations about preaching, lectures and confessions. In point 5 he speaks about giving the SpEx and suggests that they '*speak in public... give the exercises of the First Week and no more, except in the case of few persons... and recommends praying for the council.*'¹⁶⁰ Point 6 refers to teaching catechism to children, point 7 to visiting the hospitals as well as visiting the poor every third day and finally point 8 refers to '*urging everyone... in conversation to frequent confession, Communion, celebration of Mass, spiritual exercises and other pious works.*'¹⁶¹ He ends with an exhortation about how they ought to conduct themselves while speaking to others.

The last part deals with the relationship among themselves and in it we see the methodology of the Deliberations being used. Along with an evaluation of the day, they were also to engage in fraternal correction with each day being dedicated to one person. Ignatius expected these instructions to '*go into effect within five days of arrival at Trent.*'¹⁶² The letter thus shows the direct and intimate connection between the testing experiences and the actual apostolic life lived by the first companions in the midst of an important mission entrusted by the Church.

9.2.3.2 Ignatius' letter about activities in Rome (1547)

Ignatius wanted Jesuits to be aware of the activities of their companions and in keeping with this desire he wrote this letter to inform others members of the Society about the activities of the Society in and around Rome. It is very informative and gives us a good idea of the activities that Ignatius and other Jesuits engaged in during this period.¹⁶³ The purpose of writing these letters was for the consolation and encouragement of one

¹⁵⁹ *LI*, p. 129. The word *lectures* is explained in a footnote as '*Instructional and devotional lectures for the general public, as distinguished from the more oratorical sermon.*'

¹⁶⁰ *LI*, p. 130.

¹⁶¹ *LI*, p. 130.

¹⁶² *LI*, p. 131.

¹⁶³ *LI*, p. 211.

another.

He begins by speaking about the purpose of writing these letters and moves on to highlight the importance of Rome in the world, the Church and for the Society. After these introductory remarks there is a long description of the activities of Ignatius and this is followed by the activities of nearly thirty-four or thirty-five other Jesuits in Rome. In explaining the link between the testing experiences and the actual ministry of the Society our primary focus shall be on these Jesuits.

The first part focuses on the spiritual attitudes expected of a candidate. It begins by speaking about the increase in vocations and the caution that Ignatius exercises *'to admit no one who is unsuited to (the) Institute and to dismiss those who after admission prove difficult or unwilling to do their duty, although he (Ignatius) helps such persons to strive to serve God better elsewhere.'*¹⁶⁴ Immediately the subject moves on to the abnegation of one's will and the importance of obedience for experiencing the same. The growth in self-abnegation, obedience and humility is first experienced by low and humble tasks in the house.

While there are plenty of occasions in the house for exercising one's desire for poverty and for the mortification of numerous impulses of self-love, there is special occasion for exercising humility, the subordination of one's own wishes and opinions, and in general all the elements of obedience. One must obey not only the father superior, the minister, and the sub-minister, who are regular superiors over everyone, but also occasional superiors among the lowliest officials in the house, such as the cook and others; everyone who comes to the house must go and serve under them, obeying their orders even though they may be persons on whom God has lavished his graces of all kinds, and even though they may at another time have themselves been served and obeyed by many. And thus house (God, the author of all good, be blessed!) functions as an excellent school of obedience, and there are many occasions to grow in abnegation, particularly of one's own judgment and will, which is considered of capital importance for persons in our institute.¹⁶⁵

The next two paragraphs speak of the ministries outside the house and these include *'administering the holy sacraments, hearing numerous confessions ...preaching in our*

¹⁶⁴ *LI*, p. 215.

¹⁶⁵ *LI*, pp. 215-16.

*Church ...regularly on Sundays and feast days...'*¹⁶⁶ They were also involved in preaching *'to the priests and pastors of Rome, many of whom (were) extremely uninformed.'*¹⁶⁷ In the same way, attention was paid to students in schools and arrangements were made to *'teach Christian doctrine and morals and what (was) most essential for their salvation.'*¹⁶⁸ The letter also refers to the *SpEx* being given to various persons, some of whom reformed their lives and others decided to enter the Society. Further on, mention is made of spiritual conversations, assistance in reconciling important persons and the ministry of *'visiting the sick, particular in the hospitals, where some of us provided corporal and others spiritual help.'*¹⁶⁹

The following paragraphs give some examples of persons who had been helped to reconcile with others. Various instances of confessions, reconciliations and the spiritual benefit accrued to different persons are highlighted in this paragraph.¹⁷⁰ The following two paragraphs give examples of persons who benefitted through the ministry of visiting the sick in hospitals. As in the case with confessions, the letter goes on to offer concrete examples of helping persons die a holy death by giving the example of a person in the palace and a women who dying in childbirth.¹⁷¹ The letter ends by offering the Society to God and asking God to make the Society a better instrument in order to be used as an instrument for God's glory.¹⁷²

The methodology used by the Ignatius is interesting. He begins by underlining the spiritual attitudes and values. This is followed by indicating how the various testing experiences are being fruitfully used in the Society's daily ministry. Finally he reinforces

¹⁶⁶ *LI*, p. 216.

¹⁶⁷ *LI*, p. 217. Due to the poor state of the Jesuit Church, this was being done in the Church of Sant'Eustachio. The attendance of these pastors was considerable.

¹⁶⁸ *LI*, p. 217.

¹⁶⁹ *LI*, p. 217.

¹⁷⁰ The letter speaks of a person who *'with God's help was induced to give public forgiveness to (a certain person) and be reconciled with him, kissing him and embracing him with a great demonstration of love, and likewise to go to confession with much devotion and to the extraordinary benefit of his soul.'* *LI*, p. 217. Other examples can be seen in *LI*, pp. 217-18.

¹⁷¹ *LI*, p. 218.

¹⁷² *LI*, p. 219. *'...so that God may 'be pleased to increase in the Society's members his holy gifts and abundant grace, so that in ourselves and in our neighbours his service, praise, and glory may be mightily increased.'*

these salient aspects of the Society's charism and ministry by offering concrete examples in order to inspire and edify the other members of the Society.

9.2.3.3 Letter to Jesuits leaving for Germany (1549)

The duke of Bavaria had requested Pope Paul III to send Jesuits as professors of theology to teach in the University of Ingolstadt, a university which had fallen into decline. In this letter while urging the Jesuits (Salmerón, Jay and Canasius) to fulfil the specific mission, he also asked them to be involved in other ministries.¹⁷³

The letter has three parts where two sets of goals are addressed. It begins with some common means for both these goals and then moves on to the specific goals of Germany and that of the Society. The letter begins by inviting them to place *'no confidence in (themselves) at all, (but) trust courageously in God and have a strong desire, aroused and nourished by charity and obedience, for achieving (the) goal.'*¹⁷⁴ After speaking of having total trust in God, he moves on to speak about what they ought to do – i.e., *'be models of charity and virtue', ...sincere charity towards all, love in word and truth... by both spiritual assistance and exterior works of charity.'*¹⁷⁵ The sixth is important because of its invitation to a life of humility and charity which concretely consists in being able to *'adapt to the local customs insofar as the Society's religious Institute allows.'*¹⁷⁶ He gives further details about winning over authorities and influential persons in order to further the apostolic goals. In this context he once again instructs the Jesuits that they should *'try to win over the university professors and other dignitaries by deep humility and modesty and by rendering them becoming acts of service.'*¹⁷⁷

The testing experiences are proposed in the second part where Ignatius instructs the Jesuits about means to achieve the primary goal – i.e. *'the upbuilding of Germany in*

¹⁷³ LI, p. 291.

¹⁷⁴ LI, p. 291.

¹⁷⁵ LI, pp. 291-92.

¹⁷⁶ LI, p. 292.

¹⁷⁷ LI, pp. 292-93.

*Faith and in Christina Doctrine and Life.*¹⁷⁸ Ignatius begins by exhorting that they ‘do well in public lectures (because this was) the main thing for which (they) were requested by the duke and sent by the Roman Pontiff.’¹⁷⁹ After dwelling on the essentials he moves to other ministries as hearing confessions (no. 4), drawing students to the Spiritual Exercises (no. 5) and give importance to spiritual conversations. (no. 6). After speaking about being engaged in some of these ministries which were part of the testing experience, he specifically instructs them to ‘devote some time to more visible pious activities – hospitals, prisons, or others ways of helping the poor.’¹⁸⁰ This is followed by an invitation to ‘reconciling of those involved in disagreements and the teaching of catechism to the uneducated.’¹⁸¹

Ignatius goes to speak about other methods in order to win the confidence of the people without compromising on their primary goal. The last part deals with the promotion of the Society in Germany and inspiring the Duke to assist in setting up colleges and seminaries for the good of the Church in Germany and the world at large.¹⁸² Once again we see the importance of the testing experiences in the Society’s apostolic activities. The Society was being entrusted with sensitive and difficult tasks and the testing experiences helped select and prepare candidates to be internally and externally prepared in order to respond appropriately and fruitfully.

With the analysis of this letter we come to the end of that part which deals with the principle and secondary testing experiences. We began with a historical background of tests in other religious orders and went on to understand the textual and spiritual interpretation of these experiences. The three letters confirm and justify the importance placed given by Ignatius and the First Companions to these experiences. These testing experience were critical to foster growth in the virtues of poverty and obedience leading

¹⁷⁸ *LI*, p. 293.

¹⁷⁹ *LI*, p. 293. Further instructions are given regarding doctrine, terminologies, the length of the lectures, the use of rhetoric and prudence. He is keen that they ‘not only nourish the mind but also add things that would nourish the religious affections, so that the hearers go home not just more learned but better persons.’

¹⁸⁰ *LI*, p. 294.

¹⁸¹ *LI*, p. 294.

¹⁸² *LI*, pp. 296-97. Ignatius’ interest in starting a college is evident and he instructs the Jesuits at length on the importance, administration, finances, composition and fruitfulness of such a venture.

to an increasing humility. The attitude of humility would be further deepened through the account of conscience because in it the individual would totally emptying himself to the superior. The total self-emptying through an account of conscience would aid the individual as well as the Society to faithfully and generously live its apostolic charism.

9.3 ACCOUNT OF CONSCIENCE, VOWS AND STABILITY [91–100]

The account of conscience is the last part in this section which relates to the humble emptying of oneself. It plays a vital role in the Society's ability to effectively fulfil the mission entrusted to it by the Church and at the same time is equally important for the spiritual well-being and growth of the individual. In this section we shall follow the earlier structure by first offering a historical background to the practice of account of conscience. This will be followed by an analysis of the text and its interpretation. Finally we shall end by presenting a summary of Ignatius' understanding of the account of conscience as elaborated in the doctoral thesis of Santiago de Goiri.

9.3.1 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

The account of conscience was not introduced during the time of Ignatius. However he gave it a specific orientation in keeping with the Society's apostolic charism whereby he insisted that the account of conscience has to be given to the Superior. Let us now look offer a brief overview of the understanding of an account of conscience within the Christian tradition until the time of Ignatius.

From the earliest Rules we find the contours of the account of conscience as consisting in the twin dimensions of: a) the good of the person and b) the good of the Order. The focus however was not equal on both these dimensions. The predominant emphasis was the good of the persons. From the earliest descriptions of monastic life during the time of St. Antony of the desert it has been found that 'the manifestation of the state of one's soul (was) a common custom among the monks.'¹⁸³

¹⁸³ GILL, JAMES J. "A Jesuit's Account of Conscience – for Personal and Organizational Effectiveness", *Studies* – Vol. IX/5, 1977, p. 251. 'In one of his Epistles can be found specific mention of a monk's seeking and getting advice from a spiritual doctor

This can be inferred from the role of the spiritual father or *abba/apa* as seen in the *Rule of Basil* and the *RP*. It would be emphasized more clearly by Cassian within the context of humility and placed within the well elaborated stages of humility with the *RM* and the *RB*. By the time these last Rules were established, the twin purpose of the manifestation of conscience had become part of the tradition of the Church and was indispensable for spiritual growth within an individual as well as a community.

In the *Rule of Basil* reference to the account of conscience is primarily explained in the context of the good of the person. The 26th *LR* raises the question whether ‘all things, even the secrets of the heart, are to be uncovered to the one who presides.’¹⁸⁴ In response it is said that one ought ‘not keep any movement of this soul concealed in himself or utter an untested word, but lay bare the secrets of the heart to those entrusted among the brothers.’¹⁸⁵ The purpose of manifestation of one’s conscience is explained in terms of the person’s progress towards perfection.¹⁸⁶ The Rule of Pachomius on the other hand presents the *apa* as one who ensure that the monastery functions in an ordered manner.

...the role of the *apa* in Pachomius’ monasteries was not that of spiritual father to each monk, but of organizer of a common regime, a subculture, that encouraged the personal development of the majority of the community as such. It was only in Western cenobitism that the head of the community took on the functions of the spiritual father, thus fusing the cenobitic ideal with that of the desert.¹⁸⁷

who was credited with being capable of curing the ills of the soul and prescribing preventive measures against future attacks. Anthony makes reference to the practice of revealing even one’s thoughts for the purpose of benefitting fully from such guidance.’ Most of the points regarding the history of an account of conscience have been taken from KORTH, FRANCIS N. *The Evolution of “Manifestation of Conscience” in Religious Rules: III-XVI Centuries*, Gregorian University: Rome, 1949.

¹⁸⁴ *The Asketikon...*, p. 227. This refers to no. 26 of the *The Longer Responses*.

¹⁸⁵ *IBID.*, p. 227.

¹⁸⁶ *IBID.* ‘...in this way what is praiseworthy will be confirmed, the fitting remedy will be applied to what is amiss, and from such collaborative endeavour, through making progress little by little, our perfection shall be attained.’ Silvas explains that this is not yet the ‘manifestations of thoughts’ which would be seen in the monastic tradition. The ‘primary purpose was medicinal’ and all (the superior and others) were attested for their skill in emotional and spiritual remediation, i.e. soul-doctors or spiritual physicians.

¹⁸⁷ *The Rule of St. Benedict...*, p. 337. This part is taken from Appendix 2 in this book which deals with monastic themes at length. This appendix deals with the role of the abbot until the Rule of Benedict. The above quote is related to the opinion of Vileux, (VILLEUX A. *La liturgie dans le cénobitisme pachômien au quatrième siècle*, StA 57). The author of this appendix is however not convinced of this characterization of Pachomius and believes that Pachomius besides being a great organizer of monastic life was also a revered spiritual father. (*IBID.*, pp. 337-38.)

The importance of manifestation of conscience was further explained by Evagrius Ponticus.¹⁸⁸ Cassian underlined the importance of manifestation of conscience more explicitly and made repeated mention of it in the *Institutes* and the *Conferences*. In 9th chapter of the fourth book of the *Institutes* it is stated that in order to progress in perfection and grow in true humility the newly initiated

are taught never... to hide any of the wanton thoughts in the hearts but to reveal them to their elder as soon as they surface, nor to judge them in accordance with their own discretion but to credit them with badness or goodness as the elder's examination discloses and makes clear.¹⁸⁹

This point about revealing internal struggles is repeated in the 11th book which deals with the spirit of vainglory where the fathers use a different pedagogy. They speak about their own difficulties in order to help the beginners understand and deal with their own problems in spiritual life.¹⁹⁰ This pedagogy is evident in the second *Conference* on discretion where Abba Moses states that:

...true discretion is not obtained except by true humility. The first proof of this humility will be if not only everything *that is to be done* but also everything *that is thought of* is offered to the inspection of the elders, so that, not trusting in one's own judgment, one may submit in every respect to their understanding and may know how to judge what is good and bad according to what they have handed down.¹⁹¹

What was emphasized by Cassian became part of the *RM* and the *RB*. The

¹⁸⁸ At this point it is worth mentioning the enormous influence of Evagrius Ponticus (345-399 CE) on the understanding of spiritual life. His classification of the vices and the manner of dealing with them was an insightful contribution to the world of spiritual life. In his writings he highlighted the importance of thoughts and the right response to one's thoughts in order to progress in spiritual life. The role of the spiritual father was important in this process and he advises the monk (or person desirous of growing in spiritual perfection) to respect one's (spiritual) father. Some examples can be seen in his work *Ad Monachos* (nos. 73, 88-92). (Cf. *Evagrius Ponticus: Ad Monachos*, (Tr. Driscoll, Jeremy), The Newman Press: New York, 2003, pp. 54 – 57.)

¹⁸⁹ John Cassian: *The Institutes...*, p. 82.

¹⁹⁰ Cf. *IBID.*, p. 247. The expose and lay bare all their struggles so that, 'they may by telling them expose and lay bare all the struggles with the vices that the younger men endure and will continue to endure. Once there have been explained to them the illusions of all the passions to which beginners and fervent spirits are subject, they will become acquainted with the secrets of their struggles. Having been taught the causes of and the remedies for the vices by which they are troubled, they will also learn about future contests before they occur, and they will be instructed as to how they should watch out for them, meet them, and fight against them.'

¹⁹¹ John Cassian: *The Conferences...*, pp. 90-91. Abba Moses then went on to narrate his own experience of surreptitiously eating a biscuit and his freedom on confessing it before Abba Theonas.

manifestation of conscience was part of the process of growing in humility and the *RM* placed it in the fifth rung of the ladder. The same could be said of the *RB* which also placed in the 5th step within the famous 7th chapter on humility. We place both the texts in parallel columns below:

<i>The Rule of the Master</i>	<i>The Rule of St. Benedict</i>
<p>Ch. 10 ...Then the disciple mounts the fifth rung of humility on the ladder of heaven if, making <i>humble vocal confession</i>, <u>he does not conceal from his abbot any evil thoughts that come into his heart or sins that he has secretly committed</u>.</p> <p>Scripture exhorts us in this regard, saying: 'Commit your ways to the Lord and trust in him.'</p> <p>And again it says: 'Give thanks to the Lord, for he is good, for his mercy endures for ever'.</p> <p>So also the prophet says to the Lord: 'I acknowledged my sin to you, my guilt I did not cover. I said: 'I will confess my faults to the Lord,' and immediately you took away the guilt of my heart.'¹⁹²</p>	<p>Ch. 7 ...The fifth step of humility is that a man <u>does not conceal from his abbot any sinful thoughts entering his heart, or any wrongs committed in secret</u>, but rather <i>confesses them humbly</i>.</p> <p>Concerning this, Scripture exhorts us: <i>Make known your way to the Lord and hope in him.</i></p> <p>And again, <i>Confess to the Lord, for he is good; his mercy is forever.</i></p> <p>So too the Prophet: <i>To you I have acknowledged my offense; my faults I have not concealed. I have said: Against myself I will report my faults to the Lord, and you have forgiven the wickedness of my heart.</i>¹⁹³</p>

The two texts are almost verbatim with only a minor changes in the first line as far as the placement of the phrase related to *humble confession* is concerned.. This idea would go on to be extensively applied in the history of spirituality and succeeding spiritual authors would consistently highlight the importance of manifestation of conscience for growing in humility, a central virtue for spiritual progress. The *RM* has one more exhortation about 'revealing evil thoughts to the deans and to the abbot.'¹⁹⁴ The *RB* however does not have a similar chapter.

¹⁹² *The Rule of the Master...*, pp. 135-36.

¹⁹³ *The Rule of St. Benedict...*, p. 199.

¹⁹⁴ *The Rule of the Master...*, pp. 159-160. After giving a few examples of the damage that could be caused by evil thoughts, the author goes on to exhort the person by saying that '*when an evil thought comes to the heart of one of the brothers and he felt that it is causing him to waver, therefore, let him immediately confess it to his deans, and they will inform the abbot of this after quickly saying a prayer.*' He gives further instructions what ought to be done if the person concerned is the dean or the abbot himself.

The succeeding period reiterated the importance of the manifestation of conscience by various religious orders. The *Carthusian Statutes* in its 23rd chapter while speaking about the Prior says that he should be loved and revered by the monks. The monks should be able to

...have confidence in him who has assumed the charge of their souls in the Lord, and cast all their care on him whom they believe to represent Christ. Far from being wise in their own eyes and from relying on their own understanding, let them turn their hearts to the truth and give heed to their father's counsels.¹⁹⁵

Within the Cistercians we can see that Bernard of Clairvaux indicates that the fifth step of humility is the confession of one's sins. The sacramental of confession is not exactly the same as the manifestation of conscience, but indicates the person's willingness to reveal oneself to another – one's actions, thoughts, internal motions and desires. As against this Bernard in his 12 steps of pride indicates that the 9th step is when a person makes an unreal confession and thus engages in deception.¹⁹⁶

The *RF* speaks of the manifestation of conscience indirectly and this can be seen in nos. 26, 36 and 36 where the rule instructs the friars to speak to others. The first relates to the issue of mortal sin where the concerned friar is advised to have recourse to the Ministers Provincial 'as quickly as possible and without delay.'¹⁹⁷ The second relates to persons who 'know and feel that they cannot observe the Rule spiritually'¹⁹⁸ Such persons should approach their Ministers who 'should receive them charitably and kindly and show such familiarity that these same friars may speak and treat them as masters with their servants.'¹⁹⁹ The third relates to any friar who 'moved by divine inspiration

¹⁹⁵ <http://transfiguration.chartreux.org/statuts-en-3.htm>

¹⁹⁶ Cf. *The Steps of Humility & Pride*, (Tr. Conway, Ambrose M.), Cistercian Publications: Kentucky, 1973, pp. 26-27, 73-75. The importance of revealing oneself to another is underlined by Ignatius in the rules for discernment where he points out that a tactic of the evil spirit is its insistence on secrecy. (*SpEx* 326)

¹⁹⁷ ESSAR, CAJETAN. *The Rule and Testament...*, pp. 24-25. Penance could however be imposed only by priests. If the Minister was a priest he could impose penance, but if he was not a priest, he would send him to another person of the Order who was a priest.

¹⁹⁸ *IBID.*, p. 26.

¹⁹⁹ *IBID.*

desires to go among the Saracens or other infidels.’²⁰⁰ Such persons are instructed to speak about this matter to their Ministers Provincials who ‘shall not grant leave except to those whom they deem fit to be sent.’²⁰¹

Within the Franciscan tradition Bonaventure spoke at length about the account of conscience and according to Santiago de Goiri, he was the first person to use the information received during the manifestation of conscience for matters related to external governance. He therefore presents Bonaventure as a precursor of Ignatius.²⁰² Moving on to other religious orders it can be said that the Dominican constitutions made no explicit reference to the manifestation of conscience. The *Modern Devotion* on the other hand would indirectly refer to it while speaking of manifesting the inner movements to a confessor.²⁰³

Ignatius was aware of the practice of the manifestation of conscience and would effectively use it in aiding the candidate fulfill the goal of growing in spiritual perfection by loving and serving others. The *GE* presents this practice in an elaborate manner and various words and phrases are indicative of the mind of Ignatius regarding this theme. Let us now analyze the text as found in the *GE*.

9.3.2 THE TEXT AND ITS INTERPRETATION

In manifesting one’s conscience (*MoC*)²⁰⁴ to the superior, the candidate enters into a more profound level of self-emptying. So far the person had been emptying himself by giving

²⁰⁰ *IBID.*, p. 27.

²⁰¹ *IBID.*

²⁰² Cf. GOIRI, SANTIAGO DE. *La Apertura de conciencia en la espiritualidad de San Ignacio de Loyola*, Graficas Ellacuría: Buenos aires, 1960, p. 12. Henceforth this book will be highlighted as *LADC*. This suggestion to use the information gained from the *MoC* for external governance is made almost in passing by Bonaventure. (Cf. GILL, JAMES J. “A Jesuit’s Account of Conscience – for Personal and Organizational Effectiveness”, *Studies – Vol. IX/5*, 1977, p. 251.)

²⁰³ Cf. *Devotio Moderna – Basic Writings...*, pp. 257-59. This refers to a text called ‘the spiritual ascents’ by Gerard Zerbolt where the person desiring spiritual progress is invited to humbly and contritely confess one’s sins. In this context, the text makes reference to the importance of having a good confessor when it says: ‘...*If possible, choose for yourself a confessor who knows how to bind and loose discreetly and prudently, to whom you are able confidently to commit your soul, your estate, and your life, to whom you can also trustingly lay out all your exercises, and from whom you may expect counsel on particulars. And if you find such a confessor, do not lightly seek another...*’

²⁰⁴ In this point we shall designate the ‘Manifestation of Conscience’ it with the initials *MoC*.

up temporal goods, voluntarily undergoing an affective separation and progressive emptying of oneself through fraternal correction as well as undergoing the principal and secondary testing experiences. The *MoC* takes this process to another level where the internalization of self-emptying love reaches its climax in the person who does not hold back anything before the superior in order to better fulfil the will of God.

9.3.2.1 The Text and its division

The *MoC* could be divided in the following manner:

[91] – [92]	Instructions for the Superior regarding <i>MoC</i>
[93]	Instruction for the Candidate regarding <i>MoC</i>
[94] – [97]	Frequency of <i>MoC</i>
[98]	Vows – Preparation and Pre-requisites
[99] - [100]	Stability and Perseverance

9.3.2.1.1 Instructions for the Superior

The *MoC* takes place within an ambit of dialogue and is explained within the context of the paternal role of the Superior. The Superior has to ensure that the twin objective of the good of the subject as well as the better fulfilment of the apostolic goal of the Society is achieved. The *MoC* is explained as an instrument whereby the Superior has ‘*complete understanding of the subjects within the context of the Society.*’ (GE 91¹) This explanation is reiterated in the next number which says that the *MoC* consists in ‘*the superior having complete knowledge of the inclinations and motions of those who are in his charge, and to what defects or sins they have been or are more moved and inclined...*’ (GE 92³) The importance of this instrument is evident by the repeated use of phrases such as ‘*we consider it to be of great and extraordinary importance in his Divine Majesty...*’ (GE 91¹) and ‘*it is not only necessary, but even supremely important.*’ (GE 92⁴)

The Superior is informed of the purpose of having the *MoC* which could be divided into five points which are as follows:

- ‘...by means of this knowledge they may be able to *direct* and *govern* them better, and while *caring* for them *guide* them better into the paths of the Lord.’ (GE 91²)

- ‘...the more thoroughly they are aware of the interior and exterior affairs of their subjects, with so much greater *diligence, love, and care* will they be able to *help* the subjects and to *guard* their souls from the various difficulties and dangers which might occur later on.’ (GE 92¹)
- ‘...to proceed without error in such missions, (when the supreme pontiff or our immediate superiors order us) or in *sending* some persons and not others, or some for one task and others for different ones...’ (GE 92³)
- ‘... so that he (the superior) may *direct* them better, without placing them beyond the measure of their capacity in *dangers* or labours greater than they could in our Lord endure with a spirit of love...’ (GE 92⁵)
- ‘...the superior, while keeping to himself what he learns in secret, may be better able to organize and arrange what is expedient for the whole body of the Society.’ (GE 92⁶)

The Superior is informed that the *MoC* places overwhelming emphasis on the good of the individual without denying the end of the Society. Of the five reasons justifying the *MoC*, four of them are concerned with the good of the person. After repeatedly emphasizing the good of the candidate, the first part of the third point and the last point (GE 92⁶) speak of the *MoC* in the context of the Society’s mission.²⁰⁵

The superior is informed about the Society’s overwhelming concern for the well-being of the candidate by a plethora of words such as ‘direct’, ‘govern’, ‘care’, ‘guide’ (GE 91²); ‘diligence’, ‘love’, ‘care’, ‘help’, ‘guard’ (GE 92¹) and phrases such as ‘sending some and not other’ (GE 92⁵); ‘direct them better’ and ‘without placing them ...in dangers’ (GE 92⁵]. The importance of confidentiality can be seen in the instruction to ‘keep to himself (the Superior) what he learns in secret’ (GE 92⁶). In developing this point, Ignatius re-states the apostolic charism of the Society. He also highlights obedience and availability to the Roman Pontiff for missions entrusted to the Society as essential characteristics of the Jesuit charism. (GE 92²)

9.3.2.1.2 *Instructions for the candidate*

In elaborating the method to be followed, this number explains at length the attitude and procedure for the candidate. An important and distinguishing element is that the *MoC*

²⁰⁵ Both these points were added in the text of 1556 – i.e. text B

was an obligation for the candidate. (*GE 93¹*) However the approach that was suggested was not one of emphasizing the obligatory nature of this instrument or threaten the candidate with sanctions, but one of creating an ambience of trust, care, fraternal love and commitment to the mission so that the candidate enters into the spiritual dynamic of the *MoC* as evidenced in the instruction to the Superior.

Given the fact that the candidate is invited to empty himself of that which is most intimate to him, this number starts off by stressing the confidentiality of the exercise. It then goes on to highlight the attitude of humility, transparency and charity which ought to characterize this dialogue and proceeds to elaborate the manner of manifesting one's conscience to the superior. The first part of this number deals with the 'when' and 'how' of the *MoC*. The text reads as follows:

Before he (the candidate) enters the first probation or after entering it, ...or some months later, ...in secret or in another manner which may be more pleasing or spiritually consoling to him, (he) must manifest his conscience with great humility, transparency and charity, without concealing anything which is offensive to the Lord of all men. (*GE 93¹⁻²*)

The second part of this number offers details about the 'what', 'who' and 'why' of the *MoC*. These details can be explained by the use of a table:

What	...an account of his whole past life, or at least of the more essential matters' (<i>GE 93³</i>) and this include both 'the interior as well as exterior affairs. (<i>GE 91¹</i>)
Who	...give it is given to 'the superior of the Society, or to the one whom he assigns to the candidate from among the superiors or subjects, according to what he thinks best.' (<i>GE 93³</i>)
Why	...so that everything may be provided for better in the Lord, to the greater spiritual help of each one with the more copious grace of God for the greater glory of his divine Goodness. (<i>GE 93⁴</i>)

This number is focused on the candidate and informs him about the basic questions related to the *MoC*. Given the sensitive nature of this instrument and its role in helping the candidate in the final phase of emptying himself, it was bound to raise serious questions. Three questions which have been reflected upon time and again and will be elaborated in the next point include: a) The *MoC's* obligatory nature; b) the interchangeability of confession and *MoC* and c) its confidentiality clause.

9.3.2.1.3 *Frequency of the MoC*

After mentioning the first time of making the *MoC* in no. 93, numbers [94-97] go on to indicate the frequency with which this spiritual exercise ought to be conducted. Though it says that it should be done until the '*professed make their profession and those who hope to be formed coadjutors take their vows,*' (GE 94²) the present practice indicates that despite the final vows of a person, he continues to make it every year. Numbers 95 & 96 stipulate the frequency of making the *MoC* at six months until final profession with each *MoC* beginning from where the person had left off last time. Some variations are indicated for scholastics, formed coadjutors and professed in nos. 96 & 97.

The frequency of the *MoC* is significant because it helps the superior to have an actualized understanding of the subject. At the same time, it obliges an individual to constantly review his life and works as an antidote against getting into a routinized way of life. The instrument of the *MoC* helps both the superior and more importantly the subject to constantly grow in discernment and devotion. As far as the text is concerned, we find that Ignatius repeats more or less the same point for candidates, scholastics, professed and formed coadjutors.²⁰⁶ The common factor in these groups is that they are invited to make the *MoC* by beginning from the last time it was made by them. Despite the danger of being repetitive, the details regarding the *MoC* have been placed here because of its importance in the spiritual dynamics of the individual and the Society in terms of being faithful to the will of God.

9.3.2.1.4 *Vows – Preparation and prerequisites [98] & [100]*

After speaking about the *MoC*, the candidate is informed of a moment which is important in a person's self-emptying process. This is the act of making a definitive commitment (GE 94¹) by making 'his oblations and vows.' (GE 98¹³) The influence of the *SpEx* is evident in this text and this can be seen in the technique of repetition and the

²⁰⁶ This decision to allow the repetition of the *MoC* at this stage could seem odd because other repetitions were taken care in text A. (Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. "La composición...", p. 232.)

presence of words which frequently appear in the *SpEx*.²⁰⁷

The setting is one of humility and at the onset the candidate is reminded that he should proceed further only if he *'thinks that God our Lord gives him courage and strength in regard to all that has been said, and (only if he) judges his incorporation in to the Society to be conducive to the greater divine glory and more salutary for his own conscience'* (GE 98¹) should he to proceed further. There is a humble acknowledgement that the enterprise of living one's vocation as a Jesuit is primarily by the courage and strength of God our Lord.

In the context of this attitude the *GE* goes on to speak about the two important pre-requisites related to the vows and these include – regular confession and repeated reading of the Society's foundational documents. The importance of these two pre-requisites is underlined by the use of the word 'ought'. Ignatius says that one *'ought to see the bulls and Constitutions and all the rest which pertain to the Society's Institute, in the beginning and afterwards every six months.'* (GE 98²) He also *'ought to make a general confession of his whole past life to a priest... because of the many benefits which this entails.'* (GE 98³) The purpose of these practices is in order to *'procure a continuous increase of integrity and virtues and intense desire in our Lord to give great service in this Society to his Divine Majesty.'* (GE 98⁷)

The second part of no. 98 indicates to us the essential virtues of obedience and humility as fundamental in a candidate who after two years of probation desires to make his vows.

When he has completed the two years of probation, and shown himself always *obedient* and edifying in his association with others and in various tests, and has with great *humility* performed the penances which will be imposed on him for his errors and negligences or defects... (GE 98⁸⁻⁹)

Before making the vows, the candidate is invited to enter into a period of

²⁰⁷ The candidate is invited to repeatedly read the Society's foundational documents and at the same time frequent the sacrament of confession. The Christology is one of the second week and the perspective of Christ as He appears in the meditation of the Eternal King and the Two Standards is prominent. This is confirmed through the use of phrases such as 'God our Lord' (GE 98¹), 'Christ our Lord' (GE 98⁵) and 'Divine Majesty.' (GE 98⁷)

proximate preparation where he re-reads the foundational texts and *'recollects himself for a period of one week in order to make the confession better and to confirm himself in his first determination (and) ...make some Exercises.'* (GE 98¹¹) After this *'he will make his oblation and vows.'* (GE 98¹³) The spiritual tone whereby the word 'oblation' is used interchangeably with the word 'vows' reveals that this is a peak moment. It is not merely a technical or juridical necessity for a person to belong to a religious order, but embodies the spiritual attitude expected of a candidate wherein he is so inflamed with the love of God that he willingly and totally empties himself.

9.3.2.1.5 Stability and Perseverance

The point related to stability was important for religious orders all through the history of religious life. Within the Society, this was equally important and hence the GE recommends that after a person has *'taken the aforementioned vows... they may not transfer to other religious institutes.'* (GE 99¹) This point was highlighted as an impediment in the second chapter of the GE. (GE 27). However the Superior General could permit persons from other religious institutes. (GE 99¹)

The point related to perseverance was important for Ignatius and hence the GE makes three reference to the point of persevering in the Society to the very end. (GE 51¹; GE 94¹; GE 119⁴) The Society respects the freedom of the candidate but has the final word regarding admittance into the Society. Hence the text instructs that in the case of *'doubt on the part of the Society about his talent or conduct'* it would be better to wait for a year more. It was necessary to wait *'until both parties were content and satisfied in the Lord'* (GE 100²) so that the final decision was taken in an atmosphere of mutual respect between the Society and the candidate.

9.3.2.2 Interpretation of the Text

The GE provides us the most detailed explanation of the MoC and at times it seems that the GE and MoC could be interchanged or that the entire GE could be considered as an

extended form of the *MoC*.²⁰⁸ It is strategically placed as a conclusion to the proposed process of self-emptying and is a prelude to the profound spiritual text of nos. [101-103]. In further interpreting this text we shall divide it into three broad categories – the goal, the spirit and legislations regarding the *MoC*.

9.3.2.2.1 *The Goal*

The goal of the *MoC* is apostolic.²⁰⁹ It is intimately related to the universal mission of the Society and spirit of availability within each Jesuit for any apostolic mission entrusted to him.²¹⁰ Within this apostolic goal we repeatedly find the double end which consists in the spiritual progress of the person and at the same time furthering the apostolic end. Kolvenbach's letter clearly defines the one apostolic end of the *MoC* with its twin dimensions when he says that:

Clearly the account of conscience has nothing in common with an interview in which an executive makes a management report to his director. Nor is it to be identified with the conversation that takes place between a Jesuit and his spiritual director. Given that the Society's vocation is apostolic, both the Jesuit's progress in his personal spiritual development as well as the appropriateness of his choice of apostolic involvement and his enthusiasm for it, depend inseparably on the account of conscience made to the one who has the authority to send him on mission.²¹¹

9.3.2.2.2 *The Spirit*

The right spirit of the *MoC* is fundamental in order to ensure the successful achievement of the above mentioned goal. This requires that both the Superior and the subject ought to understand the common goal and apply themselves wholeheartedly in this enterprise. The subject ought to understand that the *MoC* envelopes the entire person and there is

²⁰⁸ '...entre el Examen y la cuanta de conciencia existe una línea fronteriza difuminada y difícil de precisar y algunas veces se entiende el Examen como sinónimo de cuenta de conciencia.' He quotes Suarez who goes further to state that the entire GE could be considered to be a *MoC*. 'En el Examen se manifiesta todo el historial íntimo de la propia vida...' (Cf. *LADC*, pp. 264-67.)

²⁰⁹ 'The Jesuit's freely-offered openness has only one objective: that his mission be entrusted to him, or confirmed or changed considering his qualities and his limitations, his spiritual and human resources, so that he may put them into action in service of the mission of Christ, which is still being accomplished in his Society here and now..' KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. "The Account of Conscience", *Acta Romana* – Vol. XXIII, 2005, p. 558. In future we shall refer to this as KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. "Conscience".

²¹⁰ Cf. SANCHEZ-GIRÓN, JOSÉ LUIS. "Cuenta de Conciencia", *DEI...*, p. 522.

²¹¹ KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. "Conscience" ..., p. 512.

no aspect of a person's life which is outside this ambit.²¹² The superior also ought to keep in mind that the spirit of the Society recommends a form of governance which is primarily spiritual. He too in a spirit of discernment seeks to fulfill the will of God and in this endeavor, the *MoC* of the subject is indispensable.²¹³ However the Superior ought to keep in mind that though he helps the subject as spiritual director, his primary task is to know the will of God and fulfill as best possible by taking the right decision in order to fulfill the two dimension of the one apostolic end.²¹⁴

The spirit of the *MoC* requires the presence of three fundamental elements which include humility, purity and charity. Kolvenbach underlines their significance and explains their order of importance by saying that:

Humility first of all, because the manifestation should be based in the truth, in all the humble and humbling truth of a Jesuit's life, called to a self-giving of greater value (*SpEx*, 97) but rightly "looked upon as an unworthy knight" (*SpEx*, 94). For to be a Jesuit "is to know oneself to be a sinner, but called to be a companion of Jesus as Ignatius was" (GC 32, 11).

... secondly, transparency, so that the other, "one in our midst", might have "complete understanding" (Co 92), thanks to this revelation, in such a manner that nothing of the inward or outward aspects of the person remains hidden from him (Co 551).

...the manifestation, as the Constitutions and Complementary Norms put it, "inspired by charity" (CN 155 §1), unfolds in a climate of self-surrender and pardon, in a generous search for the will of Him who is the Master of the vineyard. "The more the account of conscience is genuinely practised, the more authentic will our discernment be of God's purpose in our regard and the more perfect that union of minds and hearts from which our apostolate derives its dynamism" (GC 32, 232). In an atmosphere of charity, it is completely Ignatian that one would not be satisfied with talking about his spiritual and physical state of health, nor about how his apostolate is going nor indeed about the degree

²¹² IBID., p. 508. '...A pesar del nombre 'cuenta de conciencia', la manifestación no se limita a nuestra conciencia, sino que engloba toda nuestra personalidad, en su relación con Dios y los designios que Él tiene sobre nosotros, en la relación con nosotros mismos y con todos aquellos y aquellas que el Señor pone en nuestro camino, en nuestras comunidades y familias, en nuestras responsabilidades apostólicas y nuestros encuentros.'

²¹³ Cf. SANCHEZ-GIRON, JOSE LUIS. "Cuenta de Conciencia", *DEI...*, p. 522.

²¹⁴ IBID., p. 523. 'En todo lo que haga a partir del conocimiento adquirido por medio de esta práctica, el Superior ha de actuar buscando el bien de los jesuitas "mirando por ellos" [Co 91] y el de la Compañía: "lo que conviene al cuerpo universal" [Co 92]. En último término, ambos fines vendrían a identificarse con buscar la voluntad de Dios, que sólo puede estar en algo que responda a uno y otro bien.' Sanchez-Girón while elaborating the spiritual character of the *MoC* points out that though the Superior's functions may overlap with that of the spiritual director, he is not one in the strict sense. He has to takes decisions – a task outside the preview of the spiritual director.

of happiness he finds in his vocation, but urged by the love of Christ he would reveal especially, "what he desires" (Ex. 139), so as to make greater progress in the mission given, to render a greater apostolic service.²¹⁵

The spirit of confidence ought to permeate the process of dialogue for the *MoC* to be fruitful. The obligatory character of this exercise makes it essential that there exists a right degree of confidence between the Superior and subject. Confidence as such cannot be manufactured, but is a reality which the Superior ought to inspire. He does so by having an attitude of acceptance and manifesting a genuine desire to help. Such an attitude helps in making this exercise a dialogue and not a monologue. The Superior and subject are not expected to aim to come to an agreement, but through sincere dialogue and mutual trust are expected to find the will of God.²¹⁶

Closely linked to the spirit of confidence is the issue of confidentiality and obedience. After GC 34, the *MoC* can no longer be a substitute for confession and the two are considered separate spiritual instruments. The matters divulged during the *MoC* cannot be spoken without the express consent of the subject.²¹⁷ The *MoC* is also closely linked to obedience with the Superior being present in the place of Christ. This part of the *GE* reveals to the Jesuits the mysticism of obedience where obedience is not merely a show of will-power or voluntarism, but is understood as a spiritual experience and is the outcome of a combined process of discernment.²¹⁸

9.3.2.2.3 *Some official clarifications*

The obligatory nature of the *MoC* was a novelty in religious life. Many other religious orders accepted this practice into their way of life. However with the passage of time there emerged complaints that this instrument which was primarily a spiritual exercise

²¹⁵ KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. "Conscience...", p. 509. The same is said by Goiri, but in a different order where he places the three in a different order – charity, humility and purity of intention. *'La primera condición que conviene destacar tocante al modo de dar la cuenta de conciencia es la caridad. La caridad, tanto por parte del que rinde la cuenta, como por la del que la recibe, debe inspirar, siempre, y acompañar a una práctica, cuya finalidad exclusiva no es otra que el mayor provecho espiritual de las almas... A la caridad, que es el alma de toda apertura, han de acompañar otras virtudes, como la humildad y pureza de intención...'* (LADC, p. 286.)

²¹⁶ Cf. SANCHEZ-GIRÓN, JOSÉ LUIS. "Cuenta de Conciencia", *DEI...*, pp. 524-25.

²¹⁷ Cf. KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. "Conscience...", p. 510.

²¹⁸ Cf. SANCHEZ-GIRON, JOSE LUIS. "Cuenta de Conciencia", *DEI...*, pp. 525-26.

was being abused for the wrong ends.²¹⁹ Due to this the CIC of 1917 gave instructions that the subjects were not to be induced or obliged to make the *MoC*. Considering this normative, the Society in 1918 adapted itself to the CIC and the *MoC* was no longer obligatory. However in 1923, Pope Pius XI confirmed the practice as established in the Constitutions and re-established the practice of the *MoC*. This privilege continues to be in force despite the new CIC of 1983.²²⁰

The GCs over the centuries have deliberated on the *MoC* and the last few GCs have strongly emphasized the spiritual character of this exercise. The fourth and fifth GC's asked for greater clarity and a fixed method for all provinces. [GC 4 – D.40; GC 5 – D.58] The confidentiality of the *MoC* was strongly affirmed in the 12th GC which stated that matters of the *MoC* could not be revealed even to the General. [GC 12 – D.15] The 22nd GC stressed the importance of the *MoC* on both the superior and the subject. [GC 22 – D.44/4] The 27th GC offered some significant points related to the understanding of the *MoC* by placing it among the substantials of second rank in the Collated Decrees. [GC 27 – CD:D.13/2/3] The 58th decree stresses that the *MoC* should be observed out of 'purest charity' and the relationship should be fraternal, as 'between a father and son.' [GC 27 – CD:D.58]

During the last few GCs the spiritual dimension has been stressed. Its relationship with discernment, mission and obedience has been underlined and the superior and subject are invited to enter into this process with a spirit of humility, fraternal love and trust. The 31st GC reiterated the importance of the *MoC* and emphasized that it ought to be characterized by a spirit of fraternal love and inspired by genuine charity. This number provides a profound summary of what is understood by the *MoC* within the Society's way of proceeding.

This truly spiritual government, whereby Jesuits are directed by superiors with discerning love rather than through external laws, supposes communication between the two which

²¹⁹ SANCHEZ-GIRÓN, JOSÉ LUIS. "Cuenta de Conciencia", *DEI...*, p. 527. '*Con el tiempo se dieron numerosas objeciones por abusos que se cometían: violación del secreto, manipulaciones de la conciencia, mala dirección espiritual por parte de Superiores poco preparados, etc.*'

²²⁰ *IBID.*, pp. 527-28.

is as far as possible plain and open. The superior should endeavor to make his mind clearly known to his confreres and understood by them; and he should take care that they, according to the nature and importance of the matter and as their own talents and duties require, share more fully in his knowledge and concern both for the personal and community life of Jesuits and for their apostolic labors. The religious, for his part, should try to make himself known, with his gifts and limitations, his desires, difficulties, and ideas, through a confiding, familiar and candid colloquy, about which the superior is held to strict secrecy.

In this way an account of conscience is obtained which is sincere and open in form, and not reduced to a formal, periodic inquiry about actions already performed. That kind of friendly and confidential conversation, one that is frankly spiritual and aims at promoting the apostolic objective of our vocation and the religious sanctification of the apostle, will constitute the dialogue that is fundamental and essential for the wholesome progress of our Society. Hence it is the mind of the Congregation that the account of conscience in its proper sense should remain and be strengthened as a general practice. But it is charity which should inspire it, as St. Ignatius wished, with any obligation under pain of sin always precluded. [GC 31 – D.17/8]

The 32nd GC consistently repeated the importance of understanding the *MoC* as part of the Society's governance which ought to be primarily spiritual in nature. The *MoC* is presented in the context of a process of discernment and the *MoC* by the subject helps the Superior in being able to discern better. [GC 32 – D.4/67] The importance of spiritual governance, its importance for mission, the esteem it is held by the Society and the need to cultivate this practice is emphasized in the 11th decree. [GC 32 – D.11/30,46] The 35th GC reiterated the importance by highlighting the letter by the Superior General in 2005 and spoke of its importance in the context of obedience and mission. [GC 35 – D.4/43]

The Complementary Norms approved during the 34th GC helps us better understand the *MoC*. We have referred to them while explaining the different portions of the text. With this section by the observations of various GCs we come to the end of the part which dealt with the text and its understanding. We have tried to highlight the importance of this spiritual instrument and its relevance in helping a person empty himself in order to be more available for the mission entrusted to him by the Eternal King. This progressive emptying of one's entire self in the *MoC* prepares the ground for a new form of existence whereby a life which was characterized by self-love is

progressively transformed into an existence wherein the person desires to lovingly empty himself totally for the other.

9.3.3 THE MANIFESTATION OF CONSCIENCE IN THE LIFE OF IGNATIUS

Given the fact that the *MoC* was expected to be confidential, Ignatius does not speak about it frequently. However he does refer to his experience of giving an account of his conscience in the *Autobiography*. Though it would not be as outlined in the *GE*, the general contours are the same. In elaborating this section we shall offer a summary of the same theme which has been explained in detail by Goiri.²²¹ At the end of this summary we shall offer a few comments on the *MoC* as explained in other parts of the Constitutions.

The official declaration by the 34th GC that the *MoC* and confession are distinct is a long way off from Ignatius' understanding on the matter. In the initial stages we find that the *MoC* and confessions would be used interchangeably. The commonality between the two related to their spiritual benefit and the maintenance of secrecy regarding what was divulged by the subject/penitent. In examining Ignatius' personal experience in manifesting his conscience in the form of a confession or otherwise we shall focus on three different periods of his life. The first relates to his life until the spiritual experience of Manresa. The second relates to his student years and finally the third period refers to his life in Rome as founder and General of the Society of Jesus.

9.3.3.1 The Initial period after Ignatius' conversion

The importance of being open to a confessor or a spiritual guide was known to Ignatius through his readings of the *Vita Christi* and the *Flos Sanctorum*.²²² However it would be a good eight months²²³ before he would speak about the new desires within his heart to a

²²¹ Goiri, Santiago has an extensive section of 88 pages in his book which is titled 'La Apertura de Conciencia en San Ignacio de Loyola.' (Cf. *LADC*, pp. 21-109.)

²²² Cf. *LADC*, pp. 27-34.

²²³ Cf. LUTURIA, PEDRO. *El Gentilhombre...*, p. 236. 'Teniendo presentes estas lecturas y la dirección posterior del mismo Ignacio, puede extrañar la absoluta reserva en que mantuvo durante ocho meses las radicales transformaciones que Dios había venido obrando en su alma...'

confessor. He was silent about what went on within and did not speak about it anyone.²²⁴ Not only did he maintain secrecy regarding his plans, he continued to take decisions according to his old method of doing what he considered best without consulting others.²²⁵ Three possible reasons for Ignatius' secrecy regarding his visit to Montserrat were as follows: a) the absence of diverse spiritual movements as experienced later; b) the desire to go to a place where he would be unknown; c) the desire to meet a learned and wise confessor.²²⁶

The sojourn at Manresa was an important period in Ignatius' growing understanding of the *MoC* as an effective spiritual instrument. The first person to whom Ignatius revealed the intimate matters of his heart was Dom Juan Chanones, a monk at Montserrat who was renowned for his virtue and wisdom. This was the first time Ignatius emptied himself of his most intimate self and it would take place at the commencement of the most intense period of his entire life. The general confession which took place according to the tradition prevalent among pilgrims would be a turning point in Ignatius' spiritual itinerary.

...San Ignacio no se limitó a hacer confesión general de toda su vida, sino que aprovechó la ocasión para hacer, lo quedaríamos hoy, una total apertura de conciencia. Han transcurrido ocho meses desde su conversión y el Santo de Loyola ha sabido guardar su secreto con aquella tenacidad y habilidad, características suyas, que veremos acompañar siempre a su carácter y que constituirán el sello y distintivo de todas sus empresas. No se había abierto a ningún sacerdote de su tierra, no se había confiado ni a su mismo hermano y ahora lo hace a un extranjero.²²⁷

²²⁴ The *Autobiography* states that he did not mention this matter to his brother: 'he did not dare to claim it nor said more than to affirm the above...' (Au 10⁴) and left the house to embark on a new journey. '...he answered in such a way that, without departing from the truth, for he was now very scrupulous about that, he slipped away from his brother.' (Au 12⁸)

²²⁵ He did not speak to anyone about his decision to leave his house or his plans to join the Carthusians. (Au 12¹⁻³) Neither did he consult any person regarding his decision to go to Montserrat, (Au 13⁶) to put on the robes of a pilgrim (Au 16⁴⁻⁵; 17³; 18¹) or away his sword and mule. (Au 17⁵) At Montserrat he decided to reveal his thoughts and desires to the confessor. This manifestation of his conscience was not in order to discern, but merely to inform him about his decision. 'He arranged with the confessor to have his mule taken in charge, and his sword and dagger placed in the Church at the altar of Our Lady. This was the first man to whom he revealed his decision, because until then he had not revealed it to any confessor.' (Au 17⁵⁻⁶). LADC, p. 43. 'El Santo, que ha premeditado en Loyola su viaje de peregrine, es fiel al itinerario y programa trazados, y cuando surge algún imprevisto, soluciona el problema según sus luces y sin pedir consejo.'

²²⁶ Cf. LUTURIA, PEDRO. *El Gentilhombre...*, pp. 236-37.

²²⁷ LADC, p. 45.

There are enough reasons to believe that this confession with Dom Chanones was the beginning of a rather prolonged spiritual relation where Ignatius frequently opened his heart to the holy monk and at the same time was instructed in the art of methodical prayer according to the book by Abbot Cisneros.²²⁸ In the first phase of Ignatius' stay in Manresa we can see that the *MoC* was becoming a periodic exercise and the issues were primarily related to his life of prayer and mortification.²²⁹ This period was characterized by a general impression that Ignatius was a living saint who had made great sacrifices and engaged in great penances. (*Au 18⁸; 19¹⁻³*) The *MoC* was not yet an exercise in humility and discernment. During the next phase he would humbly learn to use the *MoC* as a spiritual instrument in order to discern the will of God in the midst of confusing, painful and frustrating experiences.

9.3.3.2 The second and third phase at Manresa

The second phase was more complex with Ignatius who 'persevered steadily in his usual confession and communion each Sunday' (*Au 21⁹*) began to 'look for some spiritual men who would cure him of his scruples.' (*Au 22⁴*) The experience of dealing with scruples, like the general confession was another important moment in Ignatius' spiritual itinerary vis-à-vis the *MoC*.²³⁰ Unlike the earlier occasion when his *MoC* to the confessor was to inform him about his decisions, he now looked for someone who would be able to help him overcome his spiritual travails.²³¹

²²⁸ The influence of the *Ejercitatorio* is very strong in the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius and it would be naive to believe that Ignatius mastered the *Ejercitatorio* all by himself. Goiri quotes Leturia, Calveras and other authors in order to show with authority that the obscure days of Ignatius' stay in Manresa can plausibly be explained by suggesting that during this period he visited his confessor Dom Channon who gave and taught Ignatius the art of spiritual exercises as contained in the *Ejercitatorio*. (*LADC*, pp. 50-53.)

²²⁹ *LADC*, pp. 56-58. '*Tenemos, pues, con toda probabilidad, que el peregrino, desde los primeros meses de Manresa, daba cuenta de conciencia a su confesor muy menudamente. ¿Cuál era el objeto o materia de apertura del que daba cuenta a su confesor tan detalladamente San Ignacio? De todo lo que hacía, es decir, de su vida de oración y mortificación, que era todo cuanto hacía por los meses de Manresa... Queremos también observar que desde el establecimiento de San Ignacio en Manresa aparece, por vez primera, la apertura de conciencia llevada de una forma periódica.*'

²³⁰ *LADC*, p. 59. '*...Después del momento definitivo en que San Ignacio abrió de par en par por vez primera, las puertas de su alma a su confesor benedictino de Montserrat, difícilmente se puede encontrar otro tiempo más importante para el estudio de la manifestación de conciencia en la vida de San Ignacio que ésta de las tentaciones y escrúpulos de Manresa.*'

²³¹ We know for certain that Ignatius had other confessors and spoke to spiritual persons during this time. These

The important aspect of Ignatius' experience was that the confessors and spiritual persons were not able to help Ignatius resolve the fundamental problem with his scruples. The situation was resolved when he had grown in the ability to discern spirits and he 'decided with great lucidity not to confess anything from the past anymore; and so from that day forward he remained free of those scruples and held it for certain that Our Lord had mercifully deigned to deliver him.' (*Au 25⁷⁻⁸*)

Ignatius' manner of having his difficulty resolved through a direct experience of God presents to us a question about the utility of the *MoC*. The experience revealed the limitation of the directors because they had failed to help him. This failure was evident in his cry for help to the Lord when he said, "Help me, Lord, for I find no remedy in men nor in any creature." (*Au 23⁶*) Not only had they not helped him in his difficulty, but they had given him advice which was incorrect as in the case of eating meat.²³²

In analyzing this situation Goiri faults the directors because they could not help Ignatius be totally open in the *MoC*.²³³ Without getting into the analysis of finding where the fault lay, we can only say that the entire episode is a humble recognition of the limitations of any human instrument. While recognizing the human person as part of this spiritual instrument was necessary as was evident in other crucial moments, (*Au 23¹; 25³*) we would like to reaffirm that ultimately a person is illumined and empowered when in all humility he places his trust in God. In the process of Ignatius' enlightenment the *MoC* was an indispensable tool, but the defining factor was the gratuitous grace of God which was directly given to him.

included persons with whom he occasionally conversed (*Au 21⁴*), a doctor at the cathedral (*Au 22⁵*) and his confessor. (*Au 21⁹; 23¹; 25³*) The confessor was probably Fr. Guillermo Pellarós and the doctor at the cathedral was probably the canon Juan Boutabi. (*LADC*, p. 60.)

²³² '... on reporting this to his confessor, the confessor told him to consider whether perhaps this was a temptation; but examining it carefully, never could he doubt about it.' (*Au 27¹⁻³*)

²³³ *LADC*, p. 65. '...La culpa de una apertura incompleta y hasta, a veces, de una 'inapertura', no podemos ponerla en el dirigido, sino en la incompetencia de los directores. El Santo buscó a quién abrirse, pero no encontró quién le entendiera... ¿Qué se había hecho de Chanones? ¿Dónde estaba el doctor muy espiritual de la Seo? Ya hemos visto cómo fracasaron. En ellos no podía encontrar el director que necesitaba el Santo y, por eso, tampoco pudo mostrarles todas las recámaras de su alma.'

The final period at Manresa was not different from the preceding periods.²³⁴ However the experience did not make him cynical regarding the spiritual guides or make him proud about being directly guided by God. It only made him more convinced of the need choosing a spiritual director carefully – one who was prudent and well prepared.²³⁵ The experience at Manresa taught him that though a wise director or confessor was necessary in order to spiritually benefit from the *MoC*; growth in spiritual life was primarily a grace and gift. God in God's loving mercy had taught him this fundamental truth as a schoolmaster teacher a student. (*Au 27⁴⁻⁵*)

9.3.3.3 The Student Years of Ignatius

The initial stage of *MoC* in Ignatius' life was related to informing his confessor about his decisions. However in Manresa, it was also related to asking the confessor or spiritual guide for advice. During the period of his studies in Barcelona or Paris he would also use this spiritual instrument in order to overcome the temptation of spiritual thoughts which took him away from his studies. (*Au 55¹⁻⁵; 82-³⁵*)²³⁶ Alcalá would be another important point in his life when he went from being considered 'a man of God to an apostle of persons'.²³⁷ Ignatius was not only manifesting his conscience to others, but

²³⁴ LADC, p. 68. Ignatius looked out for spiritual persons before leaving for Jerusalem, but found none. In the *Autobiography* he says that: 'While he was still in Barcelona before embarking, he sought out, as was his practice, all spiritual persons, even though they lived in hermitages far from the city, to converse with them. But neither in Barcelona nor in Manresa during the whole time he was there did he find persons who could help him as much as he wished...' (*Au 37²⁻³*)

²³⁵ LADC, p. 69. 'San Ignacio tiene el gran mérito de confirmarse en la idea de la necesidad de un director, a pesar del poco fruto que iba sacando de los suyos de Manresa. Quizá las luces de Cardoner, o talvez el mismo fracaso de sus directores, o ambas cosas a la vez, le convencieron de la absoluta necesidad de un director prudente y bien formado.' After leaving Barcelona, Ignatius was no longer interested in looking for spiritual persons. (*Au 37⁵*) However a certain woman (*Au 37⁴*) and some others did make an impact on him. The fact that Ignatius found a spiritual director who was prudent and well prepared can in his admission that on the advice of his confessor he decided to beg for biscuits. (*Au 36⁵*) We also know that on his return from Jerusalem to Barcelona he went looking for a friar from the order of St. Bernard who was a 'very spiritual man.' (*Au 54³*)

²³⁶ LADC, p. 78. 'Siempre que el Santo se abrió, anteriormente, lo hizo para pedir consejo o dirección. Ahora abre las puertas de su alma, para vencer una tentación.'

²³⁷ LADC, p. 79. 'El discípulo se convierte en maestro, el dirigido en director, y el que hasta entonces hacía la apertura de conciencia a los demás, en el que la recibe de los otros. Cardoner le había convertido totalmente en el hombre de Dios, pero no, del todo, en el apóstol de los hombres. Es en Alcalá donde su vida adquiere un carácter totalmente apostólico.'

was the passive receptor of the manifestation of conscience made by others to him.²³⁸

During this period we find an important growth in Ignatius' understanding of the *MoC* from the ecclesial point of view. Considering the fact that Ignatius' enlightenment took place through a direct experience of God, he continued to remain humble and did not consider his experience as the norm for knowing the will of God. Despite his disagreement with the authorities of the Church on various occasions, he believed that the Church was the final criteria for discernment.

El criterio supremo y último de conocimiento de la voluntad divina no lo coloca San Ignacio ni en el discernimiento, por propia cuenta de los espíritus, ni en la seguridad subjetiva de los más perfectos, sino simplemente en la declaración autorizada del superior.²³⁹

The same attitude would be seen in Ignatius towards ecclesial authorities during the inquiry at Alcalá, Salamanca and Paris. During his stay in Alcala he was in contact with two priests – Diego de Eguía and Miguel Miona. Both of them became confessors of Ignatius at a later stage.²⁴⁰ However this was a period when he was unable to easily get spiritual persons to whom he could open his heart.²⁴¹ His ability to be open to ecclesial authorities was a dynamic process as can be seen in the different ways of dealing with authorities in different places. In Alcala and Salamanca he was a rather reticent spiritual guide who was guarded and at times brusque in his response to Church authorities. However in Paris he was more forthcoming and took the initiative to approach the inquisitorial authorities on learning of a complaint against him. (*Au 86²⁻⁶*)

Ignatius engaged in manifesting his conscience using various methods and to a variety of persons. These could include a confessor, a spiritual director, the ecclesiastical authority, a superior or a counsellor. Ignatius did not restrict himself to any person and was willing to open himself to anyone who offered the required confidence and manifested the expected expertise.

²³⁸ *LADC*, p. 81.

²³⁹ *LADC*, p. 76.

²⁴⁰ *LADC*, p. 83.

²⁴¹ *LADC*, p. 87.

Toda manifestación de conciencia en sentido estricto suele ser hecha o al superior, o al confesor, o al director espiritual, o a un consejero. Hemos estudiado hasta aquí el fenómeno de la apertura de San Ignacio, sin poner empeño en precisar la condición del sujeto que la recibía; una veces, era un superior, otras su confesor y otras un simple consejero. El concepto de *director espiritual* no estaba entonces bien delimitado; confundíase muchas veces con el confesor y otras con el mismo superior. Estaba en uso el término de *padre espiritual*. Con el término de *padre espiritual* solía designarse a toda persona con alguna autoridad moral que ejerciera algún influjo espiritual sobre el alma. Como se ve, el concepto era bastante genérico.²⁴²

Just as Ignatius learnt to discern spirits through his personal experience beginning in Loyola, similarly he learnt to recognize good spiritual persons with the passage of time. Despite having advanced in spiritual life in order to reach high levels of mysticism, he continued to regularly open up his conscience to persons whom he could trust. This was in order to be more faithful to the will of God in the varied responsibilities he held.

As he progressed in life he was an active subject who manifested his conscience to others and at the same time was a passive subject where he received the manifestation of conscience of others. Let us now look at the last phase of his life where the *MoC* as explained in the *GE* was more well-defined and how Ignatius fulfilled the twin roles of being an active as well as passive subject with regard to the spiritual instrument called *MoC*.

9.3.3.4 The final years at Rome as General of the Society

The final years consisted in a period of various activities of importance to the nascent Society. However in the midst of this, Ignatius was concerned about the *MoC* both as a passive as well as an active subject. Very little is known about the passive dimension because of the secrecy involved with this matter. However Goiri gives us three examples where he shows us Ignatius' desire to know about both the internal and external matters that pertained to his subjects.²⁴³ Much more is said about Ignatius' perspective of the

²⁴² *LADC*, pp. 85-86.

²⁴³ The first relates to a letter written to Araoz and concerns his appointment as the teacher of the prince – a matter about which Ignatius was not informed. Ignatius (through Polanco) expresses his view that he would like to be informed about everything. The second relates to Câmara's remark that Ignatius desired to know all that happened to

passive dimension in the later part of the book where he elaborates the role of the director in the Spiritual Exercises and the Superior in the Constitutions.

As far being an active subject during his role as General, there are no clear indications. Ignatius seemed to have a confessor as well as some spiritual director.²⁴⁴ The role of his confessor, Fr. Theodosio, a Franciscan friar of Santo Pedro de Montorio is evident during the election of Ignatius as General of the Society.²⁴⁵ In all humility he manifested his faults and sins of the past in the hope that it would dissuade them from electing him as General.²⁴⁶ This humility continued to be evident as Ignatius manifested his sins and failings on various other occasions – but always with the purpose of doing good to others.²⁴⁷ A clear example of this would be the very narration of the *Autobiography* which (according to the preface of Câmara) was in order to help him in his struggle with vainglory.

In the year '53, one Friday morning, the fourth of August, ...I (Câmara) began to give him an account of some particulars concerning my soul. Among other things I spoke to him of vainglory. ... the Father told me how much he had been bothered by this vice for two years, so much so that when he embarked from Barcelona for Jerusalem, he did not dare tell anyone that he was going to Jerusalem; and so in other similar instances. And he went on to say how much peace of soul he then felt in this regard. ... (Later) in September the

the Jesuits in distant lands such as India – even the number of bugs that bit them. The third remark refers to the effect on Ignatius when he knew of the faults and failings of his subjects and his affection and concern for such persons. (Cf. *LADC*, p. 93.)

²⁴⁴ It is probable that D. Diego de Eguia was his confessor and considering that he had exaggeratedly praised Ignatius, he was asked to ask pardon publicly. Further on a note explains that Ignatius only spoke about his sins to his confessor thus giving greater credence to the fact that Ignatius spoke about the graces to a spiritual director. Goiri goes on to comment about the note by saying: '*Otra conclusion del ultimo texto es que San Ignacio separaba la dirección de la confesión; y la manifestación de los problemas del alma con miras a la dirección, de la manifestación de los pecados con miras al perdón.*' (Cf. *LADC*, pp. 97-98.)

²⁴⁵ Cf. RIBADENEYRA, PEDRO DE. *Vida de Ignacio...*, pp. 110-11.

²⁴⁶ Cf. LETURIA, PEDRO. *El Gentilhombre...*, p. 87. '*...purificado más adelante por la contrición perfectísima de sus Ejercicios, halló en su humilde y dolorosa confesión el medio de infundir ánimo y dolor para confesar las propias culpas a almas imperfectas; y aun creyó poder evitar por ese camino en 1541 el temido cargo de General de la Compañía.*'

²⁴⁷ *LADC*, pp. 99-100. '*San Ignacio aparece también bastante veces manifestando sus propios problemas y pecados fuera de la confesión, para orientar, consolar y edificar a los demás.*' This is followed by three notes. The first one was by Ribadeneira who comments that Ignatius had a special gift of being able to articulate the internal sentiments of a subject when he was unable to express himself adequately. The second by Nadal who said that in order to help a person overcome his scruples, he would speak about his own struggle with scruples and the third by Câmara who speaks of how Ignatius helped a brother overcome the guilt of a sin committed before entering the Society by manifesting his own sins before being converted.

Father called me and began to tell me about his whole life and his youthful escapades, clearly and distinctly and with all the details. Later in the same month he called me three or four times and carried his story down to his early days in Manresa, as one may see by the writing in a different hand.²⁴⁸

Ignatius had experienced over the years the enormous spiritual benefit of the *MoC* in his own life as well in the governance of the Society. The confession of one's sins and failings to a confessor as well as manifesting in an appropriate forum helped him to grow in humility and also helped in the edification of others. Due to this he was insistent that candidates ought to make a general confession before or immediately after entering the Society.²⁴⁹

As Superior general he was conscious of the importance of the *MoC* in the spiritual process of the individual Jesuits and at the same time the universal good of the Society's mission. Knowing the lights and shadows, difficulties and strengths, consolations and desolations as well as inclinations and revulsions of the subject helped Ignatius understand the overall situation better. This in turn permitted him to take decisions which would fruitfully take forward the apostolic venture. It would also help the subject live the apostolic charism of the Society and discover in it a means to constant devotion and greater union with God. This experience of Ignatius would be institutionalized in the *MoC* as explained in the *GE* and further elaborated in other parts of the Constitutions. [Const. 200, 263, 602, 424, 551, 764]

9.4 HUMILITY AND THE PROCESS OF SELF-EMPTYING – THIRD STEP [98–103]

The emptying of oneself is probably the most complicated and arduous phase in the process of growing in self-emptying. In keeping with the earlier structure as seen in giving up of temporal good and affective separation we shall continue to explain the dynamics of self-emptying from four different perspectives – the individual, the Society, the Church and from a universal perspective. Let us now understand the dynamics of growing in humble self-emptying love as proposed by this part of the *GE*.

²⁴⁸ DIVWARKAR, PARMANANDA. *A Pilgrim's Testament...*, p. 7.

²⁴⁹ Cf. *LADC*, pp. 96-97.

9.4.1 HUMILITY AND SELF-EMPTYING LOVE IN THE CANDIDATE

9.4.1.1 Methodological Considerations

The golden rule of spirituality invites all to move from self-love to self-emptying love. The process of emptying oneself is a continuation of having given up his temporal goods and affectively relations. However true freedom to generously do the will of God emerges when one is able to be empty of one's own self-love.

The dynamics of the *GE* proposes a methodology which moves from that which is *external towards what is more internal*. This is seen in the fact that the first part refers to fraternal corrections which are primarily related to external manifestations of unexpected behaviour. During the primary and secondary experiments a person engages in activities which are in keeping with the Society's orientation by focusing on both the external dimension as well as internal attitudes. Within these internal attitudes it is expected that the candidate grows in the central virtue of humility. While explaining the text we have highlighted various moments where the *GE* lays stress on the need of humility in order that this dynamic process can bring about the desired effect. The experiments are followed by an explanation of that which pertains to the innermost dimension of a human person – his conscience. The movement from that which is external to what is internal is not a linear process but one which is a spiral with each revolution taking the person to a greater depth of identification with the total self-emptying love of Christ.

The methodology of the *Spiritual Exercises* is observed in the manner of training an individual in humility. The chronology of the experiments is similar to that of the methodology of repetitions. In the first experiment a candidate is invited to and experiences the joy of God's gratuitous love leading to a radical commitment of oneself towards following the poor and humble Christ. This is followed by the experiences of the hospital and pilgrimage where the candidate continues to grow in humility. This growth is further deepened by the humble and lowly tasks of the house. The last two experiments are in order to live out a life of humble self-emptying love in an apostolic

and more specifically a ministerial environment. Within the spiritual process we also see a flow from universal spiritual principals towards concrete suggestions. Instructions have been given regarding these suggestions so that they are effectively executed. A clear example is seen in the way how Ignatius speaks of growing in humility through humble and lowly offices and follows it with instructions on obeying the cook and the infirmarians. The dynamics of the SpEx is creatively employed in this process of the *GE*

The methodology of self-emptying affects the *entire person*. The earlier stages have revealed a certain degree of emptying vis-à-vis external things or persons. However here we see that the concerned person's being is affected. A person humbly accepts the corrections and charitably gives it to others in order that there is a behavioural change which is both external and internal. The experiments as well as the manifestation of conscience affect the mind in terms of the way of thinking, the will in terms of firmness of one's decisions, the affect in terms of one's inclination and finally the intimate desires of the heart. The entire person is aided in the transformative process so that humility becomes a way of life for the person. It is not limited to one among the various virtues but becomes a fundamental element within the entire person and is a way of being.

9.4.1.2 Internal Transformation

The focus of the process is not so much on external differences, but on internal transformation. The apostolic charism meant that a Jesuit would have to go to different persons and engage in different kinds of missions. The stability of a monastery or well established lifestyle was not necessarily available to a Jesuit at all times and hence he had to be well prepared internally before being sent for any mission. He therefore would have to be internally equipped by having an experiential knowledge of three aspects: a) constant devotion; b) sufficient practice of discernment and c) the necessary adaptability to ensure that the fundamental mission is fruitfully completed.

The primary internal process consists in training the candidate in growing in *devotion* – i.e. the ability to find God in all things. This as Buckley states is the primary purpose of the *SpEx* in the novitiate. The Jesuit vocation requires a person to be mobile

and there would not always be the possibility of regular formal prayer within a structured format as in a monastery or other institution. A great deal of time was spent in interacting with other persons and being involved in activities outside the confines of the community. The candidate through the experiences humbly learns to rely less on himself and more on the grace of God. The experiences and the post-reflection on these experiences teach him to empty himself of his false attitude of self-sufficiency and fill himself with the empowering grace of the Spirit.

This part of the *GE* represents a well-developed blueprint whereby the candidate could be adequately trained to have a *sensitive internal life*. The primary experiences as well as the secondary experiences, the regular practice of fraternal correction, *MoC*, regular reading of the Bulls and constitutions as well as a well-nourished sacramental life help a person grow in the experience of the presence of God in a variety of persons and situations. Within the *GE's* blueprint of the house of probation we find that besides some of the normal practices of religious order, there were other practices which were geared towards preparing a person to grow in devotion within an apostolic context. These include more focused methods of prayer such as the Examen, the sacramental practices of periodic confession, the regular exercises to cultivate the virtues of humility and charity as well as other spiritual tools such as the *MoC*. These methods aid the candidate to constantly empty himself of his self-love, internalize and deepen the experience of the Spiritual Exercises and progressively grow in a familiarity with finding God at all times and in all things.

The movement from self-love to self-emptying love is not an automatic process but involves the person's experiential knowledge of *discernment*. During the process of all that has been indicated during this section of the *GE*, we find the person having a progressive understanding of the diversity of spirits. In the initial phases, the person would need the assistance of a spiritual guide more often in order to be careful of the deceptions of self-love and at times make greater acts of humility by going against one's own sensibilities. As the candidate begins to understand the diversity of spirits within himself, he is also invited to use this instrument in order to help others in their spiritual

progress. The attitude and process is not of a master teaching a student, but that of one pilgrim humbly aiding another pilgrim in a shared journey.

The internal process of self-emptying also leads the candidate to grow in adaptability. The gift of discernment helps him distinguish between means and ends and he therefore learns to empty himself of his own cultural, historical and personal peculiarities in order to become ‘all things to all men.’ (1 Cor. 9,22) Ignatius and the first companions manifested this adaptability in an extraordinary fashion and were able to enter into dialogue with persons who were diverse in nature. The candidate is made aware that this ability to adapt oneself is not an external attribute added from outside, but the fruit of a deep internal experience of an Incarnate God. The Incarnational spirituality which forms the basis of the Society’s apostolic charism aids the internal transformation of the candidate so that they are prepared to effectively respond to a variety of missions.

9.4.1.3 Self-emptying and inter-relatedness

The very process of self-emptying as narrated in the *GE* contains a perspective which is *other centered*. Fraternal correction is not merely centered on being corrected by others but also involves correcting other with charity and prudence. The notion of an exclusively personal spiritual progress is incompatible with a genuine process of self-emptying because by its very nature it is inter-related. The sign of spiritual maturity is when a person is less focused on oneself and more willing to empty oneself for others.

In the spiritual process as outlined in the *GE* we find a progressive *growth in one’s inter-relatedness*. One realizes that one’s existence is an inter-related existence and such an understanding is founded on the mystery of the Holy Trinity. During the initial phases of giving up temporal goods and affective separation the focus is to a larger extent on a person’ emptying himself for the sake of growing in freedom. However in the part which deals with an emptying of the self, the person is more and more other-centered. From a concern for others in fraternal correction whereby a person desires the good of the other, we have a substantial elevation in self-emptying love in the *MoC*

where a person desires to hold back nothing in order to better love and serve others in the mission entrusted to him.

The process moves from being open to humility and poverty towards a greater *identification with Christ* by desiring humiliations and insults. The attitude of the third degree of humility beckons the candidate and he is invited to desire it ardently. The flame of this desire where he longs to empty himself for the sake of Christ is regularly fanned during the period of his studies. The years of probation have transformed him internally and he is spiritually prepared to embark on a life which will basically be apostolic in character. During the period of studies or during a life in active ministry, he will be living the joy of humble love by generously emptying himself for others – thus participating in the labouring love of the Lord.

Ignatius, like other before him did not consider humility as a burden or a result of negative self-abasement. Rather he had discovered its redemptive role and apostolic effectiveness. He desired that a candidate longed for a life of humility and poverty because of its fundamental role in taking forward the spiritual process begun in a candidate. Bereft of these virtues, the vocation of a candidate would be shaky from the very start and would not be able to withstand the rigors and vagaries of a Jesuit vocation. On the other hand, the progressive internalization of humility and poverty would help a person constantly empty himself for others leading to greater identification with Christ and deeper union with the Triune God.

9.4.2 THE SELF-EMPTYING OF THE 'MÍNIMA' SOCIETY OF JESUS

In elaborating the self-emptying of the 'least' Society we shall begin by speaking about the relationship between the process of self-emptying as articulated in the *GE* and the experience of the first Jesuits. This will be followed by stressing the importance of the process in terms of the Society's apostolic effectiveness. Finally we shall end by showing how the elements that form the self-emptying process in fact form the basic structure of the Society.

The process elucidated in the fourth chapter in order to help a person in his

spiritual process was the result of the actual experience of *Ignatius and the first companions*. From the very beginning Ignatius and his companions were motivated by humility to call the Society as the 'least' Society of Jesus. The Society that the candidate was invited to enter was a humble society where its members were like earthen vessels. (2 Cor. 4,7) Just as the danger of self-love always threatened the spiritual progress of an individual Jesuit, in the same way the danger of riches, honor and pride at an institutional level always posed a danger to the concept of the 'least' Society of Jesus. A glimpse of this concern related to poverty can be seen in the *Spiritual Diary* of Ignatius.

The humility and self-emptying of the candidate is fundamental to the Society's *apostolic mission* and continues to remain so. It coincides with what is taking place at a larger level in the universal Society. Humility has always been important within the Christian tradition, but its integration in an apostolic charism was the genius of Ignatius. By engaging in concrete experiments and spiritual exercises, the candidates were already participating in the apostolic mission of the Society – albeit in a minor way. The same can be said today about the involvement of the candidates in the Society's apostolic involvement in the contemporary world. By ensuring that the formation of a candidate takes place through brief involvements in apostolic missions related to faith, justice and dialogue throughout the world, the Society ensures that humble self-emptying love of the candidate contributes in some manner to the actual apostolic involvements of the Society.

The *inter-related nature* of formation programmes and their corresponding spiritual processes influenced the other members of the Society as well as the well-wishers and collaborators of the Society. Formation of candidates was not confined to the four walls of the novitiate, but necessarily consisted in involvement with the outside world. The struggle of the candidate to grow in humility and self-emptying love was shared by others who had gone through the same process and joyfully shared in the initial phase of the candidates as friends in the Lord. The various factors that aid a candidate's process of self-emptying continue to repeat themselves in myriad ways all through the life of a Jesuit. The participation of other Jesuits and lay persons in the

formation of candidates was a constant reminder of a person's own spiritual itinerary and invited them to greater commitment, humility and self-emptying love.

The various instruments indicated in the methodology to help a candidate spiritual progress is *part of the Society's basic structure*. Fraternal correction is expected to continue in a modified manner all through the life of a Jesuit. Genuine concern would make a person look out for effective ways and means to help a Jesuit companions at all times. The various experiences are part and parcel of the apostolic activities of the Society at all levels. The spiritual apostolate, the commitment to justice, concern for vulnerable populations, academic involvement, preaching, sacramental ministry and so on form part of the Society's mission even today. And last of all every Jesuits is expected to engage in the spiritual exercise of the *MoC* at least once a year. The repeated reading of the Bulls, Constitutions and a reflection on one's vows and commitment is recommended to all Jesuits periodically. We thus see that what has been presented as instructions for candidates is today integrated into the basic structure of the universal Society.

The 'least' Society has been constantly reminded of the challenge of being true to its foundational charism of humility. From the very beginning it has been involved in diverse ministries and interacted with a variety of persons holding high positions. On various occasions it has had access to the courts of kings, high ecclesiastical offices, and important seats of learning. Access to power, adulation and prestige coupled with the dispersed nature of its mission makes it extremely necessary to tenaciously foster the virtue of humility as a binding force for the Society well-being at various levels – spiritual, relational, functional and material. Bereft of this virtue it would be difficult for the Society to totally empty itself in fulfilling the mandate given to it by the Church and live up to its true vocation as the 'least' Society of Jesus.

9.4.3 A 'SERVANT' CHURCH AT THE SERVICE OF OTHERS

The birth of the Society was an important moment in the history of the Catholic Church. It was being assailed on various fronts within Europe with one crisis following another.

On the other hand new opportunities were emerging in the form of missionary prospects, scientific and literary developments as well as technological progress. A few centuries earlier during a similar situation within the Church, another charismatic saint, Francis of Assisi had a vision at the country chapel of San Damiano where he was told to 'repair' the Church. Now in the tumultuous sixteenth century, Ignatius was invited to 'serve' the Triune God during a vision at La Storta. As a response to this invitation, the Society of Jesus would be born and its members would be trained to 'serve' the Triune God by offering themselves totally. This total self-offering would be according to whatever mission was received from the Church and would express itself in a variety of ways the world over.

The Church was being called to re-discover its true identity as a servant Church and humility was the need of the hour. There was need of being humble before the poor who were ignorant and sidelined, humble before kings, princes and intellectuals who felt the Church was not being faithful to the Good News and desired to break away, humble in new places which were receiving the Good News of Jesus Christ for the first time and so on. The destructive triptych of riches, honour and pride had wreaked havoc and it was now time to apply the only antidote of humble service in order to recover the unity and identity of the true Catholic Church. This re-discovery required a conversion towards humble loving service at all levels – institutional, hierarchical, political, intellectual and most importantly personal.

Any change would take place only if the individual subject underwent a transformation and the *SpEx* was turning out to be just the right tool in order to aid the transformation of people in high places such as intellectuals, theologians, ecclesiastical authorities, members of the ruling class as well the ordinary folk such as ignorant adults and unlettered children. It helped people rediscover the joy of humble service and the Church slowly began to go out of itself and empty itself in various acts of service. The situation began to stabilize and the Church began to give witness of itself as a servant at the service of others. The *SpEx* as a spiritual instrument which aided the transformation of the candidate was influential in helping the Church become a servant for others.

Along with the Spiritual Exercises, the other elements seen in the *GE* were actively implemented by the Society in the service of the Church. This included humble service towards the poor and sick, training of the clergy, reform of monasteries, educating the masses regarding right Christian doctrine, missionary activities places which had no Christian presence, serious theological reflection, setting up schools to educate students, the fostering of arts and sciences and so on. All this manifested to the world a new and vibrant Church which was no longer centered on itself, but was outgoing and concerned about others. It must be pointed out that merely engaging in activity was not enough, but what was more important was the attitude of humility underlying all these activities.

From the very onset, the Society's identity and existence was intrinsically linked to the Church. The constant ecclesial dimension is seen in the life of Ignatius and the first companions. Despite being inspired and guided by God, they humbly submitted their desires to the wishes of the Roman Pontiff. The programme of the *GE* which was creatively re-designed in other areas of ecclesial life helped in inculcating an abiding love and humility towards the Church as well as the Roman Pontiff. These elements of the *GE* which aided the candidate to grow in humility and self-emptying love worked as a catalyst for the Church in order to re-discover its true identity as a 'servant' called to serve the world.

9.4.4 GLORIFYING GOD'S SELF-EMPTYING LOVE IN A BROKEN WORLD

The spiritual process of the candidate whereby he desires and chooses humility and poverty was not an isolated inconsequential event. Rather through it a person actively participates in the universal salvific plan of God.

The *SpEx* situates for the Jesuit the scope of his vocation and mission – it consists in participating in God's salvific plan for the whole world. By faithfully and humbly engaging in the mission assigned to him, he participates in the Triune God's humility. This humility has been definitively revealed in the descent of the Second Person to become human and went on to suffer a humiliating death on the Cross. The response of God to a creation which is groaning for fulfilment (*Rom. 8,22*) is one of love and total

self-emptying. The candidate makes this response of the Triune God his own when he too inspired by the gratuitous love of God joyfully empties himself in order to participate in the humble descent of God.

The candidate participates in God's humble and loving activity [*SpEx*, 236] in the present moment by consciously choosing poverty, insults and humiliations. In this way he is in solidarity with the love and humility of God who is constantly present in the pain and suffering of all reality. Despite the fact that the material value of the candidate's endeavour seems insignificant, he actively participates in the eternal redemptive mission of the Triune God. Through his love for poverty and humiliations he lives out the Society's charism of being with Christ carrying His cross in today's existential situation. The repeated engagement of this nature leads to a growing spiritual maturity within the candidate and is manifested in greater humility and total emptying of oneself – an emptying which is manifested in the commitment made during the vows.

The Society was born during a *moment of encounter* between different cultures and civilizations. The spiritual formation given to the Jesuit at the beginning of his journey within the Society gave him an openness of spirit allowing him to respond to new and unknown situations in a truly Christian fashion. The key to this mostly successful response lay in an attitude of humility which facilitated genuine dialogue. This formation allowed Jesuits to become instruments of the Good News in a manner which allowed them to permeate and transform existing cultures. Other endeavours which placed their emphasis on a sense of arrogance, pride or self-love ended up causing enormous and irreplaceable damage. The formation of Jesuits who were trained in devotion, discernment and adaptability led to significant advances in various areas of human enterprise and worked as a positive catalyst of genuinely human and divine encounters.

With the Incarnation the earlier dichotomy between the sacred and profane has been taken away and all reality is part of our mission. The universal salvific plan of God is an ongoing realization and the Incarnation, life, death and resurrection of Christ have

revealed it in a definitive manner. God desires that all persons be saved (*1 Tim. 2,4*) and the spiritual process of emptying oneself during the second probation has great significance not only for the concerned candidate, but for God's universal salvific plan. The candidate's humility and self-emptying love leads to a reciprocal transformative process at various levels whereby it influences the candidate, the Society of Jesus, the Church and the world at large.

CONCLUSION

The transformative process elaborated in the third stage of the *GE* is a reflection of an ongoing transformation. It is a process where God has always taken the initiative by lovingly and totally emptying Himself for the sake of reconciling a broken world. The human person on the other hand is constantly invited to glorify God by responding in like manner by concretely emptying oneself of possessions, affective attachments and further on of one self. This is not an automatic process, but takes place through a rigorous method wherein the process of making choices of emptying oneself involve the entire person.

The present chapter has focused on the unique process of self-emptying love as proposed by the Society to the candidate. The progressive invitation to empty oneself is concretely lived out through fraternal correction, the various experiences and the manifestation of conscience. These are not one time events, but tools for spiritual transformation which are effective through the life of a person. Given the fact that the process of emptying oneself was not an easy process, Ignatius pays great attention to elaborating those points that deal with the internal spiritual attitudes which the candidate is expected to cultivate. The process as indicated earlier is spiral and the methodology brings the candidate back to foundational spiritual values such as humility, poverty, obedience and generosity in order to take forward the transformative process of growing self-emptying love

Within these foundational values, the requirement of an attitude of humility in order to fruitfully grow through this process (which will be repeated through the life of a

person) has been underlined. The candidate and in effect every person who desires to live the Society's charism is exhorted to ardently desire and choose that which is humble and poor because it offers a concrete manifestation of love and self-emptying. What is desired and lived out in a seminal form during the second probation flowers and grows to its fullness during the course of a person's entire life.

The text of the *GE* does not end with the invitation to empty oneself. The next chapter focuses solely on the last three numbers of the fourth chapter and these numbers could be considered as the core and kernel of an already profoundly spiritual chapter. This text brings together various strands of the transformative process elaborated so far by inviting the candidate towards a transformed desire in order to have a growing love for the Cross and greater longing to imitate Christ. This transformation which manifests itself through concrete choices effects an ongoing conversion leading to greater union with the Triune God by a mysticism of humble and loving service.

CHAPTER 10

UNION WITH GOD – HUMBLE LOVE AND THE DESIRE TO BE '*CLOTHED IN CHRIST*'

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

We now come to the 'most inspiring part of the chapter, of the book of the Examen, and indeed of the entire Constitutions.'¹ It reiterates the ideal of identifying with the poverty and humility of Christ by loving the cross. This ideal has been present all through and now is placed before the candidate as something to be ardently desired and towards which he is expected to move.² A person who was living a self-centered life now desires to live a life totally centered on Christ. This transformed desire of a person and its concrete expression is the means for greater spiritual union with God.

The phrase 'clothed in Christ' has a profound meaning within the Christian spirituality. It is reflective of an internal spirit which manifests itself through concrete external expressions.³ We shall begin with an historical overview of the phrase 'clothed

¹ ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory...*, p. 61.

² Cf. IBID.

³ The internal spirit of this phrase has been interpreted by different religious orders in their own unique manner. At the same time this spirit manifests itself externally whereby the desire to discard one's worldly life and imitate Christ is expressed in taking on a new attire.

in Christ' within the Christian tradition. This will be followed by an analysis of the text of the *GE* and its interpretation by some contemporary authors. Finally we shall highlight transformation in the life of Ignatius by using the schema of Lonergan.

10.1 HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

From the commencement of Christianity, we find that spiritual masters insisted on the importance of having an intense desire and love for the Cross. However it was not enough to love the Cross, but one also had to concretely reject the world and publicly express the rejection of its values. This internal attitude of desiring and accepting the self-emptying love of Christ as well as abhorring and rejecting the self-love of the world was externally manifest in liturgical ceremonies that took place within the precincts of monasteries or religious communities. During these ceremonies a person in all humility put on new clothes which were more appropriate to following Christ poor and humble and discarded old clothes which were representative of a world dominated by pride and self-glory. In elaborating this section we shall focus on three inter-related areas: a) the love of the Cross; b) rejection of the world and c) the importance of humility in the process of spiritual growth.

10.1.1 THE EARLIEST RULES – PACHOMIUS, BASIL AND AUGUSTINE

Pachomius spoke about the love of the cross while referring to his mentor Palamon who was 'always carrying the cross ...and following him with a humble heart.'⁴ In a letter to a spiteful monk he cautions against seeking honour and rather exhorts them to seek humility.⁵ He speaks about the centrality of humility among all virtues⁶ and finally ends this instruction by asking the monk to 'put on humility... (and to) be like a poor man carrying his cross and loving tears.'⁷

⁴ *Pachomian Koinonia – I...*, p. 302.

⁵ Cf. *Pachomian Koinonia – III...*, p. 18.

⁶ *IBID.*, p. 35. '*...we have been given humility, which watches over all the virtues and is that great holy strength with which God clothed himself when he came into the world. Humility is the rampart of the virtues, the treasury of works, the saving armor and cure for every wound.*'

⁷ *IBID.*, p. 39.

The *Rule of St. Basil* refers to the love of the Cross at the onset Q.4 deals with the question whether there was indeed a necessity to renounce everything.⁸ The answer begins with a quote from *Mt. 16,24* where Jesus asks a disciple to ‘deny himself, take up his cross and follow Him.’ Elaborating this further, the *Rule* states that a true disciple is crucified to the world and the world is crucified to him. (*Gal. 6,14*) This internal attitude is manifested in a monk’s garment – a point which is dealt in *LR 22*. The clothes should be ‘fitting (of) one who has abased his life to the uttermost in humility.’⁹ They ought to be ‘consistent with the ordinary style of dress or usage - (should) cover (one’s) modesty and protect against harm from the weather – (have) a common distinctive character¹⁰ and ...bear witness of his profession of life.’¹¹

The *RA* focuses on the internal attitude with an invitation to have the mind and heart of Christ. In the beginning of the *Rule* (no. 1/2) there is an exhortation where the community is asked to be ‘of one mind and heart.’ (*Acts. 4,32*) This explicit reference to the first Christian community contains an implicit reference to the letter to the Philippians. (*Phil. 2,5*) The end of the *Rule* (no. 8/1) contains an exhortation to ‘spread the life-giving aroma of Christ’ (*2 Cor. 2,15*). The *Rule* however has no reference to an external expression to this internal disposition. In order to live this rule, the role of humility is important. In the *Rule*, nos. 6 & 7 offers us an unexpected transition to the theme of humility where it is seen as the condition of the possibility of being able to live in love.

For Augustine humility is not just one virtue among others; it is, in the full sense of the word, a basic virtue. All other virtues rest on humility. In this way, humility is also the fertile soil of love. Love’s essence is that a person leaves himself in order to go out to another. In love one becomes, as it were, alienated from oneself through the acknowledgement of the other with whom one is face to face. Love therefore compels us to take distance from ourselves, and this we cannot do without the humility which breaks

⁸ Cf. *The Rule of St. Basil ...*, p. 83.

⁹ *The Asketikon of St. Basil...*, p. 220.

¹⁰ *IBID.*, p. 222. The commonality is because all those who are in the monastery ‘tend to the same purpose and goal (and) are for the most part consistent with each other.’

¹¹ *IBID.*, pp. 221-22. He ends the response to this question by indicating how the clothing distinguishes persons of different professions. In the same way, ‘it is fitting and consistent that a Christ also should in some way be marked by his clothing...’ (*IBID.*, p. 223.) The next point goes on to speak about the significance of the belt. (*IBID.*, pp. 223-34.)

down the walls imprisoning our ego in itself. In this we see the very important place of humility in Augustine's spirituality.¹²

10.1.2 LATE PATRISTIC PERIOD – CASSIAN, *THE RULE OF THE MASTER* AND BENEDICT

Cassian in the *Institutes* has an entire book related to the "Garb of the Monk". He begins by speaking about the monk's belt (Ch. 1) and ends by describing its spiritual significance (Ch. 11). He says that 'it is proper for a monk always to dress like a soldier of Christ, ever ready for battle.'¹³ The garment worn by him 'should cover the body, counter the shame of nakedness, prevents the cold from doing harm (and avoids) nurturing vanity or pride.'¹⁴

While the external attire is explained in the first chapter, the internal disposition of loving the Cross and having an attitude of humility is explained in the fourth book, "The Institutes of the Renunciants." In this book, Abba Pinufius (a monk who longed to live a life of humility) is seen giving instructions to a new brother received who was being received into the cenobium. In the 24th chapter the newcomer is told that 'renunciation is nothing else than a manifestation of the cross and of a dying.'¹⁵ He is cautioned about once again being 'clothed in the garment that had been stripped off' and this could include the former 'lusts and pursuits ...which had been renounced or rejected' or 'the pride that had been trampled upon at the start of the ardour of faith and the totality of humility.'¹⁶

The 90th chapter in the *Rule of the Master* deals with the '...the change of garb'. As

¹² VAN BAVEL, TARCICIUS J. *The Rule of Saint Augustine*, (Tr. Canning, Raymond), Image Books: New York, p. 55. Van Bavel after commenting upon the virtues of humility as seen in these two numbers, goes on to explain the dangers of pride as seen in this text and other writings of Augustine. Pride is presented as 'the great adversary of humility – the positive qualities of humility are mirrored negatively in pride – it is not simply a fault among other faults, but a basic vice... the origin and the beginning of all sins.' (IBID., p. 56.)

¹³ *John Cassian: The Institutes...*, p. 21.

¹⁴ IBID., p. 22. While they approved of wearing something which was different from the apparel of this world, they also rejected sackcloth as being showy and conspicuous. It also contained the possibility of leading to pride.

¹⁵ IBID., p. 97. One has been crucified to the world and henceforth 'you no longer live, but he lives in you who was crucified for you... All our desires and yearnings (are) fixed to his dying and not subservient to our lust.'

¹⁶ IBID., p. 98. The quotes in this sentence are from p. 98. In the 39th chapter he offers us 10 indicators in order to verify the authenticity of humility. (IBID., p. 100.)

early as the 10th chapter we have the famous 12 steps of humility. These 12 steps begin with an explanation of the descent of exaltation and the ascent of humility. After the 12 steps have been completed, the person is expected to start living a life of humility out of love and delight in this virtue.¹⁷ The 90th chapter begins with an instruction about denying what one loves and desires and imposing what one hates.¹⁸ Considering that all self-will is carnal and leads to what is wrong, the chapter speaks about the importance of negating one’s self will and growing in humility and obedience.¹⁹ The candidate is made to wait for a full year before being tonsured and the secular clothes are exchanged for the sacred habit. During this intermediate period, the abbot constantly emphasizes the importance of having an internal attitude and relates it to an external attire by saying that:

‘My son, the clothing you are wearing in the monastery for the time being in no way anticipates our judgment concerning you, but only when you have first cleansed worldly ways from the depths of your heart in the divine service will you finally change your garments as well, so that in your body it may from then on be apparent to all, and rightly so, that in your spirit you belong to God. And after cutting malice out of your heart it is quite proper that you should also cut your hair. Then when you, still in your own clothes, have perfectly put into practice all that is contained in the Rule of the monastery, you will remain steadfast, holier still, after receiving our habit.’²⁰

The *RB* has a similar pattern and the 7th chapter on humility is replete with scriptural texts. The monk who ascends the 12 steps would ‘quickly arrive at that perfect love of God which casts out fear.’²¹ The *RB* is not as elaborate as the *RM* but the 58th chapter²² speaks of an external ritual whereby he ‘is stripped of everything of his own that he is wearing and clothed in what belongs to the monastery.’²³ This ritual is expressive of an internal spirit of total self-giving whereby he gives up all that he has

¹⁷ *The Rule of the Master...*, pp. 131-39. The last part of this chapter describes the joy and fulfillment that accompanies such a life of humility.

¹⁸ *IBID.*, p. 260.

¹⁹ Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 263-64. ‘...all self-will is carnal and issues from the body, its seductiveness leads us to commit what is wrong, and during the short span of this life it seems to the flesh sweet through its desires, only to be more bitter than gall afterwards and forever.’

²⁰ *IBID.*, p. 265.

²¹ *The Rule of St. Benedict...*, p. 201.

²² This chapter deals with the procedure for receiving brothers.

²³ *The Rule of St. Benedict...*, p. 271.

(include his very body), humbly prostrates himself before each monk and asks them to pray for him.

10.1.3 BERNARD OF CLAIRVAUX (CISTERCIANS) AND THE CARTHUSIANS

The Cistercian order desired to live a life in imitation of Christ and the apostles and for this purpose sought to follow the Benedictine Rule.²⁴ Along with other authors, Bernard of Clairvaux 'articulated a particular form of *imitatio Christi*, a stress on love and friendship, and an affective spirituality whose expressions of love and friendship, put in a religious key, encouraged personal repentance, contemplation and social reformation.'²⁵ The stress on an internal spirit of an *imitatio Christi* was geared towards realizing the goal of Christian living – i.e. 'the restoration of the *imago Dei* given to Adam in the beginning, severely deformed in the Fall, but once again made accessible to humans through the saving work of Christ.'²⁶ Their greater focus consisted in experiencing God as eternal and unchangeable love.²⁷

In order to have a transformative experience of God's love, one needed to be guided by humility.²⁸ The first of Bernard's many works would be his treatise *The Steps of Humility and Pride*.²⁹ In this spiritual classic he outlines the importance of humility in a person's spiritual process when he says that 'the way is humility, the goal is truth.'³⁰ In affirming the role of humility in a person's spiritual process he says:

²⁴ NEWMAN, MARTHA G. "Foundation and twelfth century", *The Cambridge Companion to the Cistercian Order*, (Ed. Bruun, Mette Birkeedal), Cambridge University Press: New York, p. 26.

²⁵ IBID., p. 31

²⁶ MCGINN, BERNARD. "The spiritual teaching of the early Cistercians", *The Cambridge Companion to the Cistercian Order...*, p. 219.

²⁷ IBID., p. 221. '*Charity alone is his unchangeable and eternal rest, his eternal and unchangeable tranquillity, his eternal and unchangeable Sabbath. It was the sole cause why he created what was to be created, why he rules what is to be ruled... advances what is to be advanced and perfects what is to be perfected... His charity is his very will and also his very goodness; all this is nothing but his very being.*' (Quoting Aelred's *Speculum caritatis*, Bk. 1:19)

²⁸ IBID. Though they were concerned about the relation between faith and reason, they were cautious about reasons since it could lead people astray and therefore one always needed to be guided by humility.

²⁹ *Bernard of Clairvaux – Selected Works*, (Trs. Evans, G. R. – Leclercq, Jean – Cousins, Ewert H.), Paulist Press: New York: 1987, p. 17.

³⁰ BERNARD OF CLAIRVAUX. *The Steps of Humility and Pride*, (Tr. Leclercq, Jean), Cistercian Publications: Kentucky, 1973, p. 29. The three fundamental aspects of spiritual process are: a) humility; b) charity/love and c) contemplation.

Yes the path of humility is a good path. It seeks for truth; it wins charity; it shares the fruits of wisdom. Just as the end of the Law is Christ, so the perfection of humility is the knowledge of truth. When Christ came he brought grace; when truth is known it brings love. It is to the humble it is known. ‘He gives his grace to the humble.’ (1 Pet. 5,5)³¹

Moving on to the statutes of the Carthusian order we see that the 36th chapter in the fifth book refers to the cowl.³² It states that, ‘the one about to make his vows is clothed with the cowl of the professed which symbolizes his conversion of life and consecration to God... Before the irrevocable act of solemn Profession, with special ardor he begs his brothers to help him with their prayers.’³³ Elaborating the attitude of humility which ought to characterize the entire life of the monk the text further states that the ceremony of being received as a cloister/brother novice or making his simple/solemn profession consists in lying prostrate and expressing his desire to be ‘received for probation in the monastic habit as the most humble servant’ (Ch. 36,3/6/8) and to live the monastic life relying ‘solely on the goodness of God and the prayers of his brothers.’ (Ch. 36/4) The internal attitude of humble self-offering is beautifully reflected in the formula uttered by the Abbot. The ceremony and formula goes as follows:

...with the help of the Sacristan, the Prior takes the short cowl and the mantle off from the novice and says: "May the Lord put off from your old self with its past deeds," and exchanges it for the long cowl, saying: "and may he clothe you with the new man, created in God's image, whose justice and holiness are born of truth."³⁴

10.1.4 THE RULE OF FRANCIS OF ASSISI AND THE DOMINICAN CONSTITUTIONS

The *RF* is the fruit of a spiritual journey of Francis of Assisi. His decision to totally strip himself of his worldly garments in order to be clothed in Christ in 1206 is well known.³⁵ In the *Admonitions* he exhorts the brothers to a life of actual insults and humiliations

³¹ *IBID.*, p. 34.

³² Different moments that deal with the novice include the 8th, 9th & 10th chapter of Bk. 1, the 17th chapter of Bk. 2 and the 36th chapter of the 5th Bk. <http://www.chartreux.org/en/texts/statutes-prologue.php> (last accessed on 21/11/2015)

³³ <http://www.chartreux.org/en/texts/statutes-book-5.php#haut> (last accessed on 23/11/2015)

³⁴ <http://www.chartreux.org/en/texts/statutes-book-5.php#haut> (last accessed on 23/11/2015)

³⁵ The decision of Francis was not sudden but part of a process which had been building up for some time. After his return from the war and recuperation, he began to do strange things. He went to the wilderness to pray, once changed clothes with a beggar and begged, showed deep concern for those less fortunate than himself and rebuilt crumbling churches. (Cf. COOK, WILLIAM R. *Francis of Assisi – The Way of Poverty and Humility*, WIPF & STOCK: Oregon, 1989, p. 24.)

because such an imitation manifests true love and authentic discipleship.³⁶ The internal spirit of the *Admonitions* and other writings find expression in an institutional manner within the *Rules* where the external garb of the monk ought to reflect the internal spirit of desiring an imitation of the humility of Christ.³⁷

The second chapter in *The Earlier Rule* as well as *The Later Rule* deals with clothing of the friars. In speaking about a newcomer who has already disposed his possessions, the minister is to give him 'two tunics without a hood, a cord and trousers, and a small cape reaching to the cord.'³⁸ After completion of a year and having made a promise of obedience, the brothers 'should have one tunic with a hood and another without a hood, if that is necessary, and a cord and trousers.'³⁹ The reference to the internal spirit of serving Christ poor and humble and belonging to the heavenly kingdom can be inferred from two biblical texts which suggest that persons who live in luxuries belong to the house of worldly kings.⁴⁰ *The Later Rule* has a different biblical quote related to perseverance (*Lk. 9, 62*). The second chapter in both these sets of rules ends with an exhortation to an internal attitude. *The Earlier Rule* ends with an exhortation to perseverance and humble service without seeking 'costly clothing in this world, so that they may have a garment in the kingdom of heaven.'⁴¹ *The Later Rule* ends with an exhortation against pride by cautioning the friars against criticizing or judging those who live in luxuries.⁴²

The *Primitive Dominican Constitutions* offers instructions regarding the clothing for

³⁶ The titles of various admonitions indicate an invitation to have an internal attitude of humility and love for the Cross. (Admonition) *Ad. V* – No one should boast of himself but rather glory in the Cross of the Lord; *Ad. VI* – The Imitation of the Lord; *Ad. IX* – True Love; *Ad. XVI* – The humble servant of God; *Ad. XIX* – The humble servant of God; *Ad. XXIII* – Humility; *Ad. XXIV* – True Love. (Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 25-35.)

³⁷ *Francis and Clare – The Complete Works...*, p. 21. The 'desire to serve in humility' characterized his spirituality and his passionate desired to be clothed in Christ by imitating His poverty and humility is evident in various writings.

³⁸ *IBID.*, p. 110.

³⁹ *IBID.*, p. 111.

⁴⁰ The two biblical quotations are *Lk. 7,25* and *Mt. 11,8*.

⁴¹ *Francis and Clare – The Complete Works...*, p. 111.

⁴² *IBID.*, p. 139.

the brothers in chapter 18.⁴³ The first reference to put on new clothes is when candidates are received for the first time into the order. At first the candidate ‘prostrates himself in the middle of the chapter...’ After the community’s decision on admittance, ‘divesting themselves of their secular clothing and putting on the religious habit, they are received into the chapter.’⁴⁴

A more elaborate ceremony is seen at the time of making profession. The external instructions on what constituted the clothing can be seen in chapter 18. The preceding chapters are on silence (ch. 17) and on the manner of making profession (ch. 16). The habit or clothes are proper for the mission of the Order of Preachers – albeit with the necessary flexibility. However the formula of profession indicates the importance of having an internal attitude of obedience.⁴⁵ Humbert of Romans uses the imagery of putting off one’s old clothes and putting on the clothes of Christ in speaking about the various means in order to ensure good conduct.⁴⁶

10.1.5 THE MODERN DEVOTION

Despite the fact that the *Modern Devotion* was not a religious order but only a gathering of the devout,⁴⁷ we shall make a brief reference to it because of the book *Imitation of Christ*. This book has undoubtedly proved to be ‘the most influential devotional book in Western Christian history.’⁴⁸ In keeping with the medieval religious piety and devotion

⁴³ The book of Constitutions and Ordinations (2012) speaks of the habit in no. 50 of the first section and in appendix 3. (<http://www.op.org/sites/www.op.org/files/public/documents/fichier/lcoenglish2012.pdf> - last accessed 23/11/2015)

⁴⁴ http://www.op.org/sites/www.op.org/files/public/documents/fichier/primitive_consti_en.pdf - accessed 23/11/2015

⁴⁵ The candidate in making profession begins with an expression of obedience to God and follows it with a promise of obedience to his superiors and finally ends with a promise of obedience to the Rule of Augustine and to the Institute of the Friars of the Order of Preachers.

⁴⁶ Quoting *Eph. 4,24* and *Lev. 15,6* he makes mention of the need of an internal purification of one’s defective inclinations through constant examination of conscience, contrition, confession and the amendment of one’s ways. http://www.op.org/sites/www.op.org/files/public/-documents/fichier/treat_on_preaching_humbert_en.pdf - (last accessed on - 23/11/2015)

⁴⁷ ‘Theirs was not to be a new religious order but a voluntary gathering of the devout. They refused to take vows, with all their legal consequences, claiming instead the right to associate freely and to persist willingly in their chosen way of life. They were to be ‘devout’ without becoming professed ‘religious.’ *Devotio Moderna – Basic Writings...*, p. 14.

⁴⁸ *IBID.*, p. 8. ‘Written only a good generation prior to the invention of printing, it exists still in some 750 hand-written copies, and from its first edition in 1472 down to the last century it appeared in some 3,000 editions (50 of them prior to the year 1500). Even today despite a marked turning away from this kind of spirituality, its attractions holds (with) three English, a Dutch and

of its time, it offers a practical outline to help people live a holy life. There is a deep appreciation of a life of virtue and suspicion of the exaggerated intellectual and speculative theological debates of the time.⁴⁹

It stressed the example of Christ in order to live a spiritual lifestyle.⁵⁰ The person of Christ was central to their spirituality and building on some spiritual traditions of the past they focused primarily on 'an individual and affective identification with particular moments in Christ's life, chiefly his passion.'⁵¹ The desire to 'be crucified (so that) it is no longer I who live, but Christ who lives in me' (*Gal. 2,20*) has been interpreted positively as well as negatively down the centuries.⁵² Irrespective of varying opinions we can say that the desire to imitate Christ led the communities that made up the *Modern Devotion* 'live together in humility and love and in pursuit of virtue'⁵³.

With the *Modern Devotion* we come to the end of this historical overview about the internal and external expression of 'being clothed in Christ'. We have highlighted that down the centuries the need to be 'clothed in Christ' was expressed externally as well as internally – an expression which symbolized the unique charism of a religious group. The external expression often consisted in an imitation of Christ by putting on a new robe signifying the acceptance of a new way of life and at the same time putting off one's old robes symbolic of the world. While the external expression was meaningful, the

French translation, all published in the last decade.'

⁴⁹ BILLY, DENNIS. *The Imitation of Christ – A Spiritual Commentary and Reader's Guide*, (Tr. Creasy, William C.), 2005, p. 7. Thomas A. Kempis who is the most probable author of the *Imitation of Christ* divided this book into four parts according to the purgative, illuminative and unitive way. The process consisted in proceeding in spiritual life by practicing Christian virtues leading to greater union with Christ which is consummated in the Holy Eucharist.

⁵⁰ Cf. ZELYCK, LORNE. "An Evaluation of Thomas A. Kempes' *Imitation of Christ*", *Journal of Grace – Evangelical Society*, 2005, p. 77.

⁵¹ *Devotio Moderna – Basic Writings...*, p. 25. '...the purpose was fourfold: to 're-live' with Christ his virtuous life and saving passion, to have him ever present before one's eyes, to manifest his presence to others, and to orchestrate, as it were, all of one's mental and emotional faculties around devotion to him.

⁵² Van Engen affirms that the emphasis was entirely positive (IBID., p. 25) while Zelyck (*fn. 50*) is critical of the *Imitation of Christ* by stating that Kempis has erred on doctrinal issues on four different counts. Of this his second criticism is that the call to discipleship has deviated into a call for perfection with Kempis having lost the goal of true self-denial. He says: 'Sadly, à Kempis, at times, loses sight of the goal of self-denial. Instead of a fundamental reorientation of one's desires and identity with Christ's sufferings, the object of self-denial has become "perfect (self) mortification" (III 31:3).' (Cf. ZELYCK, LORNE. "An Evaluation of...", pp. 78, 81.)

⁵³ *Devotio Moderna – Basic Writings...*, p. 15.

internal attitude of conforming oneself to the mind and heart of Christ was always considered more important. This internal transformation led to greater self-emptying love and consequently a closer imitation of Christ. Within this spiritual process we have indicated that humility always had a foundational dimension. We shall now show how this spiritual process of being ‘clothed in Christ’ was understood within the Society as explained in this last part of chapter four of the GE.

10.2 THE TEXT AND ITS INTERPRETATION

The four texts ‘α’, ‘A’, ‘B’ and ‘D’ are almost verbatim. Though there are certain orthographical differences and a few phrases that have been modified from one text to another, they are rather insignificant.⁵⁴ The text is brief and succinct, but at the same time dense and profound in spiritual wisdom. The three numbers have an internal harmony and it combines high spiritual idealism with typical Ignatian realism. In explaining these numbers we shall begin by highlighting some significant features of the text and follow it with a few comments regarding the dynamics of the text. Further on we shall explain the relationship of this text with the three degrees of humility [SpEx-165-68] and finally end with a few concluding remarks.

10.2.1 THE TEXT

The text contains three numbers and the first number (nº 101) repeats the exhortation that the candidates ought ‘(to) clothe themselves’ in the ‘garb and uniform’ of Christ on two different occasions. The word ‘garb and uniform’ are words used in the translation by John Padberg. Another word used to explain the same is ‘livery’ and Aldama explains its meaning in the following manner.

Insults, affronts, false accusations, and the like constitute the ‘livery’ of Christ. ‘Livery’ was the set of identifying garments worn to distinguish the servants of one lord or prince from those of another. It was also the uniform worn at tournaments to distinguish one team of knights from another. (It was not a military term.) This explains why those who

⁵⁴ These include: a) the addition of the word ‘Christo’ (GE-101⁵) from text ‘A’ onwards; b) removal of the word ‘vera’(GE-101⁶) from text ‘B’ onwards; c) removal of the phrase ‘repentinos o inuentados del inimigo de la nuestra natura humana’ (GE-101³) from text ‘A’ onwards and finally removal of the words ‘por qualquiera’ (GE-101⁴) from text ‘A’ onwards. The changes are minor and insignificant. It could be said that the text is verbatim in all the four texts.

follow Christ 'truly' will 'love and desire intensely' to put on this livery⁵⁵

In explaining the meaning of 'garb and uniform', the text states that the candidates should – '*...desire to clothe themselves with the same garb and uniform⁵⁶ of their Lord because of the love and reverence owed to him*' (GE – 101³) and reiterates this idea by stating that the candidate ought to have a '*...desire to resemble and imitate in some manner our Creator and Lord Jesus Christ by putting on his garb and uniform, since it was for our spiritual profit that he clothed himself as he did*' (GE – 101⁵). The next number also has a reference to the invitation to put on the cloak of Christ. The candidate should be asked if he was '*determined and ready to accept and suffer with patience, with the help of God's grace, any such injuries, mockeries, and affronts entailed by the wearing of this uniform of Christ our Lord*' (GE – 102³)

The above quoted texts indicate that the reason for putting on these clothes of humiliations, poverty and insults was primarily internal - in the case of Christ it was 'for our spiritual profit' and in the case of the candidate it was 'out of love and reverence'. The internal attitude of ardently desiring humiliations and insults for the sake of Christ was dear to Ignatius and he used a *variety of words* in the beginning of this number to emphasize the importance of cultivating this internal attitude.

It is likewise very important to bring to the attention of those who are being examined, emphasizing it and giving it great weight in the sight of our Creator and Lord, to how great a degree it helps and profits in the spiritual life to abhor in its totality and not in part whatever the world loves and embraces, and to accept and desire with all possible energy whatever Christ our Lord has loved and embraced.' GE-101⁴

It must be noted that within this text there are no references to external ceremonies and the *entire focus is on an internal transformation*. The importance of the internal attitude of Christ is explained by contrasting it with the attitude of the world⁵⁷

⁵⁵ ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory Commentary...*, p. 62.

⁵⁶ Other words which signify the 'garb and uniform' would include words such as 'livery', 'garment', 'clothes' and 'robe'. Despite the fact that we have used the translation of John Padberg in this entire work, we shall be using the general word 'clothed' in this part. However in some specific moments other words will be used.

⁵⁷ Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory Commentary...*, p. 62. The internal attitude is seen in the exhortation of a doctrine which consists in love of the cross for the sake of Christ. This doctrine is proposed '*through a strong black and*

where the attitudes of the world is mentioned twice and the attitudes of Christ four times. Such was the importance of this internal attitude that Ignatius reiterates it over and over to the candidate. The following table illustrates the contrast between the world and Christ as well as the repeated emphasis in desiring to be clothed with Christ – i.e. imitating Christ.

The World	Christ
<p>...abhor in its totality and not in part whatever the <i>world</i> loves and embraces,... (GE-101¹)</p> <p>Just as the men of the <i>world</i> who follow the world love and seek with such diligence honors, fame and esteem for a great name on earth, as the world teaches them,... (GE-101²)</p>	<p>...and to accept and desire with all possible energy whatever <i>Christ our Lord</i> has loved and embraced. (GE-101¹)</p> <p>...so those who proceed spiritually and truly follow <i>Christ our Lord</i> love and intensely desire everything opposite. (GE-101³)</p> <p>... desire to suffer injuries, false accusations, and affronts, and to be held and esteemed as fools (but without their giving any occasion for this) because of their desire to resemble and imitate in some manner our <i>Creator and Lord Jesus Christ</i> (GE-101⁴⁻⁵)</p> <p>...is he determined and ready to accept and suffer with patience, with the help of God’s grace, any such injuries, mockeries, and affronts entailed by the wearing of <i>this uniform of Christ</i>... (GE-102³)</p>

One word which stands out in this text is *the word ‘desire’*. N^o 101 refers to this word six times, while n^o 102 refers to it four times. The candidate is invited to have a growing desire to be internally transformed so that the realm of humility, insults and poverty becomes second nature to the person. These desires are a gift from God and can only be received from above.⁵⁸ They are centered on the person of Christ⁵⁹ and hence the

white’ contrast between the world and Christ, between the minions of the world and the followers of Christ.’

⁵⁸ O’LEARY, BRIAN. *Sent into the...*, pp. 39-40. ‘*The question now put to the applicant is not about determination but about desires. There is a significant shift of emphasis. Ignatius has here opened up part of his soul, and he knows from his own experience that what he is seeking in the applicant can only be ‘de arriba’, that is, pure gift from God.*’

⁵⁹ The person is not invited to desire humility for its own sake, but desires it in the context of the glory to Christ. Ignatius believed that the eagerness of a higher goal, i.e. the glory to God would motivate the person to imitate the humility of Christ. (Cf. *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*, (Tr. Ganss, George.), The Institute of Jesuit Sources: St. Louis, 1970, p. 108. (fn 23))

candidate who is invited to put on the garment of Christ is asked to have the 'sum of his desires ... centered on and unified around the person of Jesus, who is loved and faithfully followed as the One and Only.'⁶⁰

The realism which characterized Ignatius' spiritual insight is visible in the subsequent point. He was fully aware that that the ideal of an imitation of Christ poor and humble could be rather difficult when it concerned a beginner. He would therefore qualify this requirement by hoping that the candidate at least had '*the desires to experience (such desires)*' (GE-102¹). The desire to have desires is in fact the prayer of the humble and is similar to the petition of those who pray for an increase in faith. This disposition would help a person to be open and disposed so that he can profit from various opportunities that emerge in life leading to a gradual increase in his desire.⁶¹ Such a desire consisted in being '*determined and ready to accept and suffer with patience ... injuries, mockeries and affronts*' (GE-102³) The candidate was expected to be at least '*sufficiently open and disposed to accept the opportunities to grow and progress along this road.*'⁶²

The realm of desire takes on a more *collective dimension* in the last number. In n^o 103, instead of using the word 'desire' Ignatius uses the word 'seek' and the candidate is invited to seek '*greater abnegation and continual mortification in all things possible*' (GE-103²). This number reiterates the fundamental nature of personal humility by emphasizing abnegation and mortification as being '*precious in the spiritual life*' (GE-103¹). However it also indicates that spiritual growth has a communitarian dimension by indicating that those responsible for the candidate should also desire to help the

⁶⁰ DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 36. A similar point is made by Corella who states that entry into the Society does not consist in one particular habit or other, but in having one's desires ordained towards totally loving and following Christ. '*El seguimiento de Jesús para quien entra en la Compañía consiste en vestirse, no de un hábito particular, sino de su librea, y en desear la locura de la cruz. Es el mundo entero de los deseos, plenamente ordenado y convergente hacia la persona de Jesús, el único amado y seguido.*' (Cf. CORELLA, JESÚS. "Primero Examen General", *Constituciones de...*, (Eds. Arzubialde, S. – Corella, J. – García Lomas, J. M.)..., p. 53.)

⁶¹ IBID. '*...si el candidato aún no siente tales deseos, desde su pobreza puede sentir al menos que no le faltan deseos de llegar a tener tales deseos. Es el deseo del aumento de fe, propio de los humildes. Y esos 'deseos de deseos' valen para entrar en la Compañía. Porque le hacen al hombre abierto y disponible para admitir y entender a fondo cuantas ocasiones le vaya ofreciendo la vida para hacerle crecer por ahí.*'

⁶² Cf. *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*, (Tr. Ganss, George.)..., p. 108.

candidate grow in the imitation of Christ poor and humble by aiding ‘...*him in those things to the extent that our Lord gives us his grace.*’ (GE-103³)

10.2.2 THE DYNAMICS OF THE TEXT

St. Ignatius concludes chapter 4 by recapitulating its message in a new way that clarifies, unifies, and gives effect to the spiritual path that he has proposed. He calls for the candidate to attach himself in his whole being to the person of Christ *poor and humble*, to Christ carrying the cross.⁶³

Corella, in his introduction to the *GE* indicates that the different part of the *GE* and the *SpEx* could be placed within the three classical ways of spiritual life – the purgative, illuminative and unitive ways. This text could be considered as belonging to the unitive way.⁶⁴ The dynamics of these three numbers have an internal harmony about them and they could be considered in the context of the ideal presented to the candidate.

Nº 101 reflects the ultimate desire of the candidate; nº 102 is more consonant with the actual aspiration of the candidate and nº 103 represents the movement towards the ideal.⁶⁵ Aldama explain the dynamic of this text in a two-step process where the first (or higher) step (nº 101) refers to the longing desire to undergo suffering, insults and humiliations and the second (or lower) step (nº 102) refers to the patient acceptance of the same.⁶⁶ Spiritual maturity would consist in at least being on the second step and then moving on to the first step.

The key to entering this spiritual dynamic which is a process of growing in perfection consists in the fact that a person makes all effort to grow in self-abnegation and continual mortification.

This passage throws light on the *creative tension* where the high spiritual idealism is complemented with human realism. While the candidate is made aware of the

⁶³ DE JAER, ANDRE. *Together...*, p. 35. The italicized words are part of the original text.

⁶⁴ Cf. CORELLA, JESÚS. *Constituciones de la Compañía...*, p. 53. According to Corella the purgative stage is the first phase of the *GE*, the experiences form the illuminative phase and this unitive phase is related to the Cross and a life in the Spirit. The unitive phase is similar to the third and fourth week of the *SpEx*.

⁶⁵ Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory...*, p. 61.

⁶⁶ *IBID.*, p. 63.

arduous nature of this enterprise and the primary dependence on the grace of God, he is also made to realize the importance of his own effort while at the same time humbly recognizing his own frailty. Though Ignatius often expressed himself in a rather complex manner, in this text we have a style which is almost lyrical.⁶⁷

Building upon the preceding texts of the chapter Ignatius ends by beautifully articulating his lofty Christocentric doctrine⁶⁸ and offering a perfect synthesis of the two standards and the three degrees of humility. This doctrine is in tune with the intense desire of the candidate who despite his condition as a fragile creature desires to totally identify with Christ poor and humble by loving and embracing all that He loved and embraced.

El número [101] es una síntesis perfecta entre los dos ejercicios de banderas y maneras de humildad, y se hace de ella la disposición óptima para que la entrada en la Compañía manifieste toda su significación real. El ritmo interno del párrafo arranca de la urgencia de aborrecer en todo y no en parte cuanto el mundo ama y abraza (repudio de la banderas de Satanás), para amar y abrazar lo que Jesús ama y abraza (adhesión a la bandera de Jesús), y acaba, en la segunda parte del párrafo (tanto que...) con un formidable crescendo afectivo, en plena tercera manera de humildad.⁶⁹

10.2.3 RELATIONSHIP WITH THE 3 DEGREES OF HUMILITY IN THE *SpEx*

Commentators are unanimous in highlighting the close relationship between this passage and the 3 degrees of humility in the *SpEx*.⁷⁰ In explaining this relationship we shall at first present the texts related to the *GE* and the *SpEx* in parallel columns. In order to better understand the dimension of love within the realm of humility we shall add the text of the *SpEx* as written by Peter and Francis Ortiz. This text offers an elaborate explanation of the meaning of the third degree of humility and its relationship with the two standards. For the sake of brevity we shall merely reproduce its first part.

⁶⁷ O'LEARY, BRIAN. *Sent Into...*, p. 39.

⁶⁸ *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*, (Tr. Ganss, George)..., p. 108, (fn 23).

⁶⁹ CORELLA, JESÚS. *Constituciones de la Compañía...*, pp. 52-53.

⁷⁰ Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO, *An Introductory...*, pp. 62-63; DÉCLOUX SIMON, "General Examen", *IOS...*, p. 142; DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 35; CORELLA, J. "Primero Examen General", *Constituciones...*, p. 52; *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus...*, (Tr. Ganss, George), pp. 107-08.

Spiritual Exercises	Text found in the writings of Peter and Francis Ortiz	General Examen
<p>{167} <i>The Third Way of Being Humble</i> is the most perfect, and consists in this. When I possess the first and second ways, and when the options equally further the praise and glory of God, <u>in order to imitate Christ our Lord better and to be more like him here and now</u>, I desire and choose <i>poverty</i> with Christ <i>poor</i> rather than wealth; <i>contempt</i> with Christ laden with it rather than honors. Even further, I desire to be <i>regarded as a useless fool</i> for Christ, who before me was regarded as such, rather than as a wise or prudent person in this world.[89]</p>	<p>The 3rd way and degree of love for God and the desire to obey, serve and imitate his divine majesty is most perfect. This includes the first and second wherein a person having a fervent love of God and desire to obey, serve and imitate His Divine Majesty... However <u>in order to imitate and be more actually like Christ our Lord</u>, one wants and chooses poverty with Christ poor more than riches, rejection and insults with Christ, rather than honor (without giving cause for it); and wanting to be estimated as a fool for Christ, because Christ was considered as such by those who put him to death rather than desiring to be considered wise or prudent by the world. ⁷¹</p>	<p>... those who proceed spiritually and <u>truly follow Christ our Lord love and intensely desire</u> ...to clothe themselves with the same garb and uniform of their Lord because of the love and reverence owed to him, to such an extent that where there would be no offense to his Divine Majesty and no imputation of sin to the neighbor, they desire to suffer injuries, false accusations, and affronts, and to be held and esteemed as fools (but without their giving any occasion for this), “because of their <u>desire to resemble and imitate in some manner our Creator and Lord Jesus Christ</u>, by putting on his garb and uniform, since it was for our spiritual profit that he clothed himself as he did.”</p>

All the three texts speak about the intense desire for poverty, insults and humiliations for the sake of imitating Christ. The interchangeability of humility and love is evident in the text of Ortiz. His text also refers to putting on the garment of humility and poverty in imitation of Christ – a garment which was worn by various other saints who appear in the Canon. Coathalem speaks about the unique angle within each of the three classical meditations before the election and goes on to say that the meditation on the 3 degrees of humility highlights the dimension of ‘humble and magnanimous love’.⁷²

⁷¹ This text is an adapted translation from the original text found in *MHSI - 100*, pp. 635-36. We have broken down the text into various sentences in order to better understand it. The original explanation of this third degree of love is rather extensive and goes on to show how this third degree is a more certain expression of love. It helps a person to be more attentive to listen and serve God. He goes on to explain that the intense love of Christ ought to move us, especially the fact that He walked in this world *wearing the garment of humility*. Such was the garment worn by other saints who appear in the canon and are presented to us as models worthy of emulation.. ‘...*que anduvo en este mundo con la librea de tal estado, y la dio a sus muy amados apóstoles, y la voluntad della dio a todos los mártires, de los cuales algunos en el canon de la misa nos propone la Yglesia...*’

⁷² COATHELEM, HERVE. *A Guide to the Complete Spiritual Exercises*, Kuangchi Press: Taichung, 1961, p. 178. According to Coathalem, the two standards emphasize safety and effectiveness, the three classes of persons emphasize sincerity and

The apostolic effectiveness expected of the candidate as articulated in these numbers is possible by having the attitude of the third degree of humility – an attitude which emerges from a profound gratitude and manifests itself in generous apostolic service. Uniting the mysticism of service with this attitude of humility Coathalem says that:

Perhaps it will be useful to point out that the practice of the third degree does not demand any spectacular and rare conditions in order to be realized. It consists rather in cultivating, in generous apostolic service, a definitive tendency to choose quiet self-effacement and privations when one is free to accept them. This is a possibility most of the time, and for all men. If one strives for it, he will thereby be prepared for the exceptional occasions; if he does not, such occasions will either be neglected, or will run the risk of being contaminated by a secret feeling of vain complacency.⁷³

Just as the attitude of the third degree of humility was presented as a condition before making an election, in the same manner such an attitude was expected of a candidate before entering into the Society of Jesus.⁷⁴ This desire which Ignatius repeatedly emphasizes in the text is an essential attitude for making an election and a candidate is invited to desire such an attitude in its totality and not in part.⁷⁵ While there is general consensus that the text of the *GE* and the third degree of humility is similar to each other, Aldama highlights the fact that in the *GE* there is no mention of the poverty and the text limits itself to speaking about ‘injuries, false accusations, affronts, esteemed as fools and mockeries.’ (*GE-101⁴; 102³*) However this is explained by the fact that a life of poverty is presumed in the case of a person who enters the Society of Jesus and hence the focus is on combating the danger of honour and pride.⁷⁶

10.2.4 INTERPRETATIONS OF THE EARLY COMPANION AND GCs

Considering the importance of having an intense desire to imitate Christ poor and

integrity and the three modes of humility, humble and magnimous love.

⁷³ *IBID.*, p. 181.

⁷⁴ CORELLA, JESÚS. ““Primer Examen General”, *Constituciones...*, p. 52. ‘El deseo de identificación con Jesús encuentra su expresión perfecta en la tercera manera de humildad de los Ejercicios. Así como ella es, en los Ejercicios, la más deseable actitud interior para la elección, aquí es la más deseable actitud para entrar en la Compañía.’

⁷⁵ Cf. DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 35.

⁷⁶ Aldama quotes Fr. Gil González Dávila (GONZÁLEZ DÁVILA, GIL. *Pláticas sobre las reglas*, Barcelona, 1964, pp. 232-33.) in stating that the candidate is expected to free and detached from everything and all that remains for them is to wage war on this enemy, honor and self-esteem. (Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory...*, p. 63.)

humble, the spirit of this text has been commented upon from the very beginning. In the *Pláticas* of Nadal we see that the vocation of Jesuit is to follow the suffering Christ within the context of the Church.⁷⁷ He underlines the fact that one who affectively embraces ignominy for the sake of Christ in effect clothes himself with Christ. Speaking of an intense desire for ignominy he says:

Hay que notar que nosotros deseamos seguir a Cristo y ello religiosamente; pero no en sí sino en la Iglesia. Pues no es sólo la cruz, los trabajos, las fieras, sino si son con ignominia; pues así padeció Cristo. Por ello cualquiera de nosotros esto debe sobre todo procurar, rechazar también todo lo que es del mundo; y lo que le es contrario abrazarlo con todo el afecto. Pues en esto se hace semejante a Cristo y se toma parecida librea por vestido.⁷⁸

Layneze while explaining this text in 1559 recalled that he did not understand the meaning of desiring insults. Ignatius responded by saying that if he could not desire it, at least he ought to have a desire to desire insults. He went on to explain that insults and humiliations have three positive effects: a) they energize, b) heal and c) strengthen. The desire for such insults comes from two kinds of knowledges which include: a) knowing and hating oneself and b) knowing and loving God.⁷⁹

Moving on to the GCs we shall limit ourselves to some texts found within contemporary GCs that took place after the Second Vatican Council. GC31 reiterated the relationship between self-denial (nº 103) and an imitation of Christ. It stated that ‘formation in self-denial will be more authentic the more closely the novices follow in the footsteps of Christ who took the form of a servant.’ [GC 31: 8/20] GC 34 situates the personal vocation as well as the mission of the Society within the Crucified and Risen Lord. [GC 34: 1/9; 2/6] In speaking of a deep personal love for Christ it states that the

⁷⁷ *Las Pláticas del P. Jerónimo Nadal*, (Ed. Lop Sebastià, Miguel), Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2011, p.106. The ecclesial dimension is underlined by Nadal in his 2nd *Plática* in Roma where he says: ‘...el fundamento de nuestra Compañía es Jesucristo crucificado, de modo que así como él con la cruz redimió al género humano y todo los días padece aflicciones y cruces en su Cuerpo Místico que es la Iglesia, así aquel que pertenece a nuestra Compañía no puede proponerse otra cosa que por muchas persecuciones, siguiendo a Cristo, procure la salvación de las almas con el mismo Cristo...’

⁷⁸ *IBID.*, p. 76.

⁷⁹ He elaborated this by giving the example of medicine which is bitter and hated by a person but is taken out love for the health of the body. While he admits that we generally love the body in an ordered manner, there are moments when it rebels and hence it would be better to start living a ordered life at this moment rather than waiting for the last minute. (Cf. DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. “Esortazioni...”, p. 177.)

inspiration of the Society's origin and the Jesuit's vocation has always been an experience of the redeeming love of God which has been gratuitously received. Jesuits from the time of Ignatius have turned towards the Crucifix with remorse, gratitude and astonishment and made a total self-offering of themselves for His mission. [GC 34: 26/4] An authentic response to Christ would necessarily bring the Society and every Jesuit face to face with the culture of self-love and result in humiliation, persecution and even death.

Today we bring this countercultural gift of Christ to a world beguiled by self-centered human fulfillment, extravagance, and soft living, a world that prizes prestige, power and self-sufficiency. In such a world, to preach Christ poor and humble with fidelity and courage is to expect humiliation, persecution and even death. [GC 34 – 26/5]

The last GC, (GC 35) has emphatically pointed out to the need of an intimate union with Christ by engaging in a life of loving humble service. It starts off by underlining the importance of an intimate union with Christ as the secret of an authentic success of one's apostolic and missionary commitment. [GC 35: 1/2] The transformative call to be with Christ poor and humble is an ongoing invitation. It is 'not merely a foundation laid in the past and ignored as times moves on: it is alive, ongoing, nourished and deepened by dynamic Jesuit life in community and mission. The experience involves both conversion from and conversion for.' [GC 35: 2/4] The internal imitation of Christ is reiterated in various texts where a modern understanding of following Christ carrying the Cross is offered in D.2. [GC 35: 2/12-15]. Christ's self-emptying love manifested in poverty and humility offers the Jesuit a pattern in order to live the charism of apostolic service.

The Son's way of acting provides the pattern of how we must act in the service of his mission. Jesus preached the Reign of God; indeed it was given with his very presence. And he showed himself as having come into the world not to do his own will but to do the will of his Father in heaven. Jesus' entire life was a kenosis, and he approached situations by self-forgetfulness, seeking not to be served, but to serve, and to give his life as a ransom for many. Thus incarnation and paschal mystery unfold in his life pattern; his life pattern will be ours also when we join with him. As companions with him on mission, his way is our way. [GC 35: 2/14]

The invitation to internally configure oneself with Christ is another expression

whereby the candidate is invited to put on the garment of Christ. While speaking about the theological aspects of obedience, the Congregation invited the Jesuits to have the same mind as Christ Jesus and to clothe themselves with the same garb and uniform of Christ. [GC 35: 4/9] The decree would further indicate that given the reality of sin and injustice, ‘some degree of participation in Jesus’ kenosis will never be absent from our lives.’ [GC 35: 4/15] The dimension of poverty, humility, self-emptying love, kenosis and internal transformation was also stressed by Pope Benedict XVI,⁸⁰ the Prefect of the Congregation for Religious Life - Cardinal Rodé⁸¹ and the Superior General of the Society of Jesus, Fr. Adolfo Nicolás.⁸²

10.2.5 CONCLUDING REMARKS

In concluding a textual analysis of this part we would like to say that the totality of self-giving is strongly stressed by Ignatius. The generosity which is expected of the candidate to enter the Society is expected to be in its ‘*totality and not in part.*’ (GE – 101¹) This generosity ought to express itself in a twin dimension of abhorrence and acceptance whereby one is called to ‘*abhor ...whatever the world love and embraces and to accept and desire with all possible energy whatever Christ our Lord has loved and embraced.*’ (GE – 101¹) The candidate is expected to make a decisive break with the world by having a negative attitude⁸³ towards the self-seeking dynamic of the world and open up to a self-emptying dynamic of Christ.

⁸⁰ (Ed.) PADBERG, JOHN W. *Jesuit Life & Mission Today...*, p. 825. ‘It is therefore natural that whoever wishes to make himself a companion of Jesus, really share the love of the poor.’

⁸¹ IBID., p. 807. ‘The service of the Society is a service “under the banner of the Cross”. Every service done out of love necessarily implies a self-emptying, a kenosis. But letting go of what one wants to do in order to do what the beloved wants is to transform the kenosis into the image of Christ who learned obedience through suffering. It is for this reason that St. Ignatius, realistically, adds that the Jesuit serves the Church ‘under the banner of the Cross.’

⁸² The Superior General while speaking about the transformative dimension of faith stressed on the internal transformative dimension of the Christian faith. He says: ‘Salvation consists in interior change, in interior transformation. Ignatian pastoral care, based on the Spiritual Exercises, consists precisely in helping people to change interiorly. From this interior change of heart comes the change in feet, hands, service, work and love for others.’ (Cf. IBID., p. 830.)

⁸³ Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory...*, p. 62. There does not seem to be a judgment of value regarding the world, but only a practical attitude of being negatively inclined to the ‘world’ and positively inclined to ‘Christ’. ‘Ignatius notes the importance of a decisively negative attitude toward the first tendency: “to abhor [or withdraw from], wholly and not partially, all that the world loves and embraces.” The break with the world is something already decided on right from the beginning of this chapter.’

Authentic generosity is seen in the ability to conform one's life to the spirit of the third degree of humility. The life of Christ manifested such a spirit and it can be said that such a spirit is a decisive condition for spiritual growth.⁸⁴ This spirit consists in a passionate love for the Cross and an affective attachment to the person of Christ poor and humble who continues to be present our contemporary world. Only by having the spirit of the third degree of humility would it possible for a person to truly discern and be faithful to the will of God.⁸⁵

Ignatius' exhortation is clearly Pauline in nature⁸⁶ and is based on the experience of his entire life. An entire life of constant movement towards greater union with God through an ever increasing imitation of Christ is exemplified in this passage.⁸⁷ The next point will indicate his spiritual process of being progressively clothed in Christ whereby the internal transformation led to a continuous growth in devotion. (*Au 99⁷⁻⁹*) The centrality of humility in this process of internal transformation from self-love to self-emptying love will be elaborated by highlighting the transformative spiritual process of Ignatius who increasingly grew in '*being clothed in Christ*'.

10.3 IGNATIUS' SPIRITUAL PROCESS OF '*BEING CLOTHED IN CHRIST*'

Ignatius' spiritual process of '*being clothed in Christ*' was a life-long process and we shall try to show this process by using the schema offered by Bernard Lonergan.⁸⁸ We shall begin with some preliminary remarks about the external and internal

⁸⁴ Cf. DECLoux SIMON, "General Examen", *IOS...*, p. 142.

⁸⁵ Cf. *IBID.*

⁸⁶ Cf. CORELLA, JESÚS. "'Primero Examen General", *Constituciones...*, p. 75. Corrella in a footnote regarding the phrase '*vestirse de la misma vestidura y librea*' (*GE 101³*) speaks about understanding this phrase metaphorically where one personalizes the sentiments, attitudes and behavior of Christ. He also makes his own the humiliation and self-emptying of Christ. Regarding the above mentioned phrase he states that: '*...es una expresión metafórica, que significa hacer propios los sentimientos, actitudes y comportamientos del Señor en lo que es distintivo y característico suyo, su humillación y anonadamiento en su forma de esclavo. Es, además, una expresión de claras resonancias paulinas; cfr. Fil 2,5-8; Rom 13,14; Gal 3,27; Ef 4,24.*)

⁸⁷ *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus...*, (Tr. Ganss, George), p. 108.

⁸⁸ Bernard Lonergan (1904-84) was a Jesuit priest who was born in Canada and taught at Regis College from 1947 to 1953 and the Gregorian University from 1953 to 1964. He was a philosopher and theologian and was influenced by Augustine, Newman, Plato and Thomas Aquinas. Some of his important works include *Insight: A Study of Human Understanding* (1957); *Method in Theology* (1972); *De Deo Trino* (1964) and *De Verbo Incarnato* (1960).

transformation of Ignatius as seen in the *Autobiography*. This will be followed by explaining Ignatius’ desire to grow in self-transcendence and authenticity as elaborated by Lonergan. The realization of this desire in terms of actual spiritual growth shall be explained within the framework of the Transcendental Method. Subsequently we shall explain the three kinds of Conversions in the life of Ignatius.⁸⁹ Finally we shall conclude with some remarks about the spiritual process of union with God through a life of humility and self-emptying love.

10.3.1 THE EXTERNAL AND INTERNAL TRANSFORMATION OF IGNATIUS IN THE ‘AUTOBIOGRAPHY’

The internal and external process in the life of Ignatius as seen in the *Autobiography* is part of an ancient tradition of transformation and is arduous in nature.⁹⁰ Within the twin realities of internal and external dimensions of transformation we find decreasing importance to external clothing and increasing importance of internal transformation. The spiritual itinerary of Ignatius reveals this difference clearly wherein we see that the call to be ‘clothed in Christ’ is primarily an invitation to be internally transformed.

The changing emphasis in the life of Ignatius as well as his companions as articulated in the *Autobiography* can be divided into three stages: a) the initial conversion and choice of attire; b) the functional role of attire during his journeys and c) transformation and attire in his companions. Finally we shall briefly highlight the

⁸⁹ The breadth of Lonergan’s writings are enormous and we would not be able to do justice to his profound works. Therefore we shall restrict ourselves to his Transcendental Method and the different kinds of conversions. These two points are in order to have a more thorough understanding of the spiritual process of Ignatius as well as to see the different elements that formed part of the overall transformation in the life of Ignatius. While there are other theories of different psychologists and philosophers which help us understand the spiritual process of an individual, we believe that the Transcendental Method and types of Conversions elaborated by Lonergan provide a theologically sound and coherent explanation of Ignatius’ spiritual process of moving from self-love to self-emptying love.

⁹⁰ The process of transformation had been elaborated by philosophers from earliest times and took place in conversation with others. ‘*The awakening of one’s consciousness and the gradual ascent to a level of being that one can most effectively reach in a person-to person struggle.*’ Connor places the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius within this tradition. Quoting Lonergan he goes on to say that the process of being able to paying attention to the operations of consciousness is not a simple process, and requires a great deal of exertion and activity. (Cf. CONNOR, JAMES L. *The Dynamism of Desire of Bernard J.F. Lonergan, S.J., on The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius of Loyola*, The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 2006, pp. 26, 31.)

ongoing nature of internal transformation as seen in the life of Ignatius.

10.3.1.1 Introductory remarks

The initial conversion of Ignatius was accompanied by a change of external attire. However in the course of time he would realize that the acceptance of the garb of a pilgrim did not make him an actual pilgrim – rather it consisted in the commencement of an extremely difficult process which would last his entire lifetime.⁹¹ This realization would set in motion a difficult but liberating process of internal transformation whereby his inner realm was transformed from being oriented towards immediate gratification towards an orientation which was drawn towards true value and ultimate worth.⁹² With the passage of time he became more conscious, critical and realistic. Slowly he would realize that external change that was merely ephemeral as against a far more complex process of internal transformation.⁹³

10.3.1.2 The initial conversion and choice of attire

The chronological sequence of events in the life of Ignatius reveals that internal transformation took place before its external manifestation. Ignatius' process of interiorization began as he was able to engage in a second level of reflection on two different kinds of thoughts that occupied his mind during his convalescence in Loyola. (*Au 8¹⁻⁵*) The internal change continued to be manifest in his heightened scrupulosity as seen in the response to his brother regarding his future plans 'without departing from the truth.' (*Au 12⁸*)

⁹¹ Speaking of the life-long endeavor of self-transcendence Vernon Gregson says that '*only after many years of development does there emerge the sustained self-transcendence of the virtuous person.*' (Cf. CONN, WALTER E. "II. The Desire for Authenticity: Conscience and Moral Conversion", *The Desires of the Human Heart – An Introduction to the Theology of Bernard Lonergan*, (Ed. Gregson, Vernon), Paulist Press: New York, 1988, p. 49.)

⁹² Given a choice the human person generally tends to one's own self-interest. He will choose what is immediately satisfying and not what is most valuable. This tendency leads one to make choices which are immediately gratifying rather than on the basis of what is ultimately worthwhile. (Cf. *IBID.*, pp. 30, 33.)

⁹³ According to Tad Dunne, the human mind is pulled towards activism or unthinking obedience. These pulls do not refer to different persons within a group, but to two processes within a single person. This problem can be met with a realistic critical mind which has to engage in the hard work of helping the person become more sensitive of two things: a) one's true feelings and b) various kinds of biases that form part of the very structure of consciousness. (Cf. DUNNE, TAD. *Lonergan and Spirituality – Towards a Spiritual Integration*, Loyola University Press: Chicago, 1985, pp. 8, 48, 94.) Lonergan dwells at length on various biases in his book, *Insights*.

This process continued during his journey to Montserrat and his conversation with the Moor reveals that his instinctual reaction was slowly being replaced with a reflexive process. Instead of immediately reacting to the arguments of the Moor he chose to engage in a second level of reflection. This led him to refrain himself from giving vent to his natural aggressive and instinctual behaviour. (*Au 16¹⁻³*)

Ignatius expressed his internal transformation at Loyola in an external manner on his way to Montserrat. He desired to proceed to Jerusalem as a pilgrim and therefore bought an appropriate attire in a large town before Montserrat.⁹⁴ On reaching Montserrat (March, 1522) and after ‘stripping off all his garments... he dressed himself in his chosen attire and went to kneel before the altar of our Lady.’ (*Au. 18¹*) The change in clothing coincided with greater compassion towards others where he wept on seeing that the beggar who had been the beneficiary of his earlier garments was wrongly accused of having stolen them. (*Au 18⁶*) The external change of garments would be the precursor of ‘great changes in his soul’. (*Au 21¹*) It led him to a growing awareness of the importance of internal transformation - an awareness which would be confirmed through various experiences throughout his life.

The horizon that emerged with his experience at Loyola would be radically challenged in Manresa. At Manresa a new horizon would emerge where he would learn the absolute nature of internal transformation as against the relative nature of external transformation. The desire to imitate and supersede the saints was a driving force in Ignatius and hence he began to disregard his external appearance. (*Au 19²⁻³*) He engaged in external activities which one associates with holiness and these included Mass, Vespers, Compline, reading the Passion at Mass (*Au 20⁵*), seven hours of prayer on his knees, getting up regularly at midnight (*Au 23³*) and intense fasting. (*Au 25¹*) The failure of these activities (*Au 25⁶*) led him to realize the fundamental value of an internal transformation which was based on an experience of the gratuitous and loving self-gift

⁹⁴ In keeping with his decision ‘he bought cloth from which sacks are usually made, loosely woven and very prickly. Then he ordered a long garment to be made from it, reaching to his feet. He bought a pilgrim’s staff and a small gourd and put everything in front by the mule’s saddle.’ (*Au 16⁵*)

of God. (*Au 25⁶*) All that one had to do was to receive this gift of unrestricted love in all humility and live as a being-in-love in the service of others.

10.3.1.3 The functional role of attire during his journeys

The period after his conversion in Manresa to the formation of a stable group in Paris has reference to clothes and garments. As far as Ignatius was concerned, they primarily referred to his attire in terms of protecting him from the vagaries of nature. In Manresa, the women who attended to him 'made him dress up and wear shoes and cover his head; ...they made him use two brown jackets of very coarse cloth and a cap of the same, something like a beret.' (*Au 34⁴*) During his return journey from Jerusalem, he was poorly clothed. He 'had no clothing other than some breeches of coarse cloth – knee length and legs bare – with shoes and a doublet of black cloth, opened by many slashes at the shoulders, and a jacket that was short and quite thin'. (*Au 49⁸*) On reaching Venice, he felt great cold and was given 'a piece of cloth, which he folded many times and put over his stomach because of the great cold.' (*Au 50²*)

From a situation of incongruence between his internal and external world at Manresa, we find a growing harmony during the period of his journey to Jerusalem and back. His attire corresponded in greater measure to the internal attitude of poverty and humility. His decision not to take any money during the journey (*Au 36⁹; 40⁵⁻⁶; 50⁴⁻⁶*) corresponded with the inner disposition of a poor man who trusts in the providence of God. An important indicator of this change was the incident of being stripped by soldiers on the road from Ferrara to Genoa. When the soldiers laid hold of him and took him to the captain, he had 'some sort of impression of when Christ was led away... (As) he was led through three main streets, he went without any sadness, but rather with joy and satisfaction.' (*Au 52¹⁻²*) This incident reveals the ongoing presence of an existential dichotomy between his external apparel and internal state. Though there was a certain degree of internal harmony, a degree of dissonance can also be seen. Though he joyfully identified with Christ who was being led to religious and civil authorities, he also realized that he was afraid 'of the tortures they might inflict.' (*Au 52⁴*) The ability to be aware of this dichotomy reveals the presence of substantial internal progress from a

spiritual point of view. He would have to go through many more experiences so that the internal transformation would be mature in order to truly bear witness to Christ.

10.3.1.4 The attire of his companions

The internal transformation in Ignatius during this time can be seen in a growing inclination ‘to study for some time so he would be able to help souls.’ (*Au 50*³) Besides the varied apostolic activities in Barcelona he also began to gather a group of companions who would be with him in Alcalá and Salamanca.⁹⁵ This desire to help others was evident in Alcalá where despite the controversy caused by their attire, Ignatius engaged in ‘giving spiritual exercises, teaching Christian doctrine (*Au 57*²) and aiding the poor. (*Au 57*⁶; *57*⁸) The internal transformation had made Ignatius bold in confronting ecclesiastical authorities (*Au 59*²; *66*¹) and at the same time humble enough to be docile and obedient to the decisions of the appropriate authorities. (*Au 63*³; *70*⁴)

At the beginning of his stay in Paris, some individual who were given the Spiritual Exercises experienced a conversion in their lives. These included Peralta, the bachelor Castro and Amador. (*Au 77*¹) The *Autobiography* indicates that they ‘were quite transformed’ (*Au 77*¹), but does not make explicit reference to an external change of attire. The group of Alcalá which went out in an attire that attracted the attention of others was not to survive and Ignatius offers details about the ultimate failure of the group. (*Au 80*¹⁻¹⁰) Of the first group at Paris, Ignatius informs us that Castro had become a Carthusian monk. (*Au 90*³)⁹⁶ The *Autobiography* makes no reference to the other two. During a later period, Ignatius was to have two illustrious roommates, Peter Faber and

⁹⁵ The attire of Ignatius and his companions would be the cause of conflict in Alcalá. He as well as Arteaga, Calixto, Cáceres and Little John went about barefoot and in the same habit. Figueroa the vicar told them that ‘since they were not religious, it did not seem right for them to go about all in the same habit.’ (*Au 58*⁵) Ignatius was also ordered to wear shoes and not move about barefoot. (*Au 59*³) Ignatius was placed in jail, and after 42 days as he was being set free, he was told that ‘they should dress like other students, and should not speak about matters of faith until they had studied for four more years...’ (*Au 62*⁵) During the short sojourn at Salamanca, the dress of Calixto who ‘wore a short tunic and a large hat on his head, with a staff in his hand and boots almost halfway up the leg’ (*Au 66*²) caught the attention of the Dominican friar.

⁹⁶ Of the first group, Little John became a Franciscan. Of the second group, Peralta was canon of the cathedral of Toledo from 1534 to 1554. Regarding Amador, there is no further information. (GEGER, BARTON T. “The ‘First’ First Companions”, *Studies* – 44/2, 2012, pp. 11-13.)

Francis Xavier. The *Autobiography* does not make any reference to any immediate change of external attire. However the interior transformation was so great that they would engage in heroic works for the glory of God and ultimately be raised to the altars as saints of the Church.

10.3.1.5 Growing internal transformation

Towards the latter part of the *Autobiography* Ignatius makes no references to the external attire that was worn by him or his companions. However there are frequent references to an internal transformation leading to greater humility and self-emptying love. This internal attitude manifested itself externally when Ignatius and the companions of Paris engaged in apostolic activities in Azpeitia (*Au* 87⁷), Bologna (*Au* 91⁴⁻⁶), Venice (*Au* 94⁴⁻⁵) and Rome (*Au* 98^{1-2, 11}).

An overview of this period reveals a spiritually mature Ignatius who had been transformed from desiring to engage in a self-centered enterprise with a spiritual façade towards an authentic internal transformation leading to a genuine commitment for the glory of God. He grew in understanding the collaborative nature (*Au* 85²; 95¹⁻²) of discipleship and the need of living his calling within the ecclesial dimension. Ignatius had matured during these years in understanding the relative importance of external attire as against the fundamental importance of an inner transformation of desire.⁹⁷ A radical transformation of his desire had taken place and he was affectively influenced so as to progressively empty himself for the sake of Christ through a life long commitment to humble loving service.

10.3.2 AUTHENTICITY AND SELF-TRANSCENDENCE

The first point has given us a brief overview of the internal and external transformation in the life of Ignatius. The *Autobiography* has revealed to us the centrality of internal

⁹⁷ Cf. CONN, WALTER E. *The Desiring Self – Rooting Pastoral Counseling and Spiritual Direction in Self-Transcendence*, Paulist Press: New York, 1988, p. 121. Explaining the phenomena of a transformation of desire, Walter Conn says: ‘Transformation of desire (is) a turning from desire for possession to desire for generosity. It is a reorientation from the possessiveness rooted in obsessive concern for one’s own needs to a self-giving in intimate love of others. ...this transformation lies at the living centre of Christian experience.’

transformation against the secondary nature of external appearances. An attentive reflection on his internal process allowed him to grow in self-transcendence and authenticity. These in turn gave meaning to his life and made him a fit instrument who would glorify God and participate in the establishment of God’s Kingdom. Let us now elaborate the understanding of authenticity and self-transcendence as indicated by Bernard Lonergan.

Lonergan begins his point on self-transcendence with a bold statement – ‘Man achieves authenticity in self-transcendence.’⁹⁸ This statement holds true when we look at the spiritual process in the life of Ignatius. Given the fact that self-transcendence is the key to authenticity, it could be said that self-love is the indicator of a flawed existence. A person can be limited to a horizon which does not go beyond the world of senses. Such an existence would make one limited as one more species of the animal kingdom. However beyond the realm of the senses, a person has the capacity of questioning and this capacity is unrestricted. In explaining the process of transcendence, Lonergan highlights various levels of questioning and relates them to differing levels of transcendence – cognitive, moral and loving.

10.3.2.1 Cognitive, Moral and Religious Self-Transcendence

Cognitive Self-Transcendence: The cognitive level of self-transcendence consists in questions for intelligence and these are followed by questions for reflection.

First there are *questions for intelligence*. We ask what and why and how and what for. Our answers unify and relate, classify and construct, serialize and generalize. ...On questions for intelligence follow *question for reflection*. We move beyond imagination and guess-work, idea and hypothesis, theory and system, to ask whether or not this really is so or that really could be. Now self-transcendence takes on a new meaning. Not only does it go beyond the subject but also it seeks what is independent of the subject. ...Still such self-transcendence is only cognitive. It is in the order not of doing but only of knowing.⁹⁹

Moral Self-Transcendence: It takes place ‘on the final level of *questions for deliberations*’. The questions are in order to deliberate on the objective value and

⁹⁸ MT, p. 104. (MT refers to LONERGAN, BERNARD. *Method in Theology*, Darton, Longman & Todd: London, 1971.)

⁹⁹ MT, p. 104.

goodness of some reality and do not depends on personal sensible feelings or experience. A person is able to grasp the objective moral value of something and live by the answers. Moral transcendence is manifest in the 'possibility of benevolence and beneficence, of honest collaboration and true love, of swinging completely out of the habitat of an animal and of becoming a person in a human society.'¹⁰⁰

Loving Self-Transcendence: Self-transcendence at a cognitive and moral level prepares a person for actual self-transcendence where a person's 'capacity becomes an actuality... (and one) becomes being-in-love.' The actualization of this capacity takes place by falling in love and such a state has its own process in terms of 'antecedents, its causes, its conditions (and) its occasions.' Once love is the foundation of self-transcendence, it influences the totality of the person and is 'the first principle... (from which) flow one's desires and fears, one's joys and one's sorrows, one's discernment of values, one's decisions and deeds.' Loving self-transcendence is of three types: a) love of intimacy, love of one's fellow humans and love of God.¹⁰¹

God's love is the foundation of loving self-transcendence. Loving self-transcendence goes beyond the point of questioning for intelligence, for reflection and deliberation and actualizes one's capacity for self-transcendence. The experience of being gratuitously loved by God enlightens human knowing and opens up new horizons.¹⁰² It leads to authentic fulfilment resulting in joy, peace and love. A rejection of such love and refusal to participate in loving self-transcendence leads to depredations, misery and despair.

¹⁰⁰ MT, p. 104.

¹⁰¹ MT, p. 105. '*Being-in-love is of different kinds. There is the love of intimacy, of husband and wife, or parents and children. There is the love of one's fellow men with its fruit in the achievement of human welfare. There is the love of God with one's whole heart and whole soul, with all one's mind and all one's strength. It is God's love flooding our hearts through the Holy Spirit given to us (Rom. 5,5).*' Love of one's fellow men could be the out of a desire of human welfare, but as Lonergan points out could also be the fruit of fulfillment because of being in love with God.

¹⁰² The unrestricted love of God is a free gift and is not the outcome of human knowing. Unlike other forms of knowledge which leads to love, God 's loves enlightens human knowing and opens up new horizons. The '*love of God transvalues our values and the eyes of love transforms our knowing.*' (MT, p. 106) Such love transforms the human person leading to '*a conscious and dynamic state of love, joy, peace and manifests itself in acts of kindness, goodness, fidelity, gentleness and self-control. (Gal. 5,22)*' (MT, p. 106)

Being in love with God is the basic fulfilment of our conscious intentionality.¹⁰³ That fulfilment brings a deep-set joy that can remain despite humiliations, failure, privation, pain, betrayal, desertion. That fulfilment brings a radical peace, the peace that the world cannot give. That fulfilment bears fruit in a love of one’s neighbour that strives mightily to bring about the kingdom of God on this earth. On the other hand, the absence of that fulfilment opens the way to the trivialization of human life in the pursuit of fun, to the harshness of human life arising from the ruthless exercise of power, to despair about human welfare springing from the conviction that the universe is absurd.¹⁰⁴

Ignatius’ fundamental experience was an experience of God invading his heart and soul and flooding his heart with a love which was unrestricted in nature.¹⁰⁵ Such an experience led to a life-long response of loving self-transcendence which was unwilling to set personal limits of any kind.¹⁰⁶ The acceptance of God’s gift of love was the beginning of a journey of authenticity and self-transcendence. With the passage of time Ignatius would learn to distinguish more clearly the difference between a false self and authentic self. He would discover that in the process of growing in authenticity, each small step of surrender was important.¹⁰⁷

10.3.2.2 Authenticity and transcendental precepts

Ignatius’ journey of growing in authenticity was intimately linked to the four

¹⁰³ Lonergan explains the meaning of ‘being in love with God’ in the next point related to Religious Experience. He says ‘*Being in love with God, as experienced, is being in love in an unrestricted fashion. All love is self-surrender, but being in love with God is being in love without limits or qualifications or conditions or reservations. Just as unrestricted questioning is our capacity for self-transcendence, so being in love in an unrestricted fashion is the proper fulfilment of that capacity.*’ MT, pp. 105-06.

¹⁰⁴ MT, p. 105.

¹⁰⁵ ‘...we experience God’s love in a context of unrestricted. ...that is the heartbeat of genuine religion (and) sets up a new horizon. It resets our values and alters our knowing.’ (CARMODY, DENISE LARDNER. “The Desire for Transcendence: Religious Conversion”, *The Desires of the Human Heart...*, p. 61.)

¹⁰⁶ ‘*During the months at Manresa, God invaded the heart and soul and mind of Iñigo and the mystical invasion culminated in a sudden and extraordinary peak experience at the river Cardoner. What basically happened was that Ignatius became unmistakable aware that he was loved by God.*’ The desire which emerged from such a spiritual experience of being loved unconditionally was the driving force for Ignatius all through his life. He realized that this was a grace whereby he grew in surrendering himself to the vivifying action of the Holy Spirit. (Cf. CONNOR, JAMES L. *The Dynamism of Desire...*, pp. 13, 37.)

¹⁰⁷ Conn in speaking about the difference between the true self and false self would explain that the true self exists as the highest level of responsible existential consciousness whereby one reaches out of oneself. On the other hand the false self remains trapped in one’s subjective reality and is incapable of loving others. He further states that when we find our true selves we find God. At the same time loving others in an authentic manner is a way of genuinely loving ourselves too. (Cf. CONN, WALTER E. *The Desiring Self...*, pp. 75, 78-80, 131.)

transcendental precepts of being attentive, intelligent, reasonable and responsible. Though not articulated as such in the form of a rules and schemas, the itinerary of his spiritual life which commenced through an experience of God's love, manifested this dynamic process.¹⁰⁸ This process consisted in various ethical and existential tensions and Ignatius realized through his own experience, the futility of depending on the soft mediations of symbols. Only on being able to go beyond the external dimension of symbols and have an insight into the meaning that the symbol contained was he able to grow in authenticity and self-transcendence.¹⁰⁹

Authenticity was manifest through the growing self-transcendence in the life of Ignatius as seen in a progressive cognitive, moral, affective and religious self-transcendence.¹¹⁰ The change in Ignatius was not something spectacular and other worldly. Rather the in-built internal structure by which he was construed was transformed by the grace of God so that his existence became more authentic. As he grew in dynamic intentionality the built-in faculties of experiencing, understanding, judging and action helped him transcend his self-love so that he could progressively empty himself for the sake of others through a life of apostolic service.¹¹¹

Ignatius embarked upon the journey of self-transcendence in Loyola. He desired to resolve the internal tension by becoming a pilgrim. Slowly he would learn that spiritual maturity consists in being able to experience the 'self as unity in tension'.¹¹² He would realize that genuine self-transcendence consists in existentially living the twin

¹⁰⁸ Dunne indicates that the first three transcendental precepts of being attentive, intelligent and reasonable are related to the realm of knowing. On the moral level there is the precept of being responsible. *'The four precepts make up the fundamental processes going on in us that make us authentic human being.'* (Cf. DUNNE, TAD. *Loneragan and Spirituality...*, p. 60.)

¹⁰⁹ Cf. *IBID.*, p. 64.

¹¹⁰ Cf. CONN, WALTER E. *The Desiring Self...*, p. 78. Conn gives us the example of Thomas Merton who rose to the heights of self-transcendence through the four conversions mentioned above.

¹¹¹ Cf. CONNOR, JAMES L. *The Dynamism of Desire...*, pp. 32-33, 35. The process of self-transcendence is a process within the person who has been graced by God. The very faculties of a person oriented towards self-love are transformed towards self-emptying love because Ignatius believed that a person can *'...with God's grace, transcend self-centred desires and reach out toward human authenticity and genuine Christian holiness.'* Conner goes on to say that the *'dynamic structure and inbuilt laws are you yourself, in your spiritual reality, your potentiality, what you are open to: being fully in love with God.'*

¹¹² Cf. CONN, WALTER E. *The Desiring Self...*, p. 68.

dimension of self-realization and self-denial – not for one’s personal gratification but for the sake of the other.

Self-transcendence, incorporating both authentic self-realization and genuine self-denial, embodies the radical dynamism of the Christian spiritual life. Through self-transcendence the self is not sacrificed, but realized in its authentic being. But the realization of the true self in its drive for meaning, truth, value, and love rejects any self-centered striving for happiness through fulfilment, requiring that one empty oneself (even losing one’s life) in the loving service of the neighbour. Self-transcendence, then, insists on the paradoxical view that authentic self-realization results not from an attempt to fulfil one’s wishes, but from a movement beyond oneself in an effort to bring about the good of others.¹¹³

Ignatius grew in understanding the internal dynamism of a human person and was more and more convinced that self-love was doomed to failure, while loving self-transcendence was true and lasting. He also realized that loving self-transcendence was a personal process which was at the same time necessarily relational and radically interpersonal.¹¹⁴ Ignatius discovered that apparent common-sense solutions were not enough to respond to the profound existential questions that troubled society. There was a constant call to be rooted in the unrestricted love of God, transcend one’s destructive self-love and move towards greater transcendental love – a process which continuously entailed a painful but fulfilling emptying of oneself.¹¹⁵

10.3.3 TRANSCENDENTAL METHOD¹¹⁶ IN LONERGAN AND IGNATIUS’ REFLECTION ON HIS INTERNAL PROCESS

10.3.3.1 The importance of understanding the *method* of spiritual transformation

Merely having a desire for authenticity is not enough – one needs to have a method by which desires can be brought to fruition. Many people find it difficult to progress beyond good intentions and desires due to a lack of internal knowledge related to

¹¹³ IBID., p. 35.

¹¹⁴ IBID., pp. 74, 80.

¹¹⁵ Cf. DUNNE, TAD. *Loneragan and Spirituality...*, pp. 181-82.

¹¹⁶ Point 2.3.5.3 of the second chapter outlined the understanding of the Divine Kenosis by Karl Rahner. He too speaks about the Transcendental Method where ‘*the transcendental argument has as its starting point not some observable or generalizable feature of the natural order, but the very structure of human knowledge itself. Ordinarily the term ‘transcendental’ is understood as something which goes beyond the normal physical experience. However Rahner introduces another meaning ‘where he relates the word to a distinct way of understanding knowledge.’*

spiritual matters. Their progress is fraught with repeated failures because of the absence of a coherent method which would bring to fruition their longing for authenticity. They are unable to understand the internal transformative dynamics within the human person and therefore fail to grow in true knowledge and greater consciousness. Their inability to transcend their limited horizon restricts them within a narrow world-view – a world-view which is primarily oriented towards self-love. The faith of such person remains limited to desires and it was rather difficult for such persons to act responsibly by emptying themselves for the sake of others.¹¹⁷

On the other hand we also find persons who were able to articulate their insight in a coherent manner and offer a method in order to progress spiritually. Their insights were institutionalized in a manner where the original spirit was not lost. In this way future generations could draw upon the institutionalized experience and personally experience the fruits of such an insight. The spiritual process of Ignatius was institutionalized in the *Spiritual Exercises*, the *Autobiography*, the *Constitutions* wherein the *GE* is an important text and so on. Let us now briefly explain the Transcendental Method of Lonergan in order to apply it so as to understand the spiritual method as it appears in the *Autobiography*.

10.3.3.2 The Transcendental Method of Lonergan

Lonergan begins *Method in Theology* by speaking of theology as a process.¹¹⁸ We too, in this work have emphasized that spiritual life is a process – as against being a normative and static reality. Ignatius' spiritual life manifested an ongoing process with recurring patterns which were dynamic and progressive and through them he constantly learnt to

¹¹⁷ 'They cannot be argued out of their faith in mere desire because they do not put faith in argument; their faith is mere desire. Nor are they easily attracted out of it by the example of good persons. Even if they desired to be such admirable persons, they feel no desire to walk the path that truly admirable men and women have always walked, a path that often detours around mere desire.' DUNNE, TAD. *Lonergan and Spirituality...*, p. 92.

¹¹⁸ *MT*, p. xi. He makes a distinction between a classicist and empirical notion of culture. The conception of culture as empirical leads to an understanding of theology as a process. '(The empirical notion) is the set of meanings and values that informs a way of life. It may remain unchanged for ages. It may be in process of slow development or rapid dissolution. When the classical notion of culture prevails, theology is conceived as a permanent achievement, and then one discourses on its nature. When culture is conceived empirically, theology is known to be an ongoing process, and then one writes on its method.' Henceforth this book will be referred as *MT*.

understand the internal dynamics of transformation in order to make more enlightened choices.¹¹⁹ By reflecting on his own experiences, he was able to discover the inner structure so as to be able to choose and elect that which was in keeping with the will of God. The method that Ignatius proposes to an exercitant or candidate helps him at two levels: a) to become more aware of *biases* which fomented greater self-love and b) uncover the presence of a *favourable process* consisting of various stages which would aid a person in growing in authenticity and greater self-emptying love.¹²⁰

Loneragan's in defining the Transcendental Method would explain it as:

*... a normative pattern of recurrent and related operations yielding cumulative and progressive results. There is a method, then, where there are distinct operations, where each operation is related to the others, where the set of relations forms a pattern, where the pattern is described as the right way of doing the job, where operations in accordance with the pattern may be repeated indefinitely, and where the fruits of such repetitions are not repetitious, but cumulative and progressive.*¹²¹

Transcendental Method is progressive, universal and normative in nature.¹²² They are contained in questions which are prior to the answers and are therefore *apriori*, unrestricted, comprehensive and move us from ignorance to knowledge.¹²³ Every person is attentive, intelligent, reasonable and responsible to some extent and therefore it

¹¹⁹ 'Method is a framework for creativity and choice, not a system for deducing conclusions.' (Cf. GREGSON, VERNON. "Preface", *The Desires of the Human Heart...*, p. ix.)

¹²⁰ Method as understood by Lonergan consists in an experiential learning. It has to be learnt and cannot be taught as other disciplines. It consists of four stages (experience, understanding, judgment and decision) and they are present at all times. These stages are in the ascending order of importance, are foundational and transversal. It is present universally in any field of inquiry. (Cf. CONN, WALTER E. "The Desire for Authenticity..." ..., pp. 17-18, 21, 23.)

¹²¹ *MT*, pp. 4-5. Each italicized word is important in order to understand the meaning of the word 'Method'. In explaining the progressive nature of method, he says that the 'wheel of method not only turns but also rolls along.' It is not a return to the point of commencement, but moves forward. There is a cumulative character to method and it allows us to grow nearer to the goal of understanding all phenomena.

¹²² 'It is a method, for it is a normative pattern of recurrent and related operations yielding cumulative and progressive results. It is a transcendental method, for the results envisaged are not confined categorically to some particular field or subject, but regard any result that could be intended by the completely open transcendental notions... (Transcendental method) is a concern that is both foundational and universally significant and relevant.' (*MT*, pp. 13-14.)

¹²³ Further on he explains transcendentals as follows: 'While categories are needed to put determinate questions and give determinate answers, the transcendentals are contained in questions prior to the answers. They are the radical intending that moves us from ignorance to knowledge. They are *a priori* because they go beyond what we know to seek what we do not know yet. They are unrestricted because answers are never complete and so only give rise to still further questions. They are comprehensive because they intend the unknown whole or totality of which our answers reveal only part. So intelligence takes us beyond experiencing to ask what and why and how and what for.' (Cf. *MT*, p. 11.)

can be said that every person knows and observes transcendental method.¹²⁴ This method is not achieved by mere theoretical study, but by heightening one's consciousness through the process of objectifying it.¹²⁵ The focus of the Transcendental Method goes beyond the external object to the consciously operating subject leading to greater awareness not only of conscious operations, but also conscious processes.¹²⁶ The intentional and conscious operations are a dynamic process leading to unity and relatedness.¹²⁷

Lonergan believes that the method of conscious and intentional operations as elaborated by him is normative in nature. The objectification of this normative pattern does not admit revision. However its objectification in terms of concepts, propositions and words can be revised from time to time. The *ability to progress depends on understanding the normative pattern of operations and at the same time having the ability to revise the patterns* in terms of concepts, propositions and words from time to time through operations which are empirical, intellectual, rational and judgmental. Herein lies the key for progress and Lonergan explains it as follows:

...in the first place, any possible revision will appeal to data which the opinion under review either overlooked or misapprehended, and so any possible revision must presuppose at least an *empirical* level of operations. Secondly, any possible revision will offer a better explanation of the data, and so any possible revision must presuppose an *intellectual* level of operations. Thirdly, any possible revision will claim that the better

¹²⁴ The next three paragraphs consist in a summary of the Transcendental Method as explained by Lonergan. *MT*, pp. 13-20. Most of the words are from the original text and we have merely tried to offer a synopsis in keeping with our intention to understand the inner dynamics within a person in order to better understand the internal spiritual process of Ignatius.

¹²⁵ Objectifying one's consciousness is a personal task and takes place through the intentional and conscious operations of experiencing, understanding, judging and deciding. These conscious and intentional operations not only intend the object, but also reveal the intending subject with awareness not only of what is intended, but of the very process of intending.

¹²⁶ It must be stated that before we can explicitly understand and objectify it, this process already exists in the human person. Indicating the universal nature of conscious and intentional operations, Lonergan says that irrespective of one's admittance or not, these operations exist and through a process of inquiry, one discovers the pattern of relations that link them together. We spontaneously move from one level of operation to other and the task of method is to invite us to be more attentive, intelligent, reasonable, responsible.

¹²⁷ The unity of an intention and conscious operation differs from the unity related to an organization of sense data because the unity of sense data is merely intelligible as against a unity of an intentional and conscious operation which is intelligent, reasonable and responsible.

explanation is more probable, and so any possible revision must presuppose a *rational* level of operations. Fourthly, a revision is not a mere possibility but an accomplished fact only as a result of a *Judgment of value* and a decision.¹²⁸

An exhaustive explanation of the Transcendental Method is beyond the scope of this work and hence we have limited ourselves to merely explaining its meaning and some of its characteristics. We have so far seen that it is normative, recurrent, and progressive and that its relatedness is discovered through questioning and inquiry. Further on we have seen that it is apriori, unrestricted, comprehensive and universal and that one grows in understanding this method through experience. Progress consists in understanding the normative pattern while being able to revise the objectification of these patterns in the light of new knowledge. The outcome of this Transcendental Method is greater unity and relatedness within an individual and consequently in society at large.

10.3.3.3 The transformative process as seen in the *Autobiography*

Based on what has been described about the Transcendental Method we shall briefly indicate instances where Ignatius engages in conscious and intentional operations as well as instances when Ignatius revises objectified patterns in terms of concepts, propositions and words. We find him engaging in a conscious and intentional operation in Loyola and Manresa where he began to reflect on an experience by going back over a sequence of feelings that emerged as he read the books and those that emerged by engaging in his fantasies about the lady of his dreams. Let us begin by analysing the process at Loyola.

10.3.3.2.1 *The process at Loyola*

The *Autobiography* in nos. 6 & 7 reveals to us process that characterized the post operational period for Ignatius wherein he was caught up in the imaginations of the lady of his dreams and the desire to imitate the great saints. During this phase the transcendental operations of experience, understanding, judgment and decision were functioning. But he was unaware of this process as it took place within him as subjective

¹²⁸ *MT*, p. 19.

process. However there was a point of inflection where he began to be aware of himself as a conscious subject and was *attentive* to the sequence of thoughts and their corresponding feeling. He was *intelligent* enough to distinguish the qualitative difference between the delight that arose from desiring to imitate the saints and the delight from thinking about what he would do for the lady of his dreams. The insight that emerged led him to be more *reasonable* whereby he acknowledges that it would be impossible to attain the lady because of her position whereas the possibility of imitating the saints was probable and at the same time more satisfying. Finally he took a *responsible* decision to choose what seemed to offer a greater degree of personal satisfaction and fulfilment.

10.3.3.2.2 *The process at Manresa*

A similar process can be seen in Manresa where he engaged in various external spiritual activities in order to scale the heights of holiness. We can presume that the *Ejercitatorio* of Cisneros would have offered him some tools in order to reflect on himself as a conscious subject. The existing knowledge of his internal pattern as well as its objectification in terms of concepts, propositions and words would be strongly challenged leading to yet another moment of insight whereby he would be able to reflect upon the transcendental operations so as to become more attentive, intelligent, reasonable and responsible.

The process at Manresa gives us a good indication of both, the negative consequences of not paying heed to the transcendental precepts (be attentive, be intelligent, be reasonable and be responsible) as well as the positive consequences of paying heed to them. The avoidance of an existence based on the transcendental precepts almost cost Ignatius his life. Let us first see the process where he was not attentive to the transcendental precepts.

We can observe that he was *not attentive* to the fact that his exaggerated penances and external manifestations were not giving him the internal peace he longed for. He *unintelligently* decided to increase the number of devotions and indiscreetly increased

the number of hours of prayers and penances. He was *unreasonable* in wanting to fast until he achieved what he desired and thought that if the situation became critical he would have the strength to ask for help and was *irresponsible* in taking a decision to undertake a fast without consulting his confessor.

The process of being enlightened indicates the opposite process. Ignatius’ eyes of understanding were opened whereby he became *attentive* to his futile attempt to gain the grace of God through his personal efforts. He also became aware of how the uncritical admittance of thoughts¹²⁹ was the cause of scruples and anxieties. He was *intelligent* in realizing that the grace of God he so ardently desired was a gratuitous gift of a God. At the same time he became aware of the harm that he was inflicting on himself by giving into various thoughts which focused primarily on his personal efforts. He became more *reasonable* so as to desire a more balanced life whereby he would take care of his physical health and focus more on having the right disposition of humility and surrender. Finally he acted *responsibly* by giving up the exaggerated austerities, suppressing the self-defeating as well as enlightening thoughts which were not in harmony with the will of God and dedicating himself towards loving and serving others.

These two important moments indicate that the process of growing in knowledge consists in a combination of all the four elements of experience, understanding, judgment and decision. While the first three aspects are important for gaining knowledge, they are not sufficient and authentic transformation comes when a person is able to take a responsible decision. This method helps a person grasp the real world of meaning and though the four elements are not infallible and need to be critically scrutinized, they are the normative process of any progress.¹³⁰

As Ignatius grew in an experiential knowledge of his internal dynamic structure, it allowed him to respond more generously to the unrestricted self-emptying love of God leading to an ever increasing level of consciousness and an ever expanding horizon.

¹²⁹ The wisdom gained by Ignatius through this point related to the thoughts would be succinctly explained in the rules for the discernment of Spirits related to the Second Week. (*SpEx* 332-334)

¹³⁰ Cf. DUNNE, TAD. *Loneragan and Spirituality...*, pp. 17-19, 24, 59.

10.3.3.4 Growth in consciousness and widening horizons

The growth in consciousness¹³¹ within the life of Ignatius took place by a transformation in his internal structure.¹³² As his internal structure was transformed his horizon grew wider.¹³³ He grew in becoming a truly conscious person who did not live according to the moment, but responded to values which were rooted in his spiritual experience.¹³⁴ He was not only aware of his actions, but was aware of himself as an operating subject with its dynamics, orientations, authenticity and biases. The process of being intentionally conscious to his own internal process resulted in two important transformations in the life of Ignatius: a) it revealed to him his true self as a subject and b) it slowly constituted him as an authentic subject.¹³⁵

Ignatius would have to accept in all humility that the growth in consciousness did not eliminate the biases and internal obstacles from his internal structure. He would learn that the conscious choice to choose in a responsible manner entailed the deliberate suppression¹³⁶ of those elements which were not consonant with his true self and his

¹³¹ The awareness of growing in true consciousness is not limited to a personal process but is intimately linked to society. Dunne explains the intimate relationship between order in the soul and order in society and when a person is able to understand and order one's inner life, it is reflected in Society. In the same manner Dunne claims that the presence of a fragmented society is the result of a fragmented and disturbed interior life of its individuals. (Cf. DUNNE, TAD. *Loneran and Spirituality...*, p. 2.)

¹³² Cf. CONNOR, JAMES L. *The Dynamism of Desire...*, p. 32.

¹³³ Cf. CONNOR, JAMES L. *The Dynamism of Desire...*, pp. 11-18. Connor explains horizon as the inner world of consciousness and encompassing frame of reference. It moves backwards and forwards. In the life of Ignatius we see his horizons changing when he felt personally humiliated before the Eternal King (p. 11), gave up his sword (p. 12), experienced the gift of God's love in Manresa (p. 14), a shift in his apostolic dimension (p. 15), Paris (16), Rome and the ecclesial dimension (p. 17).

¹³⁴ Hildebrand in speaking about true consciousness would say that a unconscious man gives himself entirely to the moment while a person who is truly conscious is open to truth and values. He interprets all in the context of God and has a genuine comprehension of values. (Cf. VON HILDEBRAND, DEITRICH. *Transformation in Christ – On the Christian Attitude*, Ignatius Press: San Francisco, 1990, p. 62.)

¹³⁵ 'In order to clarify his notion of conscious intentionality or intentional consciousness, Lonergan focuses on such distinctively personal activities as understanding, judging, and deciding – all operations that are essentially personal in the sense that whenever they are performed the self pre-reflectively is aware of, is present to, or experiences itself operating. Such operations not only intend objects, then, but also render the operating self conscious. Thus by their intentionality essentially personal operations make objects present to the self, and in the same act, by their consciousness, they simultaneously make the operating (in act) person present to itself – make it an "I".' CONN, WALTER E. *The Desiring Self...*, pp. 48.49.

¹³⁶ Dunne makes reference to the mechanism of repression and suppression. Repression takes place when we detach and transfer emotions from initial objects to others. Suppress is done consciously. It can be healthy or unhealthy and

ultimate end. The grace of devotion which allowed him to encounter God in all things was the result of a difficult and life long process of learning to be constantly progressing in terms of being more attentive, intelligent, reasonable and attentive.¹³⁷ Let us now see how the transcendental precepts led to a continuous process of intellectual, moral and religious conversion in the life of Ignatius.

10.3.4 THREE LEVELS OF CONVERSION IN IGNATIUS

Ignatius’ awareness of himself as an operating subject enhanced the understanding of his internal process so as to respond more realistically, generously and freely to the call of the Eternal King. Looking at Ignatius’ process through the prism of the Transcendental Method we realize how the transcendental precepts helped take forward his internal spiritual process so that he was able to proceed from one horizon to another.¹³⁸ There was a continuous process of conversion in his life and this took place at the intellectual, moral and religious level. They were not separate processes, but were interlinked with each other leading to a life-long transformative process whereby his self-love was transformed into a love which emptied itself for others.

In order to better understand this process let us begin by explaining the meaning of conversion and the three types of conversions as outlined by Lonergan – intellectual, moral and religious. Each conversion will be briefly explained and illustrated with an episode from the life of Ignatius as elaborated in the *Autobiography*.

Conversion is a radical reorientation of one’s life¹³⁹ towards what one is truly

a healthy repression is one that suppresses feelings that respond to mere ego-centeredness. (Cf. IBID., pp. 73-77.)

¹³⁷ An important element in this process is the dimension of data. It consists in bringing to one’s experience all possible data. Further one makes sense of this data through understanding and judgment and finally one distinguishing between good and the apparently good in order to decide and act responsibly. Such responsible action can be truly considered love. (Cf. CONNOR, JAMES L. *The Dynamism of Desire...*, p. 29.)

¹³⁸ Lonergan begins his point by using Joseph de Finance’s distinction between the horizontal and vertical exercise of freedom. ‘A horizontal exercise is a decision or choice that occurs within an established horizon. A vertical exercise is the set of judgments and decisions by which we move from one horizon to another.’ MT, p. 237.

¹³⁹ ‘In its simplest terms, conversion for Lonergan is an about-face, a radical reorientation of one’s life’. (CONN, WALTER E. *The Desiring Self...*, p. 116.)

called to be.¹⁴⁰ It is a life-long process and consists in a breakthrough into the world of intrinsic intelligibility and a release from a self-centered world. Deductions do not lead to conversion. Rather conversions take place through true experience, understanding and judgment – a process which takes a person away from an illusory and make believe world and brings one to the real world.¹⁴¹ With this brief introduction regarding the meaning of conversion, let us now look at the three kinds of conversions highlighted by Lonergan – intellectual, moral and religious conversion.

10.3.4.1 Intellectual Conversion

Intellectual Conversion¹⁴² takes place when one is able to overcome the myth ‘that knowing is like looking.’ Such a myth is unable to understand the distinction between the world of immediacy and the world of meaning. Knowing is a complex process of entering into a world of meaning and is ‘given in experience, organized and extrapolated by understanding, posited by judgment and belief. An intellectual conversion takes place when one grows in knowledge and is able to ‘break long-ingrained habits of thought and speech... (that function on) the assumption that all knowing must be something like looking.’¹⁴³

Ignatius’ manifold journeys during his entire life put him in contact with various persons, situations, historic events, institutions, other faiths and cultures. Each had their own meaning system and Ignatius’ encounter with them did not immediately open him

¹⁴⁰ Cf. CARMODY, DENISE LARDNER. “The Desire for Transcendence: Religious Conversion”, *The Desires of the Human Heart...*, pp. 72-73. ‘If we think of Christian conversion as turning toward what we have been made and called or called to be, Christian conversion sins that we have been made and called to be children of God, intimates of the Ultimate, the Wholly Good, the Absolute, the Holy. If we think of conversion as rejecting dysfunctional ways, throwing off of what frustrates human development and community, Christian conversion presents itself soberly as a disavowal of sin, a rejection of absurd self-centeredness... Finally in Lonergan’s own terms, Christian conversion is making Christ the way and life of authenticity. Jesus is self-transcendence personified, incarnate, divinized. The unrestricted of Christ’s love is the life that all people hunger to enjoy. The cross of Christ is the law of redemption, the way that conversion passess on to putting one’s body and spirit on the line for authenticity and self-transcendence, a good God and a good world.’

¹⁴¹ Cf. DUNNE, TAD. *Lonergan and Spirituality...*, pp. 36, 48.

¹⁴² We will not be giving distinct footnotes for these three explanations on intellectual, moral and religious conversion. They contain a summary of the following pages from *Method in Theology* wherein some words and phrases have been taken verbatim from the text. (Cf. *MT*, pp. 237-244.)

¹⁴³ *MT*, p. 238. All the quotes in this paragraph are taken from the same page.

to the other world of meaning. On contact with these realities he would grow in awareness that the world we live is not constituted by sense perception but by human understanding.¹⁴⁴ Through the dynamic internal structure he would learn to question his own world of meaning and be open to greater knowledge. His intellectual conversion consisted in going beyond knowledge that was primarily based on seeing and sense perception towards a world mediated by meaning.¹⁴⁵

An example of such a moment was his encounter with the Moor on the road to Montserrat. The experience at Loyola had already begun a process of conversion and transformation in him. During the conversation, his sense experience based on what he saw, heard and felt pushed him towards taking a decision to kill the Moor. This impulse was based on an earlier world of meaning which now seemed doubtful. This doubt was the result of second level of reflection which made him suspect his conclusions which were solely based on sense experience. Though he was still in the initial stage of a process of being radically transformed vis-à-vis the dominant orientation of his life, we do see an intellectual conversion where Ignatius understood in his own unique manner that there was a distinction between the world of meaning and world of immediacy. This in turn led him to question his long held judgments and beliefs leading to a choice to defer his decision and avoid responding in an impulsive manner.

10.3.4.2 Moral Conversion

In moral conversion¹⁴⁶ the criteria to make decisions and choices shifts from satisfaction to values. The conversion to values takes place when we ‘discover for ourselves that our choosing affects ourselves no less than the chosen or rejected objects, and that it is up to each of us to decide for himself what he is to make of himself.’ Moral conversion takes place in the exercise of vertical freedom whereby one opts for ‘the truly good, even for

¹⁴⁴ Cf. CONN, WALTER E. “The Desire for Authenticity...” ..., pp. 27-28.

¹⁴⁵ There is no doubt that data and descriptions are important. However there is a difference between describing and explaining. Description brings one to the threshold of understand. It aids in having an insight, though it must be pointed out that a description in itself is not an insight. Once there is an insight, one needs to return to the descriptive contents of data and pass judgment and based on our judgments there is need to take a decision. (Cf. DUNNE, TAD. *Loneragan and Spirituality...*, pp. 51-52.)

¹⁴⁶ MT, p. 240.

value against satisfaction when value and satisfaction conflict. Such a process requires a person to be alert and constantly develop one's knowledge of reality, scrutinize intentions and preferences, listen to others, learn from others and in this manner continuously grow in awareness in order to allow the moral conversion to be a continuous process.¹⁴⁷

A growing adherence to the standard of Christ manifests the moral conversion that was taking place in Ignatius. His decisions were progressively motivated by a search for true values rather than immediate gratification.¹⁴⁸ This immediate gratification was at times related to elements that pertained to physical, emotional, psychological or spiritual needs. Ignatius realized that gratification in itself was not bad, but was an obstacle in his spiritual process when it was primarily inspired by self-love and not by values as such. He learnt to organize his feelings according to a system of values¹⁴⁹ and would go on to experientially realize the importance of the value of humility in order to live an authentic life as against the danger of pride leading to an inauthentic life.¹⁵⁰ The life-long moral conversion in Ignatius¹⁵¹ helped him better understand his thoughts and feeling allowing him to slowly emerge as an outstanding master in discernment – a gift which he used effectively and fruitfully in guiding others and ensuring that he too progressed in greater and authentic love and service.

A good example of moral conversion can be seen during his sojourn in Azpeitia after his studies in Paris. He was returning to a familiar environment after a break of

¹⁴⁷ However it must be kept in mind that deciding to do something does not automatically mean a person has undergone a moral conversion because the actual choice of values is influenced by individual, group and general biases. *MT*, p. 240.

¹⁴⁸ Cf. CARMODY, DENISE LARDNER. "The Desire for Authenticity...", p. 47.

¹⁴⁹ Moral conversion and responsible actions are linked. A person whose existence and decisions are based on values knows how to organize one's feelings according to values. Dunne gives us five levels of values which include vital, social, cultural, personal and religious values. (Cf. DUNNE, TAD. *Lonergan and Spirituality...*, pp. 78-79.)

¹⁵⁰ Hildebrand speaks of two kinds of pride – satanic pride where one makes a conscious choice to live a life against values and a milder form of pride where a person is not blind to value but is incapable of responding to it. (Cf. VON HILDEBRAND, DEITRICH. *Transformation in Christ...*, pp. 155-56.)

¹⁵¹ 'To be morally converted is not to be morally perfect. Conversion must be ongoing. For insofar as moral conversion reveals how drastically limited our effective freedom really is, we must commit ourselves to the endless task of continuing conversion.' CARMODY, DENISE LARDNER. "The Desire for Authenticity..." ..., p. 52.

nearly 13 years. The moral conversion is seen in his transformed perspective of his family, village, society and the church. His decision to reject the comfort of his brother's house and live in the hospice, the efforts to educate the people in matters of doctrine, requests to the local authorities in order to help the poor and put an end to some popular vices and finally a request to the local ecclesial authorities to ensure that bells were rung so that people prayed in union with the universal church stand in sharp contrast to his earlier involvement in the same environment. The internal moral conversion of Ignatius is seen in the fact that he did not reject these realities which made up part of his internal structure. They had shaped him and made him who he was. However his relationship to these realities had changed and the internal structure which had been enlightened, responded to situations in a different way. His internal process of responding was no longer based on instinctual feelings or physical kinship but one based on a more profound values which were rooted in his faith and religious convictions.

10.3.4.3 Religious Conversion

Religious conversion¹⁵² consists in being grasped by ultimate concern and an other-worldly falling in love. The conversion consists in ‘total and permanent self-surrender without conditions, qualifications, reservations.’ However surrender in a religious conversion does not refer to an act, but ‘a dynamic state that is prior to and principle of subsequent acts.’ This form of surrender is only realized as ‘an under-tow of existential consciousness, as a fated acceptance of a vocation to holiness, as perhaps an increasing simplicity and passivity in prayer.’ Such a conversion allows operative and co-operative grace to transform a heart resulting in greater freedom and love.¹⁵³ Religious conversion results in love without condition and though ‘it abounds in truth and moral goodness, it has a distinct dimension of its own. It is otherworldly fulfilment, joy, peace and bliss – fruits of being in love with a mysterious, uncomprehended God.’¹⁵⁴

The religious conversion of Ignatius can be seen in the fact that he was a new

¹⁵² *MT*, pp. 240-43.

¹⁵³ *MT*, p. 241.

¹⁵⁴ *MT*, p. 242.

person. Though in general matters, knowledge precedes love, in the case of God, love precedes knowledge.¹⁵⁵ The experience of God, who totally emptied himself for others and experienced as such by Ignatius in a personal manner made him a new being. He was transformed from an existence which was characterized by self-love towards becoming a new creation who only desired to engage in a life-long process of humbly emptying himself in loving and serving others.¹⁵⁶

God's gift of his love gave Iñigo a new orientation, an orientation towards the Unknown, and an inkling of "transcendent mystery". This mysterious Unknown he found riveting. He was awestruck and filled with "reverent dread." He had an intimation of creative power so overwhelming that it left him all lost in wonder and filled with holy joy. He had an intimation of incandescent holiness that was "transcendent in loveliness". The fascination was so compelling that it launched him on a quest for God that was marked by its absoluteness – a lifelong quest that he undertook with all his heart and all his soul and with all his mind and all his strength.¹⁵⁷

The transcendental love transformed Ignatius affectively and helped in the process of his progressive integration.¹⁵⁸ The unrestricted love of God had touched his heart and transformed the horizon of his life.¹⁵⁹ It led to a total surrender of himself to the will of God leading him to dedicate his entire life in loving and serving others in an unrestricted manner. The religious conversion transformed the core of his being in such

¹⁵⁵ 'Ordinarily, knowledge precedes love... But, as Lonergan reminds us, the major exception to the rule is God's gift of his love. We awaken to find ourselves in the dynamic state of being in love. We experience deep joy, and profound peace. Love reveals values we had not appreciated – values like prayer, the liturgy, repentance and belief.' (CONNOR, JAMES L. *The Dynamism of Desire...*, p. 14.)

¹⁵⁶ The process of falling in love leads to permanent surrender and transforms the existential subject. The surrender of this conversion does not consist in giving up one's moral autonomy, but one's pretense to autonomy and realizing one's true identity is that of a creature who has been loved by the Creator. The conversion that takes place is not necessarily a 'religious' conversion, but a radical reorientation of one's life towards God. 'One allows God to move to the center of one's life, to take over and direct it.' (Cf. CONN, WALTER E. *The Desiring Self...*, pp. 127-28.)

¹⁵⁷ CONNOR, JAMES L. *The Dynamism of Desire...*, p. 14.

¹⁵⁸ ...affective conversion is the transformation of personal being which actualizes that possibility, which makes effective response to that challenge a reality. Affective conversion, therefore is the concrete possibility of overcoming moral impotence, of not only being able to make a decision to commit oneself to a course of action or direction of life judged worthwhile and personally appropriate, but of being able to execute that decision over the long haul against serious obstacles.' (CONN, WALTER E. "The Desire for Authenticity...", pp. 52-53.

¹⁵⁹ God takes the initiative and reaches out to the human person. Without this love the human person's striving becomes trivial and frustrated. The unrestricted love of God opens up a new horizon, resets values and alters all knowing. It turns around the consciousness of the person and makes it desire to respond with unrestricted love. (Cf. CARMODY, DENISE LARDNER. "The Desire for Transcendence...", pp. 60-61.)

a manner that his life from then on was one of continuous benevolence and appreciation.¹⁶⁰

Various examples of religious conversions can be found in the *Autobiography*. The experience of Manresa was without doubt a defining moment in his life. However we would like to point out to another moment of religious conversion in the life of Ignatius – the Trinitarian vision of experiencing Christ carrying the Cross at La Storta. It took place at a time when his attempt to go to the Holy Land had failed and this encounter precipitated a total surrender on the part of Ignatius to the desire of God. He consciously and passively submitted himself entirely to the plan of God as would be manifested to him in Rome. There were no conditions, qualifications or reservations and the new horizon that he entered with this surrender was a move into the unknown. He was unsure of the consequences of this decision but in an act of faith, hope and love allowed God to take total control of his life and in humility desired to totally co-operate in God’s salvific plan.

10.3.4.4 The dynamic nature of conversions

In reflecting upon the process of conversion one ought to be conscious that intellectual, moral and religious conversions are not a mechanised, systematic and ever ascending process. Lonergan cautions against the idea of an automatic process and points to the reality of biases, sinfulness and breakdowns. He explained the possibility of decline as indicative of the presence of sin which he defines as the privation of total love and is a radical dimension of lovelessness.¹⁶¹ Breakdown on the other hand is the collapse of all that has been laboriously built up by the individual, society and culture. This

¹⁶⁰ The two features of being in love are benevolence and appreciation. Benevolence consists in concrete acts which emerge from a genuine desire for the welfare of the other. Appreciation on the other hand does not focus on the good that can be done, but rather on the good that the person actually is. *‘Benevolence draws on attention, intelligence, reason and responsibility... (while) appreciation, on the other hand is the mysterious part of love.’* (Cf. DUNNE, TAD. *Lonergan and Spirituality...*, pp. 107, 122.)

¹⁶¹ He distinguishes it from moral evil. It can be sustained by superficiality, but the escape is not permanent and will manifest itself in various ways. *‘Absence of fulfilment reveals itself in unrest, the absence of joy in the pursuit of fun, the absence of peace in disgust – a depressive disgust with oneself or a manic, hostile, even violent disgust with mankind.’* Cf. MT, pp. 242-43.

breakdown begins by undermining some aspects of cognitional self-transcendence, values and religion. These 'negations may be true, and then they represent an effort to offset decline. But they may also be false, and then they are the beginning of decline'¹⁶² False negations will lead to destruction and elimination of a genuine dimension of culture, society or the individual. The process of breakdown will continue to be supported through a screen of self-deception and perpetuated by consistency leading to 'increasing division, incomprehension, suspicion, distrust, hostility, hatred and violence.'¹⁶³

All three conversions aid self-transcendence¹⁶⁴ leading to something new and distinct. Without interfering or destroying the past, it preserves the features and properties and moves 'forward to a fuller realization within a richer context.'¹⁶⁵ In this way one conversion builds upon the other and hence it could be said that moral conversion goes beyond intellection conversion¹⁶⁶ and in the same way religious conversion goes beyond moral conversion.¹⁶⁷ However Lonergan points out that the sequence of conversion is not linear as progressing from intellectual to moral and religious. Rather the reverse holds true with the religious conversion being the starting point and being followed by moral and intellectual conversion. Elaborating this point he says:

First there is God's gift of his love. Next, the eye of this love reveals values in their splendour, while the strength of this love brings about their realization, and that is moral conversion. Finally, among the values discerned by the eye of love is the value of

¹⁶² MT, pp. 243-44.

¹⁶³ MT, p. 244.

¹⁶⁴ MT, p. 241. *'Intellectual conversion is to truth attained by cognitional self-transcendence. Moral conversion is to values apprehended, affirmed, and realized by a real self-transcendence. Religious conversion is to a total being-in-love as the efficacious ground of all self-transcendence, whether in the pursuit of truth, or in the realization of human values, or in the orientation man adopts to the universe, its ground, and its goal.'*

¹⁶⁵ MT, pp. 241-42.

¹⁶⁶ Ibid. *'Moral conversion goes beyond the value, truth, to values generally. It promotes the subject from cognitional to moral self-transcendence. It sets him on a new, existential level of consciousness and establishes him as an originating value.'*

¹⁶⁷ MT, p. 242. *'Questions for intelligence, for reflection, for deliberation reveal the eros of the human spirit, its capacity and its desire for self-transcendence. But that capacity meets fulfilment, that desire turns to joy, when religious conversion transforms the existential subject into a subject in love, a subject held, grasped, possessed, owned through a total and so an other-worldly love There is a new basis for all valuing and all doing good.'*

believing the truths taught by the religious tradition, and in such tradition and belief are the seeds of intellectual conversion. For the word, spoken and heard, proceeds from and penetrates to all four levels of intentional consciousness. Its content is not just a content of experience but a content of experience and understanding and judging and deciding.¹⁶⁸

10.3.5 CONCLUDING REMARKS

Ignatius’ life-long conversion reveals that the *existential tension* which characterized his internal transformation was similar to the process of other mystics whereby he grew in knowledge, freedom and generosity in accepting and responding to God’s self-revelation.¹⁶⁹ Though the basic orientation was towards greater self-emptying love it consisted in a mixture of upward and downward spirals.¹⁷⁰ Once he was able to better understand the internal process within himself he was better equipped to choose and elect in a discerning manner. In this way he was able to take responsible decisions and co-operate more intelligently in the process of participating in divine life.¹⁷¹

The spiritual process of Ignatius would not have been possible without the *assistance of others*. However despite the assistance of others, the process of growing internal transformation in order to be more configured in Christ was a personal process.¹⁷² The operations of experiencing, understanding, judging and deciding were within the realm of his own personal freedom and through a consistent life-long personal process he grew in becoming more attentive, intelligent, reasonable and responsible. The initiative and foundation was the grace of God and the action of the Holy Spirit adapted to his created nature.¹⁷³ The process of spiritual integration in the

¹⁶⁸ MT, p. 243.

¹⁶⁹ Dunne makes a point that though mystics cutting across cultures did not see or hear the same thing, they all experienced ‘*the same inner movement from attention to intelligence to reason to responsibility and to a transcendental love whose brilliance at times could obscure everything else.*’ DUNNE, TAD. *Lonergan and Spirituality...*, p. 115.

¹⁷⁰ Cf. IBID., pp. 92-94.

¹⁷¹ Cf. IBID., p. 85.

¹⁷² Gregson while speaking about the levels of consciousness points out that experience, understanding, judgment and decision are stages and levels. One builds upon the other and these operations have to take place within the subject – it has to be a personal experience and no amount of self-talk, arguments or explanations by others will help in any way. (Cf. GREGSON, VERNON. “The Desire to Know...”, p. 19.)

¹⁷³ Connor quotes Cusson (CUSSON, GILLES. *Biblical Theology and the Spiritual Exercises*, pp. 121-122) in explaining how grace built upon nature in the case of Ignatius. Ignatius’ movement was towards his end and the graces of light and energy ordered that movement and gave it a new inexhaustible love. He quotes Cusson and says ‘*The action of the Holy*

life of Ignatius took place through an ongoing conversion and was not a body of knowledge understood in the conventional sense. Rather it consisted in a growing internal knowledge which emerged through trial and error and through a lifelong process whereby he grew in experiencing a state of constant devotion – i.e. a habit of the soul where he was constantly conscious to the presence of God in everything.

Spiritual integration is primarily a commitment to using one's head and heart not only about the realities of the outer world, but particularly about the head and heart themselves. It is a habit of soul, not a body of knowledge. It regards the data of consciousness as the testing ground for any theory about how we use our capacities for transcending ourselves. In this sense, spiritual integration is by no means complete. It will develop and grow as any empirical science does, by the self-correcting process of trial and error.¹⁷⁴

Ignatius' process of moving from self-love to self-emptying love took place in the measure that he grew in true *knowledge and humility*. True knowledge helped him recognize his false sense of omnipotence and realistically becoming aware of his creatureliness. Such awareness emerged through an encounter with a personal God in the person of Christ whose total self-emptying love revealed to him the true being of God and at the same time revealed to him his own authentic identity.¹⁷⁵ The love of God revealed in the person of Christ confronted him to engage in a journey towards his true self. On slowly becoming experientially aware of his true self he realized that it required the emptying of the illusory or false self. From the commencement of his spiritual journey Ignatius realized that in order to actualize this invitation to empty himself, the dimension of humility was fundamental.

Spirit in us is not violent; it follows the bend of our being and orients to the true Life, through the natural path of desire which it opens into infinite capacities... For Ignatius, this spiritual desire gently moves the soul towards its end. Love engenders and nourishes this desire, while the desire itself seeks perfection of love in the praise and service of God. Through these simple words of desire, will, and spiritual relish, Ignatius understands and expresses the whole natural thrust of a human being who has been invaded by grace, that 'inflamed with the love of God', he may be capable of accomplishing everything God may ask of him.'
CONNOR, JAMES L. *The Dynamism of Desire...*, p. 38.

¹⁷⁴ DUNNE, TAD. *Loneragan and Spirituality...*, p. 183.

¹⁷⁵ 'Only in our confrontation with a personal God we become fully aware of our condition as creatures, and fling from us the last particle of self-glory...It is only the overwhelming contrast between creature and personal Creator that discloses to us, in all its depth, the principal fact about ourselves: that we receive all our being from God; that He is That Which Is, whereas we are 'as though we were not.' Hildebrand goes to say that humility which emerges from such knowledge '...is not a reluctant or resigned admission of our nothingness: it is, primarily, a joyous response to the infinite glory of God.' (Cf. VON HILDEBRAND, DEITRICH. *Transformation in Christ...*, pp. 155-58.)

Humility as understood by Ignatius was not merely pious self-abasement but a truthful insight into the inner dynamics of the self.¹⁷⁶ It consisted in humbly admitting the biases which lead to decline and being open to self-transcendence in order to participate in the kenotic process of transformation. In explaining religious conversion from a kenotic perspective Conn says that:

The kenotic participation in ‘the mind of Christ’ is the Christian version of religious conversion, the orientation toward transcendent mystery that climaxes one’s radical desire for self-transcendence. This culmination of the self-transcending process is an orientation toward mystery because, although conscious, it is not objectified. In mediating a return to immediacy, as Lonergan expresses it, the contemplative subject has withdrawn from objectification to a prayerful cloud of unknowing. Still though other-worldly, such radically religious experience must not be understood in any isolated, individualistic sense (because) ‘a man cannot enter into the deepest center of himself and pass through that center into God, unless he is able to pass entirely out of himself and empty himself and give himself to other people in the purity of selfless love’.¹⁷⁷

Ignatius’ conscious choice to participate in a kenotic process as indicated in the above quote could not be merely an individualistic personal fulfilment as its end. Genuine humility helped him to progressively understand the ontological dignity of every human person and realize how God’s glory was reflected in each human person.¹⁷⁸ Growing empathy for others and total self-emptying for others through a life of love and service led to an every closer identification with Christ¹⁷⁹ – an identification which could only have come about through an internal transformation whereby he progressively ‘clothed himself with Christ’ (*Rom. 13,14*) through a growing facility in ‘having the mind of Christ.’ (*Phil. 2,5*)

Finally it can be said that Ignatius’ reflection on his own spiritual itinerary

¹⁷⁶ CONN, WALTER E. *The Desiring Self...*, p. 124.

¹⁷⁷ *IBID.*, p. 130. In this text Conn uses a quote from Thomas Merton (MERTON, THOMAS. *Seeds of Contemplation*, p. 41.)

¹⁷⁸ Disregard for the ontological dignity of man who is made in God’s image and likeness would be a disregard for the glory of God. Genuine humility therefore recognizes the glory of God and constantly reminds one of the call to participate in divine life. Humility also leads to have the right perspective of others and leads to ‘*life our eyes to the majestic splendor of God and to God’s reflection in our fellow men.*’ (Cf. VON HILDEBRAND, DEITRICH. *Transformation in Christ...*, pp. 164, 179.)

¹⁷⁹ In highlighting the communitarian dimension of humility Connor speaks of a relationship between humility and empathy. Empathy consists in compassion towards others while humility consists in having a realistic view of oneself. (Cf. CONNOR, JAMES L. *The Dynamism of Desire...*, p. 124.)

allowed him to give directives for the appropriate formation of a candidate who desired to join the Society. His personal experiences allowed him to better understand the dynamism of desires¹⁸⁰ as well the inherent pitfalls in such an endeavour. He therefore proposed a coherent methodology whereby the desires of a person would be transformed and oriented¹⁸¹ towards that which was true, meaningful, valued and loving- i.e. towards the glory of God.¹⁸²

Ignatius wanted candidates with great desires that had been enlightened, transformed and liberated through an experience of the humble self-emptying love of God. This experience would in turn assist a person to engage in a life-long process of self-emptying love. Due to this the *GE* maintains the focus on the internal transformation of the subject allowing for a lasting influence on the person. While he did expect the attire of a Jesuit to bear greater witness to the poverty and humility of Christ, the exhortation would be to constantly internalize the internal attitude of Christ.

In keeping with the flexibility which was typical of the Society in lieu of its charism, Ignatius would merely indicate that the attire of a Jesuit ought to be in consonance with the prevailing local customs for priests. (*GE 18-19*) While some rules were offered regarding the external clothes, Ignatius' greater emphasis was in dealing with the dynamism of desire in order to take forward the internal transformation of the candidate – a transformation which would manifest itself in a life-long process of intellectual, moral and religious conversion.

¹⁸⁰ 'The dynamism of desire means that every human being is a creature, that every one of you has been set in motion toward your end, that the action of the Holy Spirit follows the bent of your being, orienting you along the natural path of desire. And so, you respond to the need you feel in the depth of your being, where each of you experiences the deepest movement of a created being, and the whole natural thrust of a human being.' (Cf. CONNOR, JAMES L. *The Dynamism of Desire...*, p. 41.)

¹⁸¹ Ignatius discovered that such an orientation already existed in the human person and not acting according to them would derail the deepest desires of the mind and heart and frustrate the true existence of a human person. (Cf. GREGSON, VERNON. "The Desire to Know: Intellectual Conversion", *The Desires of the Human Heart...*, p. 22.)

¹⁸² This is primarily seen in the Spiritual exercises where the reflexive methodology contained in concrete activities such as the examens, reviews, interview with the director and so on aid the transformative process of the exercitant. All these techniques help the transcendental operations of experience, understanding, judging and deciding so that the person grows in greater authenticity and responsibility.

CONCLUSION

We now come to the end of the section related to the GE. The internal spirit of growing humility and self-emptying love will continue to present through the subsequent ten parts of the Constitutions. The method observed in this text is the initiation of a dynamic process which will continue through the life of a person who desires and chooses to live and die in the Society. The succeeding ten parts of the Constitutions are an aid to take forward this process.

The present conclusion would not be limited to the three numbers elaborated in this chapter. Rather it includes the eighth, ninth and tenth chapters – i.e. the entire text of the GE. Let us summarize all that has been seen so far by highlights five points that encapsulate the spirituality of the Society.

The first and most important point relates to the mysticism of service that characterizes the charism Society. This charism can only be lived if there is an abiding internal attitude of humility and an earnest desire to share in the poverty, insults and humiliations of the Cross in today's contemporary world. Humility is thus fundamental in living this unique charism. All through the history of the Church various saints have received different charisms from the Holy Spirit. The charism received by Ignatius was one of apostolic service. His mystical life manifested the dimension of service over union, infused contemplation and other mystical graces. Other graces were means, while apostolic service was the end of the Society's charism. Humility opened a person to these graces so that the end could be realized. A Jesuit by being faithful to the will of God progresses in mystical life and union with God. Fidelity and humble love is a far more fruitful means to spiritual growth, rather than the reception of extraordinary spiritual gifts or infused contemplation.¹⁸³

¹⁸³ Cf. DE GUIBERT, JOSEPH. *The Jesuits – Their Spiritual Doctrine...*, pp. 176-81. De Guibert explains that the dimension of service was not new in the tradition of spiritual life. However for the Jesuits the dimension of service is all encompassing and not relegated to one of the various activities. *'The apostolic service which among the Benedictines always remains an occasional extension of the service at home, becomes on the contrary for the Jesuits the service for which everything is*

The message which God gave to Ignatius through the effusions of mystical graces which filled him from Manresa onward was a message of apostolic service. ... (This is) the very heart of both the life and spiritual doctrine of St. Ignatius. His mystical life was one stressing service because of love, rather than a mysticism of union and transformation – as we stated above in regard to the gifts of infused contemplation which God heaped upon him to such an extent that they dominated and oriented his whole interior life. Service through love is also what Ignatius emphasized in the spiritual teachings which he gave to others.¹⁸⁴

The *GE* informs a candidate that the mysticism of service is the defining characteristic of the Society of Jesus. The other four points related to the spirituality of the Society include: a) self-emptying as a life-long process which takes concrete shape at the moment of entrance; b) primacy of God's gratuitous love in initiating and taking forward this process; c) the arduous nature of this enterprise and d) a method which emphasizes the role of a personal experience of poverty and humility.

Despite the fact that the process of self-emptying is a lifelong process, the *moment of entrance* into the Society of Jesus is *an important moment* in the life of an individual and therefore, 'the candidate (is asked) at the outset to give careful consideration to how it all develops... (The 4th chapter) maps out in broad strokes the spiritual journey along which the candidate will be guided.'¹⁸⁵ What begins during the second probation is a process that continues all through the life of a Jesuit. However the candidate is expected to understand the meaning of continual emptying because of its abiding importance in religious life.¹⁸⁶ In the course of the fourth chapter, a candidate is shown the method of engaging in a process of life-long self-emptying in keeping with the apostolic spirituality

organized, and the service as truly essential as the personal service to the Master.'

¹⁸⁴ *IBID.*, pp. 177-78.

¹⁸⁵ DE JAER, ANDRE. *Together for Mission...*, pp. 27-28.

¹⁸⁶ Though Laynez uses the word 'renunciation, it could also be understood as 'emptying'. The Oxford Dictionary explains the word 'renounce' as a formal declaration of one's abandonment of a rightful claim (*v*); refuse a right or possession (*n*); and in explaining the phrase 'renounce the world' explains it as a complete withdrawal from society in order to lead a more spiritually fulfilling life. This is similar to the theological meaning of the word 'emptying' and hence we believe that the two words, 'renounce' and 'emptying' can be interchanged in this text. Much of the teaching of the 4thGE is centered on the renunciation of temporal goods, of family ties and the self. The importance of renunciation as explained to the candidate makes this text in harmony with the tradition of religious life in the Church - beginning with the oldest tradition which began in the desert. (Cf. O'LEARY, BRIAN. *Sent into the Lord's Vineyard...*, p. 38)

of the Society of Jesus.¹⁸⁷

The central element in the spiritual process of living one’s vocation is an abiding *awareness of God’s gratuitous love*. The fundamental attitude expected of a candidate is that he realizes that a vocation to the Society is a gift. He is invited to walk upon a grace filled path and realize that the joyful response primarily depends on the grace of God and not on any personal effort. The process of the *GE* is in order to find out if this grace has been received by the candidate.¹⁸⁸ While the determination within the candidate could emerge from oneself, the desire and ability to actually respond to God’s call is a grace which can only be received from above.¹⁸⁹ The transformation of a person’s desire which is an important grace is highlighted again and again in the *GE* and appears in various numbers of the text.¹⁹⁰ The 31st GC elaborated at length on the spiritual formation of Jesuits and while reminding that the process of spiritual growth was a grace, invited all Jesuits to ask for the same.¹⁹¹

The text offers the candidate an idea of *the arduous nature of the enterprise*. According to Aldama, the 4thGE ‘has no other meaning than (indicating) the severity or

¹⁸⁷ *IBID.*, p. 41. The candidate is offered a solid synthesis of all that is essential to his vocation. (Cf. JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 28. However the candidate is not informed about everything, but only that which is essential at this primary stage. This is logical considering the fact that this chapter deals with practices of the life of a person who is at the very beginning and is about to embark on a life which is proper to the Institute. (Cf. ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory...*, p. 40.)

¹⁸⁸ Cf. DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 28.

¹⁸⁹ Cf. O’LEARY, BRIAN. *Sent into...*, pp. 39-40. O’Leary while commenting on nos. 101-102 speaks of the shift in the candidate who is invited to primarily trust in the grace of God from above. ‘*The question now put to the applicant is not about determination but about desires. This is a significant shift of emphasis. Ignatius has here opened up part of his soul, and he knows from his own experience that what he is seeking in the applicant can only be ‘de arriba’, that is, pure gift from God.*’

¹⁹⁰ Cf. DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for...*, p. 28. In the pointed questions we find repeated references to the person’s desire. ‘...the document is full of pointed questions for the candidate: “Is he in agreement?” “Does he freely choose?” “Has he the desire?” (55, 57, 60, 63, 90, 98, 100, 101) “or at least the desire to desire?” (102)’

¹⁹¹ GC-31: D/8,1 In nos. [76-79] we find how a Jesuit is invited to grow in conformity to Christ by trusting in the grace of God. ‘*Spiritual progress is the work of divine grace, it is essential that each one should dispose himself to implore that grace by humble prayer and to respond to it with docile obedience. ...though called to perfect love, we are still sinners, (and) our following of Christ must take the form of continual conversion to him. ...this progressive conformity to Christ can take place only on condition that we humbly listen to his word in Scripture, continually draw life from his sacraments and follow him as present in the Church. ...let those attitudes of mind be cultivated which St. Ignatius held most dear: personal love for the poor and humble Christ...*’

austerity'¹⁹² of the endeavour. The precautionary tone of warning the candidate of the rigors of religious life can be seen all through the tradition of the Church. Irrespective of the kind of life led by a person,¹⁹³ we find that the following of Christ was demanding and the path of the authentic discipleship was strewn with various hardships. Ignatius also desired to make the candidate aware of the hardships involved in the choice to follow Christ within the Society. However unlike the external austerities and penances which characterized earlier forms of religious life, Ignatius would place greater emphasis on inner mortification and abnegation from the very onset. Ignatius, through his experience had recognized that growth in any kind of authentic freedom was not easy – more so when it concerned inner freedom and outlined the rigors of such a journey at the very onset.¹⁹⁴

Finally we conclude by indicating that the spiritual process of growing in self-emptying love is based on *actual experiences of poverty and humility*. Such was the experience of Ignatius and the first companions and the concerned candidate would do well to understand that an actual experience of poverty and humility is fundamental in order to understand and live the Jesuit charism. Ignatius and the first companions choose poverty and humiliations and by reflecting on the same experientially understood its salvific dimension. This internal knowledge transformed them in order to generously offer themselves for various apostolic ventures. They realized that the mysticism of service entails a constant experience of actual or spiritual poverty as well as humility because such is the cost of true discipleship. The methodology proposed in the *GE* helps a candidate grow in having an experiential knowledge of God's total self-emptying love as revealed on the Cross. This knowledge in turn leads to a growing desire to love and choose poverty, insults and humiliation for the sake of Christ. The

¹⁹² ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory...*, p. 39.

¹⁹³ When we speak of religious life we include all the various forms of life which necessitated some form of *fuga mundi*. This could include the desert fathers, the monastic traditions of Basil, Pachomius, Augustine, Benedict or later renewal movements or mendicant movements. We have shown how all of them insisted on indicating to the candidate the hardships associated with a choice to participate in a specific charism of a particular religious order by leaving one's property, family and their selves.

¹⁹⁴ Cf. O'LEARY, BRIAN. *Sent into...*, p. 39.

degree of a person’s internal freedom to make such choices contains the transformative key in order to move from self-love to self-emptying love

A person who desires to live an authentic life as a Jesuit is invited to grow in love for the Cross. This is manifest in a love for poor, humble and suffering persons in one’s contemporary world. Love of the Cross is thus actualized in loving the poor and having a preferential option for them. The candidate is invited to personalize the invitation of the Eternal King, live by the standard of Christ and grow towards having an attitude in keeping with the third degree of humility. He is exhorted to empty himself totally in a life of apostolic service thus participating in the laboring love of the Triune God.¹⁹⁵

¹⁹⁵ GC 34 in elaborating the cost of discipleship in order to live the Society’s apostolic spirituality reiterates the fundamental role of the *SpEx* in order to understand and live the Society’s charism. It states that: “*Ignatius, and all those called to this service, are taught to be companions in hardship with Christ in his ministry. In the Spiritual Exercises, we contemplate the mission of Christ as a response of the Blessed Trinity to the sins which afflict the world. We contemplate the Incarnate Son born in poverty, laboring to bring the Kingdom through word and deed, and finally suffering and dying out of love for all men and women. In the pedagogy of the Exercises, Jesus invites us to see in his earthly life the pattern of the mission of the Society: to preach in poverty, to be free from family ties, to be obedient to the will of God, to enter his struggle against sin with complete generosity of heart. ...As the Risen Lord, he is now present in all who suffer, all who are oppressed, all whose lives are broken by sin. As he is present, so we too want to be present, in solidarity and compassion, where the human family is most damaged. The Jesuit mission, as a service of the Crucified and Risen Lord, is always an entry into the saving work of the Cross in a world still marked by brutality and evil. Because we are companions of Jesus, our identity is inseparable from our mission. Nadal makes it clear that, for Ignatius, although the Risen Christ is now in glory, through the Cross he is present in the suffering which continues in the world for which he died: “Christ, having risen from the dead, and dying now no more (Rom. 6:9), still suffers in his members, and constantly carries his Cross so that he said to Paul, ‘Why do you persecute me?’” [GC 34 – D,2/26]*

CONCLUSION

“...desire to suffer injuries, hardships, offenses, accusations, to be considered a fool, to be despised by all, to hold to the cross in everything for the love of Christ our Lord, and to put on his livery; because in this is the way of perfection, and spiritual well-being, happiness, and consolation.”¹

[1] Introduction: The ardent desire expected of any person who belongs to the Society of Jesus is similar to what Paul expected from the community of Philippians. The exhortation of Paul in his letter to the Philippians (*Phil. 2,1-7*) and Ignatius' advise to Nadal is as valid today as it was in the first century or the 16th century. The inspiration for true discipleship is the mystery of God's love as revealed in the Divine Kenosis and the authenticity of such discipleship is seen in the total emptying of oneself for the sake of others. While the spiritual process of Divine initiative and human response is seen from times immemorial, it takes on a special character within the context of the Society's charism. Humility is fundamental in initiating and taking forward this spiritual process.

[2] Affirmation of the thesis: The central thesis of our work consisted in exploring the transformative role of humility in the spiritual process of growing in self-emptying love. The overall thesis has dealt with two aspects: a) the transformative process within a person and b) the role of humility in this transformative process. We have held that the fundamental and necessary element for actualizing this transformative process is the dimension of humility – where humility is understood as a concrete expression of love. Bereft of this understanding of humility, any transformative process will only be a more

¹ ALDAMA, ANTONIO. *An Introductory Commentary...*, p. 64. (Quoting Nicolau, M. op. cit. in note 85, pp. 108-09.)

subtle and sophisticated form of self-love. We repeatedly affirmed during the course of this work that humility is only effective antidote to the subtle and extremely complex deceptions of self-love.

Based on this position we have highlighted two aspects of humility: a) it is a foundational element in any authentic transformative process and b) true humility is a concrete expression of love. The understanding of humility as a concrete manifestation of love has its roots in the Divine Kenosis. The understanding of the true nature of humility has been revealed to us only because of the Kenosis of Christ. The life of Christ from His Incarnation until his death on the Cross reveals to us the salvific value of poverty and humility as against the deception of riches, honor and pride. Though there were some indications of this inversion of values in the period preceding Christ, the truth regarding the redemptive and salvific value of humility in all its fullness has been revealed in the humility of Christ.

Humility is salvific in nature when it is understood as a concrete expression of Divine and human love. Such an interpretation of humility makes it an essential means for genuine transformation. The originality of this thesis lies in affirming this understanding of humility and its transformative role from a theological, spiritual, anthropological and historical perspective. The foundational experiences of the Society reveals a redemptive experience of humility leading Ignatius and the first companions to have a longing desire to passionately love poverty, insults and humiliations for the sake of Christ. The centrality of humility in their personal experience was institutionalized in the fourth chapter of the General Examen so as to guide a candidate who desired to live the charism of the Society.

[3] Humility and self-emptying love as transversal themes. Humility is the transversal theme in the entire thesis and all the chapters highlight different dimensions of it. We have shown that true humility is posited within the very being of God (Chs. 1 & 2) and highlighted its central role in the transformative process of a human person (Ch. 3). After offering a theological and anthropological perspective, we moved on to the

foundational experiences of the Society in section two. The four chapters (Chs. 4-7) elaborated the significance of humility as a constant and critical factor in the life of Ignatius, in the Spiritual Exercises and in the collective experience of the Deliberations of 1539. Finally in the last section, we focused on humility within one specific document, i.e. the General Examen (Chs. 8-10) and explained its role in aiding a candidate grow in self-emptying love. Our focus in these last three chapters was on highlighting the role of humility within a spiritual method which is proposed by Ignatius to the candidate in order that the good intentions and authentic desires to follow Christ can come to fruition.

Humility is not an isolated virtue, but is situated within the spiritual process of growing in self-emptying love. Each chapter directly or indirectly highlighted the transformative role of humility in this spiritual process. The first chapter presented the redemptive dimension of humility from a Biblical perspective by stressing its role in personal and social transformation. The second chapter posited humility within the very being of the Triune God and revealed its significance in the Divine plan of transforming a broken world into the Kingdom of God. The third chapter explained how an experience of the Triune God's humility transforms a person from being rooted in self-love towards a love that empties itself for the sake of others. The fourth and fifth chapters highlighted the role of humility in the spiritual transformation of Ignatius. The sixth chapter dealt with the Spiritual Exercises and we saw that the transformative role of humility is transversal in the various dynamics of the Spiritual Exercises. The seventh chapter moved on to highlight the importance of humility in the spiritual transformation of an entire group. The eighth, ninth and tenth chapters indicated that humility is the cornerstone of a spiritual methodology proposed to a candidate in the General Examen – this process consists in a lifelong transformation of self-love to self-emptying love.

[4] The importance of a method: The five texts that have been explained in this thesis directly and indirectly point to a specific method in order to take forward the transformative process. Method evolves with experiences and is indispensable in order to transform desires and intentions into reality. Method includes a general

understanding of the manner in which Divine-human communication takes place. This is understood by reflecting on the spiritual processes of others as well as reflecting on the dynamics within one's own life. God who has created the human person relates and communicates in a manner which is respectful of the internal structure of a person. Besides this, one needs to understand the dynamics of spiritual life in terms of living a life oriented towards God as against one which is oriented towards self-love. The meditation on the Two Standards is a classical example of the same. Finally it could be said that it is equally important to understand the method which characterizes a person's internal functioning. One needs to be aware of the factors which influence one's internal process of experiencing, understanding, judging and deciding.

Humility is essential for an increasing awareness regarding the three methods indicated above. It helps a person to be constantly open to the creative and diverse ways that the Spirit transforms persons and structures. The presence of pride and arrogance gives a person a false sense of omniscience and blocks the possibility of any growth. It leads one to become rigid and inflexible regarding spiritual processes. On the other hand authentic humility makes a person look out for different avenues in order to understand and grow in an internal knowledge regarding the dynamic method that entails personal and collective spiritual processes. This in turn leads to new insights and ever widening horizons.

[5] The transformative process in a person: We believe that the petition of the second week of the Spiritual Exercises succinctly explains the role of humility in the transformative process from self-love to self-emptying love. The exercitant desires 'an interior knowledge of Our Lord, who became human for me, that (he) may love him more intensely and follow him more closely.' (*SpEx 104*) We shall explain the transformative process by elaborating three phrases – 'an interior knowledge'; intense love' and 'follow Him.' While there is a chronological progression to the three, we should not consider them as compartmentalized in an absolute manner. They are inter-linked and as a united whole aid a person's spiritual transformation.

[5.a] Interior Knowledge: Transformation begins with an internal knowledge of God—more specifically a God who deigned to become human. An internal knowledge of God's love can only be known and experienced by one who is humble and meek. In order to make this point, Jesus put before the disciples the example of children, the poor widow, the publican and various other marginalized persons. An attitude of humility does not come easily because of the need of the human person to affirm oneself over and above others. The humility of God in the Divine Kenosis was despised by the Greeks as a folly and the cause of shame for the Jews. This tendency to move towards self-love in an open as well as subtle manner is seen in the life of Ignatius on various occasions. Two important moments can be seen in his desperation at Manresa and the struggle in addressing the issue of poverty in the *SD*. However the attitude of humility would transform these trying moments into moments of grace and would be the starting point for a period of spiritual growth. A similar struggle can be seen in the entire group during the Deliberations and the moment of humility helped them in progressing spiritually.

Humility helps take forward the process of growing in internal knowledge leading to greater transformation. The internal knowledge received by Ignatius and the companions helped them go beyond the external appearance of the crucified Christ and internally know the love manifested by the humanity of Christ. This internal knowledge avoided the extremes that characterized some of the heresies of the initial centuries. It avoided considering the human suffering of Christ to be merely a façade or exaggerate the Divine Kenosis to such an extent that divinity was negated. The growth in internal knowledge was directly related to the growth in humility. Without taking away the person's freedom to make choices in life, the more a person grew in realizing one's own creatureliness as well as the primacy of God in one's life, the greater was the degree of growing in internal knowledge. The freedom to reject the Divine initiative and continue on a path of self-love was always available to the human person and this is seen in the choice of Judas Iscariot and some of the companions of Ignatius. However the growth in humility led to a corresponding increasing internal knowledge about the true nature of

God as well as of the human person.

The internal knowledge of the humiliated and crucified Christ allows persons to better understand the mystery of the Triune God. The humiliation of Christ paradoxically reveals the absolute power and freedom of God – a freedom which manifests itself in love and total self-giving. Having an internal knowledge of the dynamics of the two standards leads a person to experientially understand the redemptive role of humility and the destructive nature of pride. The precondition for this kind of internal knowledge was the grace of God that surpassed all forms of human knowing. Ignatius experienced this in Manresa and would therefore compare all other learning as being insignificant compared to what was revealed to him there. The humility of a person who reverentially approaches the Kenosis of Christ, allows him to be enlightened so as to understand that the ‘God who became human’ reveals the total self-giving of the Triune God. Participation in the mystery of the Triune God leads to greater internal knowledge about the very being of God and an authentic identity of the human person. This knowledge is fundamental in order that there is a transformation of love so that a person who intensely loved oneself, begins to intensely desire a participation in a process of total self-emptying.

[5.b] Intense Love: The second part of the petition relates to an intense love cause by this interior knowledge. The starting point of this intense love lies in having an experiential knowledge of God who intensely loves all creation – a love which is revealed in the Divine Kenosis. This knowledge helps us recognize that the love of the Triune God is not an abstract reality, but is manifest in concrete and historical events. We see it manifest in the history of Israel, most importantly in the person of Christ, in the first Christian communities, down the centuries when the doctrinal reflections related to the Divine Kenosis developed, during the 16th century with the commencement of the Society of Jesus and continues to be manifest in the present day. The grace to be humble, open and receptive to the Spirit would allow us to recognize and experience the passionate love of God at all times. The mystical experience of Ignatius culminated in the ability to experience this ‘labouring love’ (*SpEx 236*) of God at all times. The ardent

desire to express such love is articulated by Jesus at the beginning of the Last Supper and continues to be expressed in a variety of ways at all times – within personal histories, within the Society of Jesus, the Church and the world at large. The growing internal knowledge of such an intense love is the source of an ongoing transformation of the human person in order to respond generously.

Based on an experience of the intense love of God as concretely experienced in a passion and death suffered 'for me', (*SpEx 193*) there emerges within a person a longing to respond through an intense self-emptying love. The possibility of such a response depends on the degree of personalizing this Divine Love and the degree of internal transformation. Ignatius and his companions had learnt through experience that external transformation was fleeting and could not stand the test of time. Ignatius faced demanding situations in his life and what allowed him to spiritually progress was the fact that his inner being had been transformed. The attitude of humility and self-emptying was far more important than other intense feelings. This is evident in the *SD* where we find various references to tears. However, the defining factor in the experience as elaborated in the *SD* did not consist in the number of times he had tears, the visions that he saw, the loquela or other extraordinary phenomenon – rather it consisted in an internal attitude in growing in humble love.

Growing intensity was a process and it could be oriented towards self-love and at the same time could be oriented towards self-emptying love. Ignatius was an expert in understanding human behaviour and understood the need for support systems in order to progress in spiritual life. While accepting the primacy of grace, he advocated different methods in order to progress in one's own personal spiritual journey. Ignatius advocated various experiences, spiritual aids such as the Spiritual Exercises, account of conscience, regular sacramental life, prayer, the examen and so on in order to maintain and foster this intensity. The neglect of these aids always contained the risk of leading the person back to a life oriented towards self-love. Despite the fact that transformation involved a break from the past, self-emptying love was a gradual process and with the passage of time Ignatius became more and more cautious about sudden, dramatic and

abrupt change to one's life. He also understood that the ideal of an intense love for the Cross ought to be tempered with a realistic appraisal of a person's age, background, personality traits and other human and cultural factors. Due to this we see that in the last part of the General Examen, while presenting the ideal of total self-emptying love and humility, he nuances his expectation of strong desires with the demand that the candidate at least ought to have the desire to desire such a love for insults and humiliations for the sake of the Cross.

We would like to end this part on 'loving intensely' by going back to the source of the transformative process – the Triune God and the revelation in Christ. Christ definitively reveals the love of the Triune God and the transformative humility within the human person has Christ as its reference point. The more profound a person's knowledge of the being of God and of oneself, the more intense is the desire to imitate Christ. So great is the intensity of love within the Trinity that there is a total self-emptying of one Person for the sake of the others. Similarly the more a person participates in the Trinitarian love, the more intense would be the desire of the person to empty oneself for the sake of the other.

The intense love was also nourished by a more humble involvement with others. Ignatius' experience was that as he left behind his narcissistic self-love and opened up to the love of others, he was transformed from within. Just as Ignatius and the first companions recognized that an individual could be oriented towards self-emptying love only by humbly being part of the community, the candidate was expected to have the same attitude and realize that the path of perfection and spiritual progress he desired to embark upon could only be taken forward in community. The apostolic charism of the Society in terms of humble service aided this spiritual process – a process which was necessarily communitarian in nature. Ignatius realized very early in life that an intense love of Christ understood in isolation and at the expense of the community was a subtle and more sophisticated form of self-love. Hence he would exhort others to grow in intensely loving Christ by an intense love for the poor, humble and marginalized – an exhortation which was confirmed by the vision at *La Storta*.

[5.c] The petition of the second week is not to merely follow, but to '*closely follow*' Christ. Love is shown in deeds and not in words (*SpEx 230*) and hence the ultimate proof of transformation in the life of a person consists in the ability to make a concrete choice in following Christ. This phase combines the previous transformative processes of greater internal knowledge and intense love. In order to follow another person one needs to be truly humble because it means that one gives up one's own narcissistic self and the false sense of autonomy. The external expression of following Christ does not mean much because the external manifestation may not correspond with the internal disposition. We have seen this in the life of Ignatius who put on the garb of a pilgrim on reaching Montserrat where his internal orientation was primarily focused on self-love – albeit with a spiritual façade.

A more authentic following of Christ consisted in having the mind and heart of Christ – i.e. a harmonious union with the internal attitude of Christ. Ignatius was keen that the candidate underwent an internal transformation instead of undergoing an external and superficial change. The candidate was expected to have Christ as his reference point and imitate Him, in the manner of Ignatius and the first companions. The fourth chapter of the *GE* does indicate Ignatius' concern for the external following of Christ in terms of clothes, physical appearance, living quarters, etc. However, such concern is limited in nature. Though he does refer to the need to ensure that the candidates were put through experiences of actual humiliation and poverty, his greater focus was to ensure that the candidates were formed in such a manner that they underwent an internal transformation. This would internally configure them in such a way that the redemptive value of humility would attract them and they would desire it ardently. Transformation of such a nature where the affect had been influenced would lead to a more authentic and permanent form of discipleship. God deals personally with each person and community and hence each transformative process is unique and manifests itself in varied forms of following Christ. However it must also be pointed out that there were some general patterns whereby a person and communities moved towards greater humility and mutual emptying for one other.

The invitation to follow Christ closely was done with a great deal of humility and respect. The freedom of the individual is always respected and the transformative process whereby a person makes a choice to follow Christ is not a mechanical process. At any point of time, the person has the freedom to reject the invitation and be transformed back into one's old orientation towards self-love. It must be pointed out that the following of Christ is strongly influenced by the dominant orientation of the person – oriented towards self-love or oriented towards self-emptying love. The dynamic nature of spiritual life ensures that there is never a status quo and the person is either progressing or regressing in spiritual life. Ignatius in the Rules for Discernment of spirits indicates the different dynamics at play when a person is progressing or regressing in spiritual life. In both these states the attitude of humility is important and the danger of pride is present in both the above mentioned states. A person needs to humbly recognize that a close adherence to Christ is necessary at every stage in order to make spiritual progress.

The ability to truly follow Christ and not one's own personal inclinations and interests depends on a humble attitude towards the Church and society at large. It requires the ability to know the internal spirit of any charism, read the signs of the time and creatively apply the same spirit in changed circumstances. Following Christ therefore is not merely an external imitation of the founders but an application of its internal spirit in one's present context within an ecclesial dimension. Though God deals directly with the person, the means to test of authenticity of any spiritual matter within the Catholic tradition has always been the Church and the Vicar of Christ. Therefore various religious orders would have a Papal clause indicating his role in their process of discernment. For the Society of Jesus, the Papal clause was in terms of its very identity – its mission.

A person who sincerely desires to follow Christ necessarily has to be humble because he realizes that true following of Christ cannot be a personal endeavour, but is part of a collective process. The arrival of the Chalcedonian formula was the fruit of centuries of theological reflection and in the same way the foundation of the Society was

also the fruit of a combined effort. Ignatius was the undisputed leader in this process, but he humbly acknowledged that the '*minima*' Society had come into existence by the grace of God and the contribution of various persons. Just as it came into existence through the grace of God, he was certain that it would continue to give glory to God through the grace of God, the approval of the Church and the support of a variety of collaborators. He humbly and joyfully recognized that the successes achieved in the missions received from the church were not a triumphalist personal achievement but primarily dependent on God and the generosity of others. Ignatius was humbly aware that the close following of Christ within an apostolic charism was totally contradictory to an individualistic enterprise seeking self-glory.

During the course of our work it has become clear that a close following of Christ has a Christological as well as a Trinitarian dimension. Both these dimensions manifest humble self-emptying love and in the degree that a person conforms to this mode of existence one discovers one's true self. The Christological dimension has been highlighted by various saints, spiritual authors and other important figures in the Church. They have affirmed that the following of Christ by a close imitation of Him has been an ideal down the centuries and have tried to live this ideal by espousing different charisms. However this ideal is a profound mystery and reveals itself in myriad ways ultimately leading to the gradual transformation of a person, community and the world at large. This dynamic process has been seen in the life of Ignatius, his companions and Jesuits in a recurring manner down the centuries. The life of Ignatius reveals that his understanding of following Christ would change over the years until its institutionalization in the *FI*, *GE* and the *Constitutions*. The progressive process of self-emptying was related to the growth in humility and this entire transformative process was part of a redemptive experience.

We cannot speak of following Christ without making reference to the larger community because the imitation of Christ is manifested in humble love and service towards the community. There is a clear relationship between Christology, Trinity and soteriology and in all of them humility and self-emptying love is intrinsic. Participation

in this salvific process transforms the community as well as the person who desires to follow Christ. Right at the onset we have seen how God's participation in the salvific process during the Incarnation transformed the very being of God. God's divine condition now contained the dimension of humanity. Some authors would state that the self-emptying during Incarnation did not lead to a loss of divine attributes but paradoxically added more attributes to the reality of God. God while remaining God is transformed through his total self-emptying on the Cross. Similarly following the humble self-emptying love of Christ, a person cannot but be transformed and through one's concrete elections in a greater imitation of Christ, there is a growing configuration in Christ and more intense participation in the Trinitarian life.

The three stages of knowing, loving and following do have some chronological sequence with one stage following the other. However they are not exclusive in themselves, but are interlinked. All these three stages exist in each other and one who is oriented towards Divine love participates in a descending spiral of greater self-emptying love and the corresponding experience of fulfilment.

[6] Transformation of Desire: For a person to be transformed so as to imitate Christ, the person's affective dimension ought to be influenced. Only an affective experience would create the transformative process of knowing, loving and following. Due to this Ignatius laid great emphasis on the transformation of a person's desire. A person who had been affectively transformed through an internal experience of knowing that the poverty and humiliations were 'for me' would in turn desire a life of humility – more specifically insults, humiliations and poverty in so far as it gives glory to God. Though this desire goes against the normal human inclination it is the only way to encounter God and is directly related to humility.

Ignatius wanted a person to have great desires, but desires that were transformed towards a life which emptied itself for others. Ignatius and his companions experienced this transformation of desire and its corresponding consequences. Ignatius' desire for personal glory was transformed into an ardent desire for God's glory on experiencing

the gratuitous and total nature of God's love as revealed in the Divine Kenosis. A peak moment in the spiritual itinerary of Ignatius was his mystical experience at Manresa. This was an experience to which Ignatius returned time and again. The repeated return to the mystery of the Divine Kenosis that were meditated and contemplated in the various meditations on the life of Christ nourished his desire leading to an ever more intense longing to offer himself totally to the Eternal King. The process of internal transformation is not a onetime affair but extends all through the life of a person. Correspondingly the growth in humility is also a life-long process. The mystery of the Divine Kenosis reveals to us the unfathomable nature of God's love and the life of Ignatius and the first companions reveals how the spiritual process of purification, illumination and union would constantly take on new shades and hues. This indicated that the transformative process was dynamic and not a determined or fixed process. Despite the fact that one could observe similar patterns and processes, it must be stated that the spiritual process is unique and particular for each person and community.

As we come to the end of our conclusion we would like to highlight three points that this work contributes towards a better understanding of the spirituality of the Society: a) a reaffirmation of the redemptive dimension of humility as the foundation of joy, love and fulfilment; b) the dynamic nature of both humility and pride in the spiritual process and c) the increasing need to interpret the Society's charism from a Trinitarian as well as Christological perspective.

[7] The redemptive dimension of humility: At the very onset the first chapter which was related to biblical foundations has stressed the redemptive dimension of humility. This dimension continued to be present in the theological reflections as well as the spiritual attitude found within the early theologians. Such an attitude helped them better understand the mystery of the Divine Kenosis. The love of God as revealed in humility is the source of an ontological split leading to a conversion of the person. The redemptive dimension of humility is also seen in the human person because it opens the person to God's loving mercy and also allows him to respond generously by humbly emptying himself for others. Humility thus understood is seen in the life of Ignatius, the

early Society and the spiritual process proposed to a candidate desirous of joining the Society. Humility is what redeemed Ignatius from self-destructive behaviour that was caused by an extremely subtle form of self-love at Manresa. It opened him to the gratuitous love of God and elicited a growing desire to empty himself in order to help others. The redemptive dimension of humility would continue to be present in varying and more subtle forms all through his life and this was manifest in personal entries of the *SD*. The method of the Spiritual Exercises whereby a person grows in freedom in order to discern and chose that which is pleasing to God has the redemptive role of humility from the very beginning and continues as a person ends the Spiritual Exercises and moves into one's day to day living. The first companions had this redemptive experience of humility when they were unable to progress in the point related to obedience. The candidate who has ardent desires to follow Christ is invited to understand the same redemptive dimension of humility in the process of giving up one's temporal goods, affective relationships and finally his very self. This humble self-emptying would be concomitant with an increasing love for the Cross where the total self-emptying love of the Triune God is manifest in glory. We thus reaffirm through our work the basic Christian understanding of humility as being redemptive and salvific. It constitutes the very being of God and makes up the true identity of the human person.

[8] The dynamic nature of humility and pride: Besides the redemptive dimension of humility, we have also tried to elaborate its transformative role within the spiritual process of a human person in the explanation of the three phrases – 'internal knowledge', 'intense love' and 'follow closely'. In this concluding remark we would like to indicate the transformative role from a more global perspective. All reality is dynamic in nature and within this dynamic process humility is a transformative force and pride is a destructive force. Divine Love is dynamic in nature and has descended to reveal that which constitutes the way, the truth and life. The human person who in ignorance and pride forgot one's true identity as a creature and desired to be equal to the Creator is enlightened by the humble descent and total emptying on the Cross. This spiritual journey of the people of God is transformed by the eternal presence of Christ carrying

the cross. The theological debates constantly reiterated the importance of recognizing the Divine Kenosis as revealing the true being of God as well as re-discovering the true being of the human person. In the encounter between Jesus and Pilate, the dynamics of the standard of Christ and the standard of the evil one is starkly represented. The destructive upward spiral manifested in pride as against the redemptive downward spiral of humility enlightens the spiritual process. These two standards are present in all the phrases of purification, illumination and union. The spiritual process contains the twin dimension of active as well as passive humility where one actively desires and chooses that which would lead to greater imitation of Christ and at the same time one responds with humble love towards situations which impose themselves upon the person.

Despite being made in the image of God, created reality tends towards self-love and therefore results in sin, suffering and death. Humility does not eliminate self-love, but transforms the orientation of love towards a voluntary self-emptying for the sake of others and this makes the reality of our existence one of grace, freedom and love. An experience of the humility of God transforms the spiritual process of the human because the love revealed in the Divine Kenosis leaves the person in wonder and awe. An experience of God's humble love changed the course of Ignatius's spiritual trajectory and opened him to a life of love and service. The same was the case with the first companions and the repeated experience of such a process led it to be institutionalized in the *GE*. Such an experience is a singular moment to which a person returns time and again. However to consider such experiences as a one-time event which are static and wholly explainable would be a misreading of such events. A person is time and again invited to return to these peak experiences and humbly nourish oneself from such mystical experiences in order to be enlightened in one's spiritual journey.

[9] Christological and Trinitarian perspectives: We would like to end our work by indicating that our effort has been to reiterate the transformative role of humility within a Christological as well as a strongly Trinitarian framework. The various chapters make constant reference to the humility and poverty of Christ as a model for a person or

community. The growing desire for an imitation of Christ by ardently desiring a life of humiliations, insults and poverty in so far as it furthers the glory of God is a positive indicator for spiritual life. Along with an affirmation of the Christological dimension of humility we have tried to equally highlight the Trinitarian dimension of humility as a model for personal and communitarian self-giving.

While the humility of Christ has often been used in order to emphasize the redemptive and transformative role of humility, we believe that much more needs to be done in order to situate humility in the Triune God. We have tried to show how contemporary theologians have consistently interpreted the Divine Kenosis as not being restricted to the self-emptying of the Second Person but as manifesting the self-emptying of the Holy Trinity. The unique charism which emerged through the life of Ignatius and the first companions as well as the spiritual process of a candidate in terms of the invitation to live an apostolic charism can be better understood by reflecting on the same within a Trinitarian context. The Trinitarian understanding of humility and self-emptying would also help us better respond to the complex challenges faced by the 21st century. It can be said that Christological and Trinitarian perspectives complement each other and we believe that in the course of this work we have tried to highlight the total self-emptying of the three Persons of the Triune God in all humility and love as a model for personal and communitarian transformation.

The challenges that face today's world are manifold and though the issues of modern society may be different from the 16th century, it can be said that the spiritual process in terms of self-love and self-emptying love are similar and found in a variety of ways. The need of the hour is once again a creative, radical and enlightened discipleship. The enlightenment of the Divine Kenosis whereby God revealed God's self-emptying love in total humility is the answer to these challenges. We hope that the eternal wisdom of the triumphant Cross enlighten and transform the human heart so that it learns to progressively imitate the meek and humble heart of Triune God as revealed in the pierced heart of Christ.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. PRIMARY SOURCES

1.1 IGNATIAN SOURCES

MHSI:¹

Fontes Documentales de S. Ignatio de Loyola, (115), Roma, 1977.

Fontes Narrativi de S. Ignatio de Loyola – I, (66), Roma, 1943.

Fontes Narrativi de S. Ignatio de Loyola – II, (73), Roma, 1951.

Fontes Narrativi de S. Ignatio de Loyola – III, (85), Roma, 1960.

Fontes Narrativi de S. Ignatio de Loyola – IV, (93), Roma, 1965.

Monumenta Exercitiae (I Exercitia Spiritualia: Textuum antiquissimorum nova editio), (100),
Roma, 1969.

Monumenta Exercitiae (II Directoria 1540 – 1599), (76), Roma, 1955.

Constitutiones: I - Monumenta Constitutionum praeviae, (63), Roma, 1934.

Constitutiones: II - Textus hispanus, (64), Roma, 1936.

Constitutiones: III - Textus latinus, (65), Roma, 1938.

Constitutiones: IV - Regulae Societatis Iesu, (71), Roma, 1948.

Epistolae et Instructiones, 12 vols., (22, 26, 28, 29, 31, 33, 34, 36, 37, 30, 40, 42), Madrid,
1903-1911. (Reprinted 1964-1968)

*Monumenta Natalis, Epistolae Hieronymi Nadal Societatis Iesu ab anno 1546 ad 1577 (et
alia scripta)*, 5 vols., (13, 15, 21, 27, 90), Madrid – Roma, 1898-1962.

¹ In continuation we have indicated the volume number in brackets followed by the year of publication.

Vita Ignatii Loialae et rerum Societatis Iesu historica (Chronicon de J. A. de Polanco), 6 vols., (1, 3, 5, 7, 9, 1), Madrid, 1894 - 1898.

FABRO, PEDRO. *En el Corazón de la Reforma – «Recuerdos espirituales» del Beato Pedro Fabro, SJ*, (Ed. Alburquerque, Antonio), Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2000.

IGNACIO DE LOYOLA. *El Peregrino – Autobiografía de San Ignacio de Loyola*, (Ed. Rambla Blanch, Josep M^a), Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 1990.

IGNACIO DE LOYOLA. *Obras Completas*, (Eds. Iparraguirre, Ignacio – Ruiz Jurado, Manuel), BAC: Madrid, 2014⁶.

IGNACIO DE LOYOLA. *Obras Completas*, (Ed. Larrañaga, Victoriano), BAC: Madrid, 1947¹.

IGNACIO DE LOYOLA. *Constituciones de la Compañía de Jesús – Introducción y notas para su lectura*, (Eds. Arzubialde, S. – Corella, J. – García Lomas – J. M.), Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 1998.

IGNACIO DE LOYOLA. *La Intimidad del Peregrino – Diario espiritual de San Ignacio de Loyola, Versión y Comentarios*, (Ed. Thió de Pol, Santiago), Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 1998.

IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA. *Letters and Instructions*, (Tr. Palmer, Martin – Padberg, John – McCarthy, John), The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 2006.

IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA. *Letters of St. Ignatius of Loyola*, (Tr. Young, William J.), Loyola University Press: Chicago, 1959.

IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA. *A Pilgrim's Testament – The Memoirs of St. Ignatius*, (Tr. Diwarkar, Parmananda), Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 1995.

IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA. *Personal Writings*, (Tr. Endean, Philip – Munitiz, Joseph), Penguin Books: Suffolk, 2004.

IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA. *Spiritual Exercises and Selected Works*, (Eds. Ganss, George – Malatesta, Edward), Paulist Press: New York, 1991.

IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA. *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius*, (Ed. Ganss, George) The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 1992.

IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA. *The Spiritual Diary of St. Ignatius*, (Ed. Munitiz, Joseph A.), Inigo Enterprise: London, 1987.

- IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA. *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus and their Complementary Norms*, (Ed. Padberg, John), The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 1996.
- IGNATIUS OF LOYOLA. *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*, (Ed. Ganss, George), Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 1970.
- IGNACE DE LOYOLA. *Journal Spirituel*, (Ed. Giuliani, Maurice), Desclée de Brouwer: Paris, 1959.
- NADAL, JERÓNIMO. *Las Pláticas del P. Jerónimo Nadal – La globalización ignaciana*, (Ed. Lop, Miguel), Mensajero - Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2011.
- . *Scholia in Constitutiones*, (Ed. Ruiz Jurado, Manuel), Facultad de Teología: Granada, 1976.
- PADBERG, JOHN W. – O’KEEF, MARTIN D. – MCCARTHY, JOHN L. (Eds.) *For Matters of Greater Moment – The First thirty Jesuit General Congregations*, The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 1994.
- PADBERG, JOHN W. (Ed.) *Jesuit Life & Mission Today – The Decrees of the 31st – 35th General Congregations of the Society of Jesus*, The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 2009.
- PALMER, MARTIN (Ed.). *On Giving the Spiritual Exercises – The Early Jesuit Manuscript Directories and the Official Directory of 1599*, The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 1996.
- POLANCO, JUAN ALFONSO DE. *Year by Year with the Early Jesuits (1537-1556): Selections from the “Chronicon” of Juan de Polanco, S.J.*, (Tr. Donnelly, John Patrick), The Institute of Jesuit Sources: St. Louis, 2004.
- RIBADENEYRA, PEDRO DE. *Vida de Ignacio de Loyola*, Espasa-Calpe: Madrid, 1967.
- RODRIGUES, SIMÓN. *Origen y Progreso de la Compañía de Jesús*, (Ed. Alonso Romo, Eduardo Javier), Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2005.

1.2 PATRISTIC, MEDIEVAL AND RENAISSANCE SOURCES

- ATHANASIUS, OF ALEXANDRIA. *Contra Arianos*, PG - 26, 12-468. [“Contra Arianos”, *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers – Catholic Edition* (2.4), (Eds. Wace, Henry – Schaff, Philip), The Christian Literature Company: New York, 1892. (Logos)]
- . *Epistulae ad Serapionem*, PG - 26, 529-676. [The Letters of Saint Athanasius concerning the

Holy Spirit, (Tr. Shapland, C. R. B.), The Epworth Press: London, 1951. (Logos)]

ATHANASIUS, OF ALEXANDRIA. *Oratio de incarnatione Verbi*, PG - 25, 95-198. ["On the Incarnation of the Word", *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers – Catholic Edition (2.4)*, (Ed. Schaff, Philip – Wace, Henry), The Christian Literature Company: New York, 1892. (Logos)]

AUGUSTINE. *De Trinitate*, PL - 42, 819-1098; CCSL - 50, 50A. ["De Trinitate", *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers – Catholic Edition (1.3)*, (Ed. Schaff, Philip), The Christian Literature Company: New York, 1887. (Logos) (Also in *Saint Augustine – The Trinity*, (Tr. McKenna, Stephen), The Catholic University of America Press: Washington, 1963.) (Logos)]

----- . *Confessiones*, PL - 32, 659-868; CCSL - 27. ["Confessiones", *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers – Catholic Edition (1.1)*, (Ed. Schaff, Philip), The Christian Literature Company: New York, 1886. (Logos)]

----- . *Regula ad servos Dei*, PL - 32, 1377-1384. [*The Rule of Saint Augustine*, (Tr. Canning, Raymond), Image Books: New York, 1986.]

BASIL. *Regulae Brevius Tractatae*, PG - 31, 1051-1306.

----- . *Regulae Fusius Tractatae*, PG - 31, 889-1050.

----- . *The Asketikon of St. Basil the Great*, (Tr. Silvas, Anna), University Press: Oxford, 2005.

----- . *The Rule of St. Basil in Latin and English – A Revised Critical Edition*, (Tr. Silvas, Anna M.), Liturgical Press: Minnesota, 2013.

BENEDICT. *Regula Monachorum*, PL - 66, 215-931. [*The Rule of St. Benedict – In Latin and English with Notes*, (Ed. Fry, Timothy), The Liturgical Press: Minnesota, 1981.]

BERNARD OF CLAIRVAUX. *Tractatus de gradibus humilitatis et superbiae*. PL – 182, 941-972. [*Bernard of Clairvaux – Selected Works*, (Trs. Evans, G. R. – Leclercq, Jean – Cousins, Ewert H.), Paulist Press: New York: 1987.]

----- . *The Steps of Humility and Pride*, (Tr. Conway, Ambrose), Cistercian Publications: Kentucky, 1973.

BILLY, DENNIS. *The Imitation of Christ – A Spiritual Commentary and Reader's Guide*, (Tr. Creasy, William C.), Christian Classics: Notre Dame, 2005.

CAJETAN, ESSER. *Rule and Testament of St. Francis*, Herald Press: Illinois, 1977.

CLARKE, W. K. LOWTHER. *St. Basil the Great – A study in monasticism*, Cambridge University

Press: Cambridge, 1913.

CLEMENT OF ALEXANDRIA. *Paedagogus*, PG – 8, 249-684. [“Pedagogus”, *Anti-Nicene Fathers – Catholic Edition (2)*, (Eds. Roberts, Alexander – Donaldson, James), The Christian Literature Company: Buffalo, 1885. (Logos)]

----- . *Stromata*, PG – 8, 685-1382; PG – 9, 9-602. [“Stromata”, *Anti-Nicene Fathers – Catholic Edition (2)*, (Eds. Roberts, Alexander – Donaldson, James), The Christian Literature Company: Buffalo, 1885. (Logos)]

COOK, WILLIAM R. *Francis of Assisi – The Way of Poverty and Humility*, WIPF & STOCK: Oregon, 1989.

CARTHUSIANS. *Consuetudines Carthusienses*. PL - 153, 631-758.

----- . *Coutumes de Chartreuse*, (Tr. Laporte, Maurice), Les Éditions du Cerf : Paris, 1984.

CYRIL OF ALEXANDRIA. *Cyrilli ad Nestorium – Epistola II & IV*, PG - 77, 40-41, 44-49; *Cyrilli ad Nestorium de Excommunicatione – Epistola XVII*, PG – 77, 106-121. [*The Three Epistles of S. Cyril, Archbishop of Alexandria*, (Ed. Pusey, P. E.), James Parker & Co.: London, 1872. (Logos) (Also in *St. Cyril of Alexandria – Letters 1 to 50*, (Tr. McEnerney, John I.), The Catholic University of America Press: Washington, 1987.) (Logos)]

DE LIGUORI, ALPHONSUS. *Uniformity with God’s Will*, (Tr. Thomas W. Tobin), A Lamppost Book: Michigan, 2009.

DELIO, ILIA. *The Humility of God – A Franciscan Perspective*, St. Anthony Messenger Press: Ohio, 2005.

DROBNER, HUBERTUS R. *The Fathers of the Church – A Comprehensive Introduction*, (Tr. Schatzmann, Siegfried), Hendrickson Publishers: Massachusetts, 2007.

EVAGRIUS PONTICUS. *Ad Monachos*, PG – 79, 1235-1240. [*Evagrius Ponticus – Ad Monachos*, (Tr. Driscoll, Jeremy), The Newman Press: New York, 2003.]

FRANCIS DE SALES. *Treatise on the Love of God*, (Tr. Mackey, Henry Benedict), Cosimo Classics: New York, 2007.

FRANCIS OF ASSISI - CLARE. *Francis and Clare – The Complete Works*, (Tr. Armstrong, Regis – Brady, Ignatius), Paulist Press: New York, 1982.

GREGORY OF NAZIANZEN. *Oratio XXVII – XXXI*, PG – 36, 11-172. [“Orations”, *Nicene and Post-Nicene Fathers – Catholic Edition (2.7)*, (Eds. Wace, Henry – Schaff, Philip), The

Christian Literature Company: New York, 1894. (Logos)]

GREGORY OF NAZIANZEN.. *Gregory of Nazianzus – Five Theological Orations*, (Tr. Reynolds, Stephen), Estate of Stephen Reynolds: Dublin, 2011.

GREGORY OF NYSSA. *De Vita Moysis*, PG – 44, 297 – 430. [*The Life of Moses*, (Trs. Malherbe, Abraham J. – Ferguson, Everett), New York: Paulist Press, 1978.]

HILARY OF POTIERS. *De Trinitate Libri duodecim*, PL – 10, 9-471; CCSL – 62, 62A. [*Saint Hilary of Potiers – The Trinity*, (Tr. McKenna, Stephen), The Catholic University of America Press: Washington, 1954. (Logos)]

HIPPOLYTUS. *Traditio apostolica*, SC – 11. [“Apostolic Tradition”, *On the Apostolic Tradition*, (Tr. Steward-Skyes, Alistar), St. Vladimir Seminary Press: New York, 2001. (Logos)]

----- . “Against Beron and Helix – I, II.” *Anti-Nicene Fathers – Catholic Edition (5)*, (Eds. Roberts, Alexander – Donaldson, James), (Tr. Macmahon, J. H.), The Christian Literature Company: Buffalo, 1886. (Logos)

----- . “Refutatio omnium haeresium”, *Anti-Nicene Fathers – Catholic Edition (5)*. (Logos)

HOLMES, AUGUSTINE. *A Life Pleasing to God – The Spirituality of the Rule of St. Basil*, Cistercian Publications: Michigan, 2000.

HUGE OF BALMA – GUIGO DE PONTE. *Carthusian Spirituality*, (Tr. Martin, Dennis D.), Paulist Press: New York, 1997.

IGNATIUS OF ANTIOCH. PG 5, 721-722. [“The Letter of Ignatius, Bishop of Antioch to Polycarp”, *The Apostolic Fathers – English Translations*, (Tr. Lightfoot, J. B. – Harmer, J. R.), (Revised and Ed. Holmes, Michael W.), Baker Books: Michigan, 1992/1999. (Logos)]

IRENAEUS. *Adversus Haereses*, PG – 7, 431-1224. [“Adversus Haereses”, *Anti-Nicene Fathers – Catholic Edition (1)*, (Eds. Roberts, Alexander – Donaldson, James), The Christian Literature Company: Buffalo, 1885.]

JIMÉNEZ DE CISNEROS, GARCÍA. *Obras Completas*, (Ed. Baraut, Dom Cipriano), Abadía de Montserrat: Montserrat, 1965.

JOHN CASSIAN. *Conlationes*, CSEL – 13; SC- 42.54.64. [*John Cassian – The Conferences*, (Tr. Ramsey, Boniface), Newman Press: New York, 1997.]

----- . *De institutis Coenobiorum*. CSEL - 17, 3-231; SC 109. [*John Cassian – The Institutes*, (Tr. Ramsey, Boniface), Newman Press: New York, 2000.]

- JOHN CLIMACUS. *Scala Paradisi*, PG – 88, 631-1164. [*The Ladder of Divine Ascent*, (Luibheid, Colm – Russel, Norman), Paulist Press, New York, 1982.]
- JUAN DE LA CRUZ. *S. Juan de la Cruz - Obras Completas*, (Ed. Pacho, Eulogio), Monte Carmelo: Burgos, 1984^s.
- . *The Essential St. John of the Cross*, (Tr. Peers, Allison E.), Wilder Publications: Radford, 2008.
- JUSTIN THE MARTYR. *Apologiae*, PG – 6, 328-440. [“The First Apology”, *The Fathers of the Church – A New Translation*, (Ed. Dressler, Hermigild), 1948. (Logos)]
- KARDONG, TERRANCE G. *Pillars of Community – Four Rules of Pre-Benedictine Monastic Life*, Liturgical Press: Minnesota, 2010.
- KATZ, S. “Person”, *Augustine through the Ages: An Encyclopedia*, (Ed. Fitzgerald, A. D.), William B. Eerdmans: Cambridge, 1999. (Logos)
- KING, PETER. *Western Monasticism – A History of the Monastic Movements in the Latin Church*, Cistercian Publications: Michigan, 1999.
- LAWLESS, GEORGE. *Augustine of Hippo and His Monastic Rule*, Clarendon Press: Oxford, 1987.
- ORIGEN. *Contra Celsus - II*, PG - 11, 791-918. [“Contra Celsus”, *Anti-Nicene Fathers – Catholic Edition (4)*, (Eds. Roberts, Alexander – Donaldson, James), The Christian Literature Company: Buffalo, 1885. (Logos)]
- . *De Principiis*, PG – 11, 115-414. [“De Principiis”, *Anti-Nicene Fathers – Catholic Edition (4)*. (Logos)]
- PACHOMIUS. *Regulae Sancti Pachomii*, PL – 23, 61-86.
- . *Pachomian Koinonia – Vol. I – The Life of Saint Pachomius*, (Tr. Veillus, Armand), Cistercian Publications: Michigan, 1980.
- . *Pachomian Koinonia – Vol. II – Pachomian Chronicles and Rules*, (Tr. Villeux, Armand), Cistercian Publicans: Michigan, 1981.
- . *Pachomian Koinonia – Vol. III – Instructions, Letters, and Other Writings*, (Tr. Villeux, Armand), Cistercian Publicans: Michigan, 1982.
- TERESA DE JESÚS. *Obras Completas de Santa Teresa*, (Ed. Efrén de la Madre de Dios, Otger Steggink), BAC: Madrid, 2002.
- The Rule of the Master*, (Tr. Eberle, Luke), Cistercian Publications: Michigan, 1977.

VAN BAVEL, TARSICIUS J. *The Rule of Saint Augustine – With Introduction and Commentary*, (Tr. Canning, Raymond), Image Books: New York, 1986.

VV. AA. *The Cistercian Order*, (Ed. Bruun, Mette Birkedal), Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, 2013.

VV.AA. *Classics of Western Spirituality – Deotio Moderna*, (Tr. Engen, John Van), Paulist Press: New York, 1988.

VV.AA. *Early Dominicans – Selected Writings*, (Ed. Tugwell, Simon), Paulist Press: Mahwah, 1982.

WEINANDY, T. G. - KEATING, D. A. *The Theology of St. Cyril of Alexandria: A critical appreciation*, T & T Clark: London, 2003. (Logos)

ZELYCK, LORNE. "An Evaluation of Thomas A. Kempes' Imitation of Christ", *Journal of Grace – Evangelical Society*, 2005, pp. 77-88.

2. SECONDARY SOURCES

2.1 IGNATIAN SOURCES

AICARDO, JOSÉ MANUEL. *Comentario de las Constituciones de la Compañía de Jesús – (Vols. 6)*, Blass: Madrid, 1919-1932.

ALBURQUERQUE, ANTONIO. "Binarios", *DEI, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander*, 2007, pp. 230-238.

ALDAMA, ANTONIO M^a. "La composición de las Constituciones de la Compañía de Jesús", *AHSI – 84*, 1973, pp. 211-245.

----- . *An Introductory Commentary on the constitutions*, (Tr. Owen, Aloysius, J.), Gujarat Sahitya Prakash: Anand, 1989.

----- . *The Formula of the Institute*, (Tr. Echániz, Ignacio.), Gujarat Sahitya Prakash: Anand, 1989.

ALFONSO, HERBERT. "La Storta – Its Foundational Significance for Ignatian Spirituality", *CIS*, 1988, pp. 72-86.

----- . "La Storta", *DEI, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander*, 2007, pp. 1091-1101.

----- . "The Jesuit / Ignatian Charism – A Personal synthesis and tribute to Fr. P. Arrupe",

- Review of Ignatian Spirituality* – 116, 2007, pp. 49-73.
- ALFONSO, HERBERT. *Placed with Christ the Son*, Gujarat Sahitya Prakash: Anand, 1993.
- ARRUPE, PEDRO. *La identidad del jesuita en nuestros tiempos*, Sal Terrae: Santander, 1981.
- . "Trinitarian Inspiration of the Ignatian charism", *Studies in the Spirituality of the Jesuits* – 33/3, 2001, pp. 1-49.
- . *En Él Solo... La Esperanza – Selección de textos sobre el Corazón de Jesús*, Mensajero: Bilbao, 1984.
- ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO. "Raíces de teología espiritual en las dos banderas", *Manresa* - 221, 1984, pp. 291-319.
- . *Unpublished Class Notes*, U. P. Comillas: Madrid, 2010.
- . *Ejercicios Espirituales de San Ignacio – Historia y Análisis*, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2009².
- ASCHENBRENNER, GEORGE A. "Consciousness Examen", *Review for Religious*, Vol. 31, 1972, pp. 14-21.
- BANGERT, WILLIAM. *History of the Society of Jesus*, The Institute of Jesuit Sources: St. Louis, 1986.
- BARRIENTOS, NELSON. "El Diario Espiritual, lenguaje y experiencia de Dios", *Manresa* – 244, 1990, pp. 307-324.
- BOYLE, MARJORIE O'ROURKE. *Loyola's Acts – The Rhetoric of the Self*, University of California Press: Berkeley, 1997.
- BRODRICK, JAMES. *The Origin of the Jesuits*, Loyola Press: Chicago, 1997.
- . *St. Ignatius Loyola – The Pilgrim Years*, Burns & Oats: London, 1956.
- BRUL, PETER DU. *Ignatius: Sharing the Pilgrim Story - A reading of the Autobiography of St. Ignatius of Loyola*, Gracewing: Herefordshire, 2003.
- BUCKLEY, MICHAEL. "Freedom, Election, and Self-Transcendence: Some Reflections upon the Ignatian Development of a Life of Ministry", *Ignatian Spirituality in a Secular Age*, (Ed. Schner, George), Wilfrid Laurier UP: Ontario, 1984, pp. 65-90.
- . "The Contemplation to Attain Love", *The Way Supplement* 24, 1975, pp. 92-104.
- BUSTO, JOSÉ RAMÓN. "Exégesis y contemplación", *Manresa* – 250, 1992, pp. 15-23.

- CALVERAS, JOSÉ. "¿De que humildad se habla en las dos banderas?", *Manresa* - 34, 1933, pp. 97-106.
- CALVERAS, JOSÉ. "Buscar y hallar la voluntad divina por los tiempos de elección de los Ejercicios de San Ignacio", *Manresa* -15, 1943, pp. 324-340.
- CATALÁ, TONI. "El seguimiento de Cristo, "enviado y disponible""", *Manresa* – 333, 2012, pp. 331-338.
- CEBOLLADA, PASCUAL. "Penitencia", *DEI*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2007, pp. 1431-1440.
- . "Del amor propio al amor de Dios: la abnegación en los Ejercicios Espirituales", *Manresa* - 289, 2001, pp. 357-379.
- . "Venir al medio". La Adición 10ª y la ascesis en los Ejercicios Espirituales [82-90]", *Manresa* - 271, 1997, pp. 131-145.
- CENTELLES VIVES, JORGE. "Valor social de 'dos banderas'", *Manresa* -218, 1984, pp. 59-75.
- CHÉRCOLES, ADOLFO Mª – RAMBLA, JOSEP Mª. "Examen de Conciencia", *DEI*, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2007, pp. 841-850.
- CLANCY, THOMAS H. *An Introduction to Jesuit Life - The Constitutions and History through 435 years*, The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 1976.
- COATHELEM, HERVE. *A Guide to the Complete Spiritual Exercises*, Kuangchi Press: Taichung, 1961.
- COLEMAN, GERALD. *Walking with Inigo – A Commentary on the Autobiography of St. Ignatius*, Gujarat Sahitya Prakash: Anand, 2007.
- CONWELL, JOSEPH. "Deliberaciones 1539", *DEI*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2007, pp. 549-553.
- . *Impelling Spirit: Revisiting a Founding Experience - 1539, Ignatius of Loyola and His Companions*, Loyola Press: Chicago, 1997.
- CORELLA, JESÚS. "Fórmula del Instituto", *DEI*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2007, pp. 891-901.
- COSTA, ALFREDO SAMPAIO. "Elección", *DEI*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2007, pp. 726-734.
- COUPEAU, CARLOS. "Constituciones", *DEI*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2007,

pp. 435-445.

COUPEAU, CARLOS. "The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus: The Rhetorical Component", *Studies in Spirituality* – 14, 2004, 199-208.

----- . *From Inspiration to Invention: Rhetoric in the Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*. Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 2010.

----- . "Del yo al nosotros: De la abnegación individual a la abnegación corporativa", *Manresa* – 289, 2001, pp. 371-386.

----- . "La Mistagogía de las Constituciones: El Mistagogo", *Manresa* – 301, 2004, pp. 371-389.

DE GUIBERT, JOSEPH. *The Jesuits – Their Spiritual Doctrine and Practice*, (Tr. Young, William), The Institute of Jesuit Sources: St. Louis, 1986.

----- . *The Theology of the Spiritual Life*, (Tr. Barrett, Paul), Sheed and Ward: London, 1956.

DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO. "Le esortazioni del P. Laínez sull 'Examen Constitutionum", *AHSI* – 35, 1966, pp. 132-185.

----- . *Ignatius of Loyola – Founder of the Jesuits: His Life and Works*, Gujarat Sahitya Prakash: Anand, 1985.

DE JAER, ANDRÉ. *Together for Mission – A Spiritual Reading of the Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*, (Tr. Brennan, Francis C.), The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 2001.

DE LETURIA, PEDRO. *Estudios Ignacianos – I*, Institutum Historicum: Roma, 1957.

----- . *Estudios Ignacianos – II*, Institutum Historicum: Roma, 1957.

----- . *El Gentilhombre Iñigo López de Loyola*, Editorial Labor: Barcelona, 1941.

DE SAJONIA, LUDOLFO. *La Vida de Cristo - I*, (Tr. Del Río, Emilio), U. P. Comillas-IHSI: Madrid-Roma, 2010.

DECLoux, SIMON. "Comentario a las cartas y el diario Espiritual", *CIS*, Roma, 1982.

DIEGO, LUIS DE. "'Vio tan claramente que Dios lo ponía con Su Hijo...'" La visión de La Storta en la vida de San Ignacio y en la espiritualidad ignaciana", *Manresa* – 333, 2012, pp. 319-329.

DÍEZ-ALEGRÍA, JOSÉ MARÍA. "La Contemplación para alcanzar amor", *Manresa* - 87, 1951, pp. 171-193.

DIVARKAR, PARMANANDA. "La Storta y el carisma jesuítico", *Manresa* – 224, 1988, pp. 243-250.

- DOMÍNGUEZ MORANO, CARLOS. "Maneras de Humildad", *DEI, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander*, 2007, pp. 1185-1192.
- DOMÍNGUEZ MORANO, CARLOS. *Psicodinámica de los Ejercicios Ignacianos*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2003.
- DUMEIGE, GERVAIS. "Communal Discernment of Spirits and the Ignatian Method of Deliberation in a General Congregation", *The Way Supplement – 20*, 1973, pp. 55-71.
- ENGLISH, JOHN. *Spiritual Freedom*, Loyola Press: Chicago, 1995.
- FERNÁNDEZ DE LA CIGOÑA, RAMÓN. "La deliberación comunitaria en la autobiografía de San Ignacio", *Manresa – 177*, 1973, pp. 385-394.
- FLEMING, DAVID. "Reino", *DEI, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander*, 2007, pp. 1562-1565.
- FULLAM, LISA. "Humildad", *DEI, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander*, 2007, pp. 957-965.
- GALBRAITH, G.R. *The Constitution of the Dominican Order: 1216-1360*, The University Press: Manchester, 1925.
- GALLAGHER, TIMOTHY M. *The Examen Prayer – Ignatian wisdom for our lives today*, The Crossroad Publishing House: New York, 2006.
- GARCÍA, JOSÉ ANTONIO. "Presentación", *Manresa – 333*, 2012, pp. 317-318.
- GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. "Los cinco ejercicios del pecado en el texto ignaciano", *Manresa – 252*, 1992, pp. 311-329.
- . "Eranse una vez Dos Banderas...". Observaciones lingüísticas al texto Ignaciano", *Manresa – 263*, 1995, pp. 149-164.
- . "Semántica y Mística. El Diario Espiritual de Ignacio de Loyola", *Miscelánea Comillas 59*, 2001, pp. 211-254.
- . "El lento camino de la lúcida entrega (Itinerario personal de Ignacio de Loyola hacia la abnegación)", *Manresa – 289*, 2001, pp. 333-355.
- . *El Dios Emergente*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2001.
- . "Los Primeros de París: amistad, carisma y pauta", *Manresa – 308*, 2006, pp. 253-275.
- . *Polanco – El humanismo de los jesuitas (1517-1576)*, Mensajero – Sal Terrae – Universidad Pontificia Comillas: Bilbao – Santander – Madrid, 2012.

- GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ. "Iglesia, sentir y sentido en san Ignacio", *Manresa* – 332, 2012, pp. 247-258.
- GARCÍA ESTÉBANEZ, ALBINO. "Tercera Semana", *DEI*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2007, pp. 1701-1703.
- GARCÍA HERNÁN, ENRIQUE. *Ignacio de Loyola*, Taurus-Fundación Juan March: Madrid, 2013.
- GARCÍA HIRSCHFELD, CARLOS. "Origen de la comunidad en la Compañía de Jesús. Una experiencia humana y religiosa en un grupo universitario del siglo XVI", *Manresa* – 248-9, 1991, pp. 393-410.
- GARCÍA MADRIAGA, J. M^a. "Contenido de la cláusula papal del voto de Montmartre", *Manresa* – 188, 1978, pp. 231-245.
- GARCÍA MATEO, ROGELIO. *Ignacio de Loyola – Su espiritualidad y su mundo cultural*, Mensajero: Bilbao, 2000.
- GARCÍA-VILLOSLADA, RICARDO. *San Ignacio de Loyola – Nueva Biografía*, BAC: Madrid, 1986.
- GEGER, BARTON. "The 'First' First Companions", *Studies* 44/2, 2012, pp. 1-38.
- GILL, JAMES J. "A Jesuit's Account of Conscience – for Personal and Organizational Effectiveness", *Studies* – Vol. IX/5, 1977, pp. 247-276.
- GIULIANI, MAURICE. *La Experiencia de los Ejercicios Espirituales en la vida*, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 1991.
- GOIRI, SANTIAGO DE. *La Apertura de Conciencia en la Espiritualidad de San Ignacio de Loyola*, Graficas Ellacuría: Buenos Aires, 1960.
- GONZÁLEZ, LUIS. "La deliberación de los primeros compañeros", *Manresa* – 240, 1989, pp. 231-248.
- GONZÁLEZ MAGAÑA, EMILIO. "Anotaciones", *DEI*, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2007, pp. 170-176.
- GRANERO, JESÚS. M. "La Compañía de Jesús y sus novicios", *Manresa* – 42, 1970, pp. 313-358.
- GUILLÉN, ANTONIO. "El proceso espiritual de la Cuarta Semana", *Manresa* – 79, 2007, pp. 127-138.
- IGLESIAS, IGNACIO. "Cuarto Voto", *DEI*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2007, pp.

515-520.

IGLESIAS, IGNACIO. "Elementos instrumentales de la experiencia de Ejercicios Ignacianos", *Manresa* – 236, 1988, pp. 235-252.

-----". "La Contemplación para alcanzar amor en la dinámica de los Ejercicios Espirituales", *Manresa* - 233, 1987, pp. 373-387.

-----". "Los tres binarios de hombres: texto y forma de exposición y reflexión bíblico-teológicas", *Manresa* 226, 1986, pp. 57-67.

IPARRAGUIRRE, IGNACIO. *Práctica de los Ejercicios de San Ignacio de Loyola en vida de su Autor*, Bibliotheca Instituti Historici: Roma, 1946.

ITURRIOZ, JESÚS. "Obediencia Debida al Papa en la Compañía de Jesús", *Manresa* – 214, 1983, pp. 65-86.

IVENS, MICHAEL. *Understanding the Spiritual Exercises*, Gracewing: Herefordshire, 1998.

JACOB, PIERRE – DULLARD, MAURICE. *The Inspirational Sources of our Jesuit Charism*, Gujarat Sahitya Prakash: Anand, 2003.

KING, NICHOLAS. "Ignatius of Loyola and Decision Making", *The Way Supplement* - 24, 1975, pp. 46-57.

KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS. *Decir...al Indecible – Estudios sobre los Ejercicios Espirituales de San Ignacio*, (Ed. Iglesias, Ignacio). Mensajero - Sal Terrae: Bilbao - Santander, 1999.

-----". *Selección de escritos - (1983-1990)*, Provincia de España de la Compañía de Jesús: Madrid, 1992.

-----". *The Road from La Storta*. The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 2000.

-----". *Letter to Major Superiors on the Account of Conscience – Acta Romana, Vol. XXIII*, pp. 554-561.

LÉCRIVAIN, PHILIPPE. "Paris", *DEI*, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2007, pp. 1412-1417.

LOSADA, JOAQUIN. "El contenido teológico de las dos Banderas", *Manresa* – 226, 1986, pp. 41-55.

-----". "Significado teológico del cuarto voto", *Manresa* – 284-9, 1991, pp. 435-450.

MADRIGAL, SANTIAGO. "Vivir hoy en la Iglesia desde el carisma ignaciano", *Manresa* – 331, 2012, pp. 141-152.

- MARTÍN-MORENO, JUAN M. "Jerusalén", *DEI*, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2007, pp. 1064-1071.
- MCMANAMON, JOHN M. *The Text and Contexts of Ignatius Loyola's "Autobiography"*, Fordham University Press: New York, 2013.
- MCNAMARA, BRIAN. "Jesus' prayer in Gethsemane: Interpretation and Identification", *The Way Supplement* – 27, 1976, pp. 79-87.
- MEISSNER, WILLIAM W. *Ignatius of Loyola – The Psychology of a Saint*, Yale University Press: London, 1992.
- MELLONI, JAVIER. *La Mistagogía de los Ejercicios*, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2001.
- . *The Exercises of St. Ignatius Loyola in the Western Tradition*, (Tr. Ivens, Michael), Gracewing: Herefordshire, 2000.
- MOLINA, DIEGO. "‘Y que militen dentro de nuestra santa madre la Iglesia...’ El papel de la Iglesia en el proceso espiritual del sujeto ignaciano", *Manresa* - 315, 2008, pp. 153-167.
- MÜLLER, MAX – HALDER, ALOIS – MÖLLER, JOSEPH – SAND, ALEXANDER – RAHNER, KARL. "Person", *The Concise Sacramentum Mundi*, (Ed. Rahner, Karl), The Seabury Press: New York, 1975.
- NICOLAU, MIGUEL. "Ascesis Ignaciana", *Manresa* – 115, 1958, pp. 129-148.
- O'MALLEY, JOHN. *The First Jesuits*, Harvard University Press: London, 1993.
- PADBERG, JOHN W. "Ignatius, the Popes and Realistic Reverence", *Studies*25/3, 1993, pp. 1-38.
- PIPER, JOHN. "Self-love and the Christian counselor's task", *The Reformed Journal*, 1978, pp. 13-18.
- RAHNER, HUGO. *The Vision of St. Ignatius in the Chapel of La Storta*, (Tr. Brennan, Robert O.), CIS: Rome, 1975.
- RAHNER, KARL. *Meditaciones sobre los Ejercicios de San Ignacio*, Herder: Barcelona, 1971.
- RAMBLA, JOSEP M. "Del gentilhomme Íñigo a San Ignacio de Loyola: una eclesialidad progresiva", *Manresa* – 331, 2012, pp. 111-125.
- RAVIER, ANDRÉ. *Ignatius of Loyola and the Founding of the Society of Jesus*, (Tr. Daly, Maura – Daly, Joan – Daly, Carson), Ignatius Press: San Francisco, 1987.

- REVUELTA, MANUEL. "Colegios", *DEI*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2007, pp. 335-340.
- ROBERT, SYLVIE. "Union and Election", *The Way Supplement* -103, 2002, pp. 100-112.
- RODRÍGUEZ OLAIZOLA, JOSÉ M^a. *Ignacio de Loyola, nunca solo*, San Pablo: Madrid, 2006.
- ROMERO, JOSÉ J. "Ser puesto con el Hijo hoy, un Hijo "cargado con la Cruz...", *Manresa* – 333, 2012, pp. 339-353.
- ROYÓN, ELÍAS. "Las tres maneras de humildad en la dinámica del seguimiento de Jesús", *Manresa* -58, 1986, pp. 69-76.
- ". "Principio y Fundamento", *DEI*, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2007, pp. 1490-1497.
- RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL. "En torno la gracia de acatamiento amoroso", *Manresa* – 135, 1963, pp. 145-154.
- ". "La Oración de San Ignacio en su Diario Espiritual", *Manresa* – 330, 2012, pp. 63-77.
- ". *El peregrino de la voluntad de Dios – Biografía espiritual de San Ignacio de Loyola*, BAC: Madrid, 2005.
- ". *Orígenes del Noviciado en la Compañía de Jesús*, Institutum Historicum: Roma, 1980.
- ". "Constitutions", *DHCJ*, Universidad Pontifica Comillas - IHSJ: Madrid-Roma, 2011, pp. 928-935.
- ". "Probaciones", *DHCJ*, Universidad Pontifica Comillas.IHSJ: Madrid-Roma, 2011, pp. 3235-3242.
- SANCHEZ-GIRÓN, JOSÉ LUIS. "Cuenta de Conciencia", *DEI*, Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2007, pp. 529-529.
- SCHAFFNER, O. "Humildad", *Conceptos Fundamentales de la Teología – I*, (Dir. Fries, Hienrich), Ediciones Cristiandad: Huesca, 1979², pp. 692-700.
- SPLETT, JÖRG – PESCH, RUDOLF – RAHNER, KARL. "Man", *The Concise Sacramentum Mundi*, (Ed. Rahner, Karl), The Seabury Press: New York, 1975, pp. 880-893.
- TEJERA, MANUEL. "Adiciones", *DEI*, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander, 2007, pp. 84-89.
- ". "El proceso espiritual de la tercera semana", *Manresa* - 329, 2011, pp. 329-334.

- TEJERA, MANUEL. "La cuarta semana en la dinámica de los Ejercicios", *Manresa* – 233, 1987, pp. 315-324.
- . "Para adentrarse en la experiencia de Ejercicios: las adiciones [73-81]", *Manresa* – 271, 1997, pp. 117-130.
- TEJERINA, ANGEL. "Petición de la contemplación de la Encarnación", *Manresa* – 278, 1999, pp. 45-61.
- TELLECHEA IDÍGORAS, JOSÉ IGNACIO. *Ignatius of Loyola – The Pilgrim Saint*, (Tr. Buckley, Cornelius Michael), Loyola Press: Chicago, 1994.
- THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO. "Diario Espiritual", *DEI, Mensajero – Sal Terrae: Bilbao – Santander*, 2007, pp. 592-596.
- . "La Experiencia de Dios reflejada en el Diario Espiritual", *Manresa* – 294, 2003, pp. 27-36.
- TONER, JULES J. "The Deliberations That Started the Jesuits", *Studies – Vol. 4*, 1974, pp. v-ix; 179-212.
- VON BALTHASAR, HANS URS. *Hans Urs von Balthasar – Textos de Ejercicios Espirituales*, (Selección e introducción - Servais, Jacques; Capítulo preliminar – Martínez-Gayol, Nurya), Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 2009.
- VV.AA. *Ignacio de Loyola en Castilla*, Caja de Ahorros Popular de Valladolid y Provincia de Castilla de la Compañía de Jesus: Valladolid, 1989.
- VV.AA. *Constitutions of the Society of Jesus – Incorporation of a Spirit*, Gujarat Sahitya Prakash: Anand, 1993.
- VV.AA. *Ejercicios Espirituales y mundo de hoy*, (Ed. García-Lomas, Juan Manuel), Mensajero-Sal Terrae: Bilbao-Santander, 1992.
- VV.AA. *Ignacio de Loyola y su tiempo*, (Ed. Plazaola, Juan), Mensajero – Universidad de Deusto: Bilbao, 1991.
- VV.AA. *Los Ejercicios de San Ignacio a la luz del Vaticano – II*, (Ed. Espinosa, Clemente), BAC: Madrid, 1968.
- VV.AA. *The Way of Ignatius Loyola – Contemporary Approaches to the Spiritual Exercises*, (Ed. Sheldrake, Philip), SPCK: London, 1991.

2.2 KENOSIS AND HUMILITY

BARCLAY, WILLIAM. *The New Daily Study Bible - The Letters to the Philippians, Colossians and Thessalonians*, Westminster John Knox Press: London, 1975. (Logos)

BIRD, MICHAEL F. *Are You the One Who Is to Come? - The Historical Jesus and the Messianic Question*, Baker Academic: Michigan, 2009. (Logos)

BOSTOCK, GERALD. "Origen's Exegesis of the Kenosis Hymn", *Sixth Origen Conference - Chantilly*, Lueven University Press: Louvain, 2003, pp. 531-547.

BROOKE, A. E. *A Critical and Exegetical Commentary on the Johannine Epistles - ICC*, C. Scribner's Sons: New York, 1919. (Logos)

BROWN, DAVID. *Divine Humanity - Kenosis and the Construction of a Christian Theology*, Baylor University Press: Texas, 2011.

BROWN, RAYMOND. E. *The Epistles of John: Translated, with Introduction, notes, and commentary - AYBC*, Yale University Press: London, 2008. (Logos)

CARLSON, SEBASTIAN. *The Virtue of Humility*, W. C. Brown Company: Iowa, 1952.

CHARTIER, GARY. *The Analogy of Love*, Imprint Academic: Devon, 2007.

CHRÉTIEN, JEAN-LOUIS. *La Mirada del Amor*, (Tr. Barrera, Pilar Jimeno), Sígueme: Salamanca, 2005.

CRONIN, KEVIN M. *Kenosis - Emptying Self and the Path of Christian Service*, Continuum: New York, 1999.

DAANE J. "Kenosis", *The International Standard Bible Encyclopedia Revised - III*, (Ed. Bromiley, G.W.), William B. Eerdmans: Michigan, 1986, pp. 7-9. (Logos)

DAWE, DONALD G. *The Form of a Servant*, WIPF & STOCK: Oregon, 2011.

DÍAZ, CARLOS. *La virtud de la Humildad*, Trillas: México D.F., 2002.

DOROSTOLSKI, METROPOLITAN HILARION. *Humility and Pride*, (Tr. Mihaylov, Stefan), iUniverse: New York, 2010.

ELLIOTT, JOHN H. *1 Peter: a New Translation with Introduction and Commentary - AYBC*, Yale University Press: London, 2008. (Logos)

ELMER, DUANE. *Cross-Cultural Servanthood - Serving the World in Christlike Humility*, IVP

Books: Illinois, 2006.

- FITZMYER, JOSEPH A. *Romans: A New Translation with Introduction and Commentary* – AYBC, Yale University Press: London, 1993. (Logos)
- FULLAM, LISA. *The Virtue of Humility: A Thomistic Apologetic*, Edwin Mellen: New York, 2009.
- FUNK, MARY MARGARET. *Humility Matters – For Practicing the Spiritual Life*, Continuum: New York, 2011.
- FURNISH, VICTOR P. *II Corinthians: translated with introduction, notes, and commentary* – AYBC, Yale University Press: London, 2008. (Logos)
- GAVRILYUK, PAUL. *The Suffering of the Impassible God*, Oxford University Press: Oxford, 2004.
- . "The Kenotic Theology of Sergius Bulgakov", *Scottish Journal of Theology* – Vol. 58/3, 2005, pp. 251-269.
- GERBER, UWE. "Kenosis", *The Encyclopedia of Christianity - III*, (Eds. Fahlbusch, Erwin & others), William B. Eerdmans: Michigan, 2003, pp. 110-111. (Logos)
- GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN. *La humildad de Dios*, Sal Terrae: Santander, 2012.
- GORMAN, MICHAEL J. *Apostle of the Crucifix Lord - A Theological Introduction to Paul and his Letters*, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company: Michigan, 2004.
- . *Inhabiting the Cruciform God – Kenosis, Justification and Theosis in Paul's Narrative Soteriology*, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company: Michigan, 2009.
- GORODETSKI, NADEZHDA. *El Cristo Humillado – Ensayo desde la Literatura y el Pensamiento Rusos*, (Tr. Jimeno Sánchez, Ramón), Sígueme: Salamanca, 2010.
- HALL, FRANCIS JOSEPH. *The Kenotic Theory – Considered with Particular Reference to its Anglican Form and Arguments*, Longmans, Green, and Co.: London, 1889. (Rpr by Bibliolife)
- HARRISON, EVERETT F. *Romans through Galatians* – EBC, Zondervan Publishing House: Grand Rapids, 1976. (Logos)
- HARRIS, MURRAY J. *The Second Epistle to the Corinthians: A Commentary on the Greek text*, W. B. Eerdmans Pub. Co.: Michigan, 2005. (Logos)
- HAWTHORNE, GERALD F. *Philippians* - WBC, (Rev. by Martin, Ralph), Thomas Nelson Publishers: New York, 2004. (Logos)

- HENRY, P. "Kenose", *Dictionnaire de la Bible. Supplément*, Libraire Letouzey et Ané : Paris, 1957, pp. 7-61.
- HUERGA, ÁLVARO. "Humildad", *Sacramentum Mundi*, (Dir. Rahner, Karl), Editorial Herder: Barcelona, 1976, pp. 555-557.
- LOOFS, FRIEDRICH. "Kenosis", *Encyclopedia of Religion and Ethics – VII*, (Ed. James Hastings), T&T Clark: Edinburgh, 1914, pp. 680-688. (Logos)
- LOUF, ANDRÉ. *The Way of Humility*, (Tr. Cunningham, Lawrence S.), Cistercian Publications: Michigan, 2007.
- LOUNIBOS, JOHN B. *Self-Emptying of Christ and the Christian – Three Essays on Kenosis*, WIPF & STOCK: Oregon, 2011.
- LUCIEN, RICHARD J. *A Kenotic Christology – In the Humanity of Jesus Christ, the Compassion of our God*, University of America: Washington, 1982.
- , *Christ: The Self-emptying of God*, Paulist Press: New York, 1997.
- MALONEY, GEORGE. *On the Road to Perfection – Christian Humility in Modern Society*, New City Press: New York, 1995.
- MARTIN, RALPH P. *Carmen Christi Philippians 2:5-11 – In Recent Interpretation and in the Setting of Early Christian Worship*, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company: Michigan, 1983. (Rv.Ed.)
- MARTÍNEZ, JULIO. "Salir del "amor propio" para hallar el "sí mismo": Un estudio de ética teológica", *Miscelánea Comillas - Vol. 55*, 1997, pp. 157-200.
- MELICK, RICHARD R. *The New American Commentary (Vol. 32) – Philippians, Colossians, Philemon*, Broadman & Holman Publishers: Tennessee, 1991. (Logos)
- MONSERRAT, JAVIER. "Kenosis – Towards a New Theology of Science", *Pensamiento - Vol. 63*, 2007, pp. 637-658.
- MORRIS, THOMAS V. *The Logic of God Incarnate*, Wipf and Stock Publishers: Oregon, 2001.
- MUJICA, HUGO. *Kénosis - Sabiduría y compasión en los Evangelios*, Marea: Buenos Aires, 2009.
- MURRAY, ANDREW. *Humility*, Bridge Logos: Florida, 2000. (Rpr. 2009).
- PARDUE, S. T. *The Mind of Christ: Humility and the Intellect in Early Christian Theology*, (Eds. J. Webster - I. A. McFarland - I. Davidson), Bloomsbury: London, 2013. (Logos)

- PODIMATTAM, FELIX M. *Kenosis Spirituality – Paschal Path to Holiness*, Claretian Publications: Bangalore, 2002.
- POWER, DAVID N. *Love Without Calculation – A Reflection on Divine Kenosis*, Herder and Herder Book: New York, 2005.
- REUMANN, JOHN. *Philippians – A New Translation with Introduction and Commentary (AYBC)*, Yale University Press: New Haven & London, 2008. (Logos)
- RIVAS REBAQUE, FERNANDO. *Terapia de las enfermedades espirituales en los Padres de la Iglesia*, San Pablo: Madrid, 2008.
- ROSELL NEBREDA, SERGIO. *La nueva identidad de los cristianos: el himno a Cristo en la Carta a los filipense*, Sígueme: Salamanca, 2010.
- RØSOK, INGVLID. “The Kenosis of Christ Revisited: The Relational Perspective of Karl Rahner”, *The Heythrop Journal*, 2012. (Wiley online)
- . “Unconditional Surrender and Love – How Spirituality Illuminates the Theology of Karl Rahner”, *The Way*, 50/4, 2011, pp. 121-132.
- . *Surrender to Life – A Systematic Theological Analysis of Human Kenosis in Karl Rahner’s Thoughts, with Reference to Ignatian Spirituality*, Norweigan School of Theology: Oslo, 2010.
- SANDERS, BRIAN. *Elusive – The Pursuit of Jesus and Humility*, Underground Media: Tampa, 2010.
- SCHAAB, GLORIA L. *The Creative Suffering of the Triune God – An Evolutionary Theology*, Oxford University Press: Oxford, 2007.
- SCHREINER, THOMAS R. *1, 2 Peter, Jude – NAC*, Broadman & Holman Publishers: Nashville, 2003. (Logos)
- SCIADINI, P. “Humildad”, *Diccionario de Espiritualidad – II*, (Ed. Ancilli, Ermanno), Herder: Barcelona, 1987, pp. 267-269.
- SCOTT, STUART. *From Pride to Humility*, Focus Publishing: Minnesota, 2002.
- SEARS, ROBERT T. – BRACKEN, JOSEPH A. *Self-Emptying Love in a Global Context – The Spiritual Exercises and the Environment*, Cascade Books: Oregon, 2006.
- SENIOR, DONALD. “Kenosis”, *The New Dictionary of Catholic Spirituality*, (Ed. Downey, Michael), Liturgical Press: Minnesota, 1993, p. 584. (Logos)

- SMALLEY, STEPHEN S. *1, 2, 3 John – WBC*, Word Incorporated: Dallas, 1989. (Logos)
- THOMAS, MOLY. *Christology in Context – Kenotic perspectives*, Intercultural Publications: Delhi, 2005
- THRALL, MARGARET E. *A Critical and Exegetical commentary on the Second Epistle of the Corinthians - ICC*, T & T Clark International: London, 2004. (Logos)
- VANSTONE, W. H. *Love's Endeavour, Love's Expense – The Response of Being to the Love of God*, Darton Longman & Todd: London, 2007.
- VARILLON, FRANCOIS. *The Humility and Suffering of God*, (Tr. Marans, N.), Alba House: New York, 1975.
- VERHEY, A. D. "Humble", *The International Standard Bible Encyclopedia Revised - II*, (Ed. Bromiley, Geoffrey), W. B. Eerdmans: Michigan, 1986, pp. 775-778. (Logos)
- VINCENT, MARVIN R. *The Epistles to Philippians and Philemon - ICC*, T&T Clark, Edinburg, 1897. (Logos)
- VON RUVILLE, ALBERT. *Humility the True Talisman; A Study of Catholicism*, (Tr. Schoentensack, G.), Simpkin, Marshall, Hamilton, Kento & Co. Ltd.: London, 1913.
- VV. AA. *Letting Go – Rethinking Kenosis*, (Ed. Zijlstra, Onno), Peter Lang: Bern, 2002.
- VV.AA. *The Navarre Bible – St. Paul's Captivity Letters*, (Tr. Gavigan, James – McCarthy, Brian – McGovern, Thomas), Four Courts Press: Dublin, 2003. (Logos)
- VV.AA. *Divine Impassibility and the Mystery of Human Suffering*, (Eds. Keating, James F. – White, Thomas Joseph), Paulist Press: Mahwah, 1982.
- VV.AA. *Exploring Kenotic Christology – The Self-Emptying of Christ*, (Ed. Evans, C. Stephen), Oxford University Press: Oxford, 2010.
- VV.AA. *The Work of Love – Creation as Kenosis*, (Ed. Polkinghorne, John) SPCK: Michigan, 2001.
- VV.AA. *Where Christology Began – Essays on Philippians 2*, (Eds. Martin, Ralph P. – Dodd, Brian J.), SPCK: Michigan, 2001.
- WILLIAMS, DAVID T. *Have This Mind – following the example of Christ*, iUniverse: New York, 2007.
- *Kenosis of God – The self-limitation of God: Father, Son, and Holy Spirit*, iUniverse, Inc:

New York, 2009.

ZAGANO, PHYLLIS. "Spiritual Wisdom, Narcissism, and Healthy Humility", *The Journal of Pastoral Counseling – Vol. XXXIX*, 2004, pp. 19-34.

2.3 OTHER

ALVAREZ, TOMÁS. "Crecimiento espiritual y dinámica del Espíritu Santo", *ViRel* 56, 1984, pp. 432-440.

ANDERSON, RAY. *Historical Transcendence and the Reality of God*, Geoffrey Chapman Publishers: London, 1975.

BARTH, K. *Church Dogmatics: The doctrine of the Word of God, Vol. I – Part I*, (Tr. Bromiley, G. W.), T&T Clark: London, 2004. (Logos)

BENEDICT XVI. (POPE) *Deus caritas est*, Encyclical Letter on Christian Love, 25th December 25, 2005.

----- . *Homily on the Conclusion of the year for Priests*, 11th June, 2010.

BENNER, DAVID G. *Spirituality and the Awakening Self – The Sacred Journey of Transformation*, Brazos Press: Michigan, 2012.

BOUCHET – ALSZEGHY – RONCO, "Relaciones entre crecimiento psicológico y crecimiento espiritual", *ViRel* 56, 1984, pp. 333-345.

BUCHANAN, G.W. "Essenes", *The International Standard Bible Encyclopedia Revised - II*, (Ed. Bromiley, G.W), William B. Eerdmans: Michigan, 1986, pp. 147-155. (Logos)

BULGAKOFF, SERGIUS. *El Paráclito*, (Ed. López, Sáez, Francisco J.), Sígueme: Salamanca, 2014.

BUXTON, G. *The Trinity, Creation and Pastoral Ministry: Imaging the Perichoretic God*, Paternoster: Milton Keynes, 2005. (Logos)

CASTRO, SECUNDINO. *Unpublished Notes*, Madrid: UPComillas, 2009-10.

CONN, WALTER E. "Self-Transcendence, the True-Self and Self-Love", *Pastoral Psychology - Vol. 46*, 1998, pp. 323-332.

----- . *The Desiring Self – Rooting Pastoral Counseling and Spiritual Direction in Self-Transcendence*, Paulist Press: New York, 1998.

CONNOR, JAMES L. *The Dynamism of Desire of Bernard J. F. Lonergan, S.J., on the Spiritual*

Exercises of Saint Ignatius of Loyola, The Institute of Jesuit Sources: Saint Louis, 2006.

CORDOVILLA PÉREZ, ÁNGEL. "¿Quién es el hombre para que Te Acuerdes de él? Una meditación Teológica sobre el Hombre", *Revista Católica Internacional de Pensamiento y Cultura Communio*, Vol. I, 2007, pp. 83-95.

COUTINHO, PAUL. *Just as You Are*, Loyola Press: Chicago, 2009.

CREED, J. M. *The Divinity of Jesus Christ*, Collins: London, 1964.

DENZINGER, H. - DEFERRARI, R. J. - RAHNER, K. *The Sources of Catholic dogma*, Herder Book Co.: St. Louis, 1954. (Logos)

DILLON, J. M. "Platonism", *Anchor Yale Bible Dictionary - V*, (Ed. D. N. Freedman), Doubleday: New York, 1996, pp. 378-381. (Logos)

DUNNE, TAD. *Lonergan and Spirituality – Towards a Spiritual Integration*, Loyola University Press: Chicago, 1985.

EGAN, HARVEY. "Karl Rahner's Theological Life", *Budhi: A Journal of Ideas and Culture - VIII*, Ateneo de Manila University: Quezon City, 2004, pp. 179-187.

ENDEAN, PHILIP. "Rahner, Christology and Grace", *Heythrop Journal – 37*, 1996, pp. 284-297.

ESTEP, WILLIAM R. *Renaissance & Reformation*, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company: Michigan, 1986.

FELDMEIER, PETER. *The Developing Christian – Spiritual Growth Through the Life Cycle*, Paulist Press: New Jersey, 2007.

FITZMYER, JOSEPH A. *A Christological Catechism – New Testament Answers*, Paulist Press: New York, 1991². (Logos)

GAMARRA, SATURNINO. *Teología Espiritual*, BAC: Madrid, 2007.

GARACHANA, ANGEL. "Crecimiento en la Comunión con Cristo y Dinamica de Mortificación", *ViRel* 56, 1984, pp. 422-431.

GARRET, STEPHEN M. "The Dazzling Darkness of God's Triune Love: Introducing Evangelicals to the Theology of Hans Urs von Balthasar", *Themelios: Vol.35/3*, 2010, pp. 414-430. (Logos)

GERSON, VERNON, *The Desires of the Human Heart – An Introduction to the Theology of Bernard*

- Lonergan*, Paulist Press: New York, 1988.
- GRILLMEIER, ALOYS. *Christ in Christian Tradition – Vol. 1*, (Tr. Bowden, John), John Knox Press: Atlanta, 1975².
- GROESCHEL, BENEDICT J. *Spiritual Passages – The Psychology of Spiritual Development*, Crossroad Publishing Company: New York, 2009.
- HARVEY D. EGAN. *An Anthology of Christian Mysticism*, Pueblo Books: Minnesota, 1991.
- HAUSHERR, I. *La Perfección del Cristiano*, Mensajero: Bilbao, 1971.
- HOLMES, STEPHEN R. *The Holy Trinity – Understanding God’s Life*, Paternoster: Milton Keynes, 2012. (iTunes)
- HOPPÁL, BULCSÚ KÁL. “Karl Rahner’s Notion of Vorgriff”, *Verbum VI/2*, 2004, pp. 451-459.
- JOHN PAUL II. (POPE) *Fides et Ratio*, Encyclical Letter on the relationship between Faith and Reason, 14th September, 1998.
- . *Reconciliatio et Paenitentia*, Post Synodal Apostolic Exhortation – Reconciliation and Penance, 2nd December, 1984.
- . *Veritatis Splendor*, Encyclical Letter on some fundamental questions about the Moral Teaching of the Church, 6th August, 1993.
- . *Vita Consecrata*, Apostolic Exhortation, 25th March, 1996.
- JOHNSON, ELIZABETH A. *La cristología, hoy – Olas de renovación en el acceso a Jesús*, (Tr. Díez Aragón, Ramón Alfonso), Sal Terrae: Santander, 2003.
- JOSEPHUS, F. *The Works of Josephus: Complete and Unabridged*, (Tr. Whiston, W.), 1987, Hendrickson Publishers: Massachusetts, 1987. (Logos)
- KÄRKKÄINEN, VELI-MATTI. *Christology – A Global Introduction*, Baker Academic: Michigan, 2003.
- KELLY, J. N. D. *Early Christian Doctrines*, Harper One: New York, 1978. (Rv.Ed.)
- KILBEY, KAREN. *Balthasar - A Very Critical Introduction*, William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company: Michigan, 2012. (Logos)
- . *The SPCK Introduction to Karl Rahner*, SPCK: London, 2007.
- KRILL, PHILIP. *Life in the Trinity: A Catholic Vision of Communion and Deification*, lulu.com,

2010.

LONERGAN, BERNARD. *Insight – A Study of Human Understanding*, Longman: London, 1957.

----- . *Method in Theology*, Darton, Longman & Todd: London, 1971.

MACKINTOSH, H. R. *The Doctrine of the Person of Christ*, T.T. & Clark: Edinburg, 1951. (Logos)

MCBRIEN, RICHARD P. *Catholicism*, Harper Collins Publishers: New York, 1994.

MERTON, THOMAS. *Seeds of Contemplation*, New Directions: New York, 1987.

MOLTMANN, JÜRGEN. *The Trinity and the Kingdom: The Doctrine of God*, (Tr. Kohl, M.), Fortress Press: Minneapolis, 1993. (Logos)

O'COLLINS, GERALD. *Christology- A Biblical, Historical, and Systematic Study of Jesus*, Oxford University Press: 2009².

O'LEARY, BRIAN. *Sent into the Lord's Vineyard*, The Way Books: Oxford, 2013.

O'MURCHU DIARMUID. *The Transformation of Desire – How desire became corrupted – and how we can reclaim it*, Orbis Books: New York, 2007.

OLIVER, SIMON. *Love Alone is Credible – Hans Urs von Balthasar as Interpreter of Catholic Tradition*, (Ed. Schindler, David L.), William B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, Michigan, 2008. (Logos)

PIET SCHOONENBERG. *Man and Sin*, University of Notre Dame: Indiana, 1965.

PINCKAERS, SERVAIS. *La Vida Espiritual*, EDICEP: Valencia, 1994.

POHLE, J. – PREUSS. A. *Christology: A Dogmatic Treatise on the Incarnation*, B. Herder: St. Louis, 1913. (Logos)

RAHNER, KARL.² *Theological Investigations*, Campion Hall: Oxford, 2004.

----- . "He Descended into Hell'." (VII)

----- . "Christian Dying." (XVIII)

----- . "Christian Living Formerly and Today." (VII)

----- . "Christology Today." (XVII)

² The articles by Karl Rahner, have been taken from a digitalized version of his *Theological Investigations*. This was part of 'The Rahner Project' undertaken by the Center of Culture, Technology and Values. The Centre for Culture, Technology and Values is based at Mary Immaculate College, University of Limerick.

- RAHNER, KARL. "Current Problems in Christology." (I)
 -----. "Following the Crucified." (XVIII)
 -----. "On the Theology of the Incarnation." (IV)
 -----. "Reflections on the Problem of the Gradual Ascent to Christian Perfection." (III)
 -----. "The Eternal Significance of the Humanity of Jesus for our Relationship with God." (III)
 -----. "The Faith of the Christian and the Doctrine of the Church." (XIV)
 -----. "The Human Question of Meaning in Face of the Absolute Mystery of God." (XVIII)
 -----. "The Scandal of Death." (VII)
 -----. "The Theological Concept of Concupiscentia." (I)
 -----. "Trinity", *The Concise Sacramentum Mundi*, (Ed. Rahner, Karl), The Seabury Press: New York, 1975, pp. 1755-1771.
 -----. *Hearer of the Word*, (Tr. Donceel, Joseph), The Continuum Publishing Company: New York, 1978.
- RATZINGER, CARDINAL JOSEPH. "Concerning the notion of a Person in Theology", *Communio*, 1990, pp. 439-454.
- RENWICK, A. M. – LASOR W. S. "Gnosticism", *The International Standard Bible Encyclopedia Revised - II*, (Ed. Bromiley, G. W.), Eerdmans: Michigan, 2002, pp. 484-490. (Logos)
- SAKHAROV, NIKOLAI. "Essential Bulgakov: His ideas about Sophia, Trinity and Christ", *St Vladimir's Theological Quarterly* 55:2, 2011, pp. 165-206.
- SALVADOR, RUIZ. *Caminos del Espíritu*, Editorial De Espiritualidad: Madrid, 1998⁵.
- SCHMELLER, T. "Stoicism" *Anchor Yale Bible Dictionary - Vol. 6*, (Ed. Freedman, D. N.), Doubleday: New York, 1996. (Logos)
- STUHLMACHER. PETER. *Jesus of Nazareth – Christ of Faith*, (Tr. Schatzmann, Siegfried), Hendrickson Publishers: Massachusetts, 1988.
- TATARYN, MYROSLAW. "Sergius Bulgakov (1871-1944): Time for a New Look", *St. Vladimir's Theological Quarterly* 4, 1988, pp. 315-338.
- TOBIN, THOMAS H. "Logos" *Anchor Yale Bible Dictionary - Vol. 4* (Ed. Freedman, D. N.), Doubleday: New York, 1996. (Logos)

- TOBIN, THOMAS H.. *The Spirituality of St. Paul*, Michael Glazier: Delaware, 1971.
- TORRANCE, T.F. *The Christian doctrine of God: One Being Three Persons*, T&T Clark: Edinburgh, 1996. (Logos)
- URBINA, FERNANDO. "Crecimiento Espiritual y Actividad Apostolica", *ViRel* - 56, 1984, pp. 449-452.
- URÍBARRI, GABINO. "La dimensión teológica de la vida religiosa Una mirada desde la promoción vocacional", *Miscelánea Comillas* - 56, 1998, pp. 73-95.
- VATICAN COUNCIL II. *Gaudium et Spes*, Pastoral Constitution of the Second Vatican Council on the church in the modern world, 7th December, 1965.
- . *Lumen Gentium*, Dogmatic Constitution of the Second Vatican Council on the church, 21st November, 1964.
- VON BALTHASAR, H. U. "Espiritualidad", *Ensayos Teológicos I*, Verbum Caro: Madrid, 1964, pp. 269-289.
- . "El Evangelio como criterio y norma de toda Espiritualidad en la Iglesia", *Concilium* 1 (9), 1965, pp. 7-25.
- . *Mysterium Paschale*, (Tr. Nichols, Aidan), Ignatius Press: San Francisco, 1981.
- . "On the Concept of Person", *Communio* – XIII, 1986, pp. 18-26.
- . *Engagement with God-The Drama of Christian Discipleship*, (Tr. Halliburton, John R.), Ignatius: San Francisco, 1986².
- . "Teología y Santidad", *Communio* – IV/87, (Ed. Oriol, José Miguel), Ediciones Encuentro, Madrid, 1987, pp. 486-493.
- . *Theo-Drama* – Vol. III, (Tr. Harisson, Grahon), San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1992. (Logos)
- . *Theo-Drama* – Vol. IV, (Tr. Harisson, Grahon), San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1994. (Logos)
- . *Theo-Drama* – Vol. V, (Tr. Harisson, Grahon), San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1998. (Logos)
- . *Love Alone Is Credible*. (Tr. D. C. Schindler.), San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 2004. (Logos)
- VON HILDEBRAND, DEITRICH. *Transformation in Christ – On the Christian Attitude*, Ignatius: San Francisco, 1990.

- VV. AA. *The Cambridge Companion to Hans Urs Von Balthasar*, (Ed. Oakes, Edward T. – Moss, David), Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, 2004. (iTunes)
- VV. AA. *The Cambridge Companion to Karl Rahner*, (Ed. Marmion, Declan – Hines, Mary E.), Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, 2005. (iTunes)
- VV.AA. *Christian Spirituality – Origins to the Twelfth Century*, (Eds. McGinn, Bernard - Meyendorff, John - Leclercq, Jean), Crossroad: New York, 1985.
- VV. AA. *Christian Spirituality – High Middle Ages and Reformation*, (Ed. Raitt, Jill), Crossroad: New York, 1989.
- VV.AA. *Hans Urs von Balthasar: His Life and Work*, (Ed. Schindler, David L.), Ignatius: San Francisco, 1991.
- VV.AA. *Oxford Readings in Philosophical Theology – Vol. 1: Trinity, Incarnation, Atonement*, (Ed. Rea, Michael), Oxford University Press: Oxford, 2009.
- VV.AA. *The Modern Theologians*, (Ed. Ford, David), Blackwell Publishers: Massachusetts, 2001.
- VV.AA. *The Study of Spirituality*, (Eds. Jones, Cheslyn; Wainwright, Geoffrey; Yarnold, Edward), SPCK: London, 1992.
- WERBICK, JÜRGEN, "Persona", *Diccionario de Conceptos Teológicos*, (Dir. Eicher, Peter), Editorial Herder: Barcelona, 1990, pp. 228-236.
- YODER, TIMOTHY J. *Hans Urs von Balthasar: The Pathway to Human Agency*, Loyola University: Chicago, 2013. (Dissertation)

3. WEBSITES

<http://dhspriority.org/thomas/SSPhilippians.htm#22>

<http://kenosis.info/index.shtml>

<http://patristica.net/graeca/>

<http://patristica.net/latina/>

<http://plato.stanford.edu>

<http://transfiguration.chartreux.org>

<http://www.ccel.org/ccel>

<http://www.chartreux.org/en/texts>

<http://www.historyworld.net>

<http://www.ignaziana.org>

<http://www.jesuitas.es>

<http://www.kritike.org/journal>

<http://www.ocso.org>

<http://www.op.org/files/public/documents>

<http://www.roger-pearse.com/weblog/>

<http://www.sjweb.info/cis>

<http://www.theway.org.uk>

<http://www.vatican.va>

<https://tspace.library.utoronto.ca/bitstream/1807/36303/1>

INDEX OF AUTHORS

- AICARDO, JOSÉ MANUEL, 498, 499
ALBURQUERQUE, ANTONIO, 365, 367
ALDAMA, ANTONIO, 457, 458, 499, 519, 520,
523, 524, 532, 534-536, 553, 594, 597, 603,
637, 638, 641
ALFONSO, HERBERT, 248, 254, 259, 260
ARRUPE, PEDRO, 248, 252, 257, 259, 260
ARZUBIALDE, SANTIAGO, 183, 198, 318, 320,
323, 324, 328, 336, 337, 341, 342, 348, 354,
361, 362, 392, 394, 403
ASCHENBRENNER, GEORGE A., 321, 323
BARCLAY, WILLIAM, 53, 55
BARRIENTOS, NELSON, 265, 287, 295, 310
BARTH, K., 116, 117, 559
BILLY, DENNIS, 592
BIRD, MICHAEL F., 47
BOSTOCK, GERALD, 77
BOYLE, MARJORIE O'ROURKE, 209, 211, 216,
221, 222, 228, 229, 230, 232, 236, 250
BRODRICK, JAMES, 210, 212, 237, 240
BROOKE, A. E., 61
BROWN, DAVID, 97, 99, 105, 108
BROWN, RAYMOND. E., 60
BRUL, PETER DU, 209, 214-216, 221, 226-228,
230, 232, 233
BRUUN, METTE BIRKEDAL, 513
BUCHANAN, G.W., 67
BUCKLEY, MICHAEL, 405-407, 461, 519, 522,
525, 533, 537
BUSTO, JOSÉ RAMÓN, 335
BUXTON, G., 168
CAJETAN, ESSER, 496
CALVERAS, JOSÉ, 352, 355, 356, 358, 360, 379,
381, 383
CARMODY, DENISE LARDNER, 613, 623, 626,
628
CATALÁ, TONI, 257
CENTELLES VIVES, JORGE, 349, 350, 353
CHARTIER, GARY, 192
CHÉRCOLES, ADOLFO M^a, 322
CHRETIEN, JEAN-LOUIS, 176, 184, 189, 192,
195
COATHELEM, HERVE, 599
COLEMAN, GERALD, 219, 235, 236
CONN, WALTER E., 175, 177, 606, 610, 613,
614, 617, 622, 624, 628, 633
CONNOR, JAMES L., 613, 614, 622, 623, 628,
632, 633, 634
CONWELL, JOSEPH, 431, 433, 435
COOK, WILLIAM R., 589
CORELLA, JESÚS, 343, 352-354, 356, 357, 365,
373, 458, 596, 597, 598, 600, 604
COUTINHO, PAUL, 321
DAWE, DONALD, 77, 88, 98, 101, 102, 104, 109,
115
DE DALMASES, CÁNDIDO, 206, 207, 236, 237,
250, 251, 254, 413, 418, 422, 424, 427, 434,
457, 459, 467, 468, 500, 521, 533, 601
DE GUIBERT, JOSEPH, 44, 193, 197, 307, 521,
534, 635
DE JAER, ANDRÉ, 519, 520, 521, 523, 525, 528,
534, 596, 597, 637
DE LETURIA, PEDRO, 207, 208
DECLoux, SIMON, 271, 288, 297, 305, 309, 310,
311, 604
DIEGO, LUIS DE, 248, 259, 260
DÍEZ-ALEGRÍA, JOSÉ MARÍA, 407
DILLON, J. M., 68
DIVARKAR, PARMANANDA, 253, 569
DOMÍNGUEZ MORANO, CARLOS, 379, 380,
382, 384, 387
DROBNER, HUBERTUS R., 75-78, 79, 83, 87, 88
DUMEIGE, GERVAIS, 435
DUNNE, TAD, 606, 615, 616, 622, 624, 629, 632

- EGAN, HARVEY D., 134, 136, 138, 141
 ELLIOTT, JOHN H., 58, 59
 ENDEAN, PHILIP, 140, 141, 145, 149
 ENGLISH, JOHN, 317, 319, 324, 355, 374, 399
 ESSER, CAJETAN, 466, 514, 548
 ESTEP, WILLIAM R., 236
 EVANS, STEPHEN C., 63, 95, 112
 FARGE, JAMES K., 240
 FEE, GORDON D., 65
 FERNÁNDEZ DE LA CIGOÑA, RAMÓN, 412, 414
 FERNÁNDEZ, MARTÍN LUIS, 210
 FISK, BRUCE N., 51
 FITZMYER, JOSEPH A., 47, 57
 FLEMING, DAVID, 333
 FULLAM, LISA, 372, 374
 FURNISH, VICTOR P., 58
 GALLAGHER, TIMOTHY M., 322, 323
 GAMARRA, SATURNINO, 183, 196-198, 362
 GARCÍA DE CASTRO, JOSÉ, 211, 216, 219, 225,
 228, 245, 246, 265, 266, 288, 294, 345, 347,
 348, 413, 415
 GARCÍA ESTÉBANEZ, ALBINO, 389
 GARCÍA HERNÁN, ENRIQUE, 210, 214, 229,
 237, 249
 GARCÍA HIRSCHFELD, CARLOS, 326, 327, 332,
 414, 416-418, 423
 GARCÍA MADARIAGA, J. M^a., 245
 GARCÍA MATEO, ROGELIO, 215, 216, 332
 GARCÍA, JOSÉ ANTONIO, 260
 GARCÍA-VILLOSLADA, RICARDO, 206, 208,
 211, 213, 218, 236, 425, 427
 GARRET, STEPHEN M., 123-125, 128, 132
 GAVRILYUK, PAUL, 91, 93, 94, 120-122
 GEGER, BARTON T., 609
 GILL, JAMES J., 544
 GIULIANI, MAURICE, 287, 288, 310, 330
 GOIRI, SANTIAGO, 549, 556, 558, 561-569
 GONZALES MAGAÑA, EMILIO, 317
 GONZÁLEZ BUELTA, BENJAMÍN, 153, 154, 162,
 163, 166, 174, 179, 192
 GONZÁLEZ, LUIS, 432, 433, 435
 GREGSON, VERNON, 631, 634
 GROGAN, BRIAN, 318
 GRILLMEIER, ALOYS, 27
 GUILLÉN, ANTONIO, 400, 402-405
 HALL, FRANCIS JOSEPH, 111
 HARRIS, MURRAY J., 57
 HARRISON, EVERETT F., 56
 HAUSHERR, I., 193, 196, 197
 HAWTHORNE, GERALD F., 52, 54, 55
 HENRICI, PETER, 124
 HENRY, P., 70, 77
 IGLESIAS, IGNACIO, 315, 366, 368, 370, 405,
 406, 407
 IPARRAGUIRRE, IGNACIO, 236
 ITURRIOZ, JESÚS, 207
 IVENS, MICHAEL, 317, 318, 325, 327, 332, 335,
 349, 350, 373-375, 377, 381, 382, 389, 390,
 393, 399, 402-405
 JAER, ANDRÉ, 316, 636
 KÄRKKÄINEN, VELI-MATTI, 86, 88, 117
 KILBY, KAREN, 135, 138, 140
 KING, NICHOLAS, 379
 KING, PETER, 509
 KOLVENBACH, PETER HANS, 337, 340, 371,
 390, 393, 394, 398, 399, 416, 421, 422, 556,
 558
 KRILL, PHILIP, 167, 168, 170
 LARRAÑAGA, VICTORIANO, 296, 304, 307
 LÉCRIVAIN, PHILIPPE, 239
 LETURIA, PEDRO, 568
 LONERGAN, BERNARD, 611-613, 616-619, 623-
 627, 629, 630, 631
 LOSADA, JOAQUIN, 344, 348, 356, 358
 LUCIEN J. RICHARD, 99, 126, 139, 156, 158,
 164, 166, 167, 172
 LUTURIA, PEDRO, 561, 562
 MACKINTOSH, H. R., 108
 MADRIGAL, SANTIAGO, 242, 245
 MALONEY, GEORGE, 154, 155, 170, 180, 191

- MARTIN, RALPH P., 56
MARTINI, CARLO, 325
MARTÍN-MORENO, JUAN M., 235
MCGINN, BERNARD, 588
MCMANAMON, JOHN M., 209, 212, 220, 222,
224, 228, 230, 232, 246, 250
MCNAMARA, BRIAN, 395
MEISSNER, WILLIAM W., 209, 210, 211, 214,
216, 219, 220, 228, 231, 235, 413
MELICK, RICHARD R., 52, 53, 55
MEREDITH, ANTHONY, 69
MOLINA, DIEGO, 235, 240, 241, 244, 247
MOLTMANN, JÜRGEN, 167, 169, 170, 172
MUNITIZ, JOSEPH, 290
NEWMAN, MARTHA G., 588
NOIA, J. A., 134, 135, 136, 149
O'COLLINS, GERALD, 45, 46, 79, 87
O'DONNELL, JOHN, 124, 126, 131
O'LEARY, BRIAN, 519, 522, 525, 526, 533, 534,
595, 598, 636, 637, 638
OAKES, EDWARD T., 123, 126, 133
OLIVER, SIMON, 124
PADBERG, JOHN W., 482
PARDUE, STEPHEN T., 35, 125
PARDUE, S. T., 34
PIPER, JOHN, 177
PLANTINGA, CORNELIUS, 159
POLKINGHORNE, JOHN, 161
POWER, DAVID N., 157, 160, 174
RAHNER, HUGO, 248, 251, 253, 257, 258
RAHNER, KARL, 135-138, 140, 142, 144-149,
173, 178, 195, 197, 345, 349, 353, 357, 373,
377, 378, 392, 396
RAMBLA, JOSEP M., 209, 241, 242, 244, 245,
247, 322
RATZINGER, CARDINAL JOSEPH, 171, 172
RAVIER, ANDRÉ, 234, 240, 245
RENWICK, A. M., 69, 70
REUMANN, JOHN, 50, 51
ROBERT, SYLVIE, 387, 388
RODRÍGUEZ OLAIZOLA, JOSÉ M^a., 217, 224, 226
ROMERO, JOSÉ J., 249, 256, 260
RØSOK, INGILD, 134-137, 142-148
ROWAN, WILLIAMS, 122
ROYÓN, ELÍAS, 319, 320, 372, 373, 374, 376
RUIZ JURADO, MANUEL, 236, 271, 296, 304,
305, 308, 309, 311, 457, 527, 534, 538
RUIZ SALVADOR, FEDERICO, 197, 198
SAKHAROV, NIKOLAI, 121, 122
SAMPAIO COSTA, ALFREDO, 379, 382, 384, 385
SANCHEZ-GIRÓN, JOSÉ LUIS, 556-559
SATURNINO GAMARRA, 179, 181, 190, 192
SCHAFFNER, O, 32
SCHMELLER, T., 68
SCHOONENBERG, PIET, 178, 183, 360
SCHREINER, THOMAS R., 59
SCHURHAMMER, GEORGE, 525
SCIADINI, P., 36
SHELDRAKE, PHILIP, 330, 331, 389, 390, 392
SMALLEY, STEPHEN S., 60, 61
STUHLMACHER, PETER, 49
TATARYN, MYROSLAW, 119
TEJERA, MANUEL, 328, 330, 397, 398, 400, 402,
404
TEJERINA, ANGEL, 335, 338
TELLECHEA IDÍGORAS, JOSÉ IGNACIO, 218,
221, 225, 229, 231-233, 237, 259
THIÓ DE POL, SANTIAGO, 265, 270, 287, 294,
304, 305, 308, 309, 310, 312
THOMAS, MOLY, 96, 97-99, 101, 110
THOMPSON, THOMAS R., 97, 98, 107, 159, 161
THRALL, MARGARET E., 58
TOBIN, THOMAS H., 67, 185
TONER, JULES., 439, 443
TORRANCE, T. F., 169, 170
VAN BAVEL, TARCISIUS J., 464, 586
VANSTONE, W. H., 162, 164, 176, 182, 183
VARILLON, FRANCOIS, 151, 158, 160, 174, 179,
181, 185, 187-189, 192
VEALE, JOSEPH, 316

VINCENT, MARVIN R., 54

VOLF, MIROSLAV, 170

VON BALTHASAR, HANS URS, 49, 54, 124, 127-
131, 155, 157, 160, 171, 195, 361, 379, 390,
394, 396, 397

VON HILDEBRAND, DEITRICH, 622, 626, 632,
633

VOS, PIETER H., 113, 114

WERBICK, JÜRGEN, 171, 172

WESTCOTT, BROOKE, 60

WILLIAMS, DAVID T., 56, 154, 155

WILLIAMS, ROWAN, 119

YODER, TIMOTHY J., 127, 129, 131, 132

YOUNG, WILLIAM, 306, 311

ZAGANO, PHYLLIS, 176, 177, 191

ZELYCK, LORNE, 592